

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Distorted Descent: White Claims to Indigenous Identity. By Darryl Leroux.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8s04q52d>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 44(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kremer, Jürgen Wermer

Publication Date

2020

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

recognized Native people and their published memoirs reinforce perspectives that can be starkly different. Adam Fortune Eagle, an Ojibwe, who helped lead the occupation of Alcatraz, remembers his time there as the “golden age of Pipestone Indian boarding school” (219), while other future Native leaders, like American Indian Movement founder Dennis Banks, also Ojibwe, retained perceptions of “concentration camps” where students were “beaten if we prayed to our Native Creator” (211).

To title the book *The Dakota Sioux Experience* seems odd, given that the author clearly provides numerous significant examples of varied student experiences and perspectives throughout, with significant attention to Ojibwes and students from other Native communities both over time and within the same era. Perhaps future Dakota scholars can build on this work to provide more particular examples of community and school relations. Readers would benefit, for instance, from seeing names of Dakota individuals who signed petitions to establish the schools, or former students who led federal recognition efforts in the 1930s. Learning of the establishment of the Four Winds Cultural Center at Flandreau fits well with the later years’ reorientation toward tribal culture, but it is unclear how this took place. Did Flandreau community members bridge retention of cultural traditions and skills developed at school to help bring this to reality?

Ultimately, the book shows how education promoted by Yankton leader Struck by the Ree in the 1880s, with an eye toward the future for his people, evolved into schools that produced students who retained Native identities, with some who became nationally known activists. Like other scholars, Landrum’s work underscores the irony that federal Indian policies designed for assimilation unintentionally contributed to the rise of tribal self-determination.

Robert W. Galler Jr.
St. Cloud State University

Distorted Descent: White Claims to Indigenous Identity. By Darryl Leroux. Winnipeg, Manitoba: University of Manitoba Press, 2019. 287 pages. \$70.00 cloth and electronic; \$31.95 paper.

At the core of this significant contribution to the literature on identity and contemporary dynamics of racism and colonialism is race shifting, which here specifically refers to the change of white French descendants into an “Indigenous” identity (with a focus on Eastern Canada). This phenomenon appears to be on the rise and is an example of virulent enactments of ongoing settler-colonial politics obstructing Indigenous self-determination and sovereignty. To be clear, the book does not document the challenges and struggles to have their identities recognized on the part of those Indigenous people who have lost their Indigenous identity and rights as a consequence of forced residential schooling, the Sixties Scoop, and discrimination by the welfare and criminal justice systems. Instead, *Distorted Descent* is about a specific group of settlers and their personal and political strategies to shift their racial identities.

Leroux's excellent critical discussion of the literature and detailed documentation make the book not only persuasive, but also highly disturbing, given the level of fantasy and fakery he documents. His conclusions are based on careful research of genealogy forums and court cases. As the author demonstrates, the underlying dynamic that enables race shifting is the differences between Indigenous and modern understandings of identity. Indigenous identities develop and are understood as a process that is part of contemporary communities and their networks of relations, social obligations, and mutual responsibilities as individuals engage in economic, political, social, cultural, and spiritual activities. Ancestors, rather than a singular point of identification as in modern identity, are part of this lived network. The process of modern individualism stands in stark contrast to such complex practice and understanding of identity anchored in place, history, origin stories, and community. It is this normative dissociation from what is central to past and present Indigenous identities that enables race shifting: it allows the facile and decontextualized creation and recreation of identities based on a person's desires and motivations.

Additionally, the prevalent reductionist emphasis on the biological aspects of identity, similarly true for many psychological issues, enables claims to identity purely based on DNA-testing. Cross-culturally, this individualistic identity formation is peculiar and unusual, as Clifford Geertz and others have pointed out. The individualistic model of self-identification enables romantic fantasies ("playing Indian") as well as strategic and politically motivated inventions that avoid confrontations with the history of colonial violence and easily impede any process of reconciliation through the power this historical shadow material holds over individual actors.

