

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Grand Endeavors of American Indian Photography. By Paula Richardson Fleming and Judith Lynn Luskey.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9sn9939r>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(2)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Gidley, Mick

### Publication Date

1994-03-01

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

cally shared metaphysical powers. The personal and collective histories that influence Tracie's worldview enable her to internalize and interpret cultural models and redefine their use in creation of her own history and ethnicity: a California Indian tied to her grandmother's line.

The stories of the Dawn women allow readers to comprehend how specific cultural models persist and transform over time; these narratives also explore how such mental recipes motivate social actors and their attenuating identities. Certain questions remain: What do the Dawn women know of being Cupeño? Are they creating an urban Cupeño ethnicity? To whom does this collectivity belong? These inquiries can be answered only through additional interviews with other rural and urban-based Cupeño individuals.

*From Mission to Metropolis* should be read as a companion book with other articles and books on ethnicity and Southern California Indian history and anthropology. On its own, this piece serves as a much-needed document on ideologies and behaviors of urban American Indian women.

*Diane Weiner*

**Grand Endeavors of American Indian Photography.** By Paula Richardson Fleming and Judith Lynn Luskey. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1993. 176 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

Chapter 1 of this book, entitled "Early Grand Endeavors," implies that the first serious photographic documentation of Native American peoples, undertaken just after the Civil War, grew organically out of earlier forms of visual depiction. These processes included painting and drawing, as practiced by George Catlin, Seth Eastman and others. In one sense—that each form of representation was employed for purposes of documentation of Indians—this is incontestably true. Yet it is also misleading, and I will pick up on this later because it relates to a pattern of strengths and weaknesses in the book as a whole.

The chapter concludes with a short but interesting introduction to the efforts of the wealthy Englishman William Blackmore—rightly described as a "shadowy figure" (p. 21)—to build a comprehensive photographic record of Native American cultures, using pictures by the likes of Alexander Gardner and William

Henry Jackson. Colin Taylor and others have done groundbreaking work on Blackmore's collecting activities, and a more detailed account of his specifically photographic enterprises would be very valuable, as only a few pages are devoted to him in *Grand Endeavors*. Blackmore was a friend to Catlin in his last years and knew of Catlin's hopes for a systematic photographic record of Indian life. Doubtless, there were other personal and institutional links between exponents of the different media; one has only to consider the simultaneous employment of painters and photographers by many of the western exploration expeditions. Nevertheless, because so many features of photography (as a form of representation) are special to it—and, in turn, so many of these features are to do with its nature as a collective or mass, even industrial, medium—the authors could have afforded always to foreground these.

"Independent Master Photographers" of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, as they are dubbed in the book's second chapter, include Swedish-born John A. Anderson, who lived and worked with the Sioux on the Rosebud Reservation; Winter and Pond, who kept a studio in Juneau, Alaska, from the 1890s to the 1940s and produced an unparalleled record of northern Northwest Coast cultures; George Wharton James, the prolific writer and amateur photographer who made frequent visits to the Hopi and other Southwestern groups at the turn of the century; and Sumner W. Matteson, the adventurer and professional photographer who took numerous "side-trips" in the first decade of the century to record Indian life in the Southwest and, perhaps more spectacularly, among the Gros Ventre and Assiniboin peoples at Fort Belknap, Montana. In their treatment of each of these figures, the authors rely on the published research findings of others—Virginia Wyatt on Winter and Pond, for example, or Casagrande and Bourne on Matteson—and they make good use of them. They also reproduce or cite unpublished letters and other archive materials in various Smithsonian collections. Since the deployment of such items enriches the known story and constitutes the book's most significant claim to originality, there should have been more of it throughout.

"Expositions and World Fairs," the subject of the third chapter, is a big one, and scholarship in general still has much to uncover. Robert Rydell and others have highlighted the ways in which these extraordinary events not only acclimatized Americans to processes of modernization but also accelerated American impe-

rialism and served to accustom the American public to its veiled ideology. The exhibition of subject peoples themselves—both those from distant territories like the Philippines and those on reservations within the borders of the contiguous United States—and, equally significant, the exhibition of photographs of them, played an important part in this cultural work. With its brief coverage of early fairs and its more substantial treatment of two major fairs, this is the most interesting and original chapter of the book. The main photographers featured are two pairs: Frank A. Rinehart and Adolph F. Muhr, and the sisters Mamie and Emma Gerhard. Rinehart and, more importantly, Muhr took numerous portraits and sham battle scenes of the Indians brought to the Trans-Mississippi and International Exposition held at Omaha, Nebraska in 1898. (The mock battles really constituted an up-market version of a wild west show—a feature accentuated in the photographs, which prefigure scenes from the film western—and it is a pity that none of these more problematic images are reproduced.) The Gerhard sisters operated at the Louisiana Purchase Exposition mounted in St Louis in 1904 and made numerous studio portraits of Native American dignitaries, such as Geronimo, as well as of ordinary families hailing from locations as far apart as Alaska and Arizona. Although in the case of Rinehart and Muhr the authors could rely on the published findings of Robert Bigart and Clarence Woodcock, for the Gerhard sisters there was little but the photographic images to go on; it is to be regretted that the sisters were not investigated further.

