

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Elias Cornelius Boudinot: A Life on the Cherokee Border. By James W. Parins.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8v95g51t>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Miles, Tiya

Publication Date

2007

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Ganter's biographical glossary is a wonderful tool to help readers sort through the many personalities encountered in authorial commentaries.

The final shortcoming involves the Removal Era as an historical context. *The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* does not include Red Jacket's responses to the involuntary program of Native dispossession. The chief passed away in January of 1830, some five months prior to the ratification of President Andrew Jackson's Indian Removal Act. Still, public debate—including discussions within Native communities as represented by *Cherokee Phoenix* articles and lyceum speeches as early as 1826—was visible and vibrant in both the Era of Good Feelings and the Jacksonian Era. Given Red Jacket's many rebukes to voluntary removal from the 1790s to the post-War of 1812 years, one would think his anti-Removal rhetorical prowess would be called upon during the late 1820s. Perhaps such discourses do not exist or were burned during the archival fires in Albany in 1911 (xix). Even if Red Jacket's Removal Era discourse could not be found, readers might expect a footnote to this effect. As a Jacksonian scholar, I was left wondering what Red Jacket said about the forthcoming policy (and *how* he said it).

Ganter's anthology of Red Jacket's discourse is an excellent collection of and contribution to American Indian studies—one steeped in responsible scholarship and cutting-edge approaches to recovering (and empowering) American Indian voices from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Scholars in the historical-critical humanities and culturally based social sciences dealing in Native-US relations will find this book a true gem. For those of us working in rhetorical studies—particularly of Native oratory—*The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* is a godsend. My hope is that more collected editions of American Indian discourse—whether biographically, nationally, or thematically centered will follow Ganter's exceptional lead.

Jason Edward Black
University of Alabama

Elias Cornelius Boudinot: A Life on the Cherokee Border. By James W. Parins. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2006. 252 pages. \$60.00 cloth.

In this first biography of second-generation Cherokee leader Elias Cornelius Boudinot, James Parins endeavors to demonstrate the importance of Boudinot's life to his times. The youngest son of well-known *Cherokee Phoenix* newspaper editor, Elias Boudinot (formerly Buck Watie), Elias Cornelius Boudinot became a newspaperman, Democratic Party politician, Confederate Civil War officer, Indian affairs negotiator, businessman, attorney, rancher, and popular public lecturer for the cause of opening Indian lands to white settlement. Parins's telling of Boudinot's life joins a set of biographies, autobiographies, and family histories of prominent nineteenth-century Cherokees whose lives spanned a momentous era of Cherokee history, including Thurman Wilkins's *Cherokee Tragedy: The Ridge Family and the Decimation of a People* (1970), Gary E. Moulton's *John Ross: Cherokee Chief* (1978), Parins's own biography of Elias

Cornelius Boudinot's contemporary, *John Rollin Ridge: His Life and Works* (1991), Tiya Miles's *Ties That Bind: The Story of an Afro-Cherokee Family in Slavery and Freedom* (2005), and the recently republished *Memoirs of Narcissa Owen, 1831–1907*, edited and introduced by Karen L. Kilcup (2005).

Parins's chief aim in narrating Boudinot's life story is to cast that story as a lens that brings us greater insight into key issues of mid-to-late nineteenth-century Cherokee life, as well as key issues in current Native American affairs. Parins's assertion that "Boudinot's life is important if only for the light it sheds on Cherokee history" is amply demonstrated by the series of events that place Boudinot at the center of critical events in the Cherokee Nation and Indian Territory and in western territories and states. In Parins's account, Elias C. Boudinot emerges as consistently positioned at the crossroads of change. In this regard, even the date of Boudinot's birth (1835)—the year his father signed the fateful Cherokee removal Treaty of New Echota—seems telling. Later in life, Boudinot stood among a corps of Cherokee men from slaveholding families who advocated early support of the Confederacy in the American Civil War. After a stint as a major and lieutenant colonel in the southern Cherokee forces led by his uncle, Brigadier General Stand Watie, and after time served as a delegate to the Confederate Congress, Boudinot was well placed to play a prominent role in shaping a truce between the northern and southern Cherokees after the war and in interpreting the US government's postwar treaty with the Cherokees that infringed upon the Cherokee Nation's right to define its citizenry and control its lands.

