

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Captives and Cousins: Slavery, Kinship, and Community in the Southwest Borderlands. By James F. Brooks

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9570m2dh>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Blackhawk, Ned

**Publication Date**

2004

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ments and experimental qualities of contemporary Native theater. The anthology ends with production histories and performance notes. Particularly helpful in describing the dramaturgical process of staging her work are Glancy's notes about the workshopping process for *Jump Kiss*. She first describes rehearsals for a staged reading on 10 March 2001, by Native Voices at the Autry in Los Angeles, directed by Dolores Apollonia Chavez, who also played the lead; then further recounts the later workshopping with dramaturge Jean Bruce Scott and director Randy Reinholz as the piece moved towards its world premiere in 2002. In the staged production for Native Voices, *Jump Kiss* was reworked dramatically to include a Narrator, Narrator's younger self, Sister; Brother, her brother as a young boy; Mother; and Father. To enhance the imagistic quality of the piece, Reinholz added multimedia slides and music (207–216).

Each work in *American Gypsy: Six Native American Plays* is highly lyrical, vividly imagined, and multivocal, driven by language and image rather than action. As Berta explains in *The Women Who Loved House Trailers*, "Words are medicine for a journey" (39). The recent successful productions of *The Woman Who Was a Red Deer Dressed for the Deer Dance*, *The Women Who Loved House Trailers*, and *Jump Kiss* show that under the guidance of a skillful director and gifted actors, the evocative qualities of these plays translate successfully to the stage, especially through the use of imaginative set designs and multimedia. Each play in this collection offers exciting new roles for Native women to develop and perform in a variety of settings—from staged readings to professional productions.

Jaye T. Darby

San Diego State University

**Captives and Cousins: Slavery, Kinship, and Community in the Southwest Borderlands.** By James F. Brooks. Chapel Hill: Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia/University of North Carolina Press, 2002. 419 pages. \$55.00 cloth; \$22.50 paper.

In 1991, Southwestern history witnessed its most acclaimed and controversial publication. Ramon A. Gutierrez's *When Jesus Came, the Corn Mothers Went Away* (Stanford, 1991) garnered the historical profession's major book awards and catapulted colonial New Mexico onto syllabi across the land. Sweeping in scope, meticulously researched, and powerfully conceptualized, *When Jesus Came* offered U.S. historians a stark challenge: ignore the multicultural, hybrid, and centuries-old dialectic of Spanish colonialism and Indian adaptation at one's own risk. For the Southwest not only came under the influence of Europeans generations before the founding of Jamestown, but also became home to cultural, economic, and social processes that bore little resemblance to the more traditional subjects in U.S. colonial history of civic culture, republicanism, and entrepreneurial development. A necessary corrective to generations of Anglocentrism, *When Jesus Came* helped inaugurate the borderlands paradigm that now increasingly characterizes early American history.

This acclaim also brought scrutiny, and many Indian scholars began critiquing Gutierrez's work. As the title implies, in Gutierrez, Pueblo Indians recede from historical examination; at the core of the first third of the book, by the eighteenth century, Pueblo communities fade from analysis. Moreover, as a series of commentaries organized out of the University of New Mexico demonstrated, Gutierrez's portrait of Pueblo societies is problematic on multiple levels (see "Commentary: *When Jesus Came, the Corn Mothers Went Away*," *AICRJ* 17, 3 1993: 141–178). These commentaries, primarily by Indian and Pueblo scholars, highlighted disturbing tendencies by Gutierrez (and by implication other historians) toward manipulating Indian history to serve other purposes. Specifically, they revealed how Gutierrez homogenized the diversity among Pueblo communities, used twentieth-century ethnographies to reconstruct early Pueblo history, and, most troubling, focused excessively on decontextualized Pueblo sexual and religious practices. Far from celebrating Gutierrez's goal to give "vision to the blind" and "voice to the mute," these Native scholars viewed *When Jesus Came* and its attendant academic accolades with suspicion, even contempt (Gutierrez xvii).

