

UC Santa Barbara

Journal of Transnational American Studies

Title

The Aesthetics of Remembering 9/11: Towards a Transnational Typology of Memorials

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7pw6k038>

Journal

Journal of Transnational American Studies, 6(1)

Author

Gessner, Ingrid

Publication Date

2015

DOI

10.5070/T861017910

Supplemental Material

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7pw6k038#supplemental>

Copyright Information

Copyright 2015 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

The Aesthetics of Commemorating 9/11: Towards a Transnational Typology of Memorials

INGRID GESSNER

Introduction

The debates around forms to memorialize the symbolic “world event”¹ of September 11, 2001, started almost instantaneously; impromptu memorials sprang up on that same day,² and the internet was flooded with postings by people asking how we are to remember. Planning memorials seemed a viable way of containing trauma. It “allowed people to begin . . . to feel as if the horrid event itself was over—containable, already a memory,” as Marita Sturken writes.³

The sites of violent terrorist impact in Manhattan, Washington, and Shanksville were immediately perceived as the definitive sites of mourning, and public discourse called for their later translation into locations for ritualized practices of commemoration around constructed memorials. Public discourse rendered them *lieux de mémoire*, sites of memory, as Pierre Nora defines them in his seven-volume study on the identity politics and memorial culture of the French nation-state.⁴ While Nora’s sites do not necessarily need to be locations, they provide spaces for the exchange and transfer of memories.⁵ The “site-specific concept of memory in modernity” renders “the land where . . . people died a more meaningful place to mourn the dead than the surrounding area,” contends Sturken.⁶ The World Trade Center site seems a case in point for the place-boundedness or site-specificity of memory-making. What Edward S. Casey calls “place memory” may trigger social memory through its particular landscape: “It is the stabilizing persistence of place as a container of experiences that contribute so powerfully to its intrinsic memorability. An alert and alive memory connects spontaneously with place, finding in it features that favor and parallel its own activities. We might even say that memory is naturally place-oriented or at least place-

supported.”⁷ Similarly, Art Spiegelman points out that locality does matter. By referring to the intensity of responses to 9/11 varying with the zip codes, he describes nuances in the reactions of New Yorkers in his graphic novel *In the Shadow of No Towers* (2004): “Long after uptown New Yorkers resumed their daily jogging in Central Park, those of us living in Lower Manhattan found our neighborhood transformed into one of those suburban gated communities as we flashed IDs at the police barriers on 14th Street before being allowed to walk home.”⁸

The felt proximity to the site of the attacks also varies within the US. Spiegelman continues,

Only when I traveled to a university in the Midwest in early October 2001 did I realize that *all* New Yorkers were out of their minds compared to those for whom the attack was an abstraction. . . . Still, the small town I visited in Indiana—draped in flags that reminded me of the garlic one might put on a door to ward off vampires—was at least as worked up over a frat house’s zoning violations as with threats from “raghead terrorists.” It was as if I’d wandered into an inverted version of Saul Steinberg’s famous map of America seen from Ninth Avenue, where the known world ends at the Hudson; in Indiana everything east of the Alleghenies was very, very far away.⁹

The discourse of the World Trade Center site’s sacralization set in soon after the attacks. Politicians and journalists have spoken of a “holy ground,” and the “sacred quality” of the site was stressed in the memorial’s design guidelines.¹⁰ The reaction was clearly tied to the question of human remains.¹¹ A desire emerged to frame the event with well-known tropes of “New York’s ‘finest’ and ‘bravest’” and of “heroes protecting against ‘evil’” (166). Yet it needs to be noted that the people who violently died in the terrorist attacks did not sacrifice their lives consciously for a higher cause, for freedom or the nation in the sense of President Lincoln’s words at Gettysburg. With regard to the acts of terrorism on September 11, David Simpson has criticized the practice of sanctification as hegemonic discourse, as merely stabilizing “the image of a flourishing civil society and a providential national destiny.”¹² As early as 2001, Edward Linenthal pointed to similar ideologically falsified dynamics at work at the site of the Oklahoma City bombing, where President Clinton spoke of “sacred ground” at the memorial’s dedication ceremony.¹³

While certainly influenced by these political-ideological mobilizations, the eventual National September 11 Memorial is based on Michael Arad and Peter Walker’s design called “Reflecting Absence” and officially opened to the public on September 12, 2011.¹⁴ What I will refer to as an on-site memorial contains a tomb for the unrecoverable remains of victims, thus combining the “symbolic” of the displayed

names with the imagined “corporeal” of the corresponding bodies, of what is left after the total destruction of the body. The assigned space for the more than one thousand unidentified victims resembles a crypt, accentuating the heroic and saintly traits attributed to the casualties of 9/11, whose deaths appear martyr-like.

The National 9/11 Pentagon Memorial was completed on September 11, 2008, and the first phase of the Flight 93 National Memorial in Shanksville was dedicated on the tenth anniversary of the attacks: a wall listing the names of the forty passengers and crew who died; a wind-chime tower and groves of trees will be added later. While these three places have a special status in the hierarchy of commemoration as they represent the sites where people died violent deaths, other memorials have appeared in more unlikely places and will be referred to as off-site 9/11 memorials. In 2014 more than six hundred memorials existed in the United States and about sixty outside the United States (see Appendix). They range from memorials to individual victims, memorial trees, dedicated park benches, streets, stadiums, schools, and streets to group-specific, state, and national memorials. To mention only a few, the 9/11 Flight Crew Memorial in Grapevine, Texas, is a group-specific memorial; the San Antonio 9/11 Memorial is monumental and represents one of the largest 9/11 memorials; the September 11 Memorial Garden in London, England, is bordered by the United States Embassy; and several memorials in Israel are in public parks and at prominent street intersections. Many of the 9/11 memorials outside the United States are connected to US diplomatic missions and are located in their gardens or environs. Others draw on the connection of individual victims to the specific country or explicitly refer to the ninety-two countries worldwide that had victims to report. Still others have been established because of personal contacts, as well as a sense of sympathy or out of obligation and duty. As 9/11 memorials without an immediate spatial connection or attributed “sacred” dimension, they manage to establish connections through various forms and contexts, while also mapping and sometimes questioning the sole global influence of US culture. To further explore the global outreach and emotional traces the experience of the 9/11 terrorist attacks generated in memorials around the world, I first consider practices of 9/11 commemoration in New York, as well as the World Trade Center site’s special status in the hierarchy of remembering. The National September 11 Memorial together with architect Daniel Libeskind’s Freedom Tower is read as the paradigmatic site of 9/11 memory, which displays specific and also familiar memorial elements. In a comparatist approach, it serves as a foil to analyze 9/11 memorials located in Ireland, Spain, Germany, Italy, and Israel (with particular emphasis on the latter two). With regard to 9/11 novels, Richard Gray asserted that no fundamental change occurred in the form of fictional works, but that they instead “assimilate the unfamiliar into familiar structures.”¹⁵ Likewise, we do not witness changes or great innovations in memorial design but rather see a continuation of patterns (and conventionalized forms) that have worked for quite some time: modernist minimalism augmented by realist representations, displays of victims’ names, or simple plaques. Certain elements are more iconic than others: for example,

the Twin Towers symbolically reemerge in Arad and Walker's National September 11 Memorial (as footprints), in the "Tribute in Light" memorial beams that have been installed several times in Lower Manhattan since 2002, and also in many memorials outside the United States. The international 9/11 memorials mostly transform an American version of pain, grief, loss, and sympathy into a globally shared one.

Contrary to what was originally assumed—that September 11 was "the day time stopped"¹⁶ and that it marked the beginning of the twenty-first century¹⁷—notions of historic rupture or change are much less prevalent a decade later.¹⁸ Gray's assertion of the assimilation of fiction, or the "reterritorializing tendencies of American literary practice,"¹⁹ rather than a negotiation of the issues of immigration, deterritorialization, and "the U.S. as cultural borderlands,"²⁰ lends itself to an examination of 9/11 memorial aesthetics.²¹ Negotiating the latter would entail deconstructing the way the national narrative sought to produce a nation on the premise of absorbing other "worlds" into its project.²² In this essay, I will argue—along the lines of Michael Rothberg who contends the same with regard to fiction writing—that the global proliferation and circulation of 9/11 memorials need to be read as mapping the "outward movement of American power" and political identity that traces "the prosthetic reach of the [US] empire into other worlds" yet also functions to reveal and subtly criticize the same.²³

To clarify, I am not examining the many effective counter-memorials that Devin Zuber and Marla Carlson so excellently describe in their respective essays but am focusing on memorial projects in New York, Ireland, Spain, Germany, Italy, and Israel that were officially commissioned after September 11, 2001, and that explicitly aim to commemorate the horrific events of 9/11 and their aftermath.²⁴ I would also like to add that all impromptu shrines are (and had to be) essentially off-site memorials, since the actual sites of destruction were not accessible to the public for quite some time.

Formulating a Typology of 9/11 Memorial Aesthetics

Commemoration at the sites of traumatic events seems to follow a recognizable trajectory that can also be traced in the case of 9/11 remembering in New York City: personal expressions of grief arranged in collective memorial shrines give way to documentary memorials in the form of temporary installations or exhibitions, and later architectural proposals that lead to the construction of permanent sites of memory, growing more metaphorical and abstract with the passage of time.

Firstly, and beside the spontaneous memorials all across New York City, the viewing platform at what was expediently termed "Ground Zero"²⁵ became a temporary memorial, demonstrating the power and attraction of the "destructive sublime,"²⁶ as well as bearing a sacred quality of standing vigil with the dead. In the same category, the missing-person flyers resembled a powerful form of spontaneous memorial, as well as—when they were put up—an expression or prayer of hope. Besides the repetition of the pictures of the burning towers in various media and in everyone's minds, the pictures of the missing represented a "powerful spectacle on

the streets.”²⁷ The walls near Bellevue and St. Vincent’s hospitals were plastered with flyers and were called the “Wall of Hope and Remembrance.” Secondly, the flyers at St. Vincent’s Hospital became part of a documentary tableau that was secured under plexiglass; it was eventually taken down. Together with art projects, such as “Tiles for America,” displaying thousands of individually created ceramic tiles from around the world at two specific sites in Manhattan, and photography exhibits, such as the 5,000 photographs by 3,000 professional and amateur photographers of *Here Is New York*, the wall at St. Vincent’s represents a grassroots democratic, albeit temporary, expression of grief. In the trajectory of commemoration, these documentary memorials follow the spontaneous expressions as (re)organized meta-shrines. These projects also fulfilled a public function as they involved those that were not immediately affected by the attacks; everyone was enabled to take part in the processes of searching and later of mourning (250). They created what the official 9/11 memorial process guidelines later called an “unofficial record of immediate response” that should not be “lost or disregarded.”²⁸

While the “Portraits of Grief” series of the *New York Times* also enabled commonly shared practices of mourning the dead, they belong in a different category than the grassroots democratic art and photography projects.²⁹ Although the initiation of the series might have been spontaneous, the production of the anecdotal eulogies was not only supervised, as Nancy K. Miller points out,³⁰ but the texts also followed an idealized script that stressed family values, communitarian virtue, and added just the right amount of leisure to otherwise busy lives.³¹ The brief notices combined with photographs of mostly smiling people presented a “snapshot of each victim’s personality, of a life lived,” as the *New York Times* editors noted.³² Yet in their idealism they also blocked out negative and unpatriotic feelings not wanted in the public domain. Compiled and written by *NYT* reporters, who began dialing the numbers they found on the missing-persons flyers in the days after the attack, the “Portraits” personalized the tragedy and were democratic only insofar as everyone (whose family had consented) was included: the executive vice president alongside the janitor (at least in the alphabetically arranged book version). With the newspaper’s promise that all profiles will remain on *NYTimes.com* indefinitely, the “Portraits” have achieved the status of a memorial of virtual permanence. They have, in the words of David Simpson, entered and will remain in “popular culture as a patriotic icon.”³³

Finally, in a third phase—and often after the passage of a certain amount of time—permanent sites of memory are created. The construction of memorials relies significantly on identity politics, and on questions of nationalism and of power. Not only Edward Said has pointed out memory’s dependence on “questions of identity, of nationalism and authority,”³⁴ but works by Nuala Johnson, Richard Peet, and Michael Kammen have shown that memorials are tied to national politics and fights over cultural identity.³⁵ In light of the patriotic public discourse and the hegemonic domination over the experience of 9/11, the triumvirate of identity, nationalism, and authority has also significantly informed the commemoration of 9/11. In fact, every

memorial process includes the designation of a site and the choice of a form; it often involves several interest groups and relies on consensus-building. Memorials thus “propagate the illusion of common memory.”³⁶ The innovative potential is necessarily much lower than in, for example, experimental art or art emerging from one person’s vision. James Young has nevertheless pointed out the dialogical quality of a memorial space.³⁷ Although a memorial of bronze or granite at first sight represents something permanent that cannot be changed easily and may preempt possibilities for alternative acts of memory,³⁸ Young proposes that memorials should not enshrine any particular interpretation of the past but instead prompt visitors to engage in “memory work” to continuously reinvigorate the memorials.³⁹ Memorials that resist processes of transformation risk losing their significance in the future. Natan Sznajder and Daniel Levy’s idea of a global or cosmopolitan memory and Michael Rothberg’s concept of memory’s multidirectionality are equally helpful in this context.⁴⁰ Since the public sphere is a “malleable discursive space” in which people articulate their positions and form groups “through their dialogical interactions with others,” the “subjects and the spaces of the public are open to continual reconstruction.”⁴¹ Marita Sturken equally reminds us that, due to its perpetual redefinition, memory can also assume an active role and allow for renewal and healing. Sturken calls the two processes involved “recollection” and “reenactment.”⁴² The forms of repetition seen in architectural designs need to be examined in order to consider what a reenactment produces, accomplishes, or enables.⁴³

In the case of 9/11 we are faced with a lack of a definitive interpretation that would create closure as political interest might require it. Indeed, while the imagery of 9/11 relies on a fixed iconography, “there is no shared narrative about 9/11 itself, which means that its representation is contested,” as Erika Doss argues.⁴⁴ A 9/11 memorial that does not attempt forcefully to provide that narrative (and thus catharsis) would give future generations a chance to reevaluate the event in their own time and culture. In this respect, the concept of an anti-monument comes to mind, modeled, for example, after Jochen Gerz and Esther Shalev-Gerz’s disappearing *Monument against Fascism* in Hamburg-Harburg, Germany (*Mahnmal gegen Faschismus*).⁴⁵ The antifascist and antiwar monument that was unveiled in 1986 vanished in 1993. The original 40-foot aluminum pillar invited people to write on its soft lead shell with a steel stylus as self-commitment to be and stay attentive in the face of (re)emerging fascism, war, and human rights violations. Whenever a section of the pillar was covered, it was lowered into the ground until it disappeared. This type of radicalism and particularly the idea of vanishing steles in reference to the attacked Twin Towers and the kind of irony suggested seemed unwelcome in New York.

