

UC Merced

The Journal of California Anthropology

Title

Phillips: *Chiefs and Challengers: Indian Resistance and Cooperation in Southern California*

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6j65m5z2>

Journal

The Journal of California Anthropology, 4(2)

Author

Mason, William

Publication Date

1977-12-01

Peer reviewed

in agreeable, non-technical prose, of what is known about the Wappo Indians who were the inhabitants of the Napa Valley when Europeans arrived, and whose descendants remain in the area today. It is evident that the author has consulted the most relevant archaeological and ethnographic literature and numerous primary and secondary historical sources. In reviewing the social history of the region and the painful contacts between the Iberian and Anglo Americans and the Native Americans, the author's tone is thoughtful and saddened rather than strident.

The largest section of the book treats the social and spiritual life of the Wappo in pre-European times. To acquaint the reader with the most common Napa Valley artifact types the author has included eight pages of shaded line drawings. Good use has been made of both the archaeological and ethnographic information. While there are a number of facts which are open to varying interpretations, this reviewer found only one questionable statement; commenting on the introduction of European trade beads, the author says, "The beads also introduced the aborigines to the idea of status based on wealth." The available evidence indicates that this idea was already well-developed, for example, in association with the clam shell disc complex in northern California.

Scattered throughout the text and expanded in the coda are the author's reasoned pleas to the reader to help preserve the remaining prehistory of the Wappo that is still to be found in archaeological sites. The names are given of institutions in the local area which can be contacted for information on the proper treatment of sites and for the disposition of artifact collections. Equally important are statements on what not to do. "DO NOT call in your friends for an exciting dig!" (the emphasis is the author's). There is also a list, with brief explanations, of Federal and State legislation pertaining to the preservation of archaeo-

logical sites. This informed concern with archaeological conservation will be welcomed by all thoughtful persons. The book concludes with four pages of references listing the most useful archaeological, ethnographic, and historic publications available on the Wappo and the Napa Valley area.

Overall, this is a most attractive little book which covers a surprisingly wide range of materials. It is an excellent addition to the all-too-sparse number of books designed to draw together available information on a particular Native American group for the non-scholarly but informed reader. Although the author wisely dispenses with some of the more cumbersome scholarly apparatus inappropriate for the general reader, there is one potentially frustrating omission. The lack of citations within the text will make it difficult (but not impossible) for a reader to pursue interests aroused by particular statements. This criticism aside, Yolande Beard has produced a very readable work on a subject which has clearly captured her curiosity, historical interest, and moral concern. It will probably perform the same service for her readers.



Chiefs and Challengers: Indian Resistance and Cooperation in Southern California.

George Harwood Phillips. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975. xi + 225 pp., illus. \$10.95.

Reviewed by WILLIAM MASON
*Los Angeles County Museum
of Natural History*

This book is a significant contribution to the ethnohistory of southern California. Phillips outdistances what has been written about the Garra rebellion, and his book will probably stand for some time as the definitive work on that episode. He also meshes into this

book the development of Indian alliances and the rise of powerful chiefs during the 1850's, clarifying several events of that period in southern California's mountainous interior. Through the use of newspaper accounts, diaries, correspondence from the U.S. Army and the Indian Bureau in the National Archives, as well as published historical works on the subject, Phillips presents a lucid narrative of the period. He has also given some attention to the problems which confronted Indian groups, American garrisons, and white settlers of this region. The first two chapters provide some background on the Luiseño, Cahuilla, and other Indian cultures in the southernmost part of the state, plus their early relationships with Franciscan missionaries, Mexican soldiers, and *rancheros*. The rest of the book chronicles the period between the American conquest of California in 1846-47 and the death of the Cahuilla leader Juan Antonio in 1863.

Phillips integrates his sources well, producing a readable account of the problems between Indians and Yankee soldiers placed in confrontation with one another, Mexican *rancheros* obliged to pursue a delicately balanced course between the two, and the events which followed. The formation of large units under a single Indian leader, such as those of Manuelito Cota or Juan Antonio, is discussed in the light of the previous political experience of Luiseño and Cahuilla, before and after contact with Hispanic culture. The role which American officialdom took in the formation of large political units in areas dominated by Indians is given some needed coverage, and the aftermath of the Garra rebellion and its impact are discussed. Four maps of the regions in question are provided, and they are most helpful, even to those who are familiar with the locales. The book also has several photographs and drawings.

