

UCLA

UCLA Historical Journal

Title

The Peace Reform in American History. By CHARLES DE BENEDETTI.
Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980. Pp. xvii + 245.
Bibliographical essay, notes, index. \$18.50.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8nk737t1>

Journal

UCLA Historical Journal, 3(0)

Author

Hall, Mitchell K.

Publication Date

1982

Copyright Information

Copyright 1982 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

New Jersey, achieved some degree of success because they had strong leadership, and they grew to develop businesses in addition to farming.

This book is a well-written and well-documented study of a much neglected area of Jewish and utopian studies. It is easily readable in one sitting, yet it offers a sensitive description of the perils and the plight of Jews trying to create a new life and new world for themselves. In two helpful appendices Herscher includes documents which give an intimate look at the New Jersey communities. The first contains excerpts from *The Jewish Farmer*, a Yiddish-language journal that reported on the efforts at Woodbine and Alliance. The second is the memoir of the founder of Alliance, Sidney Bailey.

In spite of its many fine points and its groundbreaking uniqueness, this book has at least two serious deficiencies. First, there are several crucial issues that should have been addressed in more detail. How did the dramatic rise of interest in agricultural communes come about among Jewish intellectuals? Why did the immigrant aid societies not learn from their mistakes with the earliest communes and change their program? How were these failures interpreted by the Jews themselves? The second deficiency is basically an organizational problem common to several books on utopian communities. It is the problem of discussing the communal experience by writing short, anecdotal histories of a number of settlements without really synthesizing or adequately analyzing their motives, their means of operation, or their constituent make-up. Herscher has, nonetheless, provided the beginnings for a potentially rich area of inquiry.

John F. Welter
University of California, Los Angeles

The Peace Reform in American History. By CHARLES DE BENEDETTI. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980. Pp. xvii + 245. Bibliographical essay, notes, index. \$18.50.

With the recent increase of concern in both the United States and Europe over the effects and dangers of nuclear war, *The Peace Reform in American History* has reached its audience at a very opportune time. One of a number of historians that has recently made the American peace movement an area of scholarly interest, Charles DeBenedetti develops a broad synthesis of the existing scholarship. Although his own perspective is evident throughout the book, it in no way detracts from a very thorough job of research. Both well-organized and clearly written, this survey covers Americans that have actively worked for peace from the early 1600s through the Vietnam War. It succeeds admirably in its attempt to fit the peace reform into the mainstream of American history.

The greatest support for the various peace

organizations has come from middle class groups that combine higher education, a reform Christian conscience, and leisure time. Intellectually, the peace movement has most often attracted religious liberals, political leftists, and cultural dissidents. Geographically, it has been centered in the urban, northeastern states.

DeBenedetti finds that peace reformers have operated primarily by denouncing war as a socially and spiritually corrupting practice and by proposing alternative methods of resolving conflicts. He views World War I as the watershed of the American peace reform as it struggled to deal with the paradox that emerged from that era, that the "very processes of modernization . . . which made peace a simple necessity of survival had intensified the kind of tribal nationalism and military influence that placed highest value upon state security and protracted struggle" (p. xiv). He develops this theme more fully in another book, *Origins of the Modern American Peace Movement, 1915-1929* (1978).

Since the end of the First World War, the peace movement often has been associated with other social reforms such as civil rights. These associations have helped to instill new vigor into the peace reform. Earlier it was associated with the abolition of slavery and women's suffrage and yet peace reform itself has never evolved into a mass movement. DeBenedetti concludes that this failure largely is due to the fact that peace reformers have remained outside the mainstream of American society. He states, "Most of all, however, the peace movement stands as a minority reform in America because it constitutes a subculture opposed to the country's dominant power culture and power realities" (p. 199). Evidence for this can be found during nearly every military conflict in which the United States has participated from the Revolution to the present. During these periods of crisis, peace reformers have been constant targets of persecution. Opposition to the peace minority has included violence as well as harassment.

DeBenedetti concludes that part of the weakness of the peace movement comes from its complexities. Internal divisions have occurred over the precise means to achieve peace. The diversity includes interventionists as well as isolationists, pacifists and those accepting the concept of a "just" war, and religious groups with widely differing beliefs. He provides succinct explanations of these divisions and of the philosophical debates behind them.

In spite of the problems there have been some important accomplishments for peace reformers. They have been the leading defenders of the right of smaller nations to self-government and have implemented nonviolent ways to achieve social justice. They have been among the most perceptive in advancing criticisms of America's global policies. The peace movement has developed numerous practical methods to avoid war such as international arbitration and disarmament, and it has proposed various plans for world government.

Peace Reform's flaws are relatively minor. The book lacks an adequate discussion of the larger historical context of the movement. DeBenedetti sometimes loses sight of the environment in which the peace reformers worked. He offers a few statements that he does not satisfactorily

explain. The author refers to the widespread unpopularity of the War of 1812, for example, without telling the reader why this was so. One question that needs to be answered in greater detail is why the peace movement has generally failed to move American foreign policy in new directions. Given that even the most extensive peace outpourings have not been able to lead the nation but only prick its conscience, how could this public opinion more effectively influence official policy? One hopes that these reformers will soon find a way, for as DeBenedetti suggests, "Peace seekers are neither fools nor cowards. They are people of honor who have unhesitatingly gambled that their words and actions will yet yield a power that will heal and not hurt, harmonize and not atomize" (p. 200).

Mitchell K. Hall
University of Kentucky

Chaco Canyon: Archaeology and Archaeologists. By ROBERT H. LISTER and FLORENCE C. LISTER. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1981. Pp. xiv + 284. Illustrations, maps, plates, index. \$29.95.

Chaco Canyon is a narrative history of the Chaco Culture National Park, near Santa Fe, New Mexico. The volume is useful to students of the history of science because it brings to life the history of American archaeology. To do this Robert H. and Florence C. Lister have used writings, reports, interviews, and photographs, beginning with the first major description of the ruins by Lieutenant J. H. Simpson in 1849 and spanning more than a century.

The volume reads like a "Who's Who" of the Old West. Lewis Henry Morgan, Charles Loomis, Richard Wetherill, and the Hyde brothers are all present. We follow traveling actors from Kansas and bilingual Anglos from Colorado, witness the youth and maturation of Southwest archaeology, American Indian adjustments to wage economics (five cents a day in 1896), cultural conflicts, government investigations, archaeological infighting, and the shift in archaeological interest from the spectacular to the mundane.

The Listers devote a chapter to the excavations of one site which makes clear how much work went into the original Chaco Canyon settlements: five thousand trees and four sandstone disks of a thousand to fifteen hundred pounds each at that site alone--without benefit of metal tools. This chapter reveals how archaeologists use architecture to date sites, makes the vagaries of preservation and discovery come to life (p. 103), gives the students of the Depression an opportunity to see the Civilian Conservation Corps at work (pp. 119-120), and shows the relationship between archaeology and ethnology (p. 111).

The book also provides an overview of the past decade's efforts by the Chaco Center to apply modern theoretical concepts and analytical techniques to over two thousand sites within forty-three square miles. It demonstrates how