# **UC Berkeley UC Berkeley Previously Published Works**

## **Title**

Integration of amorphous ferromagnetic oxides with multiferroic materials for room temperature magnetoelectric spintronics

**Permalink** <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5zq9047f>

**Journal** Scientific Reports, 10(1)

**ISSN** 2045-2322

## **Authors**

Taz, Humaira Prasad, Bhagwati Huang, Yen-Lin [et al.](https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5zq9047f#author)

**Publication Date** 2020

### **DOI**

10.1038/s41598-020-58592-5

Peer reviewed

# **SCIENTIFIC REPORTS** natureresearch

**OPEN**

# **Integration of amorphous ferromagnetic oxides with multiferroic materials for room temperature magnetoelectric spintronics**

**HumairaTaz1,2,11, Bhagwati Prasad1,11\*, Yen-Lin Huang1, ZuhuangChen1,3, Shang-Lin Hsu1, RuijuanXu1, VishalThakare1, Tamil Selvan Sakthivel 4, Chenze Liu5, Mark Hettick6, Rupam Mukherjee7, Sudipta Seal 8, LaneW. Martin1,9, Ali Javey6, Gerd Duscher5, Ramamoorthy Ramesh1\* & Ramki Kalyanaraman2,10\***

**A room temperature amorphous ferromagnetic oxide semiconductor can substantially reduce the cost and complexity associated with utilizing crystalline materials for spintronic devices. We report a new material (Fe0.66Dy0.24Tb0.1)3O7-x (FDTO), which shows semiconducting behavior with reasonable electrical conductivity (~500 mOhm-cm), an optical band-gap (2.4eV), and a large enough magnetic moment (~200emu/cc), all of which can be tuned by varying the oxygen content during deposition. Magnetoelectric devices were made by integrating ultrathin FDTO with multiferroic BiFeO3. A strong**  enhancement in the magnetic coercive field of FDTO grown on BiFeO<sub>3</sub> validated a large exchange **coupling between them. Additionally, FDTO served as an excellent top electrode for ferroelectric**  switching in BiFeO<sub>3</sub> with no sign of degradation after ~10<sup>10</sup> switching cycles. RT magneto-electric **coupling was demonstrated by modulating the resistance states of spin-valve structures using electric felds.**

Spintronics aims to utilize the charge and spin of electrons in order to revolutionize technologies for information storage and logic by bringing them together onto a single chip<sup>1[,2](#page-8-1)</sup>. Current state-of-the-art in magnetoelectronics is based on using multilayers of crystalline oxides in which signifcant efort must be placed in achieving low defect densities through careful materials selection and processing routes<sup>3-8</sup>. Thin film amorphous semiconductors are excellent candidates for spintronic applications related to switching, storage, and logic for multiple reasons $9-20$ . Amorphous flms have the advantage that they can be deposited at room temperature, making it possible to integrate them for electronic applications with a wider spectrum of material types.

The ternary amorphous oxide system of In-Ga-Zn-O has been successfully utilized to fabricate transparent channel layers in thin film transistors for display applications<sup>17,21-23</sup>. These materials exhibit a suitable combination of transparency, conductivity, mobility, and carrier concentration - all properties needed for switching applications - but they do not possess room-temperature magnetism. Therefore, while control of electronic transport

<sup>1</sup>Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, CA, 94720, USA. <sup>2</sup>Bredesen Center, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, 37996, USA. <sup>3</sup>School of Materials Science and Engineering, Harbin Institute of Technology, Shenzhen, 518055, P. R. China. 4Advanced Materials Processing and Analysis Center (AMPAC, Materials Science and Engineering (MSE) Department, University of Central Florida, Orlando, FL, 32816, USA. 5Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, 37996, USA. <sup>6</sup>Department of Electrical Engineering and Computer Sciences, University of California, Berkeley, California, 94720, USA. <sup>7</sup>Department of Physics, Lovely Professional University, Phagwara, Punjab, 144411, India. <sup>8</sup>College of Medicine, University of Central Florida, Orlando, FL, 32827, USA. <sup>9</sup>Materials Sciences Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, California, 94720, USA. <sup>10</sup>Department of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, 37996, USA. 11These authors contributed equally: Humaira Taz and Bhagwati Prasad. \*email: [bprasadiitk@gmail.com](mailto:bprasadiitk@gmail.com); [rramesh@berkeley.edu;](mailto:rramesh@berkeley.edu) [ramki@utk.edu](mailto:ramki@utk.edu)

is on a relatively good footing, the use of amorphous semiconductors for magnetoelectric spintronics has not yet emerged. Several groups have attempted to introduce magnetism into semiconductors by doping<sup>24</sup>. For instance, conventional III-V semiconductors such as GaAs have been doped with magnetic cations to form dilute magnetic semiconductors. However, these materials have still not achieved room temperature ferromagnetism. On the other hand, dilute magnetic oxides have been prepared by doping transparent heavy transition-metal oxides with magnetic cations<sup>25–[27](#page-8-11)</sup> and these have shown to have Curie temperatures above 300 K. A few complex oxides, such as  $La_{0.7}Sr_{0.3}MnO_3^{28}$ ,  $Sr_2FeMoO_6^{29}$  $Sr_2FeMoO_6^{29}$  $Sr_2FeMoO_6^{29}$ , and  $Fe_3O_4^{30,31}$  $Fe_3O_4^{30,31}$  $Fe_3O_4^{30,31}$  display room-temperature magnetism and metallic conductivity. However, all of these magnetic systems require good crystallinity in order to preserve the room temperature magnetism and metallicity that arises from long range spin order; they lose their magnetic order when disordered or highly defective.

