

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Indian Lives: Essays on Nineteenth and Twentieth Century Native American Leaders. Edited by L. G. Moses and Raymond Wilson.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8bn7s5t6>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 10(1)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Shulte, Steven C.

### Publication Date

1986

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

characteristics of its local speech patterns as it is to the speech itself as a defining and identifying factor" (23).

John Murdoch reports that the Inuit, like the Montagnais, are not disposed to compromise their local dialects to facilitate wider communication. Whereas Mailhot despairs, however, Murdoch defends the wisdom of small bands which assert their own independence and autonomy and seek to perpetuate the diversity and flexibility of their ancestors. He warns against imposing "ethnocentric Euro-Canadian priorities" on the "development of literacy priorities by hunter-gatherers" (135). "Confidence," he says, "must be restored in the orthography native to each community whether syllabic or alphabetic."

Another Inuktitutist, S. T. Mallon, makes an "optimistic forecast" (156): "complete standardization . . . throughout the school systems" in the eastern arctic in the next 5-10 years, "steady but unspectacular development of a literature, [and] increasing familiarity with roman [orthography] leading to increased interest in Greenlandic" (156). "As for a pessimistic forecast," he says,

all we need to guarantee that is a failure of will on the part of the Inuit, a reversed or slackening of present declared government policies, and a drying up of support. In that case, the future would be too bleak to contemplate, and I do not intend to finish this article by outlining it.

*Willard Walker*  
Wesleyan University

**Indian Lives: Essays on Nineteenth and Twentieth Century Native American Leaders.** Edited by L. G. Moses and Raymond Wilson. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985 227 pp. \$19.95 Cloth. \$9.95 Paper.

*Indian Lives* is the most recent example of an increasingly popular genre in American Indian historiography—the short biographical anthology. L. G. Moses and Raymond Wilson have assembled essays on a diverse group of subjects representing almost two hundred years of American Indian leadership. Both

editors are experienced biographers who have written on Native American subjects.

With such a broad focus, the editors attempt to tie the subjects together in an introductory essay. As a field of inquiry, American Indian leadership has been largely neglected by scholars. Moses and Wilson include figures who have maintained an Indian identity "during times when it proved difficult to do so" (13). Each leader attempted to "create a world" where Indians could remain Indians, "according to his or her particular vision" (14). Each subject also had been profoundly impacted by cultures, institutions or agencies, outside the tribe. Obviously, the United States government usually presented the greatest challenge to Indian leadership skills. According to the editors, a strong conception of "Indianness" binds the biographical subjects together, despite vastly differing historical experiences. Employing this selection criteria, eight short studies are included in *Indian Lives*: Maris Bryant Pierce (Seneca), Nampeyo (Hopi-Tewa), Dr. Susan LaFlesche Picotte (Omaha), Henry Chee Dodge (Navajo), Charles Curtis (Kaw), Luther Standing Bear (Brule Sioux), Minnie Kellogg (Oneida), and Peterson Zah (Navajo).

As with any collection of essays, some contributions stand above the others. Several of the essays demonstrate a significant amount of original research based on primary sources. Others are largely based on secondary sources, but nevertheless provide an interesting and useful overview of the subject's life. Valerie Sherer Mathes' essay on Susan LaFlesche Picotte is an especially well done account of an Indian woman caught between the forces of her tribal past, and the dominant society of the late nineteenth century. Similarly, Laurence M. Hauptman's fine study of Minnie Kellogg demonstrates both extensive research and a sophisticated understanding of the forces which shaped early twentieth century Iroquois politics. Kellogg, one of the most controversial twentieth century Iroquois leaders, is portrayed by Hauptman as contributing, whether by design or accident, to the revival of traditional Iroquois culture. Readers interested in sensing the complexity of modern tribal factionalism are well-advised to consult Hauptman's essay.

Several other essays, though not as original in research or design, are nevertheless significant biographical contributions. Richard N. Ellis' study of Luther Standing Bear provides a context for understanding this notable Sioux writer's life. David M.

Brugge's assessment of Henry Chee Dodge, though largely based upon secondary sources, succeeds in placing the Navajo leader within the complex modern political history of that tribe. George M. Lubick's study of contemporary political leader Peterson Zah stresses his largely successful blending of traditional tribal values with a progressive outlook. Lubick's essay is the only contribution which addresses the life of a post-1945 Indian political figure.

It might be fruitless to question why a certain subject was included in this anthology. After all, Indian leadership has been a neglected area of scholarly inquiry and almost any contribution might be deemed significant. Yet several misgivings must be noted. William Unruh's otherwise well written study of United States Vice President Charles Curtis might not meet the editors' criteria for inclusion. Similarly, it is difficult to see how Maris Bryant Pierce and Nampeyo can be considered significant leaders. Its broad chronological coverage is both *Indian Lives*' greatest strength as well as the source of its shortcomings. Its breadth makes it an attractive resource to supplement readings for surveys of American Indian history, but the essays lack overall unity. A more topical or chronological approach could have been more effective. In particular, the volume's lack of emphasis after 1945 is lamentable.

*Indian Lives* appears on the heels of two similar essay collections, R. David Edmunds' *American Indian Leaders* (University of Nebraska Press, 1980) and H. Glenn Jordan and Thomas M. Holm, *Indian Leaders: Oklahoma's First Statesmen* (Oklahoma Historical Society, 1979). There is much to recommend the short essay approach to Indian biography. In the past, a perceived lack of material has deterred scholars from writing Indian life histories. The scarcity of biographical material is both real and imagined; yet for many of the subjects in *Indian Lives*, full length studies would be both possible and welcomed. It is thus hoped that *Indian Lives* would act as a catalyst to inspire further investigation into the careers of Indian leaders in general, and its eight subjects specifically.

Steven C. Shulte  
College of the Ozarks