

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Monumental Mobility: The Memory Work of Massasoit. By Lisa Blee and Jean O'Brien

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7hn7k7xv>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 44(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Ong, Josephine Faith

Publication Date

2020-03-01

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

racial ideology of *mestizaje*. However, she interrogates claims that rigidly (and perhaps too reductively) position US colonialism as acting through the dispossession of land for the elimination of Native peoples, while framing Latin American colonialism as exclusively acting by extracting resources and labor. The realities are much less neatly defined: in Latin America, for example, the extraction of resources extends to the dispossession of land, which in turn facilitates the elimination of Indigenous People. Speed clarifies these complex realities through the experiences of the *vulneradas*, whose narratives in *Incarcerated Stories* demonstrate that Indigenous Mexicans and Central Americans are exposed to heightened violence and targeted for death both in Latin America and in the United States.

When Indigenous Peoples cross colonial borders, Indigenous identities do not simply vanish, nor does settler violence end, Speed contends. Indigenous migrant women endure structures of violence and premature death that are part of a colonial thread interwoven throughout the hemisphere. This part of the book's conversation advances theories of racial triangulation proposed by scholars such as Eve Tuck, K. Wayne Yang, and Jodi Byrd. Speed's analysis, alongside Byrd's concept of the *arrivant*, complicates monolithic approaches to the figure of the migrant by demonstrating precisely how the vulnerability of Indigenous migrants remains conditioned by violences that exceed the boundaries of any one settler-capitalist state.

Incarcerated Stories is a compelling book rooted in the raw testimonies of Indigenous women and the multitude of systems that have constructed their vulnerability. The contributions are vast and fruitful. Speed urgently reminds us to place analyses of Indigenous migrants within the interdisciplinary rubric of Indigenous studies, rather than relegating them solely to the narrow parameters of immigration and border studies. By extension, the stories of the *vulneradas* push us to understand ICE detention as settler space, although it is often not theorized as such. *Incarcerated Stories* provides a nuanced approach that enriches existing conversations on Latinx migrant women and state violence, including those provided by Eithne Lubhéid, Martha Escobar, and Rosa-Linda Fregoso. Finally, Speed eloquently demonstrates that theories of settler colonialism and neoliberalism cannot be detached from one another; they must both be examined as mutually constitutive logics of state formation.

Cynthia Martinez
University of California, Riverside

Monumental Mobility: The Memory Work of Massasoit. By Lisa Blee and Jean O'Brien. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2019. 288 pages. \$90.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper; \$22.99 electronic.

In *Monumental Mobility: The Memory Work of Massasoit*, Indigenous studies historians Jean O'Brien (White Earth Ojibwe) and Lisa Blee trace the memorialization, from early-twentieth-century Plymouth, Massachusetts to Salt Lake City, Utah, of the figure of Massasoit, the Wampanoag chief who supposedly welcomed the Pilgrims

to Plymouth in 1621. The authors argue that Massasoit's memorialization manifests settler-colonial desires to erase and replace Indigenous Peoples and their histories, supporting their thesis with archival analysis, oral history interviews, and ethnographic visits to memorials dedicated to Massasoit. *Monumental Mobility* builds upon Blee's and O'Brien's previous scholarship about public history and settler commemorations, as they consider multiple temporal, spatial, and political spaces that recount a narrative framing Massasoit as a passive Wampanoag chief.

Monumental Mobility itself is organized by various theatrical themes. Chapter 1, entitled "Casting," considers the creation of the first Massasoit statue by Utah-born sculptor Cryus E. Dallin, who was motivated by his desires to civilize Native peoples and assimilate them into US settler society. O'Brien and Blee also consider the figure of Wampanoag chief 8sâmeeqan, who served as the model for the first Massasoit statue, whose alliance with English settlers motivated Dallin and his commissioners, a fraternal order called the Improved Order of Red Men. In chapter 2, "Staging," the authors analyze 1921 Plymouth-based newspapers that announced the unveiling of the Massasoit statue on Cole's Hill in Massachusetts. In "Distancing," O'Brien and Blee unpack both settler and Indigenous narratives found in the museum "Plimoth Plantation" as well as the 2004 PBS series *Colonial House*. The final chapter, "Marketing," critiques the function of settler public performances in reinforcing settler control over political and economic capital, such as the play in the Plymouth-based Jenney Museum's tour.

