

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Federal Cylinder Project: A Guide to Field Cylinder Collections in Federal Agencies. Volume 2: Northeastern Indian Catalog, Southeastern Indian Catalog. Edited by Judith A. Gray and Dorothy Sara Lee.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8963t5z0>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 10(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Forry, Mark E.

Publication Date

1986-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Reviews

The Federal Cylinder Project: A Guide to Field Cylinder Collections in Federal Agencies. Volume 2: Northeastern Indian Catalog, Southeastern Indian Catalog. Edited by Judith A. Gray and Dorothy Sara Lee. Washington, D.C.: American Folklife Center, 1985. xii + 419 pp. \$14.00 Cloth.

This exceptional research aid addresses a major need in Native American studies: the lack of bibliographic access to early sound recordings. In the last two years, guides have been published to the two largest collections of cylinder recordings in the United States; those held by the Library of Congress and other federal agencies, and those held by the Archives of Traditional Music at Indiana University. A similar project is under way for the third, the Lowie Museum of Anthropology at the University of California at Berkeley. This activity is a response to several contemporary tendencies in Native American scholarship: a review of the methodologies and published work of early scholars, a renewed interest in early archival recordings, and the emerging awareness of the desirability of repatriating tribal materials to their rightful custodians.

Until recently, information concerning Native American recorded sound resources has been limited. Jamake Highwater's discography of American Indian music (*Stereo Review*, 1973), now long outdated, is the only published guide to commercially-available recordings; a current discographic project at the UCLA Ethnomusicology Archive has yet to be published. Dorothy Sara Lee's *Native North American Music and Oral Data* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1979) treats field and commercial recordings housed at the Indiana University Archive of Traditional Music as of 1976; it is an important (and at the time of its

publication, the only) source of documentation on early field recordings. Indiana University's holdings in cylinder recordings have also been documented in Anthony Seeger and Louise S. Spear's recent *Early Field Recordings* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987), and their work serves as a valuable complement to the Cylinder Project catalogs. Both Indiana works include subject indices, which are very helpful for locating particular genres and for comparative work.

This is the third published volume of a multi-volume catalog of cylinder recordings held by federal agencies. Under the auspices of the American Folklife Center (a part of the Library of Congress), the Federal Cylinder Project "has three fundamentally interrelated goals: the preservation and duplication of wax cylinder recordings, the documentation and archiving of cylinder collections, and the dissemination of the results of the project to the public, particularly to those culture groups from which the material was originally collected" (*Vol. 1: Introduction and Inventory*, p. 7). Recordings of music and language representing nearly 140 Native American groups comprise almost 7000 cylinders, over two-thirds of the cylinder holdings in federal agencies. These collections are documented by Cylinder Project catalogs: volumes 1, 2, and 8 (*Early Anthologies*, 1984) are already in print. Five volumes will represent the remaining catalogs: (1) Plains; (2) Plateau/Great Basin, Northwest Coast/Eskimo, and California; (3) Southwest-Navajo; (4) Southwest-Pueblo; and (5) Southwest-Apache, Papago, and Others, and Middle and South America.

The first volume of the series, *Introduction and Inventory* (1979) edited by Erika Brady, serves as a general introduction to the Cylinder Project, giving technical information on cylinder duplication and preservation and providing an overview of the collections which will be included in the series. As such, it is comparable in scope to the Seeger and Spear work. The volume currently under review consists of two independent catalogs, each with its own foreword, introduction, catalog entries and bibliography. The Northeastern catalog is edited by Judith Gray with a foreword by Thomas Vennum (who is also director of the Cylinder Project), while the Southeastern catalog is edited by Dorothy Sara Lee with a foreword by David Draper. All are scholars who have worked extensively with at least one of the groups represented in this volume and whose experience in assembling

research aids is amply demonstrated by the thoroughness and clarity of the catalogs.

A general preface gives a brief history of the Federal Cylinder Project and explains the basic organization of the catalog and types of information provided in the individual entries. The preface also contains "About the Densmore Recordings," a brief but useful discussion of Frances Densmore's methodology, field technique, and organization scheme. It points out that "the song was the basic organizing unit for Densmore's studies of American Indian music" (p. ix) as opposed to genre or text; this insight is important to an understanding not only of her massive collections but of many early studies of Native American music. The editors' critical review of the scholarship of such early collectors as Densmore, Jesse Walter Fewkes, Alice C. Fletcher, and Paul Radin is an important adjunct to the access to and information about recordings offered by the catalogs.

