

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Sacred Encounters: Father De Smet and the Indians of the Rocky Mountain West. By Jacqueline Peterson, with Laura Peers.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6nh8t6kr>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Haines, Roberta

**Publication Date**

1994-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**Sacred Encounters: Father De Smet and the Indians of the Rocky Mountain West.** By Jacqueline Peterson, with Laura Peers. Norman and London: The De Smet Project, Washington State University, in association with the University of Oklahoma Press, 1993. 192 pages. \$49.95 cloth; \$24.95 paper.

In recent years, exhibits that address Native American issues have accepted the challenge to be more accurate about the period they display and more forthright about the realities of the encounter between indigenous peoples and American colonists. This can be a difficult commitment for curators and directors as they struggle to balance the pain and destruction of the encounter with the efforts of real people on both sides to live and create in a world of intense conflict. *Sacred Encounters* is the catalog for an exhibit that explored a very particular kind of nineteenth-century encounter in the Rocky Mountains: the missionary movement deep into indigenous territory by the Jesuit, Pierre-Jean De Smet, S.J.

There can be few topics more challenging for exhibition than the encounters of tribal peoples with missionaries—encounters that frequently have ended in slavery, death, and destruction. Nevertheless, what Jacqueline Peterson undertook with her exhibit and the accompanying book was to explore the dialogue between people with two very different perceptions of the world.

This book makes several contributions to scholarship. First, access to the Jesuit records reveals a wealth of information about the tribal peoples of the area that is not normally available. For example, the numerous sketches by Nicolas Point, S.J., of the Flathead, Coeur d'Alene, Pend Oreille, and Blackfeet people and their tribal leaders during the 1840s document a variety of activities, clothing styles, and personalities that can help fill important gaps for historians and social scientists. There are sketches of Marie Quilix, a female warrior of the Pend Oreille, and numerous village scenes, some depicting the insides of lodges in careful detail. De Smet's maps of the river systems and native villages are also significant to scholars, especially in light of his collaborative efforts with the government to control the indigenous populations. De Smet urged the Sioux to sign the Fort Laramie treaties, believing "reservations were the only alternative to extinction" (p.117). The influence of missionaries on tribal political positions in relation to the United States is problematic, and no one would expect it to be fully addressed in an exhibit. However, some clearer reference in the catalog would have been very useful.

One area of conflict that is addressed more directly in the book is the one between the Catholic and Protestant missionary efforts. Each group developed its own hierarchical religious chart as a teaching tool for work among the indigenous peoples. Reproductions of "Protestant Chart or Ladder" developed by Eliza Spaulding, Presbyterian minister to the Nez Perce in the 1840s, and of De Smet's "Catholic Ladder" show how each condemned the other.

One failing of this catalog is that it contains no recognition of the effect that this kind of battle had on indigenous institutions. The Christian missionary movement changed many Native American institutions. Some of those changes are suggested in the catalog, but the depth of the agony created in some cases is not even mentioned. The book makes it seem as if the Catholic missionaries were beneficently tolerant of tribal practices. It speaks not at all to the force and violence used by missionaries to break the people's commitment to their beliefs. Weakened by war, frightened by terrible epidemics, tribal people were suffering on many levels and seeking help from any avenue. The price for Christian help was the sacrifice of their own practices, traditions, and beliefs. The Catholic church wanted control of the sacred. That was the goal in their battles with the Protestants and with the indigenous peoples. For a better analysis of the official attitudes of the Catholic church toward tribal peoples, see Robert Williams, *The American Indian in Western Legal Thought: A Discourse of Conquest*. An excellent book is available in French that looks at how the Jesuits developed manuals to guide the confessions of native peoples so they could find out what the Indians' sins really were and track down the perpetrators. See Martine Azoulay, *Les Pêches du Nouveau Monde: Les Manuels pour la Confession des Indiens, XVI-XVII Siècle*.

