

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Germans and Indians: Fantasies, Encounters, Projections. Edited by Colin G. Calloway, Gerd Gemünden, and Suzanne Zantop.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/97h8933g>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 27(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Medak-Saltzman, Danika

Publication Date

2003-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

In general, *Frontier Blood* contains a great deal of information on the mentality and ways of life of the inhabitants of the expanding American western frontier during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Exley's extensive research has produced an estimable contribution to the literature on pioneer life and Indian captivities.

Joaquín Rivaya-Martínez
University of California, Los Angeles

Germans and Indians: Fantasies, Encounters, Projections. Edited by Colin G. Calloway, Gerd Gemünden, and Suzanne Zantop. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002. 351 pages. \$29.95 paper.

Who's Indian . . . whose Indian? Examining these, among other questions, this volume is based on the contributions of Native and non-Native authors to a conference on "Deutsch und Indianer/Indianer und Deutsch: Cultural Encounters across Three Centuries" held at Dartmouth the spring of 1999. The chapters were selected and separated into four parts in order to exhibit the progression of the confrontations, imaginings, and histories of these two groups and their ideas of and intertwinings with each other.

Although it might seem questionable to conflate the culture groups and indigenous Nations of an entire continent as "Indian"—which is markedly different from doing the same with a group of people who share the same language as "German"—the chapters in this collection usually employ these categories in a careful manner. Acknowledging the polemical danger of using both the terms *Indian* and *German*, Susanne Zantop, one of the three editors, introduces the historic moments that provided the genesis for this project. Zantop sets the scene for German interest in American Indians before, after, and beyond the writings of Karl May's late nineteenth-century novels about Old Shatterhand, a German hero, and his Apache sidekick, Winnetou. Zantop, like most of the authors in this collection, seems to agree that elements in May's works helped to make Germany, and the German consciousness, a fertile ground for what Hartmut Lutz calls "Indianthusiasm." Lutz articulates this term in his contribution to this volume as "a yearning for all things Indian, a fascination with American Indians, [and] a romanticizing about a supposed Indian essence" (p. 168). Although enchantment with the Indian, whether as a noble savage or a savage warrior, was by no means unique in Europe to Germany with the "discovery of the New World," the blossoming of Indianthusiasm after World War II within East and West Germany is especially interesting. The chapters that analyze this phenomenon are some of the most stimulating in this collection.

In her introduction, Zantop asks the reader to bear in mind that, while categories such as "Indian" and "German" can conjure up stereotypical images, we must not allow these binaries to color the historic and contemporary realities that these groups faced. Rather, one should examine the situation through "careful nuanced study" (p. 5). Thus, the goal of the editors in

organizing both a conference on Germans and American Indians, as well as this resultant publication, becomes clear. And it seems fair to suggest that any disjointedness that might appear in a chapter, beyond that inherent in the nature of any edited collection, might well be due to the untimely death of Zantop herself and her vision for this collection.

Excerpts from fictional works that include Indian and German characters written by Native authors Emma Lee Warrior and Louise Erdrich are used to frame the more traditional scholarly chapters of this collection, most of which are contributions by non-Native writers. These bookends of creative fiction might at first appear to be a useful technique of exhibiting how German characters are portrayed in Indian novels. However, their placement at the start and finish of this collection, together with the inclusion of few articles written by other Indians, leads the reader to wonder why more Native scholars are not taking the German-Indian connection to task. Perhaps one can conclude that such explorations are of more interest to non-Native peoples interested in understanding their desire to know the Other. Conversely, it might be that solicitations for participation aren't reaching their targeted Native audiences. Whatever the reason, this near silence requires a closer inspection.

The short contribution of Yurok filmmaker Marta Carlson asks some pointed questions about the German fascination with "playing Indian." Drawing on her fieldwork, documenting the appropriation of American Indian culture and spirituality by German Indian hobbyists and their clubs, Carlson explores how East and West Germans have played Indian in fascinatingly different ways. In the chapter immediately following Carlson's, Katrin Sieg explores this topic further. As these two chapters explain, East German hobbyism takes a more scholarly approach to the study of Indians, which includes an interest in contemporary Indian issues; in contrast, the West German groups focus on emulating and reenacting what they view as the golden age of the Indians. Although Carlson asks whether the activities in East or West Germany are simply "making entertainment out of genocide" (p. 215), she suggests that neither of these branches of Indian impersonators can honestly feign blindness with regard to the racial implications of their hobbies. Both Carlson and Sieg allude to Renato Rosaldo's concept of "Imperialist Nostalgia" (see Rosaldo's book *Culture and Truth*, 1989)—a longing for a pure precolonialized culture by those who have participated in that culture's purposeful and irrevocable alteration. The analysis of Alaskan Native scholar Shari Huhndorf in her book *Going Native* (2001), while not examining the German case in particular, provides an interesting in-depth look at the implications and historic reasoning behind attempts at "going native." It would be a worthwhile project to develop a lens for analyzing the specificity of "going native" in the German case. This is especially true because, as Hartmut Lutz states, "for Germans, aware of the nation's racist history, casting themselves as the friends of Indians and feeling empathetic to Native American political causes provides an ahistorical and guilt-free ideological realm, far removed from the more depressing aspect of German reality past and present" (p. 169).

