

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Interpretations of Native North American Life: Material Contributions to Ethnohistory. Edited by Michael S. Nassaney and Eric S. Johnson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/68d6958g>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Holzmann, Tim E.

Publication Date

2002-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

could have written her book in the same way ten or twenty years ago, before this institutional and cultural flowering.

The book contains some flaws in factual reporting. Too often Loew wrongly reports the size of a Wisconsin Indian reservation. She confuses the Dawes Act allotments with the treaty-based allotments negotiated by Commissioner George Manypenny in the 1850s. And the editors at the Wisconsin Historical Society Press have sometimes placed baffling illustrations amid the text without proper context or captions. For example, Loew describes the "Strolling Potawatomi" who settled in far northern Wisconsin's Forest County, yet the illustrations picture a different band of migrant Potawatomis that settled in Wood County, two-hundred miles away. Perhaps the author and editors can make corrections in a second edition of the book.

Loew's book is published at an important moment in modern Wisconsin Indian affairs. The American Indian studies programs of the different campuses of the University of Wisconsin system are fashioning a joint curriculum for teaching the subject. The place of oral history and elder-taught history is a prominent discussion topic. Loew's *Indian Nations of Wisconsin*, with its reliance on solid secondary sources, archival documents, and oral histories, is a good model for how a scholar and teacher can approach the topic employing different ways of knowing. Her book is also timely as Wisconsin trains a new generation of public-school teachers under a state law that requires instruction in Wisconsin Indian history, culture, and tribal sovereignty in the elementary, middle, and high school grades. Education students who study Loew's book will have a good foundation for teaching an important subject to the state's schoolchildren.

James W. Oberly

University of Wisconsin, Eau Claire

Interpretations of Native North American Life: Material Contributions to Ethnohistory. Edited by Michael S. Nassaney and Eric S. Johnson. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2000. 400 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

Interpretations of Native North American Life is a collection of essays that explores the relationship between material culture and ethnohistory. Throughout the collection the authors note that historical archaeology's focus upon material culture has much to inform ethnohistorical interpretations of Native America. In some of the chapters, the analysis of material culture has a direct relationship to ethnohistory, helping to fill gaps in our understanding of the past. In other instances the analysis of material objects and written documentation produces diametrically opposed interpretations that lead to reassessment. The essays in *Interpretations of Native North American Life* are useful both in pointing out areas of productive contribution and for sparking potentially useful rethinking of data and theory.

The foreword by Charles Cleland sets a philosophical tone linking the prehistorian's emphasis upon tool-making traditions with the historical

archaeologist's access to contemporary written documents and oral tradition. The editors' introduction takes a more pragmatic approach to material culture, providing a primer on the role of material culture in North American ethnohistory and a guide to the subsequent chapters.

The main text of *Interpretations of Native North American Life* is organized in three parts. Part one deals with ethnogenesis, which the editors define in the subheading as "the creation, maintenance and transformation of ethnic identity." The correlation between ethnic identity and material culture has long been a formidable question for archaeologists. On the one hand, material culture is intimately associated with the people that produce it and bears their mark. On the other hand, the boundaries of ethnic groups tend to be permeable and people, ideas, and ways of fashioning material objects flow between them. The chapters in this part offer insight into methods for using material culture to make sense of ethnogenesis. Chapters one through three in this first part deal with the contact period and look at the relationship between cultures known largely through archaeological contexts or early contact descriptions and ethnic groups clearly identified in the written record. Kathleen Cande (chapter one) looks at descriptions of Mississippian peoples met by De Soto in 1541 and the Quapaw who inhabited the same area in eastern Arkansas in the late seventeenth century. Cande examines ritual activity and associated material culture to link the inhabitants at the time of the Spanish entrada, with groups living there during the French occupation. James Pendergast (chapter two) trains a scholarly eye on attempts to identify the inhabitants of the Stadacona and Hochelaga sites along the St. Lawrence and strongly advocates a rigorous application of the direct historical approach to the question of ethnic identity. John Staeck (chapter three) finds archaeological and historical reconstructions of Ho-Chunk (Winnebago) ethnogenesis to be inadequate and recommends the use of oral tradition to link them with Oneota and Effigy Mound complexes. Chapters four and five are less concerned with associating particular known groups and archaeological assemblages than they are with how societies used material culture to proclaim their ethnicity. Eric Johnson (chapter four) looks at southern New England after the Pequot War (1636–1637) where he argues that the Mohegans created a distinctive ceramic style, Shantok ware, to express a new kind of community political identity. Susan Neill (chapter five) considers the persistence of ribbonwork-decorated clothing over two centuries in the southern Great Lakes region as both a cultural tradition and as an ethnic marker. In general, the chapters in part one reflect the ongoing status of research regarding ethnogenesis and recommend protocols for additional research.

