

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Tribe, Race, History: Native Americans in Southern New England, 1780-1880. By Daniel R. Mandell.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/940327jd>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(3)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Genetin-Pilawa, C. Joseph

### Publication Date

2008-06-01

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The subject of Indian water rights also deserved far more treatment than the three pages of attention it did receive. Because Daniel McCool has artfully referred to contemporary water-rights settlements as constituting a new treaty era, surely those multilateral documents needed additional coverage. Additionally, I emphatically disagree with Kevin Gover's assertion in his otherwise solid essay when he declares that "as important as treaties are in the history of federal Indian policy, they are second in importance to the statutes enacted by Congress" (109). This may be true from the federal government's perspective; it is not, however, true from the perspective of most Native peoples for the reasons alluded to earlier.

Stacy Leeds is also off the mark when she states that "when formal federal treaty making came to an end, states and local governments increased their willingness to negotiate with tribes, realizing that treaties and agreements are mutually beneficial" (8). Although it is true that states and local municipalities are increasingly engaging in political compacts, accords, memorandum of agreements, and so forth with tribes, these engagements do not have the same dignity or status as treaties; states, as quasi-sovereigns, are prohibited by the Constitution from negotiating treaties with any parties.

Finally, although I was pleased to see the diplomatic record of Native peoples and Canada included, a short essay is necessary in order to introduce and compare the experiences of these two states and the Indigenous nations whose lands have been overrun by non-Natives more effectively. For example, we are not told why the treaty process never ended in Canada although it has surely changed in the United States. The fact that Canada and various provinces continue to engage in direct diplomacy is a fascinating reality, and it should have been given far greater attention.

No single work, even one that is three volumes in length, can adequately embrace all the fascinating dimensions and nuances of Indigenous diplomacy, especially when two states—the United States and Canada—and literally hundreds of aboriginal nations are being dealt with. Still, this is a useful collection of important topics that will add texture and depth to any person's knowledge of Native/state diplomacy and should be added to the libraries of those who desire to know more about these important accords.

*David E. Wilkins*

University of Minnesota

**Tribe, Race, History: Native Americans in Southern New England, 1780–1880.**  
By Daniel R. Mandell. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007.  
341 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

Daniel R. Mandell's *Tribe, Race, History*, the recipient of the Organization of American Historian's 2008 Lawrence W. Levine Award for the best book in American cultural history, examines the historical experiences of Native people in Massachusetts, Connecticut, and Rhode Island from the end of the American Revolution through the Reconstruction era. Based on thorough

research in regional and state archives, as well as in printed sources and government documents, the author presents a story of struggle, adaptation, and survival, as Southern New England Native communities navigated through constantly changing political, economic, and social conditions in an effort to maintain cultural practices and political viability throughout the nineteenth century.

Mandell argues that Native people and their communities were not only significant for the development of southern New England, but also that their story can be used as a lens through which to view larger forces and changes in US society. Therefore, these experiences, he asserts, are of “great significance for American history” and American historians (xvii). The author suggests three broad ways in which the communities of this region provide insight into the nineteenth-century Native experience. First, he asserts that these people were “a marginalized yet protected minority” and “were simultaneously within and without the dominant economic, political, and legal systems” (xvii). In these ways, Mandell argues, the Native communities of southern New England might be compared to modern federally recognized tribes. Second, through intermarriage with whites and African Americans, their story addresses issues of race, ethnicity, and identity from an often overlooked Native perspective. Intermarriages revealed the complex interplay of notions of race and gender, as well as a fluid tension between efforts to maintain fundamental cultural traditions within Native communities and the role of external forces that reshaped the groups. Third, the Native experience provides a unique view of the developments within New England throughout the nineteenth century. Native people grappled with issues of race and class along with African Americans and poor whites. They also experienced segregation (especially occupational), a widening of democratic politics, industrialization, an emerging consumer culture, and the profound ways in which evangelical religious reform efforts shaped the region’s society. Mandell divided his text chronologically into two halves, each devoted to a half century, and thematically, with chapters focusing on land and work practices; community and intermarriage; autonomy; reform; popular images and notions of Indianness; and citizenship and coercive assimilation policies.

In his discussion of land-holding and work patterns, the author delineated four different types of Native living situations. Many New England Natives lived on large, legally protected reserves, such as Gay Head and Mashpee in Massachusetts and Narragansett in Rhode Island. These communities had significant political autonomy and resources. Smaller reserves and enclaves, such as Eastern Pequot and Niantic in Connecticut featured a core group of Native families that lived in a centralized location, often within a larger non-Native community, while other tribal members disbursed in the local area. A few communities, Punkapoag and Natick in Massachusetts, for example, were represented by loose but identifiable networks of families living within or near a former reserve or village. Finally, a significant and growing number of Native people in the nineteenth century lived in larger non-Native towns, especially ports, throughout New England. On the reserves in the early nineteenth century, Native people practiced a mixed subsistence economy that included cultivating

crops, hunting, fishing, and some wage labor, and although these activities mirrored those of non-Native farmers on the economic margins, the dominant culture came to understand them as particularly backward and aboriginal in nature. As they became increasingly surrounded by Euro-Americans, Mandell asserts, many New England Natives found work as domestics, laborers, and whalers. This demographic trend of transient labor combined with the informal and then formal allotment of tribal lands to lend credence to the emerging popular notion of the “vanishing Indian” among the non-Native population. Mandell concluded that Anglo-Americans after the Revolution came to view Indians as part of an “undifferentiated group of people of color” (35).

