UCLA
UCLA Electronic Theses and Dissertations

Title

Cultural Tourism for Salvador, Brazil: A Viable Means of Community Economic Development

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7kp2v9bc

Author

Ciccone, Adrieannette

Publication Date

2012

Peer reviewed|Thesis/dissertation

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

Los Angeles

Cultural Tourism for Salvador, Brazil:

A Viable Means of Community Economic Development

A thesis submitted in partial satisfaction

of the requirements for the degree of Master in Arts

in Urban Planning

by

Adrieannette Lynn Ciccone

2012

ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS

Cultural Tourism for Salvador, Brazil:

A Viable Means of Community Economic Development

by

Adrieannette Lynn Ciccone

Master of Arts in Urban Planning

University of California, Los Angeles, 2012

Professor Leobardo Estrada, Chair

In Brazil, slavery's despotic legacy of racial marginality presently continues in the form of racial economic inequality. The outcome of which has resulted in the existence of two very different Brazil's, bifurcated based on racial income differentiation. One Brazil is "black", while the other is "white". In black Brazil, blacks generally earn 28 times less than their white counterparts. To decrease the racial income gap, the success of cultural tourism as a viable means of community economic development in Salvador, Brazil has been examined. Salvador is known as the Black Rome and thus provides the most African cultural experience to tourists outside of Africa. Although the cultural tourism industry in Salvador yields significant profits from Afro-Brazilian culture, black cultural producers may be victims of exploitation, of which one outcome is not receiving congruent benefit from their contributions to the industry. This may signal that in order to decrease racial economic inequality, solutions tied solely to financial increase may be insufficient.

The thesis of Adrieannette Lynn Ciccone is approved.

Lauren Derby

Anastasia Loukaitou-Sideris

Leobardo Estrada, Committee Chair

University of California, Los Angeles

2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was a project that was a long time in the making. It began in 2007 with a piqued interest in Brazil which led me to participate in a Comparative Planning research trip to Brazil, led by Leobardo Estrada. This research trip in conjunction with conversations with Susana Hecht solidified my interest in Brazil. In 2008, I was selected as a Foreign Language Area Scholarship recipient, which allowed me to learn Portuguese in Salvador de Bahia. While in this magical place, I was connected with Rosali Braga Fernandes and Angela Gordilha Sousa, who graciously explained the delicate situation of race, land tenure, and cultural tourism to me.

It would not have reached completion without the continuing help of God, my mother, Mary Kelley, my Ciccone and Miller families, or the Layne's. Many thanks to all of the people at UCLA that helped me along the way. Thank you everyone! I want to thank my chair, Leobardo Estrada for his continued support of my academic and career aspirations, student support of advocating for under-represented groups, and constructive critiques; Anastasia Loukaitou-Sideris for inspiring me to use creative solutions for economic development and for supporting me to think outside of the box; Robin Derby, for her support by encouraging me to learn about the importance of African cultural retentions; Kevin Terraciano for supporting me, even on short notice; Magda Yamamoto, for her amazing administrative advocacy and support; Robin McCallum for her administrative support and clarity. Additionally, I would like to thank Gilda Haas, Jacqueline Leavitt, Vinit Mukhija, and Judith Carney for allowing the space for me to develop my ideas.

Lastly, this work is dedicated to all of the bondsmen and ancestors who laid the foundation for me to complete this work and to all who are working to break down barriers to make the world a more just place

1-INTRODUCTION

In Brazil, those groups that have historically been in power are those of European descent, who are also presently more economically secure, while those that were previously enslaved, those of African descent, are 3.5 times more likely to be poor than whites (Telles, p. 112). A clear example of the persistence of the negative ramifications of slavery is that as a nation, those Brazilians with the average income of the highest 10% of earners (who are mostly "whites") earn **28 times** that of the average income of the bottom 40% (who are mostly "non-whites") (Telles, p. 107). Thus, economic inequality and race in Brazil are correlated. Whites live at a standard similar to the citizens of France, while blacks live at a standard similar to the citizens of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (Vargas, p. 279).

In order to decrease the income gap between both groups, one can look to the tourism industry in Brazil to facilitate economic development because the industry is growing (WTO, p. 1). Tourism to Brazil is widely advertised, even in US publications like Ebony Magazine.   For example, in its 2009 issue, Salvador, Bahia was advertised to encourage perspective visitors to experience its vibrant Afro-Brazilian culture. Tourism in Salvador has had so much success that the industry accounted for more than 6% of the city's earnings in 2005 (Castro, p. 36).

Salvador is of particular significance because it is known as the "Black Rome" (Matory, p. 2), due to its majority non-white or "black" population (Telles, p. 205). The high percentage of non-whites has afforded Salvador the opportunity to be the center of Afro-Brazilian cultural production. Unfortunately, over 35% of Salvador's residents are in poverty (IBGE, 2010). What this points to is that Salvador is a black majority city and that an overwhelming number of residents live in poverty. As such, Salvador is a prime example of the two Brazil's that Telles' research found. There is a Salvador of haves and one of have-nots. Therefore, it may be best to

1

think of blacks in Brazil with a quality of life likened to that of a developing nation (Vargas, p. 279).

It is inherently contradictory that Afro-Brazilians are the arbiters of the culture that attracts tourists (i.e. capoeira, Candomble, samba) and make both Salvador and Brazil famous, but can still be the majority of have-nots (Telles, p. 107). One would think that since black culture is so prevalent and celebrated in Salvador, and since many cultural agents are black, that racial economic inequality would not be the case.

In order to address this contradiction, the following questions came to mind. Does the current sponsorship and promotion of tourism need to be altered so that proponents of black culture can receive their fair share of financial, social, and political benefits from cultural tourism, in efforts to alleviate poverty? How can cultural tourism be improved so that cultural agents (who are the base of the industry in Salvador) receive adequate compensation for their involvement in the tourism industry in Salvador?

In order to properly address these questions, the research set forth in this inquiry is divided into distinct parts. First, the literature on black inequality, marginality, and use of cultural tourism as a form of economic development as a means to alleviate poverty are presented. The review begins with literature that displays how detrimental poverty is and the ramifications associated with being both marginalized and poor. The review then continues with literature that presents the advantages and disadvantages of cultural tourism as a means for economic development.

Second, a brief history of the Brazilian state is presented, in order to provide the context for the current economic situation and reality for blacks in Brazil. Third, a brief explanation of racial politics and land tenure in Brazil are presented. Fourth, a description of Salvador de Bahia

is presented. Fifth, a case study of redevelopment in Salvador is presented. Fifth, the economics

of cultural tourism are described based on United Nations (UN) standards, so that a clearer

understanding of the global economic calibration of the cultural tourism industry can be

presented. The last section discusses policy recommendations and lessons learned on how global

cultural tourism industry measuring standards can be applied to Salvador.

2-BREIF HISTORY OF BRAZIL

Brazil is the largest country in South America. The Portuguese "discovered" or rather landed in the state of Bahia on April 23, 1549. Almost immediately after their arrival, they began importing African bondsmen into Brazil. Salvador de Bahia was the capital city until 1763. After which, the capital seat was moved to Rio de Janeiro. The current capital city is Brasilia. Until slavery was formally abolished in Brazil in 1888, an estimated upwards of 3.5 million African bondsmen were brought to the country. This figure is astounding because it is roughly 10 times that of the US.

Brazil has developed into a unique multi-racial society. From the initial settlement until the 2001 census, the population has grown to 174,468,575 inhabitants. Per the WTO, the annual economic growth rate in Brazil from 1999 to 2000 was 17.2% (WTO, p. 8). The increasing growth rate shows that Brazil is growing in both economic and population terms. The high population size makes Brazil the fifth most populated country across the globe. This population has historically been concentrated near the coastal areas for many reasons, but primarily because the coastal regions offered and continue to offer greater access to trade, employment opportunities and a milder climate than the inner environs.

The country covers more than 3,286,426 square miles. From its northern to southern poles, it spans over 2,700 miles and is almost equal in miles from east to west. The landmass that Brazil occupies comprises more than half of the South American continent. The large size of Brazil is important to mention because the geography has allowed many different Brazil's to simultaneously co-exist (Telles, p. 3). However, the coexistence of many sub-groups has produced social conflict that has been extreme at different time periods.

The large size of Brazil coupled with geographical barriers has contributed to a regionalism. There is the North, the Northeast, the Center-West, the Southeast and the South. The focus of this research has been on the Northeast but it is important to mention other regions because they often differ both economically and socially. The Center-West and North are home to the majority of Brazil's indigenous populations. The South is home to many of Brazil's European descendants while the Southeast is the home of Brazil's industrial economy (including both Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo). The Southeast also received a large influx of African bondsmen descendants between the abolishment of slavery and industrialization, which contributed to a problem common throughout Latin America: rapid urbanization without proper infrastructure to accommodate all residents.

The Northeast was the home to the first capital of Brazil, Salvador de Todos os Santos (which will be referred to as Salvador and or Bahia). The colonial captaincies in this region remained profitable until the sugar industry declined in importance in the 19th century. During colonialism, the sugar industry provided the economic support to transform Salvador into a booming metropolis and gateway between Brazil and the rest of the world. Most valuable to the sugar industry were the bondsmen that toiled in the sugar plantations and other agricultural areas.

Those who owned land and slaves were often the European elite. During the colonial era, they occupied the top of the social hierarchy. The African bondsmen that provided the labor that extracted their wealth in the form of resources on the other hand, were at the bottom of this hierarchy. In many cases those who are descendants of the landed elite group continue to be powerful while those who are descendants of bondsmen continue to be powerless (Telles, p. 7). Thus, the disparate social relations established during colonialism often still persist.

When the sugar industry began its decline, due to a failure to modernize, regional pervasive poverty began. Unfortunately, those who occupied marginal positions suffered most severely from the economic downturn. When slavery was abolished in 1888, those formerly in servitude bore the brunt of this. The implications of a lack of modernization continue into the present and have resulted in the Northeast being the home to the largest area of abject poverty in the Americas (Telles, p. 7). The income gap between the rich and the poor is arguably most pronounced in this region (Telles, p. 7). The most notable thing about this region is that while it is the most impoverished, it is also home to the strongest Afro-Brazilian culture in Brazil.

The Afro-Brazilian culture in Brazil flourished in the Northeast primarily due to the high numbers of Afro-descendants. By the 1930's, the elements of African culture in Brazil came to be a celebrated part of the "racial democracy" by the notable Brazilian philosopher Gilberto Freyre. The concept of "racial democracy" championed by Freyre is based on the idea that Portuguese colonizers of Brazil were less prejudiced against Africans than other Europeans. The basis for this assertion is that the Portuguese colonizers treated African bondsmen "better" than other Europeans because of the seventh-century occupation of the Iberian Peninsula by the North African Moors, which meant the Portuguese had developed a level of "comfort" with Africans. Gilberto Freyre's research became famous because he argued that Brazilians represented a new tropical race that was a "racial paradise" (Telles, p. 53). Freyre's notions of a Brazilian "racial paradise" have often been criticized and deemed false because of the extreme socioeconomic inequality that persists between Afro and Euro Brazilians (Telles, p. 53 and 209).

