

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Elsie's Business. By Frances Washburn.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5kb47553>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Maynor, Louise Cummings

**Publication Date**

2007-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

archaeology (255): “that archaeologists understand the historical, political, and community contexts of their research. With these contexts in mind, each archaeologist must strive towards a discipline that is a positive force for Native people, instead of the negative and destructive force it has so often been.”

This is a great book. Every chapter adds a layer of nuance to understanding the ongoing transformation of archaeology. Every author has something meaningful to contribute to the debate about what archaeology has been and what it could be. It is as if these authors have been storing up their thoughts, arguments, and experiences over the decades only to have them explode onto the pages of this powerful volume. All of the authors emphasize that collaboration is not easy, that at every juncture there is the equal possibility of cooperation or conflict. They uniformly write that there is no one basic formula for collaboration, although there are some basic principles: share power, ensure good communication, and foster mutual respect (xxx). These can be achieved not through rules and regulations but by cultivating the virtues of goodwill, listening, and honesty. It is a habitual enactment of these virtues that lead to fruitful collaboration. “In the final analysis,” as Sanger, Pawling, and Soctomah simply yet persuasively conclude, “a synergy develops from mutual trust and respect” (327).

*Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh*

Denver Museum of Nature and Science

**Elsie’s Business.** By Frances Washburn. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2006. 212 pages. \$17.95 paper.

*Elsie’s Business* by Frances Washburn is a fast-paced mystery of a young Indian woman, Elsie Roberts, who lives a troubled, isolated life burdened with hardship and tragedy. The defining moment of Elsie’s life occurs when she is beaten, raped, and left to die on the side of the road in Mobridge, North Dakota just outside Standing Rock Reservation. Elsie miraculously survives this brutality, but that is just the beginning of the miseries plotted in Washburn’s engrossing tale of Elsie’s survival. *Elsie’s Business* captivates the reader with a plot of unexpected, sometimes macabre, developments and complications. In thirty engaging chapters, Elsie Roberts proves to be a resolute, tough, resourceful woman who surprises, stuns, and even horrifies the reader from time to time. A first novel for Frances Washburn, *Elsie’s Business* holds the reader’s interest from its beginning to the final page.

Washburn knows traditional storytelling and combines the oral tradition with the literary to reveal the intricacies of Elsie’s story. The author employs a framework tale—a story within a story—in which a stranger comes to Jackson, North Dakota, seeking information about Elsie Roberts who died a year earlier. The narrator has learned that stories take on a life of their own in the American Indian community, and the only way to know the full story is to consult the elders. The unnamed narrator seeks the truth about Elsie by consulting the elder Oscar DuCharme “who can tell you all the stories” (1).

The sympathetic narrator's identity remains unclear for most of the novel, but we learn a great deal about Oscar DuCharme, the mysterious events of Elsie's life, and the supportive nature of the American Indian community through this stranger's interaction with Oscar.

*Elsie's Business* is narrated through a dual point of view. The narrator, whom we come to know as George Washington, tells the external frame story in second-person present tense, but Oscar DuCharme tells Elsie's story in third-person past tense, interweaving flashbacks, flash forwards, myths and tales, and lessons from the Lakota cultural traditions. At first, the narrator's second-person "you" reference is puzzling, but the reader is soon convinced that "you" is not a communicative or directive reference to the reader to perform some action in response; this reference is an authentic second-person voice to be sustained throughout the story. This "you" becomes an active participant in the story. Although the second-person point of view has been used in contemporary novels and in some short stories, it is not common in fiction. Jay McInerney's *Bright Lights, Big City* is probably the best-known example of sustained second-person narration. Through second-person narration, Washburn is able to withhold the full identity of the narrator until the end of the novel, thus increasing the mystery of why he sacrifices so much in order to know Elsie; Washburn emphasizes the insider and outsider relationship of the characters involved and focuses the themes clearly.

The stranger's perspective also gives the reader an objective eye on the Lakota world of DuCharme, while DuCharme, as a trusted elder, fills in the details of Elsie's experiences to prove that "if you really want to see it like it happened, go ask one of the grandfathers" (1). As a permanent member of the community where Elsie lived, Oscar DuCharme is a credible narrator who has heard the story from all angles. By the end of the story, none of the direct participants in Elsie's business can speak for her except Nancy Marks, another emotionally resilient woman in the story. All of these factors lend DuCharme the objectivity he needs to satisfy the narrator who is seeking the truth about Elsie. From their first meeting on 16 January to their last day together on 4 February 1970, the two men participate in a fascinating exchange of viewpoints as well as a deepening appreciation of each other. Washburn's innovation with DuCharme as narrator of the inner story and the stranger as narrator of the external story actually engages the reader in the oral tradition. The second-person narration draws the reader in as confidante, listener, and participant in the story.

In *Elsie's Business*, Washburn gets an opportunity to test her own theory of Native storytelling—interlocking oral and literary traditions. DuCharme tells one story with another; he sometimes answers the narrator's questions with another story. "Oscar folds his hands over his big belly and he starts a different story, a story that you think doesn't have anything to do with Elsie" (5). Stories and myths of the Lakota weave their way into the master narrative. The stories concatenate from the opening chapter to the final one with each one linked to Oscar DuCharme's version of Elsie's business. Mixing the oral with the written is tricky for the writer, but Washburn does it well because she does not overdo it. DuCharme's stories do connect to Elsie's story.

