

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Landmarks of Healing: A Study of House Made of Dawn. By Susan Scarberry Garcia.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6022g84d>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 15(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Woodard, Charles L.

**Publication Date**

1991-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

transsexual, berdache is an alternative gender role and/or a combination/mixing of masculine and feminine aspects in one androgynous person. Writings on the American Indian berdache now posit it as the world's most prominent example of the different ways that societies organize gender, beyond the "two opposite sexes" of Western thought.

The newest trend in berdache studies is the discovery that many other traditional societies around the world have accepted such alternative gender roles; see, for example, Serena Nanda, *Neither Man Nor Woman: The Hijras of India* (1990). As more cross-cultural research is being done in the fields of sexology and gender studies, it is becoming obvious that American Indians may be more typical of human acceptance of homosexuality and gender variance than the rigid condemnation offered by Western culture. Rather than a marginal status, the berdache role "ensured the representatives of diversity a place in the middle, as valued participants" (p. 214). Such social acceptance is of more than academic relevance. Roscoe asks "whether men and women today can ever achieve mutuality and wholeness as long as men who manifest qualities considered feminine, and women who do the same in male realms, are seen as deviants to be criminalized and stigmatized. Fear of being associated with this deviant status stands before every man and woman who would seek psychic integration" (p.169). Roscoe concludes that the berdache provides a model of "gender reconciliation that Western societies can no longer afford to ignore" (p. 169). For pointing out a cross-cultural relevance in this aspect of American Indian studies, Roscoe deserves thanks.

*Walter L. Williams*  
University of Southern California

**Landmarks of Healing: A Study of *House Made of Dawn*.** By Susan Scarberry-Garcia. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990. 228 pages. \$24.50 cloth. \$13.95 paper.

The majority society's failure to understand or appreciate historical and cultural contexts has afflicted Native Americans since first contact, and the affliction continues. Native Americans have been and are thought of mainly in the past tense, or tribal distinctions are ignored, or contemporary plights are the main news.

One logical reason for these reactions is the melting pot impulse: the American tendency to undervalue or ignore diversity. Another reason is denial of individual and collective responsibility: the apparent difficulty some individuals have in acknowledging the enormous vitality and worth of indigenous cultures in the larger context of America's genocidal responses to those cultures. Frequently, an additional reason has been defeatism: the perception that too much has been lost to create context, or that "outsiders" simply cannot have sufficient access to needed information. Certainly, another reason has been arrogance: the assumption that Euro-American cultures are more "advanced" and "civilized" than are Native American cultures and therefore are more worthy of contextual exploration.

Nowhere is the undervaluing of Native American context more apparent than in the mainstream literary criticism of the past several decades. Much of the literary establishment's reaction to the writings of Native American authors reads like New Criticism carried to its most illogical extremes.

In response to that, Susan Scarberry-Garcia's *Landmarks of Healing: A Study of "House Made of Dawn"* is an energetic and engaging argument for context. In explicating *House Made of Dawn*, Scarberry-Garcia declares, and proves, that "knowing the cultural constituents or references in a story is the point of departure for analyzing themes, symbols, and structures, as well as assessing the literary style of the text" (p. 118). By naming and explaining Pueblo, Navajo, Kiowa, and Euro-American cultural myths and attitudes and experiences in *House Made of Dawn*, Scarberry-Garcia significantly enlarges the reader's understanding of the contexts within which that narrative occurs. Consequently, *Landmarks of Healing* is not only an important contribution to Momaday scholarship but a compelling model for evaluating many other literary texts, especially the culturally rich writings of contemporary Native Americans.

Scarberry-Garcia's specific method in this study is "an interdisciplinary discussion of the multitiered mythic structures of healing that form the native vertebrae" of Momaday's book (p.3). Beginning with critic Richard Ohmann's idea that many contemporary American novels are "unfulfilled narratives of illness," chronicles of pain offering no hope for cures, Scarberry-Garcia identifies *House Made of Dawn* as "both a narrative of illness and a narrative of healing" (p. 1). Further, she affirms those critics who "have noted that healing takes place both inside and outside of Momaday's

novel, that the power of the narrative extends to the reader" (p. 2). Then, through sensitive and perceptive explanations of indigenous healing methods, especially the "native language acts" (stories and songs) that "dissolve fragmentation and discord as they create wholeness" (p. 4), she convincingly illustrates her important thesis.