In reality, the reason that the "racial paradise" myth was disproved was because scholars found that the promotion of European immigrants in Brazil and the prohibition of African immigrants there created a whitening of the Brazilian population. This whitening process served

to valorize and promote European cultural attributes and to marginalize African attributes. Promoting whiteness and marginalizing blackness is contrary to the image of the "racial paradise" that Freyre was tried to disseminate about Brazil.

While Freyre's concept often promoted whiteness, not all forms of blackness were demonized. For example, Afro-Brazilian cultural elements (like music and spirituality) were elevated and celebrated in Salvador. The racial democracy theory focused on the combination of European intellect with African culture. Of main issue with this combination is that the celebration of black culture has yet to provide congruent socioeconomic recompense for the importance that black culture holds, especially to the cultural tourism industry. This is conveyed in the research conducted by Telles in 2004, discussed below.

Socioeconomic inequity is clarified when one examines the Gini Coefficient for Brazil. The Gini Coefficient is an index used to measure socioeconomic equity by examining income inequality between the most wealthy and impoverished groups within a geographic area. Further, when one examines the Gini Coefficient against the growth of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) this inequality appears magnified. Brazil's growth is reflected in its membership in the G-20 global economic summit. Brazil has moved from its position as a "third world" nation to the UN classification into a mid-level country (WTO, p. 8). Although Brazil has grown economically and is no longer considered a "third world" country, these economic gains have not been equitably distributed (Telles, p. 83).

Economic development requires an increase in both per capita growth and equity in order to be successful. Moreover, equity for those who have been oppressed since colonial times, is connected to Brazil's Gini Coefficient being reduced. Achieving socioeconomic equity in Brazil

has been challenging because it appears to require more than economic solutions due to the prevalence of racial inequality.

On one hand, many Afro-descendants may have contributed to racial inequality because they may have accepted the myth of the "racial paradise", and may not be aware of inequality's direct link to race, as it is possible they may think that one's social class (education included) is the basis for economic inequality. On the other hand, many elites may continue to defend the myth to justify the further whitening of Brazil. In any event, Freyre's myth has been applied to the Brazilian national identity and the celebration of the black culture of the "racial democracy" was an arguably important component of the nationalism project.

Samba, an African based dance and musical style, has been established as the national dance. Feijoada, an Afro-Brazilian bean stew, has been appropriated as the national dish of Brazil. There are countless other African based cultural elements that have been incorporated into the national Brazilian identity. The common thread is that the government, beginning with President Getulio Vargas, in the 1930's, has appropriated these elements as the soul of Brazil not only so Afro-Brazilians could be included but also to attempt to ease the tension between the working and ruling classes (Lewis, p. 60). Since President Vargas' nation building campaign, the government has funded various "folk" or Afro-Brazilian art forms that have been marketed for tourists. Samba schools were funded by the Ministry of Tourism for Carnival and Afro-Brazilian culture was exploited by the government (Perlman, p. 246). The government exploited "black" creativity for its own financial benefit without properly reimbursing those "black" bodies for their creative works. This unfortunate occurrence has happened in various locations and time periods.

In Rio de Janeiro, a trend has formed where racial tourism of favelas has been a successful urban redevelopment strategy. The Favela Bairro project (which literally means from shantytown to neighborhood) was located in the Serrinha favela of Rio de Janeiro. Serrinha was a strategic choice because of its unique past as nationally accepted birthplace of samba. The Favela Bairro project was part of the urban redevelopment strategy to encourage outsiders to tour the area in order to promote inclusion. Although outsiders were encouraged to visit this neighborhood in efforts to promote cultural tourism, caution arose because promoting cultural tourism of African cultural elements involved a fetishization of black history (meaning that African cultural elements were sensationalized) (Amar, p. 251). It is important not to contribute to the fetishized perception of blacks championed by Freyre, which was based on the combination of white rationality with black music and spirituality (Amar, p. 275).

The government's national efforts at promoting black culture through tourism can be construed as efforts to preserve black culture (Amar, p. 285). Black cultural production is being marketed for tourist consumption (Amar, p. 298). The socioeconomically beneficial impact of the long-standing national government efforts is that practices formerly considered marginal have translated into potential social capital for cultural agents (Amar, p. 297 & p. 298). This means that governmental support exists for policies to support African-based cultural tourism, which can yield greater economic returns for blacks.

In order for such policies to be successful enough to stimulate effective adequate economic development, they must be tailored in a manner so they do not further fetishize blacks and create avenues for funds generated from this tourism to reach blacks directly and eradicate their poverty. Such policies should also take into account the long-standing issues of racial inequality and land tenure's effects.

9

3-LITERATURE REVIEW

Approximately between the 16th and 19th centuries, the Atlantic Slave Trade transferred

African bondsmen to the Americas to cultivate the land. Their labor would become the

backbone of production and of the capitalist economies that later developed in the New World.

It also lent itself to the social construct we call race because slavery was associated with

embodying features from Sub-Saharan Africa, where people are various shades of ebony in skin

complexion. People with European ancestry, who were owners of bondsmen became "white",

while bondsmen became "black". In Latin America, people were often caught in between

positions of black and white.

Black Genocide

Historically, black has always been associated with subservience, slavery, negativity and

with Africa. White conversely, has been associated with positivity, freedom, and Europe

(Vargas, p. 275). The lasting socio-psychological impacts on one being "black" have been

detrimental. The manifestations of the negative impacts of black racialization have been recently

referred to as a form of genocide, by Dr. João Costa Vargas.

In his work on black genocide, Vargas argued that when employing the United Nation's

(UN) definition of genocide, blacks in the Americas are experiencing this unfortunate

phenomenon. The genocidal qualifiers are the every-day forms of psychological, physical,

political, and economic oppression characterizing blacks' experiences in a white-dominated

polity (Vargas, p. 275). In other words, because blacks bear the mark and badges associated with

slavery, the daily experience within a white-dominated society is genocidal and oppressive.

Thus, genocide results from the manifestations of slavery's continued oppression.

To illustrate the racial disparity in the Americas, Vargas, like Edward Telles, consider Brazil. Both of their works present Brazil as one of the most unequal countries on the planet. The median household income for the richest 20% was $21,134 (like France), which is 26 times higher than those of the poorest 20%, which earn $828 (like the Democratic Republic of the Congo). The richest 20% had 64% of the national income and the poorest 20% have 3% of the national income (INSPIR et al., 1999- Vargas, p. 279). Although both groups experience an overwhelming different economic reality, they frequently interact socially. For example, many poor young black women work as domestics in the homes of middle class or well-to-do whites. Working in a subservient position in the home of a white Brazilian shows how the psychological impacts of slavery and genocide are currently experienced in Brazil.

Vargas shows how blacks are continually the victims of mass incarceration, dehumanizing treatment, premature death, and violence. He relies on demographic data to show the astounding percentages of blacks in incarceration and death records. He discusses how blacks are continually mistreated because of their position in a white dominated society and compares the US to Brazil to show how, although the realities for blacks in both places may be different, they are worse in Brazil (Vargas, p. 282). This is due in part to the fact that affirming one's blackness in Brazil is a much newer concept than it is in the United States because of the myth of "racial democracy" that Brazilians asserted as truth from the 1930's onward.

The racial democracy myth was debunked when activist Abidas do Nascimento examined this concept and showed that this term was actually a tool for promoting whiteness (Vargas, p. 279). Nascimento proved how the manifestations of anti-black racism (unemployment, poor education, poverty, and early death) were are all determined by race when the same demographics were compared with whites (Vargas, p. 279). Due to the fact that the United

States did not have an internalized notion of being a "racial paradise" people were black or white, and nothing in between. Therefore, because of the in-between position of blacks in Brazil, they did not necessarily know they were being treated as "blacks", or rather did not accept this, and did not affirm their blackness. The lack of affirmation led to a lack of a cohesive political group based on race.

Understanding black genocide and the marginal status of blacks in the Americas is important to the research at hand because Afro-Brazilian cultural attributes are the driving force of the cultural tourism industry in Salvador, Bahia. The social position of blacks is important to this work because it highlights the fact that blacks across the African Diaspora need an immediate intervention in order to combat the oppressive and genocidal nature of their existence in the Americas. Silence, inaction, and ignorance are as genocidal as the most racist acts and thoughts (Vargas, p. 283). When genocide is mentioned, it is not something that should be allowed to continue without making earnest efforts to end it.

An economic intervention seems most appropriate in order to lessen the gap between black and white incomes. The high incidence of black or rather non-white (both will be used interchangeably) poverty in Brazil is but one manifestation of black genocide. Poverty comes with negative social stigmas, included that of being marginal in comparison with whites. Both poverty and marginality literatures have been reviewed to show the magnitude of the black genocide in Brazil and more importantly, point to the need for an intervention that includes social policy to combat racism and result in poverty alleviation.

Non-White Poverty vs. Non-White Marginality

The literature for the causes of poverty associated with race were presented in a 1992 book entitled *Separate Societies*. Three general social explanations for poverty were presented and refuted. The concept of "poverty as pathology" is demystified, "poverty as accident" is proven to be incorrect, and "poverty as structure" is finally concluded as the reason why poverty persists. The three theories on the existence and persistence of poverty are interesting because they take race into account, in a time period (the 1990's) where blacks were negatively portrayed in the media to be lazy, violent, and irresponsible. This study is important, although dated, because it shows how in spite of persisting racial disparities, there is hope for change because racism's effects are felt most at institutional and social levels.

Goldsmith and Blakely (1992) show how severe poverty is built into the economic and political structures by three forces. First, the long-term intergenerational disconnect of the poor from the mainstream due to a lack of employment created physical and social isolation of the poor from society. Second, educational and social handicaps prevented the poor from entering into the labor force. Third, institutional hostility of welfare systems, penal systems, and bureaucracy make poor people the victims dependent on public charity (Goldsmith, p. 10). These three forces are a direct corollary to the effects of the black genocide that Vargas argues. However, because the analysis of this project is based in Brazil, marginality literature is important because in Brazil, poverty and blackness are included in the construct of marginality.

Marginality

In Janice Perlman's 1976 book, *Myth of "Marginality,"* the Brazilian underclass is thoroughly addressed. She examines how the poor are victims of false stereotyping created by society's negative characterization of the poor who reside in informal dwellings (who are

overwhelmingly non-white). She provides analysis of the prevalent theories of marginality from social and psychological disciplines to define what social marginality is, then goes on to question middle and upper class Brazilians asking them why they think that *favelados*[1] are marginal and deserving of punitive public policies.