Washburn critiques the writer's difficulty with "translating oral tradition into literary tradition" in a 2004 critical review, "The Risk of Misunderstanding in Greg Sarris's *Keeping Slug Woman Alive: A Holistic Approach to American Indian Texts*," in *Studies in American Indian Literature* (70). To paraphrase, Washburn explains the difficulty of telling stories on the printed page—what we miss in the translation, what we cannot capture in a removed context from the storyteller, what the writer must do to compensate for the potential loss in this printed form, and even what the writer must provide for the reader to understand the story (70–76). She asserts that the reader who is not steeped in the oral tradition may not be able to interpret the meaning intended in the story. "Oral tradition must be translated and explicated so that readers see beyond just the tapestry itself to an understanding of the cultural impulses that make up the weaving" (82). Given this extra burden of knowing the context of the story, the reader of *Elsie's Business* can move effectively through this story because of Washburn's use of the dual-narrative technique. We know more of the cultural context of the story because of the external narration of George Washington who can probe for the answers. From DuCharme we hear the emotionally compelling story of Elsie and a depiction of the supportive nature of the tribal community to help to preserve its own. George Washington frames the story; DuCharme gives us the meaning. Washburn inserts her own literary theory of the nature of storytelling early in the text in a passage that does not seem to belong to either of the narrators—George Washington or Oscar DuCharme. This voice explains that "bigger towns touch the gossip one day, one week, maybe one month, and then they reach out to some newer story, but in Jackson, a story as big as Elsie's happens rarely, so it gets handed around for weeks and months. . . . [P]eople have fondled the story so long that they've worn the bumps off it, smoothed it with loving words, polished it with lies, half truths, and omissions" (1).

Interwoven with the narrative of *Elsie's Business* are stories of Double Face Woman and the deer woman that are analogous to the events in Elsie's story and that underscore the theme of justice in the novel. In these narratives, a force of nature avenges the wrongs that would otherwise go unpunished. In the larger story, it is clear that deer woman brings about justice when Elsie is raped and left to die in Mobridge. The white boys responsible for the violence meet instant death that night when they see a deer in their headlights causing them to crash into a tree. This incident is just the first encounter with deer woman in the story. Deer woman is blamed for the sexual excesses of the men in the story. The lives of Donald Marks and John Caulfield are changed for the worse as a result of their abuses of Elsie. Or is the deer woman just avenging wrongdoing? Marks and Caulfield meet strangely tragic ends. Jack Mason who looms ominously over Elsie's life must bear the suspicion that he is responsible for Elsie's death. DuCharme sums up the deer woman's role when he says, "The spirits take care of justice" (185).

Further review of *Elsie's Business* could consider the layers of meaning in the story beginning with the title, the humor of the American Indian storyteller, the supportive role of Native communities, the alienation and isolation of the protagonist, the infusion of myth and culture-specific information in

narrative, the implications of identity with a half-black/half-Indian protagonist, and the role of women in American Indian fiction. The novel invites thematic comparisons with James Welch's protagonist in *Winter in the Blood*, with the burdened Rayona of Michael Dorris's *Yellow Raft in Blue Water*, with the conflicted Tayo in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Ceremony*, and many more.

*Elsie's Business* is the fifth title in the new series, *Native Stories: A Series of American Narratives*, published by the University of Nebraska Press and edited by Gerald Vizenor and Diane Glancy. Judging from the high quality of this novel, the series attracts the best Native literary and cultural contributors of our time. Gerald Vizenor described this novel for the book jacket as "an outstanding, original, engaging narrative of a native community and survivance." I fully agree.

Louise Cummings Maynor  
North Carolina Central University

**Imagining Native America in Music.** By Michael V. Pisani. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2005. 422 pages. \$48.00 cloth.

Academic interest in Western composers who have used Native North American themes and imagery has been on the upswing in recent years, in large part because the burgeoning subfield of American music studies has begun to make itself heard in the broader discipline of musicology. In many ways "Americanists" (as they often refer to themselves) took to discussing musical expression outside of the typical canon of "Great Works" because, according to the disciplinarily approved definition, Europeans wrote essentially all Great Works. Americanists also tend to do the small stuff and in doing so often uncover larger themes in music and culture that would be lost by simply studying minor composers. Essentially this is exactly what Michael Pisani has done with this text, and, by exploring the theme of "Indianness" in Western music, he has brought to light the often strange collaborations of composers, ethnographers, crusaders for social justice, and commercial interests in producing a musical genre that, while failing to catch on as art, remains with us today in various popular styles including musical theater and film scores.

Pisani wrote his dissertation on this topic (as did this author) and uses (and graciously credits) the theoretical framework I created in the mid-1990s for this newer study that, after Charles Peirce's semiotic schema, categorizes compositions as symbolic (Native inspired), indexical (drawing in some way from Native culture), or iconic (using sound materials derived in some way from Native music, usually through mediated transcribed sources). This framework rests upon the relationship of the musical work to the "authentic," which in this case means the actual Native song, oral text, or other cultural expression, often filtered multiple times, first through the process of transcription into Western notation and then by "idealization" (that is, changing the pitches), in order to make the melody easier to harmonize. Idealization was most often done by a group of composers who were writing