

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Fatal Confrontation: Historical Studies of American Indians, Environment, and Historians. By Wilbur R. Jacobs.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6p91m3ws>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 22(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Terrie, Philip G.

Publication Date

1998

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

full-blood Medawakanton Dakota, was born in a Dakota community in Minnesota a year after Eastman arrived in the vicinity. After Eastman left the area, McLaughlin remained, learning the Dakota language in childhood and living (with her husband, noted agent Major James McLaughlin) on other Sioux reservations most of her life. Both authors intended their books to help preserve aspects of the Sioux way of life they both believed was quickly "receding" (Eastman, p. 13; McLaughlin, foreword). McLaughlin had a far richer store of material than Eastman, and was more conscious of the need to preserve what she called the "'timbre' of a people's stories [that] tells of the qualities of a people's heart" (foreword). She included a wider range of stories, including animal tales, and retold them without irritating editorial comments like Eastman's about the need for missionaries.

Neither book adheres to contemporary folkloric standards; McLaughlin fails to identify any storyteller by name, and includes tales from several different Sioux groups without identification. In addition, the paperback copy I have includes unattributed drawings in a style decidedly non-European in perspective so that I longed to have an expert on Dakota art explain for me. Publishers and editors do us all a great service by making older works about Indians available; I wish they would go all the distance and hire contemporary scholars to write introductions and afterwords that would make these works truly accessible to today's readers.

In summary, this is not the book I'd recommend to someone eager to understand nineteenth-century Dakota life. In my opinion, Ella Deloria's 1988 *Waterlily*, though fictional and written a century later, does a much better job of presenting the truth about Native values and lifestyles.

Helen M. Bannan
West Virginia University

The Fatal Confrontation: Historical Studies of American Indians, Environment, and Historians. By Wilbur R. Jacobs. Introduction by Albert L. Hurtado. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996. 214 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Wilbur R. Jacobs, as Albert L. Hurtado remarks in the introduction to this volume of essays, "is a historian with a conscience" (p. xv). In a dozen books and more than one hundred articles,

Jacobs has devoted a lengthy and productive career to pushing the study of American history toward acceptance of multicultural and environmental perspectives. The journals represented in this book are the *AHA Newsletter*, *Pacific Historical Review*, *William and Mary Quarterly*, *Western Historical Quarterly*, *American Historical Review*, *American West Magazine*, and *Journal of American History*. A distinguished scholar and a dedicated teacher, he was a key player in dragging American historians away from a Turnerian faith in "progress" and toward acknowledgment of the horrible cost—in both human and environmental terms—of the European invasion and conquest of North America. The essays assembled for this volume by Hurtado, Jacobs' former student, document Jacobs' departure from the historiographical assumptions obtaining when he was a student and his arrival at an understanding of the dire consequences of the march of Euro-American culture across the continent.

The last essay here is a previously unpublished autobiographical sketch, "In Search of the Frontier," wherein Jacobs describes his own western migration. When he was a child, his family moved from Chicago to Southern California, tracing, on one or another of their several drives west, parts of the Oregon Trail and other historic emigrant routes: "I fondly recall our mounting Cajon Pass and then the thrilling descent into the fresh, succulent greenery of southern California" (p. 180). Jacobs's personal acquaintance with the quintessential emigrant experience inspired him at an early age to aim for a career as a professor of history. After working with Nazi SS POWs during World War II, moreover, he "resolved to devote my historical writing to opposing human injustice" (pp. 183-84). And that is just what he did: He combined his fascination with the history of the American West with a drive to expose its manifold injustices.

Several of the essays here consider the career and impact of Frederick Jackson Turner—his method, thoroughness, and legacy to generations of American historians. First drawn to Turner for his efforts to make history more scientific, including his attempt to adapt the research model of geologist Thomas C. Chamberlin, mainly the "concept of multiple hypotheses," Jacobs, as late as an essay published in 1964, could pass over Turner's insistence on the lure of "free land" without comment that the land seized by Euro-American emigrants was anything but free. But by 1970, Jacobs was explicitly rejecting the Turnerian belief in progress, seeing U.S. expansion as an environmental disaster and calling for historians to "impress upon

their readers the utterly destructive impact that the fur trade [for example] had upon the North American continent and the American Indian" (p. 5). At the same time, he was insisting that the Native point of view had to be considered in any fair treatment of the Western drama.

