

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

From Warriors to Soldiers: The History of Native American Service in the United States Military. By Gary Robinson and Phil Lucas.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6nh86631>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bennett, Pamela D.

Publication Date

2009-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

the British, began to crumble, as so-called Third World nations from South America to Africa and Asia fought for their independence.

What indigenous thinkers from Deloria to Smith and Alfred have made clear is that there are different levels to decolonization. Although nation-states around the world from Peru to India may be liberated from the European powers that once dominated them, in each of these nation-states are smaller tribal groups, which are in a colonial relationship between themselves and the respective nation-states that engulf them. Certainly, indigenous nations throughout the United States and Canada are in such a relationship with the American and Canadian federal governments. So the question now is how do indigenous nations decolonize themselves from their respective nation-states? Obviously, there is no clear and easy answer to this question. In which case, perhaps, it is already time to ask another question: What lies beyond decolonization? Bruyneel adds something to this burgeoning discussion.

David Martínez

Arizona State University

From Warriors to Soldiers: The History of Native American Service in the United States Military. By Gary Robinson and Phil Lucas. 144 pages. New York: iUniverse, 2008. \$24.95 cloth; \$14.95 paper.

The material for this work was originally researched in the 1990s as a prelude to creating a television documentary, but funding to produce the film series could not be obtained at the time. Upon the death of his coauthor in 2007, Gary Robinson decided to publish the research in book format. This research provides an abbreviated and chronological representation of American military service from early British/American conflicts through Operation Enduring Freedom. The book is divided into four sections and includes supplementary information in the appendices. Unfortunately, the work is far too ambitious to cover the history of Native warfare in any detail, and, as such, it promises more than it delivers. That said, however, its primary weakness is in its attempted scope, not in its goal to provide a summary of Native military involvement; the authors have been successful in this effort. The material simply would better serve as a film documentary, and it is a shame that it was not funded in its original format.

An important theme of the book is the continuity of commitment of the Native warrior (and later, serviceman) in the face of conflict. As Robinson notes, the reasons that Native men and women chose to serve are complex. Early on, they chose to fight in order to protect their land, families, and sovereignty, but such motivation is not so far removed even in contemporary wars. Motivation for military service is not always linked to patriotism; some veterans interviewed by Robinson and Lucas state that they were drawn to service because it was their “turn” to serve. This sentiment agrees with that found by other researchers. Although many Native veterans of World War II cite patriotism as a reason of service, in general, most Indian veterans will

have other and often more personal reasons for their military service, such as having a father, grandfather, or uncle who served, or even the desire to live up to treaty obligations. Robinson effectively utilizes comments from veterans as the book opens with a discussion of the modern powwow and its role in honoring Native military service. Virtually every powwow has an honor guard of veterans bringing in the flags, but much more important than powwows are gourd societies—the modern equivalent of prerreservation warrior societies and something the authors did not include. Springing up not long after World War I, gourd societies were formed to recognize Native veterans who had met the requirements of warriorhood through their US military service. It is within these modern-day societies that Native warriors gather together to sing, dance, and honor the service of all veterans. It would have been appropriate to include these important Native veteran societies.

Why they served is as important as how they fought. Native and non-Native warfare techniques differed extensively, and, as early as the Revolutionary War, non-Natives recognized the advantage of recruiting Native warriors. In the mid-to-late nineteenth century, Native forces were used in more structured units, serving as Indian scouts for the US Army. Their enlistment was of limited duration and unlike the enlistment of the non-Indian regular army troops, yet the US Scout service proved so successful that several army officers advocated in the 1890s for the formation of an all-Indian regular army unit. This temporary experiment, known as Troop L, proved unsuccessful; however, it was to be a precursor to Native Americans' more formal involvement in the US military system.

Another important idea Robinson notes proved that Native participation in military service was not without negative repercussion. As Indian forces served on both sides of British and American conflicts, their participation placed Native nations in a precarious position and quite frequently in a no-win situation. When Britain signed treaties of surrender, they did nothing to protect their Native allies from American repercussion. Even serving on the American side of the conflict provided no guarantee of safety or lasting gratitude, as evidenced by Andrew Jackson's Removal Act that forced thousands of tribal nations from their homelands and caused the untimely deaths of countless people. Even when Native nations preferred to remain neutral, they were often forced into choosing sides. It was a commitment not lightly made as consequences remained potentially bleak. This issue was raised again during the Civil War when the Cherokee Nation and other tribes divided along Southern and Northern alliances.

Natives' reputation as excellent scouts and their ability in battle earned them praise from US Army officers and continued to cement their reputation as being naturally gifted in warfare. It was a reputation supported by their often-heroic deeds during the world wars that followed. Robinson follows the increased role of Native servicemen inside of the American military system including the first use of indigenous language as a code when the army used Comanche soldiers during World War I. So successful was this endeavor that it was used again in World War II, primarily with a group of Diné servicemen known as the Navajo code talkers. Unfortunately, only five pages were dedicated

to covering both world wars. Even with the inclusion of appendices that reprinted the US Army publication, *Native Americans in the Military: Today and Yesterday* (1984), which provides a list of American Indian Medal of Honor recipients and others who served with distinction, there is a substantial omission of data in *From Warriors to Soldiers*. For a thorough history of Native involvement in World War II, read Alison R. Bernstein's *Toward a New Era in Indian Affairs: American Indians and World War II* (1991), Jeré Bishop Franco's *Crossing the Pond: The Native American Effort in World War II* (1999), and Kenneth William Townsend's *World War II and the American Indian* (2000). Of these, the authors used only Bernstein's work as a reference, and the book would have benefited from the use of these and other more recently published works.

The perception of Native warriors as being innately gifted in warfare became a stereotype as Hollywood propagated the myth through the Western movie. This was to prove especially hazardous to those serving during the Vietnam era, as Indian servicemen were often forced to "walk point," or to assume the first and most exposed position in a combat military formation, based on the myth that they had more "natural" survival abilities such as being able to see in the dark. If not genetically gifted as "natural" warriors, Native servicemen and women served in greater numbers based on their population than any other ethnicity throughout much of their involvement in formal military service. For more information on the experiences of American Indian veterans of the Vietnam era, read Tom Holm's *Strong Hearts, Wounded Souls* (1996).

This work has the unusual distinction of having its strength (its concise brevity) become its greatest weakness. The subject matter is simply too vast to be undertaken in a book of less than 130 pages. The ability of a film to cover a diverse selection of events broadly and in a timely but concise manner is the nature of a well-made documentary. Its very brevity does not, however, lend the same strength to printed media. Although this book would be an excellent introduction to the subject, or a welcome additional reading for a general survey course on American Indian warfare, it would not be appropriate as the primary textbook in college coursework. Other authors cover aspects of Native military service in far greater detail. Moreover, no contemporary book on military service would be complete without greater inclusion of the Native female servicewoman and veteran. Robinson should not be blamed for the paucity of such information in general. Since Robinson and Lucas began their original research in the 1990s, several books have been written on the recent participation of Native servicewomen that might have proven useful by this 2008 publication. Aside from its ambitious reach in subject matter and its subsequent problems with scope, *From Warriors to Soldiers: The History of Native American Service in the United States Military* has some strengths. Robinson weaves an interesting and compelling story of continuity of spirit, motivation, courage, and patriotism, and gives a concise, albeit brief, historical summary of American Indian military participation.

Pamela D. Bennett
University of Arizona