On the Bloody Road to Jesus: Christianity and the Chiricahua Apaches. By H. Henrietta Stockel. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2004. 314 pages. $29.95 cloth.

The relationship between Christianity and indigenous peoples throughout the Americas has always been problematic, especially given the extent to which Christianity not only served the needs of European colonialism but was an effective instrument of cultural imperialism. Stockel's use of the words *bloody road* in the title to her work is an apt descriptor for what she believes to be an enduring struggle of the Chiricahua Apaches with Christianity, a history that extends from the Spanish conquest of Mexico to the present. How much of traditional Chiricahua religious and cultural traditions remains after centuries of varying attempts to transform and restructure every aspect of Chiricahua life is still a matter of conjecture, but what is not a matter of speculation is the lasting impact that Christianity has had on the Chiricahua people. At the same time, there are important historical differences, not only in Catholic and Protestant missionary tactics and goals but in the successive empire-building strategies employed by the Spanish, Mexican, and American invaders.

Stockel begins her study with an overview of the sacred traditions, ceremonies, and life-giving stories that gave meaning to the Chiricahua people and tied them to their land, the southwestern part of the United States and northern Mexico. For a people whose lives were anything but sedentary, the Chiricahuas' encounter with the Spanish merging of Christianity and empire, as embodied in Jesuit and, later, Franciscan missionaries, was first and foremost a conflict over basic cultural, social, and religious values. It was also clear from the outset that it was essential, on the part of the agents of empire, to reorganize Chiricahua life, through the creation of a mission system that could more easily integrate the Apache into the developing needs of a colonial system.

The Jesuit colonial venture, among the Chiricahuas, lasted about one hundred years, from the latter part of the seventeenth century to the eighteenth. It was a period marked by the ebb and flow of a small mission population, disease, and resistance. The failure of the Jesuits to "civilize" and "Christianize" large numbers of Chiricahuas was due to their inability to either entice or capture them, based on the belief that this was the only way to thoroughly indoctrinate an obstinate people. Instead the Chiricahuas continued their nomadic existence, with an intact kinship system that used the raiding of Spanish colonialists to supply necessary food and livestock. Before the implementation of plans that would shift Spanish policy from cultural to physical genocide, focusing particularly on the removal of Chiricahua children, the Jesuits were expelled from northern Mexico in 1767, only to be replaced by Franciscans.

The Franciscans who replaced the Jesuits in 1768 continued to encounter Chiricahua raiding and resistance, to which the Spanish governing authorities, in 1786, enacted a "peace policy" that offered the Apaches either their destruction by the military force or "peace," if they settled around presidios or missions. Two "peace establishments" were created: one in Bacoachi, Sonora, and the other in Janos, Chihuahua. Both communities, Stockel

contends, were examples of the degree to which some Chiricahua accepted Spanish religious and material culture quite willingly, even though there was still conflict with traditional values and customs, such as marriage. It never was a simple case of total acceptance or rejection, but forms of accommodation and resistance that allowed the Chiricahuas to adapt Spanish cultural mores in ways that preserved their own ancient traditions, resulting in "a complicated mix of erratic religious and secular syncretism" (99).

Janos, in particular, was an example of the reprehensible nature of Spanish colonial policy. Chiricahuas, including children, were deported as slave prisoners to Havana, Cuba, by way of Mexico City and the port of Veracruz, to serve as "servants." The other policy, which set Chiricahuas against one another, was the offering of a bounty for dead Chiricahuas that resulted in an unprecedented cultural change, which broke apart what bound tribes and families together. These policies were unopposed by Franciscan missionaries.

With the independence of Mexico from Spain, Spanish Franciscan missionaries were expelled, and eventually the Spanish colonial system broke down because of a lack of support from the new Mexican government. Stockel concludes that "despite a few individuals subscribing to Catholicism, it appears that people's identity as Chiricahua Apaches who practiced the religion of their ancestors remained strong at the end of the Jesuit and Franciscan missionary period in northern Mexico" (99). It is only with the coming of American domination of the Southwest that the Chiricahua were to experience what Stockel labels the "Apache Diaspora."

American government policy toward the Chiricahua differed from its Spanish counterpart in the creation of reservations rather than missions, with the desired end being the removal of the Chiricahua from their homelands. Resistant to permanent settlement on the reservation at San Carlos, in 1876 the Chiricahua, under the leadership of Geronimo, fought a protracted war that ended with Geronimo's final surrender ten years later. For the next twenty-seven years all Chiricahuas, even those who had supported the US government, were held as prisoners of war. The Chiricahua were initially incarcerated at Fort Marion, St. Augustine, Florida, and Fort Pickens, Santa Rosa Island, in Pensacola Bay; those incarcerated at Fort Pickens were later moved to Mount Vernon, Alabama. Death from disease and the physical dislocation of removal took their toll. Stockel argues that some Chiricahuas found comfort in Catholicism as a means of both keeping faith with their ancestors and the preservation of their cultural identity. But unlike their experience under Spanish and Mexican control, where mission life allowed the Chiricahua to leave and return to their traditional encampments, American control was absolute, with no freedom of movement allowed.

