UC Santa Barbara
UC Santa Barbara Previously Published Works

Title
J ohn W arne M onroe . Metropolitan Fetish: African Sculpture and the Imperial French Invention of Primitive Art .

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/96b7p1qv

Journal
The American Historical Review, 126(1)

ISSN
0002-8762

Author
Bloom, Peter J

Publication Date
2021-03-01

DOI
10.1093/ahr/rhab119

Peer reviewed

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

tlement colony in French Guiana. The experiment was a dismal failure, as Europeans succumbed to disease just as they did in Africa. The directory would revive the idea of settling West Africa, but this plan, too, was diverted—this time to Egypt, with equal lack of success.

The islands were not easy to handle, as the physiocratic intendant of Martinique, Le Mercier de la Rivière, discovered in the 1760s. Corruption was rampant. There were conflicts between the merchants in privileged French ports and the planters, who resented their inability to obtain food supplies and other basic goods from nearby British or Dutch possessions. Indebtedness and lack of specie were perennial concerns. Grievances against the mother country mounted. Choiseul loosened the Exclusif, allowing for some free ports and granted planters a dominant voice in colonial councils. Slavery, however, was there to stay, until its abolition in 1794—and reinstatement by Napoleon in 1802.

An abolitionist movement had mushroomed in Britain and France, calling for an end to the slave trade, envisioning a gradual demise of slavery itself, without the courage to demand it outright. Rather than recognizing its ideological ties to the physiocrats, the Société des amis des noirs preferred to look to Britain for inspiration, a mistake that cost some members their lives during the revolution. Yet it was the legacy of physiocracy that led to the continued prominence of agriculture in French colonial thinking. Agriculture, since M8irabeau *père*—and repeated enthusiastically by the comte de Mirabeau, his son, during the revolution—was associated with humanism and the spread of "civilization." Freemen working on the land would become property owners, imbued with strong moral values. These ideas became so prominent in Western thinking that the period between 1780 and 1830 has come to be viewed as a separate phase of informal "agrarian" imperialism. History, Pernille Røge tells us, is not just a series of breaks but displays continuities. It is important to pay them heed because, like the physiocratic land-centered project, they go underground and then reemerge, showing how deeply they had penetrated the Zeitgeist.

Liana Vardi
University at Buffalo, SUNY

John Warne Monroe. *Metropolitan Fetish: African Sculpture and the Imperial French Invention of Primitive Art*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2019. Pp. xi, 349. Cloth $45.00.

In *Metropolitan Fetish: African Sculpture and the Imperial French Invention of Primitive Art*, John Warne Monroe asks an important question in the introduction to this well-researched monograph: "Why has 'primitive art' proved to be such a durable Western aesthetic category?" (13). By "primitive art," he is primarily referring to African sculpture that became integral to the invention of twentieth-century modernist art associated with Parisian artistic and avant-garde movements. While the geographic expanse of "primitive art" in France was mostly collected during the era of the French colonial Empire under the Third Republic (1870–1940), the analytic underpinnings of its history and aesthetic claims have been part of an extensive critical literature since the 1980s, but renewed in recent work by Yaëlle Biro and Z. S. Strother in particular. Chapters 2–5 are primarily organized around collectors, curators, ethnologists, and market makers, which incorporates significant archival research by reference to less well-known Parisian archives that includes the archives of Alain Bouret, Guy Ladrière, and Louis Carré. The introductory chapter begins with the pre–World War I context for African art exemplified in Pablo Picasso's early work, starting with *Les Demoiselles d'Avignon* (1907) and *Tête de femme* (1908), which reference an important Fang *Ngil* mask from present-day Gabon that sold in 2006 at the Hôtel Drouot auction house for €5.9 million (20, 25–26). The dealers, collectors, curators, ethnographers, and experts described throughout the volume demonstrate historical shifts in conceptualizing African art as a fetish and cultural inheritance from *art nègre* to value-laden claims of provenance and authenticity.

The historical nomenclature of *art nègre* is used to describe African art exhibited and collected just prior to, during, and after World War I. Henri Clouzot and André Level were among the early figures who organized some of the first auctions of African art. They are positioned within a discourse of connoisseurship in association with Guillaume Apollinaire and Joseph Brummer (chap. 2). But the core of the monograph (chap. 3) and the most compelling discussion in the volume examines the activities of Paul Guillaume, a rogue-like art dealer, tastemaker, and exhibition organizer. Guillaume's working life began at an automobile showroom where he displayed an African sculpture that was noticed by Apollinaire and Brummer, who helped launch his newly found career promoting African art in a poetic register of connoisseurship. The narrative arc of the monograph points to an important shift from *art nègre* to an emerging ethnographic aesthetic associated with *art primitif*, marked by the significant work of Georges Henri Rivière (chap. 4). Rivière's work has been well documented, but his role in relation to the Surrealist movement is positioned as a shift toward museum ethnology. While the important American patron and collector Albert C. Barnes plays a supporting role, particularly in relation to Guillaume, his influence carries over to an extensive discussion of Charles Ratton in the chapter to follow (chap. 5). Ratton's contribution to Nancy Cunard's *Negro* anthology (1934) and contribution to the 1935 MoMA *African*

