UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
”Come, Blackrobe”:De Smet and the Indian Tragedy. By John J. Killoren.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7n68c7bz

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 19(1)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Keller, Robert H.

Publication Date
1995

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

Glancy is a major voice in Native America today. *Claiming Breath* is a refreshingly honest depiction of contemporary life and an important step in American Indian literature. Non-Indian readers can learn much from Glancy's text, which presents an Indian worldview complete in its holistic complexity and integrity.

Julie LaMay Abner
California State University, San Bernardino

"Come, Blackrobe": De Smet and the Indian Tragedy. By John J. Killoren. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1994. 448 pages. $29.95 cloth.

In his book *Young Men and Fire,* Norman MacLean successfully wove a half-dozen diverse themes around one subject to produce a masterpiece that readers cannot forget. In *"Come, Blackrobe": De Smet and the Indian Disaster,* John J. Killoren attempts to combine three topics into a single coherent story, but, unlike MacLean, Killoren does not succeed. Killoren's goal, although admirable and sound, proves too arduous.

The three large themes of *"Come, Blackrobe"* are the life of the Jesuit missionary Pierre-Jean De Smet (1801–73), nineteenth-century United States Indian policy, and American Indian experience during that period. Killoren correctly sees his three subjects as inseparable, and he further recognizes that, in the history of Indian affairs, one must distinguish between official government statements, the implementation of policy, and the actual results. He accurately identifies most but not all of the factors that led to the failure of federal planning and of De Smet's life work as well. Killoren's central thesis contends that the native "buffalo culture" of the Great Plains was doomed by the time Lewis and Clark returned and that De Smet early foresaw the, inevitable tragedy that he would later witness in detail.

Killoren demonstrates why missions established for besieged, disintegrating cultures on the Plains and in the Pacific Northwest failed as Roman Catholic clergy and laymen encountered many of the same frustrations that Protestant missions and government agents experienced. To explain the failures, Killoren cites lack of time, inadequate resources, lack of goodwill, inability to control the white population, outright deception and duplicity, the en-

couragement of native economic dependence, Indian indecision in the face of threat, and intertribal warfare. The author points out humanitarian conflicts of interest that shaded into hypocrisy, and the contradiction between Thomas Jefferson's paternalism toward tribes and his vision of national expansion. The story makes clear that sympathy for the weak has little effect on the behavior of the powerful.

Thus one must commend *"Come, Blackrobe"* for its analysis of policy as well as for its extensive primary and secondary bibliography. Regrettably, the book falters, then ultimately collapses on historiographic and biographic grounds. Technical flaws mar the text, the writing is weak and at times hackneyed, the author neglects important research, and the publisher has not provided adequate maps. Most damaging of all—and like the federal government with its Indian policy—Killoren exercises scant control over his subjects and sources.

Technical problems include the practices of introducing historic figures and contemporary scholars by their last names only; quoting from quotations; frequently failing to document quotations and sources; omitting dates of documents cited; failing to define key concepts such as the Paraquay plan and Jesuit "reductions." Killoren's research is inadequate because he depends on Gregory Franzwa's tour guide *The Oregon Trail Revisited,* while ignoring John Unrah's *The Plains Across* and the work of James Ronda and Richard White. In addition, he repeats Loring Priest's erroneous conclusions in *Uncle Sam's Stepchildren* (1942) instead of using more recent scholarship; this practice leads to factual errors and superficial analysis of U.S. Grant's peace policy of the 1870s.

That the writer is over his head and awash in materials is evident in his writing style. Killoren absorbs biased language from his sources, especially the word *hostile* to describe resisting tribes. He refers to "beloved Indians" whom De Smet considered "these poor children." Long digressions do not connect within chapters. Quotations are excessive, at times constituting 50 percent of the text; a good example is A.B. Chambers's newspaper reports telling the story of the 1851 Fort Laramie Treaty (pp. 140–70; also see pp. 280–95 and 309–35). Many of the quotations contain trivial information: De Smet reports that, in 1868, "the Missouri was . . . very low, and our progress slow in consequence . . . . After thirty-three days of constant struggle with the current, sandbars, and snags, I thanked and bade farewell to the worthy

captain and all my old and new acquaintances and was put ashore at Fort Rice" (p. 318). Nor do the four maps help the reader navigate the geography, especially given Killoren's typical vagueness; he describes St. Mary's mission as being "southward up the Bitterroot Valley" and Fort Colville as "near the headwaters of the Columbia" (pp. 72, 87). A table of dates and a map of De Smet's travels, which included twenty-three crossings of the Atlantic and fourteen major excursions into the Far West, would have assisted the reader.

