

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Cherokee Indian Nation: A Troubled History. Edited by Duane H. King.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/84g442wc>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 5(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Wilson, Terry P.

Publication Date

1981

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

directly related to Oklahoma Indian history than to that of Nebraska.

As an introductory work for general readers, this book is adequate. While there is some variation in quality, the chapters, although brief, are informative, but prospective readers might do better to look elsewhere. For example, W. David Baird and Gary Moulton have books in print on their subjects, Peter Pitchlynn and John Ross; Arrell Gibson's tribal history of the Chickasaws provides a better source for the Colbert family than does his brief chapter on the Colberts; and Donald Berthrong's study of the Southern Cheyennes similarly includes more information on Black Kettle and in the full context of Cheyenne history. Coverage of some twentieth century leaders would have made the book more valuable.

Richard N. Ellis
University of New Mexico

The Cherokee Indian Nation: A Troubled History. Edited by Duane H. King. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1979. 256 pp. \$12.50.

Some tribes of Indians are more popular than others. For a variety of reasons movie-makers have chosen to feature Plains Indians, especially the Sioux, and Mountain Apaches in their cinematic epics. Anthropologists positively dote on the Navajo and Hopi while other Native American groups attract attention regionally and occasionally because of numbers, militancy, or unusual happenstance. However, if a statistics-prone social scientist were to tabulate the number of publications per tribe the Cherokee would probably top the tally. Now Duane King offers *The Cherokee Indian Nation*, a collection of a dozen interdisciplinary essays, which fortunately occupies the latest rather than the last place on a lengthy list.

Chronologically the volume's articles cover aspects of Cherokee culture from prehistory to the nineteen seventies; topically they are equally far-reaching. King, who is editor of the *Journal of Cherokee Studies*, prefaces his contributors' chapters with substantial and informative introductions designed to place them within

the framework of the three-hundred-year history of the Cherokee dating from initial white contact. Prior to the record of Indian/white relations, the tribe inhabited clusters of towns ranging from them on hunt-expeditions covering an area of 40,000 square miles in parts of the Carolinas, the Virginias, Kentucky, Tennessee, Georgia, and Alabama. Beginning with their first treaty with South Carolina officials in 1684, the Cherokees became increasingly involved with Euro-Americans so that the tribe's pattern of existence was unalterably modified. In 1838 the forced removal of the Cherokees began following years of strained relations between the tribesmen and their Anglo-American neighbors. Surviving removal, involvement in the Civil War, and constant pressures to acculturate, the tribe exists today as two separate entities: the Eastern Cherokees, descendants of those few who managed to avoid moving to Oklahoma where the second and more numerous western contingent is concentrated in several northeastern counties of that state.

Anthropologist Roy S. Dickens, Jr. delineates the archaeological scholarship surrounding "The Origins and Development of Cherokee Culture" in the book's first chapter. With the aid of several excellent maps and photographs Dickens upholds the 1960-1970 revisionist theory that the Cherokees had inhabited the region they lived in at the time of European contact "for a long and relatively unbroken continuum" (p. 11), rather than constituting a culture only recently immigrated to those parts.

The geography of the tribe is also the subject of the third chapter, "Distribution of Eighteenth-Century Cherokee Settlements." Betty Smith uses maps and charts in describing twenty-two Cherokee towns. Her approach, unfortunately, is more summary than analytic as she relegates the discussion of the importance of towns in tribal culture to the final paragraph. The article's somewhat tedious prose does support Smith's not unimportant conclusions that the major settlements were built and rebuilt several times and owed their longevity to the presence of town houses which served as centers for ceremonies and council meetings attended by adjacent hamlets and villages, the latter often mistaken as full-fledged towns.

Law Professor John Phillip Reid, author of *A Law of Blood: The Primitive Law of the Cherokee Nation* (1970) as well as a more recent volume on early Cherokee diplomacy, offers a brief, well-reasoned essay entitled "A Perilous Rule: The Law of International Homicide." Utilizing the experiences of the first Britishers to pene-

trate the Cherokee homeland, Reid discusses the concept of vengeance within the clan and tribal structures distinguishing it from the Indians' international law. He concludes that scholars should discard the erroneous notion that Europeans "introduced the idea of corporate responsibility by treating a nation as a political entity for purposes of demanding satisfaction for homicide" (p. 43). Rather it was southern-Indian law that viewed a killer's people collectively liable.

Also in the realm of international politics is William C. Sturtevant's "The Cherokee Frontiers, the French Revolution, and William Augustus Bowles." A bizarre tale, based on researches in European archives, it chronicles the career of Tory "Indian hobbyist" Bowles who led a delegation of Cherokee and Creeks to London in 1790-91 on a confused and dimly perceived mission. While Sturtevant's account is eminently readable and enhanced by some fascinating portraiture of the Indians in England, its inclusion in this collection is questionable as it sheds more light on Bowles admittedly incredible adventures than illuminating "the role, or the potential role, of the Cherokees in international colonial power politics" (p. 62).

