

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Native Acts: Law, Recognition, and Cultural Authenticity. By Joanne Barker.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7mf7156t>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Denetdale, Jennifer

Publication Date

2013-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

between Māori as they affect museums. How do museums deal with the claims of those on whose land the museum is located, and the different claims of the owners of the taonga in that museum's collections who are from other lands? *Te Papa* gives its marae over to different iwi on a rotating basis. How does this fit with the claims of locals for recognition of their land? These are questions McCathy ignores. Biculturalism has disguised the rich contextual landscape of Māori customary relationships, something a post-bicultural approach must address. At the same time the treatment of other cultures remains problematic. New Zealand museums have extensive Pacific collections and McCathy's inclusion of Sean Mellon's "Afterword" does little more than acknowledge the problem. However, no other book comes close to as finely and extensively covering such an important transformation in New Zealand's recent graspings at postcolonialism.

Michael Belgrave
Massey University

Native Acts: Law, Recognition, and Cultural Authenticity. By Joanne Barker. Durham: Duke University Press, 2011. 296 pages. \$84.95 cloth; \$23.95 paper.

Joanne Barker's *Native Acts* moves among seemingly disparate topics such as the California Indian mission disenrollments, the federal government's termination of the Delaware of Oklahoma, the legal complaints of gender discrimination in *Martinez v. Santa Clara*, and the same-sex marriage bans by the Navajo and Cherokee nations to explore the limits of recognition with which tribal nations grapple as a result of being rendered "domestic dependents" of the United States. Barker's analysis troubles tribal nation-building and its intersections with identity and cultural authenticity through which Native legal status and rights are articulated. She argues that culturally based philosophies and teachings have the possibilities of radically reformulating Native social and interpersonal relations in that healthy tribal nations and communities must be based upon ethics and responsibilities towards all citizens.

Native Acts invokes the familiar categories of recognition, membership, and tradition that shape Native studies to explore how United States narrations of national progress—civilization, democracy, freedom, liberty, and equality—actually uphold relations of domination between the United States and tribal nations. As Barker shows, our tribal nations, leaders, and citizens have been forced to make impossible decisions about the future of their lands and people, and although we must appreciate the predicaments of leadership, we must also recognize that their decisions are bounded by the legal discourse

of liberalism in the United States, which undercuts tribal sovereignty. Using four case studies, Barker shows how Western-imposed meanings of recognition, membership, tradition, and cultural authenticity reverberate in Native communities as acts of discrimination, hate, and social injustice, so that some tribal citizens do not belong as fully as others.

In the first study, the Delaware Tribe of Oklahoma sought to regain federal recognition after termination in 1979 and was subsequently incorporated into the Cherokee Nation. Over the objections of the Cherokee Nation, who insisted that the Delaware were its citizens, and after numerous court challenges, the Delaware first were reinstated in 1996 and then again removed in 2005. As Barker argues, it is impossible to disengage politics from the web of social relations through which power is articulated. Further, a careful analysis of the historical and political context of the politics of recognition illuminates the powers of various entities of the United States, including federal agents, the US Congress and courts, the federal government, and tribal nations to interpret treaties, laws, and their amendments through the lens of US narrations that maintain the unequal status between the United States and tribal nations.

In the next two studies, Barker traces the shifting meanings of “tradition” and “culture” through the legal case of *Martinez v. Santa Clara* and the disenrollments of citizens in California tribes. In the *Martinez* case, a Santa Clara woman filed a civil rights violation suit against her Santa Clara tribal government when her children, whose father was Navajo, were not allowed to enroll as members and hence, would not have access to all the rights and privileges accorded to other Santa Clara tribal citizens. The suit went all the way to the US Supreme Court, who remanded it back to Santa Clara because the justices felt that to make a ruling would be an infringement on tribal sovereignty. Barker’s close reading reveals the power of US narrations of cultural authenticity and tradition to shape tribal customs and practices in ways that privilege patriarchy, thereby denying the ways in which Native cultures and traditions have been undermined by colonial, racist, and assimilationist ideologies. Rather than assert a static “tradition” or “culture,” Barker argues that Native peoples pay attention to what is at stake when we mark territories that define Indian members through United States articulations. The decisions Native peoples make about who belongs, and how they belong, matter both politically and ethically.

In the final study, Barker examines the Cherokee and Navajo nations’ enactment of legislation banning same-sex marriage in the aftermath of the US Defense of Marriage Act of 1996 (DOMA). Although in both cases tribal leaders defended their decisions to pass such bans based upon their rights as sovereign nations who are merely upholding cultural traditions, an examination of the political and social contexts illuminate how such decisions draw upon larger United States concerns around terrorism and national security.

Tribal determinations about social and sexual relations have been profoundly shaped by US narrations about nation, family, and gender, thereby naturalizing patriarchy as the norm. Barker argues that Native cultures and identities are always in negotiation, transformation, change, and exchange, and that there never has been a moment of “authenticity.”

It is still the case that most textbooks on tribal nation-building will make a cursory nod toward the relationships between nation, gender, and belonging, thereby legitimizing and sustaining patriarchy and relationships of domination and inequalities. *Native Acts* is an important development in studies of tribal nation-building and sovereignty because it makes so many decolonizing movements. This study illuminates the historical, social, and legal processes through which US national narrations reify cultural authenticity for Native peoples as always in the precolonial past: prehistorical and therefore always natural, inevitable, compromised, and tragic. Rather, we must think about decolonization as an engagement with the ongoing consequences of colonialism and imperialism. Engaging with the consequences of colonialism, imperialism, and neo-liberalism on tribal nation-building necessarily requires critiques of how Western and United States ideologies assume that all histories and cultures dovetail neatly into the dominant narrative; how tribal nation-building is shaped by dominant discursive practices, legal and otherwise; and how the language of tradition is used to mediate Native assertions of tribal legal status and rights to sovereignty and self-determination. Further, although it seems that the realization of sovereignty on each tribal nation’s terms remains elusive, Barker does suggest that tribal nations’ move to an international forum, particularly the adoption of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, holds the possibilities of rearticulations to produce social formations that are more in keeping with distinctive tribal philosophies and teaching. *Native Acts* is a necessary step to creating healthy indigenous nations that respect the rights of all their citizens.

Jennifer Denetdale
University of New Mexico

Narratives of Citizenship: Indigenous and Diasporic Peoples Unsettle the Nation-State. Edited by Aloys N. M. Fleischmann, Nancy Van Styvendale, and Cody McCarroll. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2011. 408 pages. \$39.95 paper.

Inspired by Samaro Kamboureli’s and Roy Miki’s collection *Trans.Can.Lit: Resituating the Study of Canadian Literature* (2007) and the special issue of