Magnetoelectric multiferroics provide a pathway to control the magnetic state of such devices with an applied electric field for low-power operation<sup>2</sup>. Recent studies have demonstrated the use of spin valves made out of conventional ferromagnets such as Co-Fe to demonstrate magnetoelectric coupling<sup>32</sup>. However, one concern with such an approach is the formation of strong Schottky barriers at the interface between the metal and the oxide ferroelectric; this invariably leads to degradation issues such as polarization fatigu[e33–](#page-9-2)[35,](#page-9-3) imprint and in the case of ferromagnets such as CoFe, the possibility for interfacial oxidation of the Co<sup>36</sup>. In contrast, oxide metals such as La-Sr-Co-O3, SrRuO3 have been demonstrated to show a strong resistance to such interfacial degradation, mainly because they form Ohmic (or almost Ohmic) contacts to the ferroelectrics<sup>[33](#page-9-2)–35</sup>. Furthermore, such oxide metals are able to accommodate the transport of charged oxygen vacancies and thus prevent the formation of interfacial charged layers that have been identifed as a possible cause for the degradation. On the other hand, ferromagnetic oxides, such as  $La_{0.7}Sr_{0.3}MnO_3$  and  $Fe_3O_4$ , have been integrated with BiFeO<sub>3</sub> for magnetoelectric switching applications but exhibit coupling only at low temperature  $(<100 \text{ K})^{36}$ . Thus, there is a need for a ferromagnetic oxide that has reasonable conductivity and large enough magnetic moment at room temperature (i.e., that can be sensed from the outside environment without the need for sophisticated sensing apparatus) and is able to withstand the deleterious efects of transport of charged point defects. We note that in this regard, while a large number of crystalline oxide metals have been explored, amorphous oxides have not been that well studied. Recent reports have emerged of amorphous materials made from iron and lanthanide systems that appear to show promising electronic or magnetic behavior<sup>[37](#page-9-5),[38](#page-9-6)</sup> and this forms the background for our studies.

In this work, we report the synthesis, characterization, and magnetoelectric manifestation of an amorphous semiconducting and ferromagnetic oxide thin-flm material grown by pulsed-laser deposition (PLD) from the Terfenol-D (Fe<sub>1.92</sub>Dy<sub>0.7</sub>Tb<sub>0.3</sub>) metallic system under varying oxygen background pressures ranging from 10<sup>-7</sup> to 10<sup>-3</sup>Torr. The films were deposited at room temperature onto fused quartz substrates or single crystalline BiFeO<sub>3</sub>/SrRuO<sub>3</sub>/SrTiO<sub>3</sub>(001) substrates using PLD (for details, see Methods section). Microscopic evidence for a homogeneous amorphous microstructure was obtained using high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (TEM), while the chemical composition and oxidation state of the  $(F_{\theta_{0.66}}Dy_{0.24}Tb_{0.1})_3O_{7-x}$  films was determined using electron energy loss spectroscopy (EELS) and X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS). Electrical conduction in the flms occurs by variable range hopping with conductivity decreasing with increasing oxygen pressure. Room-temperature magnetic measurements using a SQUID magnetometer revealed ferromagnetic hysteresis with a magnetic moment and coercivity decreasing and increasing, respectively, with increasing oxygen pressure. X-ray magnetic circular dichroism (XMCD) identified the source of magnetism to be the Fe<sup>2+</sup>/Fe<sup>3+</sup> cations with the total moment of the system being highly dependent on the ratio of the two valence states of iron. The pressure-dependent measurements revealed that films deposited with oxygen pressure in the range of  $1-3$  $\times$  10<sup>-6</sup>Torr had a promising combination of properties for spintronic applications, including a high magnetic moment (~400 emu/cc) and low resistivity (~8 mOhm-cm). We also ascertained that this amorphous oxide can be a promising magneto-electric coupling layer to BiFeO<sub>3</sub> that can also be used as a contact electrode by demonstrating at least10<sup>10</sup> ferroelectric switching cycles of BiFeO<sub>3</sub>.

#### **Results and Discussion**

The microstructure, compositional homogeneity and the chemical state of each of the metals in FDTO films were investigated by a combination of high-resolution imaging and electron energy loss spectroscopy (EELS) in the TEM and x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS). Figure [1\(a\)](#page-3-0) shows a representative FDTO flm (deposited at room temperature under 2 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr pressure) sandwiched between the underlying quartz substrate and a protective Au overlayer. Nano-difraction patterns from the FDTO layer marked by the red box are shown in the bottom left panel in Fig. [1\(a\)](#page-3-0) and consist of a diffuse pattern that is typical of an amorphous microstructure. In contrast, the difraction pattern from the blue box within the top Au layer showed sharp rings corresponding to a polycrystalline microstructure. Areal concentration distribution of Fe, Dy, Tb and O by EELS measured from the area marked by the purple rectangle showed that the distribution of the elements was homogeneous over the probed area, as shown in Fig. [1\(b\).](#page-3-0) Small regions showed higher concentrations of iron cations due to variations in the thickness of the cross-section sample causing the lanthanide peaks to be under-estimated at the expense of over-estimating the iron peak. No evidence of metal clustering or structural order was found from such TEM studies indicating that FDTO flms were amorphous oxides. In order to obtain the flm thicknesses and corresponding densities, the FDTO films were also characterized using X-Ray Reflectivity (XRR). There is a slight trend of the densities decreasing and thickness values increasing as oxygen deposition pressure increases for the flms grown at same deposition conditions (see Fig. S1, supplementary information). Given that the deposition times were kept constant, the increase in the thickness was attributed to increasing volume with increasing oxygen pressures as a result of higher oxygen incorporation.

The oxidation state of the metal cations for films prepared under varying oxygen pressures was investigated using XPS measurements. In Fig.  $1(c)$ , the peaks obtained from iron 2p (top panel), terbium and dysprosium 4d (middle panel), and oxygen 1 s (bottom panel) for the film deposited at  $2 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr are shown. The key result



<span id="page-3-0"></span>**Figure 1.** Amorphous microstructure and cation composition of FDTO. Panel (a) HRTEM image showing protective top Au layer, middle FDTO layer, and bottom quartz layer (top panel). Bottom panels shows the diffraction pattern taken from the FDTO layer (red box) and Au layer (blue box). Panel (b) The elemental distribution of Fe, Dy, Tb and O (top to bottom) obtained from EELS spectrum of the area inside the purple box. (**c**) XPS signal and peak ftting for the various metals and oxygen. (**d**) Quantifcation of the observed valence states of Fe (Fe<sup>2+</sup> and Fe<sup>3+</sup>; left y-axis), and the ratio of Fe<sup>3+</sup>/Fe<sup>2+</sup> (right y-axis) across varying oxygen pressure from  $1 \times 10^{-6}$  to  $5 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr. (**e**) Atomic % of the three metals measured by energy dispersive spectroscopy for flms deposited at the various pressures, showing elemental composition of a-FDTO to be very close to that of the metallic target and consistent over all pressures. For Figure (**a**–**c**), a flm deposited at 2 × 10<sup>-6</sup> Torr of pressure was used.

