

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Cherokee Editor: The Writings of Elias Boudinot. Edited by Theda Perdue./Cherokee Removal: The "William Penn" Essays and Other Writings by Jeremiah Evarts. Edited by Francis Paul Prucha.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/754139kf>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 8(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

McLoughlin, William G.

Publication Date

1984

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ly learned from tribal elders. To achieve a more satisfying classroom experience for both teacher and Indian student the authors suggest that speech teachers broaden their cultural perspective on expectations for speech organization and develop a more flexible approach to the evaluation of speeches.

As a collection the Native American papers in this book are uninspired. Several of them are interesting and one—Kroskrity's—is exemplary. Others, however, amount to little more than naive editorial opinion thinly veneered with sociological or educational jargon. Like most anthologies, this one varies dramatically in what it offers. Its unevenness and frequent shallowness are unfortunate since the Borderlands offer such rich and exciting opportunities for socio-linguistic research. Perhaps the major contribution of this book is to demonstrate that the study of Native American bilingualism in the region is still in its infancy.

Douglas R. Parks
Indiana University

Cherokee Editor: The Writings of Elias Boudinot. Edited by Theda Perdue. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1983. 248 pp. \$18.95 Cloth.

Cherokee Removal: The "William Penn" Essays and Other Writings by Jeremiah Evarts. Edited by Francis Paul Prucha. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1981. 320 pp. \$19.50 Cloth

These well-produced and attractive volumes are a welcome addition to the growing body of primary materials about Native American history. The University of Tennessee Press is to be congratulated for its continuing effort to assist students of Native American history by making these long out-of-print and difficult-to-obtain sources accessible. Both contain key documents for the study of Indian removal in the 1830s. Both are edited by noted scholars in the field, and both have excellent scholarly introductions, footnotes and a handy, usable format.

Some might argue that we already have enough material on

the Cherokee and that scholars would be better served by documents pertaining to some of the less well-documented tribes. A good case, however, can be made for the claim that "as the Cherokee went, so went the rest of the Native Americans east of the Mississippi" in the early nineteenth century. No one can deny that the Cherokee made the most dramatic, vigorous, persistent and persuasive fight for Native American rights in that era. To understand how and why the Cherokee case failed is to understand the depths of this profound struggle for all Native Americans. There were eloquent spokesmen for other Indian Peoples in the early years of the nineteenth century, like Red Jacket and Tecumseh, but no other tribe was so effective in arousing public opinion.

Elias Boudinot and Jeremiah Evarts rank with John Ross, Principal Chief of the Cherokee, as the most effective leaders of the resistance to Indian Removal. There were eloquent statements by others in the halls of Congress, in editorial columns and petitions and in stinging letters to the President (such as that written by Ralph Waldo Emerson in 1838—much too late in the day to be effective). None, however, worked so long, with such skill or with such profound moral concern in this cause as Boudinot, Evarts and Ross. Most of the statements by contemporaries on the issue drew upon their publications.

Elias Boudinot was the son of Chief Oo-watie, a warrior who had fought in the guerrilla war of the Cherokee and Creek against the frontiersmen of Tennessee and Kentucky from 1780 to 1794. When that war ended Oo-watie settled in that part of the Cherokee Nation located in northwestern Georgia, became a farmer and sent his firstborn son, Buck, to the Moravian mission school at Springplace. Buck was six years old in 1811 and for the next ten years of his life he grew up more under the care and influence of White Christians than of his own family. He retained, however, his command of the Cherokee language and became an effective translator for the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (a Boston-based mission board of Congregational and Presbyterian persuasions—the same mission board for which Evarts worked). After his marriage to a White woman in Cornwall, Connecticut (where he attended a mission school), Buck Watie, who had adopted the name of a prominent Presbyterian minister Elias Boudinot in 1817, settled near his father's farm and began to work for the Rev. Samuel A. Worcester

translating parts of the Bible, Christian hymns and other pious literature designed to convert the Cherokee from paganism to Christianity. When the Cherokee Council voted to start a newspaper in 1826, Boudinot helped to raise the \$1500 to buy a press and in 1828 became its first editor, a post he held for four crucial years.

