

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Natalie Curtis Burlin: A Life in Native and African American Music. By Michelle Wick Patterson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6vb7p630>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hamill, Chad

Publication Date

2012

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

confounded the people's political efforts, making the group appear to lack cohesion and governmental (tribal) unity. As Lowery makes clear, the Lumbees have had to negotiate their identity in attempts to secure tribal status. They have confronted a fundamental problem with federal acknowledgment policy: Congress has tended to see tribal recognition as a political favor to constituents, and the Office of Indian Affairs generally privileged treaties, official blood quantum, and surviving aboriginal culture—traits the Lumbees did not possess.

Overall the book is enriched by Lowery's autoethnological approach (or use of personal and family knowledge) and fluid use of secondary and archival sources. It could benefit from a firmer grounding in the literature about the federal acknowledgment process that is so central to the group's twentieth-century history. As argued by Lowery, little doubt exists that the Lumbees became, through struggle and negotiation, an Indian people and tribe; it is questionable whether they are, as the author asserts, a sovereign nation. Throughout the book, the author uses this term in the loosest of senses. Without a reservation and federal tribal recognition, true sovereignty as used in a tribal context—seen in powers to govern one's own territory, make laws, and tax, and in a host of other governmental powers—certainly eludes the Lumbee people.

As the first major book about the Lumbees in more than a decade, Lowery's monograph is a welcome addition to the literature; written from an insider's perspective, the author accomplishes her goal of enlightening the reader to a "Lumbee way of seeing" the world. Lowery's exploration of the category of "Indian" is an important endeavor, an enterprise that promises to become increasingly important in coming decades. Based on a wealth of primary sources, secondary literature, and personal insights, Lowery's new book should be of interest to scholars of Native American studies, race relations, ethnic identity, and related fields.

Mark Edwin Miller
Southern Utah University

Natalie Curtis Burlin: A Life in Native and African American Music. By Michelle Wick Patterson. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2010. 430 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Utilizing a wealth of published and unpublished primary sources, Michelle Wick Patterson provides a comprehensive and nuanced account of the life of Natalie Curtis, an important figure in the research and preservation of

Native American and African American musical traditions at the dawn of the twentieth century.

Following in the footsteps of members of the Bureau of American Ethnology (BAE), Curtis sought to preserve elements of Native American culture that were certain to disappear. The Indian wars were over, and Curtis joined the ranks of those interested in salvaging what was left of American Indians before they vanished into the traces of a new, ascendant America. They were wrong, but the work of Curtis and her contemporaries remains important, not only for Native and non-Native scholars but also for Native communities interested in reigniting the songs and stories of their past.

In her efforts to preserve Native American songs, Curtis took cues from the likes of Alice Fletcher and Francis Densmore. Considered founding mothers of what would become the field of American ethnomusicology during the mid-1950s, both were actively recording songs as members of the BAE. Unlike her contemporaries, however, Curtis sought to privilege a Native perspective, producing *The Indians' Book* (1907). A comparison of Curtis's publications to that of others doing work on Native American music during that time will quickly yield distinct differences in approach and emphasis (see Alice Fletcher, *Indian Story and Song, from North America* [1900]; James Mooney, *The Ghost-Dance Religion and the Sioux Outbreak of 1890* [1896]; Washington Mathews, *Navajo Legends* [1897]; Franz Boas, *The Central Eskimo* [1888]; Frank Hamilton Cushing, *Zuñi Folk Tales* [1901]; and Frances Densmore, *Teton Sioux Music* [1918] as well as Joan Mark's biography of Alice Fletcher, *A Stranger in Her Native Land* [1988]). Not interested in simply satisfying the curiosity of a white audience, Curtis framed *The Indians' Book* as a work by and for Indians. As Patterson points out, however, Native perspectives in *The Indians' Book* were heavily edited, passed through a filter framed by Curtis's larger agenda and delivered in a manner she felt would be palatable to white readers. Intent on awakening Euro-Americans to the "poetic" songs of America's Native "children," Curtis believed Native American songs had the potential to carry them back to their own primitive beginnings. In her view, Euro-Americans were missing a connection to their past, a bottom rung on an evolutionary ladder where Native Americans sat, uncorrupted, noble, and blissfully ignorant of the cultural cacophony of an increasingly frenetic and modernist America. Curtis felt the songs echoed a primordial voice, one that could help displaced Euro-Americans find themselves. In doing so, she hoped to cultivate sympathy and soften Washington's Eurocentric policies.

While laboring to dispel stereotypes of Native Americans as savage, immoral, and irredeemable, Curtis created new ones, reconstructing Native American identity to serve her own purposes, however well intentioned. As history has shown, good intentions can do considerable damage. In addition to

recording songs of the Niimiipuu (Nez Perce), a well-intentioned Fletcher was charged with implementing the Dawes Act on the Nez Perce Reservation, the disastrous results of which can still be felt on the reservation today (for more on Fletcher's interactions with the Niimiipuu, see E. Jane Gay's *With the Nez Percés* [1987]). Still, it would be unfair to deny that many of Curtis's actions benefited Native people. An activist of sorts, Curtis championed (in her own paternalistic fashion) the interests of those with whom she worked. She stood at odds with the rigid reformers and missionaries of the day who demanded the eradication of all that was Indian about Indians, instead calling not only for the preservation of song traditions but also for the spiritual traditions that fostered them. She was a cultural pluralist long before it became a movement during the 1920s and 1930s, using Native American song as a tool to tweak Indian policy and argue for cultural autonomy. In addition, she was critical of Indianist composers who sought to "improve" Native American songs by subjecting them to harmonization, a horrific form of musical colonization pursued by a number of her contemporaries (for more on the relationships between researchers and composers during the time, see Dorothy Sara Lee, "Native American," in *Ethnomusicology: Historical and Regional Studies*, ed. Helen Myers, 1993, 19–35). By "co-authoring" a book with Native peoples and acting as an advocate for their interests, she foreshadowed values that have only recently been adopted in the field of ethnomusicology.