was that no metallic peaks were seen from iron, terbium, and dysprosium for all the pressures investigated suggesting that the metal constituents were completely oxidized. The XPS spectra taken from all FDTO films deposited at varying oxygen pressures are shown in Fig. S2 (see supplementary information). For the entire pressure range investigated, terbium showed XPS peaks corresponding to the composition of  $Tb<sub>4</sub>O<sub>7</sub>$ , which is a mixed phase of Tb<sup>3+</sup> and Tb<sup>4+</sup> with excitation at 151.6  $\pm$  0.2 eV, while dysprosium showed excitation corresponding to  $Dy_2O_3$ , which occurs at 154.7  $\pm$  0.1 eV. On the other hand, the behavior of the iron cation states of Fe<sup>3+</sup> to Fe<sup>2+</sup> changed systematically with oxygen pressure. Using peak positions obtained from the standard XPS database, the  $Fe<sup>2+</sup>$  and Fe<sup>3+</sup> peaks could be decoupled thus allowing quantification of the two valence states of iron. Figure [1\(d\)](#page-3-0) shows the %Fe<sup>2+</sup> decreasing and %Fe<sup>3+</sup> increasing with increasing oxygen pressure. While the ratio Fe<sup>3+</sup>/Fe<sup>2+</sup> was observed to increase with increasing oxygen pressure, all the films were found to be richer in  $Fe^{2+}$  compared to in Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, where the ratio of Fe<sup>3+</sup>/Fe<sup>2+</sup> is 2. These results validated the conclusion that the thin films made by room-temperature deposition correspond to amorphous materials with completely oxidized metal constituents. The co-existence of  $Fe^{3+}/Fe^{2+}$  is one of the key aspects of using an amorphous layer such as FDTO, thus enabling conduction through hopping mechanisms as well as facilitating magnetism. The cationic stoichiometry of the oxide was verifed by using energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy in an SEM to measure the metallic compositions along with summing the oxygen content according to the stoichiometry of the metal oxides identifed by XPS. Figure [1\(e\)](#page-3-0) shows that the atomic percentage of Fe, Tb, and Dy were found to be  $66 \pm 10\%$ ,  $10 \pm 15\%$  and  $24 \pm 15$ % respectively in the FDTO films, which is consistent with the metal composition of the Terfenol-D target (Fe: 66%, Tb: 10%, and Dy: 24%), and hence indicating that the average chemical composition of grown flms is  $Fe<sub>0.66</sub>Dy<sub>0.24</sub>Tb<sub>0.1</sub>$ <sub>3</sub>O<sub>7-x</sub>.

The electronic band gap of the FDTO thin films were investigated by a combination of optical and XPS techniques. In Fig.  $2(a)$  the Tauc plot derived from optical transmission spectroscopy measurements (see Fig. S3, supplementary information) revealed that the flms had a direct bandgap ranging from 2.5 eV (oxygen pressure 1 × 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr) to 3.2 eV (oxygen pressure 1 × 10<sup>−</sup>3Torr). Te indirect bandgap was also seen to increase from 1.7 eV to 2.8 eV as pressure increased across the same range. The optical transmission measurements, shown in Supplementary Fig. S3(a) indicated that the flms were optically transparent, although transparency decreased with decreasing oxygen pressure. To further elucidate the band structure, XPS measurements were used to measure the work function and valence band maximum (VBM) of the FDTO films deposited at  $1 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr and 5  $\times$ 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr. While both flms had an identical work function of 4.4 eV (see Fig. S3(d),(e), supplementary information), the Fermi level was found to lie 0.25 eV inside the valence band for the lower pressure film (1  $\times$  10<sup>-6</sup>Torr), while it was 0.34 eV above the valence band for the higher pressure film (5  $\times$  10<sup>-6</sup>Torr). Considering all the aforementioned pieces of information, along with prior understanding of band structure of amorphous semiconductor films, the band structure of amorphous FDTO can be envisioned as shown in Fig.  $2(b)$ . The important information here is that the band-gap suggested a semiconducting material whose energy gap could be tuned



<span id="page-4-0"></span>**Figure 2.** Band-gap and electrical conductivity of amorphous FDTO. (**a**) Direct and indirect bandgap obtained from Tauc plot for thin films of a-FDTO deposited at oxygen pressures ranging from  $5 \times 10^{-7}$  Torr to  $1 \times$ 10<sup>−</sup>3Torr. (**b**) Schematic of band structure of a-FDTO flm deposited at 2 × 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr showing the bandgap, work function, and mobility edges and tail states at the conduction and valence bands. (**c**) Resistivity as a function of temperature from 3K to 300K for two a-FDTO flms deposited at two diferent oxygen pressures. Both curves show semiconductor behavior. (**d**), (**e**) Fit of temperature dependent resistivity to (**d**) 3-D variable range hopping model, showing good ft for both a-FDTO flms above 100K, and (**e**) 1-D variable range hopping model showing good ft for both flms below 100K.

by changing the oxygen pressure during growth. In addition, the position of the valence band maximum with respect to the Fermi level indicated FDTO to be a p-type semiconductor. Tis band structure analysis suggests the interesting possibility that quantum-well homo-structures could be made in a monolithic flm by simply tuning the oxygen pressure during growth.

