

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

New Perspectives on Pottery Mound Pueblo. Edited by Polly Schaafsma.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/84g065h0>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Habicht-Mauche, Judith A.

**Publication Date**

2008

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

remained untouched by the colonial experience and, as a consequence, is the real meaning of sovereignty.

Without doubt this remarkable book should be read by every graduate student interested in Native studies. Cook-Lynn's ideas have a definite place in every traditional discipline. She has rehabilitated a discussion of the place of Native studies in the academy and aroused a renewed sense of purpose in those of us who do research Native studies. *New Indians, Old Wars*, taken in combination with her other works, solidifies Native studies as a true, unique, and freestanding academic discipline.

*Tom Holm*

University of Arizona

**New Perspectives on Pottery Mound Pueblo.** Edited by Polly Schaafsma with a preface by Linda S. Cordell. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2007. 302 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

University of New Mexico Professor Frank C. Hibben conducted a series of archaeological field school excavations at the ancestral Pueblo site of Pottery Mound, New Mexico during the late 1950s and early 1960s. Although Hibben published several general articles and a book on the site's spectacular kiva murals (*The Kiva Art of the Anasazi*, 1975), the findings from these field school excavations and subsequent salvage work at the site have never been fully or adequately reported. Just prior to his death in 2002, Hibben made a large bequest to the Maxwell Museum at the University of New Mexico for the construction of a new archaeological research and storage facility. The Hibben Center now houses most archaeological collections from Pottery Mound, as well as an important archive of field notes, drawings, and unpublished research reports from the site that had previously been in Hibben's private collection.

*New Perspectives on Pottery Mound Pueblo* is based on papers originally presented at a two-day seminar at the School for Advanced Research in Santa Fe, New Mexico in 2004. Some authors (P. Schaafsma, R. G. Vivian, and P. Vivian) participated in the original field school excavations at Pottery Mound with Hibben. Others, such as Adler, Eckert, and Clark, represent a younger generation of Southwest archaeologists who examine the Pottery Mound material with fresh questions and new theoretical approaches. A third group of authors, including Crotty, Hays-Gilpin and LeBlanc, Webster, and Wilcox, examine Pottery Mound from a more comparative perspective that situates the site within a broader regional and historical perspective.

As a group, the chapters provide a good assessment of the range and quality of research materials, artifactual and archival, available from the site and highlight some problems inherent in working with older archaeological collections. As R. G. Vivian and P. Vivian discuss in their contributions to the volume, it is not at all clear that Hibben ever had, and certainly he never articulated, a clear research objective for his work at Pottery Mound. In addition, some field methods that he used, such as his highly destructive techniques

for uncovering and recording the multiple layers of kiva murals at the site, were probably ethically dubious, even in the 1960s. Finally, his later work and interpretations of the site were highly skewed by his belief that there was a strong Mesoamerican presence at the site. This tendency to see things that were not really there is most obvious in his assertion that the site sat on top of a Mexican-style pyramidal mound, complete with stairs and the bodies of sacrificial victims that had been flung down the side. There appears to be no physical evidence to support these claims and later stratigraphic and geomorphological analyses suggest that the site sits on a natural clay-topped terrace above the Rio Grande tributary's floodplain. This desire to see Mesoamerican influence at the site also impacted Hibben's interpretation of the unparalleled corpus of kiva mural art. R. G. Vivian suggests, I suspect correctly, that Hibben was probably deeply influenced by Charles DiPeso's contemporary work at the site of Casas Grandes in Chihuahua and the Amerind Foundation's research agenda in the early 1960s. However, Hibben made these claims at a time when Americanist archaeology began to turn away from diffusionism as an explanatory concept, and, as a result, the Southwestern archaeological community largely rejected his interpretations of the site. The result, as emphasized by Cordell in the preface, is that what Pottery Mound actually has to tell us about an extremely dynamic and important period in the American Southwest's Native history has gone largely unexamined.