I have long held that we should take the style of photographic representations into account to the same degree to which we would take the styles of painters into account in coming to an understanding of their views of their subjects. Consequently, for me the book's final chapter, "The Pictorialists," was potentially the most exciting in the book. However, in spite of the correct grouping of the chosen figures—Roland Reed, Joseph Kossuth Dixon, and Edward S. Curtis—under a heading referring to the most important stylistic movement in early twentieth-century artistic photography, there is no mention of any of the aesthetic tenets of pictorialism. These include the domination of one tone throughout a composition, the avoidance of detail in favor of broad masses, or, as the contemporary critic Charles Caffin put it, "looking at objects through a great gauze veil." Perhaps the single most significant strain in pictorialism—if its most elusive one—was, as its very name implies, a stress on the picturesque. This is

a large and intractable topic. Loosely, of course, picturesque means "pretty as a picture." In the picturesque work of Reed, Dixon, and Curtis, there was almost always an effect of completeness and composure, a tendency towards the preferred view, the prospect suitably framed.

Instead of analyzing, or even just characterizing, the work of the pictorialists in this way, *Grand Endeavors* emphasizes descriptions of their work as beautiful, with the bulk of the space given over to accounts of their contact with Indians, as if, indeed, these men were only recording what they saw. Also, it is odd that the book ends with a recounting by Barbara Davis of the Curtis story, when, in terms of chronology and influence, Curtis definitely preceded both Reed, who was an independent, and Dixon, who was subsidized and sponsored by the heir to the Wanamaker department store in Philadelphia. On the latter, in fact, Curtis wrote scathingly to his friend Edmond S. Meany in 1914, "I smile at your suggestion of noble impulses in connection with [Wanamaker and Dixon]. The noblest impulse ever had by that organization was to advertise the Wanamaker stores and make fakey imitations of my pictures" (20 April 1914, Meany Papers, University of Washington Archives, Seattle).

As this Curtis letter implies, for a time Dixon was himself an influential figure. Nonetheless, absolutely no evidence exists to support the claim in *Grand Endeavors* that "it was largely due" to the "ethnographic power" of Dixon's images "that full citizenship was finally granted to the North American Indian in 1924" (p. 107). (In fact, if any photographer had any bearing on the 1924 Citizenship Act, it was Curtis—and his involvement, in turn, was not primarily in the guise of photographer.) Still, it is good to see a treatment of Reed's and Dixon's work—and, even more, reproductions of important images by them—in what will probably become a popular book.

*Grand Endeavors* is certainly a beautifully produced publication which makes available some welcome lesser-known images. It is especially pleasing to see those by Prince Napoleon Bonaparte, even if taken at expositions rather than "in the field." Unfortunately, the text is rarely more than competent. The book treats individuals who could be said to represent the spectrum of photographic activity, from shy, self-taught amateurs, to artists, to semi-industrial entrepreneurs. The time has come to consider whether these contexts had any appreciable effects on the texts produced. A large-scale study of the evolution of photographic

representations of Native Americans based on primary sources could and should still be done, perhaps by several scholars working together. Until such a study is available, scholars, like the general public, must be genuinely grateful to receive the slightly less than grand endeavors of books like this.

*Mick Gidley*

University of Exeter, England

**In the Spirit of the Earth: Rethinking History and Time.** By Calvin Luther Martin. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1992. 176 pages. \$19.95 cloth.

Anyone interested in the personal perspectives and philosophical musings of Calvin Luther Martin should, by all means, read this book. The author wrestles with an inner emptiness, what he calls a "vague, perhaps distinctively male, sense of dissociation from the natural world" (p. 9). His years of wandering through the apparently arid wasteland of academia have failed to ease his soul's hunger, for its resident scientists and historians have failed to pursue what Loren Eiseley called "the real business of the artist," which is "man's salvation" (p. 120).

Martin's spiritual odyssey seems anchored in a deep conflict with his father, a Christian minister who appropriately named his son Calvin Luther. Readers with a Freudian bent would no doubt find ample evidence for analysis by noting Martin's scorn for Pastor Martin, who, his son believes, wasted his life telling "tales in folly" (p. 115)! Indeed, although Martin allegedly reveres Native American culture, he venomously violates a cardinal principle of its tradition: honor and respect for your elders, especially your parents. Still, those who happen to be interested in Martin will understand him better by noting his hostility toward his father.

Beyond those interested in its author, this book might appeal to those who wonder "what if" the world were not as it is, what if primordial pathways could be recovered. Would not the world be better without the technological "progress" of the past several thousand years? What if the shift from hunting and gathering to agriculture had never occurred? This issue has been profoundly discussed by Lewis Mumford in his two-volume study, *The Myth of the Machine*, and given careful analysis by Jacques Ellul in *The*