Before the late 1960s, Jacobs noted that the story of the fur trade had almost always been told with a "capitalistic bias" (p. 5). The fur trade was but one feature of an American history that was, he insisted, a "revolting story ... an unpleasant narrative of the reckless exploitation of minerals, waterways, soil, timber, wildlife, wilderness, and Indians" (p. 6). These were strong words for an academic historian to be writing in 1970. A year later Jacobs observed that the persistence of Turnerian views among academic historians was evidence that historians were narrowly focused on the development of white civilization and unconcerned with its disastrous exploitation of the landscape.

In the afterword, Jacobs notes that it took him ten years to "emerge from the Turnerian umbrella to see western history in a more balanced perspective, especially in Indian and environmental studies" (p. 185). Once firmly convinced of the injustices done to Native Americans by both Turnerian historians and their government, he became an advocate of better history and better policy. He testified on behalf of Indian leaders at the Wounded Knee trials and was warmly welcomed by Russell Means, Dennis Banks, and Vine Deloria. At the University of California, Santa Barbara in the 1960s, he worked with Roderick Nash to establish a program in environmental studies, and he offered the first American Indian history course taught on any campus of the University of California.

Examining the incursion of peoples, animals, and pathogens from Europe into the preconquest environment of North America, Jacobs helped to advance the study of what Alfred Crosby has called the "Columbian exchange." One result of this line of inquiry was an interest in Native American demographics. In a 1974 article published in the *William and Mary Quarterly*, he observed that "the dismal story of Indian depopulation after 1492 is a demographic disaster with no known parallel in human history... [T]he catalyst of all this was undoubtedly the European invasion of the New World" (p. 81). In this article, "The Tip of an Iceberg: Pre-Columbian Indian Demography and Some Implications for Revisionism," Jacobs engaged the controversial and difficult project of estimating preconquest populations. Along with a handful of other scholars, Jacobs concluded that Indian populations had been vastly larger than most Americans had been encouraged to believe. At the end of the fif-

teenth century, he suggested, "the Western Hemisphere may have had a greater population than Western Europe" (p. 78). The profound implications of this for Turnerian assumptions about "empty land" were obvious: "It is hard to imagine that our history can ever be the same again since we can scarcely portray the European invasion of the Western Hemisphere as the relatively quiet expansion of Europeans into sparsely settled lands" (p. 81).

Jacobs' awareness of the combination of human depopulation and environmental havoc, which he was among the first (of academic historians) to describe, led him to ponder the complicity of institutions that most Americans had, until the 1960s, thought of as benign or at least neutral. In 1978, summing up the latter stages of the environmental catastrophe that resulted from conquest, he commented, "The American government has had an increasing role in the despoliation because of its links with predatory business interests and scientists, many of them associated with leading universities" (p. 26). Contemplating the role of universities in this tragedy, he called for "drastic ... revision of doctoral programs ... if we hope to train qualified candidates who can write intelligently about the history of the exploitation of the land" (p. 8) as early as 1970.

Jacobs' lifetime effort to bring balance and compassion to the study of American history reflected his mission to construct an "ethno-environmental history of the American frontier" (p. 196), a way of synthesizing history and ecology, of introducing Aldo Leopold to Walter Prescott Webb. Before the "new western history" even existed, Jacobs was pioneering new and interdisciplinary ways of studying the American West. When he began arguing these positions, Hurtado notes, he was seen as a revisionist or "something worse" (p. xiv). Now, while Jacobs' aim to understand the frontier encounter has taken him as far afield as New Guinea and Australia, a generation of historians acknowledges Jacobs as one of its path finders.

Philip G. Terrie
Bowling Green State University

Hopi Basket Weaving: Artistry in Natural Fibers. By Helga Teiwes. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1996. 200 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Helga Teiwes clearly states that her goal in writing *Hopi Basket Weaving* was to justify the high prices for basketry, a medium