Perdue's book provides us with eighty pages of selections from Boudinot's writing for the *Cherokee Phoenix*, his famous fund-raising *Address to the Whites* (1826), twenty-one pages of his letters to various religious newspapers and his eighty-page tract explaining his dispute with Chief John Ross over removal and the infamous treaty of New Echota (which Boudinot signed in 1835, although Ross and the over-whelming majority of the Cherokee opposed it). After fighting as desperately as Ross or Evarts to oppose Indian Removal from 1828 to 1832, Boudinot gave up the battle and worked to obtain the most advantageous treaty possible for removal. For that he earned the enmity of his People and in 1839, after the Trail of Tears, he was murdered because he had broken the tribal law against participating in a fraudulent sale of tribal land.

Boudinot's story is part of the tragedy of Indian Removal and Perdue, in a carefully balanced and yet sympathetic Introduction, describes the full measure of Boudinot's wrenching struggle to do what he thought was best for his People.

Jeremiah Evarts had no such struggle. Born in Vermont in 1781, he graduated from Yale in 1802. A generation older than Boudinot, Evarts too was a devout and committed Christian of the New England theocratic variety and after 1811 he edited the missionary magazine for the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions in Boston and served on its Prudential Committee. He died in May 1831 before the cause was wholly lost. In fact, a year after Evarts' death, the Cherokee (and the American Board) won their famous case before the Supreme Court in which Chief Justice John Marshall tried to accomplish what Congress had failed to do—thwart the efforts of Georgia and Andrew Jackson to remove the Indians by compulsion. Only after Jackson refused to carry out Marshall's ruling did Boudinot lose hope. Evarts, however, suffered a major defeat in May 1830 when his mighty effort failed to defeat Jackson's removal bill in Congress. Evarts lived long enough to see the beginning of the famous test case inaugurated by the Rev. Samuel A. Worcester

with the help of the American Board, but what he would have done, had he lived to see Jackson flout it, is unclear. Perhaps, like Boudinot, Worcester and the members of the Prudential committee of the American Board, Evarts too would have given up and advised the Cherokee people to accept "the inevitable." Perhaps, like John Ross, he would have struggled on till the bitter end in 1838.

Ever since, White Americans have been living with what Emerson called that "crime" against humanity, "religion and liberty." Some hearts may be buried at Wounded Knee, but the terminal illness began with the passage of the Removal Bill. The deity Himself provided an appropriate symbol for that crime when He allowed gold to be found within the Cherokee Nation in 1828. These two volumes enable every American to look more closely into this American tragedy. They help us to answer whether or not Indian removal really was "inevitable," who was to blame and whether, given the circumstances, the removal process may not have been, as Boudinot argued, more beneficial to the Indians than allowing them to remain among hostile White frontiersmen, unscrupulous whiskey sellers and greedy politicians. Evarts died believing the choice was not inevitable and that the Indians would lose far more than they gained by removing.

Prucha's edition of Evarts' published papers does for one man's role what Dale Van Every did for the general background of the Removal Crisis in *Disinherited* (New York 1966) and what other scholars (like Angie Debo, Grace Woodward, Arthur H. DeRosier, J. Edwin C. McReynolds and Mary E. Young) have done for individual tribes. He provides us with the setting of the removal crisis in his excellent Introduction and then allows Evarts to speak for the issues at stake. Students will still have to rely upon the standard scholarly studies of the broader aspects of Indian-White relations (by Bernard Sheehan, Michael Rogin and Prucha himself) in order to place Evarts' role in perspective. In his Introduction Prucha concentrates on the techniques by which Evarts sought to arouse the apathetic voters of the nation about the issue. Once Jackson was elected, Evarts realized that only an aroused public conscience could prevent Indian removal. As Prucha vividly portrays, Evarts became a one-man propaganda mill for this moral crusade. First he provided the documentary evidence for the treaty rights of the Cherokee in a series of articles published under the pseudonym "William Penn" in 1829.

