

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Ordeal of Change: The Southern Utes and Their Neighbors. By Frances Leon Quintana.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8j34m93z>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

McPherson, Robert S.

Publication Date

2005

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

intersections between Okfuskee/Creek and Anglo-American life and also point to Anglo-Americans' growing refusal to countenance these connections. These insightful discussions are, unfortunately, too brief; thus, the complexity of the cross-cultural connections sometimes lacks force, as in the discussion of gender roles and female authority. Nonetheless, Piker's overarching argument that historians of early America need to account for Native peoples remains uncompromised, and this book serves as an excellent model for such inquiry.

Barbara Krauthamer
New York University

Ordeal of Change: The Southern Utes and Their Neighbors. By Frances Leon Quintana, with an afterword by Richard O. Clemmer. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2004. 157 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Until recently, the Southern Utes have not been the subject of much scholarly investigation. Compared to neighboring tribes like the Navajo, many of the Plains groups, or the Pueblo people (ancestral and contemporary), these American Indians have captured neither the attention of the academician nor the imagination of the general public. Small in size, but important in their historical role, the Southern Utes are starting to come into their own, with a half dozen reliable works recently completed and available on the shelf. Quintana and Clemmer have added to this growing body of knowledge.

Change, over a fifty-year period (1877–1926), is the authors' principal focus. Quintana's study examines the effects of contact with the dominant culture when imposed on a large scale. During this period the federal government not only moved the Southern Utes from a hunting and gathering society and disposed of their lands after placing them on a reservation but also enforced a conscious policy to bring them culturally and economically into white society. Not surprisingly, these attempts were met with resistance and the failure of both groups to embrace cross-cultural possibilities. This scenario is familiar to anyone who has studied federal relations with American Indian tribes.

One might ask, what makes the Ute experience different from any other tribe? In some respects, nothing. The book follows the well-known trail of lost lands, displaced Indian leadership, the boarding school era, land allotment, the Indian Reorganization Act, termination, the efforts of the Great Society, and contemporary growth in self-sufficiency. The resulting squalor, mistreatment, depression, and theft, especially in the early years, are effectively but briefly rendered. Still, there is nothing surprising.

The main focus of this work is not to provide substantial detail about the Southern Ute experience but rather to analyze elements of change as they apply to their circumstances. Quintana depends heavily on government records located in the Denver Federal Records Center, where she worked as a graduate student (1959) under Omer C. Stewart. In 1960 she performed

limited fieldwork among the Southern Utes, but her endnotes indicate a primary reliance on the records in Denver. Thus, the government or white perspective dominates the pages of this study and only inferentially does the Ute view surface.

Until 1868 the Southern Utes, comprising the Wiminuch, Muwach, and Kapota bands (spellings vary, but these are the ones Quintana uses), hunted and gathered over an area that encompassed northwestern New Mexico, southwestern Colorado, and southeastern Utah. As white encroachment on these lands became more expansive and friction occurred, the Native peoples became compressed on an ever-shrinking reservation in southwestern Colorado. The Allotment Act of 1887 initiated further change, and by 1895 the tribe was divided into two contiguous reservations—the Southern Ute headquartered in Ignacio and the Ute Mountain Utes in Towaoc. The general composition of the former was Muwach and Kapota, the latter Wiminuch. From the government's perspective, the Southern Ute reservation was open for allotment, allowing for individual ownership of land, while the Ute Mountain Utes followed the older practice of communal ownership.

Quintana dwells primarily on the history of the Southern Utes of Ignacio. Perhaps this is because the change would presumably be more dramatic and easier to quantify as the dominant culture challenged traditional practices. Allotment was a direct assault on earlier tribal patterns, whereas the people at Towaoc were considered less "progressive" in their attempt to maintain the older lifestyle. If this was the reason that the Southern Utes are featured, the author missed an opportunity for comparison as part of her measurement of change. Richard K. Young, in *The Ute Indians of Colorado in the Twentieth Century* (1997), tackles this question and, when comparing the Towaoc Utes to the others, finds that the "difference between this band and the other two Southern Ute bands were magnified tremendously in the aftermath of the events of 1895" (58). Quintana does not draw this distinction.

There are other missed opportunities. For instance, there is little mention of some major events, such as the impact of World War I and the subsequent Ute reaction. The influenza epidemic of 1918 created a large stir that caused people to move away from their usual places, raised fears about the vaccination process, and encouraged suspicion about the dominant culture's role in this dread pandemic. Another noteworthy absence is the conclusion of the issue of Removal in 1895. While the author mentions the role of the agents in both helping and hindering the process of sending the Utes to Utah and away from the white population of Colorado, events in the dramatic conclusion are not discussed. Nothing is said about Agent David Day entering Utah with more than eleven hundred Southern Utes to possess the lands that they thought had been allocated for their use. The arrival of Utah governor Caleb West with an arsenal of fifty rifles to be issued to the Mormon settlers inhabiting the land did little to calm the situation. Neither did the threat to call out the state militia if the federal government refused to turn the Indians back to where they came from. Eventually peace prevailed, the Indians returned to Colorado after availing themselves of hunting in the area, and the Colorado reservations became the permanent

solution. Both Ignacio and Buckskin Charlie, whom Quintana discusses extensively, participated in this event, which is the culmination of a lengthy section in the book on Removal. If there is one reason why some of these things have been omitted, it may be because the author depended too heavily on her single source of government material.

Quintana's stated purpose is to evaluate change. She selects the categories of economics, politics, education, and medico-religious practices as the primary fields in which to explore it. For instance, in the economic realm there was a move to replace "nomadism" with fixed residences, hunting and gathering with farming and stock raising, communal with individual enterprise, and shared property with individual control. To these efforts she applies anthropological terms such as *assimilation* and *syncretism* (both mosaic and compartmentalized) to explain what happened. She concludes that the Utes "had neither merged with nor become dominated by any segment of the forces composing contact relations" (109). There was also a high degree of inconsistency in change that occurred, depending on individual circumstances. The one fairly consistent and positive force in easing the Utes into aspects of twentieth-century white society was provided by neighboring Hispanic communities. Having had two centuries of interaction between the two groups, there seemed to be a much greater acceptance of shared values and selective borrowing.

This book's afterword, by Clemmer, is a well-reasoned synopsis that provides the reader with a current survey on the Utes' status since the first quarter of the twentieth century. Using the familiar pan-Indian events of the Indian Reorganization Act, termination, and so forth, he shows their impact on a tribal level. While any one of these topics could be greatly expanded, there is enough information for the reader to see that the process of change has taken large steps toward the dominant society. For example, the role of casinos in the tribal economy, the fact that less than two-thirds of the Southern Utes now live on the reservation, the loss of the traditional language, and continuing legal battles over water rights are all indicators of changing times. However, there are also elements such as the spring Bear Dance, the establishment of a Ute Academy, and an active Elders Council that promise a continuation of aspects of the culture. When contrasted with the period that Quintana examined, today's attitudes have moved in the opposite direction of maintaining tribal identity and cultural preservation.

Ordeal of Change, despite its omissions, is a good book. Although the author did not totally evaluate the impact of change on the tribe during a fifty-year period, she has tried to quantify what that change was. When this work is used in conjunction with other, recent sources about the tribe, a more complete picture can be obtained about the Southern Utes.

Robert S. McPherson

College of Eastern Utah, San Juan Campus