In the National September 11 Memorial that is based on Arad and Walker’s design “Reflecting Absence,” a “national narrative of triumph,” of “strength, solidarity and endurance” is undeniable.⁴⁶ Although the particular state of that narrative and of American nationalism is never fixed, one can tick off the ingredients of modern memorial design that answer to it: names; negative forms, underground levels, or

voids; water; rock or walls; light installations; and trees. An aesthetic of verisimilitude, expressed for instance by a representational sculpture (a fireman, a police officer, an investment banker with a cell phone, or a rescue dog) that would foreground questions of inclusion and exclusion, is conspicuously absent.⁴⁷ In fact, Arad and Walker's memorial has been criticized for the "omission of human motifs and objects that evoke the materiality of the disaster,"⁴⁸ yet no design changes were made in this respect. This contradicts James Young, who argues that the realist art contingent is almost always powerful enough to press for the installation of figurative sculptures.⁴⁹



Figure 1.
The World Trade Center site
under construction,
New York, 2011.
Photo by Irene Woodbury.

Names: Among the more consensual elements, the display of names has become synonymous with the contemporary memorial ever since Maya Lin's wall at the Vietnam Veterans Memorial. In her work Lin drew on Sir Edwin Lutyens's Thiepval Memorial to the Missing of the Somme from World War I. In New York, Arad's original proposition of a random array of names in the underground galleries became an issue of great controversy until it was resolved by listing the names at the appropriate tower site and by affiliation on the plaza level.⁵⁰ The listing by groups draws attention to the

national heroism (of rescue workers, those who fought back on Flight 93), of what Doss calls “the national narrative of triumph.”⁵¹

Negative Spaces or Voids: Emptiness and voids, a descent into memory as the Vietnam Veterans Memorial has it, have become primary memorial design elements. In contrast to vertical structures, a void emanates negative meaning, seems passive, and fosters expressions of grief. The void symbolizes the loss or, as the jurors wrote in their statement, “By allowing absence to speak for itself, the designers have made the power of these empty footprints the memorial.”⁵² At the National September 11 Memorial, the impression of the concave structure of Arad and Walker’s “void,” the sunken pools and the underground level, powerfully counterbalances the vertical structure of Daniel Libeskind’s Freedom Tower, which even surpasses the original towers in height (see Figure 1). The new World Trade Center tower emanates narratives of resilience and strength. Libeskind’s design was selected as the master plan for the rebuilding of the site in February 2003. The World Trade Center Site Memorial Competition (2003–2004), from which Arad and Walker emerged as winners in January 2004, already relied on Libeskind’s specifications.

Trees: The planting of trees continues a tradition of signifying liberty, rebirth, and resistance. As a memorial element the deciduous trees that Walker and Arad deliberately chose for the memorial also represent the narrative of endurance and survival. Over the seasons, the trees mimic the cycle of life. The landscape architect Walker also uses the trees to modify space at the site, with trees functioning as a shield from the urban surrounding.

Rock and Walls: Libeskind in his nationalistic Freedom Tower design proposal already celebrates the “great slurry walls” that survived the attack.⁵³ The memorial design guidelines stipulated for bedrock to be preserved and made accessible, and the eventual design reveals the slurry wall as part of the design. The memorial tropes celebrate endurance and resistance under greatest duress. By containing the unidentified remains of the victims at bedrock level (reminiscent of a crypt in Christian churches), the earlier discourse of sacralization is continued.

Light installations usually illuminate memorials at nighttime. At the National September 11 Memorial, light shines through the names of the victims, making them visible at all times. Finally, **water** and reflecting pools are among the most common features of memorials (in the US context, the National Mall in Washington, DC, is probably the most immediate association). Water is also a central element of the national 9/11 memorial. The two cascading, sunken pools and the parapets that surround them encompass the footprints of the Twin Towers. The preservation of the footprints of the towers crystallized as an imperative early on. Associations with water include life and transformation and thus naturally support the “national narrative of triumph.”⁵⁴ Yet critics of the memorial have questioned whether the waterfalls do not merely represent empty spaces or a “watery grave—not metamorphosis, not

renewal.”⁵⁵ The footprints may even be read as the tracing of a wound.⁵⁶ Effacing the latter analogy, the “Tribute in Light” installation uses the footprints as the base for the eighty-eight searchlights that create two vertical columns of light. Conceived as a temporary piece in 2002, it has been repeated every year on September 11 ever since.⁵⁷ Whereas the “Tribute in Light” beams equally mark the footprints, illuminate the night sky, and project an illusion of the former towers onto it, the sunken pools are negative markers and draw attention to loss. Precisely in their ambiguity between life and loss, the pools represent powerful and enduring memorial elements.

Tracing the Twin Tower Aesthetics

Besides the on-site memorials at “Ground Zero,” the National September 11 Memorial, and “Tribute in Light,” several off-site memorials similarly replicate the towers. The design of memorials in Ireland, Spain, and Germany are only three international examples that share the Twin Tower aesthetics. The Donadea 9/11 Memorial near Dublin, Ireland, is a scaled replica of the Twin Towers carved in blocks of limestone (see Figure 2). It is surrounded by a copse of newly planted oak trees. The names of all the men and women of the New York Fire Department, police officers, and Port Authority officials who died in the terrorist attacks are engraved on the steles. Metonymically the memorial is dedicated to Sean Tallon, a second-generation Irish-American NYFD firefighter who lost his life on September 11, 2001. Apart from the symbolic recreation of the Twin Towers, the connection between New York and Donadea relies on Tallon’s familial ties to the region, as well as the historical connection between New York City’s police and fire departments and Irish immigrants. The group-specific memorial was dedicated only two years after the attacks, on September 21, 2003, with New York emergency and rescue services workers attending the ceremony.⁵⁸



Figure 2.
The Donadea
9/11 Memorial,
Ireland.
Photo by
buzzard525
on Panoramio,
image ID 4493144,
license: Creative
Commons.

The Moncalvillo 9/11 Memorial in Spain is a white two-column stone tribute to Spaniard Edelmiro Abad Elvira and all other victims who lost their lives in the 9/11 attacks.⁵⁹ Dedicated on August 11, 2002, the memorial is located in the Iglesia de San Pedro's cemetery of Moncalvillo de la Sierra, a small Spanish town in northwestern Spain. Abad's biography represents the proverbial rags-to-riches story of an industrious immigrant. Born in Moncalvillo in 1947, Abad came to the United States with his family when he was seven years old and realized his "American Dream" by attaining a high-ranking executive position in the financial sector. In their obituaries, the *New York Times* and the *New York Daily News* equally stress the dedication to his job and his family as Abad's key characteristic.⁶⁰ The anecdotal text follows the patriotic narrative of the "Portraits" series. Situated in the arid region of Castile and León and inscribed in Spanish only, the memorial primarily brings a Spanish hero who has made it in America back to his home country. While the Irish and Spanish memorials establish a contextual relation by remembering the events of 9/11 through the tragic death of individuals—heroized in their hometowns—the connection of the following memorial to the events of 9/11 is more abstract.

The 9/11 World Trade Center Memorial in Oberviechtach, in southeastern Germany, combines an original 5-foot steel beam from "Ground Zero" fixed on a block of local granite with a 6.8-foot glass replica of the Twin Towers that is illuminated at night (see Figure 3). Referencing both the site of the attacks and the site of the memorial, the materials used stem from the World Trade Center (steel beam) and the Upper Palatinate region (granite and glass).⁶¹ The memorial shares its site, An der Allee (an access road into the city of Oberviechtach),⁶² with the war memorial (for World Wars I and II), the memorial to the Sudeten Germans, and the memorial marker for *Bundeswehr* members on foreign missions. Dedicated on October 8, 2011, the 9/11 memorial is the visible marker of a friendship between residents of New York City and Oberviechtach and of a deep-felt sympathy that began and grew in the aftermath of the attacks. When the New York Port Authority approved Oberviechtach resident Martin Zimmermann's request for an original piece from the Twin Towers in February 2011, efforts to build a memorial gained momentum and it was realized in less than a year.



Figure 3. The 9/11 World Trade Center Memorial, Oberviechtach, Germany.
Photo by Alexandra Herzog.

The memorial was funded entirely by private donations and is maintained by a not-for-profit association called German American Firefighters and Friends (G.A.F.F.). The name also underlines the emotional connectedness of the Oberviechtach residents, some of whom are volunteer firefighters, to the NYFD personnel they met at the “Person to Person History Tribute WTC Visitor Center” in 2007. The memorial’s granite base carrying the steel beam admonishes visitors to “never forget,” and the towers’ inscription reads, “dedicated to all who serve with honor.” Beyond the memorial name’s explicit connection to “Ground Zero” and 9/11, the dedication line—in English and not in German—widens the scope to include anyone working for relief agencies on either side of the Atlantic or in the world; agencies with branches in

Oberviechtach are represented by their respective crests on the base of the memorial. The memorial also includes events in the aftermath of 9/11 by displaying emblems of the German *Panzer Grenadier Battalion* 122 Oberviechtach and the US Stryker Brigade Vilseck; the units were deployed to Afghanistan and Iraq respectively. Necessitated by this broad scope, the memorial's resort to the rather traditional yet iconic universal marker of the Twin Towers seems comprehensible.

David Simpson, referencing Baudrillard, has pointed out that the towers have indeed “become the motif of a deliberate opacity, a piece of history before the history has even been properly projected or deciphered.”⁶³ The iconization of the towers, it should be noted, was mainly brought about through the media discourse. It has also been referred to as a “phantom limb phenomenon”⁶⁴; the more the lack of the towers was visualized, the more the presence of the absence was felt. Ten years after the attacks, in 2011, the global public outcry following the release of the design of two residential high-rise buildings in Seoul, South Korea, which eerily resemble the Twin Towers under attack, testifies to this view of visual uniqueness and also speaks for a wish of eternal preservation and memory of a pre-9/11 state of the towers (see Figure 4).⁶⁵ The project was canceled in April 2013. The two proposed skyscraper towers would have been connected in the center by a “pixelated cloud” that conjures up the image of the burning towers.⁶⁶ While there seems to be no general public objection to the ubiquitous replication of the intact towers in memorials, postcards, banners, and T-shirts, there seems to exist a consensus that the representation on such a large scale of the towers under attack denotes sacrilege.



Figure 4.
The Cloud at Yongsan Dreamhub,
Seoul, South Korea.
Image: MVRDV.

The replication of these iconic markers in a memorial may trigger emotional reactions and individual feelings of grief. The “Tribute in Light” installation in Manhattan and the memorials in Germany, Ireland, and Spain project an almost

romantic image of the still-intact towers and also function as metonymic containers for the lives lost. As such, they leave enough space open for interpretation and attain the quality of a “motif of deliberate opacity,” as Simpson calls it.⁶⁷ The Irish and Spanish memorials were inspired by the death of individuals, and the form of the respective memorials references the actual site of their violent deaths. On the other hand, the World Trade Center’s original function, as Zuber observes, “as a monument (perhaps the monument) to global capital” also needs to be figured into the equation.⁶⁸ Is this function indicated by the replications, or do the replications rather demonstrate the vulnerability of the system and emphasize our need to question it? Especially in light of the latter interpretation, the critical potential of the off-site memorials referencing the Twin Towers should not be underestimated. Lastly, it should be stressed again that the violent destruction of the towers and of the lives lost is always also represented in the memorials.