Lack of control stands out as a major weakness in this book, which opens with a fifty-page, meandering, discursive, unfocused discussion of early American Indian policy and concludes in much the same fashion. Chapter 2 is a collection of disconnected facts about the fur trade and Jesuit missions, none related to De Smet or any narrative. Organization, chronology, and development of ideas remain tenuous throughout. Editorial help seems to have been nonexistent.

Sadly, the book also fails as biography. One would hope to meet Pierre-Jean De Smet as a full and complex human being. Instead, we find a nice man, an effective fundraiser, a bland spectator to history, and a superficial thinker who watched the destruction of Plains Indian cultures but apparently never reflected on his experience theologically, on his own role in the process, or on the nature of evil.

Killoren briefly critiques De Smet and the Jesuits (pp. 88–92) but never asks hard questions: Was De Smet deceptive and hypocritical or just weak and naive in his understanding of government policy and his misinterpretation of it to Indians? Why were De Smet's advocacy of native rights and his condemnation of injustice so tame when compared to those of contemporaries Nathaniel Taylor or Henry Whipple? How much did De Smet's friendships with and dependence on traders, Indian agents, politicians, and generals—men such as Thomas Fitzpatrick, Thomas Hart Benton, Jim Bridger, Charles Galpin, Charles Chouteau, William Harney, Joseph LaBarge, and Robert Campbell—compromise the priest's loyalty to Indians? Was his opposition to native resistance after 1857 tied to his relations with Harney, John Pope, and William Tecumseh Sherman? How could a missionary be close friends with Sherman, who ordered Philip Sheridan to hunt down Indians and "prosecute the war with vindictive earnestness till they are obliterated or beg for mercy" (p. 333, no source cited)? Killoren knows that De Smet's views changed

radically several times between 1823 and 1873, but he fails to penetrate the surface of the Jesuit's mind, experience, or personality (pp. 305–306). Perhaps one should not expect more of a biography that completely ignores the childhood, culture, family, and vocation of its subject. And if De Smet remains hollow, we certainly should not expect to meet Red Cloud, Spotted Tail, Eagle Woman, and Red Feather as real human beings.

"Come, Blackrobe" tells us once again that disaster happened to Indians in North America between 1840 and 1870 and gives us a fair idea of why it happened. Pierre-Jean De Smet stood square in the middle of those events. Yet, despite John Killoren's extensive research and labor of love, we learn little more about De Smet himself than we had known from the earlier work of Hiram M. Chittenden, Eugene Laveille, and John Terrell.

Robert H. Keller
Fairhaven College

The Fox Wars: The Mesquakie Challenge to New France. By R. David Edmunds and Joseph L. Peyser. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993. 282 pages. $24.95 cloth.

Compared to their European rivals in North America, the French created many more military alliances and profitable fur trading partnerships with native nations. The so-called French and Indian Wars against the British between 1689 and 1763 attested to France's ability to work effectively with aboriginal partners. Less well known were the detrimental effects of these relationships. France's Indian allies frequently suffered from depopulation due to disease and warfare, alcohol addiction, economic dependence on European trade goods, and dislocation from their homelands. Even more obscure was the fate of aboriginal nations that refused to do France's bidding and against whom this mighty European nation unleashed destructive forces. *The Fox Wars: The Mesquakie Challenge to New France* is thus an important addition to our knowledge of New France's fur trade and the historical influence of one Indian nation determined to preserve its identity and independence.

The Fox Wars is a superb example of the "new Indian history." The Fox (or Mesquakie) people are not merely flotsam amidst the swirling events of Great Lakes history; Edmunds, a professor of history at Indiana University, and Peyser, a professor of French at