

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Turning Adversity to Advantage: A History of the Lipan Apaches of Texas and Northern Mexico, 1700-1900. By Nancy McGown Minor.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/97845250>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(2)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Rivaya-Martínez, Joaquín

### Publication Date

2011-03-01

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

and encouraging. However, the cumulative work begs a number of questions: What are the implications of having the discourse on Native people from North America expand to include scholars from across the ocean? What might a growing interest in Native North Americans among non-North Americans mean for the future of the field? On a more practical level, what kind of sources do they use? What do they choose to discuss? The editors might have done more to bring some of these questions to the fore.

Although Kinbacher's conclusion (playfully titled "Beginnings") succinctly outlines the book's overarching value, the editors could have tried harder to establish a coherent theme. It is never quite clear what they are trying to reconfigure or why anything needs to be reconfigured in the first place. Moreover, given the wide range of topics and quality of scholarship, the book's intended audience is not entirely clear. Ultimately, the strength of the book rises and falls with the quality of its individual essays. In this case, the sum is perhaps weaker than the individual parts.

*Douglas K. Miller*  
University of Oklahoma

**Turning Adversity to Advantage: A History of the Lipan Apaches of Texas and Northern Mexico, 1700–1900.** By Nancy McGown Minor. Lanham, MD: University Press of America. 242 pages. \$59.95 cloth; \$34.00 paper.

In this book, Nancy McGown Minor, tribal historian of the Lipan Apache Tribe of Texas, conscientiously attempts to reconstruct the vicissitudes of the different Lipan bands and related Apache groups that roamed across the South Plains and northeastern Mexico prior to 1900. Throughout the book, but most significantly in the last few chapters, the author carries out a painstaking effort to trace the particular stories of Lipan bands in order to establish their actual connections with several contemporary groups whose members claim Lipan ancestry.

The first two-thirds of the book narrate the changing relationship between the Lipans and the Spanish of Texas and northeastern Mexico, a relationship that was significantly conditioned by the relentless southward expansion of the Comanche Indians across the central and south plains at the expense of the Lipans and other Eastern Apache groups throughout the eighteenth century. As a consequence of the Comanche encroachment, the Lipans lost control of most of the south plains by 1760. Minor chronicles Lipan raids against Hispanic settlements in detail. Seemingly, Lipan behavior toward the Spanish-controlled communities and peoples of colonial Texas depended largely on

opportunistic ad hoc decisions. Similarly, Spanish policies toward the Lipans changed across time and space as a result of particular military and economic conjunctures. Moreover, the implementation of such policies was occasionally subject to the peculiar idiosyncrasies of the individual officials in command. Still, Minor recognizes an overall shift in Spanish attitudes toward the Lipans over time, from the execution of purportedly retaliatory campaigns largely aimed at obtaining Lipan captives and plunder, only occasionally interrupted by temporary truces and trading encounters, which characterized the first half of the eighteenth century, to the painstaking but ultimately failing Spanish attempts at missionizing the Lipans that began during the 1750s. In the end, though, such attempts earned Spaniards the antagonism of the Norteños (that is, the “Northerners,” a generic term for the Indians who lived north of Spanish Texas, including the Comanche, the Wichita, and other groups). The Norteño menace, in turn, compelled Spanish authorities to ally with the Comanches and Wichitas against the Lipans during the 1780s. Minor connects the Lipan-Spanish peace of 1749 to 1751 with the emergence of tribal divisions among the Lipans. She also argues that the continuous Lipan raids of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries were, in part, a reaction to the merciless campaigns of Juan de Ugalde against the Apaches between 1779 and 1790.

The final third of the book explores the roles of the Lipans in the Texas wars for independence, first from Spain, and then from Mexico, between 1800 and 1836, as well as the constant movements of Lipan groups across the Texas-Mexico border region in their attempts to raid with impunity or to flee the military campaigns launched against them by US and Mexican authorities during the central decades of the nineteenth century. Those campaigns turned into an overt annihilation war fought intermittently during the 1870s and early 1880s that brought the Lipan population to its nadir. Contrary to earlier scholars’ assumptions that all surviving Lipans had taken refuge in US reservations by the 1890s, some Lipan remnants subsisted in the Santa Rosa Mountains of Coahuila, while others amalgamated into Texan and Mexican communities. The final chapter discusses the attempts to obtain recognition by several contemporary groups that claim descent from the Lipans. So far, only the Lipan Apache Tribe of Texas, the one with which the author associates, has obtained state recognition in Texas, whereas none of those groups has achieved federal recognition yet.

