

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Boundaries Between the Southern Paiutes, 1775–1995. By Martha C. Knack.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8gm7w1cc>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Stucki, Larry R.

Publication Date

2002-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

and again at death.” Now the husband, in his “endless mourning,” struggles with his knowledge of the ghost that was his wife, but the poem ends in almost heart-breaking beauty with lines that balance the complexities of love, identified with the astringent chokecherries of the Great Plains, with grasshoppers, always in Louis’s poetic vision, a symbol of aridity and sterility:

Listen,
 when the chokecherries
 ripen, you’ll hear me call.
 When the grasshoppers
 wither, I’ll be standing
 with you.
 Upon the ghost road,
 hand in hand,
 our dry lips dark
 with cherry blood,
 we’ll sing our song
 of what was us.
 When the chokecherries
 ripen, look for me.

I’ll be there, I promise.

Dancing up a dust storm
 with all our lost days.

Robert L. Berner

University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh (emeritus)

Boundaries Between the Southern Paiutes, 1775–1995. By Martha C. Knack. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2001. 450 pages. \$50.00 cloth.

This history is by far the most comprehensive work that has ever been written on the Southern Paiutes. It is a well-documented story of how the members of these very small foraging groups survived the almost complete destruction of their aboriginal resource base and the heavy-handed attempts to erase their unique ethnic identity. However, as the author points out, unlike what happened to better known Indian tribes in the United States, the Southern Paiutes “were never targets of U.S. cavalry campaigns” (p. 2), which were not needed to destroy the ability of these people to survive in the desert by traditional means. For, as Knack writes: “two or three men on horseback with repeating rifles were enough to seize a spring” (p. 2); horses, cows, farmers, and traveling wagon trains quickly destroyed fields of seed producing grasses; and newly mounted Ute slave raiders stole many women and children.

As a consequence of unpredictable rainfall patterns, in precontact time no single place could be relied upon to provide even a single family with depend-

able sustenance. Thus, these “people had to be mobile”(p. 14), an ability that would also prove to be the key in explaining their survival strategies in the post-contact world. Their mobility greatly frustrated numerous Bureau of Indian Affairs agents who through the years tried their best to stop the movement of individuals and families from one reservation to another. And their mobility also helped defeat continuous attempts to “break up the Indian reservation system, allot the lands in severalty, extinguish the Indian title, destroy tribal relations, deal with Indians in their individual capacity, and absorb them into the national life as American citizens” (p. 137), preferably as individual family farmers. Also, adding greatly to the frustration of early federal agents was the “virtual monopoly of control” (p. 74) exercised by leaders of the Mormon Church in the new Utah territory.

The author does an excellent job in defending Utah’s Paiutes against the accusation that they were the “sole and autonomous” killers of more than 100 men, women, and children in the infamous Mountain Meadows Massacre (p. 79). Instead, there is increasing evidence (e.g., the newly published *Blood of the Prophets: Brigham Young and the Massacre at Mountain Meadows* by Will Bagley) that Mormon Church leaders and members, many disguised as Indians, were the prime organizers and killers. A key passage that the author should have included in the main text rather than in a footnote is the following: “The relevant factor is that an attempt was made to pass off the event as an Indian massacre, with the assumption that this explanation would not be questioned by the American public. Such faith in the racist presumptions of native hostility reflects the frontier attitudes of the times, attitudes that the Mormons of Utah shared with their fellow Americans” (p. 331). However, even those Paiutes bought by Mormons from the Ute slave traders or obtained directly from Paiute parents as adopted children or plural wives were never fully accepted as being freed from the “curse” of their “disobedient” ancestors. Thus, Brigham Young warns his people to: “Treat them kindly, and treat them as Indians, and not as your equals. ... You have been too familiar with them. Your children have mixed promiscuously with them, they have been free in your homes, and some of the brethren have spent too much time in smoking and chatting with them. ... Live with them and seek to raise them to our level instead of sinking ourselves by condescending to their vile and filthy habits” (pp. 62, 64). The author clearly documents in this comprehensive work, that of all the non-Indians surrounding the Paiutes, contact with the Mormons was by far the most intense and intimate: “The Paiute children bought by Mormons never became full members of non-Indian society, rarely married or had children of their own, and often lived only short lives. Children of mixed ancestry ... were more readily absorbed by Paiute society than by non-Indian communities” (p. 310). Other non-Indian communities such as Las Vegas, for many years, maintained an even sharper boundary between non-Indians and Paiutes by using Paiute workers whenever there was a need for cheap, unskilled labor but denying them access to water, sewer, and electric lines (p. 263) as well as schooling for their children (p. 109). However, Knack briefly points out that even on the Navajo Reservation where Paiutes have become virtually indistinguishable culturally from their Navajo neigh-

bors, in 1989 they won a long battle to obtain a separate federally recognized tribal identity despite legal attempts by the Navajo tribe to reverse this BIA decision (pp. 287–288).

One of the highlights of this important book is the discussion of why the Utah Paiutes were selected for termination despite being less prepared for it than their close relatives, the Kaibab Band, just across the state line in Arizona (p. 262). The difficulties that the terminated bands encountered before regaining federal recognition are well documented as well as the often frustrating struggle of all of the bands, both those terminated and those not, to create viable economic opportunities for their enrolled members. Today, having “left behind nineteenth century visions of self sufficiency through reservation-based agriculture” (p. 296), their “greatest economic successes have been where they joined the regional shift toward upper-middle-class tourism” (p. 296). Unfortunately for the other bands, the main beneficiary of this shift has been the band with the best location, downtown Las Vegas.

Larry R. Stucki

Reading Area Community College

Clearing a Path: Theorizing the Past in Native American Studies. Edited by Nancy Shoemaker. New York: Routledge, 2002. 215 pages. \$80.00 cloth; \$21.95 paper.

Nancy Shoemaker, in her introduction to *Clearing a Path: Theorizing the Past in Native American Studies*, notes that historians often shy away from theory. She argues that this tendency is particularly true for scholars specializing in American Indian history. Within the field of American Indian studies, the trend for several generations of scholarship has been to focus on the particular experiences of American Indian nations and avoid universalizing theories. Nonetheless, Shoemaker believes it is necessary to engage with and develop theories for studying American Indian history, and to that end she has organized this collection. The eight essays in this collection, authored by Native and non-Native scholars from several disciplines, provide a variety of ways to connect theory with studies of American Indian history.

Native systems of knowledge and ways of knowing the past, as expressed through Native stories, oral traditions, and language, receive important attention in several essays. The opening essay, Julie Cruikshank’s “Oral History, Narrative Strategies and Native American Historiography: Perspectives from the Yukon Territory, Canada,” uses the stories of two Tlingit and Tagish women to examine the work performed by narrative. Angela Sidney, a community historian, and Kitty Smith, a community member whose carvings were acquired by a local museum, worked with Cruikshank during the 1970s to record their life histories. In this essay, Cruikshank explores the women’s incorporation of oral traditions into their life stories, arguing that for Sidney and Smith these “stories were not merely *about* the past, they also provided guidelines for understanding change” (p. 13). Cruikshank argues that oral