The transport properties of the films were investigated as a function of temperature to determine the nature of electronic conduction. Figure  $2(c)$  shows the temperature-dependent resistivity between 3–300 K for the lower oxygen pressure films. The films displayed decreasing resistivity with increasing temperature, indicative of semiconducting behavior. Films deposited at pressures of  $1 \times 10^{-5}$  Torr and higher show extremely high resistivity at room temperature (see Fig. S4(a), supplementary information), which did not change much with changing oxygen pressure, and thereby suggests that the flms deposited at higher oxygen pressures are highly insulating in nature. The conduction in many disordered systems can be explained by either variable-range hopping (VRH) or small-polaron hopping  $(SPH)^{39,40}$  $(SPH)^{39,40}$  $(SPH)^{39,40}$ . The magnitude of conductivity observed in the FDTO system for deposition pressures below 5 × 10<sup>-6</sup> Torr, as shown in Fig. [2\(c\),](#page-4-0) is of the order of  $10^{-1}$  to  $10^{2-1}$  cm<sup>-1</sup> and is much higher than those typically observed for systems with SPH conduction (highest being  $10^{-3}$  -1 cm<sup>-1</sup> for vanadium oxide<sup>[41](#page-9-9)</sup>), VRH seemed the more likely conduction mechanism. In 3-D VRH, the DC conductivity, is related to the temperature through a parameter, which can be expressed as  $1/(d+1)$ , d being the space dimension of the system [38, 39] and 1/4≪1.0. Te value of is largely determined by the localized DOS near the Fermi level, as explained by Singh and Shimakawa<sup>[42](#page-9-10)</sup>. In case of a constant  $DOS$ ,  $=1/2$  is obtained; however, the value of can be less than unity in the case of modified VRH if the fractal nature of the system is taken into account<sup>[39,](#page-9-7)[43](#page-9-11)</sup>. Therefore, selecting



<span id="page-5-0"></span>**Figure 3.** Magnetic properties of amorphous FDTO flms. (**a**) Room temperature magnetic moment of FDTO flms as a function of oxygen pressure during deposition. Inset shows the magnetic moment for a wider range of deposition pressure (up to 10<sup>−</sup>3Torr) with a logarithmic x-axis. (**b**) XAS (top) and XMCD (bottom) data from an FDTO film deposited at  $2 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr showing the magnetic signal aligning with the absorption energy from Fe3<sup>+</sup> peak. (**c**) Room temperature magnetoresistance of FDTO flm deposited at 4× 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr showing positive magnetoresistance.

the correct model to apply is not trivial. In the case of FDTO, the most typical ft of 3-D VRH was applied to the low-temperature resistance data for both the films. As Fig.  $2(d)$  shows, the experimental data fit very well with 3-D VRH (with T<sup>−</sup>1/4) down to 100K, below which a 1-D VRH (T<sup>−</sup>1/2) ft the experimental data best, as shown in Fig.  $2(e)$ . The transition from 3D-VRH to 1D-VRH is a result of Coulomb interactions playing a greater role at low temperature where the kinetic energy of the electrons is also low.

SQUID magnetometry of the FDTO flms, deposited at varying oxygen pressure on quartz substrates, reveals a systematic variation of the saturation moment with the growth oxygen pressure, Fig. [3\(a\)](#page-5-0) (for details, see Fig. S4(b), supplementary information). For films deposited at oxygen pressures below  $3 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr the magnetic moment was >100 emu/cc at room temperature. The inset shows that those films prepared at oxygen pressures above 1  $\times$   $10^{-5}$  Torr exhibited no room-temperature remanent magnetism. Based on the presence of iron cation states in these films, X-ray magnetic circular dichroism  $(XMCD)$  measurements (Fig. [3\(b\)\)](#page-5-0) were made on FDTO films deposited at  $2 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr to confirm that one of the sources of magnetism was the iron cation state and not metallic iron. The split peak appearing in the X-ray absorption spectroscopy data in the top panel of Fig. [3\(b\)](#page-5-0) is evidence of Fe<sup>3+</sup> in the film, consistent with Fig. [1\(d\).](#page-3-0) X-ray measurements at the iron L<sub>2</sub>, edges revealed strong dichroism [Fig. [3\(b\),](#page-5-0) bottom panel], indicative of a net ferromagnetic moment, arising from the iron site. This result further supports the ferromagnetic state of the film, consistent with the SQUID results.

These magnetic, optical, and transport properties demonstrate that FDTO is an amorphous semiconductor displaying magnetic ordering at room temperature. However, in order for it to be useful in spintronic devices, the spin and charge carriers in the system must be coupled. One way to prove this is by confrming magnetoresistance in the system. Figure  $3(c)$  shows the room-temperature magnetoresistance curve of an FDTO film deposited at 2  $\times$  10<sup>-6</sup>Torr, demonstrating positive magnetoresistance where resistance increases with increasing magnetic field, a phenomenon that has been reported in several disordered and granular magnetic systems<sup>[44](#page-9-12)[–48](#page-9-13)</sup>. Although the %MR in FDTO is lower than that in  $Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>$ , the existence of magnetoresistance confirmed the coupling between spin and charge carriers in FDTO, and hence consolidating its utility towards magnetoelectric devices.

In order to examine the applicability of FDTO thin flms for magnetoelectric devices, we studied the coupling to a known multiferroic, BiFeO<sub>3</sub> (BFO). Figure  $4(a)$  shows a cross-section high-resolution TEM image of amorphous FDTO film grown on single-crystal BFO/SrRuO<sub>3</sub> at  $2 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr of oxygen pressure. The interface between FDTO and BFO was sharp and without any contamination, and the epitaxial oxide layers of BFO and SrRuO<sub>3</sub> did not show any detrimental effect after the growth of FDTO films (see Fig. S5(a), supplementary infor-mation) The magnetic behavior of this system was compared to FDTO grown on quartz and is shown in Fig. [4\(b\).](#page-6-0) A substantial increase in coercivity for in-plane confguration, from ~10 to ~300Oe, was seen for the FDTO on BFO compared to that on quartz. Tis strongly points to exchange coupling between the layers suggesting that the magnetic order in FDTO can couple to the underlying canted magnetic moments of BFO. Such a large enhancement in coercivity (observed in several samples, see Fig. S5(b), supplementary information) can be understood by the fact that the in-plane coercivity for a ferromagnetic metallic flm (CoFe) changes, due to exchange coupling with BFO, from  $\sim$ 100e to  $\sim$ 100 Oe<sup>[32](#page-9-1),[36](#page-9-4)</sup>.

