

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Ghost Dance Songs and Religion of a Wind River Shoshone Woman. By Judith Vander.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5kt0x3t2>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 12(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Keeling, Richard

Publication Date

1988-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

plaining continuity and change just as logically as the nearest social scientist.

Richard O. Clemmer
University of Denver

Ghost Dance Songs and Religion of a Wind River Shoshone Woman. By Judith Vander. Monograph Series in Ethnomusicology, Number 4. Los Angeles: Program in Ethnomusicology, Department of Music, University of California, 1986. 76 pages. \$9.95 Paper.

It is unusual to find such a wealth of subtlety and inspiration in a book so brief as this. Not one word is wasted here, and *Ghost Dance Songs* has a quality of directness and honesty that begins to be recognized as its author's trademark. Vander's style has a certain innocence about it—not to be confused with naiveté—and it is perhaps this which allows her to take such a bold approach in the book under review. To explain this remark, it may help to digress a bit concerning the current movement toward ethical reform in Native American studies and how this has effected recent work in ethnomusicology.

In modern literature on American Indian music, two inter-related trends seem to have emerged as especially significant: (1) first, a recognition of Indian artists or intellectuals as accomplished persons rather than merely as anonymous culture-bearers, and (2) secondly, a willingness to stand aside and let these individuals speak for themselves. Self-evident as these standards may seem, they have not always prevailed, and the literature on Native American cultures published between 1900 and 1970 is dominated by works in which ethnologists use information given by nameless "informants" as fuel for their own creative accomplishments.

Recently, however, "scientific" description and analyses of Indian music has finally begun to wane in prominence, and a new style is beginning to emerge. Basically, these books try to focus on things from an Indian point of view, and a few of them deserve special mention.

One of earliest and most important of these books is *Navajo Blessingway Singer: Frank Mitchell 1881-1967*, which appeared in

1978. This is narrated in first person throughout, and Navajo specialists Charlotte Frisbie and David McAllester serve mainly as editors. In a work such as this, the reader gets a very close look at Frank Mitchell and the events of his life, but there is virtually no attempt at musical analysis. Another study which strives to relate the personal knowledge of an individual is *The Ojibwa Dance Drum: Its History and Construction*, by Thomas Vennum Jr. (1982). In this book, Vennum quotes often and at length from his Ojibwa friend, William Bineshi Baker, Sr., and these comments become a foundation upon which Vennum erects an impressive study of Ojibwa ethnohistory in relation to the drum. Here again, however, music (sound) itself does not receive close attention, and one is provoked to speculate whether extended analysis might have introduced a "tone" quite different from what Vennum was trying to achieve.

A third example, the recent study *Yaqui Deer Songs* (1987), is actually a collaboration between a professional scholar (Larry Evers) and a younger Yaqui man (Felipe S. Molina) who is himself a traditional deer singer. Working together, they produce beautiful translations of the song texts, but again there is very little information about the deer songs as music (nor do the authors attempt to discuss the broader distribution of similar song-cycles among other tribes of the Southwest and in Southern California).

In these and other modern writings on American Indian music, I sense a distinct reluctance to analyze or even notate Indian music. As ethnomusicologists, we seem to be somewhat paralyzed by a recognition that our analytical toolchest is filled with implements that were developed during an earlier era of (exploitive) research we are currently trying to live down. Thus, these new books have a lot of Indian-ness but not enough musicology, and one could begin to wonder whether we had reformed ourselves into extinction.

None of this is a problem for Judith Vander, who balances comments of a (Wind River) Shoshone woman with scholarly analysis as if there were nothing in the world more natural. In the Preface and a brief first chapter the reader is introduced to Emily Hill and learns to appreciate the special significance of her knowing 17 Ghost Dance songs at this point in history. We are also given background information on Wind River Shoshone, and most significantly that these Indians have sort of dual heritage:

they were a Great Basin people originally, but later adopted the horse and came under the general influence of Plains Indian life.

Vander's boldness becomes evident in the next section (Chapter Two), which is entitled "The Naraya" (as the Ghost Dance is known among Wind River Shoshone people). She summarizes information on Wovoka's vision as described in James Mooney's 1896 classic, *The Ghost Dance Religions and the Sioux Outbreak of 1890*, but up against this she juxtaposes Emily Hill's opinion that the Naraya is actually more ancient than Mooney suggests: "Them songs been sung long time ago," Emily is quoted, "by old Indians, I don't know how many hundred years" (page 7).

At first, Emily's comments strike the reader as apocryphal when viewed against the grainy truth of a history we have long since taken for granted, but Vander follows with a convincing analysis suggesting that the so-called Ghost Dance was indeed but a single manifestation of broader religious practices which were current among Indians of the Basin and Plateau areas since long before 1890.

In Chapter Three ("Musical Analysis"), Vander's scholarly alter-ego comes yet further to the fore, but the writing is so clear and unpretentious that non-specialists will easily grasp the special qualities of the music. The methods used here are not terribly different from those of George Herzog in his famous essay, "The Plains Ghost Dance and Great Basin Music" (1935), and yet Vander does proceed beyond Herzog in one important respect, and this is the key to her approach. While Herzog focused on the symmetry of the music, Vander plays off Herzog's analysis to focus on the variations between repeated phrases. She follows Herzog in noting that every phrase is sung twice, but rather than embracing this formula completely she looks at all the little ways in which the details of melody and rhythm work against it. She also demonstrates how the paired repetitions achieve formal unity over the course of a whole song and even employs a skeletal analysis reminiscent of Schenker (page 36) to demonstrate how one song reflects influence of Plains Indian singing.

Before leaving Chapter Three, it seems worth noting that its special mixture of simplicity and sophistication owes much to the quality of the music itself. The analysis seems all the more elegant because Vander has based her analysis upon a corpus (17 songs sung by one woman) which is complete unto itself yet

seems to reflect the larger realm of the music as a whole. This is another advantage that Vander created for herself by focusing on Emily Hill as an individual, and such are the hidden decisions that make for superior scholarship.

Chapter Four ("Textual Analysis") was the most informative of all for me, and here again one is struck by the author's resourcefulness. Vander provides an interlinear translation for several of the songs and conveys additional information on each text in quotes drawn from comments made by Emily Hill. There are many inspired moments here, and one, for example, relates to a song-text which mentions a butterfly fluttering amidst the boughs of a pine tree. Juxtaposing Emily's remarks with her own clarification, Vander writes as follows (page 45):

"They fly under those shady pine trees. . . . That's where those butterflies fly. That's what it means." Emily elaborated on the meaning of the verb *yarokand*. She held up one hand, motionless, with fingers spread apart and moved her other hand behind it. This was her demonstration of how one saw the butterflies (moving hand) flying under or through the shady pine boughs (motionless hand).

In a final chapter (Chapter Five) entitled "The Naraya Today" Vander examines the decline of the Naraya in modern times, and she finds a way to touch on many aspects of the process in a very short space. She manages to convey the living significance of this music for her friend Emily Hill, and here again at the end of the book the reader is impressed by an author who manages to seem both scholarly and down-to-earth at the same time.

Richard Keeling
University of California, Los Angeles

Halo of the Sun: Stories Told and Retold. By Noel Bennett. Photographs by John Running. Flagstaff: Northland Press, 1987. 125 pages. \$14.95 Paper.

There is no question but that this is a handsome volume. On the cover, the bright colors of the sunrise announce a book with the look and heft of a coffee table book. The many photographs, both color, and black and white, and the slick paper proclaim the