Exploiting her position within a lineage of well-connected family members, Curtis was not shy about rapping on the doors of those in power in service of her agenda. She cajoled President Theodore Roosevelt into granting her unfettered access to Native communities, giving her license to record in a climate in which Indian agents discouraged every expression of indigenous song and ceremony. She took full advantage of her free reign in Indian country, enlisting the participation of High Chief (Cheyenne), Lololomai (Hopi), and Chiparopai (Yuma), three influential Native leaders who made critical contributions to *The Indians' Book*. Accompanied by a leader of the Yavapai tribe and Frank Mead (the Sequoya League), she cornered Roosevelt yet again, imploring him to make good on a promise made by General George Crook to create a reservation for the Yavapai at Camp McDowell, an old military post within their ancestral homelands. He did. Curtis was unrelenting and tenacious in her pursuits, qualities she brought to the promotion and preservation of African American music.

Working under the auspices of the Hampton Institute, an education facility geared toward educating and training African American students to serve their communities, Curtis produced the four-part series *Negro Folk-Songs* (1918–19) as well as the book *Songs and Tales from the Dark Continent* (1920). Both collections relied heavily on song material culled directly from students at

Hampton, a lab for Curtis to observe the intuitive and “spontaneous” fusion of harmonies in black spirituals and, in the case of *Songs and Tales*, songs, proverbs, and stories drawn from students of African descent. Three of her four patrons during this period (George Peabody, Hollis Frissell, and Charlotte Osgood Mason) shared many of Curtis’s beliefs in white superiority and primitivism. Her fourth patron, the celebrated anthropologist Franz Boas, stood apart as a notable exception. Unsatisfied with theories of race circulating within the field of anthropology, Boas used his work to dispel notions of racial superiority (see *Race, Language, and Culture*, 1940). Whatever reservations he had regarding Curtis’s primitivist inclinations were set aside, most likely because he recognized the overall importance and potential of her work. In addition to using her New York connections to sponsor concerts featuring African American performers, she pushed for black composers to incorporate elements of spirituals into their compositions (rather than privileging white composers eager to appropriate black folk music in the formation of a national musical identity). She sought to render African American spirituals and work songs faithfully, striving to create notational “photographs” that fully embodied the tradition without the intrusion of European harmonization and white American sensibilities. At the same time, Curtis recognized the limitations of musical transcription, calling it the “peep of a caged canary” compared with the music, the “free caroling of a bird on open wing” (238). Her approach to transcription, and her criticism of it, once again set her apart from her contemporaries and presaged future issues debated within the field of ethnomusicology (for a concise history of the field, see the introduction in Myers, *Ethnomusicology*).

Natalie Curtis Burlin: A Life in Native and African American Music is well written and thoroughly researched. Patterson’s job here was without doubt a difficult one. Always lingering over Curtis’s substantial accomplishments were her clouded theories of race. Although common during the time, her beliefs were often at odds with the more progressive and pioneering aspects of her work. The story of Natalie Curtis is rife with ambiguity, and Patterson artfully and evenhandedly confronts it, revealing a life that inspires as often as it disappoints. Moments of occasional circularity and some minor editorial oversights exist, none of which threaten the historical integrity of the book. A more concise treatment of Curtis’s privileged East Coast upbringing and aspirations to become a concert pianist might have been appropriate. Although the elements that shaped her life are certainly relevant, the reader is asked to wade through a mass of incidental detail to reach the crux of the story, which centers on Curtis’s efforts to preserve Native American song as a vehicle to influence and reform Indian policy (a cause she championed up until her tragic and untimely death at age forty-six). Still, the journey is worth it. The book

is rich in detail throughout, capturing the essence, energy, and resolve of the dogged Natalie Curtis, a sometimes less than sympathetic figure who did some good things—not just for the preservation of Native and African American songs but also for the those who continued to sing them through a storm of ire, neglect, and good intentions.

Chad Hamill (Spokane)
Northern Arizona University

The Networked Wilderness: Communicating in Early New England. By Matt Cohen. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010. 296 pages. \$67.50 cloth; \$22.50 paper.

With this work, Cohen casts relations between colonists and Native Americans in early colonial-era New England as a struggle over communication systems. What are the interpretive possibilities, he asks, if we conceptualize early New England, not as a barren wilderness inhabited by illiterates but more accurately as a place already densely networked with organized human communications? Cohen demonstrates that not only can we understand the colonies in this fashion, with the hindsight afforded by postcolonial scholarship, but also that the early English colonists contended with the challenge of an already networked wilderness and left ample evidence of their engagement with, and concern about, Native American communications in their writings.

Cohen draws upon recent developments in Native American studies, linguistic anthropological debates on literacy, and the history of the book in the formulation of his approach. Following current trends across these disciplines, he extends the notion of a “text” beyond written documents, arguing against the conceit that there exists a great divide between societies with writing and those without. Rather, texts are materially instantiated in a variety of ways and circulate through multiple channels in any society. To further set Native American and European colonial actors on comparable footing, Cohen takes as his unit of analysis the “publication event.” This notion encompasses book publication, proclamations, the reading of wampum, the use of landmarks, and other forms of inscription to memorialize and publicize events. In many ways, Cohen’s work can be viewed as an elaboration of the analysis of “encounter” pioneered by ethnohistorian James Axtell. By comparison, Cohen’s close textual analysis provides more precise elaboration and specificity to the terms of encounter established by key English colonial agents, and his conceptualization of the permeability of border-zone communications allows for new