

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Art from Fort Marion: The Silberman Collection. By Joyce M. Szabo

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5bb181sz>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Meadows, William C.

Publication Date

2009

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Art from Fort Marion: The Silberman Collection. By Joyce M. Szabo. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. 208 pages. \$49.95 cloth.

Art from Fort Marion focuses on a set of drawings made by Plains Indians (primarily Kiowa and Cheyenne) imprisoned after the close of warfare on the southern Plains at Fort Marion, Florida, from 1875 to 1878. Already coming from a rich tradition in Plains pictographic painting and drawing and encouraged by Captain Richard Henry Pratt to make drawings during their incarceration and for sales to tourists, a unique genre of pictographic drawing or ledger-style art emerged. The late Arthur and Shifra Silberman of Oklahoma City collected a number of these drawings, later donating them to the National Cowboy and Western Heritage Museum in Oklahoma City. This collection was analyzed and described by art historian Joyce Szabo. Although the majority of the collection consists of eighty-seven drawings on paper, one fan, one vase, and one shield are also examined (7).

Szabo provides a thorough examination and description of the collection. She elicits many useful details such as Zotam's focus on panoramic views that chronicle the group's selection and trip to Fort Marion and his use of miniature abbreviated references, and Making Medicine's focus on individual scenes and activities in Florida with fine linear lines and great attention to detail. Although the majority of the drawings depict groups of men engaged in a variety of activities before their arrival at (portraits in traditional dress, warrior society gatherings, hunting, their surrender at Fort Sill, their selection for imprisonment), on the way to (transport, trains, boats, cities they passed through), and at Fort Marion (landscape, work details, sailing, shark hunting, dances, army staff, lighthouses, interaction with tourists), a few are portraits of individuals.

Useful aspects include spatial experimentation and captions, the influences of daily interaction with members of the other tribes, and the shift away from warfare-related themes typical in traditional Plains Indian graphic arts. The author also shows that primarily younger warriors engaged in the making of the drawings—perhaps due in part from the need to secure their status in contrast to older, more established warriors, and the focus of the works as auto-ethnographic and as representations of not only what the men experienced but also of what they deemed important and chose to depict (34–35).

Although the limited number of drawings in the collection and the artists that produce them restricts the breadth of analysis beyond a few topics (clothing and paraphernalia, warrior society membership, narrative vs. close-up *foci*, Kiowa vs. Cheyenne styles), the author not only recognizes these limitations but also links them to the broader patterns in the numerous studies of Fort Marion art. She concludes by discussing factors of collecting Indian art to larger issues of colonialism, romanticism, and individual interests.

There are a few weaknesses in this work, which suggest opportunities for future research. Aside from two phone interviews from a relative, there is little data on the Silbermans from people who knew them well such as Kiowa artisan Vanessa Jennings, Cheyenne artists, scholars (including myself), and local museum staff in Oklahoma. This would have contributed to a more

well-rounded presentation of the Silbermans' personalities, their motivations and methods in collecting Native art, how they interacted with others in the field of Indian art, and how Native peoples viewed the Silbermans and their collection. Some scholars and Native peoples found Mr. Silberman rather difficult to interact with. The role and impact of the collection in previous museum exhibits could also have been explored further (8). Furthermore, the anthropological concept of syncretism and the principals associated with this process of cultural blending and its contexts would aid Szabo in her discussion of hybridity (172).

In comparison with some earlier and more general works on Fort Marion art, this book focuses on a specific collection of drawings from this period. Whereas *Kiowa Memories* and the recently published *A Kiowa's Odyssey* focus on the drawings contained in specific books or ledgers, this work focuses on those of a specific couple's art collection. As additional Fort Marion works are brought to light through publication and analysis, our larger knowledge of this unique period in Plains Indian art, its artists and their experiences, and the genre of works they produced is enhanced.

Overall, I like this work and enjoyed reading it. It is concise, clear, easy to read, and beautifully illustrated. It synthesizes many seminal aspects of the Fort Marion experience in salient fashion and the Indian art produced there, makes another set of works from this unique experience accessible, and represents a solid contribution to studies of Plains Indian and Fort Marion art. As such it will be a useful contribution for scholars of Plains Indian cultures and arts.

William C. Meadows

Missouri State University

Bad Fruits of the Civilized Tree: Alcohol and the Sovereignty of the Cherokee Nation. By Izumi Ishii. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008. 260 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

In this well-written and accessible book, Izumi Ishii aims to examine "the ways in which the Cherokees integrated alcohol into their society and used it both culturally and strategically" from the early eighteenth century to the beginning of Oklahoma statehood in 1907 (2). She calls for scholars to move beyond simple tropes of Indian drunkenness, to consider the ways Indians brought alcohol into their lives, and to investigate how particular Indian groups dealt with this European innovation. Her research "demonstrates that the history of alcohol among the Cherokees was not simply a narrative of the conquest and destruction of Native society," but was far more complicated than that (11). The use of alcohol certainly became a problem at times, she argues, but there were other possibilities, and "Cherokees managed to regulate consumption in ways that asserted their sovereignty and demonstrated their morality" (165).

Specialists may not find these arguments entirely surprising, but Ishii does a fine job of showing us aspects of the constantly evolving Cherokee