

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Goodbird The Indian: His Story. By Edward Goodbird, as told to Gilbert Wilson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6dz600bm>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 11(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Ruppert, James

Publication Date

1987

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Excellent use is made of ethnographic analogies in reconstructing Paleoindian lifeways, but Zimmerman makes little use of the rich ethnographic record of the historic Plains Village tribes in his discussion of their prehistoric antecedents in South Dakota.

There are instances in the text where the author, in an attempt to synthesize data, has oversimplified the presentation. For example, in describing how bison may have been driven and killed in Paleoindian times, the author states ". . . people jumped out from behind the rocks or brush and waved blankets." (p. 53). Hides would have been a better word choice than blankets in this instance. Similarly, the concept of Primary Forest Efficiency is not explained well nor how researchers derive "kinship patterns" from pottery designs (p. 47).

The most serious shortfall of the book are the illustrations. The selection of what to illustrate by chapter is good. The problem is that the vast majority of the illustrations are done with a stippling technique that, in my opinion, simply does not work. There are no scales with most of the artifacts, and some figures are repeated (Figures 41 and 49) with no new information added. More important, many of the illustrations are either copied or redrawn from other sources without credit given to the original source.

Preparing popular syntheses of the archaeological record especially on a regional or state level is not a task most archaeologists would undertake or can do. Zimmerman has succeeded admirably, however, in presenting a thoughtful overview of South Dakota archaeology and of archaeology as a discipline for the public. I am sure it will be read by many South Dakotans interested in South Dakota's past.

Joseph A. Tiffany

Scientific Resource Surveys, Inc., Huntington Beach, CA

Goodbird The Indian: His Story. By Edward Goodbird, as told to Gilbert Wilson. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 1914, rpt. 1985. 78 pp. \$5.95 Paper.

This facsimile edition brings back into circulation the as-told-to autobiography of Edward Goodbird, who lived from 1870 to 1938

in western North Dakota. The narrative covers the years from 1870 to 1913, as young Goodbird grows to manhood, goes to mission school, works for the agency, converts to Christianity, and eventually becomes the first ordained Indian minister on the Ft. Berthold reservation. As a traditional Hidatsa, his life spans a period of tremendous change for that tribe and other tribes in North Dakota, changes in which Goodbird participated and with which he agreed.

In 1913, Goodbird told his life story to seminarian turned anthropologist Gilbert L. Wilson. After working on the reservation for a number of years, Wilson became acquainted with Goodbird, even being adopted into the same clan as Goodbird. Goodbird worked as a translator on a number of documents for Wilson. Only years later did Wilson decide to collect Goodbird's autobiography.

This autobiography was originally published by the Council of Women for Home Missions as a part of their Interdenominational Home Mission Study Course. Their book series was designed to acquaint young Christian readers with other peoples and cultures, and thus eventually bolster the Home Mission program. *Goodbird* was conceived by Wilson as the first in an educational trilogy for children. A second volume about Goodbird's mother, *Waheensee: An Indian Girl's Story* was published seven years later. The last was never published.

In an informative introduction, anthropologist Mary Jane Schneider argues unsuccessfully that though the volume has been ignored, it now deserves serious study and respect. She contends that it was perceived as a religiously motivated children's book, but it should be applauded as representing an attempt by an anthropologist to reach a popular audience and for anticipating by ten years the use of autobiography to illuminate culture. While some important cultural information is revealed, the text is so heavily message-laden and edited by Goodbird, Wilson, and the Council of Women that the only serious study it serves is the study of editorial intrusion.

While Wilson did produce some significant anthropological material, this book is more in keeping with Wilson's other successful children's books, *Myths of the Red Children* and *Indian Hero Tales*. In those books, Wilson turned myth into fairy tales; here Wilson turns autobiography into young adult reading material.

Schneider's introduction outlines the production of the book and the interaction between Goodbird and Wilson as created through Wilson's field notes. Her thesis is that since Wilson is not an "active presence" in the book, the narrative should be considered as highly authentic, culturally revealing, and true to the spirit of Goodbird's story of his life. She lauds Wilson's technique with informants and asserts his field notes reveal "the minimal nature of his editing and organizing." Then she spends the next 13 pages outlining the outright editorial intrusions and skirting over what she calls Wilson's organizing and selecting of elements in the narrative, ignoring the fact that the whole chronological structure is Wilson's, not Goodbird's. The impression that one receives is that she is in favor of this massive restructuring.

It seems a shame that Schneider seems unaware of the provocative new research being done on autobiography and editor/informant relationships by Arnold Krupat, H. David Brumble, Kay Sands and Gretchen Bataille, to name only a few. Other anthropologists are quite aware of the work of more literary oriented researchers, but Schneider forges ahead as if *Crashing Thunder* were the only Indian autobiography ever written. Part of this neglect, of course, stems from the fact that she probably feels her introduction is aimed at a lay audience. However, any audience that would pick up this text is not a general audience, and deserves a more serious appraisal.

In the form presented to us, Goodbird's narrative does not have the richness of detail, the emotional insight, nor the cultural introspection of many of the better known Indian autobiographies. It, of course, has some historical significance since it documents one individual's reaction and contribution to the changes in turn-of-the-century North Dakota, but Goodbird has an agenda in his story.

While he appreciated the old Indian ways, he had to show the Mission, which had only recently placed him in a position of responsibility, that he had thoroughly given up the old beliefs and was worthy of their tentative trust. When his mother laments that under white influence, the tribe is dying, Goodbird is quick to add that, "this is hardly true of the Christian families (p. 20)." He is clear to inform the reader that he knows one can not be a Christian and believe in the old ways at the same time.

For Goodbird, the missions were bringing civilization to the Indian. Christians should appreciate the different form of Indian culture and acknowledge that the Indian has contributed much to America. Yet the missions and their programs, including allotment, are essentially progressive. The Indian should be proud of his past, but he should realize that the white ways are better.

I don't mean to suggest that the text is flawed because Goodbird adopts this reactionary position popular with many progressives at the turn-of-the-century, rather that the multiple layers of editing, censoring and encoding make for a text that gives us only a glimpse of Goodbird's actual words and an even less substantial view of his experience.

James Ruppert
New Mexico Tech

Atlas of Great Lakes Indian History. By Helen Hornbeck Tanner. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1986. Illus., 33 Maps with Explanatory Text, Index, 224 pp. \$65.00 Cloth.

The value of such visual materials as illustrations and maps for their published work has been altogether too little appreciated by historians. Yet the importance of these aids to understanding the past should be self-evident, for they illuminate aspects of the human story that cannot be adequately represented in words, and so would otherwise remain obscure, if not actually hidden. Ideas and abstractions, for all their fundamental importance for historians, are still not their own concern; personalities and events also contribute to the stuff of history, and these are complicated by cultural considerations, not to mention geography and climate. The word is the basic medium for weaving all these factors into historical narrative, but with the judicious help of visual aids it can become clearer and more meaningful.

Helen Hornbeck Tanner pushes this approach about as far as it will go in her editing of Great Lakes history as told in 33 maps, with the help of pictures, and with the text reduced to an explanatory role. While presenting history in this way must come to terms with certain limitations, in this case it does succeed in vividly portraying the buffeting endured by Great Lakes peoples