The theories of marginality are ethnographic marginality, where the societal perception of marginal people becomes "recuperated" and improved by placing them in regular housing environments; and the culture of poverty school, where the poor have specific negative personality traits which keep them in poverty (this school was championed by Oscar Lewis & E. Franklin Frazier in the US). This theory contends that poverty persists in spite of opportunities to excel because individuals are not equipped to take advantage of new opportunities they are given (Perlman, p. 117). Being thought to be ill-equipped, marginal groups were presumed to be outside of the scale of integration because they are physically separated from the whole of society at the residential level in Brazil because they often live in informal settlements.

Perlman finds that although they are separated, they are still included at some level. For example in Rio de Janeiro, Samba Schools were funded by the Ministry of Tourism and the elite, to increase profits from the annual Carnaval, by encouraging samba as a tourist attraction. Therefore, this separation theory does not hold true. Government funding for tourism purposes means that the marginal are integrated at some level, but that this integration happens only to exploit their culture for economic benefit (Perlman, p. 173). The lack of integration and exploitation of favelados is indicative of the fact that the "…favela is a necessity of the Brazilian social structure because it demands economic dependence which results in misery of the dependents," (Perlman, p. 245). Thus, the marginality of the poor persists to preserve the status quo. The cultural production of marginalized groups is celebrated, giving the appearance that

---

[1] Those that reside in favelas. Favelas are informal settlements that are generally equivalent to shantytowns.

they are not marginal. Once profits are made, they are forced to retreat to their marginal social status. On the other hand, if funds generated from cultural tourism were allocated to the cultural producers, it could be an effective economic development strategy.

Cultural Tourism as Economic Development

The success of economic development strategies is generally measured by examining employment data through the census. In the United States, little is known about the relationship between economic development and the implication of employment in the tourist industry (Blakely, p. 230). It is challenging to quantify employment levels from the tourism industry because the economic effects generally happen at a local, not at a state level. Additionally, many cultural agents tend to work informally, and as such receive their payment in cash, which is generally not counted by census reports and taxes (Blakely, p. 230). The nature of the tourism industry is also spatially selective, therefore, it can have tremendous positive impacts on areas that have unique historical and cultural elements (Blakely, p. 230). If the proper infrastructure is in place to capitalize on unique cultural elements, it can be effective because at minimum, it can generate cash for cultural producers.

To use cultural tourism as a means of economic development, Sideris suggests that some broad prerequisites must be employed. Included are local involvement in the identification, preservation, and promotion of cultural assets, and the participation of locals in the marketing of cultural assets (Sideris, p. 9). Economic goals also should not supersede community goals because "culture cannot be dealt with in conventional economic terms" because culture, although commodified for tourism, is not like other commodities that have substitutes (Sideris, p. 9). Therefore, community interest should be the main focus of any economic development strategies employed.

Cultural Tourism As a Poverty Alleviation Tool

Poverty is defined by the World Tourism Organization (WTO)[2] as "…hunger and malnutrition, poor health, lack of access to water and sanitation, lack of participation in education, lack of marketable skills, insecurity and vulnerability," (WTO, p. 5). In other words, poverty is defined to be a lack of resources that lead to future and foster current unemployment. The WTO definition for poverty includes the same characteristics that Vargas noted that constitute genocide in the Black Diaspora communities. Therefore, black Brazil can be thought of as a poverty stricken segment within the Brazilian nation state.

One living in poverty is classified by surviving on under $1US dollar per day. Globally, the majority of those that fall in this financial bracket are concentrated in medium and larger countries. Poverty and marginality are more than a lack of income because they directly impact the quality of life. It is within the United Nations Millennium Development Goals to halve poverty at the global scale by 2015 (WTO, p. 11). This goal was adopted by 191 United Nations Member States, of which Brazil is included. Employing cultural tourism to meet this poverty reduction goal seems to be a splendid idea because tourism can provide needed economic development.

Evidence presented by WTO suggests that tourism is growing in poverty stricken countries. Brazil, which has a large poor population, is receiving large numbers of tourists (WTO, p. 7). Brazil's annual tourist arrival growth rate from 1990 to 2000 was 17.2% (WTO, p. 8). Increasing tourists to Brazil, and rather to black Brazil has the potential to catapult Afro-Brazilians out of poverty and put them in a higher earning bracket.

In addition to increasing cash flow, other benefits may exist. The literature suggests that cultural tourism can "contribute to the geographic spread of employment, provide flexible jobs,

---

[2] The WTO is a UN Specialized Agency.

employ women and young people, has the potential to employ diverse skill leveled individuals, create opportunities for small business, increase cultural pride, provide a greater awareness of the natural environment, and provide a sense of ownership and infrastructure for poor communities," (WTO, p. 10). Thus, the benefits of tourism are high because they can foster both social and economic empowerment.

In the past decades, the WTO highlighted that tourism has become a key component of service exports because it has the power to generate funds that can be immediately directed towards poverty alleviation. In fact, it accounts for over 30% of all service exports, globally (WTO, p. 1). In order for tourism to be used as a poverty alleviation tool, the funds generated must be directed towards the poor (WTO p. 1). They list many ways that funds can be directed to the poor. For example, employment in the tourism industry and self-employment in the tourist industry are two of the most likely ways that one would receive tourism funds directly (Sideris, p. 8 & WTO, p. 17).

Cultural tourism as an economic development tool has become increasingly important because of the overall interest in "marginal" cultures. This new trend is in stark contrast to tourists visiting places and doing activities associated with "high culture" (Sideris, p. 2). Due to the increase in interest in oppressed and subaltern cultures, tourism provides a growth market for the impoverished where they have the comparative advantage where cultural commodities are unique, and thereby have the potential to generate income (WTO, p. 5). Due to the fact that people are in a place where they are interested in experiencing "real" culture, marginal groups are often thought to embody this "real" culture, thus giving them the comparative advantage. In the last decade, misrepresented or under-represented cultures have been included in predominant

culture, history and identity (Sideris, p. 5) which has led to an increased level in interest of misrepresented or under-represented cultures.

In the works by both Sideris and Perlman, they caution that cultural tourism can have a negative side effect and reinforce cultural hegemony (Perlman, p. 173 & Sideris, p. 7). Cultural hegemony is an issue because it is possible that people may be drawn "off the beaten path" to experience places, based on negative stereotypes of the culture. However, if one experiences another's culture and is able to relate to their humanity, a cultural heterogonous experience will serve to break down cultural hegemony. Additionally, when cultural attributes are commodified, they may be in danger of being commercialized. If they become too commercial, it is likely they will lose some of their uniqueness, which makes them have a possible competitive advantage in the first place. Nonetheless, cultural tourism has such economic potential because culture is regarded as the motor of the urban economy, and cultural activities have developed into tourist attractions (Sideris, p. 1).

In 2007, United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) defined cultural tourism as "a discerning type of tourism that takes account of other people's cultures," which is the fastest growing market segment of the tourist industry (Sideris, p. 2). Although cultural tourism has emerged as the fastest growing market of the tourist industry, a slim body of literature exists that has examined the application of cultural tourism strategies in ethnic and inner city neighborhoods for economic development (Sideris, p. 5). Thus, cultural tourism as a poverty alleviation tool and community economic development strategy, in conjunction with social policies to address racial inequality's effects are studied in this work.

4-THE SIGNIFICANCE OF RACIAL POLITICS AND LAND TENURE

Racial politics are important to the discussion of cultural tourism as a means of community economic development (CED) in Brazil for many reasons. As previously mentioned, most blacks in Brazil have the standard of living of the Democratic Republic of the Congo while most whites in Brazil have the standard of living of France. The discrepancy in the economic indicators between blacks and whites is due in part to the manifestation of unequal levels of access to social mobility, which is directly connected to Brazil's legacy of slavery and post-abolition inequity.

In the 1930's Gilberto Freyre attempted to explain the history of Brazil's colonial patriarchal society. In *Mansions and Shanties*, he provided a framework for understanding the social relations in the plantation era society, which he used to explain the contemporary racial politics. In this work, he provided a history of the housing arrangements that were popular during his lifetime. The interesting thing is that over 70 years after the publication of his book, the same racial politics and housing arrangements persist.

In *Mansions and Shanties*, it is clear that the reason that racial tensions went undetected was due to the structure of plantation society (Eldridge, p. 36). This signals that the structure of plantation society may be tied to his theory of "racial democracy". It is possible that this theory was based on all racial groups "knowing their places" and not going outside of those boundaries. Although this may be the case, the boundaries within which people existed changed according to the time period. Therefore, a history of racial relations and land tenure will be described separately, based on time periods.

Racial Politics

Based on research conducted by Jocelio dos Santos, Brazilian government policy towards blacks has gone through three distinct periods.

1-Post-Abolition

The Post-Abolition period was dominated by the goal of establishing a nation that excluded ex-slaves and indigenous people (Santos, p. 118). After slavery's abolition in 1888, the Brazilian government did not attempt to provide reparations for freedmen. The lack of financial assistance, often left freedmen dependent on the protection of their previous owners, making them vulnerable in both the society and economy (Butler, p. 161). If one is being protected or taken care of by their former "master", one is not "free" because one is still dependent on the same powerful forces that encouraged servitude. In addition to former slaves not having any state assistance, Brazil was undergoing a dramatic economic and political change.

The Brazilian Republic was being formed, which provided a means for Brazil to recreate itself. During the formative years of the Brazilian Republic, Brazil, like other Latin American countries instituted whitening policies to whiten out the black population. Undertaking such a project, Brazil recruited Europeans and some North Asian groups to "whiten" out the black population and serve as the newly paid labor force following abolition. In establishing immigration preferences, the state implemented racist theories and contributed to discourses on inferiority (Santos, p. 118). This whitening is important because it was promoted by the government and displays a form of institutional racism. Policies associated with the promotion of whiteness were often designed to be punitive for blacks.

Punitive policies were ambivalent in nature because some expressly threatened to thwart Afro-Brazilian cultural activities like candomblé and capoeira. Last, anti-black policies were often legally covert and masked the inequality that black Brazilians faced. It must be noted that although blacks were often the majority of the population, like in Salvador, they lacked majority rule and power (Santos, p. 118).

2-Racial Democracy

The second stage began in the 1920's and 1930's with Gilberto Freyre's myth of racial democracy and continued until the 1970's (Santos, p. 119). Although this has fallen over and received lots of criticism, it continues to be embedded in the Brazilian public opinion. It continues to be the basis for policies based on social class and meritocracy.