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ahr/article/126/1/271/6244175 by University of California, Santa Barbara user on 12 October 2023

Negro Art exhibition curated by James Johnson Sweeney serve as more contemporary and credible credentials culminating in his role as African art expert with the publication of *Masques africains* (1931). Monroe, in fact, describes him as *commissaire-priseur*, or expert auctioneer and appraiser. His expertise was developed within a market dynamic for promoting African art through carefully orchestrated auctions and exhibitions with illustrated catalogues in association with New York-based patrons and collectors. In chapter 6, Monroe describes the shift from *art nègre* to an emphasis on authenticity and value in the market for African art. The featuring of well-known African writers, such as Léopold Sédar Senghor, artists, such as Jean Dado, and colonial administrators actively engaged in promoting a humanist vision of African art finally culminates in the creation of the Maisons des Artisans (1932) as a French art school in Bamako, Mali, and the Institut français d'Afrique noire (IFAN) museum (1936) in Dakar. In a short conclusion, Monroe returns to some of the lingering questions asked in the introduction regarding the status of African art within the terms of the "primitive" and "fetish." He writes that he has "sought to reveal the importance of this commercial dimension [of the market for African art], and the uncanny way it has of making theoretical notions of otherness seem real" (294). Monroe has sought to demonstrate how the market shapes "aesthetic perception."

There is some predictability to this story of African art between Paris and New York that references many well-known sources and the negative critique of the French colonial system of aesthetic value that was a significant feature of scholarship from the 1980s to 2000s. But there is a richness to the detailed rendering of particular figures, especially the Dorian Gray–like portraiture of Paul Guillaume. The monograph concludes with a flair in the recounting of a short unfinished story by a scholar and member of the Musée de l'homme—Société des amis du Musée d'ethnographie du Trocadéro—during the 1920s. This story then segues into a 2016 restitution case resulting in the return to the Republic of Benin of a significant collection of Fon treasures that belonged to King Béhanzin of Dahomey, which was taken to France in 1904. Before being returned, items from the collection were exhibited in French national museums, including the Louvre and the Musée du quai Branly. Monroe concludes by claiming that this case, among others like it, may in fact point to the last stand of an already embattled French civilizational paradigm such that the return of these works among others may allow the objects themselves to resonate aesthetically from their point of origin. The quality of the research is excellent, but I remain unconvinced by Monroe's optimism regarding the justice that restitution implies. This might, in fact, be the subject of another article that I hope to write, for which I will cite and thank Monroe for his truly enriching monograph.

Peter J. Bloom
University of California, Santa Barbara

Sasha D. Pack. *The Deepest Border: The Strait of Gibraltar and the Making of the Modern Hispano-African Borderland*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2019. Pp. xiv, 342. Cloth $70.00.

In 1867, the *Quaker City* called at the port of Gibraltar, carrying American passengers on an excursion to the Holy Land, eager, following their transatlantic crossing, to disembark and explore the city. Among the passengers was Samuel Clemens, who, in *Innocents Abroad*, described both Gibraltar and its sibling Tangier as exotic, cosmopolitan spaces. Clemens reserved his strongest orientalist language for Tangier, which he described as "a foreign land if ever there was one, and the true spirit of it can never be found in any book save *The Arabian Nights*" (quoted on 40). One element that seems to have contributed to Clemens's orientalizing depiction was the ethnoreligious diversity of the cities anchoring what Sasha D. Pack terms the "trans-Gibraltar" borderland. Indeed, Pack suggests that this cosmopolitanism was in part a product of the borderland dynamic that defined this zone in the late nineteenth century. In his second monograph, *The Deepest Border: The Strait of Gibraltar and the Making of the Modern Hispano-African Borderland*, Pack focuses on a cluster of cities, including Tangier, Gibraltar, Tétouan, Ceuta, and Melilla, all located on the Strait of Gibraltar and the narrow Sea of Alborán, separating southern Spain from North Africa. Tracing political, military, economic, and social developments across the long century from 1850 to 1970, Pack employs the conceptual framework of borderlands history to analyze a series of shifts that led from the region being one of fluid and exploitable borders to a zone characterized by hardened, less porous boundaries. Pack's objective in this study is to examine "the development of a multilateral regional order in the Hispano-African borderland over a long historical period" (6).

The Deepest Border is composed of three parts, each structured chronologically and exploring a particular set of themes across its constituent chapters. Part 1, "From Shatter Zone to Borderland, 1850–1900," elucidates the conditions that coalesced by around 1850 to create a region characterized by "multiple borders and diverse imperial claims" (2). Part 2, "Between Borderland and Empire, 1900–1939," traces the careers of several "slipstream potentates" on both sides of the strait who were able to exploit this "plurisovereign environment" (162) in their political entrepreneurship. In this section, Pack also offers a recontextualization of several significant conflicts, including the Great War, the Rif War (1921–26), and the Spanish Civil War.

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ahr/article/126/1/271/6244175 by University of California, Santa Barbara user on 12 October 2023