

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

American Indians in the Marketplace: Persistence and Innovation among the Menominees and Metlakatlangs, 1870-1920. By Brian C. Hosmer.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7c77b3fz>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hauptman, Lawrence M.

Publication Date

2000-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

spirits of the dead (*opía*) love *guayaba* fruit and still dance with the living in the ancient *areito* (present-day Danza del Cordón). We can reconfirm the traditional use of sacred tobacco and copal-pom among contemporary Cuban *campesinos* and about the continuing practice of burying tri-cornered icons in the four corners of cropping fields to call forth the fertility of the yucca crop.

Duke University's Latin American Studies Program provides a valuable service through its Latin America in Translation series, which produced this classic text for the first time in English. As a result, scholars, as well as Caribbean indigenous descendents living abroad, will have improved access to a fundamental reference work on Caribbean Native origins.

Arrom—scholar, teacher, elder—is the twentieth century's gift to the understanding of Caribbean origins. Everything this maestro has studied and analyzed he has clarified. Arrom's scholarly career has been one of vigorous purpose for over half a century. Duke or some other publishing company should consider translating his other classic Caribbean work, *Mitología y artes prehispánicas en las Antillas*, which further corroborates much of his linguistic and historical research on the *Account* to many of the exquisite Taino pieces found in major museums.

I am ever thankful to have Arrom on tape discussing some of these pieces at New York's National Museum of the American Indian. I can report that he handled the ancient statuettes with great care and respect; even with a spiritual *carino* or tenderness. He sat for a session with the Deminan, main creator twin; he cradled his mother, Itiba Cahubaba, Great Bleeding Mother, explaining common elements. "It is a great honor," Arrom said, "to be with these Taino ancestors" (National Museum of the American Indian, video collection, 11 July 1995, videocassette).

For some people, Pané's *Account of the Antiquities of the Indians* may simply represent an old piece of writing about the primitive indigenous inhabitants of the Antilles. Others who are more studied appreciate the work for its ethnological and historical quality and launch increasing scholarship in its wake. In a generous and sincere collaboration across time, space, and language, Pané and Arrom are great cosmic partners, appreciated by ongoing generations for deciphering the key to the origins of our diverse Caribbean cultures and peoples; original intimations of who we are and who we need to be.

José Barreiro
Cornell University

American Indians in the Marketplace: Persistence and Innovation among the Menominees and Metlakatans, 1870–1920. By Brian C. Hosmer. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1999. \$35 cloth.

Brian C. Hosmer's book is one of the better studies I have read in the past decade. Hosmer, assistant professor of history at the University of Wyoming, has made good use of the records of the National Archives, the Public Archives of Canada, and the State Historical Society of Wisconsin. He also

conducted fieldwork and interviews among the Menominees and Tsimshians. His writings show his familiarity with the diverse economic theories about dependence and self-sufficiency. Hosmer's book is divided into two sections of four chapters each on the two communities; the work is well-written and totally integrated. The opening chapter of each section provides an effective overview of these Indians' beliefs, social and political systems, and early histories of Euro-American contact.

Hosmer challenges the generally held notion that western-market capitalism, which rewards individual behavior, simply challenged and corroded Indian community values. By focusing on the Menominee and Tsimshian experiences, Hosmer maintains that these Indians were "not so mystified by this economic and cultural phenomenon" but were "understandably concerned about its implications" (p. xi). Both the Menominee and the Tsimshian were not simply victimized by the evils of world capitalism; each creatively "explored means to conform economic change to their needs" (p. xi). The author insists that these Indians "engaged the market in a complex dialogue" and "attempted to forge accommodations with it" (p. xi).

Long before 1870, as Hosmer shows, the Menominee and the Tsimshian were frequently reinventing themselves. By 1876, the Menominee timber industry was harvesting 24 million feet of lumber a year. Hosmer shows that these Indian loggers, nevertheless, "respected established leadership, operated according to clan and band ties and accepted the idea that some profits must filter down to the collective community" (p. 56). Support for the expansion of Menominee logging after 1890, with its increased desire for profits, intersected with the conviction that reservation timber belonged to the entire Menominee Nation rather than to individual Indian lumberjacks. Yet with expansion the successful ad hoc Menominee logging industry was soon transferred to the control of white outsiders, and formal regulations set wages, restricted the use of logging funds, and allowed for the appointment of supervisors, most of whom were non-Indian. Apart from this development, the author also suggests that the Menominee escaped allotment because Wisconsin lumber interests saw the advantages of keeping the Menominee Reservation in tact, since it would facilitate the purchase of timber through a tribal unit rather than through individual Indian allottees, some of whom were experienced logging contractors who might strike hard bargains. Thus Hosmer challenges our widely held opinions about allotment by maintaining that some white businessmen were against Indian fee-simple title, promoting tribal sovereignty to facilitate the transfer of resources, preventing competition and maximizing profits.