Part 3- Change of Policy Towards Black Culture

The third stage began in the 1970's and included official discourse that reflected racial democracy but also changes in public policies directed at black culture (Santos, p. 119). The government changed its position to blacks for many different reasons. Most important were the Black Movement (MNU) and the widespread recognition of African culture as a valuable economic resource by the Brazilian government at all levels. By the 1960's, the reality of the Brazilian black came to be known. The idea that all races blended together in perfect harmony was no longer sound because black inequality was obvious in economics and housing conditions.

When the MNU surfaced in the 1970's*,* the racial democracy myth in Brazil was finally dispelled. The MNU worked for equal rights for blacks in Brazil due to the many socioeconomic hardships they faced. The MNU fully formed during the Military Regime in Brazil. This Military dictatorship provided many setbacks for the MNU's development but it survived because of international support (Santos, p. 117). Blacks in the United States, Africa, Europe

and Latin America were being empowered as a result of the Civil Rights Movement in the United States and this empowerment reached Brazil.

When the Military Regime fell, the government policy was aimed toward efforts to re-democratize the nation. This lent itself to the strengthening of the MNU.

Inclusion of Blacks in Society through Black Culture

Civil society groups placed international pressure on Brazilian society to make the importance of the black population to both history and culture of Brazil known. The promotion of the historical significance and the awareness of blackness in Brazil translated into black mobilization. In response to mobilization, culture became the terrain for public policies, and cultural policies prescribed distinct roles for Afro-Brazilians (Santos, p. 118). Culture was a natural terrain for which blacks mobilized for the simple fact that blacks in Brazil were not yet respected for their intellect, rather, they were respected for their cultural attributes (ability to cook, sing, dance, perform martial arts and African-based religion). Thus, the use of the culture was a strategic move because they knew that the government and population at large would respond to this already accepted medium.

Government Responses to Black Culture

The Brazilian nation state, since its foundation as a Republic, has been the guardian of a society characterized by racial inequality because of racial degradation of blacks during slavery. In guarding the society, the state has attempted to centralize power and impose conformity, using culture as one of its tools. Thus, this cultural method in which the state negotiates with the MNU is important (Santos, p. 118). This vehicle of culture as a means of communication between the government and the MNU often results in two parties attempting to control or rather negotiate for the power associated with culture. Afro-Brazilian culture can be manipulated to suit the

needs of either side. By making Afro-Brazilian culture an arena in which power is contested, the use of culture as poverty alleviation tool can often be stagnant because of the seeming constant pull.

At the Federal level, there is a Ministry of Culture that houses the Ministry of Tourism. After visiting the national tourism website (http://www.turismo.gov.br/turismo/home.html) one can gather that the government is promoting Brazil as a nation characterized by racial harmony and mixing. The nation state has also taken another step in trying to use its power as the guardian to define folklore in order to best market it as a tourist attraction, while simultaneously promoting the myth of "racial democracy" (Santos, p. 119). This is problematic because, when the government controls culture, it produces a false harmonious view that excludes the narrative account of black oppression in Brazil by denying racial discrimination.

When Brazil started promoting its racially democratic culture, it was not coincidental that they also developed trading with newly independent black African nations. Brazil tried to capitalize on its African cultural origins for purposes of economic development by the government exploiting elements of black culture to sell products to Africans (Santos, p. 121). This was problematic because although the government used Afro-Brazilian cultural elements to sell products in Africa, they discriminating against these same blacks. Thus, while African culture was able to serve as a means to build a race friendly trading environment, racial inequality was despotic and black culture continued as subordinated to economic policy (Santos, p. 122). As a result, the Brazilian government could use black culture for economic gain. The actual parameters of what constituted black culture, or rather Brazilian culture, however, was under government control.

Racial Politics Relation to Land Tenure

In the previous section, examples of how Brazilian racial politics have directly impacted the way in which blacks have been treated by the government were provided. At different time periods, exploitative trading policies have influenced the sociopolitical treatment of blacks, which has directly affected their access levels to quality of life indicators (education, housing, employment, social mobility, etc.). The amount of income one has is reflected in one's housing options. Since blacks had little to no income following their emancipation and a covertly racist society that attempted to conceal discrimination, housing options were limited.

The high number of blacks living in poverty meant that a substantial amount of poor people needed to be housed, often without adequate finances. Just as the government had different policy responses to black culture, they also had different responses to the question of land tenure, or legalization of land. Illegal land tenure heavily impacted blacks because those who could not afford to live legally often found housing in informal settlements. Therefore, the lack of means to secure legal land tenure and the informal illegal housing options directly affected poor blacks.

Land Tenure

Period 1- Post Abolition 19th century

Prior to the abolishment of slavery, the agrarian economy that served as the basis for Brazil's plantation economy's success began to decline. Emperor Dom João's move to Rio de Janeiro also worked to transform the agrarian economy into an industrial one (Eldridge, p. 37). The decline of the agrarian economy naturally decreased the need for high numbers of agricultural workers because both industries have different types of labor requirements.

What resulted from the economic transformation were larger plantations with labor surpluses (which was primarily done by bondsmen) and a drop in demand for agricultural products. From an economic viewpoint, when there is a surplus of labor and a drop in demand for a product, the labor force is typically laid off. Slaves were not a paid labor force and thus could not be laid off. This chain of events leads to the assumption that ex-slaves would likely relocate to urban areas in search of industrial employment opportunities, following abolition in 1888. However, due to their lack of finances, those who wanted to live outside of the control of their former masters had to settle in free, often informal, settlements because many could likely not gain adequate employment in the new market due to hiring preferences for non-blacks (Eldridge, p. 1). These free settlements were often informal land occupations.

In this same decade, coffee boomed and was responsible for transforming Brazil into an industrialized economy (Eldridge, p. 36).[3] The coffee boom also moved Brazil's economic center from the Northeastern region to the Southeastern region. When freed slaves moved to follow economic opportunities following slavery, they often continued to settle in informal settlements because of the cost-effectiveness of this living situation, as the payment structure for housing was either non-existent or fluid (Eldridge, p. 36).

Period 2- 20th Century Settlement Patterns and Land Tenure

Beginning in the 1930's and 1940's, industrialization's force took root. This is evidenced by the mass rapid urbanization that occurred between the mid 1930's through approximately the 1970's. Although the time period changed and blacks were "freed" for at least 50 years at the start of this period, the plantation mentality and social hierarchy generally persisted in the form of black unemployment because of employment discrimination. This continued to lead blacks

---

[3] Although coffee is an agricultural crop, it was processed in an industrial manner during this time period in Brazil.

into inexpensive and informal living situations. These informal settlements have come to be presently known as the favela.

The majority view is that those who reside in favelas are responsible for the moral decline of the community and for their own situations (Eldridge, p. 38). However, one only has to examine racial politics that have contributed to the development of favelas to conclude otherwise. Thus, the poor treatment of the underclass (blacks) comes from an undeniable link to patriarchal Brazil, which favored the slavery and subjugation of Africans (Eldridge, p. 39).

Period 3-Military Regime

During the Military Regime in Brazil, which lasted approximately from the 1960's to the mid 1980's, the centralized government began working on urban policies that allocated funds to states for redevelopment. Unfortunately, the allocation of these funds for redevelopment projects was not evenly implemented and consequently, urban redevelopment suffered (Eldridge, p. 29). This failure was the impetus for the creation of a series of housing agencies.

During this period in 1966, the National Bank of Housing (BNH) was created to act as a housing finance agency. In 1973, the government recognized that the poor needed adequate housing and began studying their housing needs. Based on government involvement through the creation of housing programs, the Brazilian national redevelopment programs were oriented towards low-income areas (Eldridge, p. 31). The government thus recognized the problem and tried to remedy it.

One way the government tried to address this problem was through relocating people living in informal settlements to government housing. Government sponsored relocation programs were unsuccessful, however, because they severed family ties and social networks (Eldridge, p. 42). The overall poverty and the social disjuncture caused by the displacement only

seemed to worsen the plight for public housing residents because they were further marginalized due to the stigma associated with both their race and living situations. Therefore, the government removal of the poor was not a successful policy initiative and providing people with new homes in new neighborhoods was not the best solution to help the poor out of poverty.

Conclusion

For aforementioned reasons, both race and land tenure have impacted community economic development (CED) and tourism in Brazil. The seemingly outside factors are also directly related to the black struggle in Brazil. CED is so important to black equity in Brazil because social mobility is linked to race, education, and class. All of these are directly connected to the lasting negative legacies from slavery (Eldridge, p. 40). If blacks can achieve upward mobility, then the hope is that they will have more political power and thus equity.

5-SALVADOR DE TODOS OS SANTOS DA BAHIA-THE BLACK ROME

Geography

The State of Bahia, which the city of Salvador is situated in, is roughly the same size as France. It is one of the largest cities in Brazil, and has been since the Colonial era. The city is located on the northern end of the peninsula of the Bay of All Saints (Todos os Santos) and was the main entry point for the sugar plantations and mills of the regional area called the Recôncavo. The Recôncavo is known for being a rich agricultural land while the area surrounding it is arid. The dry climate of the surrounding area was home to most of the cattle production of the region but was often subject to drought. The metropolitan city of Salvador was, therefore, more attractive because of its favorable environmental characteristics.

As the colonial seat, port city, and home to a high recipient of African bondsmen, Salvador developed into a city that thrives as a cultural hub. It boasts preserved colorful colonial buildings. As a port city, the actual port lookout is still in operation as a tourist attraction. As a place that received a high number of African bondsmen, it is home to the African Diaspora seat of the New World. As a city that is over 80% Black (in terms of United States racial identification terms), it is the home to the soul of Brazil because it is the home to Afro-Brazilian culture (IBGE, 2010).

Salvador's boundaries are situated on the 13th degree of latitude to the south and the 38th 30' degree of latitude to the west. It currently covers approximately 313 square kilometers. The northern boundary of the city is the ocean (Fernandes, p. 93). The average temperature is 25.5 degrees Celsius. There are several rivers that reach the ocean.

The urban configuration was initially divided into two areas: an upper city (which is 60 meters above sea level) and a lower city. The upper city was characterized as the city center,

which included measures to provide defenses for the city. The lower city was characterized as a port city that was the center of commercial activity (City of Salvador, p. 13). Today, colonial-style homes are an attraction of the Pelourinho neighborhood.

The proliferation of Africanity or rather African cultural symbols and practices in Salvador allow Bahia to be known as "the Black Rome," (Matory, p. 149). Salvador has become a tourist attraction for its geographical, historical and most importantly African-based cultural retentions. The estimated population in 2007 was 2.8 million, making Salvador the third largest metropolis in Brazil, following Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo (Kraay, p. 3). Rightfully so, Salvador's cultural elements, along with its lush fertile green areas, make it a location that has more to offer a tourist than a tropical vacation.

