

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

A Broken Flute: The Native Experience in Books for Children. Edited by Doris Seale and Beverly Slapin.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7nc6x8nb>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Darby, Jaye T.

**Publication Date**

2006-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

I recommend this book to anyone interested in mission history, education, literacy, and Native American history. George Tinker in *Missionary Conquest* (1993) argues that we must look beyond the proselytizing impulse of missionaries if we are to understand more fully the impact of the colonial encounter on Native Americans. Furtwangler's book expands our understanding of the missionary agenda in Oregon by delving into the minds of the missionaries through their experiences of reading and writing in order to see how their ideas of self and place in Oregon changed as events unfolded. He also helps us to understand how our contemporary images of Native peoples have been informed by missionary efforts to bring Indians to the literate, Western world through writings that were necessarily colored by their own experiences with reading and writing.

Micheline E. Pesantubbee  
University of Iowa

**A Broken Flute: The Native Experience in Books for Children.** Edited by Doris Seale and Beverly Slapin. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2005. 463 pages. \$49.95 paper.

As a teacher educator I often hear the following comment from teachers: "I would like my students to learn about American Indians in a respectful manner, but I have no idea where to start." Many teachers know that asking students to cut out feathers for Thanksgiving is highly inappropriate; yet they remain confused about the alternatives. Becoming acquainted with Oyate, which serves a major role in guiding teachers on a respectful path, and *A Broken Flute: The Native Experience in Books for Children* is an excellent way to start. The editors describe Oyate as

a community-based Native organization working to see that our lives, traditional arts and literatures, and histories are portrayed honestly. Our work in the world is expressed by the suggestion of the great Lakota spiritual leader, Tatanka Iotanka (Sitting Bull) who said, "Let us put our minds together and see what life we will make for our children." We are influenced by the teachings of our elders that all children are sacred beings and that in all things we must work for the benefit of the next seven generations. (iv)

Oyate seeks to achieve this vision through advocacy, workshops, development of reference books, and a detailed Web site with a catalog of recommended Native books for grades K–12.

*A Broken Flute* follows an earlier volume, *Through Indian Eyes: The Native Experience in Books for Children*, edited by Beverly Slapin and Doris Seale, and serves as a companion piece. Both books bring Oyate's vision into the classroom and belong in the hands of every teacher, librarian, aide, family member, or friend seriously interested in teaching children about Native

Americans. In her introduction to *A Broken Flute*, Seale explains that the book's purpose is "to bring attention to some of the gifted writers and illustrators of the past ten years or so, frequently published by Native and small presses and also to evaluate as much as possible the most objectionable work of the non-Native writers" (4).

*A Broken Flute* makes a significant contribution to multicultural children's literature and Native American Studies, filling a vital need in K–12 education. Encyclopedic in its scope, the book contains fifty entries, including personal accounts, stories, poetry, and reviews from more than sixty contributors. The subtitle *The Native Experience in Books for Children* captures the book's span of children's and young adult books by Native and non-Native writers. The entire book seriously challenges educators to rethink and hopefully redesign entrenched mainstream teaching units, including those on Christopher Columbus, Thanksgiving, missions, the westward movement, pioneers and settlers, and sovereignty. The contributors ask readers to take a hard and often painful look at American history and contemporary life in America's interactions with the more than five hundred nations in the United States. At the same time, *A Broken Flute* also points educators to books that celebrate the power, courage, fortitude, and beauty of Native American communities in all their multifaceted diversity—past, present, and future.

Opening selections set the context for using Native books in the classroom, establishing that words are power and what children read matters. Particularly moving are "Open Letter to a Non-Indian Teacher" from an Indian Mother, "Living Stories" from parents, "Moccasins to School Again" by Heather Harris, "My Precious Little Nephew" by Cindy La Marr, and "Stories I Tell My Daughter" by Deborah A. Miranda, which focus on the cultural strengths and needs of Native students and the emotional pain that too often is experienced in mainstream schools. "Frybread- and Feather-Free" by Cynthia Leitich Smith introduces readers to her contemporary Native novels and dispels the vanishing Indian stereotype. "Welcome Home, Our Relative" by Radley Davis lovingly describes the ceremony when "we laid our relative, Ishi, to rest" (28). Review essays are then arranged thematically and by author, interspersed with related poetry, stories, and personal reflections. Notable thematic reviews include those on books about the California missions, the Navajo Long Walk, Indian residential schools, and buffalo. Other helpful essays include "Goodbye Columbus: Take Two" by Jean Paine Mendoza and "Deconstructing the Myths of the 'The First Thanksgiving'" by Judy Dow and Beverly Slapin. Righteous anger fills many of these selections as reviewers expose the stereotypes, racism, distortions, and condescending attitudes that too often permeate mainstream books about Indians.