Libeskind Aesthetics in Italy

The Memoria e Luce World Trade Center Memorial in Padova, Italy, equally relies on the iconography of the Twin Towers. The memorial, also created by Daniel Libeskind, revolves around a twisted steel beam from the South Tower. The steel beam was originally exhibited in the American Pavilion at the Venice Biennial 2002 and was subsequently donated to the Veneto region by the city of New York. Padova was chosen as the site for a memorial that would feature the beam as an integral part. As several sources and the US consul Deborah Grace claim, the city was chosen as the site for the memorial for its history of tolerance; Padova hosts one of the oldest European universities and counts Galileo Galilei among its famous teachers.⁶⁹ The memorial is located in the vicinity of Padova’s most famous tourist destination, the Scrovegni Chapel. Presented as a proposal on May 29, 2004, the Padova memorial was realized in little more than a year.

Two facts establish an intricate connection of the memorial to “Ground Zero”: firstly, the inclusion, exhibition, and thus musealization of an original piece creates an aura of authenticity and triggers emotional attachment; secondly, to choose a design by Libeskind, who also gave New Yorkers the vision of a Freedom Tower, points towards the wish for a visible architectonic connection between the two sites, that Libeskind’s thumbprint would be recognized. With his Jewish Museum design in Berlin (2001) and the Danish Jewish Museum in Copenhagen (2003), Libeskind has established himself as the prominent authority in recreating traumatic spaces. In Berlin and Copenhagen, Libeskind worked with tilted, nonlinear structures and voids that suggest disorientation. The Jewish Museum in Berlin has been compared to a disassembled Jewish star or a lightning bolt made of stone and glass.⁷⁰ Libeskind’s vertical structure and uplifting rhetoric in New York are different. His rhetorical strategy played a major role for the decision in his favor, and in his “Statement for the Proposal Plans for the New York World Trade Center” he presented the Freedom

Tower design in ways that echo US-American foundational myths. For example, he stressed that the resonant 1,776 feet in height would reassert the preeminence of liberty and show the resilience of the American nation even in times of crisis. This “post-9/11 rhetoric,” as Sabine Sielke has pointed out, “performs a mimicry of America’s master narrative” of optimism and survival.⁷¹ In his essay in the *New Republic*, Martin Filler has called Libeskind an “entrepreneur of commemoration,” a label that similarly highlights the commercial aspect of memorialization.⁷²

In Italy, Libeskind designed a large book-shaped memorial built almost entirely with etched glass (see Figure 5). The open-book symbolism might be read as a nod to the equally V-shaped Vietnam Veterans Memorial. A glass wall zigzags through the memorial ensemble and ends in a wedge formed by two glass walls that form the leaves of a book that symbolically opens in the direction of the former World Trade Center. Crisscrossing lines and curves have by now become trademarks of Libeskind’s designs, for instance in his Jewish Museum in Berlin.



Figure 5.
Memoria e Luce
World Trade
Center Memorial,
Padova, Italy.
Photo by
Irene Woodbury.

Libeskind’s architectural symbolism and the rhetoric evident in his Freedom Tower project is reused in Memoria e Luce: a detached page from the glass-wall book

carries the twisted original joist that, according to Libeskind, is oriented towards the Statue of Liberty in New York, clearly referencing the immigration narrative and thus the transnational relevance of this Italian project. Additionally, New York's and the Twin Towers' verticality is represented in the upright axis of the book in the Padova memorial. On his website Libeskind explains dramatically, "The Light of Liberty shines through the Book of History. This Book is open to the memory of the heroes of September 11th, with the left-hand page holding a dramatic beam salvaged from the World Trade Center attack. The latitude of New York is connected to the center of Padua as the vertical hinge of the Book. The eternal affirmation of Freedom is inscribed on the Statue of Liberty, as seen by million of emigrants [sic] coming to America."⁷³ In order to draw attention to the most distinct part of the composition, the steel beam is set against a background of luminous material. Usually illuminated by white light, one-hour cycles of color variations have been programmed on a number of symbolic dates important both to the European and the US public, including September 11, Christmas, New Year's, April 25 (Italian Liberation Day), and the Fourth of July. This allows for different modes of visual experience and interaction on these particular days and also adds a subtle transnational and transcultural component.

Memorial Rhetoric in Israel

Several smaller 9/11 memorials, many of which replicate the Twin Towers, as well as rededicated squares and parks exist all over Israel.⁷⁴ On September 12, 2009, after six years of planning, a central 9/11 memorial with the names of all of the victims was dedicated in Jerusalem.⁷⁵ Mirroring the special US-Israeli relationship, the memorial, albeit placed in Israel and designed by an Israeli artist, Eliezer Weishoff, is a project of the US-based Jewish National Fund, funded by the Bronka Stavsky Rabin Weintraub Trust and by the New Yorker Edward Blank. The memorial includes a "path of donors" with "milestones" sculpted as metal memorial pillars that are inscribed with the names of people who gave donations.

Given the memorial's agenda to "mourn the victims of 9/11 as well as consider the thousands of victims of terrorism worldwide,"⁷⁶ the rhetoric employed at the dedication ceremony is as important to contemplate as the architectural rhetoric. Russell Robinson, CEO of the Jewish National Fund, defined the location of the memorial, Jerusalem, as "a battleground of civilization but also a place of hope."⁷⁷ Former Prime Minister Ehud Olmert instrumentalized the occasion for Israeli politics; he not only publicly denounced the United Nations' Goldstone Report (that accused both Israel and Hamas of war crimes during the Gaza war, 2008–2009) but called on the leaders of the western world—and the United States in particular—to understand that the war against terrorist leaders cannot be stopped until all of the organizations are destroyed. Acknowledging the difficulties inherent in asymmetric warfare, Olmert made a fundamental distinction between victims of terror and those hurt in the course of antiterror operations. His political rhetoric was complemented by well-established

civil-religious acts of commemoration. Firefighters marched around the plaza carrying flags of the countries that lost citizens in the attacks. They were followed by families of victims, members of the Zionist group Young Judea, and official representatives from countries that lost citizens on 9/11, such as Poland, Germany, the Netherlands, Mexico, and Canada. They all laid wreaths by the plaques of names. The family of Alona Avraham, who died on-board United Airlines flight 175, laid a wreath in memory of the five Israeli victims, thus establishing a direct individual connection.⁷⁸ A wreath for members of all faiths was offered by two representatives from Jewish and Greek Catholic faiths—with a member of the third major monotheistic religion of Islam being conspicuously absent. The ceremony concluded with the Jewish funeral practices of the mourner's kaddish and the shofar-blowing as white doves were released into the sky. Together with the simultaneous lowering of the Israeli and American flags and the intonation of the two anthems, the rituals were intended as symbols for shared loss and emphasized the Israeli–American friendship. What might be read as a focus on the two nations and their flags is, however, universally enlarged through a plaque at the site, which reads, “A reminder of shared loss and a call for peace among nations” in Hebrew, English, and Arabic.⁷⁹

Compared to Libeskind's minimalist design in Italy, the Israel 9/11 memorial uses a more conventional memorial language. The central 30-foot-high bronze sculpture represents a waving American flag transforming into a memorial flame (see Figure 6). As in the case of the Italian 9/11 memorial, a small piece of wreckage from the Twin Towers symbolically establishes the connection to “Ground Zero.”⁸⁰ However, elements of destruction or loss are not explicitly visualized in this generally uplifting sculpture, as even the original piece of debris is not displayed openly but is blended into the granite base of the flag/flame; it is visible behind a piece of clear glass. The display of the victims' names as well as their ninety-two countries of origin on over three thousand metal plates, including the names of those killed in New York, Washington, DC, and Pennsylvania, establishes the most evident connection to the National September 11 Memorial. Like the memorial in Manhattan, it is an inclusive site of memory that names all the victims—the first to do so outside the “Ground Zero” site. Moreover, by including all the countries where the victims hailed from, the Israel 9/11 memorial puts forward a transnational gesture and does not fall into the traps of an exceptionalist discourse.



Figure 6. The 9/11 Living Memorial, Jerusalem, Israel.
Photo by Daniella Nowitz.

The sculpture is surrounded by a circular, crater-like plaza. The plaza aims to connect the memorial to the three sites of destruction of 9/11: firstly, although the plaza does not resemble a pentagon, its base is a pentagon; secondly, the plaza's indentation into the earth does not represent a descent into memory as abstract memorial architecture would have it, but it more literally depicts the plane that crashed in Pennsylvania; thirdly, the sculpture represents the American flag in flames and in its verticality signifies the Twin Towers. The inclusion of all three 9/11 sites counters the dominance of New York and the World Trade Center in the memory of 9/11.

Both the Memoria e Luce World Trade Center Memorial and the 9/11 Living Memorial in Israel incorporate physical remnants (originating from the site of destruction) as genuine artifacts to authenticate the respective spaces, reinscribe them in the discourse of the sacred, create an aura of the original, as well as follow current tendencies of musealization, exhibition, and education. Contrary to merely mapping the “outward movement of American power” as Rothberg cautions, both memorials stress the tragedy of 9/11 more as a global disaster and, at least cautiously, reveal transnational and multicultural memorial agendas: in Padova they are evident in the nod to the immigration narrative and the particular lighting schedule; in Jerusalem they are apparent in the international presence at the dedication ceremony, by the inclusive dedication in Hebrew, English, and Arabic, and lastly, by the naming of the ninety-two countries of origin of the victims.

Continuity or Change?

To conclude I would like to return to the question of the potential for transformation of 9/11 on- and off-site memorials, a question indirectly posed by Marita Sturken and James Young. In order to enable processes of transformation and adaptation of 9/11 memorials in the future, I would like to argue, a return or rather continuance of minimalist memorial style with its maxim of simplicity seems most adequate. Minimalist abstraction as we see it in Arad and Walker's design for the National September 11 Memorial, in Libeskind's book-shaped glass walls, and to some extent in the plaza of the Israeli memorial seems to function as the most effective form to enable very different memories to come to the fore and allow transformation of the memorial itself over time. Symbolic Twin Tower replications, furthermore, serve the need to eternally preserve the iconic image of the 9/11 terrorist attacks and have proven their interpretational openness and adaptability in several memorials around the world. The global experience of crisis is naturalized through the employment of by now predictable memorial elements, such as walls and names that work on local and national levels. The smaller elements that are put to the fore in the international memorials—the immigrants, the ninety-two countries, the languages displayed—may attest to the fact that the US empire reaches “other worlds” but is also unraveled there.⁸¹

An attestation of the continuation of—by now—conventional minimalist structures echoes Gray and others, who argue against 9/11 as a point of rupture. Gray recommends “a demonstration of both the structural continuities between past and present” and a visualization of “the processes by which those continuities are challenged, dissolved, and reconstituted,” which would in turn allow for fictional works of art, and also memorials, to become sites that commemorate past destruction but also stimulate dialogue between cultures.⁸² The debates that ensued around the planned construction of Park51, an Islamic community center two blocks from the World Trade Center site, are a case in point. In order to resolve the controversy over the proposed development around the ninth anniversary of the September 11 terrorist attacks, one would have needed to address the misguided discourse of sacralization of “Ground Zero.” Questioning the ideological narrative that has transformed the site into sacred ground discloses the idea that the proximity of the mosque is a sacrilege as unfounded. A fruitful dialogue could ensue from there, involving questions of space and dynamics of multidirectional memory. In this sense, it is not paradoxical to ask for 9/11 sites of memory to foster renewal rather than repetition.

Notes

I thank Birgit Däwes, Erika Doss, Susanne Leikam, and the two anonymous *JTAS* reviewers for their insightful comments on an earlier version of this article. I am indebted to many more people, but I want to extend my sincere gratitude to two scholars in particular. Shelley Fisher Fishkin's transnational vision and Werner Sollors's call for the recognition of a multilingual basis for American literary and cultural history have deeply influenced my understanding of and belief in American Studies as a discipline to be studied from the inside out and the outside in (cf. the 2006 ASA Annual Meeting theme).

¹ Jean Baudrillard, *The Spirit of Terrorism and Requiem for the Twin Towers* (London: Verso, 2002), 3.

² For a discussion of spontaneous 9/11 memorials, see Harriet F. Senie, "A Difference in Kind: Spontaneous Memorials after 9/11," *Sculpture*, July–August 2003, http://www.sculpture.org/documents/scmag03/jul_aug03/webspecial/senie.shtml. Manhattan's Union Square, in particular, served as a meeting space.

³ Marita Sturken, "The Aesthetics of Absence: Rebuilding Ground Zero," *American Ethnologist* 31, no. 3 (2004): 321.

⁴ Pierre Nora, *Les Lieux de Mémoire*, 7 vols. (Paris: Gallimard, 1984–1992).

⁵ Cf. Ann Rigney, "The Dynamics of Remembrance: Texts between Monumentality and Morphing," in *A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies*, ed. Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2010), 345.

⁶ Sturken, "Aesthetics of Absence," 318.

