well-rounded presentation of the Silbermans' personalities, their motivations and methods in collecting Native art, how they interacted with others in the field of Indian art, and how Native peoples viewed the Silbermans and their collection. Some scholars and Native peoples found Mr. Silberman rather difficult to interact with. The role and impact of the collection in previous museum exhibits could also have been explored further (8). Furthermore, the anthropological concept of syncretism and the principals associated with this process of cultural blending and its contexts would aid Szabo in her discussion of hybridity (172).

In comparison with some earlier and more general works on Fort Marion art, this book focuses on a specific collection of drawings from this period. Whereas *Kiowa Memories* and the recently published *A Kiowa's Odyssey* focus on the drawings contained in specific books or ledgers, this work focuses on those of a specific couple's art collection. As additional Fort Marion works are brought to light through publication and analysis, our larger knowledge of this unique period in Plains Indian art, its artists and their experiences, and the genre of works they produced is enhanced.

Overall, I like this work and enjoyed reading it. It is concise, clear, easy to read, and beautifully illustrated. It synthesizes many seminal aspects of the Fort Marion experience in salient fashion and the Indian art produced there, makes another set of works from this unique experience accessible, and represents a solid contribution to studies of Plains Indian and Fort Marion art. As such it will be a useful contribution for scholars of Plains Indian cultures and arts.

William C. Meadows
Missouri State University

Bad Fruits of the Civilized Tree: Alcohol and the Sovereignty of the Cherokee Nation. By Izumi Ishii. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 260 pages. $45.00 cloth.

In this well-written and accessible book, Izumi Ishii aims to examine "the ways in which the Cherokees integrated alcohol into their society and used it both culturally and strategically" from the early eighteenth century to the beginning of Oklahoma statehood in 1907 (2). She calls for scholars to move beyond simple tropes of Indian drunkenness, to consider the ways Indians brought alcohol into their lives, and to investigate how particular Indian groups dealt with this European innovation. Her research "demonstrates that the history of alcohol among the Cherokees was not simply a narrative of the conquest and destruction of Native society," but was far more complicated than that (11). The use of alcohol certainly became a problem at times, she argues, but there were other possibilities, and "Cherokees managed to regulate consumption in ways that asserted their sovereignty and demonstrated their morality" (165).

Specialists may not find these arguments entirely surprising, but Ishii does a fine job of showing us aspects of the constantly evolving Cherokee

engagement with alcohol. For example, her book begins with a chapter that summarizes the Cherokees' initial experiences with alcohol during the eighteenth century and argues that, in these experiences, we can see both "Cherokee vulnerability" and "Cherokee cultural adaptability" (36–37). She then turns to twin chapters devoted to Cherokee experiences in the pre-Removal nineteenth century, with a particular emphasis on politics and national sovereignty. Ishii shows first how Cherokee leaders used alcohol regulations as part of their debate with the US government over the powers and prerogatives of Indian nations, and then how Cherokees integrated alcohol policies into their efforts to adopt—and to be seen as having adopted—aspects of Euro-American "civilization." For those who have read William McLoughlin's work, this material will be recognizable, but Ishii has provided an effective, in-depth discussion of one facet of his Cherokee renascence.

Her later chapters follow the same basic strategy: focus on a particular period of Cherokee history and then put alcohol-related issues at the center of the book's narrative about that era. Thus, she argues in chapter 4 that, in the immediate aftermath of Removal, social trauma led to increased alcohol consumption but also to "a reinvigorated temperance movement that promised to transcend [the] political factionalism" tearing apart Cherokee country (104). Chapter 5 turns to the years immediately following the Civil War, during which time, Ishii suggests, the "inability to regulate alcohol epitomized the erosion of Cherokee institutions, values, and sovereignty" (111). Likewise, chapter 6 chronicles the ways in which Cherokee temperance advocates' criticism of the nation's enforcement of its own laws helped to undermine Cherokee sovereignty and bring on Oklahoma statehood, while other Cherokees used prohibition as a way to argue for Indian political autonomy. Throughout, she is sensitive to gender issues, noting how the temperance movement moved from excluding Cherokee women from the nation's political life to encouraging those women to make a substantial contribution to their nation's public debates. Each chapter is clearly argued and well researched, with the exception of chapter 1, which relies almost entirely on published primary sources and attempts to cover too much ground in too few pages.

It is not clear if these chapters—either as discrete entities or as a whole—fundamentally alter our understanding of Cherokee history and Indian experiences with alcohol. That said, however, Ishii's book does provide a solid case study, one that offers readers both a well-focused narrative about a Native people's struggles with alcohol and an accessible overview of two centuries of Cherokee history. Ishii's decision to focus on the Cherokee Nation materially enhances the book's value and will hopefully win it a wide readership. Putting the Cherokees at the book's center allows us to particularize Indian experiences with alcohol. It thus furthers the effort to counteract the drunken Indian stereotype, and it helps us to understand the many roles alcohol and alcohol-related debates played in the history of real Native people.

