

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

William Fenton: Selected Writings. By William N. Fenton.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8tp013f8>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Bonvillain, Nancy

**Publication Date**

2011

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**William Fenton: Selected Writings.** By William N. Fenton. Edited and with an introduction by William A. Starna and Jack Campisi. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. 368 pages. \$40.00 paper.

William Fenton was one of the eminent anthropologists of his generation and certainly a major figure in what later became known as Iroquoian studies. He began his professional career in 1933 with fieldwork among Senecas living on the Allegheny Reservation located in western New York State while a graduate student in anthropology at Yale University. Because Fenton had previously spent summers nearby on a family farm, he knew something of the region and the people living there. Throughout his long career, Fenton developed personal and long-lasting relationships with many people from Allegheny and from the Six Nations Reserve near Brantford, Ontario. He produced a large number of writings generated by his research and his public position with the New York State Museum.

William Starna and Jack Campisi have drawn together an impressive selection of Fenton's writings in this volume. The articles demonstrate Fenton's breadth as a scholar and exemplify the range of his interests. He came from the generation of anthropologists in the American Boasian tradition. His mentors at Yale (Edward Sapir, George Murdock, and Clark Wissler) included people who had been students of Boas and who taught their own students to be mindful of the complexities of culture and history.

*William Fenton: Selected Writings* is divided into four sections. The first and major section contains an array of Fenton's contributions to the anthropological literature concerning Iroquoian societies. The second section consists of reviews of five books that have become classics in the field of Iroquoian studies. The third section contains obituaries of a number of Fenton's Seneca friends and consultants. The final section is devoted to several short reports of the Annual Conference on Iroquois Research, which was founded by Fenton and others in 1945 and still continues yearly.

The articles that form the major section of this volume illustrate Fenton's ethnographic and theoretical approaches. They are arranged chronologically beginning with "Iroquois Indian Folklore" (1947) and ending with "He-Lost-a-Bet (Howan?neyao) of the Seneca Hawk Clan" (2001). These two articles are instructive examples of Fenton's methodologies and style. The article about folklore argues for the centrality of people's narratives in order to gain an understanding of their perceptions of their world and themselves. This work lies clearly within the Boasian tradition. It presents various schema for classifying folktales on the basis of their content, social usage, and ceremonial or religious significance. Fenton also argues strongly, in this and other works, for the importance of understanding historical processes as they impact Native

societies. This theme is expanded in two additional articles in the collection: "The Training of Historical Ethnologists in America" (1952) and "Cultural Stability and Change in American Indian Societies" (1953). Although Fenton advocates for the inclusion of a historical perspective in anthropology, he also argues that an overemphasis on studying change can lead analysts to overlook or ignore the continuity of cultural motifs, norms, and practices even within changing external conditions. He finds many of these continuities in the realms of folklore, ceremonialism, and interpersonal relationships.

In his article, "This Island, the World on the Turtle's Back" (1962), Fenton dissects the central sacred narrative of the Iroquois (the Woman Who Fell from the Sky) and extracts its core thematic elements, reflecting "main themes in Iroquois life": the earth, our mother; renewal; "it is us women that count" (kinship); the law of the kettle (hospitality); "do not oppose the forces of nature"; "there is a regular way [of life]"; "restraint is important"; "dreams compel fulfillment"; reciprocity; and *orenda*, or spiritual power (117–18). Fenton then shows how these elements are interwoven throughout Iroquoian culture; they are not only limited to the sacred world but also to the world of human interaction and human thought. The article demonstrates the depth of Fenton's knowledge about Iroquoian societies. Throughout this article and many others, Fenton includes the words and perspectives of the Seneca consultants upon whom he relied for their insights and hospitality.

The last article included in this section is an account of the adoption ceremony that incorporated Fenton into the Seneca Hawk clan. Although the article was written in 2001, the ritual took place nearly seventy years prior to that in 1933. It is a reminiscence, an analysis, and an homage to his Seneca hosts. Clearly, the friendships that Fenton developed had great meaning to him. This respect was returned, as evidenced by statements made at the time of Fenton's death in 2005.

However, Fenton's relationships with the wider Iroquois community were sometimes problematic. Included in this volume is an article that Fenton wrote on the occasion of the repatriation of eleven wampum belts to the Six Nations in 1988 ("Return of Eleven Wampum Belts to the Six Nations Confederacy on Grand River, Canada" [1989]). In the article, Fenton painstakingly details the history of the fraudulent sale of the belts to an American collector in 1899; their subsequent transfer to the Museum of the American Indian, Heye Foundation; and the eventually successful efforts by the Iroquois to retrieve them. Although, in this case, Fenton lauded the confederacy's desire to repatriate their sacred objects, he took a contrary position in another hallmark case. In their introduction, the editors refer to Fenton's article, "The New York State Wampum Collection: The Case for the Integrity of Cultural Treasures" (1971); however, they do not include it in this collection, nor do they discuss

its contents and implications. In the article, Fenton rejects the claims of the Onondaga chiefs representing the Iroquois Confederacy to return wampum belts that had become a central holding of the New York State Museum. Although Fenton overtly opposed the return of the wampum belts on the grounds that they had been legitimately transferred to the care of the Regents of the University of the State of New York in 1898, one wonders whether Fenton's own role as an officer of the New York State Museum influenced his position. As a museum spokesman, Fenton argued that the wampum belts and, by implication, other treasures from indigenous peoples have become part of the regional and national heritage. These are arguments that many (but not all) museum officials and archeologists have used in numerous cases prompted by the passage of the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (1990). Although Fenton's article predated that act by about twenty years, his arguments demonstrate a misunderstanding of and blindness to the moral basis of Native American claims to their cultural heritage, whether these objects were removed through legal means or taken fraudulently. Fenton's loyalty to his own community seems to have outweighed his respect for the Iroquois and their sovereignty.

*William Fenton: Selected Writings* is a welcome addition to the literature on Iroquoian societies because it brings together some of the complex and thought-provoking articles by one of the major scholars in the field. Starna and Campisi's introduction discusses some highlights of Fenton's work and career. In the collection, there is a summary description of each article. Although these descriptions are quite helpful, perhaps they are a bit too brief. Readers, particularly those not so familiar with the contexts of Fenton's work and of Iroquois culture, might benefit from some further analysis.

*Nancy Bonvillain*

Bard College at Simon's Rock

**The Yamasee War: A Study of Culture, Economy, and Conflict in the Colonial South.** By William L. Ramsey. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 324 pages. \$29.95 cloth; \$29.95 paper.

The colonial Southeast has experienced a renaissance of scholarship during the past decade, and yet, despite this, there has been no comprehensive reevaluation of the 1715 Yamasee War until now. William L. Ramsey's study sets out to correct this lacuna and to "draw southern historical memory . . . farther back into its multiethnic colonial roots" (10). The Yamasee War, for Ramsey, is a significant event that shaped the plantation South and its racialized hierarchy.