

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Seminole Nation of Oklahoma: A Legal History. By L. Susan Work.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7123p5k2>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Fixico, Donald L.

Publication Date

2012-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

later resurfaces in Buford's explanation of the ultimately successful campaigns to reinstate Thorpe's Olympic awards.

Despite its numerous strengths, however, this encyclopedic volume is not without its flaws. Factual errors that may elude other readers prove distracting, if not disappointing, to baseball historians. Thorpe did not play his first professional baseball game in Rocky Mount, North Carolina, nor was "A and M athletic field in Rocky Mount"; both were in Raleigh (87). Thorpe did not suffer his final pair of pitching losses of 1910 while with the Rocky Mount team; these two games came after his trade to the Fayetteville Highlanders (406). The Eastern Carolina League was not "created" in 1908, the year before Thorpe entered it, "with four teams," nor were "two more . . . added for the 1909 season" (85). During the three seasons it operated, the league always had six teams, Rocky Mount and Fayetteville replacing Kinston and New Bern after the 1908 season. Thorpe did not end "the 1922 season leading the Eastern League with a .344 average" (232); Elmer Bowman led the league in hitting with an average 21 points higher.

While its abundant research is a delight, the volume is not as satisfying in other ways. Buford's treatment of the massive amount of information that she includes is oblique, perhaps caused by a fear of offense, and as a result, no satisfying sociological and psychological depiction of Thorpe emerges. What does emerge comes dangerously close to the kind of portrait to which, in a speech on March 28, 2003, on Jim Thorpe Honor Day in North Carolina, Thorpe's son Jack objected: Jim Thorpe as a stereotypical American Indian, alcoholic, irresponsible, incapable of adapting to the demands of Anglo-European civilization. When Jack delivered his moving comments, he left no doubt in the minds of his audience that his athletically gifted father should be viewed as a man caught between two cultures that, in his words, "buted heads." Despite her commendable research, Buford's words are not similarly clear and convincing.

Robert Reising
University of Central Arkansas

The Seminole Nation of Oklahoma: A Legal History. By L. Susan Work. Foreword by Lindsay G. Robertson. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2010. 376 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

The Seminole Nation of Oklahoma: A Legal History is the fourth volume of the American Indian Law and Policy Series published by the University of Oklahoma Press. The author, L. Susan Work, is a member of the Choctaw

Nation, has worked with the Seminole, and has practiced tribal and federal Indian law in Oklahoma for thirty years. Work served on a research project of the Five Civilized Tribes (Cherokee, Choctaw, Chickasaw, Muscogee Creek, and Seminole), and the report was subsequently published as an article on the threat of Seminole termination in the *American Indian Law Review* (6.1 [1978], 81–141). This well-written book consists of nine chapters with an introduction, epilogue, and foreword by the series editor, Lindsay G. Robertson. It also features two useful maps that place the Seminole in Indian Territory before Oklahoma statehood in 1907 and ten photographs that beautifully illustrate Seminole history.

Rather than following a historical sequence of events, the book is organized around important topics in modern Seminole history. Whereas numerous books about the Seminoles have stressed Eastern Seminole ethnohistory and military history, concentrating on their time in Florida, as in the work of Harry Kersey and other scholars, Work has written a modern legal history of the Western or Oklahoma Seminoles. Her book builds on both *The Seminoles*, a classic by Edwin McReynolds (1957), which concludes with the Seminoles becoming US citizens in 1924, and *Removal Aftershock: The Seminoles' Struggles to Survive in the West, 1836–1866* (1994) by Jane Lancaster. Work's daring topic is the long legal saga of the Seminole Nation as it was challenged by more than a hundred years of federal laws, court decisions, and threats against tribal sovereignty.

The methods applied to the subject are legal historical and narrative analysis. The book does not attempt at the outset to present and prove a scholarly thesis, nor does it raise and pursue significant questions. Instead, presenting an overview of the modern legal history of the Seminole Nation in Oklahoma, the author begins with the arrival of the Seminoles in Indian Territory during the late 1830s amid the Second Seminole War (1835–42). Although the narrative is not always presented chronologically, the author explains the complex federal court systems and laws and their implementation that prepared Indian Territory for Oklahoma statehood in 1907. Chapter 1, on the federal presence in Indian Territory, demonstrates how much government paternalism impacted the Seminoles in the rebuilding of their nation. Chapter 2 importantly details a ten-year period in preparation for statehood, tracing the labyrinth of federal laws, legal interpretations, allotment implications, and tribal rights under fire in Indian Territory.