That said, I do have some concerns about *Bad Fruits*. Although the book's tight focus on alcohol has its advantages, a willingness to venture further afield topically would have allowed Ishii to make a more significant

contribution. She might, for example, have compared Cherokee debates over alcohol with contemporaneous Cherokee efforts to deal with other socially charged issues. The obvious point of comparison for Ishii's material on alcohol would have been the Cherokee conversation about race, an issue that surfaces all too briefly in Ishii's discussion of the nation's post–Civil War efforts to deal with intermarried white men. A more sustained engagement with the work of scholars such as Tiya Miles, David Chang, and Fay Yarbrough would have opened up the possibility of using alcohol not simply to illustrate the Cherokees' developmental trajectory but also to weigh the many forces that have shaped the nation's history.

There are also, it seems to me, two problems with this book that transcend its narrowness of field. To begin with, Ishii has an unfortunate habit of assuming that the Cherokee Nation's laws and even the activities of Cherokee temperance societies manifest the almost entirely unchallenged will of the Cherokee people. In so doing, she neglects the political nature of politics—the contests and disagreements, the tensions and arguments. Ishii is willing—in describing the Euro-American temperance movement—to quote the historian Ian Tyrrell's view that temperance involved "the social control by one group over another," but she exhibits no sustained interest in what that might mean within Cherokee society (61). The end result is a narrative that flattens Cherokee politics and homogenizes Cherokee society. To be sure, Ishii makes the occasional nod toward dissent, but she never investigates the dissenters' perspectives, and she portrays Cherokees who failed to fall in line with the "national consensus" not as resisters with their own social, cultural, and political agendas but rather as dysfunctional deviants (108).

That emphasis on deviance connects quite clearly to the book's second significant problem: Ishii's uncritical adoption of the perspective put forward by temperance advocates that alcohol is a "bad fruit," full stop. Once the leaders of the Cherokee Nation began advocating for temperance in the years leading up to Removal, her earlier analysis of the positive or neutral ways Cherokees could incorporate alcohol into their lives goes out the window. The perspective of those Cherokees who did continue to drink is almost completely missing. From the late 1820s on, in Ishii's view, those people were simply a problem and so was the liquor they drank. Thus, she writes of the temptation and vice of alcohol, notes that "individual Cherokees faltered," and asserts that failing to regulate alcohol undermined Cherokee values (166). When national leaders failed to sign a temperance pledge, it indicated "a decline in moral standards," and when "Cherokees managed to regulate consumption" of alcohol, that "demonstrated their morality" (148, 165). This antidrinking rhetoric even leads to factual errors, as when Ishii refers to "drunkenness and other forms of lawlessness" despite an earlier discussion noting that, while selling alcohol was prohibited in the nation, "Cherokees did not make drunkenness a crime" (167, 129). It is a slight exaggeration—but not as slight as I would like—to say that, if Ishii intended to write a protemperance brief for Lyman Beecher and his ilk, she hit the mark.

It is difficult to see how this material matches up with her call—made in the introduction's invocation of "the complexity of Indian drinking,"

reinvoked in the conclusion's reference to "a complicated" Native relationship to alcohol, and enacted to some extent in chapters 1 and 2—for a more nuanced approach to Indian experiences with alcohol (2, 165). Ishii writes, "a focus on alcohol as simply a problem threatens to objectify the Cherokee people who consumed it, incorporated it, abused it, regulated it, and opposed it" (167). Readers will wish that, in this case, she had profited from her own wisdom.

That said, however, Ishii's book has much to recommend. It would certainly work well in an undergraduate classroom and will take its place on my ever-growing shelf of books devoted to the eminently worthwhile project of explicating and evaluating Cherokee responses to the nineteenth century's challenges and opportunities.

Joshua Piker
University of Oklahoma

Border Fictions: Globalization, Empire, and Writing at the Boundaries of the United States. By Claudia Sadowski-Smith. Charlottesville and London: University of Virginia Press, 2008. 208 pages. $57.50 cloth; $20.00 paper.

In her book, *Border Writing: The Multidimensional Text*, Emily Hicks asks, "If writing is always a rereading, is not reading always a rewriting?" (1991, 11). Although literary critics had explored the topic for decades, Hicks's rigorously nonessentialist deployment of theory, historiography, and literary criticism set the standard for "border theory" in 1991. *Border Fictions* by Claudia Sadowski-Smith also focuses on the ragged edges of American culture and politics. By using the methodologies of ethnography and comparative literature, Sadowski-Smith examines the narrative record of spaces where countries and communities collide at national and personal levels. Her work is continental, important, and new in many ways. A few topics were not mentioned, and there is a great deal of politics in this volume of literary criticism, but for the most part, she pushes readers to "reread" the stories of the borderlands and to think differently about identity and community.

The "borders" examined by Sadowski-Smith are the political and historical result of US empire building. Her focus is primarily on the northern area where the United States meets Canada and the southern divide between the United States and Mexico. Although these areas appear to be well defined, she argues they are fragmented environments where economic, cultural, and political distinctions are magnified.

The "fiction" examined includes novels, short stories, autobiographies, and drama. She does not limit herself to a single genre, gender, or ethnicity and mentions in several places the ways in which stories of these borderlands become emblematic retellings that apply more broadly to entire communities, time periods, or events. She also notes which texts were published in the author's first language and traces their distribution to show how they often only gain recognition when translated into the "official" language of the