Unfortunately, blacks in Bahia have historically been relegated to the bottom of the social hierarchy, in spite of the fact that the city is overwhelmingly black. A traveler during the emancipation period noted that Bahia is like "…an African capital, residence of a powerful black prince, in which a population of foreigners, pure whites, lives unnoticed," (Kraay, p. 3). Salvador can therefore be thought of as a contradiction. How is it that there is an overwhelming black population but that the dominant population is at the bottom of the socio-economic hierarchy? In order to provide a foundation to address this question, the treatment of blacks through different time periods is presented.

Colonial Bahia

Colonial Bahia had all of the elements of a thriving city. It was composed by the wealthy merchant families, bondsmen, sugar planter "clans" connected to the government, government, an army garrison, and the lower class (Kraay, p. 6). The wealth of the colony was based on the labor of slaves and those who worked in the sugar industry. The sugar industry rose in the 19th

century due in part to the high prices that resulted from the Haitian Revolution but fell after the mid-1810's. From 1822-1823 a war was waged to expel the Portuguese from Bahia. When the Portuguese left, they also took their capital with them and this lack of capital proved to be detrimental to the sugar industry. The lack of capital coupled with the advancing sugar plantation technology of the Caribbean was too much for Brazil to compete with. Thus, the decline was based on the lack of capital, which led to a lack of modernization that would result in Bahia being developmentally behind other regions (Kraay, p. 6). The abolition of slavery had a profound affect on the Bahian economy, which was reliant upon slave labor to produce its exports.

Post-Colonial Bahia

Africans and Brazilian born Africans or Creoles were treated poorly. The Bahian government had many campaigns to oppress African culture but was only successful at such efforts for short periods of time. From 1810 to 1818 the governor at the time, Count Arcos, advocated the toleration of Afro-Bahian culture in efforts to foster ethnic rivalry between African groups. After his removal, the ruling class reverted back to the extreme oppression of African cultural practices. Although the advocacy of toleration of African culture lasted eight years, it displayed the ambiguous relationship between African culture and the state. In spite of oppression, Afro-Bahian culture continued to survive (Kraay, p. 14).

Prior to the 19th century, many people worked in the agricultural industry and lived in the lower city region, adjacent to the port. By 1890 (just two years after emancipation), Salvador had 174,000 residents. By the early 20th century, there were an estimated 200,000 residents in Salvador. Researchers have calculated that 90% of this population lived in poverty (City of

Salvador, p. 15). Due to the close proximity in time of emancipation in 1888, it can be concluded that most of those in poverty were marginalized, excluded descendants of bondsmen.

Poor treatment of blacks was coupled with the city's economic decline that continued until the 1950's when petrochemical industries located in Salvador, which were also supported by the government. The petrochemical industry and government investment in Salvador allowed the region to partake in the economic miracle that the nation underwent during the Military Dictatorship that last from 1964-1985 (Kraay, p. 7).

Post-Military Regime through Present Bahia

Between 1970 and 1991, the population of Salvador doubled to over 2 million residents. The rapid increase in the population strained Salvador's resources. The problem with the rapid increase in the urban population was that many new residents were in poverty. Over half of the population struggled for survival in the informal economy, as documented by the 1991 IBGE census (Kraay, p. 7). Unemployment and underemployment continue as major issues because they act as a base of exclusion from acquiring skills to be successful in the current market. When one is under- or unemployed, one likely faces struggles to survive, and may look to the informal economy for sustenance and a steady living wage. Participating in the cultural tourism industry can thus provide income that can lead to greater economic stability.

Demographic Information

In 2008, the estimated population of Salvador was 2.8 million people (City of Salvador, p. 13). A major issue in Salvador is low-income housing provision. Overall, the housing for the low-income has been precarious due to the great disparity that exists between those who have and those who have not (City of Salvador, p. 3).

Urbanization Trends

Starting in the 1940's, the time period that the rest of Brazil began its urbanization process, many people living in the surrounding rural areas began migrating to Salvador. To illustrate this point, the population in 1940 was 290,443. By 1950, the population increased to 393,000, which indicates an approximately 3% annual population increase (City of Salvador, p. 15). From the 1950's through the 1980's, the population percentage continued increasing at 5% annually. The problem with the rapid population increase was that new residents were often ill equipped to work in the urban employment sector, because most people only had agricultural skills (City of Salvador, p. 15). The mismatch between skills and employment opportunities contributed to the poverty of the new urban residents.

Due to the lack of income and insufficient government programs to assist them, the poor lived in informal housing. Most of the informal housing situations were the result of publicly owned land being "invaded" (City of Salvador, p. 16). In 1991, 27.8% of the population lived in informal housing but 17% of the informal settlements evaluated were inappropriate for residential uses (City of Salvador, p. 16). Although informal settlements are scattered throughout Salvador, they are concentrated in both the Ferroviario Suburb and the Miolo areas of Salvador. One problem with informal settlements is that they often lack proper infrastructure.

During the 20th century, the economic industry in Salvador changed from an agricultural base to an industrial one. This change has transformed the urban landscape. This caused a population increase, an increase in industrial buildings and employment rates (City of Salvador, p. 14). For example, Petrobras, a leading Brazilian petrochemical company arrived in Salvador at this time.

During the industrialization period, the city began expanding horizontally, in an artificial form, which worsened the living conditions and drained public services (Fernandes, p. 102). The poorest of the population concentrated in the north of the city while the more wealth concentrated in the southern area (Fernandes, p. 102).

Between the 1960's and 1970's, industrialization required that the city provide necessary structures for its development, while social problems that resulted from this growth went unattended (Fernandes, p. 103). Between the 1970's and 1980's, growth continued horizontally, but also included a vertical component. This caused the urban areas to become expensive and inaccessible to the poorest populations (Fernandes, p. 103). As a result, in the 1980's the city grew towards its periphery (Fernandes, p. 103). The informal Miolo neighborhood is located on the periphery.

In the 1990's, the Brazilian national crisis impacted Salvador's urban and social structure because it became integrated with the capitalist industrial system and globalization (Fernandes, p. 105). The problem with this period is that a great part of society was excluded from the economic gains that Salvador received; which reflected the internal structure of the city that suffered from segregation (Fernandes, p. 105). This period fostered a decentralization of the inner city of Salvador, which can be called "anti-urbanization" (Fernandes, p. 106). As most industrial complexes were located outside of the center of the city, most industrial jobs were also located outside of the center. People no longer relied on the inner city for their needs because they could purchase goods near the industrial complexes (Fernandes, p. 106).

In 2004, the industrial sector was the largest component of the state of Bahia's GDP at 48.5%. The service sector provided 40.8% of the GDP while Agriculture representing 10.7%.

Bahia, made 4.9% of the Brazilian economy (IBGE, 2004). In spite of industrialization, the 2010

IBGE census indicated that the incidence of poverty was 35.76% (IBGE, 2010).

Black Culture Perseverance

Black or rather African-based culture has been preserved in Bahia through cultural

elements. Indeed Salvador has developed into a global city that has the capacity to intervene in

the global hierarchy of the concentration power because of its importance to the black Atlantic

and African Diaspora in general (Pinho, p. 48). Bahia has preserved African cultural elements

that seem to have been lost by other locations in the New World. African-based culinary

traditions, religion, dance, and culture in general attract those in search of a home away from

home in Salvador. The perseverance of African cultural elements, due in large part to the high

number of Afro-descendants, makes it a unique location and thus a prime destination for those

seeking African culture.

It is the chosen location that people flock to in efforts to experience black purity because

Bahia holds African traditions that have arguably been "lost" by African Americans (Pinho, p.

54). Due to the cyclical nature of oppression of African cultural elements, in contrast with the

absolute nature of oppression of African culture in the United States, and with the large number

of blacks in Bahia, an arguably "pure" African culture continues (Pinho, p. 54).

Candomblé, an Afro-Brazilian religion based on Yoruba practices (present day Nigeria,

and Benin region) is one element that helps establish the uniqueness of blackness in Brazil due to

its strong connection to Yoruba religious traditions. For example, Dr. Patricia de Santana Pinho

argues that Afro-Bahians have African traditions that African Americans go in search of and

exchange for the modernity that blacks in the US have (Pinho, p. 87). The attraction of Afro-

descendants is not limited to those who live outside of Brazil. Brazilians within Brazil seeking

34

to experience African tradition also look to Bahia for purity as well (Pinho, p. 53). Thus, if one is seeking an African cultural experience, one visits Bahia.

Since the 1970's, African Americans have been on pilgrimages to rediscover "home" (Pinho, p. 50). The most popular "roots" tourist attractions in Bahia are places where one can experience the most pure manifestation of African culture. The historic Ilê Axé Opô Afonjá spiritual center is visited, along with Angolan capoeira studios, and Ilê Aiyê, the arguably most Afrocentric black carnival group, is visited (Pinho, p. 52). Ilê Aiyê was critical to the creation of Afrocentricity in Bahia because it was the first black carnival group in Brazil.

Purity is important in the tourism industry because as noted by Matory, it is an element for which competing cultural producers compete over since exclusivity is most profitable (Matory, p. 145). A cultural group that can establish itself as "pure" can attract more visitors than one that is deemed as commercialized. As cultural attributes have developed as commodities, it is important that authenticity remains a focal point to ensure the preservation of African cultural retentions.

6-CULTURAL TOURISM: A CASE STUDY IN PELOURINHO

Introduction

In 1992, Salvador's Maciel- Pelourinho neighborhood began a massive redevelopment project. The Institute of Artistic and Cultural Patrimony (IPAC) led the project. Over $100 Million US dollars were invested in the project (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). These funds were derived from the privatizing banking system, major highways, ferryboats and power and light companies (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 287). The redevelopment was supposed to physically upgrade and improve the fabric of the neighborhood so that it could attract more tourists in search of an Afro-Brazilian experience. The significance of the project is addressed.

Pelourinho

Pelourinho was selected by UNESCO to be a World Heritage Site in 1985 for many reasons. Salvador was the colonial capital of Brazil until 1763. In fact, the Pelourinho neighborhood, which literally means whipping post, played the double function as the colonial era downtown and the whipping post for African bondsmen. The Pelourinho claims to be the embodiment of the "real" Bahia because it represents the essences of Bahia and arguably Brazil because Salvador is typically characterized as "Brazil's African soul" (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 279). Bahia thus functions as a manifestation of New World African identity because of the vibrancy of its black culture that is clear from the visible retentions of African culture through religion, cuisine, and martial arts.

The reason the neighborhood was selected for redevelopment was that it was previously neglected by the government, and fell into decline (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). As a result, the middle and upper classes did not frequent the area. The neighborhood was

arguably cut-off from the world of the middle and elite classes because of its intimate association with blackness, which continues to receive a negative stigma.