Oklahoma Indian history cannot be addressed without a discussion of oil, and chapter 3 demonstrates how the Seminoles and the other Five Tribes were victimized by Congress and federal paternalism. This extensive chapter demonstrates the importance of legal history, though it provides scant information about Seminole daily life in the various communities. Modern Indian

history must also address land claims, and chapter 4 does this very well in regard to the Seminoles. The subject of chapter 5 centers on the challenges to early modern Seminole government posed by federal law and bureaucratic intervention. As the chapter jumps back to 1906 to begin this discussion, some conditions and events are repeated, such as the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934, and the Oklahoma Indian Welfare Act of 1936. Whereas this chapter covers sixty-two years, chapter 6 details five, explaining how the forming of the tribal constitution marked a new beginning for the Seminole Nation.

Chapter 7 covers in depth the administrations of three chiefs, Terry Walker, Floyd Harjo, and Edwin Tanyan. Work reveals the factionalism within the tribe, an old problem that has plagued many Indian nations. This inner perspective is helpful to understanding the development of a tribal government as it modernizes itself while dealing with the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) and federal programs. This internal view continues in chapter 8 as Work addresses the administrations of the three succeeding Seminole chiefs, Richmond Tiger, Tom Palmer, and James Milam, effectively illustrating how the Seminoles achieved self-determination internally and externally. The second phase of modern self-determination is shown in chapter 9, which covers the administrations of Edwin Tanyan and Jerry Haney from 1985 to 1993. In this contemporary era, the Seminole Nation dealt with external entities such as the state government of Oklahoma, the federal government, and other outside interest groups as it strove to develop its resources, especially as it moved into the Indian gaming industry. At the end of the twentieth century, the Seminole Nation found itself at odds with the BIA.

The last chapter and the epilogue are the strength of the book, as Work skillfully uses her legal training and experience to explain the Seminoles' amendments to their constitution and the legal entanglements that they have encountered during the first decade of this century. The epilogue includes the Seminole Nation's conflicts with the National Indian Gaming Commission and the need to resolve the freedmen's issues. In her last sentence, Work stresses that the Seminole Nation has overcome difficult times in a long remarkable history lasting more than one hundred years.

Although not a historical narrative in the conventional sense, this volume is crucial to understanding the long struggle of a modern Indian nation whose resilience derives from its cultural past and from coping with external influences that were not always positive. Work's acumen and knowledge of federal law pertaining to the Five Tribes makes this book succeed as a significant contribution to the literature on the history of federal-Indian relations. Another strength is the extensive primary research, consisting of 10 treaties, 123 federal laws, 4 federal regulations, 68 Seminole tribal laws, 10 state laws with numerous amendments, 69 US Supreme Court cases, 42 cases in

US Court of Appeals, 52 cases in US District Courts, 13 Oklahoma court cases, and 87 miscellaneous government documents. The secondary literature includes a dozen manuscript collections. The richness of the bibliography alone makes the book well worthwhile.

This book will appeal to scholars of Native studies, federal Indian law, and political science. *The Seminole Nation of Oklahoma* is not meant to be a cultural or ethnohistorical study, but is a major contribution to federal-Indian legal studies where more bold examinations of modern tribal histories are appearing. Such books are overdue, and Work's book is timely and welcome. Finally, if the question "what happened to the Seminoles after their removal to the West?" is asked, this volume proudly responds, explaining thoroughly what happened from that time until the end of the first decade of the twenty-first century.

Donald L. Fixico
Arizona State University

Spirits of Earth: The Effigy Mound Landscape of Madison and the Four Lakes. By Robert A. Birmingham. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2009. 280 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Thirteen thousand years ago, spruce forests and swamps draining glacial melt water welcomed small bands of hunters into what is now southern Wisconsin. Twelve thousand years later, Native Americans constructed monumental earth sculptures in animal shapes—effigy mounds—in the prairies that the glaciers left behind. Former state archaeologist Robert Birmingham describes and interprets these ancient wonders, comparing them to the megaliths of Europe and the geoglyphs of Peru, while showing their significance and continued presence and power in contemporary times.

Most effigy mounds are found in Wisconsin, with a few in southeastern Minnesota, northeastern Iowa, and northern Illinois. Birmingham argues that effigy mounds provided ceremonial centers for the groups that were increasing their corn cultivation and becoming more sedentary in the Late Woodland era of AD 700 to 1100. Because these megalithic structures were no longer built, settled societies increased their use of agriculture once more. Birmingham's study of effigy mounds opens a window into understanding this transition as it occurred in Wisconsin and other places.

Prominent archaeologist Robert Hall (*An Archaeology of the Soul*, 1997) argued that one needs a broad understanding of Native American beliefs, cultural practices, and worldviews to understand mound builders and interpret