

UCLA

UCLA Historical Journal

Title

Indian Police and Judges: Experiments in Acculturation and Control.
WILLIAM T. HAGAN. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1966; reprint ed.,
Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1980. Pp. viii + 194. Illustrations,
notes, bibliography, index. \$4.95

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6zp9k8zk>

Journal

UCLA Historical Journal, 2(0)

Author

Herring, Joseph B.

Publication Date

1981

Copyright Information

Copyright 1981 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

would be better advised to consult Geoffrey Hosking's 1973 study, *The Russian Constitutional Experiment: Government and Duma, 1907-1914*.

Michael Gelb
University of California, Los Angeles

Indian Police and Judges: Experiments in Acculturation and Control. By WILLIAM T. HAGAN. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1966; reprint ed., Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1980. Pp. viii + 194. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$4.95 (paper).

Seeking a solution to the Indian "problem," post-Civil War philanthropists assumed the duty of lifting the aborigine to a level of civilization comparable to that of white men. Convinced of the righteousness of the cause, few of these citizens considered taking Indian aspirations into account before launching their reform crusade. Despite this oversight, native Americans became active participants in their own acculturation process. American Indians, by adapting the methods and institutions of the white man, devised strategies to defend their cultural integrity. A sophisticated use of America's communication, religious, educational, and legal systems helped Indian cultures endure and eventually prosper.

William Hagan attempts to tell one part of this story in an unrevised reprint of his 1966 book, *Indian Police and Judges*. During the 1870s, Indian agents decided that their wards could assume responsibility for reservation law and order. Despite low pay, scant provisions, and taunts from fellow tribesmen, "progressive" Indians joined agency police forces. Lawmen like the daring Cherokee Sam Sixkiller evicted reservation trespassers, arrested bootleggers, broke up fights, and forced children to attend school. Informal courts, presided over by native judges, tried lawbreakers. Early experiments proved so successful that Congress agreed to fund the reservation legal systems. Not until after 1900, when state laws began to prevail on reservations, did the need for Indian police diminish.

Throughout this work, Hagan is sympathetic but patronizing toward Indians, often falling into the trap of ethnocentrism. He refers, for example, to native lawmen as "vanguards of a more highly developed civilization" who helped tame a people "among whom the fighting tradition was still strong" (p. 162). While it is true that native Americans had technologically less complex cultures than whites, Hagan deems Indian society inferior. He speaks of superstitious natives as if to imply that Christian whites held no superstitions, and he laments the fact that Indian police often would not overstep the bounds of tribal belief by questioning the authority of a medicine man.

Indian Police and Judges contains several undue simplifications of complex subjects. The author concludes, for example, that native American difficulty with alcohol resulted from an inability to mass produce intoxicants. As inexperienced drinkers, Indians were prone to crime and a constant source of trouble on the reservations. By explaining away the multi-faceted subject of Indian alcoholism in a few sentences, Hagan ignores factors such as stress produced by white efforts to destroy Indian cultural integrity. Similarly, the author oversimplifies when he aligns native civili-

zations along a spectrum with the Plains Indians and the Five Civilized Tribes of Oklahoma as the two extremes, and the Winnebagos, Sacs, and Foxes as "the slough of despond in the middle" (p. 18). By portraying Indian cultures in a linear progression from a savage to a civilized state, Hagan fails to account for the diversity of native civilizations as well as the dynamic flux of all cultures.

Like a well-intentioned reformer of the nineteenth century, Hagan fails to understand the adaptive nature of native American culture. He focuses on the assimilative results of the reservation law program, but fails to demonstrate how Indians used the law to keep their native cultures intact. While praising progressives for accepting farming, education, and white dress, he denigrates so-called conservatives like Sitting Bull, who preferred a traditional life. Hagan's analysis is ill-served by this strict progressive/conservative dichotomy. As he himself acknowledges, by the 1890s, many tribesmen had a foot in each camp. They accepted the outward trappings of white society but managed to keep a separate cultural identity. Comanche Judge Quannah Parker was one example: Hagan tells us that Parker drew praise from whites as an effective lawyer. The judge aided civilization efforts by helping agents enact the land allotment program. At the same time he was a pioneer in the dynamic peyote cult. What the author does not reveal is that in 1908, Parker used his law experience successfully to defend this native religion against white efforts to ban it. Other tribesmen used their legal experience to fight infringements on native dances and ceremonies, to prevent white encroachment on their lands, and to ensure government conformity to treaty agreements. Hagan, however, does not discuss those efforts that served to strengthen Indian cultural integrity.

Indian Police and Judges is one of few works that address the subject of reservation legal systems. With the revision demanded by fifteen years of subsequent scholarship, it could have been a valuable book. As it stands now, this interesting subject still awaits adequate treatment.

Joseph B. Herring
University of Maryland

The Los Angeles Barrio, 1850-1890: A Social History. By RICHARD GRISWOLD DEL CASTILLO. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979. Pp. xiv + 217. Tables, maps, illustrations, appendices, glossary, bibliography, index. \$16.50.

Griswold del Castillo's history of the Mexican community during the first decades of the "American era" has as its focus the active participation of the Mexican population in the shaping of its own culture and society. The author's intent is to draw attention away from the concepts of "barrioization" and "proletarianization" as explanations of Chicano history. Recent Chicano historians have argued that the very nature of imperial colonization of non-white peoples by the Anglo-Americans determined the course of the Mexican community's history and culture. Griswold del Castillo's social history of the Los Angeles barrio concentrates on the mechanisms which the community adopted as it was confronted by changes in the economic structure of the region, the in-migration of Anglo-Americans as well as Mexicans, and by the effects of racial segregation on the community.