The next four chapters deal with aspects of change in Cherokee life resulting from continuous interfacing with the government of the United States and its citizens. V. Richard Persico, Jr. analyzes "Early Nineteenth-Century Cherokee Political Organization" in a highly satisfactory fashion. He thoroughly explicates his thesis that the "overall trend [of Cherokee political organization] was toward a greater centralization of power" (p. 93), climaxing with the adoption of the 1828 constitution. Persico indicates that the Cherokees combined traditional and European elements to forge a viable polity in response to white pressures but maintained "long-established patterns" internally.

Theda Perdue pursues one of the ethnic history's hottest subjects in "Cherokee Planters: The Development of Plantation Slavery Before Removal." Drawing from materials gathered in preparing her recent book-length publication on slavery and Cherokee society, she relates how the incursion of the white capitalistic system worked a change in tribal society and economics to produce an attenuated system of human bondage. Characteristic of Perdue's exhaustive research is her final judgment fittingly encapsulated in the words of a Cherokee-owned slave: "If I must be a slave, I had by far, rather be a slave to an Indian, than to a white man" (p. 125).

"Chaos in the Indian Country: The Cherokee Nation, 1828-35," by Kenneth Davis, offers additional information on the removal period. Concentrating his attention on the internal troubles of the tribe brought about by Georgia politics, the discovery of gold, and Andrew Jackson's policymaking, Davis's essay amplifies existing knowledge rather than blazing any new interpretative path excepting his comments on the role of Cherokee newspapers during this critical era. In "Postremoval Factionalism in the Cherokee Nation," Gerald Reed narrates a stirring rendition of the bloody and complicated three-sided political struggle in present-day Oklahoma. Thanks to issues raised over removal in their eastern homeland, the Cherokees' internal dissensions were carried west where their relative isolation allowed them to gradually alleviate the problems until the advent of the Civil War exacerbated them anew. Only in the aftermath of that conflict did forty years of factionalism finally die.

Editor King is the author of "The Origin of the Eastern Cherokees as a Social and Political Entity," one of three chapters on the tribe's eastern division. The semi-mythical figure of Tsali is reckoned to be the focus of the Eastern Band's historical self-consciousness. King effectively rescues the Tsali saga from folk legend while acknowledging its importance as such. Richard Iobst in "William Holland Thomas and the Cherokee Claims" details the tortuous trail of litigation and lobbying followed by Thomas in trying to recover monies owed the tribe as set down in the 1835 treaty of removal. The claims were not resolved until 1848 when Thomas's persistence won through the Washington bureaucratic maze. John Witthoft provides a real scholarly service simply by fulfilling the promise of his article's title, "Observations on Social Change among the Eastern Cherokees." He chose to concentrate the discussion of the findings of his field work on economics, health, education, and social problems. Especially illuminating was Witthoft's analytical attack on the role of "white Cherokees" in tribal life since Reconstruction and extending to the present.

"New Militants or Resurrected State? The Five County North-eastern Oklahoma Cherokee Organization," the book's last chapter, was co-authored by Albert L. and Jane Lukens-Wahrhaftig. Their account of the Five County Northeastern Oklahoma Cherokee Organization from 1965 to 1972 constitutes an enviable model for non-Indian ethnohistorical writing. Depending on observations and actual participation with the group, the Wahrhaftigs penetrated beyond press reports to reject a simplistic categoriza-

tion of the Cherokee movement "as an example of . . . sporadic ethnic militantism . . . in the 1960s" and treat "its significance to Cherokee themselves . . ." (p. 223).

Duane King and his contributors should receive thanks from students and scholars in the field for this outstanding collection. The tone of the writing was sympathetic to the plight of the Cherokees without descending into sentimentalization. With a couple of exceptions, the contributors concentrated on the Cherokee people themselves rather than relegating them to the role of passive objects. King performed his editorial labors well, effectually offering a truly interdisciplinary product. Hopefully others will emulate his example with similar compendiums on other Indian nations.

Terry P. Wilson
University of California,
Berkeley

Stand Watie and the Agony of the Cherokee Nation. By Kenny A. Franks. Memphis: Memphis State University Press, 1979. 257 pp. \$12.95.

Until recently, scholars have dealt with American Indian leaders in much the same manner as they have looked upon such historical personages as Robert E. Lee—gallant and admirable enemies who fought losing battles against overwhelming odds. Rarely did historians bother to analyze the cultural and ideological backgrounds of their subjects or seek to explain the internal tribal politics that led Indian leaders to make crucial decisions regarding the future of their people. Too often explanation and analysis were sacrificed for the drama of armed resistance.

Within the last ten years, however, historians have attempted to reverse this methodology in biographical literature, especially concerning tribal politics. The newest trend in American Indian biography has been toward cultural and political analysis. Scholars are concerned now with the motives of American Indian leaders and how those leaders attained status within their tribal political structures. The benefits of this recent scholarship are manifold: Indian leaders are not only better understood but they are also given a degree of humanity, a trait woefully lacking in most of the subjects of older "Great Man" biographies.