For those interested in New Mexican-Indian relations, such condemnation, while instructive, has overshadowed many of Gutierrez's achievements. Notwithstanding the offense he delivers to Pueblo people in his first chapter, elsewhere, Gutierrez fascinatingly assesses how gender and power enveloped all of the region's peoples into a matrix of unequal social relations. Throughout the book, power courses within each section; for example, Franciscans fight with Spanish governors over the direction of colonial society, fight with each other over the nature of theology, and even fight within themselves over the many temptations of flesh offered by captive Indian girls and boys. For Gutierrez, no group is immune from such enveloping power relations. Among the book's many important components, Indian slavery and the detribalized *genizaro* offspring it engendered provide Gutierrez fertile ground for reinterpreting the colonial Southwest. Identifying how Indian captives underpinned the colony's gendered notions of honor, race, and status, Gutierrez estimates that nearly one-third of the colony's total population stemmed from such captive origins. Indian slavery and its "psychological and sexual comforts" offered New Mexican patriarchs access to an increasing number of female captives, whose sexual and reproductive labor provided important economic and demographic advantages (Gutierrez 153). Locating Indian slavery at the center of the colony's relations with neighboring Indians as well as in its evolving culture and identity, Gutierrez powerfully reveals the insidious ways that captivity structured colonial society.

James Brooks's *Captives and Cousins* extends these themes, providing the first sustained academic study of indigenous slavery in the Southwest. It too garnered an unprecedented series of professional awards; it is the only book to ever win the Parkman, Bancroft, and Turner prizes. Where Gutierrez remains primarily concerned with the impacts of Indian slavery upon colonial society, Brooks explores the nature of captivity within the surrounding Indian world. He maintains that indigenous slave networks intimately linked and sustained a series of "borderlands communities of interest" in the three

proximate ecological regions surrounding New Mexico: the Navajo pastoral borderlands to the west, the mountainous regions of the Colorado Plateau to the north, and the bison and horse-rich Plains grasslands to the east (79). Throughout these borderlands, captive raiding bonded diverse sets of Native and non-Native peoples through practices that began before contact and continued until state incorporation in the nineteenth century. Indeed, as he concludes, "Without the military and economic consolidation of Mexico and the United States after 1877, they might still be raiding today" (368). With its geographic reach, sophisticated use of cultural and anthropological theory, and methodological rigor, *Captives and Cousins* rivals and expands the prevailing scope of borderlands history.

Its accomplishments are many and varied. First and foremost, Brooks uncovers evidence of the astonishing frequency of Indian captivity within colonial records. From the colony's founding to its demise, Indian slaves served colonial New Mexico as domestics, herders, laborers, militia members, and eventually as wives and kinsmen. They literally helped to build, defend, and settle the colony and also, importantly, linked the colony to Indian communities in surrounding regions. Brooks exhaustively employs records from the Spanish Archives of New Mexico, published Spanish, Mexican, and U.S. sources, among others—see, for instance, his fascinating use of the French traveler Jean Luis Berlandier's 1830 narrative of Texas (185–187)—as well as secondary works in multiple fields. He conjoins multiple regional, ethnographic, geographic, and temporal subjects and interrogates them through mutual dialogue, as well as comparative analysis. Brooks's borderlands, for example, resemble regions of West Africa where, he argues, comparable systems of kinship, servitude, and cultural integration have historically turned captives into viable and important community members.

Organized regionally and chronologically in eight dense chapters, *Captives and Cousins* first explores the encounter of similarly based captive networks in the Southwest, whose roots have "origins in native America and the Mediterranean" (6). The book then charts the development and evolution of the three primary adjacent regions and traces their eventual dissolution with state pacification and incorporation. It concludes with a series of moving biographical vignettes of participants caught within rapidly shifting cultural and economic systems, torn between the increasingly competing demands of customary kinship and community on the one hand, and those of the American capitalist economy on the other. Throughout, Brooks focuses less on actual moments of enslavement and more on how captivity functioned. Among Navajo and Comanche communities, captivity served changing labor and demographic needs, especially as Navajos developed pastoral economies and the Comanche became equestrians on the Plains. Navajo headmen, he reveals, deployed captive herders to tend their growing herds, while Comanches adopted and integrated generations of borderlands peoples into their raiding communities. Returning her focus to New Mexico, Brooks identifies overlapping patterns of kinship between New Mexican and neighboring Indian societies. Comanche leaders, for example, placed their children into New Mexican households to facilitate intercultural exchange, while destitute

settlements on the colony's margins similarly placed children into Indian societies during difficult times. For Brooks, individual and group agency and overlapping kinship networks more fully explain the prevalence of borderlands captivity than do military and economic inequities. Such focused attention to kinship and the multifaceted internal complexities of borderlands slavery is among Brooks's central achievements. This same attention, however, also represents the book's primary fault.