⁷ Edward S. Casey, *Remembering: A Phenomenological Study* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000), 186–87.

⁸ Art Spiegelman, *In the Shadow of No Towers* (New York: Pantheon Books, 2004), n. pag.

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Maureen Korp, "Seeing What Is Missing: Art, Artists and September 11," in *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, ed. Bryan S. Rennie and Philip L. Tite (New York: Routledge, 2008), 256.

¹¹ Paul Harvey Williams, *Memorial Museums: The Global Rush to Commemorate Atrocities* (Oxford: Berg, 2007), 43.

¹² David Simpson, *9/11: The Culture of Commemoration* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), 31.

¹³ Quoted in Edward Tabor Linenthal, *The Unfinished Bombing: Oklahoma City in American Memory* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), 234.

¹⁴ Michael Arad's "Reflecting Absence" was among the eight finalists that were chosen from 5,201 submissions for a 9/11 memorial on November 19, 2003. In the second round of the competition, architect Michael Arad teamed up with Peter Walker, a famous landscape architect from Berkeley, California. Their design was declared the winner on January 7, 2004. The thirteen members of the jury included Maya Lin (who had declined the offer to design the memorial earlier) and James E. Young; several design professionals, artists, architecture professors; and Paula Grant-Berry as a representative of the victims' families (her husband was killed in the attacks).

¹⁵ Richard Gray, "Open Doors, Closed Minds: American Prose Writing at a Time of Crisis," *American Literary History* 21, no. 1 (2009): 134; and Richard Gray, *After the Fall: American Literature since 9/11* (Chichester, UK: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 30.

¹⁶ Marianne Hirsch, "The Day Time Stopped," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, January 25, 2002, <http://chronicle.com/article/The-Day-Time-Stopped/20768>.

¹⁷ Paul Auster, "Jetzt beginnt das 21. Jahrhundert," *Die ZEIT*, September 13, 2001. Reprinted in Toni Morrison, Paul Auster, et al., *Dienstag 11. September 2001* (Reinbek: Rowohlt, 2001), 13–15.

¹⁸ Birgit Däwes, *Ground Zero Fiction: History, Memory, and Representation in the American 9/11 Novel* (Heidelberg: Winter, 2011), 1, 19.

¹⁹ Richard Crownshaw, "Deterritorializing the 'Homeland' in American Studies and American Fiction after 9/11," *Journal of American Studies* 45, no. 4 (2011): 759.

²⁰ Gray, "Open Doors, Closed Minds," 135.

²¹ The idea that fear drives us to familiarize the unknown is not new and has been expressed by Michael T. Taussig, *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 1993).

²² Crownshaw, "Deterritorializing the 'Homeland,'" 759.

²³ Michael Rothberg, "A Failure of the Imagination: Diagnosing the Post-9/11 Novel: A Response to Richard Gray," *American Literary History* 21, no. 1 (2009): 153.

²⁴ Devin Zuber, "Flânerie at Ground Zero: Aesthetic Counter-memories in Lower Manhattan," *American Quarterly* 58, no. 2 (2006): 269–99; Marla Carlson, "Looking, Listening, and Remembering: Ways to Walk New York after 9/11," *Theatre Journal* 58, no. 3 (2006): 395–416.

²⁵ I use quotation marks to draw attention to the problematic claim of exceptionalism and morality of suffering inherent in the designation, which originally referred to the two Japanese cities of Hiroshima and Nagasaki bombed by US nuclear forces in August 1945. Between 150,000 and 250,000 people were killed immediately and many died of long-

term effects. See also Simpson, *9/11*, 43–44; Diana Taylor, *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003), 263.

²⁶ For a discussion of the labeling of the World Trade Center observation areas as viewing platforms, see Korp, “Seeing What Is Missing,” 257. On the “destructive sublime,” see Miles Orvell, “After 9/11: Photography, the Destructive Sublime, and the Postmodern Archive,” *Michigan Quarterly Review* 45, no. 2 (2006): 239–56.

²⁷ Taylor, *Archive and the Repertoire*, 245.

²⁸ “Seven General Principles for the Rebuilding of Lower Manhattan,” New York New Visions, accessed January 5, 2012, <http://nynv.aiga.org/principles.shtml>.

²⁹ See Simpson, *9/11*, 21–23; and MaryAnn Snyder-Körber, “Lost and Found Lives: The Portraits of Grief and the Work of September 11th Mourning,” *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 55, no. 3 (2010): 451–78.

³⁰ Nancy K. Miller, “‘Portraits of Grief’: Telling Details and the Testimony of Trauma,” *differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 14, no. 3 (2003): 116.

³¹ Simpson, *9/11*, 42.

³² “Portraits of Grief,” *New York Times*, accessed January 5, 2012, <http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/us/sept-11-reckoning/portraits-of-grief.html>.

³³ Simpson, *9/11*, 43.

³⁴ Edward W. Said, “Invention, Memory, and Place,” *Critical Inquiry* 26, no. 2 (2000): 176.

³⁵ See Nuala Johnson, “Cast in Stone: Monuments, Geography, and Nationalism,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 13, no. 1 (1995): 51–65; Richard Peet, “A Sign Taken for History: Daniel Shays’ Memorial in Petersham, Massachusetts,” *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 86, no. 1 (1996): 21–43; Michael Kammen, “Commemoration and Contestation in American Culture: Historical Perspectives,” *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 48, no. 2 (2003): 185–205; and Michael Kammen, “Public History and National Identity in the United States,” *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 44, no. 4 (1999): 459–75.

³⁶ James E. Young, “Memory and the Monument after 9/11,” in *The Future of Memory*, ed. Richard Crownshaw, Jane Kilby, and Antony Rowland (New York: Berghahn, 2010), 80.

³⁷ James E. Young, *The Texture of Memory: Holocaust Memorials and Meaning* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993), xiii.

³⁸ Simpson, *9/11*, 31.

³⁹ Young, *Texture of Memory*, 15. An example of such a reinvigoration is the dialogue initiated by objects and letters left at the Vietnam Veterans Memorial in Washington, DC. See Ingrid Gessner, *Kollektive Erinnerung als Katharsis? Das Vietnam Veterans Memorial in*

der öffentlichen Kontroverse, *Mainzer Studien zur Amerikanistik* 44 (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2000), 96–116. Visitors not only share objects with the dead but also with other visitors. See also Young, “Memory and the Monument,” 81.

⁴⁰ Daniel Levy and Natan Sznaider, *Erinnerung im globalen Zeitalter: Der Holocaust* (Frankfurt/M.: Suhrkamp, 2001); and Michael Rothberg, *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009).

⁴¹ Rothberg, *Multidirectional Memory*, 5.

⁴² Marita Sturken, *Tangled Memories: The Vietnam War, the AIDS Epidemic, and the Politics of Remembering* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 17.

⁴³ See Marita Sturken, *Tourists of History: Memory, Kitsch, and Consumerism from Oklahoma City to Ground Zero* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007).

⁴⁴ Erika Doss, *Memorial Mania: Public Feeling in America* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010), 172. For an overview of official and unofficial proposals for the World Trade Center site, including a memorial, see Suzanne Stephens, Ian Luna, and Ron Broadhurst, *Imagining Ground Zero: Official and Unofficial Proposals for the World Trade Center Site* (New York: Rizzoli, 2004).

⁴⁵ The full title of the monument reads Monument against Fascism, War, and Violence – for Peace and Human Rights (*Mahnmal gegen Faschismus, Krieg und Gewalt – für Frieden und Menschenrechte*).

⁴⁶ Doss, *Memorial Mania*, 174.

⁴⁷ For a discussion of an aesthetic of verisimilitude often present in 9/11 memorials, see Doss, *Memorial Mania*, 126.

⁴⁸ Geoffrey M. White, “National Subjects: September 11 and Pearl Harbor,” *American Ethnologist* 31, no. 3 (2007): 305.

⁴⁹ See James E. Young, “The Biography of a Memorial Icon: Nathan Rapoport’s Warsaw Ghetto Monument,” *Representations* 26 (1989): 69–106.

⁵⁰ Names are placed within nine primary groups. People who were in or around the North Tower, people aboard Flight 11 (the jetliner that hit it), and victims of the 1993 bombing of the World Trade Center are represented around the North Pool. Emergency workers (mostly firefighters and police officers), people from the South Tower, people aboard Flight 77 (the jetliner that hit it), people at the Pentagon and from Flight 77, and people aboard Flight 93, the jet that crashed in Pennsylvania, are represented around the South Pool. Within these groups, names are arranged by affiliation and according to requested adjacencies. “Memorial Guide,” 9/11 Memorial, <http://names.911memorial.org/>.

⁵¹ Doss, *Memorial Mania*, 174.

⁵² Quoted in Young, “Memory and the Monument,” 91.

⁵³ Jackie Craven, “Daniel Libeskind, Ground Zero Master Planner,” About.com, accessed April 8, 2013, <http://architecture.about.com/od/architectsaz/p/daniel-libeskind.htm>.

⁵⁴ Doss, *Memorial Mania*, 174.

⁵⁵ Korp, “Seeing What Is Missing,” 260.

⁵⁶ See Cathy Caruth, *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996).

⁵⁷ The light beams replicate the cover illustration Paul Myoda and Julian LaVerdiere created for the *New York Times Magazine* (September 22, 2001) and called “Filling the Void” (see also p. 80 of that issue).

⁵⁸ Kevin Kelly, “Sean Tallon,” Donadea 9/11 Memorial, March 31, 2004, accessed January 5, 2012, http://www.kildare.ie/donadea911/cat_sean_tallon.html.

⁵⁹ The inscription reads, “El Pueblo de Moncalvillo a la Memoria de Edelmiro Abad Elvira Muerto en el Atentado de Nueva York el 11-IX-2001—A Todas Las Victimas del Terrorismo—Moncalvillo 11-VIII-2002.”

⁶⁰ Joyce Shelby, Michael O. Allen, and Don Singleton, “2 Tragically Linked Lives Are Mourned: Crowded Services for WTC Victims,” *New York Daily News*, December 16, 2001, <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/2-tragically-linked-lives-mourned-crowded-services-wtc-victims-article-1.928523>; and “Edelmiro Abad: One Office, Two Families,” *New York Times*, October 11, 2001, <http://www.nytimes.com/2001/10/11/national/portraits/POGF-229-12ABAD.html>.

⁶¹ I am grateful to Martin Zimmermann, one of the initiators of the memorial, for explaining the memorial’s history and scope to me. It is meant as a symbol for tolerance, a visual marker against terrorism and any form of extremism, Zimmermann stresses. A full discussion of the memorial would justify another article. Yet I feel a brief inclusion of this German memorial to be called for, since it combines two of the features that concern me in this article and that seem to have become “household items” of 9/11 memorial design: original pieces (in this case the only one displayed in Germany) and Twin Tower replicas.

⁶² The denomination of the site of memory as *Heldenhain* (heroes grove) that is mentioned in a *Süddeutsche Zeitung* article was dropped years earlier to avoid any discord in relation to the German past. See Max Hägler, “Einziges deutsches Denkmal für 9/11: Ein Trumm Eisen, gebettet auf roten Filz,” *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, September 9, 2011, <http://www.sueddeutsche.de/bayern/einziges-deutsches-denkmal-fuer-ein-trumm-eisen-gebettet-auf-roten-filz-1.1140973>.

⁶³ Simpson, *9/11*, 213.

⁶⁴ Taylor, *Archive and the Repertoire*, 247.

⁶⁵ In another context, Birgit Däwes has aptly spoken of “a historicity frozen into iconic timelessness” regarding the impact of the visual dimension of 9/11 (Däwes, *Ground Zero Fiction*, 412).

⁶⁶ Rosie Gray, “Designers of Planned Twin Towers Look-Alike in Seoul ‘Regret Deeply’ Resemblance,” *Village Voice*, December 12, 2011, http://blogs.villagevoice.com/runninscared/2011/12/designers_of_pl.php.

⁶⁷ Simpson, *9/11*, 213.

⁶⁸ Zuber, “Flânerie at Ground Zero,” 271.

⁶⁹ See, for example, Nicoletta Canazza, “Memoria e luce, a Padova un memorial all’11/9, che brilla per pochi,” *Il Sole 24 ORE*, September 10, 2007, <http://www.ilsole24ore.com/art/SoleOnLine4/Speciali/2007/11settembre/memoria-e-luce.shtml?uuid=27c776a6-5fa2-11dc-b5d3-00000e25102>; and “Monumento ‘Memoria e Luce’—Comune di Padova,” *Padova Net*, September 9, 2008, <http://www.padovanet.it/dettaglio.jsp?id=10845#.VL15Ci7F-Mg>.

⁷⁰ Jay Winter, “Sites of Memory and the Shadow of War,” in *A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies*, ed. Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2010), 70.

⁷¹ Sabine Sielke, “Why ‘9/11 is [not] unique,’ or: Troping Trauma,” *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 55, no. 3 (2010): 398.

⁷² Martin Filler, “More Than Zero,” *New Republic*, September 9, 2002, <http://www.newrepublic.com/article/more-zero>.