Being treated as prisoners of war was also the fate of Chiricahua children, who were rounded up and sent to Captain Richard Henry Pratt's Carlisle Indian Industrial School, in Pennsylvania, where, like other Indian boarding schools, the stated policy was to destroy all that was "Indian" in its students. Stockel contends that in spite of all the efforts of Carlisle School authorities, Chiricahua children managed a "middle ground" between total acceptance of Christianity and total adherence to their cultural and religious traditions. At

the same time, with the final stage of removal of all the Chiricahuas to Fort Sill, Oklahoma, in 1894, Protestant missionary endeavors were to have a lasting impact on the Chiricahua people. Stockel stresses that Carlisle was designed to serve Protestant missionary goals, especially given Pratt's animosity toward Catholics and Catholicism in general. Thus it is not surprising that many of the Chiricahua students who were to join their parents and relatives at Fort Sill later were now devout Protestants.

The removal of the Chiricahuas to Fort Sill is the beginning of what Stockel labels "the Protestant period," with work among the Chiricahuas now under the missionary auspices of the Dutch Reformed Church of America (later known as the Reformed Church of America). What makes the Protestant period for Stockel a "major turning point in the history of the Chiricahua Apaches" hinges on the role that children have historically played in Chiricahua life (174). The Chiricahua have always valued their children, and Stockel asserts that this was, in effect, used against them. For it was the adults' desire not to be alienated from the children who had returned from Carlisle as convinced Protestants that allowed for an easier conversion to Protestantism than otherwise would have been possible.

By 1913 Chiricahuas ceased to be prisoners of war and were assigned to the Mescalero Apache Reservation in New Mexico, though a small number stayed in Oklahoma in an area known as Apache, Oklahoma. Stockel concludes her work with brief biographical sketches of various individuals who she believes speak about the richness of the Apache religion, culture, and history.

As a study of Christianity and the Chiricahua Apaches Stockel's work exhibits an obvious sympathy for the struggle that the Chiricahua have undergone over the centuries against a Eurocentric religious tradition that has failed to respect or value the religious and cultural traditions of the Chiricahua people. Yet a number of important questions remain. Stockel seems to suggest, though does not develop, the extent to which perhaps Catholicism more than Protestantism allowed for a preservation of traditional Chiricahua religious and cultural values. It may be the case, as suggested by William Powers (*Beyond the Vision: Essays on Indian Culture* [1987], 97–124), that Catholicism permitted the coexistence of two different religious and cultural traditions. In addition, in spite of what missionaries and governmental authorities intended, namely Christianity as an instrument of cultural domination, it might be worth asking to what extent the Chiricahuas' encounter with Christianity served instead as a means of cultural survival. There is finally the question of the character of present-day Chiricahua Apache Christianity and how Protestant and Catholic communities have sought to regain that which was lost and are in service of Chiricahua people rather than a Euro-American agenda.

Robert H. Craig
The College of St. Scholastica

Pocahontas: Medicine Woman, Spy, Entrepreneur, Diplomat. By Paula Gunn Allen. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco. 2003. 350 pages. $26.95 cloth; $15.95 paper.

Pocahontas is one of the most romantic, enchanting, and enigmatic figures in American history. She is the consummate bicultural individual, a woman who knew intimately European and Native cultures and who, as far as we know, was the first Native person to learn English; to become a Christian; to marry an Englishman, John Rolfe, and have his child; and then journey to England with her new husband and son. She is the epitome of a person bridging two cultures and transforming both with her presence and charisma. Her bloodline persists, with more than four hundred descendants as we begin her seventeenth generation, and one of her direct ancestors, John Rolfe, was a student of mine in 2001. As if coincidence was not enough, my daughter teaches at John Rolfe Middle School in Richmond, Virginia.

Professor Allen's intriguing hypothesis that Pocahontas was a medicine woman and enchantress casts a different glow on the story of her integration into English culture and her legendary status as an American icon. Allen has done a unique service by giving an enlightened perspective into the mindset of Native peoples, its spiritual component especially, and infusing it into this inspiring story of love and cultural communion with allegories and literary comparisons. She intimates that what linked Pocahontas and Rolfe were the spirit powers in tobacco, and she captures a key to this classic cultural encounter.

Allen cleverly compares Pocahontas to Malinalli, who escorted Hernan Cortes and had a child by him, and to Sacagewea, who served as Native guide for Lewis and Clark. She links Pocahontas's abduction to other literary parallels, such as Helen and Guinevere. Her knowledge of English literature serves her well when she alludes to mythical tales such as *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* to show how unseen forces, like dream-vision occurrences, enter into human affairs.

Allen links the medicine power of the Dream Vision people as a way of connecting Native narrative conventions, particularly the supernatural conditions of Native consciousness. But in emphasizing Native oral traditions she needlessly disparages the science and methods of historical investigation. It's true that over time the lack of details and the imaginative bias of biographers have created more legend than insight about Pocahontas. But this is true of all oral traditions; by the time they have become transformed into written records, they have apocryphal elements.

The attempt to inject a new perspective into the life of Pocahontas and her possible role as a priestess, and the compelling delineation of the spiritual side of Native culture, is an ambitious objective and an essential and recurrent theme. Nevertheless, this hypothetical rendition has its imperfections, not the least of which is that Allen tries to characterize this young woman, barely out of her teens, with as many roles—medicine woman, spy, entrepreneur, and diplomat, as the subtitles show—as Ben Franklin had.