Boudinot leveraged his political experience, contacts with prominent people in Washington, DC and elsewhere, and keen awareness of the trajectory of US Indian policy, as evidenced by the 1866 treaties with the slaveholding tribes, to develop a series of profit-seeking business ventures. And this is the aspect of Boudinot's biography that Parins, and likely his readers, finds disconcerting. In his attempts to use to his advantage both long-standing Cherokee norms (for example, access to common lands) and oncoming American trends (for example, railroad development) to bolster his own tobacco, hotel, railroad, and ranching ventures, Elias C. Boudinot comes across more as an economic opportunist than a Cherokee statesman. As Parins points out, Boudinot's ardent and publicized support of railroad development, normative territorial status for Indian lands, and white settlement—in the form of lectures, letters to editors, and pamphlets complete with maps of "surplus" Indian lands—earned him the label of traitor by many of his Cherokee contemporaries. It is this tenuous position as a well-known Cherokee leader who was loved more by neighboring whites than by Indians of his own tribe that leads Parins to label Boudinot's life a "border" life in the subtitle of the book. Boudinot spent many years in the Northeast and in the border state of Arkansas before finally settling in the Cherokee Nation and was constantly in motion as he traveled across community, state, and national boundaries in his work as a lecturer and lay negotiator. He also adopted an identity and mode of interaction that located him on the social and political borders of his virtual Cherokee community.

To his credit, Parins resists the pull to relabel Boudinot as a traitor or to interpret his life in simplistic terms that only allow for strict loyalty to a perceived

Indian nationalist agenda. Though Parins does openly describe Boudinot as image conscious, ambitious, opportunistic, capitalistic, self-promoting, and vitriolic in his rhetoric, Parins does so with an eye to both psyche and context that softens the blow of these charges. In a mode of analysis that veers toward the psychoanalytic, Parins reminds us that Elias C. Boudinot was a virtual orphan, whose white mother died when he was a toddler and whose father was murdered in an act of political vengeance. In addition to being raised by his white stepmother far from his Cherokee community, Boudinot was marked psychologically and emotionally by his father's brutal death and his family's lost glory. This physical separation and emotional scar, in Parins's view, deprived Boudinot of an intimate regard for Cherokee ways of life and "poisoned his soul," accounting for his self-interested manipulations of circumstance and visceral hatred of some prominent Cherokees (218).

Though clearly sensitive to personal issues that may have propelled Boudinot's actions, Parins has constructed a biography that centers on what might be termed traditional masculine arenas: politics, warfare, and commerce. A studied attention to the domestic spaces of Boudinot's life and to the intimate relationships between Boudinot and family members certainly would have yielded pertinent information and an even deeper understanding of Boudinot's experience. Although Parins does discuss the outlines of Boudinot's friendship with Washington, DC socialite and sculptor, Vinnie Ream (after whom the town of Vinita, Indian Territory was named at Boudinot's suggestion), two examples indicate this missed opportunity in the book: the lack of examination of cultural norms and social life in the white New England society in which Boudinot was raised and educated and the thin account of Boudinot's marriage to Clara Corinth Menear, which is only afforded one paragraph, perhaps due to a lack of existing sources (211–12).

Despite these gaps, Parins's account does pinpoint the likely emotional backdrop to Boudinot's often surprising courses of action. And just as importantly, Parins overwhelmingly demonstrates the growth and impact of US manipulation of Native American political affairs. If, in this book, we see Elias C. Boudinot's opportunistic reading of the handwriting on the wall, we see just as clearly the force and seeming inevitability of US intrusion and power in this period. By the end of Boudinot's life in 1890, we glimpse, along with the perceptive Boudinot, the historical through line to the dissolution of Native nations in Indian Territory, Oklahoma statehood, and comprehensive US citizenship for American Indians.

Due to Parins's careful rendering, Elias C. Boudinot, who might be deemed an antihero of Cherokee history, gains the reader's understanding and concern. James Parins concludes this biography with the observation that Boudinot's was a "frustrated life"—making us wonder all the more who Boudinot might have been and what dreams he might have pursued, absent the extreme pressure, dislocation, and violence of US colonizing practices (219).

Tiya Miles

University of Michigan