

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

These People Have Always Been a Republic: Indigenous Electorates in the U.S.- Mexico Borderlands, 1598-1912. By Maurice S. Crandall.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9kx426xs>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 44(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Nelson, John William

Publication Date

2020-06-01

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

is a complete dismantling of the justice system in order to establish a more useful and equitable institution. Many Indigenous scholars advocate similar approaches for all manner of institutions (Billy-Ray Belcourt, Daniel Heath Justice, and Eve Tuck, for example) and, like Starblanket and Hunt, point out that current systems function exactly as they are intended—to exclude Indigenous people.

The process of storying demonstrates how contemporary prairie institutions have been shaped by historic, cultural, geographic, and economic forces. These conditions have shaped Indigenous and settler relations and cemented them into the structural fabric of the legal environment in which Stanley acted and then was tried. The text concludes with appeals to kinship, suggesting that the responsibility to dismantle systemic racism and resist the flattening of knowledge into western institutions is expansive, as is the potential for better outcomes.

Amanda Foote

University of Calgary

These People Have Always Been a Republic: Indigenous Electorates in the U.S.–Mexico Borderlands, 1598–1912. By Maurice S. Crandall. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2019. 372 pages. \$90.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper; \$22.99 electronic.

Native Americans' participation in civil government and their engagement with voter franchise is not simply a modern American story. Covering centuries in his ambitious study, Maurice Crandall examines how Indigenous peoples of the American Southwest and northern Mexico have conducted themselves in representative government from precontact to the contemporary moment. The author offers to corral a "confluence of stories" from various Indigenous peoples and shape it into a cogent history of Native sovereignty and political participation through a succession of colonial regimes in the Southwest (1). Crandall succeeds in this daunting task, analyzing through the lens of citizenship and voting rights how four groups—the Pueblos, Yaquis, Hopis, and Tohono O'odhams—navigated the changing political expectations and opportunities within Spanish, Mexican, and United States administrations.

The book's three sections on the Spanish, Mexican, and American periods of colonization focus on the experiences of these four Indigenous peoples. Crandall further distinguishes between his examinations of Pueblo developments in New Mexico and the experiences of the Yaquis, Hopis, and collective O'odham peoples of the Sonoran-Arizona borderland. A study this broad, covering multiple groups across a range of territory and an eventual international border, necessarily requires hopping between peoples, sites, and eras. While at times this threatens to disorient readers not steeped in the history and peoples of the Southwest, Crandall outlines his study in lucid terms and provides signposts to keep his audience on track. The book also features a series of maps that makes it easier to reorient between geographic zones and time periods.

Crandall's book is manifestly relevant to scholars of the Southwest borderlands and the specific Indigenous peoples he studies, but it also holds value for a wider

audience of historians, legal scholars, and those in Native and Indigenous studies more broadly. Crandall's investigation allows important insight into how Spanish efforts to create Indigenous republics and incorporate Native peoples mapped onto the primary Spanish objective in the borderlands of New Mexico and Pimería Alta—to create taxpaying Indigenous subjects. But he also shows how Native peoples in the region met these colonizing efforts with a variety of responses. Puebloans, already sedentary agrarians with precontact antecedents to republican governance, adopted certain aspects of electoral representation to steer Spanish colonial policy in New Mexico. Hopis violently resisted such structures and may have eliminated members of their community who adopted certain Spanish modes of governance. The Yaquis accepted some Spanish civil government but only to maintain their political autonomy within Sonora. The O'odhams countenanced Spanish missionary activities, but neither directly engaged with Spanish colonial government the way neighboring groups did, nor did they form separate, sovereign República de Indios.

Crandall's examination of the Mexican era likewise presents some significant and surprising historical revelations. It remains an important detail that the Mexican state extended citizenship to Native peoples so early in its national history. Crandall presents this period between 1821–1846 as one of both ambiguity and possibility for Native peoples in the body politic. For instance, in the Río Arriba Rebellion of 1837, Hispano and Indigenous New Mexicans briefly established a multiethnic Cantón and placed José Gonzales—a *genízaro*—at the head of government. But there was also chronic underfunding to support or engage with Native groups in the northern hinterlands and in general, the Mexican state left groups like Hopis and O'odhams to their own devices.

