

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Political Economy of North American Indians. Edited by John H. Moore.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8kf4g7nh>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Anderson, Terry L.

Publication Date

1994-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Lame Deer Seeker of Vision by John (Fire) Lame Deer and Richard Erdoes tells the story of Lame Deer and his search for a place in the white world, as well as his later years as a holy man of the Lakota Sioux. Erdoes, unlike Niehardt, tried to be as true as possible to Lame Deer's account. However, it is still an interpretation, although not as much license was taken as in the account by Niehardt. Neither account possesses the honesty of the unhampered manuscript that *Our Grandmothers' Lives as Told in Their Own Words* provides.

Another aspect of Indian life is portrayed in *Our Grandmothers' Lives* as well. This is the gender perspective. Both Niehardt's and Erdoes's books come from a male perspective and focus on the spiritual, while Ahenakew's book comes from the female perspective and is rich in tales of the temporal world. Overall, much is to be gained by reading *Our Grandmothers' Lives as Told in Their Own Words*. These stories focus on the practical, the spiritual; on memories, as well as on prophecies. Humor, an important aspect of storytelling, is also evident. This is a wonderful book, a welcome addition to the literature on Native North Americans.

Loretta Winters
University of California

The Political Economy of North American Indians. Edited by John H. Moore. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993. 320 pages. \$32.95 cloth.

As a neoclassical economist, I anxiously awaited the review copy of *The Political Economy of North American Indians*, naïvely expecting an anthology applying modern tools of economics and political science. Reading John Moore's preface, however, I thought it strange that a volume on political economy would have its roots in correspondence between Moore and Valery Tishkov, a Soviet ethnologist. Then my naïveté quickly disappeared: The political economy in this volume is Marxist. If you thought Marxist ideology disappeared with the demise (Moore calls it a "restructuring") of the Soviet Union, rest assured that it is alive and well. *Bourgeois, proletariat, precapitalist exploitation*, and other Marxist rhetoric permeate Moore's introduction and some of the other papers. As a neoclassical political economist, I was sure I would be disappointed in the volume.

This proved to be true for several of the chapters, most especially the final chapter on "Native North Americans and the National Question" by George P. Castile. This contribution is a quintessential example of classical Marxism, attributing the exploitation of Indians to the oppressive state controlled by the ruling class. There can be little doubt that bureaucratic control of Indian resources, both physical and human, has stifled prospects for Indian self-determination. But to understand what lies behind this bureaucratic control and to ultimately muster coalitions to change the status quo, we must understand the incentives that are built into the system. It will not do to talk in terms of class struggle and exploitation. The more interesting questions, which are not answered by the Marxist approach, are, How and why did coalitions form to take land from the Indians? Was "capitalism" (meaning private ownership of the means of production) inimical to Indian cultures? Was allotment an economic failure? Do theories of bureaucratic budget maximization explain the desire of the BIA to maintain control of reservation economies? Generally, these questions and their answers are absent from this volume.

That said, let me heartily recommend this anthology to all students of North American Indian history. The papers are well written and well documented, making the book a useful research tool. The chapters on Indian education, health care, and powwows do provide some new data and analysis of these issues.

But two chapters stand out in my mind as particularly important for understanding Indian history: "Symbiosis, Merger, and War: Contrasting Forms of Intertribal Relationship among Historic Plains Indians," by Patricia C. Albers and "Political Economy of the Buffalo Hide Trade: Race and Class on the Plains," by Alan M. Klein. In the former, Albers provides refreshingly new insights into why, when, and where Plains tribes lived in peaceful coexistence or in warring conflict. Her analysis is based on what she calls "exchange theory." My interpretation of her theory is that the rules of the game chosen by individuals or groups in their interaction depended on the perceived benefits and costs of alternative institutions. Just as modern firms merge to take advantage of economies of scale or reduced transaction costs, Plains tribes recognized the prospects of gain from trade. Albers notes, "By revolutionizing subsistence and military techniques, the horse and gun introduced a new dimension into intertribal relations. If tribes did not have these objects, they stood little chance of surviving in the face of those who did" (pp. 102-103). Hence

markets arose, with some tribes breeding and trading horses and others serving as middlemen in the trade of guns and other European goods.