⁷³ “Memoria e Luce, 9/11 Memorial,” Studio Libeskind, accessed June 22, 2012, <http://libeskind.com/work/memoria-e-luce-911-memorial/>.

⁷⁴ A sculpture in a park in Ness Ziona was dedicated as early as November 30, 2001. A square in Or Yehuda was dedicated to Israeli families of the victims of 9/11 on September 3, 2003. In Eilat, a memorial of two metal beams was dedicated on September 4, 2003. A square in Ashkelon was dedicated on October 7, 2003. In Herzliya, two memorial stones were dedicated on May 17, 2005. A memorial stone in a park in Yehud was dedicated in April 2005. A memorial of two stainless steel steles was dedicated in Beer Sheva on September 13, 2005. D Quarter Park in Ashdod was dedicated on September 19, 2005. Two stone steles in Rishon LeZion were dedicated on September 11, 2007. At Bar-Ilan University, Tel Aviv, a gate was dedicated to Hagay Shefi, a former graduate who lost his life in the 9/11 attacks. See Dov Shefi, “Memorials in Israel,” *Hagay Shefi*, accessed January 5, 2012, <http://www.hagayshefi.info/english/MemIsrael.html>.

⁷⁵ Participants included former Prime Minister Ehud Olmert, several Israeli Cabinet ministers, and Knesset members, the US Ambassador James Cunningham, and family members of the victims. US Congressman Erik Paulsen led a delegation from the US.

⁷⁶ “9/11 Living Memorial in Jerusalem,” Jewish National Fund, accessed January 5, 2012, <http://www.jnf.org/work-we-do/our-projects/tourism-recreation/911-living-memorial-in.html>.

⁷⁷ Ibid.

⁷⁸ Chaya Minkowitz-Hyams, “Jerusalem’s 9/11 Memorial Dedication,” *Jewish Press*, November 25, 2009, accessed October 30, 2010, <http://www.jewishpress.com/pageroute.do/41574>.

⁷⁹ I am grateful to Sarit Schonbrun, Director of Communications at the Jewish National Fund, for answering my questions regarding the inscriptions, the placement of the World Trade Center’s metal remnant, and the memorial’s specific location in Jerusalem.

⁸⁰ Schonbrun even points to a personal connection as Ehud Olmert, then mayor of Jerusalem, requested the piece from Rudy Giuliani. The inscription reads, “This metal remnant was taken from the remains of the Twin Towers that imploded in the September 11, 2001 disaster. It was sent over to Israel by the City of New York to be incorporated into this memorial. This metal piece, like the entire monument, is a manifestation of the special relationship between New York and Jerusalem and an expression of gratitude to Keren Kayemeth Lelsrael—Jewish National Fund whose initiative and the generous contribution of its supporters made this monument possible.”

⁸¹ Rothberg, “Failure of the Imagination,” 153.

⁸² Gray, “Open Doors, Closed Minds,” 147.

Selected Bibliography

“9/11 Living Memorial in Jerusalem.” Jewish National Fund. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://www.jnf.org/work-we-do/our-projects/tourism-recreation/911-living-memorial-in.html>.

Baudrillard, Jean. *The Spirit of Terrorism and Requiem for the Twin Towers*. London: Verso, 2002.

Canazza, Nicoletta. “Memoria e luce, a Padova un memorial all'11/9, che brilla per pochi.” *Il Sole 24 ORE*, September 10, 2007. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://www.ilsole24ore.com/art/SoleOnLine4/Speciali/2007/11settembre/memoria-e-luce.shtml?uid=27c776a6-5fa2-11dc-b5d3-00000e25102>.

Carlson, Marla. “Looking, Listening, and Remembering: Ways to Walk New York after 9/11.” *Theatre Journal* 58, no. 3 (2006): 395–416.

Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996.

- Casey, Edward S. *Remembering: A Phenomenological Study*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Craven, Jackie. "Daniel Libeskind, Ground Zero Master Planner." About.com. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://architecture.about.com/od/architectsaz/p/daniel-libeskind.htm>.
- Crownshaw, Richard. "Deterritorializing the 'Homeland' in American Studies and American Fiction after 9/11." *Journal of American Studies* 45, no. 4 (2011): 757–76.
- Däwes, Birgit. *Ground Zero Fiction: History, Memory, and Representation in the American 9/11 Novel*. Heidelberg: Winter, 2011.
- Doss, Erika. *Memorial Mania: Public Feeling in America*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010.
- "Edelmiro Abad: One Office, Two Families." *New York Times*, October 11, 2001. <http://www.nytimes.com/2001/10/11/national/portraits/POGF-229-12ABAD.html>.
- Filler, Martin. "More Than Zero," *New Republic*, September 9, 2002, <http://www.newrepublic.com/article/more-zero>.
- Gessner, Ingrid. *Kollektive Erinnerung als Katharsis? Das Vietnam Veterans Memorial in der öffentlichen Kontroverse*. Mainzer Studien zur Amerikanistik 44. Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2000.
- Gray, Richard. *After the Fall: American Literature Since 9/11*. Chichester, UK: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.
- . "Open Doors, Closed Minds: American Prose Writing at a Time of Crisis." *American Literary History* 21, no. 1 (2009): 128–51.
- Gray, Rosie. "Designers of Planned Twin Towers Look-Alike in Seoul 'Regret Deeply' Resemblance." *Village Voice*, December 12, 2011, http://blogs.villagevoice.com/runninscared/2011/12/designers_of_pl.php.
- Hägler, Max, "Einziges deutsches Denkmal für 9/11: Ein Trumm Eisen, gebettet auf roten Filz." *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, September 9, 2011, <http://www.sueddeutsche.de/bayern/einziges-deutsches-denkmal-fuer-ein-trumm-eisen-gebettet-auf-roten-filz-1.1140973>.
- Hirsch, Marianne. "The Day Time Stopped." *Chronicle of Higher Education*, January 25, 2002. <http://chronicle.com/article/The-Day-Time-Stopped/20768>.
- Johnson, Nuala. "Cast in Stone: Monuments, Geography, and Nationalism." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 13, no. 1 (1995): 51–65.
- Kammen, Michael G. "Commemoration and Contestation in American Culture: Historical Perspectives." *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 48, no. 2 (2003): 185–205.
- . "Public History and National Identity in the United States." *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 44, no. 4 (1999): 459–75.

- Kelly, Kevin. "Sean Tallon," Donadea 9/11 Memorial, March 31, 2004. Accessed January 5, 2012. http://www.kildare.ie/donadea911/cat_sean_tallon.html.
- Korp, Maureen. "Seeing What Is Missing: Art, Artists and September 11." In *Religion, Terror and Violence: Religious Studies Perspectives*, ed. Bryan S. Rennie and Philip L. Tite, 253–70. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Levy, Daniel, and Natan Sznaider. *Erinnerung im globalen Zeitalter: Der Holocaust*. Edition zweite Moderne. Frankfurt/M.: Suhrkamp, 2001.
- Linenthal, Edward Tabor. *The Unfinished Bombing: Oklahoma City in American Memory*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- "Memoria e Luce, 9/11 Memorial." Studio Libeskind. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://libeskind.com/work/memoria-e-luce-911-memorial/>.
- Miller, Nancy K. "'Portraits of Grief': Telling Details and the Testimony of Trauma." *differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 14, no. 3 (2003): 112–35.
- Minkowitz-Hyams, Chaya. "Jerusalem's 9/11 Memorial Dedication." *Jewish Press*, November 25, 2009. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://www.jewishpressclassifieds.com/pageroute.do/41574>.
- "Monumento 'Memoria e Luce'—Comune di Padova." *Padova Net*, September 9, 2008. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://www.padovanet.it/dettaglio.jsp?id=10845>.
- Nora, Pierre. *Les Lieux de Mémoire*. 7 vols. Paris: Gallimard, 1984–1992.
- Orvell, Miles. "After 9/11: Photography, the Destructive Sublime, and the Postmodern Archive." *Michigan Quarterly Review* 45, no. 2 (2006): 239–56.
- "Portraits of Grief." *New York Times*. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/us/sept-11-reckoning/portraits-of-grief.html>.
- Rothberg, Michael. "A Failure of the Imagination: Diagnosing the Post-9/11 Novel: A Response to Richard Gray." *American Literary History* 21, no. 1 (2009): 152–58.
- . *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009.
- Rigney, Ann. "The Dynamics of Remembrance: Texts Between Monumentality and Morphing." In *A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies*, ed. Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning, 345–53. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2010.
- Said, Edward W. "Invention, Memory, and Place." *Critical Inquiry* 26, no. 2 (2000): 175–92.
- Senie, Harriet F. "A Difference in Kind: Spontaneous Memorials after 9/11." *Sculpture*, July–August 2003. http://www.sculpture.org/documents/scmag03/jul_aug03/webspecial/senie.shtml.
- "Seven General Principles for the Rebuilding of Lower Manhattan." *New York New Visions*. Accessed April 8, 2013. <http://nynv.aiga.org/principles.shtml>.

- Shefi, Dov. "Memorials in Israel." *Hagay Shefi*. Accessed April 8, 2013.
<http://www.hagayshefi.info/english/MemIsrael.html>.
- Shelby, Joyce, Michael O. Allen, and Don Singleton. "2 Tragically Linked Lives Are Mourned: Crowded Services for WTC Victims." *New York Daily News*, December 16, 2001. <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/2-tragically-linked-lives-mourned-crowded-services-wtc-victims-article-1.928523>.
- Sielke, Sabine. "Why '9/11 is [not] unique,' or: Troping Trauma." *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 55, no. 3 (2010): 385–408.
- Simpson, David. *9/11: The Culture of Commemoration*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Snyder-Körber, MaryAnn. "Lost and Found Lives: The Portraits of Grief and the Work of September 11th Mourning." *Amerikastudien/American Studies* 55, no. 3 (2010): 451–78.
- Spiegelman, Art. *In the Shadow of No Towers*. New York: Pantheon, 2004.
- Stephens, Suzanne, Ian Luna, and Ron Broadhurst. *Imagining Ground Zero: Official and Unofficial Proposals for the World Trade Center Site*. New York: Rizzoli, 2004.
- Sturken, Marita, "The Aesthetics of Absence: Rebuilding Ground Zero." *American Ethnologist* 31, no. 3 (2004): 311–25.
- . *Tangled Memories: The Vietnam War, the AIDS Epidemic, and the Politics of Remembering*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.
- . *Tourists of History: Memory, Kitsch, and Consumerism from Oklahoma City to Ground Zero*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007.
- Taussig, Michael T. *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Taylor, Diana. *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.
- White, Geoffrey M. "National Subjects: September 11 and Pearl Harbor." *American Ethnologist* 31, no. 3 (2007): 293–310.
- Williams, Paul Harvey. *Memorial Museums: The Global Rush to Commemorate Atrocities*. Oxford: Berg, 2007.
- Winter, Jay. "Sites of Memory and the Shadow of War." In *A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies*, ed. Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning, 61–74. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2010.
- Young, James E. "The Biography of a Memorial Icon: Nathan Rapoport's Warsaw Ghetto Monument." *Representations* 26 (1989): 69–106.
- . "Memory and the Monument After 9/11." In *The Future of Memory*, ed. Richard Crownshaw, Jane Kilby, and Antony Rowland, 77–92. New York: Berghahn, 2010.

———. *The Texture of Memory: Holocaust Memorials and Meaning*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993.

Zuber, Devin. “Flânerie at Ground Zero: Aesthetic Counter-memories in Lower Manhattan.” *American Quarterly* 58, no. 2 (2006): 269–99.

Appendix

This appendix is an attempt to list 9/11 memorials by drawing mainly on the following sources: (1) the waymarking.com category “9/11 Memorial Sites”; and (2) VOICES of September 11th (<http://voicesofseptember11.org/>). The nonprofit organization VOICES evolved from a small group of 9/11 family members. Where known, I have added the dedication dates of the international 9/11 memorials. I kindly ask *JTAS* readers to contact me regarding memorials that have escaped this list (memorials@ingrid-gessner.de).