Then Hosmer focuses on the political careers of Mitchell Oshkenaniew and Reginald Oshkosh in leading the Menominee from the 1880s through World War I. Oshkenaniew helped create a fifteen-member business committee in 1904 that replaced the traditional role of the hereditary chiefs council. With the backdrop of the national debate over corruption and conservation in the progressive era, and faced with a horrendous cyclone that blew down 25 to 40 million board feet of timber on the reservation, Oshkosh, a man of prominent lineage, on a platform of restoring traditional values and guarding

collective welfare, helped overturn the 1904 changes. He did away with the business committee in 1908 and censured and excluded Oshkenaniew from representing the Menominee. Eventually in 1913, Oshkenaniew was rehabilitated, and a revised tribal business committee was reestablished. This internal battle between 1904 and 1913, Hosmer points out, largely was in response to congressional acts that seriously affected Menominee self-sufficiency and subsequently relegated these Indians to the status of common laborers. To Hosmer, the Menominee “performed a delicate balancing act” throughout the period, attempting to “conform to certain fundamental values” (p. 106). In a highly complex way, the community engaged in a “spirited debate over the consequences of economic change”; “it would be a mistake to characterize this as a zero-sum game, where one set of values overcame another, where the modern displaced the traditional” (pp. 106–107).

The author then focuses on the Tsimshian of British Columbia. He insists that Tsimshians were equally adaptable people, drawing on their “long history of coastal and inland exchange kinship links with partners and ‘suppliers’ and a facility for integrating novel goods to secure an upper hand over trading relationships” (p. 123). Unlike the Menominee section, this narrative’s focus shifts to the influence of a white man, the Anglican missionary William Duncan who founded Metlakatla, which became a successful refuge as a religious enclave as well as a sustainable economic experiment.

Tsimshians fled there to escape the ravages of alcohol, dependence, smallpox, and squalor found at Fort Simpson. The Indians were not simply passive receptors of Christianity, but maintained many of their established resource-gathering patterns. Metlakatla flourished with its diversified economy. Besides fishing, hunting, and gathering, new industries were encouraged, such as canning, forestry industries, smithwork, shoe-making, and gardening. Duncan’s contacts with the Church Missionary Society and his initial favorable relations with the provincial government of British Columbia helped fund the experiment and provide grants for new homes and further economic development.

Hosmer points out that this brought more and more Tsimshians to the community. Importantly, Duncan’s leadership paralleled traditional Tsimshian society since “legitimate leadership rested on the ability to provide a stable social environment,” precisely what Duncan offered (p. 150). Hosmer also points out that even lower-status individuals “benefited [at Metlakatla] from social and economic arrangements that distributed goods widely and without regard to prior associations” (p. 157). Thus, Hosmer concludes that the Tsimshian mission experience at Metlakatla produced the ethnogenesis of a new “tribe.”

Duncan understood that his Metlakatla mission experiment depended on good wages and tolerance. He knew not to push the Tsimshian too fast toward Christian conversion. Consequently, the missionary found himself increasingly under attack by more zealous authorities, including the Anglican bishop. Hosmer points out that the white power structure’s reactions to Duncan was also caused by his long-time defense of Metlakatla’s land base, with land claims that extended fifty square miles. Hence, Duncan,

although hailed for more than two decades by religious and governmental officials, now became *persona non grata* in British Columbia, leading him to found a new mission, New Metlakatla, in Alaska, and relocate some of his flock there in 1891. He was aided by Henry Solomon Wellcome, an American chemist and philanthropist who wrote the polemic *The Story of Metlakatla*, and helped raise substantial moneys for a new successful mission experiment. The result was a new mission church, homes, a store, a lumber mill, and a salmon cannery. Despite the communal nature of New Metlakatlan's industrial activities, some individual Tsimshian entrepreneurs operated their own businesses there, albeit under Duncan's "guidance."

Soon, however, the New Metlakatrans faced rivalry with commercial canneries and the powerful and politically connected Alaska Packers Association. With this competition, poor salmon runs, and Duncan's inability to delegate authority over successful Tsimshian entrepreneurs, who he had educated, the missionary closed down the mill and cannery in 1912, and six years later he died. In the end, the paternalistic missionary could not understand the Indians' desire for self-determination despite his own significant efforts in training the Indians in this direction. Thus, the Menominee and Tsimshian emerged into the twentieth century significantly different, but still Native American. At the end of his excellent book, Hosmer concludes: "To an important degree, both societies found in economic development a way to preserve unity, independence, and indeed survival" (p. 219).

Laurence M. Hauptman

State University of New York, New Paltz

The Apache Diaries: A Father-Son Journey. By Grenville Goodwin and Neil Goodwin. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000. 284 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

It is difficult to put this book down. It reads like a novel, but it is entirely non-fiction. Never would I have expected that a father's diary, used as a map template to guide a series of journeys and diaries created by his son years later, would make for such captivating reading. A reader does not have to be an Apachean scholar to appreciate this story.

Grenville Goodwin, from a privileged eastern family, was a maverick who lived his life on his own terms and did what he wished, often without parental consent when he was young or without proper academic credentials as he grew slightly older. Sadly, his days numbered far too short. He died in 1940, in his thirty-third year, when his son Neil was only a few months old. In his short life, however, Grenville produced work on Arizona Apache that is highly regarded in scholarly realms even today. He reinvented ethnographic fieldwork, not out a sense of academic obligation, but from the knowledge that living side-by-side with Apachean people and learning their language and lifeways was a most effective ethnographic method.