Based on ceramic evidence, the site appears to have been occupied from around AD 1375 to 1475, during a period of dramatic demographic reorganization and social transformation in the Pueblo Southwest. Beginning at the end of the thirteenth century, large areas of the Southwest were abandoned with the population concentrated in larger, more densely compact communities that integrated people from diverse geographic, cultural, and linguistic backgrounds. Pottery Mound represents one of these new towns, and its remains have much to reveal to us about the problems and complexities of how these communities were formed, new identities were forged, and social lives were remade in the aftermath of one of the well-documented human diaspora in the premodern world's history. Of particular significance is the amazing corpus of kiva murals from the site that provide an unusually rich visual record of the Ancestral Pueblos' ritual life just prior to European contact.

Thus, Pottery Mound is an amazingly important site, but an extremely difficult one to interpret. This is not only because of the way that it was excavated and recorded by Hibben but also because of its uniqueness. It is strategically located in the lower valley of the Rio Puerco of the East, on the frontier between the Pueblo communities of the Hopi, Zuni, and Acoma on the West and the Rio Grande Pueblos to the East. As several authors in this volume point out (Adler, Clark, Crotty, Eckert, C. Schaafsma, and P. Schaafsma), the founding population at Pottery Mound appears to have had strong cultural ties to the Eastern Pueblo communities of the central and southern Rio Grande Valley, especially those from the Southern Tewa (Tano), Southern Tiwa, and Tompiro areas. However, the site also incorporates an unusual and eclectic mix of cultural elements that are generally associated with the Western Pueblos. These elements include aspects of kiva architecture and orientation (Crotty), specific

features of ceramic technology and aesthetics (Eckert), and iconographic representations incorporated into kiva murals, graphic representations of textiles, and painted ceramics (Crotty, Eckert, P. Schaafsma, Hays-Gilpin and LeBlanc, and Webster). Interestingly, in no context do these Western elements appear as wholly intrusive but are always integrated with Eastern elements to create a synthetic style that appears to be unique to Pottery Mound.

Several chapters (in particular, Crotty, Eckert, P. Schaafsma, Hays-Gilpin and LeBlanc, and Wilcox) reflect a lively debate among scholars on how to interpret this synthesis of regional styles at Pottery Mound. Crotty and Eckert argue that the incorporation of Western technical and stylistic elements into kiva architecture and mural paintings and glaze-painted ceramics, respectively, reflects the presence of Western immigrants and their descendents at the site. Both discuss the various manners that these elements were blended with more indigenous elements in ways that they interpret as alternatively emphasizing or deemphasizing in different contexts and settings the complex and diverse histories of the Pottery Mound community's inhabitants. Hays-Gilpin and LeBlanc focus specifically on representations of the famous Sikyatki style in kiva murals and on painted pottery and argue that this style may be linked to some sort of transethnic social identity, such as a ritual sodality. They suggest various models for the discontinuous appearance and spread of this style across the northern Southwest that challenge more simplistic models of migration and identity formation. Their discussion of gendered realms of knowledge and how these may have impacted the spread of stylistic elements across both space and artistic media is particularly insightful. In contrast, P. Schaafsma, in reference to a broad comparative corpus of Southwestern rock art, largely rejects the idea of "Western" influence at Pottery Mound and sees its iconography and aesthetics as emerging from a local Eastern Pueblo cosmological tradition, centered in the central and southern Rio Grande Valley, and with deep historical ties to Mimbres, Jornada Mogollon, and possibly northern Mexico.

One positive attribute of *New Perspectives on Pottery Mound Pueblo* is that it allows these varying interpretations to sit, sometimes uncomfortably, in dialogue and debate with one another. Much of the Hibben collection and later excavated materials from Pottery Mound remain unexplored and unanalyzed. This volume provides us with just a taste of what we have yet to learn from this incredible site. The scholarship's quality is uniformly high, and the authors do a fine job of bringing discussions of this important site back into the center of current scholarship and debate on the history of the late precontact Pueblo Southwest. The volume is quite handsome; it is one of the nicest examples of book design that I have seen in recent years. It is published on high-quality, glossy paper with a profusion of color figures that do justice to the amazingly rich artistic record from this site. The book's price is especially reasonable given its high production value. This volume will appeal to a broad audience of people interested in Native American religion, art, and aesthetics, and to professional archaeologists and art historians.

*Judith A. Habicht-Mauche*

University of California, Santa Cruz