The catalogs are organized by culture group (tribe) and further grouped by collector. Within the collections, the basic descriptive unit in the catalog is the cylinder. This affords a much greater level of detail than the Indiana catalogs, which are organized at the basic level of the collection. For each cylinder, the catalogs give identification numbers (cylinder number, American Folklife Center number, and collector number), time, a relative indication of recording quality, a brief description of the contents, performers, date of recording, and notes. The notes section gives physical descriptions of the cylinders, technical information regarding the sound quality (a glossary of technical terminology is given in the preface), indications of announcements or other interventions by the collector, notes on documentation, and commentary by the editors and collaborators. Entries for each cylinder are placed two or three per page in an attractive and easily readable format.

The catalogs are more than simple listings of archival holdings. In both catalogs, the editors have reviewed each of the recordings, noting stylistic similarities with other recordings, indicating stylistic dissimilarities which may indicate that the cylinder's documentation is in error, and supplying references to other works by the collector. The Densmore material, comprising over half the recordings in the two catalogs, is particularly rich with cross-references; citations are given to volume and page number in Densmore's monographs for selections from given cylinders

which have been transcribed and analyzed. The notes sections also give indications of items from the Densmore collection which have been commercially released on Library of Congress (Chippewa and Menominee) and Folkways (Seminole) recordings. Mention should also be made of several other commercial reissues of cylinder recordings not listed in the catalogs: Folkways FE 4251, "Healing Songs of the American Indians" (1972), which includes reissues of Densmore's material; and the Library of Congress' *Folk Music in America* anthology in 15 volumes, which includes two flute songs from Densmore's Menominee collection (LBC 2, 1976) and Fewkes' recording of Noel Josephs' Passamaquoddy Snake Song (LBC 15, 1978). Although the Flute Songs may be found in the cylinder catalog, the Snake Song could not be correlated by date or AFS number with those in the catalog.

Some other minor criticisms may be offered as suggestions for future volumes. In a reference work of this size, it would be helpful to have running heads to locate given tribes and collections. The entries look much the same from section to section, and when using the work to look for documentation of a given recording, particularly those located in the longer sections of Densmore's recordings, one has to locate the beginning of the collection and then go through sequentially to find a given cylinder. An arrangement with a culture area and culture group on the verso head (i.e., "Northeastern: Chippewa") and the collection on the recto head (i.e., "Densmore Collection") would make the collection much more handy for reference work. In addition, alternative arrangements of the concordances would be useful in this regard. The concordances are ordered by cylinder number as given by the American Folklife Center and as such provide a good overview of given collections and correlations with performers. However, when trying to find information on a given transcription from the Densmore monographs, one must try to locate the cylinder using Densmore's field number or collection number. This is sometimes difficult, particularly in the Winnebago collection, where her field numbering does not run parallel to the cylinder numbering. A concordance ordered by collector number would alleviate this problem. There are a few instances of erroneous cross-references; however, a small percentage of such errors are unavoidable in a work of this magnitude.

While the dissemination phase of the Cylinder Project is discussed in the introductory volume, editorial modesty seems to have precluded further mention in the catalogs of what is to my mind a remarkable aspect of this project. At the request of Indian performers, project staff members have been actively contacting members of tribal governments and have made copies of the cylinder recordings and catalogs available in local Indian communities. Such activities are a part of the ongoing work of the American Folklife Center, activities which include assistance with starting tribal archives and museums, acquiring archival and museum materials, and contacts with funding sources. In some areas, the revitalization of traditions, the reincorporation of older repertoire, and the completion of missing portions of ceremonies attest to the uses to which the recordings and catalogs can be put and ultimately to the success of the project. Further information concerning the project's dissemination phase may be found in the Library of Congress Information Bulletin (45:45):369-370 (Nov. 10, 1986) and the Folklife Center News 9(1):14-15 (Jan.-Mar. 1986), as well as volume 1 of the Cylinder Project catalogs.

This work constitutes a major research tool in the study of Native American culture and is valuable contribution to critical studies in anthropology and ethnomusicology. The editors and project staff deserve praise for their efforts, and I am certain that we may anticipate that future catalogs will be equally useful and important.

Mark E. Forry

University of California, Los Angeles

The Choctaw Before Removal. Edited by Carolyn Keller Reeves. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1985. 243 pp. \$20.00 Cloth.

"Who Speaks for the Choctaw?" With this introduction, Carolyn Keller Reeves and Samuel J. Wells, two contributors to *The Choctaw Before Removal*, present the other six contributors who speak for the Choctaw. When there are so many writers there is danger of a lack of cohesion and continuity because style, sources and interpretations can be vastly different. However, that is not the case; a certain amount of continuity is provided because