The neighborhood's association with blackness continued well after emancipation. Brazil derives its "vernacular" or rather "folkloric" culture from its African roots (due to the high number of bondsmen it received). Thus it makes sense in light of promoting cultural tourism or rather racial (black) tourism that Pelourinho would be a likely choice for the funneling of enormous amounts of redevelopment funds. The redevelopment of such a historically important, although marginalized place was necessary because it was seemingly overlooked from government investment prior to its redevelopment (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238).

Urban spaces in Brazil are important when discussing the selection of redevelopment projects because they have been used as forums where people have been publicly "sanitized of the white world's denunciation of being infected by non-whites," (Collins, Critique of Anthropology, p. 238). The need to be cleansed is directly associated with the whitening movement because it was thought that non-whites imparted degeneracy on society and culture. Therefore, in the redevelopment of the Pelourinho, a two-fold process was undertaken. First, the locale was actually redeveloped. Second, and as will be discussed later, IPAC has been able to create a "sanitized" Pelourinho (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). This two-fold process is critical to the debate on cultural tourism as a means for CED in Salvador because the same culture that is promoted through tourism and from which lots of finances are generated, is the same culture sanitized and controlled.

Pelourinho's Development

What is important is that although Salvador was the former colonial capital, it was often viewed as backwards by the rest of Brazil because it lacked the industry of Southeastern Brazil

and because it was home to Brazil's blackness. Writer Euclides Da Cunha noted that it was a "barbaric space" that early Brazilian nationalists tried to sanitize to avoid the erosion of civilization that was associated with Latin American nature (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). Therefore, historically Pelourinho was viewed as a socially "improper" place because of its perception as being a barbaric space.

The Pelourinho was construed as improper for many reasons. First, following slavery's end, poor and socially disgraced women found solace here as they gained employment in brothels and as domestics (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 294). Second, it played an integral role in creating intimate relations between white men and non-white women because it provided the space for socially taboo sexual relations to transpire (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 295). This begs one to question why an arguably red light district would be added to UNESCO's World Heritage Site list. Professor John Collins contends that the social function of this type of place and other similar places in Brazil is that they have historically been used to manage relations between Brazil and the global capitalist market (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). The concept of capitalism is of note because capitalism is the system by which the cultural tourism industry current operates in. Capitalism is also the system that has its economic base in slavery and thus is related to racial politics.

In 1967, UNESCO began working to transform Pelourinho into a World Heritage Site. In that process "…the daily activities of its residents became…a cultural product of some value in a neo-liberal marketplace for multicultural difference," (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 238). Between the 1980's and 1990's the presence of NGO's was overwhelming because they were in "the process of producing reports that acted as blueprints for reforms that codified people's habits as culture," (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 295).

During this study period, interns surveyed people's occupation of space, ability to produce this typical Brazilian expressive culture, and household economic activities. IPAC was at this point attempting to put economic value on people's lives to determine how much money would be needed to convince inhabitants to relocate in the redevelopment (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 296). In other words, the residents of the Pelourinho were studied and were on their way to becoming commodities. Some inhabitants would be forced to leave because they fell outside IPAC definitions of what was cultural patrimony (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 296).

At first glance, the preparation for the UNESCO site, and the 1992 redevelopment appear to have the same effect that slavery had on Africans by turning their daily cultural activities into commodities for sale. Thus, both processes can be construed as taking a backward progress. However, as will be discussed, new meanings have been ascribed to African cultural elements, which should be harnessed as a relevant and applicable form of empowerment.

International Pressures

When the world renowned samba reggae group, Olodum, recorded music and went on tour with Paul Simon for the 1988 *Rhythm of the Saints* album, the music and culture of this area received extreme global or rather white, Anglo recognition. Olodum's joint venture with Paul Simon was a turning point in the history of black carnival groups with the rest of society because it proved that there was global commercial viability of such groups as tourist attractions and businesses (Butler, p. 170). International interest was thus increasing due to the rise of Olodum.

Michael Jackson's song "They Don't Really Care About Us" video was also filmed in the Pelourinho and featured Olodum in 1996. Within a decade, Olodum became one of Brazil's most important musical groups because they helped to politicize and convince the Bahian state of

the value of Pelourinho culture (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 287). The African culture of

Bahia and Pelourinho specifically was no longer viewed as completely marginal by the masses

because it had Anglo commercial value attached to it.

The value attached to the African culture in the Pelourinho was coupled with an

economic upsurge in the state of Bahia. Industry arrived in Bahia at the end of the 1970's until

the early 1990's as a result of the Military Regime's attempts to unify the nation and guarantee

low-cost labor. Late industrialization meant that Salvador boomed in the 1980's (Collins,

Critique of Anthropology, p. 240). Blacks benefited from this economic growth but were often

barred from leisure-based associations. In response to discrimination, they were given resolve to

establish and strengthen their own cultural groups like *Olodum* (Collins, *Critique of

Anthropology*, p. 240). Therefore, the racism that blacks faced provided the opportunity to profit

from their own cultural expressions. The cultural manifestations located in the Pelourinho made

it the prime location for redevelopment as a tourist center.

Redevelopment Process

In order to implement what Collins calls the "sanitation" process previously mentioned,

IPAC and the police cleared "undesirable" people out of the Pelourinho. Longtime residents

were forced out and paid indemnifications that averaged between $400 and $800, while those

who resisted were moved at gunpoint by the state police (Butler, p. 170). Those whom IPAC

considered valuable were those (who were formerly researched) who displayed culturally

"valuable" practices and were allowed to remain because they convinced IPAC that they were

able to perform sanctioned versions of Afro-Bahianness (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p.

240).

This had negative outcomes because "…the rapid removal to distant slums of thousands of working people from a historical center in which they were able to survive in ways impossible on Salvador's periphery appeared catastrophic," (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 290). This process was controversial at the most fundamental level because of its social implications.

During the redevelopment process, outside urban planners argued that "…the problem, they agreed contradictorily, was that planners subordinated the needs of…inhabitants to technical, economic, and political criteria," (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 280). This process was called a "Disney" in that an "ethnocide" (or genocide in terms of Vargas) was directed at Afro-Brazilians. Culture that remained in the Pelourinho was determined by IPAC, who acted as agents of the state to recreate a tourist destination to display a level of culture that was tailored to the state's needs to create the most economic benefit (Collins, Cultural Anthropology, p. 280). This is largely problematic because the government usurped the power to generate economic profit by controlling who was allowed to remain in the neighborhood.

The economic profit, when considering racial politics which marginalize blacks, seems connected to the market. Rather, Pelourinho's renewal exemplifies the intersection of race and class in Brazil because it put the poor and powerless against the rich and powerful (Butler, p. 171). As the poor were powerless in this case, the politics surrounding cultural tourism made it arduous, if possible at all, for the funds generated from cultural tourism to funnel down to those who stayed in the neighborhood because the government controlled who was even allowed to remain. Therefore, it can be concluded that Brazilian racial politics and land tenure have influenced cultural tourism (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 282). The relation between the two is strong because if racial politics were different, the cultural tourism and selection of items or people that embodied patrimony would likely be different.

Living Patrimony as a Redevelopment Tool

In light of the government's redevelopment plan, some residents were classified as living packages of patrimony if they embodied characteristics previously researched. Residents could claim to possess and be the sources of characteristics that were perceived to be the tools that produced culture, thus making them the tourist attraction (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 241). This exploited residents because the state relied on them to perform their blackness to make profits. "Residents have come to realize that the state relies [on them] for the production of value on its surveillance of their kinship relations, forms of sexuality and worship, domestic chores and culinary traditions," (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 241). Thus, those commodified likely became aware that they carried value to the government's redevelopment plan because they were a part of the draw for tourists.

During the redevelopment process, those who were able to remain have done so by linking themselves to patrons in the state or by convincing IPAC that they represent Pelourinho history (Collins, *Critique of Anthropology*, p. 239). Those residents that essentially are patrimony are called tombado in Portuguese, which means to be patrimonialized. This status is given to describe the registry in IPAC and UNESCO archives (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 296).

This word comes from the Portuguese verb "tombar which means to crystallize…to fix the form of something, to fall, to knock down, or to drop dead," (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 296). This may imply that those who have this status must remain fixed in form and that the form can be knocked down or dropped dead. Due to the history of racial politics, one cannot help but think that government just may be attempting to kill people who are tombado by forcing them to remain static. However, those who are viewed as tombado may know how to use their

42

status to gain benefits from interactions with tourists to securing resources from the same institutions that oppress them.

Additional Tourist Draws

As another part of the redevelopment scheme, the government founded the Museum of the Black. This museum included only African cultural artifacts (Santos, p. 123). This museum exemplified how the state manipulated the symbolic realm of culture to gain political control and realize economic gains. In being able to realize economic gains from culture, the state was asserting its political control over culture and the value culture has attached to economic development, in particular with the reproduction of a "national culture" that could be marketed by Bahia's tourist industry (Santos, p. 123). This governmental control over culture is problematic because again, the culture presented in the Museum of the Black was only government approved black culture, in which the government could use the museum to sharpen the picture that Brazil was a racial democracy. Thus, tensions developed between public governmental institutions and cultural producers around controlling what was for many producers (in Salvador who are primarily black) a way of life (Santos, p. 125). The state then, has played an uneven role: on one hand it still attempts to control black culture and the finances it generates while at the same time acting as an advocate for those government-approved cultural producers.

This appears to be a huge contradiction for those outside of Brazil. In actuality, the government's actions fit in with the notion of paternalism and clientelistic relations associated with Brazil, like racial inequality. Thus, the valorization of black culture by public authorities must be seen as a re-elaboration of practices that have characterized Brazilian society since the 19th century slave abolition period because they are still not allowing blacks to be liberated since

blacks may not be the final arbiters of their culture. Cultural or rather racial tourism and African

folklore have been dominated by the racial democracy myth as different sectors and levels of the

Brazilian government have exploited this culture in a common form of patrimony.

Post-Redevelopment

The result of redevelopment was "…a fetishization of interior essence that mimicked the

valorizations of culture going on at wider levels," (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p. 296). The

redevelopment project that was supposed to generate cultural tourists and economic development

serves as a narrative of the interplay between racial politics and land tenure. The convergence

between Brazilian patrimony and Bahia's racial heritage is significant because it shows that

IPAC tampered with culture through valorizing some aspects and repressing others (Collins,

Cultural Anthropology, p. 297).   Cultural heritage that is government controlled and approved,

can thus be thought of as the new form of the myth of "racial democracy" because it creates a

picture that is not accurate by controlling what is included (Collins, *Cultural Anthropology*, p.

302). It also robs perspective cultural agents that do not fit into the government norm from

participating in the tourism industry in Pelourinho. Lastly, it is difficult to assess how funds

from tourism are generated since they likely come in forms that may not be quantifiable through

means like the census.