Leroux details this underlying dynamic, together with its significant sociopolitical consequences. Going Native or playing Indian are not new phenomena. While the term *métis* is often used by English speakers to refer to all individuals of mixed ancestry, the Métis Nation has been recognized as one of the Indigenous peoples of Canada. The 2003 *Powley* Supreme Court of Canada decision recognized a rights-bearing Métis community. The court ruling included a test to define and identify Métis rights holders, such as ongoing connections with a historic Métis community and acceptance by a contemporary community. In 2016 the Canadian Supreme Court established a problematic framework that further legitimized and eased the process of race shifting when it held that the central requirements for identification as Métis were self-identification and genealogy. This allowed white French descendants to develop "Indigenous *métis*" identities in Quebec, New Brunswick, Ontario, and Nova Scotia.

Leroux documents three strategies used by race shifters to enact their identities. The three strategies only make sense in an individualistic paradigm that overemphasizes self-identification and gives space to the postmodern play of identities in social media and elsewhere—anything goes! From an Indigenous practice of identity, self-identification practices appear as fantasies and dissimulations, both absurd and fraudulent. In one strategy, termed *lineal descent*, people who identify a single purported Indigenous ancestor from 300 to 375 years ago (ten or more generations) claim an "Indigenous" identity; this means that of about eight thousand ancestors, one was Indigenous. *Aspirational descent* involves changing a French female ancestor

from 400 years ago into an “Indigenous” woman; this strategy frequently involves DNA testing. *Lateral descent* is a strategy that does not involve any direct Indigenous ancestry; instead, claims are based on certain family names associated with indigeneity.

Leroux documents these strategies through careful textual analysis and virtual ethnography. The deceptive nature of the race shifting enterprise is especially of concern given the political background and intentions Leroux documents. Two of the organizations seeking recognition as Métis under the *Powley* test (using strategies of lineal and aspirational descent, with the use of DNA ancestry testing central in one of the organizations), are pursuing an anti-land claim, anti-Indigenous, and pro-white rights politics (some of their leaders formerly were leaders in movements supporting these goals). The supremacist nature of their strategy is apparent in the example of one of the organizations seeking recognition claiming that the Indigenous Innu, the Aboriginal people of present-day Quebec and parts of Labrador, are less civilized than the “métis” (or even that they actually disappeared). Race shifting as contemporary manifestation of colonial strategies threatens both existing Indigenous rights as well as the process of Indigenous individuals legitimately seeking recognition of their identity and rights after suffering the insults of dispossession, residential schools, and discrimination.

The importance of Leroux’s work becomes obvious when surveying the scope of the race-shifting phenomenon. Since 2003, tens of thousands have sought to appropriate an Indigenous identity. As discussed in the book, the Métis Nation of the Rising Sun alone has between 16,000 and 20,000 members, an organization that also aggressively attempted to block a Mi’kmaq venture that would have helped their economic development. There are now more than fifty organizations using race shifting strategies to claim indigeneity. Almost sixty cases seeking recognition have gone to court, although so far all of them have failed to win. Political candidates and members of parliament in Canada make spurious claims to indigeneity, like Elizabeth Warren in the United States. In the present climate of “fake news” and claims to “post-truth,” Leroux’s book provides essential data. Any hope for genuine reconciliation requires decolonization and the acknowledgment of the violent history of settler colonialism. Leroux’s contribution is a call to honest engagement.

Jürgen Werner Kremer
Santa Rosa Junior College

Knowing Native Arts. By Nancy Marie Mithlo. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2020. 254 pages. \$34.95 cloth and electronic.

Talk of indigenizing pedagogies and decolonizing institutions is today a fairly common topic at academic conferences, on college campuses, and within cultural institutions. Coupled with these ideas are the push for inclusion and the accurate and respectful representation of underserved populations in art exhibitions and museum collections. In the past few years, attempts have been made to address these needs. The results