In addition, some chapters provide in-depth critiques of books the editors find particularly egregious. Dennis McAuliffe Jr.'s insightful essay, "Little House on the Osage Prairie," takes on the perennially popular *Little House on the Prairie* by Laura Ingalls Wilder from an Osage perspective and asks the question, "Why are children still reading a book so unsuitable for children?" (50). Far from the tale of plucky homesteaders claiming their piece of the American dream on land that is theirs for the taking, McAuliffe observes,

Little Laura Ingalls, her sisters and their beloved Ma and Pa were illegal squatters on Osage land. She left that detail out of her 1935 children's book, *Little House on the Prairie*, as well as any mention of ongoing outrages—including killings, burnings, beatings, horse thefts and grave robberies—committed by white settlers, such as Charles Ingalls, against Osages living in villages not more than a mile or two away from the Ingalls' little house. (49)

This essay is a must-read for anyone who teaches about the West. The lengthy review of Ann Rinaldi's *My Heart Is on the Ground: The Diary of Nannie Little Rose, A Sioux Girl, Carlisle Indian School, Pennsylvania 1880* also proves very illuminating in terms of historical and cultural inaccuracies, beginning with the title word of *Sioux* instead of *Lakota* and a narrative that romanticizes the horrors of Carlisle Indian School and the residential school experience.

Complementing these selections are more than two hundred pages, "Reviews: Authors 'A' to 'Z,'" that contain short annotated reviews of Native and mainstream books about Native Americans published during the last fifteen years. These are helpful guides to choosing culturally and historically authentic books to reflect the rich diversity of communities throughout Native North America and reevaluating classroom materials that are historically inaccurate, culturally inappropriate, and hurtful to Native students. Although many of the Native books are from small presses, most are available through the Oyate online catalog found at <http://www.oyate.org/catalog/index.html>.

At times, though, the encyclopedic scope of the book is also a weakness, especially for readers unfamiliar with the field of Native children's and young adult literature. Given all the entries and the overall organization of the book, it may be difficult for someone new to the field to get a clear sense of what's important in teaching children and young adults about Native Americans. Short of knowing about specific issues, books, and/or authors in advance, *A Broken Flute* offers no easy way to access material except to go through the entire book page by page, certainly a very worthwhile endeavor and one I highly recommend, but not always practicable for time-starved educators. What I also miss in *A Broken Flute* are guidelines for teachers to evaluate materials, especially clear criteria such as "How to Tell the Difference," which is provided in *Through Indian Eyes*. All of this information is embedded in the opening essays and throughout the reviews, but it is not readily accessible. Given the significance of the material in *A Broken Flute* for improving K–12 education, I would like to see an accompanying supplemental guide with a clear overview that directs readers, depending on their level of expertise, to specific highlights of the book, provides contributors' lists of their top-five must-reads for different age groups, and suggests recommended readings for specific tribes. In addition, a resource section including descriptions of Oyate's work would also be helpful.

*A Broken Flute: The Native Experience in Books for Children* joins its companion *Through Indian Eyes* as an invaluable reference that belongs in every school and library. Both books are indispensable for those hoping to

provide respectful classrooms and welcoming reading circles. Through their vision and dedication, Seale, Slapin, and their contributors have provided a path for educators to follow.

*Jaye T. Darby*

San Diego State University

**Children of Coyote, Missionaries of Saint Francis: Indian-Spanish Relations in Colonial California, 1769–1850.** By Steven W. Hackel. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2005. 476 pages. \$59.95 cloth; \$27.50 paper.

Beginning in 1769, the Spanish began to expand their empire into what was then Alta California. These expeditions, made up of men of the cloth as well as the military, went by both land and sea. Their first permanent colonial presidio and mission, San Diego, was erected in that same year. The missionization would continue until the final mission, San Francisco Solano de Sonoma, was established in 1823, two years after Mexico had gained its independence from Spain. The Spanish instituted a reign of terror from the moment they set foot on Alta California soil, capturing and enslaving Native Californians who in turn became the ready labor force that built the missions. Ostensibly, the Spanish arrived to Christianize the Indians, which they did through various means of forced coercion, such as corporal and capital punishment. However, not all of the California Indians were subjugated. In the end, disease took more lives than Spanish guns and steel.

In 1824 Mexico, the possessors of the land began the process of selling tracts not owned by the government or Mexican citizens, much of which had been occupied by Indians since the beginning of time. The year 1834 witnessed the secularization of the missions, thus changing the lives of the Mission Indians once again. At the conclusion of the Mexican-American War in 1848, Alta California became a possession of the victorious United States. That same year gold was discovered at Sutter's Mill, and the subsequent Gold Rush brought in more than one hundred thousand settlers within a calendar year. Each one of these turning points further eroded the tenuous hold California Indians had over their ancestral land and their own lives. What had been a precontact population estimated at as high as one million was reduced to an estimated twenty-five thousand by 1850.

The history of the Spanish colonization of Alta California up to the early US era has been long studied by scholars through a variety of academic lenses. The truth behind the colonial relationship, the nature of the negotiations that existed, has not always been presented in the clearest of light. Indeed fourth-graders in California are still taught the mythologized tradition and not the brutal reality. And although more sophisticated and honest scholarship has emerged over the past few generations, the stain of a whitewashed version of elementary and middle school California Mission history persists. Perhaps in the not too distant future the children will be told the facts.