The chapter by Colin Calloway, another of the collection's editors, discusses Germans and Indians through, as its title indicates, their "Historic

Encounter across Five Centuries.” Although Calloway is only able to touch lightly upon the details of specific instances, he allows the reader to piece together some intriguing historical facts. This is perhaps best exemplified by the discussion of Franz Boas. Often touted as one of the fathers of American anthropology, Boas’ work dealt primarily with the Natives of the Northwest coast, yet the German public—Boas’ countrymen—still imagined “real Indians” to be Natives from the Great Plains. One might infer from other chapters in this collection that this was the result of the Wild West shows that were touring Europe during the period of Boas’ publications. However, when a group of Bella Coola (peoples native to the Northwest coast) toured Germany in 1885 (*before* Buffalo Bill began taking groups of Indians to Europe) the German “press frequently pointed out that they did not look like Indians were supposed to look” (p. 71). Obviously, for better or worse, ideas of what an Indian was “supposed” to look like were already firmly established in the minds of many people. As Calloway illustrates, a variety of people from as many backgrounds traveled into Indian country, and “[t]heir recorded impressions regularly display the biases, prejudice, and cultural myopia of their times as they projected their own interpretations and values onto Indian America” (p. 63). Such observations underscore the point that information about Indians was being collected and distributed throughout Europe in many forms—sketches, paintings, or (tall) tales, images and imaginings—long before the “Show Indians” set foot off the boats themselves.

Gerd Gemünden and Renate Eigenbrod focus on film and literature, respectively, in their chapters. Gemünden, the third editor of the publication, explores the portrayals of Indians in films produced primarily in East Germany and their political implications. “[T]he fate of the North American Indians provided a showcase of what it means to be a victim of capitalist expansion, the consequences of which can range from unequal trade, theft, and deceit to willful starvation, random murder, and organized genocide” (p. 245). Interestingly enough, “the films make an effort to deflect any connections to recent German history” (p. 249). Eigenbrod’s exploration of the portrayal of German characters in three Canadian First Nation’s novels provides a unique look into the process of engaging with and relating to a cultural Other. Both of these chapters provide intriguing readings of artistic texts and the political nature of the way these genres have been used. Eigenbrod uses the words of Wendy Rose, a Native poet and scholar, to provide a glimpse of the power dynamic that is intrinsically linked to any exploration of German and Indian intertwinement. Rose writes, “[t]he roots of colonized people are grasped firmly but blindly by the rootless in order to achieve some kind of stability, however superficial and delusional” (p. 277).

Whether we see the rootless as settlers in the “New World,” or as the escapist Indian impersonators described by Lutz, or even disregard the notion entirely, will perhaps depend on which of the chapters in this collection one has just finished reading.

Danika Medak-Saltzman

University of California, Berkeley

Grave Injustice: The American Indian Repatriation Movement and NAGPRA.

By Kathleen S. Fine-Dare. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2002. 250 pages. \$60.00 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

Author Kathleen S. Fine-Dare's *Grave Injustice* is the fourth volume in a series of contemporary ethnographies from the University of Nebraska Press entitled *Fourth World Rising*. The series is designed for classroom use and a general audience in order to "change the public perception of native struggle" by presenting contemporary issues that hold "practical and theoretical implications" for understanding more general cultural and political processes (p. ix). In addition to a concern with the misperception of Native people as timeless, the book addresses a more complex issue: the argument against Native homogeneity. This call for attention to "internal differentiation among native peoples" is a major theoretical thrust of the both the series and this work in particular. Rather than looking at these "splits" in Native communities as "simple factionalism" along lines of traditionalists or progressives, the series editors argue for the model of a changing "social matrix" of Native communities that work "within and against" the dominant society (p. 195). The complexity of NAGPRA (the context, development, implementation and compliance to the 1990 federal law: the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act) is presented as a means to understanding how political struggles can productively use models of differentiation, not unity.

The text consists of two sections: "The Historical and Legal Contexts of the Repatriation Movement" and "Interpretation, Compliance, and Problems of NAGPRA." As if predicting the objections of readers to her devoting half of the work to the "actions and motivations of nineteenth-century European scientists" rather than "the ways the world-view and attitudes they institutionalized . . . have been addressed, contested, resisted and revised" (p. 113), Fine-Dare argues that understanding how Native American human remains and objects were acquired "has everything to do with the discussions about their return" (p. 51). The historical section adequately addresses most of the ways in which the military, scientific institutions, the academy, and museums justified the systematic acquisition of Native American human remains and cultural objects (for example, manifest destiny, world's fair exhibits, and evolutionary theory). However, this analysis lacks the engagement that characterizes the author's firsthand experience described in the second section, which deals with repatriation case studies and their theoretical implications as "dense symbol(s) laden with deep layers of cultural meanings" (p. 8).

Fine-Dare's historical examination draws heavily from standard sources that are readily available in their full format, and her writing here appears rather uneven in its scope and references. A highlight of this section is the description of varying notions of Native identity (inserted after a discussion on the Wounded Knee massacre and before an example of the Dawes Act) titled "'Being Indian' in the United States" (pp. 53–58). Here, the various definitions of identity—such as race, minority, special status (noble, victims, savages), sovereign entities, legal designations, and even the racial hatred informing the notion of "Indians as deserving of negative treatment"—