

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Circle of Goods: Women, Work, and Welfare in a Reservation Community. By Tressa Berman.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5tj078c5>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 27(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Dobkins, Rebecca

**Publication Date**

2003-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

reconstruction of ancestral houses Allen recounts in Maori fiction and cultural performance. Struggles over the retention and return of grave goods parallel the “prized possession” motif in the Maori texts. The recuperation of not only land, but also collective memory, as the touchstone for indigenous identity in the Wounded Knee occupation offers a logical extension of Allen’s central argument. An interesting three-way comparison could be developed among AIM standards of indigenous identity at Wounded Knee, the “mixed blood” versus “full blood” dispute in Pine Ridge politics during that period, and the federally defined standards for enrollment, blood quantum and otherwise.

Though perhaps beyond the scope of this book, an even more compelling area of analysis would seem to be the counternarratives deployed against indigenous struggles in the 1970s. Why does Allen’s book close with international declarations from 1974 and 1975 when the book’s parameters are 1945 through 1980? Perhaps because such strategies suffered major setbacks in the following years, the dominant culture seemed to be speaking with a bulldozer in New Zealand in 1978. But some of the narratives being deployed in the United States were more Machiavellian and ultimately far more destructive, particularly the FBI strategies centering around circulation of the apocryphal “Dog Soldier” teletypes just prior to the 1976 bicentennial.

Allen shows convincingly that “re-membering” the language of treaties in order to recuperate indigenous identity and rights is an important strategy for indigenous survival. But whether construed as self-directed ritual reenactment or as confrontational politics directed at a dominant culture, the significance of this strategy transcends identity politics. As John Trudell stated in a “Radio Free Alcatraz” broadcast, “What we have done by this declaration, we have done for Indians, but to those whites who desire that their government be a government of law, justice, and morality, we say we have done it also for you. Signed Indians of All Tribes” (*Alcatraz*, p. 132).

*Sandra Baringer*

University of California, Riverside

**Circle of Goods: Women, Work, and Welfare in a Reservation Community.** By Tressa Berman. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003. 154 pages. \$65.50 cloth; \$21.95 paper.

At its heart, *Circle of Goods: Women, Work, and Welfare in a Reservation Community* is a critique of federal Indian policy, articulated through the voices of Native American women of the Fort Berthold Reservation in North Dakota and through Berman’s astute development and application of social theory. Berman’s contributions are twofold. First, she develops a group of conceptual tools that help us theorize about the relationship between the ceremonial and the political in reservation economies. Second, she artfully employs testimonies collected over many years of fieldwork, offering a kind of ethnographic montage possible only after long-term familiarity with a community. These two contributions are, of course, interdependent: the testimonies

themselves, originally focused upon work, lead inevitably to an analysis of the historical and contemporary federal policies against which Native American women's economic experience is shaped.

The location of *Circle of Goods* is the Fort Berthold Reservation in North Dakota, home to the Mandan, Hidatsa, and Arikara, considered the "Three Affiliated Tribes" for political and legal purposes. Berman has more than ten years of association with the people of the reservation, although an overview of specific dates of residence is not offered. The historical experiences of the three tribes, which include epidemics, forced relocation, and displacement from the creation of the Garrison Dam hydroelectric project in the 1950s, resonate with those of others throughout North America (see, for example, Loretta Fowler's *Shared Symbols, Contested Meanings: Gros Ventre Culture and History, 1778–1984*, [1987]). The photographs illustrating the book testify to the geographical isolation of Fort Berthold.

The organizing theme of Berman's fieldwork and analysis is that of the "circle of goods" of the book's title—the circulation of goods and commodities that can be understood as a symbolic system reflecting power relations. Women are at the center of this circle, with the often-separated categories of work, family, and ceremony intertwined in community life. Berman's core analytical concept is that of "ceremonial relations of production," introduced in chapter two. This concept encompasses the complex involvement of American Indian women in community cultural life, subsistence practices, and the market economy that extends in space beyond the reservation to urban centers. As Berman explains: "Ceremonial relations of production distribute power by stretching out webs of social relations across space (beyond the localized work site) and through time as a dimension of cultural history" (p. 31). Integral to the concept of ceremonial relations of production is an understanding of the "community as worksite," in which "site" is understood not strictly in spatial terms, but in terms of the web of social relations extending from *both* workplace and kinship relations. Along the strands of this web, Berman convincingly argues, are "focalwomen," a term she coins to describe Fort Berthold women who produce and distribute goods and organize key community events such as feasts, giveaways, and other public ceremonial occasions. Not necessarily activists or political leaders, focalwomen might nonetheless become involved in political activities, as a consequence of their ability to mobilize social networks.

To illustrate ceremonial relations of production in concrete terms, Berman turns to a long-standing tradition in ethnographic representation: creating a composite picture of a series of events. After the death of the elder, Lizzy, a network of women related through marriage, blood ties, and fictive kin relations begins to gather the food and goods needed for the wake and funeral. Among the most important goods are star quilts, which various women make in great quantities, to be finished by an Indian-owned quilting business. In this section, Berman discusses the historical development of star quilts as part of both "ceremonial and market cycles of exchange" (p. 42). As a symbol of "Indianness," they are valued as a marker of status and given to mark major life events. They are also produced for external markets

(museums, galleries, individual collectors, powwows, etc.), and thus provide income and/or a means of exchange for other needed goods. Berman also notes the shift from the collective quilting process historically engaged in by groups of women sewing together by hand to the contemporary home-based process of machine sewing done by individual women.