For an author who is not a “professional” historian, the praiseworthy meticulousness of the archival research behind this book is surprising. Minor uses a wide array of primary sources, particularly for the Spanish colonial period, which include the Bexar Archives, as well as copies of numerous documents from Spanish and Mexican repositories available at the Center for American History at the University of Texas at Austin. For the nineteenth century,

Minor also relies on a variety of English-language documents, including Indian agents' and army officers' reports. The author also utilizes Lipan oral traditions and secondary ethnographic and historiographic sources. Perhaps Minor's discussion of issues such as gender or ethnogenesis would have been richer if she had incorporated some recent scholarly works about the Indians of Texas and northern Mexico.

Although the thorough documentation of significant events and processes in Lipan history constitutes the most salient strength of Minor's work, the book is, at times, lacking in interpretation—so much so, that some excerpts read almost as a chronological report of relevant events in Lipan history. This contrasts with the more nuanced discussion of Lipan history in Thomas A. Britten's *The Lipan Apaches: People of Wind and Lightning* (2009), which is not as rich in details as Minor's book, particularly with regard to the Spanish and Mexican periods and sources. Both works complement each other in this sense.

Some of Minor's analyses are questionable. Her identifications of particular Lipan bands in the documentary record seem more plausible for the late eighteenth century and the second half of the nineteenth century than in other times, which is probably a direct consequence of the differential quantity and quality of the sources available for each period. The author fails to acknowledge that the Comanche term *Esikwita* was also applied to the Mescalero Apaches, rather than just the Lipans (3). She has a tendency to attribute to Lipans the actions of Indian groups whose exact ethnic identity is not explicitly stated in the sources. In other instances, Minor relies on one single contemporary testimony for such ascriptions. For example, the 1844 Indian raid of La Palmita, Nuevo León, which cost the lives of more than eighty residents and resulted in the capture of several dozen women and children, was most likely a Comanche incursion (149–50). A few of Minor's interpretations seem farfetched: for instance, that the 1772 marriage of Comanche leader Povea to two daughters of Lipan leader Boruca amounted to severing “an entire Comanche band” from the intertribal coalition that fought the Lipans (76). More likely, such intermarriages contributed to establishing peaceful relations only between the particular bands involved, rather than with whole ethnic groups. Similarly, Minor's reference to life in Spanish missions as “slavery” is disputable (30).

The book includes five maps in which the author identifies the approximate locations of Lipan groups as well as some relevant sites. The quality of the maps, however, is rather poor. They are partially handwritten, and do not always provide all the relevant geographical information for the period at stake. Some Spanish words are consistently misspelled throughout the book (for example, the use of *Costalites* instead of *Costalitos* to refer to an important

Lipan leader of the 1870s), although this may reflect distortions of the names that appear in the original sources.

All in all, Minor has produced a thorough chronicle of the Lipan Apaches between 1700 and 1900 that will be a helpful reference for further research. Some of Minor's interpretations, however, remain open to debate.

Joaquín Rivaya-Martínez

Texas State University–San Marcos

**Uncommon Defense: Indian Allies in the Black Hawk War.** By John W. Hall. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2009. 384 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Three books about the Black Hawk War have recently appeared: Kerry Trask's *Black Hawk: The Battle for the Heart of America* (2006), Patrick Jung's *The Black Hawk War of 1832* (2008), and now *Uncommon Defense* by John W. Hall, the Ambrose-Hesseltine Assistant Professor of History at the University of Wisconsin–Madison. The book's subtitle refers to four Great Lakes Indian tribes that, for their own reasons, fought Black Hawk's British Band of Sauk and Mesquakie Indians in 1832. The tribes examined include the Dakotas, Ho-Chunks, Menominees, and Potawatomis. Hall seeks to place the Black Hawk War in a longer historical context of intertribal alliances between Great Lakes tribes and an external European power in need of Native manpower. The author observes that other accounts begin their Black Hawk War histories with the 1804 land-cession treaty in which the Sac and Fox (or Sauk and Mesquakie) Indians ceded a vast tract of land in present-day Illinois; by contrast, in *Uncommon Defense* he proposes to trace the roots of the conflict back to the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Two good chapters, "Roots of Conflict" and "A New Onontio," tell the history of competing intertribal alliances with the French and British in the western Great Lakes, but then the author directs the narrative not just to 1804 but also to the 1820s, and soon enough to 1832 and the battles of the Black Hawk War. Jung has thoroughly covered this ground in his book, including the service of Potawatomi and Ho-Chunk scouts and Menominee and Dakota soldiers during the last phase of the war. Trask does a superior job of placing the Sauk and Mesquakie Indian warrior ethic into a larger history of manhood and masculinity. In this reviewer's opinion, *Uncommon Defense* might have made one good, long journal article or two shorter ones, and not a monograph.

Hall writes that some of the tribes perceived that the military alliance with the United States was not reciprocated on the part of the so-called Great Father, the American president. Andrew Jackson proved an unreliable partner to the