When the United States began advancing claims of suzerainty over the Indigenous peoples of the region in the nineteenth century, the old maxim that excluded Indians from American political society came under fire as Anglo officials debated the status of Pueblos within the territorial government of New Mexico. Further complicating this question of Indigenous citizenship in the United States, Article VIII of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, which ended the US–Mexico War, stipulated that Mexican citizens within ceded territory would become de facto US citizens. At least on paper, this included the Native peoples of the Southwest who had received citizenship recognition from Mexico during the independence movement. Crandall's chapters on the American period show how at the territorial and state level, legal suits during the nineteenth and early twentieth century sought to limit the franchise of Native peoples in Arizona and New Mexico. But he also shows how Indigenous groups at times rejected the franchise “in favor of protecting citizenship” and autonomy within their distinct political communities (220). Native peoples and non-Indigenous advocates saw the acceptance of voting privileges under US auspices as a threat to retaining separate Indigenous sovereignty and collective land rights.

The upshot of this long and complex history through three colonizing regimes is to demonstrate that rather than clear patterns, Native peoples in the region engaged with the political process of franchise and representation in strikingly different ways. Sometimes this included armed resistance, as in the case of the Yaqui Revolt of 1740,

when Native peoples rose up specifically to protect the integrity of an Indigenous electoral system at the local level, free from Jesuit intervention. At other times, it meant forgoing voting rights in order to protect the collective sovereignty and separate identity of Indigenous governance, apart from the American settler state. The one constant in all these actions was that Native peoples strategically adopted, rejected, and modified political structures of the colonizing regimes to best protect their sovereignty.

This work, apart from its significance to the history of voter franchise in North America, also augments a growing body of scholarship about Native peoples' experiences with citizenship across a continent. Alongside studies like Audra Simpson's *Mohawk Interruptus* (2014) or the ongoing work of scholar Holly Guise on Alaska's Native peoples, Crandall's book illuminates the deeper and more varied history of Indigenous peoples' engagement with colonizing polities and their civil governments. Rather than one upward arc of progress towards citizenship, franchise, and equal rights, Crandall shows how over the course of three colonial regimes, Native peoples in the Southwest have navigated the promises and pitfalls of voting with the goal of maintaining their sovereignty above all else. This historicizes the struggle for Indigenous sovereignty and democratic forms of participatory government in deeper time.

Crandall also brings a warranted personal perspective to the project as a member of the Yavapai-Apache Nation. Bookending his far-ranging study with insights from his own family history helps to situate Native peoples' experiences with civil government in the Southwest in both the present and the past. This is a fittingly circular, rather than linear, way to structure a book that shows how Indigenous groups strove to maintain sovereignty and community participation for centuries and will continue to do so well into the future.

John William Nelson
Texas Tech University

Unsettling Native Histories on the Northwest Coast. Edited by Kathryn Bunn-Marcuse and Aldona Jonaitis. Seattle: Bill Holm Center for the Study of Northwest Coast Native Art in association with University of Washington Press. 2020. 334 pages. \$39.95 cloth; \$39.95 electronic.

Given that the apprehension of Northwest Coast Native art is an ever-evolving process, these essays provide readers with an urgently required snapshot of dynamic contemporary strategies. The current and recent projects described here grow in tandem with efforts toward the decolonization of museums, changing methodologies in scholarship, and the production of new artworks that self-consciously foreground Indigenous authority and cultural perspectives. These developments have taken shape in a field that, for some time, has been in the process of coming to terms with colonial histories, the ongoing occupation of Indigenous lands, and the need to acknowledge asymmetrical power relationships between Native and non-Native peoples. *Unsettling Native Histories* is structured in four sections, introduced by Bunn-Marcuse's overview