

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Mavericks on the Border: The Early Southwest in Historical Fiction and Film. By J. Douglas Canfield.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/69c2933q>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 25(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Tharp, Julie

Publication Date

2001-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

when external factors occur. Unfortunately, improvements will not come from a suddenly enlightened federal government or a realignment of broad-based governmental policies. To contribute to the improvement of the Lakotas' situation, Pickering should instead examine how the Lakotas might adopt a model of economic participation that is predicated on self-reliance and personal initiative. This model might include a rehabilitation of tribal government, exploitation of currently available governmental programs, and participation in private initiatives like the Lakota Fund and other nonprofits. Perhaps more fundamentally, Pickering needs to see that the battle is over; in spite of its faults, free-market capitalism has won and it provides the best means for improving the economic circumstances of the residents of the Pine Ridge and Rosebud reservations. As Sivivat Voravetvuthikun, a Thai real estate developer who had gone bankrupt in the Thai economic crash, explained: "Communism fails, socialism fails, so now there is only capitalism. We don't want to go back to the jungle, we all want a better standard of living, so you have to make capitalism work, because we don't have a choice. We have to improve ourselves and follow the world rules. . . . Only the competitive survive" (quoted in Thomas L. Friedman, *The Lexus and the Olive Tree* [New York: Anchor Books, 2000], 102).

Angelo A. Calvello

State Street Global Advisors

Mavericks on the Border: The Early Southwest in Historical Fiction and Film.

By J. Douglas Canfield. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001. 238 pages. \$27.50 cloth.

According to my copy of the *American Heritage Dictionary*, a "maverick" is an "unbranded range calf or colt" or "one that resists adherence to a group." The lone rider, the tough individualist who lives by his own moral code in the Old West, has been a staple of American entertainment and identity for most of the twentieth century. With *Mavericks on the Border*, J. Douglas Canfield implicitly shifts the definition and, by implication, understanding of American individualism. He sees the maverick of much southwestern literature and film as someone who resists adherence to one group because the individual can comprehend the perspectives of two, and possibly several, groups. This maverick has effected an imaginative, if not literal, crossing to another race, another nationality, and even another gender. Canfield attempts, in sixteen short chapters, to elucidate the various ways in which these crossings are attempted. He succeeds in offering a suggestive reading of a wide variety of texts, while avoiding any firm generalizations or conclusions on the subject.

The theoretical framework of this study is itself borrowed from several contexts. Canfield is most interested in the existential dilemmas presented within the works he isolates. He uses Julia Kristeva's notion of the abject, filth or absolute defilement, from which the self must differentiate or die. Kristeva sees this condition of the abject as the "border" of her "condition as a living

being" (p. 3). The other important theorist upon whom Canfield relies, Gloria Anzaldúa, is interested geographical borders. Anzaldúa's important 1987 book *Borderlands/La Frontera* theorizes various border crossings tied to the cultural and national diversity of the land on either side of the Rio Grande. She privileges those who live in the borderlands and maintain a dual, even multiple, vision in spite of the fact that this is a very dangerous place, physically and psychologically. Canfield's combination of the two arguments makes sense, especially given the common ground of physical threat. Most of the literature and film he includes expose the protagonists to violence and even death. The existential vision of the works lies within the protagonists' responses to that violence, to the abject. Many of them are hurt or killed as a direct result of their refusal to adhere to one group. Some are prompted by the violence to cross borders.