Part two of *Interpretations of Native North American Life* deals with the persistence of traditional material culture into relatively recent times. Historical treatments of Native culture have often emphasized the abandonment of traditional culture in the face of European intrusion and the world economic system. For the most part, such assumptions are contradicted by the six chapters in part two. Alice Kehoe (chapter six) uses Native artifacts from a late-eighteenth-century trading post on the Saskatchewan River to identify the Indian wives of European fur traders and to suggest an important role for the

Native technology of women in the maintenance of the post. Brooke Arkush (chapter seven) notes the persistence of Paiute big-game traps in the Mono Lake Basin from the precontact period to the twentieth century, despite modification of the traditional seasonal round by wage labor on farms, mines, and ranches. Sean Dunham (chapter eight) uses ethnohistorical evidence to link archaeological descriptions of shallow surface depressions with cache pits, which were used by Michigan Indians for food storage into the twentieth century. Carol Mason and Margaret Holman (chapter nine) question the material evidence for indigenous maple sugaring. Catherine Carlson (chapter ten) uses archaeological data to investigate the extent of Shuswap fur trade dependency. Mark Miller (chapter eleven) finishes part two with an assessment of the potential for using George Catlin's paintings as historical evidence of Mandan culture. For the most part, the chapters in part two point out that many assumptions about the consequences of European contact for Native American culture cannot be taken for granted.

Part three of *Interpretations of Native North American Life* focuses upon the contribution that analysis of ritual objects and sites can make to ethnohistory. Larissa Thomas (chapter twelve) notes the significance of female iconographic imagery in Mississippian ceremonial life and indicates its potential for informing ethnohistoric interpretations of post-Contact societies. Barbara Brotherton (chapter thirteen) suggests the use of Tlingit human masks as documents to inform cultural continuity and change. Paul Robinson (chapter fourteen) looks at burial sites in a Rhode Island community and the maintenance of two different historical traditions about the same locations by Narragansett Indians and the community's non-Indian residents. Michael Nassaney (chapter fifteen) examines the postmortem interment of a single soapstone smoking pipe and an oral-history account to infer changes in Narragansett gender roles in the face of European intrusion. The chapters in part three all point to the importance of symbolic systems and the contribution their material evidence can make to ethnohistory.

Since the now-famous Tucson, Arizona, garbage study, there has been little dispute that the study of material culture can add a substantial dimension to social-science inquiry. Borrowing from archeological data has also been a part of many ethnohistorical studies and the growth of historical archaeology in North America has added substantially to the database available to ethnohistorians. In many cases, these data are complementary with written documents and add a greater dimension to our understanding. In other instances, the evidence of material culture causes reassessment of assumptions carried over from the written record. Both ultimately will contribute to our increased understanding of Native North American culture.

Interpretations of Native North American Life offers some contributions to ethnohistorical research. The focused nature of the essays in this collection and the often-noted need for further research limit its importance as a direct resource book. Ethnohistorians are more likely to find it a source of ideas, as the essays suggest means and methods that can be adapted to our own areas of inquiry, much as some of the most useful cookbooks are best read for inspiration rather than recipes. In this line, the major detraction of the book is the

lack of a concluding chapter on the order of “Where do we go from here?” Certainly this is not neglected in the introduction, but it could be elaborated on to better purpose in the conclusion and would help tie the essays together.

Tim E. Holzkamm

Treaty and Aboriginal Rights Research Office

Kit Carson and the Indians. By Tom Dunlay. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2000. 525 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Tom Dunlay is a Kittite, an admirer of Kit Carson, who has set out to rescue Carson’s reputation from revisionism. In recent years, revisionist historians and critics, like Clifford E. Trafzer in *The Kit Carson Campaign: The Last Great Navajo War* (1982) and myself in the pages of this journal (“Kit Carson, John C. Frémont, the Indians, and Manifest Destiny; or, Oliver North Abets Lawrence of Arabia,” 1998), have questioned Carson’s reputation as a hero, especially in his relations with Indians in the conquest of California and Dinétah (Navajoland). Dunlay does not mention my article—though he alludes to a folksinger’s use of the analogy between Carson and North—and he does not really challenge Trafzer’s interpretation head-on, opining that others have already done the job in C. Gordon-McCutcheon’s *Kit Carson: Indian Fighter or Indian Killer?* (1996)

Dunlay makes as good a case for Carson as perhaps can be made. Carson came from a backwoods background, with its ethic of vigilante justice. As a trapper he fought with Indians just as they fought with each other, especially in retaliation for raids on life and property, usually stock. Throughout his memoirs Carson calls such retaliation “chastisement” (though both Dunlay and I have suggested that the word carried paternalistic connotations, the *Oxford English Dictionary* lists a separate military usage that strikes me now as closer to Carson’s usage). And he brought the ethic of chastisement along on Frémont’s expeditions. Dunlay uses it to justify Carson’s participation in a pre-emptive chastisement against Indians near Lassen’s ranch in northern California and again his participation in retaliatory chastisement against Klamaths who subsequently attacked a small party led by Carson and Frémont. Dunlay concedes that “Frémont’s decision to launch an attack on the Indians near Lassen’s ranch, to prevent an anticipated attack on white settlers, may have precipitated his later troubles” (p. 119). But he says that “Frémont must bear some, if not all, of the responsibility” (p. 119). He lays very little—or no—blame on Carson himself.

As he approaches Carson’s years as an Indian agent for the Muache Utes and Jicarilla Apaches, Dunlay tells of Carson’s experience with the decimation of California Indians before the onslaught of the Gold Rush. Here he would have done well to avail himself of more recent, important work by Trafzer, who has shown through the presentation of documents that this decimation comes very close to the official genocide Dunlay tries to avoid as an inappropriate concept (*Exterminate Them: Written Accounts of the Murder, Rape, and*