9/11 Memorials in the United States

Alabama

9/11 Liberty Garden (Birmingham)
Freedom Blooms (Troy)
Moody 9/11 Memorial (Moody)

Arizona

9/11 Memorial at Wesley Bolin Memorial Plaza (Phoenix)
9/11 Memorial at Yuma Fire Station No.1 (Yuma)
Arizona Heroes Memorial (Bullhead City)
The Salome 9/11 Memorial (Salome)

Arkansas

9/11 Steel Monument Memorial (El Dorado)
Cossatot Community College of the University of Arkansas (DeQueen)
Keep Faulkner County Beautiful (Conway)

California

9/11 Memorial at San Diego Airport (San Diego)
Beverly Hills 9/11 Memorial Garden (Beverly Hills)
Flight 93 Memorial (Union City)
Fountain Valley 9/11 Memorial (Fountain Valley)
LAX “Recovering Equilibrium” 9/11 Memorial (Los Angeles)
Lisa Anne 12KV Power Line (Santa Ana)
Lisa Anne Frost Plaque & Tree (Rancho Santa Margarita)
Los Angeles Fire Department 9/11 Memorial (Los Angeles)
Manhattan Beach 9/11 Memorial (Manhattan Beach)
Paul Sloan Flagpole & Plaque at San Marin High School (Novato)

Pepperdine University Heroes Garden (Malibu)
San Jose 9/11 Memorial (San Jose)
San Ramon Memorial Park (San Ramon)
The September 11th Memorial Plaza (Sacramento)
Valhalla Park Memorial (North Hollywood)

Colorado

9/11 Stair Climb (Morrison)
9-11 Monument (Broomfield)
Peace Wall (Thornton)
World Trade Center Memorial (Fort Carson)

Connecticut

Alexander R. Steinman Memorial Locker Room (Suffield)
Amy Toyen Sculpture (Avon)
Beardsley Zoo Hanson Exploration Station and Backyard Habitat (Bridgeport)
Capt. Vincent Giammona Memorial Bench (Bolton)
Capt. Vincent Giammona Memorial Bench (Manchester)
Christine's Tree at the Old Academy Nursery School (Easton)
Connecticut's 9/11 Living Memorial (Westport)
Danbury 9/11 Memorial (Danbury)
Diane Urban Garden (Litchfield)
Eric Thorpe Memorial Bench (Mystic)
Flagpole Memorial (Wilton)
James A Greenleaf Memorial (New London)
James A Greenleaf Memorial (Waterford)
James Madison Memorial Gardens (Madison)
Jason E. Sabbag Benches at Greenwich High and Western Middle School (Greenwich)
Joe Lenihan Memorial Bench and Flagpole and Piano (Cos Cob)
Joseph A. Lenihan Memorial Bench (West Hartford)
Josh Piver Athletic Field (Stonington)
Josh's Bench at Stonington Point (Stonington)
Lindsay Morehouse Courtyard (Greenwich)
McCourt Memorial Garden (New London)
New Milford 9/11 Memorial (New Milford)
Peter Hanson Monument at Joel Barlow High School (Redding)
Rabbit Weathervane Memorial (Windsor)
Ridgefield 9/11 Memorial (Ridgefield)
Settlement Hill 9/11 Memorial Garden (Windsor)
The Memorial Garden at the Unitarian Church (Westport)
Tyler's Court (Ridgefield)
Windsor High School 9/11 Memorial (Windsor)

District of Columbia

Dave Bernard Memorial Garden

DIA (Defense Intelligence Agency) 9/11 Memorial Defense Intelligence Analysis Center
Bolling Air Force Base Georgetown University Memorial Park
Leckie Elementary School Garden Memorial
September 11 Memorial Grove at Kingman Island
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 1: Marie Reed School
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 2: New Jersey Avenue Grove
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 4: Upshur Park
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 5: Langdon Park
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 6: Historic Congressional Cemetery
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 7: Penn Branch Gateway Park
September 11 Memorial Grove in Ward 8: Oxon Run Park
The National 9/11 Pentagon Memorial

Florida

Friendship Park 9/11 Memorial (Redington Beach)
Indian River Boulevard Memorial (Vero Beach)
Liberty Garden (Ocala)
Lindsay Morehouse Tennis Courts (Palm Beach Gardens)
Memorial Garden (Spring Hill)
Patriot's Day Memorial Dedicated to Michael H. Edwards & All 9/11 Victims (Take City)
Steven Coakley Memorial (Madeira Beach)
Whispering Pines Friendship & Tolerance Garden (Boca Raton)

Georgia

Forsyth County Liberty Garden (Cumming)
September 11th Memorial Garden and Trail (Athens)
We Will Not Forget Memorial (Cartersville)

Hawaii

Honolulu Community College 9-11 Memorial (Honolulu)

Illinois

Arbor Day Trees as a Tribute (Bloomington)
Commander Dan Shanower September 11 Memorial (Naperville)
National Shrine of Our Lady of Snow (Belleville)
Oak Ridge Cemetery Quercetum (Springfield)
Swansea Illinois 9/11 Memorial (Swansea)

Indiana

Tyler's Court (Indianapolis)
We Remember (Plymouth)

Iowa

Freedom Trees Veterans Memorial Stadium (Cedar Rapids)
Knoxville Freedom Trees Memorial (Knoxville)

Kansas

Anthony 9-11 Memorial (Anthony)

Kentucky

9/11 Plaque (Danville)

9-11 Memorial at Noble Park (Paducah)

Livingston 9/11 Memorial (Livingston)

Tribute Park (Alexandria)

Walton Community Park 9-11 Memorial (Walton)

Louisiana

Doug Irgang Research Center (New Orleans)

Lake Charles 9/11 Memorial (Lake Charles)

Shreveport's Liberty Garden (Shreveport)

Tammany Trace Trail (Slidell to Covington)

Maine

Augusta Firefighters 9/11 Memorial (Augusta)

September 11th Memorial in Fort Allen Park (Portland)

Maryland

Inspiration Park (Gaithersburg)

Joshua Aron Memorial Tree (Gaithersburg)

Montgomery County 9/11 Memorial (Rockville)

National Fallen Firefighters Memorial (Emmitsburg)

September 11th Memorial Forest (Quantico)

Survivors and Victims Memorial (Ocean City)

Massachusetts

Al Filipov Memorial Bench (Concord)

Bob's Bench (Woburn)

Boston College 9/11 Memorial Labyrinth (Chestnut Hill)

Boston Logan Airport 9/11 Memorial (Boston)

Boston Public Garden 9/11 Memorial (Boston)

Brian Joseph Murphy Memorial Preservation Land (Westfield)

Captain John Ogonowski Memorial Preservation Farmland and Memorial Square (Dracut)

Cook's Garden (Historic Deerfield)

Hanson Family Memorial (Groton)

Hemenway Landing (Eastham)

Jessica Sachs Prayer Garden (Billerica)

John B. Cahill Memorial Bench (Brookline)

Lindsay S. Morehouse Memorial (Williamstown)

Mark Bavis Memorial Box (Boston)

Memorial Bench at Agawam Fire Department (Agawam)

Memorial to Merrimack Valley Victims (Lawrence)

Naismith Memorial Basketball Hall of Fame (Springfield)

Neilie Point (Woods Hole)
Operation Days Work 9/11 Memorial (Quincy)
Painted Post Road Hanson Family Memorial (Groton)
Plymouth 9/11 Memorial (Plymouth)
Prayer Garden in Memory of Jessica Leigh Sachs (Billerica)
Rick Thorpe Scoreboard (Wilbraham)
September 11 Memorial Garden in Heritage Park (Sudbury)
Susan Blair Memorial Stone and Garden at Needham High School (Needham)
Tewksbury 9-11 Memorial (Tewksbury)
TJX Family Memorial Garden (Framingham)
Tyler's Court (Springfield)
Wayland High School Memorial (Wayland)

Michigan

9-11 Memorial Flagpole at Regents Court (Dearborn)
Kelly A. Booms Memorial Flagpole (West Bloomfield)
Kelly A. Booms Robinwood Tree (Royal Oak)
Meredith Whalen Memorial Bench (Canton)
Remembrance Plaza (Lansing)
The Shrine of Remembrance at Michigan Memorial Cemetary (Flat Rock)
Tyler's Court (Detroit)

Minnesota

9/11 Memorial Park (Marshall)
Memorial Bench on Stewsie Island (Northfield)
Mt. Iron 9/11 Memorial at USS Mine (Mt. Iron)
Tom Burnett Memorial Flag (Bloomington)

Missouri

Fenton Heroes Memorial (Fenton)
Gateway Greening 9-11 Orchard (St. Louis)
John Willett Memorials (Walnut Shade)
O'Fallen 9/11 Memorial (O'Fallen)
Phelps Grove 9/11 Memorial (Springfield)
Remembering 9/11: Memorial Stair Climb (Kansas City)
Spirit of Freedom 9/11 Memorial (St. Charles)

Montana

Community 9/11 Memorial at MSU Billings (Billings)

Nebraska

Keep Fremont Nebraska Beautiful Liberty Tree Planting (Fremont)
Memorial Clock (Lexington)

Nevada

9-11 Memorial at New York NY Hotel & Casino (Las Vegas)

New Hampshire

Benson Park 9/11 Memorial (Hudson)
Eric Thorpe Harkness Table (Exeter)
Lindsay S. Morehouse Memorial Bench (Concord)
Sharon's Arboretum September 11th Memorial Hemlock Grove (Durham)
Teddy Maloney Rink (Andover)

New Jersey

Rutgers University Jayceryll Malabuyoc de Chavez Library Fund (New Brunswick)
9/11 Memorial at the Howell Municipal Center (Howell)
9/11 Memorial Garden (Chatham)
9/11 Memorial Garden (Nutley)
9/11 Memorial Gazebo (Jackson)
9/11 Memorial Labyrinth (Woodbridge)
A Place to Remember (Basking Ridge)
An American Remembrance in the Manalapan Arboretum (Manalapan)
Andrew Kim Memorial Tennis Courts and Memorial Plaque (Leonia)
Angel in Anguish (Brick Township)
Atlantic Highlands County Memorial (Atlantic Highlands)
Bergen Catholic High School 9/11 Memorial (Oradell)
Bergen County 9/11 Memorial (Leonia)
Berkeley Heights 9/11 Memorial (Berkeley Heights)
Bernards Township 9/11 Memorial (Basking Ridge)
Bloomfield 9/11 Memorial (Bloomfield)
Brooklawn 9/11 Memorial & Monument (Brooklawn)
Camden County Victims of Terrorism Memorial (Merchantville)
Carteret 9/11 Memorial (Carteret)
Catholic Cemeteries 9/11 Memorial Monument (Newark)
Centennial Park Memorial (New Providence)
Chatham 9/11 Memorial (Chatham)
Christopher Vialonga 9/11 Memorial (Demarest)
Cranbury 9/11 Memorial (Cranbury)
Cranford 9/11 Memorial (Cranford)
Dauntless Efforts 9/11 Memorial (Jersey City)
Dominique Pandolfo 9/11 Memorial (Paramus)
Eagle Rock September 11th Memorial (West Orange)
East Brunswick 9/11 Memorial (East Brunswick)
East Newark 9/11 Memorial (East Newark)
East Rutherford Fire Department's Exempt Firemen's Memorial Park (East Rutherford)
Echo Lake Park Memorial (Union County)
Empty Sky New Jersey State 9/11 Memorial (Jersey City)
Englewood 9/11 Memorial (Englewood)
Fair Haven 9/11 Memorial (Fair Haven)
Fairview 9/11 Memorial (Fairview)

Frank A. DeMartini Wrestling Center (Haddon Heights)
Franklin Lakes Memorial Pond (Franklin Lakes)
Freedom Park (Randolph)
Freehold Township 9/11 Living Memorial Tree Grove (Freehold Township)
G.R.A.C.E Memorial at Veterans Park (Glen Rock)
Garden of Remembrance (Green Brook)
Garfield Port Authority Police Memorial (Garfield)
Glen Ridge 9/11 Memorial (Glen Ridge)
Glen Rock 9/11 Memorial (Glen Rock)
Grove of Remembrance (Jersey City)
Hamilton 9/11 Memorial (Hamilton)
Harrington Park 9/11 Memorial (Harrington Park)
Harrison 9/11 Memorial (Harrison)
Hawthorne 9/11 Memorial (Hawthorne)
Hazlet Township 9-11 Tree and Garden Memorial (Hazlet)
Hoboken Island (Hoboken)
Holmdel 9/11 Memorial (Holmdel)
Howell High School 9/11 Memorial (Howell)
Howell N.J. Municipal Offices (Howell)
Jackson Police Department Memorial (Jackson)
James Park 9/11 Memorial (Madison)
Jim Samuel Jr. 9/11 Memorial (Monroe)
John P. Bocchi Memorial Field (New Vernon)
Kaulfers and Robin 9/11 Memorial (Kenilworth)
Keansburg 9/11 Memorial (Keansburg)
Kermit Anderson Memorial Bench (Dunellen)
Kevin Cohen Ave. (Edison)
Lake Papaiani 9/11 Memorial (Edison)
Leonia Park Memorial (Leonia / SUNY Binghamton)
Lincoln Park 9/11 Memorial (Morris County)
Livingston 9/11 Memorial (Livingston)
Lodi High School 9/11 Memorial (Lodi)
Manalapan 9/11 Memorial (Manalapan)
Manalapan 9/11 Memorial Tree (Manalapan)
Mantua Township 9/11 Memorial (Sewell)
Mark Rasweiler Memorial Bench (Flemington)
Marlboro Township Living Memorial (Marlboro)
Matthew C. Sellitto 9/11 Memorial Park (New Vernon)
Matthew C. Sellitto Gymnasium (New Vernon)
Matthew C. Sellitto Memorial Garden (West Orange)
Matthew C. Sellitto Memorial Plaque (Bernardsville)
Matthew C. Sellitto Tree Planting (New Vernon)
Memorial of Remembrance (Stirling)
Metuchen Freedom Plaza 9/11 Memorial (Metuchen)