With this understanding of the magnetic coupling between the FDTO and BFO, the next step was to study the possibility of magnetoelectric coupling, i.e., electric feld manipulation of the magnetic state of the FDTO. In order to do this, we have typically been using a spin valve as a sensing element<sup>[8](#page-8-3)[,32](#page-9-1)</sup>. Thus, as a first step, we fabricated a standard CoFe-Cu-CoFe giant magnetoresistance (GMR) heterostructure on the FDTO. Figure [4\(c\)](#page-6-0) shows the corresponding device schematic, where a bottom  $Co_{0.9}Fe_{0.1}$  layer coupled to the BFO layer through the ferromagnetic FDTO, resulting in its higher coercivity compared to the top  $Co_{0.9}Fe_{0.1}$  layer. This difference in coercivity between the top and the bottom  $Co_{0.9}Fe_{0.1}$  layers gives rise to the GMR signal. Figure [4\(d\)](#page-6-0) shows a peak 0.35% GMR signal of the heterostructure when no voltage was applied across the BFO. Application of +7V lef



<span id="page-6-0"></span>**Figure 4.** Magnetoelectric spintronics with ferromagnetic amorphous FDTO thin flms. (**a**) HRTEM image of the interface between amorphous FDTO deposited at  $2 \times 10^{-6}$  Torr at room temeprature on crystalline BFO. (b) Magnetic moment (emu/cm<sup>3</sup>) loops taken at room temperature, showing enhanced coercivity of the FDTO/ BFO flm (red) as compared to the FDTO/quartz (blue), demonstrating magnetic coupling between FDTO and BFO thin flm at room temperature. (**c**) Schematic of GMR heterostructure used to study ME switching capabilities of amorphous FDTO. (**d**) GMR signal as a function of applied magnetic feld at room temperature showing change in the GMR signal upon switching BFO ferroelectric polarization from one state to another with the application of +7V (green) to −8V (blue). (**e**) Schematic of a-FDTO/BFO capacitor used to test the robustness of FDTO layer as a top electrode for BFO. (**f**) Ferroelectric hysteresis loop of the capacitor in (**e**) at room temperature showing nearly rectangular closed hysteresis. (**g**) Fatigue test of the capacitor in (**e**) showing stable polarization for  $\sim 10^{10}$  cumulative switching cycles.

the GMR signal unchanged, but application of −8 V markedly changed the GMR signal of the heterostructure. We have seen such a resistance modulation in several devices (see Fig.  $S5(c)$ , supplementary information). The ferroelectric switching of BFO thin flms with the amorphous FDTO as a top contact electrode was also tested and hysteresis loops were measured at room temperature on the capacitor device schematically shown in Fig.  $4(e)$ . The device showed stable polarization-electric field hysteresis loops as can be seen in Fig.  $4(f)$ , where the ferroelectric switching voltages match well with the magnetoelectric switching felds of spin valve devices fabricated on FDTO/ BFO/SRO heterostructure (see Fig. [4d](#page-6-0)). In addition, bipolar polarization fatigue measurements showed at least  $\sim$ 10<sup>10</sup> switching cycles, as seen in Fig. [4\(g\)](#page-6-0), a performance that is better than that for commonly used metallic electrodes such as platinum and comparable to the best crystalline oxide electrodes for BiFeO<sub>3</sub><sup>[33](#page-9-2)-35</sup>.

In conclusion, we have shown a new thin film oxide magnetic material (Fe<sub>0.66</sub>Dy<sub>0.24</sub>Tb<sub>0.1</sub>)<sub>3</sub>O<sub>7-x</sub>, that exhibits a desirable combination of magnetic moment ( $\sim$ 200 emu/cc) and low enough resistivity ( $\sim$ 8 mOhm-cm). The magnetism in the FDTO couples to the BiFeO<sub>3</sub> at room temperature resulting in magnetoelectric switching that was probed through the fabrication of a simple spin valve structure. Also, FDTO could be used as a contact electrode and demonstrated stability with no indication of fatigue even after  $\sim 10^{10}$  ferroelectric switching cycles of BiFeO<sub>3</sub>. Tis work points to several directions for further research. An in-depth study of the degradation mechanisms would be extremely valuable. There has been very little use of amorphous metals as contacts to ferroelectrics and this work may be useful in that regard. Similarly, it would be of interest to create tunnel junctions using the FDTO as the magnetic layer (instead of the CoFe-Cu-CoFe on the FDTO), thus probing the spin transport directly.

#### **Methods**

**Synthesis and fabrication.** Thin films (20–30 nm) of FDTO were deposited from a commercially available metal alloy target, Terfenol-D (66% Fe, 24% Dy, 10% Tb) by pulsed laser deposition using a KrF excimer laser was used with wavelength of 248 nm, rep rate of 10 Hz, and energy density of  $1$  J/cm<sup>2</sup>. Quartz substrates were used to allow for transport, magnetic, and optical measurements on the flms, as well as for GIXRD, XRR, TEM, and XPS. FDTO flms were deposited at room temperature and in dynamic oxygen pressure environments of 5 × 10<sup>−</sup>7Torr to 1 × 10<sup>−</sup>3Torr. For the device studies, FDTO was grown as described above at 3 × 10<sup>−</sup>6Torr on BFO (100nm)/ SRO (20nm)/SRO (001) substrates in the presence of a magnetic field (~2500 Oe). The BFO and SRO were grown using the methods described in ref. <sup>32</sup> GMR structures of  $Co_{0.9}Fe_{0.1} (2.5 \text{ nm})/Cu(5 \text{ nm})/Co_{0.9}Fe_{0.1}(2.5 \text{ nm})$  were deposited on FDTO(4 nm)/BFO(100 nm)/SRO(20 nm)/STO using magnetron sputtering techniques and subsequently the micron sized spin valves were created by conventional photolithography techniques. These same structures were used for ferroelectric measurements. The lateral dimension of the device was about 50  $\mu$ *m*, while the device width was about 10*μm*. Contacts were made by careful wire bonding to the Pt contact pads.