The heart of the study is Scarberry-Garcia's examination of the images of twins and bears, which she persuasively identifies as central to the narrative. Of particular interest is chapter 3, "Bears and Sweet Smoke," because an understanding of Momaday's bear identity is increasingly important to an understanding of his work. Exploring the Jemez, Navajo, Kiowa, and Anglo-American sources of the bear stories that occur throughout the narrative, Scarberry-Garcia proves the crucial importance of bear knowledge for both the characters of the novel and for all people "living in bear country on the North American continent" (p. 47). This, of course, is all of us, since "bear knowledge" is both a literal need and a metaphor for the earth relationship we must have in order to be residential on this landscape.

If one accepts Scarberry-Garcia's main assumptions—and it seems unlikely that anyone who is well-informed about indigenous literature and life would contest them—then only minor exceptions might be made in commending this work. One is its length: Complicated cultural contexts sometimes seem too briefly explained. But against that complaint there is Scarberry-Garcia's reasonable declaration that "it is never a literary writer's aim to explain everything, per se, in a literal fashion but rather to do as Momaday does, and extend the beauty and mystery of life into the imaginations of the readers" (p. 114). Most of the omissions in this text's explanations can be viewed as creatively provocative—motivations for the reader to further engage the mysteries of *House Made of Dawn* and its culturally vital sources.

Perhaps more troublesome are some of the details of what the author believes are the errors of other critics. She seems correct in most of her contentions, but at times she probably could make her point as effectively without naming names (a methodology that would be more consistent with the spirit of the materials being discussed); where her contentions are at least arguable, she sometimes appears contentious. For example, she objects to the following statement by one critic in describing Abel's reaction to hearing Francisco's bear hunt story: "After this rite, Abel can truly be the bear." She points out that Abel could not have been born when the

hunt occurred, so the critic she names should have said, "after hearing this story of this rite" (p. 77). From the indigenous point of view, however, stories are not merely retold but are, in some significant sense, recurring as the teller speaks; it can be argued, then, that Abel may well have been at least partially experiencing the rite as he heard the story.

In the main, though, this is an exceptionally good book, an impressive proof of the importance of empathetic readings of Native American writings. For *House Made of Dawn*, it is a multi-culturally rich sourcebook and an important complement to Matthias Schubnell's *N. Scott Momaday: The Cultural and Literary Background* and to the writings of other leading respondents to Momaday's extraordinary novel. Most importantly, however, *Landmarks of Healing* is an eloquent argument against the monoculturalism that often restricts literary criticism and a clear challenge, especially to majority society critics, to explore and appreciate more fully some of the most creative and dynamic writing now available.

Charles L. Woodard

**Confederate Colonel and Cherokee Chief: The Life of William Holland Thomas.** By E. Stanley Godbold, Jr. and Mattie U. Russell. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1990. 224 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Since the publication of James Mooney's *Myths of the Cherokee* (1900), William Holland Thomas has been familiar as the adopted "son" of chief Yonaguska and longtime chief (1839-67) of the North Carolina Cherokee. In 1956, Mattie Russell completed a Duke University dissertation on Thomas. As she neared retirement as curator of manuscripts in the Duke library, she enlisted E. Stanley Godbold, Jr. to update and rewrite the biography. His version incorporates "much of her work, and some of her words" (p. xii) but adds fresh research and the context provided by the work of a generation of scholars, notably John Finger's definitive study of the nineteenth-century North Carolina Cherokees. Like previously published work on Thomas, Russell's and Godbold's focuses on his performance at the interface between native and Anglo-American governments. Their most important contribution lies in placing Thomas's career with the Cherokees in the