The main argument of *Monumental Mobility*—that Massasoit's various memorializations continue to perform settler histories and "superiority"—is reinforced by the authors' theatrical chapter themes. Throughout, O'Brien and Blee center a multi-scalar analysis that traces how Massasoit served as a conduit to inform and reinforce the settler state at the national, local, and individual levels. While monuments themselves may be erected in one place, O'Brien and Blee consider how Massasoit's image relies on temporally fluid, spatially transportable images of Native submissiveness and include various historical contexts that begin with 8sâmeeqan's 1621 alliance with British settlers—framed as evidence for British settlers' cordial relations with Wampanoag people, which later helped America come into being as a nation—and end with contemporary understandings and commemorations about Massasoit.

With archival and oral history research that reveals how multiple historical and contemporary actors have produced different cultural meanings of Massasoit, the authors trace how the Massasoit memorials shape both the monument's sponsors, such as lawyer John W. Converse's 1915 proposal to memorialize Massasoit, as well as its contemporary viewers' perceptions about Indigenous-settler relations across the United States, including Brigham Young University students and tourists who regularly visit Plymouth. For example, O'Brien and Blee trace different tours of Plymouth, one by the Jenney Museum founder, Leo Martin, who prioritized patriotic narratives about pilgrims, and the other by the Cherokee Nation citizen Tim Turner, who centered Wampanoag histories and understandings of Plymouth (chapter 4).

Focusing on Massasoit as a settler-colonial symbol rather than a historical figure helps the authors trace historical connections between different time periods and places that range from early-twentieth-century Plymouth in chapter 1, to a 1977 suburban shopping mall in Evergreen Park, Illinois in chapter 2. O'Brien and Blee also trace how the Massasoit statue operates "as a site of intervention, an opportunity to disrupt settler memory and install an alternative temporal consciousness" that erases Indigenous historical and contemporary acts of resistance (203). In this way, O'Brien and Blee's analysis disrupts narratives of settler-colonial progress and modernity that is devoid of Native peoples, save for memories of their contributions and sacrifices to the seventeenth- to nineteenth-century formation of the US settler state.

The authors' analysis grounds the importance of Wampanoag people's place-based context through their critical reading of settler archives like Massasoit's monuments, interviews with Wampanoag cultural leaders like Darius Coombs, and framing of Massasoit as a settler-colonial conception. Consequently, O'Brien and Blee reveal how settler histories rely on the historical narrative of Massasoit's collaborations with English settlers, rather than the historical experiences and struggles of 8sâmeeqan himself. In this way, O'Brien and Blee emphasize Indigenous genealogical ties to place that the settler state constantly tries to erase through the invalidation of Wampanoag historical experiences or commodify through an emphasis on British settlers' perspectives about 8sâmeeqan's 1621 alliance.

O'Brien and Blee describe how Wampanoag and other Native organizers contest settler-colonial erasure by staging acts of protest that caused the Plimouth Plantation to create the Wampanoag Homesite (144), or create Indigenous monuments that instead remind viewers about historical and ongoing acts of Native genocide (135). Grounded in Wampanoag cultural meanings and histories, O'Brien and Blee astutely critique the role public history plays in maintaining settler colonialism's systematic, intended erasure and replacement of Indigenous People across the United States. By displaying how 8sâmeeqan as a Wampanoag historical figure was commodified into the mobile image of Massasoit, the authors show how settler colonialism relies on public performances of Native collaboration, rather than historical memories of Native survivance and resistance.

All in all, *Monumental Mobility* is a striking book that critiques the role US settler-colonial imaginaries and desires play in Massasoit's memorialization. Whether it is a Massasoit memorial in the Utah capitol building, or a Jenney Museum tour of Plymouth, O'Brien and Blee effectively trace how public historical narratives consolidate settler-colonial erasure and control, but can nevertheless be deconstructed and resisted through their emphasis on Indigenous actions and histories. *Monumental Mobility* is an important work for scholars who study Indigenous performances and histories.

Josephine Faith Ong
University of California, Los Angeles