**Characterization techniques.** *Microstructure and chemical composition*.

- **X-ray reflectivity (XRR) and X-ray diffraction (XRD):** XRR was performed on the films Panalytical X'Pert<sup>[3](#page-8-2)</sup> MRD X-ray difractometer in order to measure the thickness and density of the FDTO flms. A slit of 1/16 was used on the beam side to optimize refectivity signals. Fitting of the XRR fringes were done using the refectivity software that came with the instrument. The same instrument was used to measure X-ray diffraction peaks of the BFO flms.
- Transmission electron microscopy (TEM): The microstructure of the as-deposited and annealed FDTO flms were further investigated in TEM to look for the presence/absence of any nanoclusters and the interfacial conditions. High-resolution TEM images, EELS spectra, and nano-difraction patterns were taken in Ultra-STEM 200 microscope at the Center for Nanophase Materials Science at Oak Ridge National Lab, FEI Titan X 300KV microscope and F20 UT Tecnai 200KV at Lawrence Berkeley National Lab.
- X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS): The as-prepared and annealed FDTO films were characterized by XPS to look at the cation states near the surface of the flm. XPS measurements were done at room temperature in an ion-pumped chamber (evacuated to  $2 \times 10^{-9}$  Torr) of an PE-PHI5400 spectrometer, employing Al-Ka radiation ( $BE = 1486.6$  eV) of about 4 mm spot size. The binding energy (BE) for the samples was calibrated by setting the measured BE of C 1 s to 284.6 eV. Peakft sofware was further used to identify the chemical state of multifaceted Fe 2p, Dy Tb 4d and O1s spectra according to the previous reports. XPS measurements were also done to measure the work function of the as-prepared films. The system used for this purpose was a Kratos AXIS Ultra system which has a monochromatic Al K-alpha source, with a hemispherical analyzer. A charge correction to C 1s peak was applied during data ftting.

*Optical properties.* The optical characterization techniques utilized here were similar to those in our previous work<sup>37</sup>. Ultra-violet-Visible (UV-Vis) transmission spectra were obtained for all thin films deposited on quartz using an Ocean Optics spectrometer with a He-Ne light source that allowed measurements to be made between 300nm to 900nm, with integration time of 1ms and 100 scans to average. Transmission spectra were acquired at fve diferent locations of each sample to ensure homogeneity of the flm thickness. Tauc plots for were generated by frst converting the transmission values (% T) to absorbance using Beer-Lambert's law and then dividing by the flm thickness to get the absorption coefficient as a function of the probing wavelength. The Tauc plot was made with y-axis as *(ahν) 1∕m* as a function of *hν* (the wavelength in energy units). A tangent was drawn at the region of the plot with sharp increase, which was then extrapolated to cut the x-axis at the band-gap value;  $m=1/2$  was used to obtain a direct band gap value and m=2 was used to obtain indirect bandgap value assuming bands are parabolic.

*Transport properties.* Four-probe sheet resistance of the samples were measured at room temperature in the Van der Pauw geometry using Ecopia HMS 3000 Hall measurement system. Pt contact pads were deposited on the four corners of the samples prior to measurement. The samples were mounted on an SPCB-1 spring clipboard that comes with the HMS system. The contact probes were gold coated and spring loaded. Temperature and field dependent resistivity measurements were made using a Quantum Design Physical Property System. High purity silver epoxy from SPI Supplies and gold wires of 25*μm* diameter were used as contact electrodes and wiring respectively. Measurements were made using the Van der Pauw confguration as described above to eliminate contact resistance at the sample-electrode interface, at intervals of 5K.

*Magnetic properties.* Superconducting quantum interference device (SQUID) was used mainly to measure magnetic moment as a function of magnetic field. The system used was a Quantum Design Magnetic Property Measurement System using brass as a sample holder at UTK, and plastic drinking straw as sample holder at UCB. Magnetic felds of up to 5 Tesla were supplied for these measurements. Samples on quartz typically contributed to a diamagnetic background signal, which was subtracted to get the saturation magnetization for the FDTO flms. Magnetic moment as a function of temperature were also measured for the as-prepared flms having diferent R values using a vibrating sample magnetometer by our collaborator at North Carolina A&T State University. All samples for magnetic measurement were handled using non-magnetic, tefon tip tweezers to prevent contamination from magnetic impurities.

*X-ray magnetic circular dichroism (XMCD).* XMCD measurements were carried out at beamline 6.3.1 of the Advanced Light Source, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, focused on the Fe L-edge. The measurements used fxed circularly polarized X-rays at 300K, in total electron yield confguration with grazing angle of 30°. To ensure that the XMCD signal was of magnetic origin, the measurements were repeated with opposite polarization and it was confrmed that the asymmetry reversed.

*Magnetoresistance (MR).*

- Normal MR: MR was measured using a home-built measurement system. The system used an electro-magnet that was capable of going up to 6000Oe, a Keithley 6221 for supplying AC current, and a Stanford SR865A lock-in amplifer to measure the voltage. A LabVIEW program was developed to interface with all the instruments, and collect, plot and save data. The contacts were made by wirebonding Ag contact pads on the samples to contact pads on a chip holder that was used to mount the sample at the center of the magnetic feld. The magnetic field was supplied IP to the plane of the sample for this measurement.
- Giant MR (GMR): GMR signal of the devices were measured using the same home-built system as described in the normal MR section. Magnetic feld was supplied IP with respect to the plane of the sample. In addition, an Agilent signal generator was used to customize pulse voltages to be supplied as bias across the BFO thin flm. A Keithley 6517a was also used for this purpose to supply a constant DC voltage when needed.