Conclusion

Thus far, the reader has been presented with material to showcase the importance of

African culture to Salvador, Brazil and to the world. Although the numerical value has not been

associated with African culture in this paper, it is arguably high because it makes up the reason

that a significant percentage of the dollars spent in the tourism section of the economy.[4] As

---

[4] If tourists visit to experience the essence of Brazilian culture, and this essence come from African elements, then it
follows that a cultural tourist visiting Bahia is really experiencing African culture.

already mentioned, tourism accounted for 6% of Salvador's earnings (Castro, p. 36) that shows that the relation is correlated.

Once the Pelourinho began its redevelopment, the home of Bahian culture became commodified. Pelourinho, which was formerly overlooked and blighted, was transformed into a major tourist attraction. It seems logical that those cultural agents who produce Afro-Brazilian culture and those whom are commodified would have received congruent economic recompense through the redevelopment project. The reason this has yet to occur can be largely attributed to the nature of race and land tenure in Brazil.

Unfortunately in the case of the Pelourinho redevelopment, this goal was not achieved and most of those forced out were at the bottom of the racial hierarchy. Therefore, generally, those who suffered the brunt of the relationship between race and land tenure were blacks in the Pelourinho redevelopment process. Due to the peculiar method of racial classification in Brazil, it is difficult to attain accurate demographics of the number of those exploited, which is also indicative of the entwinement of racial politics to this issue. Due to the tenuous nature of racial politics and land tenure, using the 1992 redevelopment process as a means of Community Economic Development strategy thus appears to have had mixed-results.

7-CULTURAL TOURISM: UNITED NATIONS APPROACH FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION

The widespread occurrence of poverty has led the United Nations (UN) to establish its eradication by 2015 as one of its Millennium Development Goals (MDG). As Brazil is a member of the UN, it is legally obligated to work towards meeting this determined goal. In order to begin poverty eradication efforts, it is necessary to examine a wide range of solutions.

In a 2004 report, the WTO argued that tourism is a viable poverty alleviation tool (WTO, p. 1 because it provides opportunities for local merchants and small business owners to generate immediate cash. It also allows for flexible employment options for women and youth. The flexibly earned funds are immediately available because tourism products are consumed at the point of production.

The direct interaction between the cultural product producers and consumers allows the opportunity for additional purchases to be made because it fosters human contact (WTO, p. 12). This leads to opportunities for voluntary giving and support of tourism enterprises, which can lead to the stimulation of investment in infrastructure in the location (WTO, p. 22 & Sideris, p. 8). Development of infrastructure in poverty-ridden tourist attraction areas is important to poverty alleviation because it can improve the physical landscape of areas that have often been neglected by local governments.

These often neglected areas have become of interest to tourists due in part to tourists looking for a less commercial experience. The increased interest in less commercial and often "forgotten" places has fostered creation of the term "tourism from below" (Sideris, p. 5). The increased interest here exemplifies a celebration of cultural diversity and cross-cultural understanding that seems to promote these neighborhood and communities. The cultural assets

of ethnic and immigrant neighborhoods' cosmology, food, language, customs, and art can now be valorized as arts of "vital transnational communities that connect the city and the world," (Sideris, p. 6). Although this appears to be a great strategy, promoting culture for consumption may have negative repercussions.

One negative aspect is the packaging of the tourist product since the industry sells culture as a commodity (Sideris, p. 7). When culture is commodified, the danger arises that it will transform into something generic and commercialized. In order for this culture to reap the most profits, it must remain as pure as possible. Therein lies the contradiction- commercializing a cultural product to market it to outsiders, while keeping it authentic so the product will have a unique value. Therefore, care must be taken to educate cultural contributors of maintaining cultural authenticity (Sideris, p. 7).

Another challenge is that the funds are often generated informally, which makes it challenging to quantify them because they are difficult to assess. Against this challenge, the WTO has found that in some countries, these funds can account for 60% of the urban workforce and 20% of the national income (WTO, p. 17). In 2000, tourism was the primary source of foreign exchange earnings in the 49 least developed countries (LDC's). In 2002, global receipts from tourism were $475 billion (WTO, p. 3). By 2020, tourism is projected to create 1.6 billion visitors (UN, p. 21).

Tourism is a principal export for 83% of developing countries and for one third of developing countries (WTO, p. 9). Although Brazil is classified by the WTO as a developing country, and not an LDC, the region of the Northeast and Salvador in particular, especially where there is a concentration of poverty, should be considered as an LDC.

Tourism in Bahia

Cultural tourism, based on Afro-Brazilian cultural retentions, is already a major generator of income in Salvador. In 1984, IPAC found that tourism was the principle base of the economy in Salvador because its earnings made up one-sixth of the city's income (Pinho, Osmundo, p. 10, quoting IPAC 1984). In 2004, the tourist industry earned $1 billion US dollars, accounting for 6.8% of the State of Bahia's gross domestic product (GDP) (Castro, p. 36). To illustrate this point, Salvador received the third highest number of international tourists in 2003, receiving 15.8% of Brazil's visitors (Castro, p. 36). It is highly likely that this is due to the high numbers of tourists that visit Bahia in search of African "roots" experiences.

When one sets foot in Bahia, the colors, sounds, smells and people make one feel like one is in a magical African land. Bahia is the American home of African culture. "Everything that runs, shouts, works, everything that transports and carried is Black," (in Bahia quoted by Pierre Verger) (Pinho, p. 191). One can experience African culture in spite of the oppressive slavery that existed in Bahia because a strong sense of Africa resides in the imaginary in the city's Afro-descendant population (Pinho, p. 24). Thus, one can feel closer to Africa due to the high level of cultural production of Afro-descendants whether this connection is imagined or is in fact real.

The significance of African culture would make any outsider think that since black culture is celebrated, that blacks would have rights that translate to political power and social equity. This "veil" of blackness in Bahia is problematic because it "…wraps a veil of harmony around a reality of conflict and pervasive inequality," (Pinho, p. 185). In actuality, the overwhelming concentration of African descendants is in the lower classes, and the elite class continues to be saturated by non-blacks. The correlation between race and poverty makes race

and class interchangeable (Butler, p. 171). Therefore, blacks make up a large part of the culture of Bahia but the political power they hold is unequal to their visibility and influence in the cultural realm. Appropriate policies are thus needed to insure equitable distribution of funds generated from cultural tourism.

Policy Formulation Strategy

In 2010, the UN released a report on the Creative Economy. The "creative economy" is an evolving concept based on the economic potential of creative cultural assets (UN, p. 10). The creative economy can have the two-fold effect of creating income while promoting cultural diversity. It is comprised of a set of culturally knowledge-based activities because it is based on creative industries that come from cultural groups (UN, p. 10).

Cultural goods and services are unique from other commodities because their value is economic, communal, and cultural (UN, p. 5). Cultural goods are also able to receive some UNESCO legal protection, thus they have the ability to sustain legal and economic protections through intellectual property and copyright law (UN, p. 5). Most important about the UN report is that it argues that the "market does not address socio-economic issues. Policies that foster development should combine both policy to lessen socio-economic disparity and the market," (UN, p. xix). As such, development strategy must account for social and cultural issues (UN, p. 36).

Measuring Economic Impact of Culture

In order to assess the great economic contribution of culture, the UN analyzes various factors. They look at "the direct contribution of the sector to output, value added, incomes and employment and further through the indirect and induced effects caused, for example, by the expenditures of tourists visiting the city to experience its cultural attractions," (UN, p. 12). Next,

the gross domestic product (GDP) is calculated by getting the sum of the value added of all industries (UN, p. 23). The GDP is the standard measure of the size of national economies. They find a problem when attempting to calculate the value added by individual creative industries because figures are not generally available from government sources. Therefore, the lack of official data points makes it difficult to estimate the creative economy's contribution to world output (UN, p. 23).

Additionally, the UN argued that its own sponsored UNESCO Cultural Heritage Sites are major sources of revenue (UN, p. 21). The problem with determining the value from these sites is that they are often not reported. As a result, the UN has determined that the best way to measure the economic impact of creative economies is through measuring international trade (UN, p. 23).

Quantifying the Cultural Tourism Sector

The creative economy industry occupies a unique space in the economic market because it impacts culture. Thus, in formulating policy, quantitative data are important but not the only data that should be analyzed (UN, p. 73). Additionally, the creative economy is a new industry, and in order to determine other factors to be addressed, more institutional work and organizational work should be carried out (UN, p. 73). The UN argues that due to its newness, it is challenging to determine analysis points for how to measure the creative economy (UN, p. 73). Therefore, they contend that a "fresh look" is required to gain full understanding of the dynamic of this emerging sector to present its economic contributions both at national and global levels (UN, p. 73). This fresh look that the UN proposes is presented below.

They argue that if data were available, four groups of economic indicators could be applied:

1-Primary: measures direct contribution to the economy using GDP and employment;

2-Secondary: measures indirect quantifiable contribution such as activities in the industry that are spin-offs in other sectors;

3-Tertiary: measures the direct yet less quantifiable contributions resulting from innovations in the creative industries that spill over into other sectors;

4-Quarternary: measures indirect, non-quantifiable contributions to the quality of life, education and cultural identity (UN, p. 77).

Many methodological approaches may be taken to provide sufficienct data for the four areas. Most common to the economic assessment model of the approaches are industrial organization, value-chain, locational, copyright and intellectual property, and contract theories (UN, p. 77). Although these means already exist to provide data points, they may be inadequately suited for the creative economy because they were not created for application to this industry analysis (UN, p. 99). The history of measuring cultures may be appropriate in determining what this "fresh look" should entail.

Cultural policy has traditionally been driven by welfare principles and advocacy. As such, it was not required for it to be evaluated in economic terms (UN, p. 96). The value associated with the creative economy comes from trading products that generally hold low material value, but that have high intellectual property value (UN, p. 100). In order for the industry of generally low cost items sold during cultural tourism transactions to be taken seriously, the demands for funds toward the industries development should be based on its efficiency as an economic development indicator (UN, p. 96). Without the economic value system in place to conduct proper analysis, it is trying for industry actors to gain resources for

this industry (UN, p. 96). Whatever strategy is found to be best to assess this industry will eventually provide a solution towards both the alleviation and eradication of poverty and inequality (UN, p. 34).

The UN framework suggests that a possible broad perspective is required in order to quantify cultural tourism and possibly also to promote it. What is clear from the UN report is that cultural tourism seems to be a helpful tool for poverty alleviation. Poverty alleviation, income generation included, is a compacted issue because it involves examining the history of a locale in conjunction with the economy, and arguable employment and educational opportunities that currently exist for those in poverty. Thus, it requires a country to take a look at its successes and failures with regards to those impoverished. This may be challenging when the majority of those in poverty have been marginalized as a result of slavery because it may lead the country into admitting their problem is directly connected to racial inequality. Herein is where the difficulty lies because nation-states may not want to admit that racial inequality exists in a place they may believe to be a racial democracy.