The buffalo hide trade analyzed by Klein tells a similar story. In his introduction to the volume, Moore describes Klein's contribution in terms of bourgeois agents of capitalism versus the Indian proletariat and "interactions between class and ethnicity" (pp. 17-18), but the chapter is much more robust than these Marxist terms imply. Klein emphasizes how the horse changed the relative benefits and costs of harvesting buffalo; how the new hunting techniques diminished the status of women in Plains society because their relative importance in the production process declined; and how the "[p]rivate ownership of horses dovetailed nicely with the individualized way in which the hunt was carried out" (p. 142). The pictures painted by both Albers and Klein show how innovative Indians were in adapting to new constraints and suggest that, if left to self-determination, they would be just as innovative today.

It should be noted, however, that peace and harmony associated with gains from trade were not the only consequences of horses, guns, and trade goods. Competition "centered on claiming choice buffalo hunting territories" and resulted in "complaining, cajoling, and threatening war," which were "as much to assure continued defense of a tribe's territory as to gain or keep a monopoly over a trader" (p. 148). Again the analogy is appropriate between intertribal relations and modern corporate efforts to form cartels, drive out competition, and establish monopolies.

To be sure, the authors in this volume approach the study of North American Indians from a Marxist perspective, but when the rhetoric is separated from the analysis, there is little difference between this perspective and that of neoclassical economics and political science (for example, see Terry L. Anderson, ed., *Property Rights and Indian Economies*, 1992). *The Political Economy of North American Indians* requires us to focus on the rules of the game that determine who controls physical and human resources and who benefits from their use. If Indians are to emerge from poverty and enjoy self-determination, we must begin to understand the importance of stable governments, minimal bureaucracies, and the rule of law for successful economies, whether we are talking about "precapitalist" Indian societies or modern democracies. Because *The Political Economy of North American Indians*, even with its Marxist rhetoric, sheds light on the stifling effect of federal

control and on the potential for self-determination, I am pleased to have it in my library.

Terry L. Anderson
Montana State University

Sanctuaries of Spanish New Mexico. By Marc Treib. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993. 352 pages.

The pueblos of New Mexico fascinate American historians because these villages, like no others on the continent, contain a profound architectural record of European colonialism. In them, a modest, unbroken building tradition of an ancient indigenous people persists in the shadow of the aggressively monumental churches of Spanish conquerors. Though constructed of the same materials and by means of similar technologies, the two types of buildings are worlds apart. Their superficial similarities cannot disguise the facts of their antithetical origins: The pueblos sought an organic union between a complex society and a severe environment, while the churches were instruments to impose an alien ideology on a people and their land. Therefore, a reading of the architectural record, either by a direct observer of the pueblos or by a scholar of historical documents, is sure to reveal many problems of interpretation.

Some authors, appealing to popular myths and blinded by the exotic character of adobe forms, have overlooked the underlying dilemma of the pueblos as we see them today. The European town is the implicit model for their uncritical acceptance of a village dominated by a monumental church. They have ignored the fact that, unlike European towns, the pueblos have been composed since the sixteenth century as an urban form reflecting the often hostile juxtaposition of two entirely different cultures. Other, more scholarly work has sought to reconcile this cultural confrontation by showing the extent to which European architectural and liturgical ideals adjusted themselves to the demands of life on a colonial frontier, and how in turn the Pueblo people adapted to an alien ideology.

In this context, Marc Treib's *Sanctuaries of Spanish New Mexico* is a valuable contribution to architectural scholarship. Following on the canonical texts in the field by Bunting, Kessel, Kubler, and others, the book provides a well-crafted overview of the physical