A strong point in favor of Phillips' book is the well-balanced integration of two disciplines, history and anthropology. He analyzes

the period in context with the cultural patterns of the Indian groups in order to bring a sharper focus to the rather confusing sequence of events. The insights presented, with some background on the Indians, are preferable to the lack of information given by historians who tend to ignore cultural differences within Indian societies. There is also an effort to correlate events and document them, which differs from the rather offhand treatment given to the historical framework by some anthropologists. This book should be displeasing to neither historians nor anthropologists for the above reasons. Phillips' efforts in these directions might be emulated.

There are but few difficulties with this book, and they are minor. In chapter two, where several secondary sources are employed to present some background on the period between 1770 and 1840, some mistakes from these sources are repeated. Use of Juan Caballería's book on early San Bernardino should be avoided by historians interested in his account of events prior to 1850. Caballería supposedly used data from San Gabriel Mission, some of which have never come to light, and which conflict with better-documented sources. Until some substantiation for his purported historical narrative is found, his material should be used with some caution. The speech of Toypurina, the woman who was one of the leaders of the San Gabriel Indian rebellion in 1785, is more probably the florid prose of author Thomas W. Temple, rather than that of Toypurina herself. As these minor defects occur in the background, they do no great harm to the main portion of the book. Other mistakes from faulty sources, such as "Cavello en Pelo" for Caballo en Pelo, or Naked Horse, as he was known in English; "mango" for *manga*, an article of clothing, are found, but are not significant enough to create problems.

Another small problem is encountered by extending the history to the death of Juan

Antonio, the Cahuilla leader, from smallpox. No mention is made of the implications of the epidemic for the Indian population of southern California. The smallpox ravages of 1862-63 and those of 1869 reduced the Indians in southern California to relative impotence. To have included the period of the epidemics may well have forced Phillips to write much more. Hopefully, he has material for another book as a follow-up.



The Changing Faces of Main Street: San Buenaventura Mission Plaza Project Archaeological Report, 1975. Roberta S. Greenwood, ed. Ventura: City of San Buenaventura Redevelopment Agency, 1976. vii + 591 pp., figs., tables, photographs. \$10.25.

Reviewed by ROBERT L. HOOVER
*California Polytechnic State University,
San Luis Obispo*

It has been said with some justice that historical archaeology has been a neglected stepchild in the United States. Recent interest in the national bicentennial has done much to correct this. Still, it is remarkable that a California community, not particularly noted for its interest in its pre-1850 past, suddenly displayed an intense pride in its rich cultural heritage. This surprising transformation was the happy result of the skills of the principal investigator, cooperative officials, and a generous budget. It is proof that environmental impact mitigation can lead to important and meaningful research results if all other factors are favorable.

The volume is a truly monumental work consisting of the final report on Greenwood's two-year archaeological project around the mission in downtown Ventura. As such, it has important information of its own to impart, but can best be combined with the first season's

report (Greenwood 1975) to provide a complete overview of the entire project. Various portions of the book deal with prehistoric, Hispanic, and post-Hispanic periods, written by different authors in chapters of varying length and detail. Some of these articles are major contributions of important new data. It is always difficult for an editor to maintain continuity of thought in a report in which many authors contribute the results of their own specialized studies. Greenwood has done an admirable job of this.

Several individual articles stand out as particularly noteworthy. An article by Tinney et al. deals with the application of image processing techniques to extract planimetric information from historical photographs. Tinney notes work completed earlier at Mission La Purisima Vieja (Costello 1975), and compares it with the digital image approach, as used at Mission San Buenaventura. These techniques will be of great value to historical archaeologists who have access to historical photographs of their sites. Paul Chace, acknowledged authority on the archaeology of the nineteenth century Chinese in California, presents a useful chapter on overseas Chinese ceramics. Chace has done extensive fieldwork in this area himself, and his descriptive catalogue of Ventura material should form the basis for the study of other Chinese sites in America and shed light on a very neglected area of historical archaeology. Also of interest is the presentation of new data on beads from Ventura by R. O. Gibson. The shell bead typology is based on that previously published by C. King (1972, 1974) under various titles and currently circulating informally in a more complete form among most archaeologists in coastal southern California. This work, in its turn, was based on the analysis by L. King (1969) of beads from the Medea Creek cemetery. Gibson's description of the manufacturing processes of glass beads is particularly interesting.