Then he worked among his wide circle of influential friends to organize public meetings, launch petition campaigns and generate tracts, pamphlets and books which presented "the facts" to the public. He also lobbied energetically in Washington and saw to it that every Congressman received copies of the books and tracts which he wrote. Prucha demonstrates that as a propagandist for a cause Evarts ranks with Tom Paine, W. L. Garrison, Neal Dow and Elizabeth Cady Stanton.

Evarts rested his argument on three bases: the legal rights of the Indians, the moral obligation to deal fairly with a minority which had no vote and the religious conviction that America was a nation in covenant with God and, if we broke our covenant, He would punish us: "The Great Arbiter of Nations never fails to take cognizance of national delinquencies." Evarts was one of those New England theocrats about whom scholars of reform efforts of the years 1830-1860 have written so much. Legally and morally he had the better side. His arguments from expediency, that the Indians would surely perish if sent off to "the Great American Desert," were not so sound.

Evarts rested his case solely on the Cherokee, "the most civilized tribe in America." He did not note that other tribes had not fared so well and that some in the Northwest favored removal. He weakened his case by attacking the Georgians and the Democrats as the villains, making his crusade seem both regionally and politically partisan. He spoke like an Old Testament prophet: "Cursed be he that removeth his neighbor's landmark!" White Americans are still reaping the guilt for that transgression.

Perdue's volume has an added dimension because Boudinot had to wrestle with the fact that Evarts' campaign had failed and Marshall's decision was not obeyed. Her portrait of Boudinot reminds one at times of the dilemma of Booker T. Washington and W. E. B. DuBois. Boudinot always feels his "twoness" in the pages; he is an American Christian and an Indian. He had faced racial prejudice when he married a White woman; he saw it again in the treatment that Georgia meted out to his People after their state asserted its jurisdiction over Cherokee territory. But Boudinot's major dilemma concerned the unwillingness of the vast majority of his own People to follow his leadership rather than that of John Ross. Boudinot was the quintessence of what was called then "a White Indian" or "a missionary man." He

had no respect for the traditions of his People and wanted them all made over in the White man's image. Perdue sees him as a utopian, hoping to raise his People to an idealized level of Christian civilization. He wanted the Cherokee Nation to be as a "city upon a hill" for the other Indian nations to imitate. She also notes that he was a theocratic Calvinist who ultimately argued that a minority of enlightened Cherokee like himself had the right to make a removal treaty binding the whole tribe when the majority of the "ignorant and deluded masses" could not see what was best for their own good.

This volume of Boudinot's writings does not by any means include all that he wrote. Nor does it spell out his quarrels with the Methodist missionaries who did not meet the standards of Christian refinement he found among the New England Congregationalists and Presbyterians. But it provides a good picture of his Christian zeal, of his political editorializing against removal and, finally, of his unconvincing effort to denounce John Ross in order to justify the Treaty of New Echota. Still, as Perdue says, Boudinot was motivated by sincere convictions and not by a desire for personal gain. He was not, like his cousin, John Ridge, eager to be chief and he never sought wealth. Like Evarts, he was essentially a conservative, Calvinistic moralist. Such persons are out of fashion today, but they are important to our history. The writings of Boudinot and Evarts demonstrate that what seems to have been "inevitable" was really the result of conscious choices made despite other alternatives. In this case the moralists were right about the crisis which faced White America in 1829, and it is important to have their arguments in their own words. Perdue and Prucha have performed an important task as scholars by bringing us the words of the past in a usable form. Scholars are not the only ones who should read them.

William G. McLoughlin
Brown University

Puritans Among the Indians: Accounts of Captivity and Redemption, 1676-1724. Edited by Alden T. Vaughan and Edward W. Clark. Cambridge, Ma.: Harvard University Press, 1981. 352 pp. \$20.00 Cloth.