

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha, or Red Jacket. Edited by Granville Ganter.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7786r6rs>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Black, Jason Edward

Publication Date

2007

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

protagonists dealing with believable mysteries that incorporate Native American cultural and spiritual tension. Although D. L. Birchfield is an award-winning novelist, having won the Western Writers of America Spur Award for his novel *Field of Honor*, he misfires with his first mystery.

Susan L. Rockwell
Rio Salado College

The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha, or Red Jacket. Edited by Granville Ganter. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2006. 296 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha is an outstanding exemplar of an American Indian anthology of discourse—both oral and written. Granville Ganter has painstakingly researched the public discourse of Red Jacket (Seneca) within several local, state, and national archival collections. Concomitantly, Ganter has chronologically located sixty-seven of Red Jacket's key rhetorical engagements at the interstices of both political and cultural contexts. The end result is a well-organized, responsibly investigated, and fulsome account of "a formidable diplomat and one of the most famous Native American orators of the nineteenth century" (xxiv).

One of the finest offerings of *The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* is the methodology called upon in the service of gathering authoritative texts. Ganter's justifications for choosing the collection's discourse are admirable. Fully admitting to the difficulties in locating so-called authentic texts subject to "a variety of honest transcription and transmission errors," he presents the earliest and most primary sources of Red Jacket's rhetoric (xvii). Instead of relying solely on the typical American State Papers collections, the National Archives, and Library of Congress records, Ganter delves deeper into local archives in New York, Massachusetts, and Ottawa, Canada—sites that the Seneca Nation called, and still calls, home. Ganter checks primary discourse against extant eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century secondary collections. This approach differs significantly from prototypical Native rhetorical anthologies relied upon by scholars of discursive studies. Less conscientious collections that fail to account for textual reliability include W. C. Vanderwerth's *Indian Oratory* (1971); Lee Miller's *From the Heart: Voices of the American Indian* (1995); Wayne Moquin and Charles Van Doren's *Great Documents in American Indian History* (1995); Peter Nabokov's *Native American Testimony* (1999); and Bob Blaisdell's *Great Speeches By Native Americans* (2000).

Substantively, Ganter's introductions to Red Jacket's discourse assist the reader in fully understanding, and engaging in, the speeches and letters crafted by the chief. He sets up the contextual underpinnings of the milieu under investigation and interjects guiding remarks throughout the presentation of Red Jacket's discourse in order to clarify form and content. Simultaneously, Ganter groups together exchanges between Red Jacket and governmental officials (that is, US presidents, secretaries of war, Indian agents)

and other Native leaders and groups. This move renders the many discourses that make up rhetorical “moments” interactive and fluid, harkening to an almost Bakhtinian notion of polysemy. In other words, the discourses are not examined individually but rather through a symbiotic lens.

In terms of rhetorical choices, Ganter does well to organize the speeches and letters into chronological and historical moments. Readers get a sampling of Red Jacket’s early treaty discourse (Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794) and land exchange councils (Council at Fort Niagara, 1796) as well as his remonstrances of Christian missionaries (Reply to Reverend Jacob Cram, 1805) and demands for Seneca and Native neutrality in the War of 1812 (To Grand River Indians, 1812). The edition’s twelve speeches and letters involving the War of 1812 remain the brightest and most fascinating kernels of Red Jacket’s rhetorical legacy. Within this moment, Ganter exhibits how Red Jacket tread the line between Native and American identities in the early nineteenth century. For instance, Red Jacket demanded information about British whereabouts in Seneca country as both a part of the US nation (“you are our brothers and relations”) and as sovereign nations (“we are not accustomed to transact important business in the DARK! . . . we are willing that the *light* should shine upon whatever we do”) (170–71). Such rhetorical occasions demonstrate the hybridity extant in Red Jacket’s character—and, generally, American Indian agency—during the United States’ first two decades. Here, the Seneca Nation, as a synecdoche for eastern Native communities, were neither America’s “red children” nor “distinct communities,” but rather an amalgam of subjectivities (see *Worcester v. Georgia*, 31 U.S. 515). The War of 1812 and the fact that American Indians chose sides spoke to this borderland of “indigenism” and Americanism (see Ronald Niezen, *Origins of Indigenism*, 2003).