Initially, Brooks maintains that indigenous systems of captivity blended seamlessly with Spanish institutions of servitude. In both pre-Columbian America and Iberia, masculine "honor-laden framework(s) of gift exchange," in which captive women were incorporated into communities and economies, helped bridge ethnic and religious difference (9). For example, the "broadly held code of male honor" of early modern Spain powerfully informed the emergent colonial culture of Mexico, where Spain's "willingness to continue customary conquest marriages" provided the basis for "long-term patterns of coexistence and cultural exchange" between colonized and colonizer (25–26). Fourteenth-century Muslim and Christian poetry, the experience of "La Malinche," Cortez's fourteen-year-old concubine, and fleeting ethnographic observations from North America are evidence enough for Brooks to conclude that honor-based captive systems pervaded Iberian, colonial Mexican, as well as American Indian societies. The subsequent meeting of these similar captive networks helps explain the inauguration of borderlands slavery and its capacity to become a "web across local cultures" (36).

For American Indian historians, Brooks's vision of the arrival of Europeans to New Mexico is eerily reminiscent of Gutierrez's. In his first chapter, for example, Brooks use two primary forms of evidence to demonstrate the existence of precontact Indian slavery: the Pawnee Morning Star Ceremony and Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca's narrative from the 1530s—the first Spanish account of the Southwest, published later, however, in Spain for an audience accustomed to narratives of wonder. Among the Skiri Pawnee, the sacrifice of young girls in the Morning Star ceremony was "so fraught with beauty and danger that it occurred only rarely" (14). Nonetheless, despite its infrequency as well as its nineteenth-century documentation, Brooks argues that "this ceremony is an archetype for a wider system of sacred violence and exchange in native North America," which stretched "throughout the continent . . . to the Great Lakes and beyond" (*ibid.*). In his reading of Cabeza de Vaca, Brooks similarly uses de Vaca's observation that besieged indigenous populations "preferred to kill their daughters rather than let a possible enemy be born to them" to conclude that Coahuiltecan "resorted to female infanticide to preserve their group identity" (27–28). He then generalizes, "here we see a most desperate expression of women's sacrifice in the name of group survival" (28). For Brooks, Pawnee human sacrifice and systematic Coahuiltecan "female infanticide" represent shared and identifiable aspects of multiple Indian cultures "throughout the continent" and help explain the subsequent course of Spanish-Indian relations.

Using ethnographies and sensationalized exploration accounts to reconstruct precontact Native cultures, particularly on such sensitive matters of

gendered violence and enslavement, raises serious concerns. Claims that Indians systematically killed their own children and sacrificed young girls need careful interrogation, not speculation. Such claims not only perpetuate obvious essentialisms, but also misconstrue the origins as well as the nature of colonial slavery. Where many borderlands scholars—for example, Jack Forbes, Thomas Hall, Elizabeth John, and Gutierrez—locate the Indian slave trade within a broader context of the traumatic transformations unleashed by Spanish intrusion, Brooks looks beyond these aspects of the colonial encounter to examine what he sees as the larger significance of everyday forms of captivity. Borrowing heavily from the work of African anthropologist Claude Meillasoux, Brooks considers how slavery transferred “useful” skills among societies and “produced enduring networks of economic and social relations,” which “allowed virtually all the protagonists . . . to experience demographic and economic growth” (34–35). Such productive assessments of borderlands slavery, however, sidestep larger questions of power. Only in a footnote, for example, does Brooks direct readers to other scholars for “view-points on the *negative* consequences of slavery.” (37; n. 55 emphasis added). And, while the vast majority of the work does creatively demonstrate how the borderlands became “a place of cultural exchange,” it repeatedly downplays the trauma of enslavement (69). For example, in arguably the most extreme and oft-cited condemnation of slavery from New Mexico, Pedro Serrano in 1761 recounted what happened when northern traders brought their captives into colonial markets: “they deflower and corrupt them in the sight of innumerable assemblies of barbarians and Catholics . . . saying to those who buy them . . . ‘Now you can take her—now she is good’” (quoted in Gutierrez 152). Gutierrez and other historians cite this passage, but Brooks only uses Serrano’s account selectively, failing to include not only this documentation of the serial rape of Indian women, but also the ritualized public spectacle engendered by such violence. When considering those whose bodies were trafficked and preyed upon both during and after enslavement, one wonders how individual captive women, the majority of whom were young girls, understood their experience as “a human bridge across . . . cultures” (102). Certainly, their rape, abuse, loneliness, and estrangement remain central aspects to any story of the Indian slave trade.

