

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Assassination of Hole in the Day. By Anton Treuer.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/96h8g9r3>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Gagnon, Gregory

Publication Date

2012-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

requires process and stasis to be thought of theoretically together. Defining culture or authenticity as unchanging prevents people from shaping their own identity” (32). Yet surely those studies that define “culture or authenticity as unchanging” or refuse to acknowledge tradition and modernity in the making of identity are outdated.

Despite its tendency to overdramatize the uniqueness of its claims, and to read somewhat like a dissertation, *Aleut Identities* is an important contribution to the anthropological literature of Alaska, the North, and fishing communities generally. Reedy-Maschner argues that “the relative absence of publications and research on the Aleut . . . contributes to many contemporary problems that Aleuts face” (9). If true, then perhaps this work will do more than simply update the record of scholarly work on the Aleut. Perhaps it will help the Aleut people navigate a quickly changing world in which their very identity as commercial fishers (and Aleuts) will be challenged by a vast array of new obstacles.

David Arnold

Columbia Basin College

The Assassination of Hole in the Day. By Anton Treuer. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2011. 295 pages. \$25.95 cloth; \$17.95 paper.

Hole in the Day the Younger (1828–68) was a major Ojibwa (Chippewa) leader who shaped Ojibwa, Minnesota, and US history. Yet this is the first major study of his place in Ojibwa history. Anton Treuer’s *Hole in the Day* (Bagone-giizhig) is multidimensional, revealed as an Ojibwa leader who alternately opposed and supported American policies; insisted on traditional relationships, but carved out his power in a radical departure from tradition; embraced wealth and self-enhancement; and often duped other Ojibwa into doing his bidding. Pictures of Hole in the Day show a striking figure wearing the otter turban of a traditional *ogima* (civic band leader), the eagle feathers of a warrior, and the tailored suit of an American man of means. Hated and feared by many, a leader unlike many Ojibwa had ever had, Hole in the Day was the embodiment of what a leader needed to be in order to negotiate the turmoil of the mid-nineteenth century.

Treuer begins his narrative with the assassination of Hole in the Day in 1868 by eleven, possibly fourteen, Leech Lake Ojibwa Band members. The assassination was widely reported throughout the United States because Hole in the Day had captured the imagination of the American public. Along with contemporary news, official Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) reactions, and oral

traditions, a 1911 investigation confirmed who killed Hole in the Day. Well-known to scholars, these same sources identify three traders who hired the assassins and secondary conspirators.

Treuer's contribution embeds Hole in the Day in the context of a rapidly changing, challenged Ojibwa world. He describes the traditional clan-based consensus government, with village leaders coming from three different sources: the hereditary civil leaders (*ogima*), warriors, and Midewiwin religion. Villages were independent although cooperative with one another. No Ojibwa had civil leadership of a region or multiple villages.

However, during the nineteenth century several factors led to a major change in leadership patterns: American demand for land and resources, the Dakota wars, and the development of a mixed-blood, exploitative merchant class in the Chippewa world. Two men named Hole in the Day, father and son, developed a new leadership that stressed regions, not villages, and sought a common political control. They gained power by asserting military prowess, proving Midewiwin legitimacy, and neatly sidestepping the hereditary requirement for civil leadership. Hole in the Day the Elder accomplished this by founding new communities and cultivating the Americans. Hole in the Day the Younger expanded on his father's power and leadership through the same process. Treuer asserts that the two leaders revolutionized Ojibwa leadership. Offering a somewhat different view is Cary Miller's *Ogimaag: Anishinaabeg Leadership, 1760–1845* (2010). Emphasizing the continuity between traditional and adaptive leadership through the important kinship ties, Miller points out that both Holes in the Day married daughters of prominent, hereditary leaders to justify their leadership.

Although Bagone-giizhig the Younger is the focus of Treuer's book, the father laid the foundation for the son, and Treuer might well have argued that Hole in the Day the Elder (c. 1800–46) was the true innovator in Ojibwa leadership style and substance. After establishing his military prowess, the Elder founded the Gull Lake village and several others in 1836. He trumpeted his leadership for the entire region, even of Crow Wing, a mixed community. Regional leadership was unique for the Chippewa, and he continued Chippewa territorial expansion southward. Because he exerted major influence on the treaties of 1837 and 1842, he was widely recognized by the Americans as the most influential Chippewa chief. He died at the height of the authority he created, and left it and his name to his son.

The Elder Hole in the Day carefully trained the Younger. He taught him the value of being a warrior and supervised his first scalping of a Dakota when the Younger was eleven. The Elder also taught his son to use a combination of threats and support to keep American respect and reinforced the importance of a leader being able to reward his followers with annuities from the treaties.