Though *The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* is a highly recommended anthology, there do exist some limitations. First, Ganter offers very little commentary—critical or historical—regarding Red Jacket’s discourse. Granted, the edition is an anthology, and the publishing process demands that the author make particular choices. Still, having gone through the trouble of introducing and interjecting remarks throughout the discourse, the presentation of Red Jacket’s messages might have been enhanced by brief interludes into his rhetorical constructions, tropes, devices, and so forth. For instance, the chief’s use of fraternal language (father, brother, motherland) and natural metaphors (“leaves of the forest,” “great winds which blew over them”) seem so incredibly robust for exploration and resonate with the *inventio* of his arguments. Collective memories to contact myths, earlier treaties, and amicable Native-US relationships are other devices, whose discussion is pivotal to Red Jacket’s discourse, that would enhance the collection. On a positive note, Ganter’s meticulous researching and selection of the texts provides a generative start for scholars in rhetorical studies, English, American studies, and American Indian studies to engage in Red Jacket’s discourse.

Second, while the author’s contextual introductions are helpful, readers are not provided with the secondary texts that he used to craft the commentaries. Links to these sources would not only bolster Ganter’s ethos but would help readers follow up on the author’s discussions. From an optimistic perspective,

Ganter's biographical glossary is a wonderful tool to help readers sort through the many personalities encountered in authorial commentaries.

The final shortcoming involves the Removal Era as an historical context. *The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* does not include Red Jacket's responses to the involuntary program of Native dispossession. The chief passed away in January of 1830, some five months prior to the ratification of President Andrew Jackson's Indian Removal Act. Still, public debate—including discussions within Native communities as represented by *Cherokee Phoenix* articles and lyceum speeches as early as 1826—was visible and vibrant in both the Era of Good Feelings and the Jacksonian Era. Given Red Jacket's many rebukes to voluntary removal from the 1790s to the post-War of 1812 years, one would think his anti-Removal rhetorical prowess would be called upon during the late 1820s. Perhaps such discourses do not exist or were burned during the archival fires in Albany in 1911 (xix). Even if Red Jacket's Removal Era discourse could not be found, readers might expect a footnote to this effect. As a Jacksonian scholar, I was left wondering what Red Jacket said about the forthcoming policy (and *how* he said it).

Ganter's anthology of Red Jacket's discourse is an excellent collection of and contribution to American Indian studies—one steeped in responsible scholarship and cutting-edge approaches to recovering (and empowering) American Indian voices from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Scholars in the historical-critical humanities and culturally based social sciences dealing in Native-US relations will find this book a true gem. For those of us working in rhetorical studies—particularly of Native oratory—*The Collected Speeches of Sagoyewatha* is a godsend. My hope is that more collected editions of American Indian discourse—whether biographically, nationally, or thematically centered will follow Ganter's exceptional lead.

Jason Edward Black
University of Alabama

Elias Cornelius Boudinot: A Life on the Cherokee Border. By James W. Parins. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2006. 252 pages. \$60.00 cloth.

In this first biography of second-generation Cherokee leader Elias Cornelius Boudinot, James Parins endeavors to demonstrate the importance of Boudinot's life to his times. The youngest son of well-known *Cherokee Phoenix* newspaper editor, Elias Boudinot (formerly Buck Watie), Elias Cornelius Boudinot became a newspaperman, Democratic Party politician, Confederate Civil War officer, Indian affairs negotiator, businessman, attorney, rancher, and popular public lecturer for the cause of opening Indian lands to white settlement. Parins's telling of Boudinot's life joins a set of biographies, autobiographies, and family histories of prominent nineteenth-century Cherokees whose lives spanned a momentous era of Cherokee history, including Thurman Wilkins's *Cherokee Tragedy: The Ridge Family and the Decimation of a People* (1970), Gary E. Moulton's *John Ross: Cherokee Chief* (1978), Parins's own biography of Elias