Middlesex 9/11 Memorial (South Amboy)
Middletown 9/11 Memorial Gardens (Middletown)
Monmouth County 9/11 Memorial (Lincroft)
Monroe Township 9/11 Memorial (Monroe)
Montclair State University 9/11 Memorial (Montclair)
Morris County 9/11 Memorial (Parsippany)
Mount Mitchill Scenic Overlook (Atlantic Highlands)
New Cedar Park Cemetery (Paramus)
New Jersey Living Memorial: A Grove of Remembrance (Jersey City)
North Arlington 9/11 Memorial (Leonia)
Oceanport 9/11 Memorial (Oceanport)
Old Bridge 9/11 Memorial (Old Bridge)
Paterson 9/11 Memorial (Paterson)
Piping Rock Memorial Park (Rumson)
Plainsboro 9/11 Memorial (Plainsboro)
Plaque at Lawrenceville Prep (Lawrenceville)
Port Authority 9/11 Memorial (Orange County)
Princeton University Alumni Memorial Garden (Princeton)
Remembrance Park (Ship Bottom)
Richard Cudina Memorial (Glen Gardner)
Ridgewood Ave. Train Station 9/11 Memorial (Glen Ridge)
Ridgewood Country Club Memorial (Paramus)
River Edge 9/11 Memorial (River Edge)
Rutgers University 9/11 Memorial (New Brunswick)
Salvatore Zisa Memorial Bench (Hawthorne)
Scott Schertzer Butterfly Garden and Scott Schertzer Drive (Edison)
Seaside Heights 9/11 Memorial (Seaside Heights)
Secaucus Memorial Library (Secaucus)
September 11th Memorial Bridge (Brielle and Point Pleasant)
September 11th Memorial Garden (Colts Neck)
September 11th Memorial Tree Grove (Hoboken)
Shrewsbury 9/11 Memorial (Shrewsbury)
Somerset County 9/11 Memorial (Somerville)
South River 9/11 Memorial (South River)
Spring Lake 9/11 Memorial (Spring Lake)
Squankum Firehouse 9/11 Memorial (Howell)
St. Andrews Seminary (South Orange)
St. Clements Church Memorial (Matawan)
St. Joseph's Church Memorial dedicated to Thomas Sabella (Stirling)
St. Luke's Parish Field dedicated to John Griffin (Ho-Ho-Kus)
Steven B. Paterson Memorial Field (Hazlet)
Tear Drop 9/11 Memorial (Hoboken)
The Memoria Project: A Commemorative Stone Sculpture (Red Bank)
The Upper Room Spiritual Center; dedicated to Robert Devitt (Neptune City)

Tinton Falls World Trade Center Memorial (Tinton Falls)
To The Struggle Against World Terrorism, Tear of Grief, Tear Drop Memorial (Bayonne)
Todd Beamer Post Office Building (Cranbury)
Tower of Remembrance (Stirling)
Trinity Church Bell (Hoboken)
Trinity Root Memorial at Trinity Church (New York City)
Victims of Terrorism Memorial (Merchantville)
Victory Park (Rumson)
Weehawken Water Tower (Weehawken)
West Windsor 9/11 Memorial (West Windsor)
Westfield September 11th Memorial Park (Westfield)
Windward Beach Park; dedicated to Robert Devitt (Brick Township)
WTC United Family Group Memorial (East Orange)
Wyckoff Statue and Eternal Flame (Wyckoff)
Wyckoff Town Memorial (Wyckoff)
Zadroga Soccer Field & Park (North Arlington)

New Mexico

Vista Verde Park 9-11 Memorial (Rio Rancho)
Sacred Heart Catholic Church (Albuquerque)

New York

14th Street 9/11 Memorial (New York City)
9/11 Memorial Wall Fountain (New York City)
9/11 Seaford High School Memorial (Seaford)
9-11 Memorial at St. Joseph's Chapel (New York City)
A Celebration of Life: Ramapo's Walk of Remembrance (Ramapo)
Abe (Avremel) Zelmanowitz Way (Brooklyn)
Albertus Magnus 9/11 Memorial Garden (Bardonia)
Alexander R. Steinman Memorial Athletic Fields (Staten Island)
Amarnauth Lachhman Place (Valley Stream)
Andrew Friedman Basketball Court (Syosset)
Andrew Friedman Way and Elevator (Woodbury)
Andrew Stergiopoulos Ice Rink (Great Neck)
Andrew Stergiopoulos Memorial at Great Neck North High School (Great Neck)
Andrew Stergiopoulos Memorial Trees in Kennilworth, Kings Point (Great Neck)
Angel of Hope (East Meadow)
Angels Circle WTC Memorial (Staten Island)
Apawamis Club (Rye)
Arthur Warren Scullin Way (Queens)
Babylon 9/11 Memorial (Barrier Island, Babylon)
Bart Ruggiere Road (Port Washington)
Bedford Canine Tribute Park (Katonah)
Bellmore/Wantagh New York Memorial (Wantagh)

Beth's Garden (Hempstead)
Block Island Memorial (Block Island)
Breezy Point 9/11 Memorial (Breezy Point)
Brian C. Hickey Monument (Bethpage)
Brian C. Hickey Post Office (Bethpage)
Brian E. Bilcher Way (Staten Island)
Queen Elizabeth II September 11th Garden at Hanover Square (New York City)
Brockport Fire Department 9/11 Memorial (Brockport)
Brooke Jackman Drive (Oyster Bay)
Brooke Jackman Memorial Garden (Oyster Bay)
Brooklyn Bridge Park Coalition Memorial Garden (Brooklyn)
Brooklyn Remembers Memorial (Brooklyn)
Bruce H. Gary Field of Heroes (Bellmore)
Camp Dudley Memorial Cross (Westport)
Captain Daniel Brethel Street (East Meadow)
Captain Vincent F. Giammona Way (Bayside)
Carl Allen Peralta Street (Staten Island)
Carol Ann Flyzik Memorial Garden & Plaque (Sidney)
Central Park Tree Trust Memorial (New York City)
Chester Kiwanis 9/11 Memorial (Chester)
Church of St. Ephrem Sept. 11th Garden of Hope (Brooklyn)
Church Sacristy Doors (Merrick)
Citi Field Memorial Plaque (Queens)
Clarkson University 9/11 Memorial (Potsdam)
Clinton Community Garden/ Hell's Kitchen Fire Heroes Benefit Concert (New York City)
Conseleya 9/11 Memorial (Brooklyn)
Coram Monument (Coram)
Crescent Beach Park – Flagpole/Memorial (Staten Island)
Crisci-Smagala Memorial Park (Holbrook)
Cure of Ars Church (Merrick)
David D. Alger Memorial (New York City)
DeWitt 9/11 Memorial (DeWitt)
Diane Gail Barry Memorial (Staten Island)
Douglas B. and Joseph H. Gardner Commons (New York City)
East Brunswick Jewish Center (East Brunswick)
East Islip 9-11 Memorial (East Islip)
East Norwich and Muttontown 9/11 Memorial (East Norwich/Muttontown)
East Williston Memorial Garden (East Williston)
Eisenhower Park American Patriot Garden (East Meadow)
EMT Mark Schwartz Rd. (West Hempstead)
Endor Community Garden (Riverdale)
Engine 227 Truck (Brooklyn)
Euro Brokers (New York City)
FDNY Memorial Wall (New York City)

Fire Patrolman Keith Roma Place (Staten Island)
Firefighter Michael J. Cawley Place (Flushing)
First Quincy Street Garden Memorial to NYC Black Firemen (Brooklyn)
Fort Greene Park Groove of Trees (Brooklyn)
Frances Haros Street (Staten Island)
Freeport 9/11 Memorial (Freeport)
Freshkills Memorial (Staten Island)
Garden City Memorial & Memorial Park Bench (Garden City)
Garden of Healing in Snug Harbor Botanical Garden (Staten Island)
Gardens of Remembrance (Suffolk)
Gardens of Remembrance in Battery Park (New York City)
Garrison Elementary School American Patriot Garden (Garrison)
Gouverneur Gardens (New York City)
Grace Episcopal Church Bell Tower (Nyack)
Greenport Osprey Memorial (Greenport)
Greenstreet Triangle (Bayside)
Grove of Healing at Sunset Park (Brooklyn)
Grove of Healing in Seaside Nature Park (Great Kills)
Harmony Grove Peace Walk and Labyrinth (Bronx)
Healing Garden of the Federated Garden Clubs of New York State (Staten Island)
Healing Trees Project (Yonkers)
Heroes Monument (Carmel)
Highbridge Park Living Memorial (New York City)
Hofstra University 9/11 Memorial (Hempstead)
Holy Rood Catholic Cemetery Memorial (Westbury)
Huguenot Park Library 9/11 Memorial (Staten Island)
Iona College Tribute (New Rochelle)
Islip 9-11-01 Memorial (Islip)
Janice Ashley Memorial Dogwood (Oceanside)
Janice Ashley Memorial Panel (Ithaca)
John Patrick Burnside Way (New York City)
John W. Perry Ave. (Seaford)
Jones Beach 9-11-01 Memorial (Wantagh)
Joseph Ianelli & Don DeFranco Holy Child 9/11 Memorial Playground (Staten Island)
Joseph Roberto Memorial Garden (New City)
Josh Birnbaum Memorial Bench (Long Beach)
Josh Rosenthal Way (New York City)
Joshua David Birnbaum Memorial Site (Elmont)
Justin McCarthy Bench (Long Beach)
Justin McCarthy Flag at Winged Foot Country Club (Westchester)
Justin McCarthy Point Lookout Bench (Point Lookout)
Keefe, Bruyette, and Woods 9/11 Memorial Plaque (New York City)
Keith Fairben Memorial Garden (Floral Park)
Kevin Williams Memorial Field (Shoreham)

Kris Robert Hughes Way (Nesconset)
Ladder 118 Engine 205 (Brooklyn)
Lakeville Park 9/11 Memorial (Great Neck)
Larry Polatsch Way (Woodbury)
Laura A. Marchese Way (Freeport)
Laura Marchese Friendship Tree (Freeport)
Laura Marchese Memorial Tree (Freeport)
Laura Marchese Pear Trees (West Babylon)
Liberty Oaks 9/11 Memorial (Brooklyn)
Living Memorial Grove (New York City)
Living Memorial Trail (Bronx)
Long Beach Memorial Benches (Long Beach)
Long Island 9/11 Memorial (Farmingdale)
Long Island Metropolitan Lacrosse Foundation 9/11/01 Memorial (Farmingdale)
Pine Barrens September 11th Community Forestry Restoration Project (Long Island)
Lorraine Lee Way (Staten Island)
Lt. Joseph Agnello Street (Staten Island)
Lt. Keith G. Fairben Memorial Monument (Floral Park)
Lt. Keith G. Fairben Way (Floral Park)
Lucia Crifasi Street (Glendale)
Luke Nee 9-11-01 (Bronx)
Lynbrook Memorial (Lynbrook)
Lynne Irene Morris Flagpole/Plaque (Middletown)
Mahopac American Patriot Garden (Mahopac)
Malone 9/11 Memorial (Malone)
Malverne 9/11 Memorial (Malverne)
Manhasset Schools Living Memorial (Manhasset)
Marsh & McLennan September 11th Memorial (New York City)
Martin J. Egan, Jr. Corner (Staten Island)
Matthew J. Grzymalski Dr. (New Hyde Park)
Memorial Courtyard (Binghamton)
Memorial Treeway of Champion Trees: Calvary Cemetery (Queens)
Merrick Park 9/11 Memorial (Merrick)
Michael Armstrong Bench (New York City)
Michael J. Pascuma, Jr. Memorial Tree (Massapequa)
Michael Stabile Way (Staten Island)
Monsignor Farrell H.S. Wall of Remembrance (Staten Island)
Nassau Country Club 9/11 Memorial (Glen Cove)
Nassau County 9/11 Memorial (East Meadow)
National September 11 Memorial & Museum (New York City)
North Babylon High School Memorial Plaque (North Babylon)
Oceanside 9/11 Memorial (Oceanside)
Orange County September 11th Memorial (Montgomery)
Orangeburg American Patriot Garden (Orangeburg)