In one of the book’s most interesting sections, the author suggests that studying Native/non-Native intermarriage in New England is significant because it “illuminates the fundamental flaws of a bichromatic view of racial relations in American history and offers new insight into the complexity, malleability, and uncertainty of ethnic identity and assimilation” (40). Mandell argues that Indian women often sought out marriages to white or African American men because they could increase their individual standing or develop useful connections for their community. African American and white men were encouraged to marry Indian women because they found themselves on the socioeconomic margins and could find a home among Native people. African American men, in particular, sought out these marriages, especially before the end of slavery, because they gained social and economic benefits, and because their children would be born free. As the nineteenth century progressed and racial attitudes hardened, the offspring of Native/African American unions came to be classified as “mulatto” or black, thus providing additional support to the “vanishing Indian” trope. The process of assimilation also factored into intermarriage in the late nineteenth century. Mandell asserts that, to Anglo-American writers, intermarriage “improved” Indian people individually and as a community. From a Native perspective, though, assimilation through intermarriage could also be dangerous for community cohesion, as mixed-ancestry children could sell reserved lands, and the marriages introduced outside forces into tightly knit communities. Although Indian women were often the conduits of change, they also served as the protectors of customary knowledge and traditions within these communities.

To the author, the Native experience in southern New England was most significant because it presents a unique window into the developments within the region. In a telling example, Mandell demonstrates how the Mashpee campaign for increased autonomy from their state-appointed guardians, which culminated in the Mashpee revolt of 1833 to 1834, reflected the broader “decline of deference, rise of evangelical religion, emergence of democratic politics and culture, and struggle between central and local powers” in the early republic. He also demonstrates how the combination of an emerging evangelical reform spirit and an increasingly activist state empowered Native people in the middle of the nineteenth century. Indians worked with religious reformers to maintain and expand their schools, develop temperance societies, and generally improve the social and economic culture of their communities. Mandell reminds readers, however, that although Indian

people worked with non-Native reformers to maintain and develop their institutions, whenever possible, they used these institutions to maintain tribal traditions. In this way, the southern New England Natives demonstrate how a subaltern group could become part of the mainstream society and culture, while resisting complete assimilation.

*Tribe, Race, History* provides a welcomed synthesis of the literature on the Native experience within this important region and significant original insights based on in-depth archival research. Mandell's prose is rich and smooth, and his mixed chronological and thematic organization, though repetitive in some places, provides readers with a clear understanding of his primary arguments. Students of New England Native history, as well as the broader nineteenth-century Native experience, will find this book thought provoking and enjoyable.

C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa  
Illinois College

**Two Spirits: A Story of Life with the Navajo.** By Walter L. Williams and Toby Johnson. Maple Shade, NJ: Lethe Press, 2006. 331 pages. \$18.00 paper.

Of all facets of Indigenous life, none has perhaps been more fascinating, titillating, repulsive, or bewildering to Euro-Western observers than those of Native gender mores and sexualities. Many early European invaders interpreted variant sexual and gender expressions as the embodied testimony to the moral degeneracy of the Indigenous populations, and the persecution of those people and practices was used to justify even the most horrific acts of violence. For example, in 1513, the conquistador Vasco Nuñez de Balboa used war dogs to slaughter almost forty male-embodied people wearing women's clothing in the household of Porque, the chief of Quarequa, whom he believed to have been engaged in "most abhominable and unnaturall lechery." Individuals in Native communities who have expressed gender identities or sexual behaviors outside the rigid realm of heteronormative patriarchy have been targeted for mockery, exclusion, or assault by non-Natives, while also being marginalized within many of their own communities, especially in recent years as antisex Christian evangelism and Euro-Western gendered expectations have become increasingly embedded in many tribal cultures.

In spite of these historical and contemporary struggles, queer and two-spirit Native people continue to walk in dignity, and their many contributions are essential to the vibrant continuity of their various tribal nations. Even when faced with social and political hostility, two-spirited people have shifted the conversations in many of their communities to incorporate a more inclusive understanding of gender, sexuality, love, and family, sometimes by returning to premissionary traditions, sometimes by appealing to the higher values of kinship and community.

Part of that important shift has been a result of increased access to a wide range of historical, sociological, anthropological, and even fictional resources