Mavericks on the Border joins a growing body of literature and criticism loosely dubbed border studies or border theory, which has emerged since Anzaldúa's publication. These include *Borderlands Literature: Toward an Integrated Perspective*, edited by Harry Polkinhorn, Jose Manuel Di Bella, and Rogelio Reyes (1990); *Border Writing*, a work of literary criticism by D. Emily Hicks (1991); and Scott Michaelson and David E. Johnson's *Border Theory: The Limits of Cultural Politics* (1997). Several texts which may have gained less attention but might be profitably combined with Canfield's include *State of Mind: Texas Literature and Culture* by Tom Pilkington (1998) and *Land of Enchantment, Land of Conflict: New Mexico in English-language Fiction* by David L. Caffery (1999), both published by Texas A&M University Press. A third text, *Old Southwest, New Southwest: Essays on a Region and Its Literature*, is a collection of essays from the Writers of the Purple Sage conference. It includes discussions by Frank Waters, Rudolfo Anaya, N. Scott Momaday, and other notables (1997). In addition to these, there are numerous anthologies available on southwestern literature at this time. The border concept is nearly always at the center of these books.

Canfield's handling of his theoretical frame is subtle. The book never foregrounds theory. Perhaps because of this, I found myself asking just what this book was adding to current understanding of border studies. He seems to claim the concept of borderlands for more than just mestizas, as Anzaldúa argues, or for Chicanos, as other border studies scholars argue. Canfield lays claim to the concept for white male characters, white women, black men, Mexicans, and Mexican Americans—essentially for individuals of almost every kind conceivably living within the Old Southwest. Indeed, he seems to imply that border crossing may lie in the very nature of the southwestern individual. It may further characterize existential dilemmas in general. Canfield, however, avoids generalizations of this kind, preferring to gesture at a variety of texts and allow the reader to draw conclusions.

The lack of historical context provided for the texts was also frustrating. The works chosen for analysis are all works of historical fiction focusing on the Old Southwest from 1833 to 1917 (Canfield's dates). They are grouped within the text by geographic location, "South to West," "North of the Border," "South of the Border," categories that indicate the northeastern, Americanist

starting point of the investigation as well as the nonchronological arrangement. Only one page of discussion ties each section together. The texts, furthermore, range from William Faulkner's *Go Down Moses*, published in 1942, to *Tombstone*, produced in 1993, and back to *The Wild Bunch*, made in 1969, and so forth. What's missing is the story about the shifting attitudes and historical forces on both sides of the border that make these different visions possible. A clearer overall narrative could have tied these works together more profitably.

Some readers may object to Canfield's choice to treat classic and popular works with no differentiation. He also reads popular films in the same manner as novels. My concern on this score is that mainstream film production can differ radically from literary production in its goals and effects, not to mention its medium.

Canfield does take pains to include an American and a Mexican woman writer as well as several male Mexican writers and filmmakers, but he has included no American Indian works in the study. This seems curious given the two chapters on Geronimo and the significant contributions of Native peoples within the Southwest. Even within the analyses of the films *Broken Arrow*, *Buffalo Soldiers*, and *American Legend*, Canfield focuses on the border crossing of the white and black protagonists and never on the Apache characters. He does consider the various depictions of Geronimo as either heroic or villainous, but gives little attention to the Indian characters who are frequently making huge concessions in crossing cultural borders. Possibly these concessions are not well developed in the films. It may also be symptomatic, however, of a shortcoming in border studies generally. The dialectic of the United States and Mexico tends to overshadow that of indigenous peoples and immigrants on both sides of the border.

Aside from these concerns, I found the book to provide thoughtful, close readings of a number of works I would not have considered together. Once yoked, they render a new appreciation for regional themes and help to advance our consideration of borders of all kinds. By teaching us to resist adherence to one group, these mavericks may offer a model for much broader understanding.

Julie Tharp

University of Wisconsin, Marshfield/Wood County

Native Religions and Cultures of North America: Anthropology of the Sacred. Edited by Lawrence E. Sullivan. New York: The Continuum Publishing Company, 2000. 249 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

This edited work by Lawrence E. Sullivan is mainly an anthropological treatment of American Indian "religion." Sullivan is director of the Center for the Study of World Religions at Harvard University and a past president (1996) of the American Academy of Religion. The book is part of a series entitled *The Anthropology of the Sacred*, which he edits with Julien Ries. Like most anthropological works dealing with Native peoples, "North America" apparently