Oyster Bay Memorial (Oyster Bay)
Oyster Bay Memorial Plaque at Oyster Bay High School (Oyster Bay)
PAPD Police Officer Walwyn W. Stuart, Jr. Drive (Valley Stream)
Patricia A. Kuras Way (Staten Island)
Patriots Park (Manhasset)
Pearl River 9/11 Memorial (Pearl River)
Pelham 9/11 Memorial Park (Pelham Manor)
Peter Raimondi Way (Staten Island)
Piermont Pier Memorial Park (Piermont)
Pine Barrens September 11th Community Forestry Restoration Project (Long Island)
Plandome Country Club (Plandome)
Plaque at High School to Honor Victims in Community (Plainview)
Plaque at NYU Stern School of Business (New York City)
Plaque for Lt. Charles Garbarini (Pleasantville)
Poly Prep 9/11 Memorial (Brooklyn)
Port Jefferson (Port Jefferson)
Postcards in St. George Neighborhood (Staten Island)
PS4K Paradise Garden (Brooklyn)
Public Bench in Central Park (New York City)
Queens Firefighter Memorial (Elmhurst)
Ramita Memorial Lane (Commack)
Rene's Garden (Rockville Centre)
Rich Caproni and Mike Hannon Memorial Tree (Oswego)
Richard Allen Pearlman Lane (Forest Hills)
Richard Pearlman Memorial Garden (Howard Beach)
Richard Pearlman Memorial Tree (Flushing)
Robert C. King Jr. Street (Bellerose)
Rockaway Partnership Waterfront Tribute Park (Rockaway Park)
Rockefeller State Memorial Tree (Pleasantville)
Rockland County American Patriot Garden (Haverstraw)
Ronald G. Hoerner Street (Massapequa)
Roosevelt Island 9/11 Memorial (Roosevelt Island)
Rosemary Ann Smith Place (Staten Island)
Roslyn High School September 11th Memorial Garden (Roslyn)
Sacred Heart Statue to Church of Holy Rosary (Staten Island)
Sandra Conaty Brace Way (Staten Island)
Scarsdale American Legion Memorial Garden (Scarsdale)
Scott Schertzer Memorial Bench (New York City)
September 11 Family Group – Russian Family Memorial (Brooklyn)
September 11 Memorial Grove in Prospect Park (Brooklyn)
September the 11th Community Memorial Garden in Forest Park (Queens)
Setauket 9/11 Memorial at Nicholls Road Fire Station (Setauket)
Smithtown 9/11 Memorial (Smithtown)
South Country Soccer Fields (Bellport)

Spring Valley 9/11 Memorial (Spring Valley)
St. Aloysius Roman Catholic Church Memorial (Great Neck)
St. Anthony's High School 9-11-01 (South Huntington)
St. Mary's R.C. Church (Manhasset)
St. Patrick's Church 9/11 Memorial (Mt. Pleasant)
St. Patrick's Cemetery 9/11 Monument (Smithtown)
St. Rose of Lima Memorial Rock (Massapequa)
Stacey Sennas McGowan Memorial Garden (Nyack)
Staten Island 9/11 Memorial (Staten Island)
Statue of St. Patrick (Staten Island)
Stephen E. Tighe Memorial Park (Rockville Centre)
Sterling Forest Project (Tuxedo)
Steve Pollicino Plaque on Tree Dedicated by Daughters and their Soccer Team (Plainview)
Street Sign 159th Street and 32nd Avenue (Flushing)
Suffern 9/11 Memorial (Ramapo)
Sunflower Project NYC (New York City)
Suntowers (New York City)
SUNY Oswego 9/11 Memorial (Oswego)
1993 WTC Bombing Memorial inside the National September 11 Museum (New York City)
The 9-11 Memorial Bridge (Saddle Rock)
The Andrew Stergiopoulos Memorial Ice Rink (Great Neck)
The Daffodil Project (New York City)
The Rising Westchester County 9/11 Memorial (Valhalla)
The Staten Island September 11 Memorial (Staten Island)
Thomas J. Foley Patriot Garden (Clarkstown)
Thomas Kelly Drive (Riverhead)
Thomas Kelly Street (Ozone Park)
Tobay Beach Memorial (Oyster Bay)
Town of Babylon September 11 Hometown Memorial (Babylon)
Town of Clarkstown American Patriot Garden (Clarkstown)
Town of Highlands American Patriot Garden (Highlands)
Tree Living (Dix Hills)
Trees for Life and Unity (Bronx)
Trees for Life and Unity (Brooklyn)
University of Buffalo 9/11 Memorial (Buffalo)
USCG Station (Kings Point)
Village Green Memorial (Rockville Centre)
Village of Cold Spring American Patriot Garden (Cold Spring)
Village of Great Neck Plaza 9/11 Memorial (Great Neck)
Vincent Laieta Jr. Way (Staten Island)
Vincent M. Boland, Jr. Bench (New York City)
Walk of Fame (Commack)
Washingtonville 9/11 Memorial (Washingtonville)
West 104th St. Garden (New York City)

“When Terror Strikes” 9-11 Memorial (Oswego)
William “Bill” Godshalk Memorial Bench (New York City)
Williston Park 9/11 Memorial (Williston Park)
Wings of a Monument: Memories Soar (Staten Island)
Yonkers American Patriot Garden (Yonkers)

North Carolina

9/11 Firefighters Memorial (Clyde)
September 11th Oak (Raleigh)
University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill Memorial Garden (Chapel Hill)

North Dakota

Brian C. Hickey Monument (Bismarck)
The Ann Nicole Nelson Hall (Minot)
The International Peace Garden 9/11 Memorial (Dunseith)

Ohio

Air Force Museum (Riverside)
Community Soup Kitchen Mural (Columbus)
Flight 93 Memorial at Cleveland Air Route Traffic Control Center (Oberlin)
Garden at O’Bannon Creek Golf Club (Loveland)
Garden at Sharon Woods Golf Course (Cincinnati)
Kelly A. Booms Memorial Bench (Oxford)
Mahoning Valley 9/11 Memorial (Austintown)
Spring Grove Cemetery Memorial Tree (Cincinnati)
Terry Lynch Youngstown State University 9/11 Memorial (Youngstown)
Todd Weaver Memorial Tree & Plaque (N. Canton)

Oklahoma

University of Oklahoma 9/11 Memorial Grove (Norman)

Oregon

Remember Me Rose Garden (Portland)
Trees of Hope (Portland)

Pennsylvania

9/11 Memorial At Tinicum Firehouse; dedicated Michael H. Edwards (Essington)
Danny Crisman South Montrose 9/11 Memorial (South Montrose)
Douglas B. Gardner ‘83 Integrated Athletic Center (Haverford)
Flight 93 National Memorial (Shanksville)
Garden of Reflection (Yardley)
Legacy Groves in Schools and Fire Departments (Somerset County)
Lehigh University 9/11 Memorial Walkway (Bethlehem)
Ludwig Picarro Flag Pole (New Castle)
Memorial Peace Garden (Saxonburg)
Norristown 9/11 Memorial (Norristown)

Peace Barn (Shanksville)
Penn State Mont Alto September 11th Memorial Planting (Mont Alto)
Philadelphia 30th Street Station Memorial (Philadelphia)
Remember Me Rose Garden (Shanksville)
Robert F. Mace Memorial Bench (Pottstown)
September 11th Memorial Gardens (Tannersville)
Wayne County 9/11 Memorial Monument (Honesdale)
William R. Steiner WTC Monument (Solebury)

Puerto Rico

We Remember September 11, 2001 (San Juan)

Rhode Island

Paul Sloan Plaque at Brown University Football Field (Providence)
Pentagon Shrine of St. Joseph (Newport)
Wall of Hope (Providence)

South Carolina

9-11 Memorial (Myrtle Beach)
9-11 Memorial (Williamston)

South Dakota

South Dakota WTC Steel Memorial (Pierre)

Tennessee

Knoxville 9/11 Memorial (Knoxville)
Peninsula Village Freedom Garden (Louisville)

Texas

9/11 Flight Crew Memorial (Grapevine)
9/11 Memorial Tree Grove at Chapin High School (El Paso)
Allen Liberty Garden (Allen)
Beaumont 9/11 Memorial Garden (Beaumont)
Candace Lee Williams Playground (Austin)
In God We Trust, United We Stand, September 11, 2001 Memorial Garden (Beaumont)
Texas Cemetery 9/11 Memorial (Austin)
Tyler's Court (Houston)
Tyler's Court (San Antonio)

Utah

9/11 Memorial Plaque (Holladay)
9/11 Memorial Monument (Sandy)
Freedom Monument (Provo)
Kearns Memorial Park (Kearns)
Murray Park 9/11 Memorial (Murray)
The Botanical Center 9/11 Memorial (Kaysville)

Virginia

Anita's Memorial to Margaret Quinn Orloske (Tazewell)
Memorial Grove (Fairfax)
National Memorial Park (Falls Church)
Westwood Country Club (Vienna)
Wilton Woods Memorial Garden (Alexandria)

Washington

9/11 Centralia Memorial (Centralia)
Million Flower Garden (Seattle)
West Virginia
September 11th Tree Memorial (Morgantown)

Wisconsin

Ann Nelson Memorial Bench at Wayland Academy (Beaver Dam)
Green Bay's 9/11 Memorial (Green Bay)
Neenah Paper 9/11 Memorial (Appleton)
University of Wisconsin-Parkside 9/11 Living Memorial (Kenosha)
Wisconsin WTC Steel Memorial (Madison)

Wyoming

Wyoming WTC Steel Memorial (Cheyenne)

9/11 Memorials around the World

WTC 9 11 01 Memorial, Bagram Air Base Kabul, Afghanistan (May 31, 2010)
Andrew's Peace, Mawson Lakes, Australia
Sydney Tree 9/11 Memorial, Sydney, Australia
9/11 Memorial, Bridgetown, Barbados (September 11, 2003)
9/11 Memorial, Hamilton, Bermuda (2007)
9/11 Memorial, Sao Paulo, Brazil (2007)
9/11 Memorial, Appleton, Canada (September 11, 2013)
9/11 Memorial Calgary International Airport, Calgary, Canada (September 11, 2003)
9/11 Memorial Plaque, Ottawa, Canada (September 11, 2005)
In Memory of the Canadians Lost, Beechwood Cemetery, Ottawa, Canada (January 14, 2002)
Lost Dogs Monument, Meaford, Canada (May 11, 2002)
St. Catharines 9/11 Walkway, St. Catharines, Canada (June 6, 2003)
Thanks and Rememberance Memorial Plaque, Toronto, Canada (September 11, 2011)
World Trade Centre 9/11 Memorial, Nanaimo, Canada (2014)
World Trade Center Memorial Beam, Military Museum, Calgary, Canada (September 11, 2011)
9/11 Memorial, Dobrá Voda, Czech Republic (September 2011)
9/11 New York Firemen Memorial, Prague, Czech Republic (September 11, 2010)
9/11 Memorial, Copenhagen, Denmark

In Loving Memory Flag, Rostrenen, France
Le Jardin du Luxembourg 9/11 Memorial, Paris, France (January 30, 2002)
In Other Words Memorial Garden, Saint Lo, France
9/11 Pentagon Memorial at Patch Barracks, Stuttgart/Vaihingen, Germany (2004)
9/11 WTC Memorial, Oberviechtach, Germany (October 8, 2011)
9/11 Meditation Garden, Glendalough (Co. Wicklow), Ireland
Donadea 9/11 Memorial, Donadea (Co. Kildare), Ireland (September 21, 2003)
Fr. Mychal Judge Peace Garden Memorial, Keshkerrigan, Ireland (September 11, 2005)
National Monument to the Fighting 69th, Ballymote, Ireland (August 22, 2006)
Ringfinnan Garden of Remembrance, Kinsale, Ireland (March 10, 2002)
9/11 Memorial, Eilat, Israel (September 4, 2003)
9/11 Memorial, Jerusalem, Israel (September 12, 2009)
9/11 Sculpture, Ness Ziona, Israel (November 30, 2001)
9/11 Square, Ashkelon, Israel (October 7, 2003)
9/11 Square, Or Yehuda, Israel (September 3, 2003)
9/11 Steles, Rishon LeZion, Israel (September 11, 2007)
D Quarter Park, Ashdod, Israel (September 19, 2005)
Hagy Shefi Gate, Bar-Ilan University Tel Aviv, Israel (September 1, 2010)
Keren Square, Herzliya, Israel (May 17, 2005)
Nave Yaakov Square, Beer Sheva, Israel (September 13, 2005)
Neve Monoson 9/11 Memorial Stone, Yehud, Israel (April 2005)
9/11 Memorial, Stresa, Italy (2007)
9/11 Memorial, Rome, Italy (September 11, 2009)
Memoria e Luce World Trade Center Memorial, Padova, Italy (September 11, 2005)
Stele dedicated to Lucia Crifasi and all Victims of 9/11, Montevago, Sicily, Italy (2004)
9/11 Memorial Plaque, Cambridge, New Zealand
Firefighters Reserve, Christchurch, New Zealand (October 26, 2002)
9/11 Memorial, Gdynia, Poland (September 11, 2002)
9/11 Memorial Plaque, Warsaw, Poland
Homo Homini Memorial to the Victims of 9/11, Kielce, Poland
Chapel of Christ the King, Memorial Bells dedicated to Lukasz Milewski, Suwałki, Poland
9/11 Memorial, Lisbon, Portugal (2001)
9/11 Memorial; dedicated to Andrew Jay-Hoon Kim, Incheon Metro City, South Korea
9/11 Memorial Grove, Parque Juan Carlos I, Madrid, Spain (September 11, 2011)
Moncalvillo 9/11 Memorial to Edelmiro Abad Elvira and all Victims, Moncalvillo, Spain
(August 11, 2002)
9/11 Garden of Hope and Memorial Plaque, Portsmouth, United Kingdom
After 9/11, Olympic Park London, United Kingdom
Grosvenor Square Memorial Garden, London, United Kingdom (September 11, 2003)
Memorial Stone, Barnsley, United Kingdom
Twin Towers Memorial, National Memorial Arboretum, Alrewas, United Kingdom
(September 11, 2002)