In quilting Berman indeed chose an excellent vehicle with which to explain ceremonial relations of production. Yet, she might have expanded her all-too-brief exploration of the cycle of production and exchange of this art form and commodity into a longer discussion of the issues noted above, such as the shift from collective to individual production of quilts and the difference between quilts produced for giving and those for sale. Nevertheless, her analysis offers a provocative example for scholars interested in the production and consumption of Native American traditional and contemporary art and links her work with that of such scholars as Ruth Phillips (see *Trading Identities: The Souvenir in Native North American Art from the Northeast, 1700–1900*). Berman's tracing of the "circle of goods" within and, to a lesser extent, outside a Native American community offers a model for scholars who study Indian "art" products ("tourist art," giveaway goods) that follow similar paths of production and exchange.

Berman recognizes that for her analytical model to make sense, she must explicate the complexity of Native American women's forms of leadership. These forms are not necessarily neatly divided into political, ceremonial, and family/kin network realms. Having introduced the concept of focalwomen, or informal community cultural leaders, Berman goes on in chapter four to discuss other examples of women's leadership. She uses Luis Kemnitzer's categories of tribal leadership as "categorical" (formally recognized, such as political positions) or "processual" (emerging through community social relations, such as traditional cultural leaders) to analyze one of her interviewees, who described women's leadership at Fort Berthold as "political" or "ceremonial" (pp. 82–83). She discusses how the Three Affiliated Tribes' first tribal chairwoman, Rose Crow Flies High, offers an example of someone who embodied both systems of leadership, with a deep cultural knowledge base that brought her the respect needed to be an effective political leader. Women's tribal leadership is an area of inquiry worthy of further analysis in Native American studies. Although the growth in the number of women tribal chairpersons has been striking over the last few decades, we know very little about where and why female leaders arise, nor do we have significant comparative analysis of women's leadership in different tribes and regions. Berman's work should serve as a jumping-off point for further such work.

One of the common threads of the book is a critique of how federal policy has shaped reservation political economies (Berman follows the work of Thomas Biolsi at Rosebud and Pine Ridge reservations). Chapter five centers on the implications of the 1996 Welfare Reform Act for native communities, particularly for women. While this reviewer would have welcomed some quantitative analysis about the impact of welfare reform on household income and on tribal social service expenditures, Berman's analysis is primarily theoretical. She argues that welfare reform requires a critical examination of what is

considered “work” and that reform policies carry race, class, and gender biases that do not reflect the “community as worksite” conceptual model of Native American reservation life. She also discusses how welfare reform undercuts tribal sovereignty, in part by routing welfare block grants to tribes through states (thus sidestepping federal trust responsibilities). She also raises the question of the potential impact on reservation economies of urban-dwelling tribal members who return home after their welfare benefits run out after the new two-year limit. These issues are all worthy of deeper consideration by scholars of contemporary native communities.

As an experiment in ethnographic writing, *Circle of Goods* has a number of strengths. One is that the text itself, by weaving in short direct testimonies from interviewees, reflects what Berman refers to as the “complex set of dialogues” (p. xiii) that make up the compositional process behind ethnography. The several case studies, or vignettes, that focus on specific communities and/or events such as the Shell Creek community descended from a rebel Hidatsa band, or the Thunder Bay land claims case where women took action to retain familial land rights, offer crisp illustrations of more abstract theoretical points. Yet, although the brevity and economy of the text is welcome, the book could benefit from the presentation of more sustained narrative strands—for example, following one or two women through the entire text, returning repeatedly to specific characters so that the reader leaves with a more complete sense of the humanity of Berman’s interviewees. The text—probably intentionally—is rather staccato, resulting in a less-than-complete image of any given Fort Berthold woman. Some explicit dialogue between author and subjects does occur within the text, but I found myself wanting more, particularly because Berman does do a good job of crediting analytical insights to her interviewees several times.

*Circle of Goods* makes an important contribution to the study of reservation political economy, gender relations, the material dimensions of ceremonial life, and art production. Scholars concerned with these arenas would do well to build upon Berman’s work.

*Rebecca Dobkins*

Willamette University

**Etowah: The Political History of a Chiefdom Capital.** By Adam King. Tuscaloosa and London: The University of Alabama Press, 2003. 216 pages. \$55.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper.

For 600 years, the people archaeologists call Mississippians dominated the Southeast and Midwest. Farmers and traders, artists and builders, politicians and town dwellers, Mississippian people left a distinctive mark on the landscape. Perhaps most prominent were their walled towns and the truncated earthen pyramids they built to serve as platforms for chiefs’ residences, religious structures, and other public buildings. Although archaeologists know more than 500 towns—capitals of simple and complex chiefdoms—