The mention of Spokane Garry in the book is a tribute to the commitment the exhibit must have had to indigenous peoples. (For more information on Spokane Garry, see *Indians of the Pacific Northwest*, by Robert H. Ruby and John A. Brown.) He gets little attention, however, and that is also an indication of the ongoing conflict between Protestant and Catholic in this part of the country. Garry was a significant leader of the Spokane and Coeur d'Alene peoples. As a boy, he was educated by the Red River Anglican missionaries. He returned as a young man, ready to carry the holy message to his people. He and the Spokane people built the first schools and the first church in the Northwest. It was

because of his work that the Nez Perce and others made trips to St. Louis to request more missionaries. The people of the Columbia Plateau, however, absorbed only what they needed of the new religion, maintaining their own traditional beliefs and practices. When Catholic missionaries moved into the Spokane country and began their own conversion efforts, it was against Garry's will. The result was a rift in the indigenous alliances that continues today. The church attacks individual religious beliefs; threatens excommunication for different marriage practices; refuses to bury unbaptized infants in the church's cemeteries; condemns tribal spiritual practices as devil inspired. Some of this material may be inappropriate for an exhibit, but curators, directors, and catalog authors should be held accountable when exposing Native American life to public view. The catalog could have addressed some of these important issues.

An exhibit catalog can be much more than a photographic summary of the museum display that generated it. It can develop the themes of the exhibit in more detail. It can contribute to the scholarship of the exhibit's storyline and fill the historical, cultural, or artistic gaps it has identified. One catalog that does this is *A Time of Gathering: Native American Heritage in Washington State*, edited by Robin Wright. Since this was an exhibit that addressed the years of interaction between two very different peoples, it necessarily exposed conflicts and provided an excellent forum for more careful thought about such conflicts. Sadly, the challenge was not taken.

A more technical problem with Peterson's book is that there is no true introduction. It is only in the acknowledgments that we learn the goal of the book and that it is a product and companion to an exhibit. The date and location of the exhibit are not identified. The first few pages of the book, which are meant to portray the indigenous perspective before the "Sacred Encounter," contain confusing bits of poetry, landscape photography, and legend that constitute only a romantic image of little depth. Since these pages are placed before the title page, they promote the idea that indigenous beliefs are premodern, preliterate, "prehistoric"; that they are not accountable in clear, concise terms. The reader is led to believe that the real story begins on page 22 with the "Invasion of the Heart."

For all of the book's failings, it does contain some photographs, sketches, and maps of the early region that give depth and meaning to the period during and since the encounter. In addi-

tion, as a result of this catalog's publication, the Jesuit records may become more accessible to scholars generally.

*Roberta Haines*

**Stability and Variation in Hopi Song.** By George List. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1993. 105 pages. \$28.00 cloth.

Stability and variation in folklore has long been at the core of folkloric theory and study. Yet surprisingly little has been produced under the rubric of "American Indian folklore" that is actually folkloric, or that studies stability and variation in American Indian folklore. What often passes for American Indian folklore is mythology (often not in the original languages); most of North and South American indigenous mythology is not folkloric at all but is/was in fact institutionalized (told only at certain times, in special contexts, by authorized persons, etc.), with notable exceptions such as the Kalapalo culture of northern Brazil.

Hence it is good to see an in-depth study of some actual folklore, in this case of the four traditional Hopi lullabies. The stability and variation of this lullaby is compared to stability and variation in a similar cultural item, a kachina songpoem, which represents a more artistic, high-culture genre of Hopi culture. How stable was the structure of the folk song (the lullaby) over time, compared to the melodic and rhythmic stability of a piece of high-culture music?

To answer this question, List returns to the pioneering ethnomusicology of Benjamin Gilman published in 1908 but done earlier. Gilman spurned the quest of his contemporaries to find scales in American Indian music, a quest that was to last well beyond the days of Frances Densmore, George Herzog, and Helen Roberts. Instead, Gilman used a harmonium in his microtonal transcriptions to study the pitch of Hopi songs in a measured way. He concluded that Hopi music was not scalar, i.e., that the tonal array (arranged in either direction) of a Hopi song told nothing about the particular song or Hopi music in general. Instead, Gilman proposed that Hopi music is phrasal.

List buttressed the Gilman theory by graphically showing that, although there is great variation in actual performance of both the