Received: 6 August 2019; Accepted: 6 January 2020; Published online: 27 February 2020

#### **References**

- <span id="page-8-0"></span>1. Awschalom, D. D. & Flatté, M. E. Challenges for semiconductor spintronics. *Nat. Phys.* **3**, 153 (2007).
- <span id="page-8-1"></span>2. Manipatruni, S., Nikonov, D. E. & Young, I. A. Beyond CMOS computing with spin and polarization. *Nat. Phys.* **14**, 338 (2018).
- <span id="page-8-2"></span>3. Liang, K. *et al. Multiferroic magnetoelectric coupling effect of bilayer* La<sub>1.2</sub>Sr<sub>1.8</sub>Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub>/PbZr<sub>0.3</sub>Ti<sub>0.7</sub>O<sub>3</sub> complex thin film. *Phys. Lett. A* **381**, 1504 (2017).
- 4. Liu, M. *et al*. Giant Electric Field Tuning of Magnetic Properties in Multiferroic Ferrite/Ferroelectric Heterostructures. *Adv. Func. Mat.* **19**, 1826 (2009).
- 5. Riester, S. *et al*. Toward a low-voltage multiferroic transistor: Magnetic (Ga,Mn)As under ferroelectric control. *APL* **94**, 063504  $(2009)$
- 6. Wu, S. M. *et al*. Reversible electric control of exchange bias in a multiferroic feld-efect device. *Nat. Mat.* **9**, 756 (2010).
- 7. Palneedi, H., Annapureddy, V., Priya, S. & Ryu, J. Status and perspectives of multiferroic magnetoelectric composite materials and applications. *Actuators* **5**, 9 (2016).
- <span id="page-8-3"></span>8. Manipatruni, S. et al. Scalable energy-efficient magnetoelectric spin-orbit logic. *Nature* 565, 35 (2019).
- <span id="page-8-4"></span>Adurodija, F., Izumi, H., Ishihara, T., Yoshioka, H. & Motoyama, M. The electro-optical properties of amorphous indium tin oxide flms prepared at room temperature by pulsed laser deposition. *Sol. En. Mat. Sol. Cells* **71**, 1 (2002).
- 10. Chen, Y.-C. *et al*. High-stability oxygen sensor based on amorphous zinc tin oxide thin flm transistor. *APL* **100**, 262908 (2012).
- 11. Chiku, M., Takeda, H., Matsumura, S., Higuchi, E. & Inoue, H. Amorphous Vanadium Oxide/Carbon Composite Positive Electrode for Rechargeable Aluminum Battery. *ACS Appl. Mat. Int.* **7**, 24385 (2015).
- 12. Chiang, H. Q., Wager, J. F., Hofman, R. L., Jeong, J. & Keszler, D. A. High mobility transparent thin-flm transistors with amorphous zinc tin oxide channel layer. *APL* **86**, 013503 (2005).
- 13. Hosono, H. Ionic amorphous oxide semiconductors: Material design, carrier transport, and device application. *J. Non-Crys. Sol.* **352**, 851 (**2006**).
- 14. Hosono, H., Kim, J., Toda, Y., Kamiya, T. & Watanabe, S. Transparent amorphous oxide semiconductors for organic electronics: Application to inverted OLEDs. *PNAS* **114**, 233 (2017).
- 15. Huang, J.-S. Amorphous zinc-doped silicon oxide (SZO) resistive switching memory: manipulated bias control from selector to memristor. *et al*. *J. Mater. Chem. C* **2**, 4401 (2014).
- 16. Idota, Y., Kubota, T., Matsufuji, A., Maekawa, Y. & Miyasaka, T. Tin-Based Amorphous Oxide: A High-Capacity Lithium-Ion-Storage Material. *Science* **276**, 5317 (1997).
- <span id="page-8-6"></span>17. Kamiya, T. & Hosono, H. Material characteristics and applications of transparent amorphous oxide semiconductors. *NPG Asia Mater* **2**, 15 (2010).
- 18. Kim, M.-G. *et al*. High-Performance Solution-Processed Amorphous Zinc−Indium−Tin Oxide Tin-Film Transistors. *JACS* **132**, 10352 (2010).
- 19. Li, X., Zhang, L., Dong, H., Xia, T. & Huang, Z. Bismuth oxide coated amorphous manganese dioxide for electrochemical capacitors. *Sol. St. Sci.* **43**, 46 (2015).
- <span id="page-8-5"></span>20. Litvinov, J. *et al*. Development of pinhole-free amorphous aluminum oxide protective layers for biomedical device applications. *Surf. Coat. Tech.* **224**, 101 (2013).
- <span id="page-8-7"></span>21. Hosono, H., Kikuchi, N., Ueda, N. & Kawazoe, H. Working hypothesis to explore novel wide band gap electrically conducting amorphous oxides and examples. *J. Non-Crys. Solids* **198-200**, 165 (1996).
- 22. Yabuta, H. *et al*. High-mobility thin-film transistor with amorphous InGaZnO4 channel fabricated by room temperature rfmagnetron sputtering. *APL* **89**, 112123 (2006).
- <span id="page-8-8"></span>23. Kamiya, T., Nomura, K. & Hosono, H. Present status of amorphous In–Ga–Zn–O thin-flm transistors. *Sci. Tech. Adv. Mat.* **11**, 044305 (2010).
- <span id="page-8-9"></span>24. Dietl, T. A ten-year perspective on dilute magnetic semiconductors and oxides. *Nat. Mater.* **9**, 965 (2010).
- <span id="page-8-10"></span>25. Coey, J. Dilute magnetic oxides. *Current Opinion in Sol. St. Mat. Sci.* **10**, 83 (2006).
- 26. Matsumoto, Y. *et al*. Room-Temperature Ferromagnetism in Transparent Transition Metal-Doped Titanium Dioxide. *Science* **291**, 854 (2001).
- <span id="page-8-11"></span>27. Pearton, S. J., Heo, W. H., Ivill, M., Norton, D. P. & Steiner, T. Dilute magnetic semiconducting oxidees. *Semic. Sci. Tech.* **19**, R59 (2004).
- <span id="page-8-12"></span>28. Sánchez, D., García-Hernández, M., Auth, N. & Jakob, G. Structural, magnetic, and transport properties of high-quality epitaxial Sr2FeMoO6 thin flms prepared by pulsed laser deposition. *JAP* **96**, 2736 (2004).
- <span id="page-8-13"></span>29. Ning, Z. *et al*. Magnetoelectric Coupling in Bilayers of Pb(Zr, Ti)O3 Epoxy and Hot Pressed Manganite Perovskite. *Chin. Phys. Lett.* **23**, 463 (2006).
- <span id="page-8-14"></span>30. Li, X. W., Gupta, A., Xiao, G. & Gong, G. Q. Transport and magnetic properties of epitaxial and polycrystalline magnetite thin flms. *JAP* **83**, 7049 (1998).
- <span id="page-9-0"></span>31. Wei, J. D. *et al*. Infuence of the antiphase domain distribution on the magnetic structure of magnetite thin flms. *APL* **89**, 122517  $(2006)$
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>32. Heron, J. T. *et al*. Deterministic switching of ferromagnetism at room temperature using an electric feld. *Nature* **516**, 370 (2014).
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>33. Baek, S. et al. The Nature of Polarization Fatigue in BiFeO<sub>3</sub>. Adv. Mat. 23, 1621 (2011).
- 34. Zhou, Y. *et al.* Mechanism of polarization fatigue in BiFeO<sub>3</sub> The role of Schottky barrier. *APL* 104, 012903 (2014).
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>35. Baek, S. H. & Eom, C. B. Reliable polarization switching of BiFeO<sub>3</sub>. *Phil. Trans. Royal Soc. London A: Math. Phys. Eng. Sci.* 370, 4872  $(2012)$
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>36. Heron, J. T., Schlom, D. G. & Ramesh, R. Electric field control of magnetism using BiFeO<sub>3</sub> -based heterostructures. *App. Phy. Rev.* 1, 021303 (2014).
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>37. Malasi, A. *et al*. Novel Iron-based ternary amorphous oxide semiconductor with very high transparency, electronic conductivity and mobility. *Sci. Rep.* **5**, 18157 (2015).
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>38. Taz, H. Transparent ferromagnetic and semiconducting behavior in Fe-Dy-Tb based amorphous oxide flms. *et al*. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 27869  $(2016)$
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>39. Shklovskii, B. I. & Efros, A. L. Electronic Properties of Doped Semiconductors. *Springer Series in Solid-State Sciences*, 45 (1984).
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>40. Kishimoto, N. & Morigaki, K. Optical Absorption and Infrared Photoconductivity in Amorphous Si–Au System. *Journal of the Physical Society of Japan* **46**, 497 (1979).
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>41. Adler, D., Fritzsche, H. & Ovshinsky, S. R., eds.,Fundamental Problems Relating to the Electronic Structure of Amorphous Semiconductors. *Physics of Disordered Materials. Institute for Amorphous Studies Series*, 1985.
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>42. Singh, J. & Shimakawa, K. Electronic processes in amorphous semiconductors. *Advances in Condensed Matter Science*, CRC Press  $(2003)$
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>43. van der Putten, D., Moonen, J. T., Brom, H. B., Brokken-Zijp, J. C. & Michels, M. A. Evidence for superlocalization on a fractal network in conductive carbon-black–polymer composites. *Physical review letters* **69**, 494 (1992).
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>44. Dho, J., Kim, B.-G. & Ki, S. Distinctive uniaxial magnetic anisotropy and positive magnetoresistance in (110)-oriented Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> films. *JAP* **117**, 163904 (2015).
- 45. Wang, J. *et al*. Magnetoresistance sign change in iron-doped amorphous carbon flms at low temperatures. *J. Phys. D: App. Phys* **47**, 215002 (2014).
- 46. Lee, Y. J., Kim, Y. S. & Shin, H. K. Magnetoresistance of amorphous indium oxide flms at the region of weak-strong localization crossover. *J. Phys. Cond. Mat.* **14**, 483 (2002).
- 47. Zeng, Y. *et al*. Large positive room temperature magnetoresistance in nanogranular FeCo–Si–N thin flms. *Mat. Lett.* **110**, 27 (2013).
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>48. Movaghar, B. *et al*. A model for the anomalous magnetoresistance in amorphous semiconductors. *J. Phys. C: Sol. St. Phy.* **11**, 125 (1977).