Such tendency to minimize the violence of captivity and to naturalize its presence among precontact Indian populations ultimately serves to diminish the deforming effects of colonialism. While Brooks displays an amazing grasp of comparative slavery and a multitude of source materials, his detailed analysis of the paradoxical capacity of borderlands slavery to simultaneously unite and untie communities emphasizes individual and community agency over asymmetries of power. Agency here becomes precariously divorced from its structural contours. Given its spate of honors, one hopes that readers of *Captives and Cousins* will not rush to embrace this alternate form of American slavery. Outside the familiar, painful tale of African American slavery, borderlands Indian slavery still remains a narrative of pain. Forged amid the maelstrom of colonial diseases, warfare, guns, horses, and economic dependency, captivity in the Southwest might have created webs and bridges between

peoples, but it did so on the backs of young Indian women and children. Their lives definitely deserve incorporation into broader narratives of American history, just not in such hopeful and celebratory tones.

*Ned Blackhawk*

University of Wisconsin-Madison

**Choctaw Prophecy: A Legacy of the Future.** By Tom Mould. Tuscaloosa: The University of Alabama Press, 2003. 263 pages. \$60 cloth; \$34.95 paper.

In his new monograph, Tom Mould offers a detailed description and painstaking analysis of a form of Choctaw verbal art that he argues is, in fact, prophecy. Mould has a two-pronged task: he both explains modern Choctaw prophecy and enlarges the genre of American Indian prophetic discourse to include not just the familiar grand, cataclysmic pronouncement often associated with a charismatic individual in the manner of the Shawnee prophet Tenskwatawa, but semi-anonymous, quotidian utterances that serve an altogether different and crucial purpose. The author supports his arguments with a large number of speeches, generally from tapes, gleaned from his own extensive fieldwork in Mississippi and rendered into texts. An important factor in the plausibility of Mould's work is the quality of his long-term relationships with many Choctaw people. The speakers both deliver the prophetic speeches and offer comments on them, which, along with Mould's own academic analysis, give us deeper insight into how these speeches function in Mississippi Choctaw communities.

The book's thesis is that, among Mississippi Choctaws, there is a marked form of discourse, which Mould terms *prophecy*, that is directly descended from the prophetic speech of the traditional *hopaii*—chosen, recognized prophets before conversion to Christianity—who assumed the role of guide to chiefs and other decision makers through their connection to the supernatural world. Modern prophecy is similar to traditional in that a chosen prophet, always an elder, and frequently, perhaps preferentially, the deceased elder of an elder, is invested with powers of foresight. The content of modern prophecy might be grouped into two major types, each of which serves a different but critical role. The first centers on accomplished events, notably the coming of technology, that have directly affected each Choctaw individual and that serve to validate the powers of the prophet-elder. The second type of prophecy is vaguer and darker, tending to be concerned with the extinction, diminution, or displacement of the Choctaws. Necessarily unfulfilled, its purpose is to serve as a focus for cultural anxiety about loss of identity, while at the same time providing a remedy for that threatened loss. Revival of and submersion in exclusively Choctaw cultural practices, including sustainment of prophecy telling, instructs Choctaws in appropriate attitudes and behaviors, thus allowing the community to monitor its members.

The author opens the book with an example of the first kind of prophecy, written in Choctaw with an English gloss, then goes on to schematically analyze this and other prophecies in terms of the "prophetic formula": attribution