The Elder and the Younger assumed important roles in the Midewiwin religion, another facet of Ojibwa leadership. By the time of the Elder's death in 1847 following an accident, the Younger was ready to lead not only the several villages of the Gull Lake Band but also the Minnesota Chippewa. Perhaps apocryphally, the Elder was quoted by multiple sources as passing his leadership on with the words, "Take the tribe by the hand. Show them how to walk" (81).

The Younger worked hard to lead the entire tribe. Treuer offers a multifaceted description of the Younger's career in the context of Ojibwa politics, trader machinations, American land and resource demands, and the Dakota-Chippewa war. With access to culture keepers throughout Ojibwa country, Treuer has been compiling his research for decades, drawing on extensive published sources and oral histories that, perhaps, only an Ojibwa who speaks the language can utilize. Treuer traces the evolution of Chippewa societies from their golden age of independence, wealth, and continuing conquest of Minnesota to domination by an American presence that determined much of the framework of Ojibwa lives through treaties. Bagone-giizhig negotiated with the Dakota and threatened war with the United States as the Dakota Conflict developed. During the war, he cleverly avoided being arrested by surrounding the military, BIA agent, and commissioner of Indian Affairs with more than two hundred warriors. According to Treuer, Hole in the Day maneuvered to assert control of the Chippewa, oppose the many exploitative traders, and speak to the many grievances of the Chippewa. He also made sure that he received "chief's payments" from treaties. He was a constant at treaty discussions and even went so far as to offer to work on behalf of the Americans before the negotiations that led the Pembina and Red Lake bands to sell the Red River Valley. He was also a violent brawler and used his warriors to intimidate. The world he lived in was unique, and so was Bagone-giizhig.

Mixed-bloods expanded their importance during the treaty era. Treuer echoes existing scholarship in identifying two types of mixed-bloods: those who were part of Ojibwa society and those who, as many would have it, were only Ojibwa when annuities or other benefits like land allotments were available. Treuer described this latter group as the "enemy within" (145). They freely exploited Chippewa people, connived at land theft, and were opposed by the Younger, in particular. The enmity was mutual.

The United States created White Earth Reservation in 1867 with the intent to consolidate all of the Chippewa on a single Minnesota reservation, with the exception of Red Lake. Bagone-giizhig used all of the maneuvers he could to oppose this relocation because this removal would have ended his power. Despite Hole in the Day's active opposition, a number of Chippewa were ordered, pressured, and lured into beginning the removal from their

reservations to White Earth. Hole in the Day set off for Washington to insist on a new treaty, but he was assassinated.

Treuer correctly concludes that a number of individuals feared the influence of the volatile, charismatic leader who could gather several hundred warriors to support his opposition. These individuals, prominent mixed-blood and non-Indian traders and profiteers, conspired against the Chippewa leader, abetted by American officials. According to Treuer, the traders staged a *coup d'état*, and he offers ample evidence to support his thesis (184). Treuer blames these "enemies within" for the terrible aftermath of the assassination of Hole in the Day. Ojibwa leadership declined, and the mixed-blood trader cabal took over the reservation, precipitating what Melissa Meyer has documented as *The White Earth Tragedy* (1994).

The Assassination of Hole in the Day is a major contribution to American Indian history. Treuer has provided an Ojibwa perspective in terms understandable to students of American history and that will enrich Ojibwa history. Perhaps he overemphasizes the importance of Hole in the Day as the last obstacle to the terrible exploitation that impoverished the Ojibwa, but it is only a matter of degree. After the death of Hole in the Day, there were no effective leaders who had a chance to counter the robber barons of Minnesota.

Gregory Gagnon

University of North Dakota

Bridging the Divide: Indigenous Communities and Archaeology into the 21st Century. Edited by Caroline Phillips and Harry Allen. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press, 2011. 290 pages. \$79.00 cloth; \$34.95 paper.

This edited volume is an outcome of the Second Indigenous Inter-Congress of the World Archaeological Congress held in New Zealand during 2005. Most of the chapters deal with indigenous peoples and, more often than not, nonindigenous archaeologists living and working in the Pacific. Questions examined include: Who has rights to assign meanings to the past? Why don't indigenous people embrace archaeology? Why are there not more indigenous archaeologists? What difficulties do indigenous archaeologists face? How can we change the way we approach and utilize archaeology, so that indigenous archaeology avoids becoming marginalized?

Don't read this book expecting to find answers. However, you will find many useful examples of how archaeologists and indigenous peoples are increasingly working together, while realizing that the pasts we discover, interpret, and tell