#### **Acknowledgements**

Tis work at UC Berkeley (R.R) was funded by the NSF-SRC center, CAPSL and by an ARO grant (R.K and H.T.) W911NF-13-1-0428. H. T. acknowledges James Bullock for helping with XPS characterization, which was performed at the Joint Center for Artificial Photosynthesis, supported through the Office of Science of the U.S. Department of Energy under Award Number DESC0004993. Work at UC Berkeley and Lawrence Berkeley National Lab (A.J.) was supported by the Electronic Materials Program, funded by the Director, Office of Science, Office of Basic Energy Sciences, Material Sciences and Engineering Division of the U.S. Department of Energy under Contract No. DE-AC02-05CH11231. Z.C. acknowledges support from the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Office of Basic Energy Sciences, Materials Sciences and Engineering Division under Contract No. DE-AC02-05-CH11231 (Materials Project program KC23MP) for the development and study of novel functional materials. R.X. acknowledges support from the National Science Foundation under Grant DMR-1708615. L.W.M. acknowledges support from the Army Research Office under Grant W911NF-14-1-0104. H. T. acknowledges Dr. David Geohagen at CNMS for use of their STEM instrument.

#### **Author contributions**

B.P., H.T., R.K. and R.R. designed the experiments. H.T. synthesized and characterized the FDTO flms. B.P. fabricated the GMR devices and performed magnetic and ferroelectric measurements. Y.-L.H. has deposited BFO/SRO flms. Z.C. has performed in XAS and XMCD measurements. V.T. and R.X. have done ferroelectric measurements. R.M., T.S.S., M.H., S.S. and A.J. performed XPS measurements. S.-L.H., C.L. and G.D. performed TEM/EELS imaging. H.T., B.P., L.W.M., R.K. and R.R. all made contribution to writing the manuscript. All authors discussed results and commented on the manuscript.

#### **Competing interests**

The authors declare no competing interests.

#### **Additional information**

**Supplementary information** is available for this paper at<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-58592-5>.

**Correspondence** and requests for materials should be addressed to B.P., R.R. or R.K.

**Reprints and permissions information** is available at [www.nature.com/reprints.](http://www.nature.com/reprints)

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional afliations.

**Co O Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit [http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

 $© The Author(s) 2020$