8-APPLYING THE UN FRAMEWORK TO SALVADOR:

RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED

Tourism in Salvador is an already important contributor to the state's economy. In 2004, the tourist industry earned $1 billion US dollars, accounting for 6.8% of the State of Bahia's gross domestic product (GDP) (Castro, p. 36). As long as it continues to grow its sector, it will continue on a viable economic development option. The review of the framework as set forth by the UN, the funds already generated from tourism, in conjunction with the result of Pelourinho's redevelopment indicate that while there are opportunities to capitalize on cultural tourism as a means of economic development, the long-standing issues of racial inequality and land tenure may require urgent attention. The opportunity lies in Salvador being able to generate more funds from cultural tourism through marketing and outreach campaigns. The funds generated from increased tourism can then be funneled into a system that can ensure that cultural agents receive congruent recompense from their participation in the industry, and into programs that can be aimed at lessening racial inequality and improving the housing conditions for the impoverished.

Policies and programs that address racial inequality and land tenure will be critical to the process of ensuring that black cultural agents will receive their fair share from the industry because it appears that issues other than the economics of tourism have negatively impacted the funds already received. As this study has presented, racial inequality is embedded in the structure of Brazilian society so it is likely that it will take time to disband the networks that support racial inequality, but with increased education, it is likely that racial inequality can be diminished.

The outcome of racial equality and funds generated from tourism being properly funneled to cultural agents to eradicate poverty will require consistent efforts by the stakeholders here, who should hold the tourism industry at both the city and state level accountable.

Recommendations

To Cultural Producers and Stakeholders

1-Cultural Production Must Maintain Cultural Authenticity

Based on findings by Sideris and Matory, in order for culture to continue to be profitable, it must maintain authenticity (Sideris, p. 7 & Matory, p. 145, 147). The economic power associated with purity is the basis for this competition for clients and is wielded for the acquisition of more clients, when exclusivity is most profitable. Hence, it is of tantamount importance that cultural authenticity is maintained because one's profits are directly correlated with cultural authenticity and purity. This can be executed by the cultural agents being educated on the detrimental effects of commercialization, coupled with conscious efforts to maintain cultural authenticity.

To City and State Level Governmental Cultural Agencies

2-Funds Generated from Cultural Tourism Must Reach the Impoverished

Through the Institute of Artistic and Cultural Patrimony (IPAC), and other governmental sponsored tourist agencies, the government was able to heavily influence who gets access to Pelourinho, and thus today determines which cultural agents will receive economic benefit from cultural tourists. As such, the local governments should craft policy that addresses the inequalities between cultural producers and the politically powerful elite. When cultural agents get congruent economic benefit for their cultural contributions, the process of equity will begin.

Federal Ministry of Tourism

<u>3-Cultural Tourism Policies Must Address Race, Land Tenure, Equity, In Conjunction with</u>

<u>Policies Set Forth by the UN</u>

In keeping in line with the UN MDG's, Brazil must make efforts to develop policies that will meet these goals by 2015. Poverty is a multi-layered issue that incorporates more than economic factors. If economic factors are the only elements that are considered in policy creation, poverty will certainly persist. Therefore, the next step may be to craft appropriate policies that address both race and land tenure, to achieve a more equitable distribution of funds generated from cultural tourism. In order to address both compacted issues, a starting point may be for the nation-state to acknowledge the inequitable results that both factors have created. Additionally, the state may find benefits if creates a set of short-term policy objectives that ensure that racial politics refrain from the further exploitation of cultural producers.

Cultural Producers, City and State Government Cultural Agencies, and Federal Ministry of Tourism

<u>4- Inter-Ministerial Cooperation is Necessary</u>

In order for the city and state to create and implement policies to address racial inequality, land tenure, and ensuring that cultural agents are receiving proper compensation, various agencies will have to cooperate, due to the complex nature of the issue. Complex problems deserve complex solutions. Both horizontal and vertical agencies can help provide accountability and strengthen the inter-agency network (Sideris, p. 39). For example, horizontal collaboration can provide the framework for stakeholders, cultural agents, and local business owners in order to present a unified front and to resist networks that will exploit blacks. Vertical cooperation can foster governmental agency support to enhance awareness and even promote

cultural tourism as a means of economic development at a greater level, leading to more exposure and hence more profits from tourism (Sideris, p. 40).

Lessons Learned

Salvador may have a long road to travel before the deeply seated problems of racial politics and land tenure can adequately be addressed in efforts to reduce poverty through cultural tourism's current and future financial gain. In spite of this probable journey, there is potential for change and for policies to exist that can be gateways towards the solution.

Infrastructure that supports the creative economy can be strengthened; appropriate copyright legislation can be drafted that will ensure that cultural agents have a monopoly over their products to earn increased profits; cultural authenticity can be maintained; and finally the fundamental cultural resources that the creative economy depends on can be protected (UN, p. 229). Work to create the proceeding policy measure can only be realized if various agencies cooperate. The underlying objective of the policy should be the creation and implementation of a long-term plan that addresses the priorities of this sector for Salvador, based on advantages that will likely result from the plan's implementation (UN, p. 260).

If policies regarding cultural tourism can be properly executed in Salvador, funds can be allocated in a more equitable fashion. If cultural agents and stakeholders hold the local and state tourism industries accountable to ensure that funds are evenly distributed, it is likely that cultural tourism can be one of the vehicles by which Brazil can meet its MDG to the UN. Additionally, the federal government may also create and implement measures to ensure that cultural attributes maintain authenticity and that cultural tourism is promoted through the nation's widespread networks. If all can cooperate, it is likely not only that poverty will be alleviated, but also that

Afro-Brazilians will have more economic and political power, and that a more just Brazil will be a reality.

9-BIBLIOGRAPHY

Amar, Paul. (2009). Savings Rio's "Cradle of Samba": Outlaw Uprisings, Racial Tourism and the Progressive State in Brazil." In Lisa Knauer and Daniel Walkowitz (Eds.), *Contested Histories in Public Space: Memory, Race and Nation.* Durham: Duke University Press.

Blakely, Edward and Ted Bradshaw. (2002). *Planning Local and Economic Development: Theory and Practice, 3rd Ed.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Blakely, Edward and William Goldsmith. (1992). *Separate Societies.* Temple: Temple University Press.

Butler, Kim. (1998). Afterword: Ginga Baiana—the Politics of Race, Class, Culture, and Power in Salvador, Bahia. In Hendrik Kraay (Ed.), *Afro-Brazilian Culture and Politics: Bahia, 1790's to 1990's*. New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.

Castro, Armando Alexandre. (2005). Turismo e Carnaval na Bahia. *Instituto Virtual de Turismo* (www.ivt-rj.net).

City of Salvador, Bahia. (2008). *Plano Municipial de Habitacao de Salvador: 2008-2025*. Salvador de Bahia, Brazil: Perfeitura Municipial Do Salvador Secretaria Municipial da Habitacao (SEHAB).

Collins, John. (2008). Public Health, Patronage and National Culture: The Resuscitation and Commodification of Community Origins in Neoliberal Brazil. *Critique of Anthropology*, Vol. 28 (2), pp. 237-255.

Collins, John. (2008). But What if I Should Need to Defecate in Your Neighborhood, Madame: Empire, Redemption, and the "Tradition of the Oppressed" in a Brazilian World Heritage Site. *Cultural Anthropology,* Vol. 23 (2), pp. 279-328.

Dos Santos, Jocelio. (1998). A Mixed-Race Nation: Afro-Brazilians and Cultural Policy in Bahia, 1970-1990. In Hendrik Kraay (Ed.), *Afro-Brazilian Culture and Politics: Bahia, 1790's to 1990's*. New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.

Eldridge, Albert. (1997). *Favelas in Rio: Personal Accounts and Policy Implications*. Thesis Submitted to UCLA for M.A. in Architecture, Dana Cuff, Chair.

Freyre, Gilberto. (1986). *Mansions and Shanties: The Making of Modern Brazil.* Translated by Harriet de Ons. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Fernandes, Rosali Braga. (2003). *Las Politicas de la Vivienda en la Ciudad de Salvador y los Procesos de Urbanizacion Popular en caso del Cabula*. Feira de Santana: Universidade Estadual de Feira de Santana.

IBGE (Brazilian Census). (2004). List of Brazilian States by GDP.

IBGE (Brazilian Census). (2010). City of Salvador Demographic Information Summary
http://www.ibge.gov.br/cidadesat/link.php?codmun=292740.

Kraay, Hendrick. (1998). The Politics of Race in Independence-Era Bahia: The Black Militia
Officers of Salvador, 1790-1840. In Hendrik Kraay (Ed.), *Afro-Brazilian Culture and
Politics: Bahia, 1790's to 1990's*. New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.

Lewis, John Lowell. (1992). *Ring of Liberation: Deceptive Discourse in Brazilian Capoeira*.
Chicago & London, UK: University of Chicago Press.

Matory, J. Lorand. (2005). *Black Atlantic Religion: Tradition Transnationalism, and Matriarchy
in the Afro-Brazilian Candomblé*, Princeton & Oxford: Princeton University Press.

Ministry of Culture Website (http://www.turismo.gov.br/turismo/home.html)

Perlman, Janice. (1976). *The Myth of Marginality.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Pinho, Osmondo S. de Araujo. (1998, Feb.). "A Bahia no Fundamental": Notas Para Uma
Interpretacao Do Discurso Ideologico Da Baianidade. *Revista Brasileira de Ciencias
Sociais.* Vol. 13 (36) Sao Paulo, Brazil.

Pinho, Patricia. (2010). *Mama Africa*: *Reinventing Blackness in Bahia.* Translated by Elena
Langdon. Durham & London: Duke University Press.

Sideris, Anastasia Loukaitou (Principal Investigator), Konstantina Soureli, Cristina Ortiz, Karen
Mack & Anne McCauley. (2009, July). Cultural Tourism as an Economic Development
Strategy for Ethnic Neighborhoods: Experiences of the Uncommon LA Project.

Telles, Edward. (2004). *Race in Another America*. Princeton & Oxford: Princeton University
Press.

United Nations. (2010). *Creative Economy Report: 2010. Creative Economy: A Feasible
Development Option.* United Nations Development Program and United Nations
Conference on Trade and Development.

Vargas, Joao Costa. (2010). *Never Meant to Survive: Genocide and Utopias in Black Diaspora
Communities.* Plymouth, UK: Rowman & Littlefield.

World Tourism Organization. (2004, March). *Tourism and Poverty Alleviation:
Recommendations for Action* (prepared by Richard and Jackie Denman). Madrid, Spain:
World Tourism Organization.