UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
RIVERSIDE

Thracians Among Others:
A Study of "Thracianness" in Ancient Cross-Cultural Contexts

A Dissertation submitted in partial satisfaction
of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

History

by

Jeffrey J. Chu

September 2022

Dissertation Committee:
Dr. Denver Graninger, Chairperson
Dr. Michele Salzman
Dr. Lisa Raphals

The Dissertation of Jeffrey J. Chu is approved:

_____

_____

_____

Committee Chairperson

University of California, Riverside

Acknowledgements

Over the years, and in the course of researching and writing this dissertation, I have benefited immeasurably from the wisdom, support, and kindness of others. First and foremost, I must express a deep debt of gratitude to my Ph.D. advisor Denver Graninger, whose unfailing patience, sage advice, and gentle prodding allowed me to bring this project to fruition. He has always pushed me to improve and challenge myself, and his example remains an inspiration. I must also give enormous thanks to my committee members, Michele Salzman and Lisa Raphals, for their input and past instruction, which nurtured my intellectual growth and greatly enriched my experience at the University of California, Riverside. Needless to say, the various shortcomings of this work are entirely my own responsibility.

I would like to acknowledge, in addition, the mentorship that I received from my former professors at California State University, Long Beach, especially the late David Hood, who set me on the path to studying ancient history and advised me during my undergraduate and M.A. programs. And I owe my understanding of Greek and Latin to the excellent teaching of Kathryn Chew, Elaine Wida, and Douglas Domingo-Forasté; they guided me through the difficult process of learning these languages with unceasing patience and care.

Institutional support from the University of California, Riverside helped make my research possible. I am profoundly grateful, in particular, for the funding that I received from the History Department and the Center for Ideas and Society. Thanks are also in

order to the library and interlibrary loan staff, who dutifully processed my hundreds of requests for books and articles.

Numerous friends and fellow graduate students have aided me along the way as well: John Haberstroh, Shahrouz Khalifian, Mark Benton, Heather Richard, Jason Moore, Ted Oh, Engin Gokcek, Kate Mower, Richard Rush, Michael D'Amato, Rachel Tyra, Madeleine St. Marie, Jordan Cohen, David Shanta, David McCaskey, Leslie Tsan, and so many others. I cherish all those times when we commiserated, laughed, and exchanged ideas with each other.

My family has been a major source of love and encouragement throughout my life: my mom Melody and late stepfather Wayne; my father Lawrence and stepmother Ondine; my stepbrothers David and Craig; my grandparents and all my aunts and uncles. I should mention, too, my cats Dexter, Shadow, Sprite, Daphne, Kuma, and Zeno, who kept me company even when I worked into the wee hours, and who regularly attempted to assist me by walking over my keyboard.

Last but by no means least, I dedicate this project to my dear wife Ash. Her constant affection, support, and understanding carried me through this endeavor, despite the emotional and financial burdens that it imposed upon her. I feel truly blessed to have her as my partner and best friend.

ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION

Thracians Among Others:
A Study of "Thracianness" in Ancient Cross-Cultural Contexts

by

Jeffrey J. Chu

Doctor of Philosophy, Graduate Program in History
University of California, Riverside, September 2022
Dr. Denver Graninger, Chairperson

Although widely attested in the historical record, the people known in antiquity as the Thracians (who inhabited a region north of Greece called Thrace) remain poorly understood on the whole and largely stand at the margins of mainstream scholarship. This dissertation seeks to improve our understanding of the Thracians by exploring how they came to be recognized as a distinct ethnic group to both themselves and outsiders as a result of various cross-cultural interactions. Centered around four case studies, my investigation covers a chronological span from the seventh to first centuries B.C.E. and analyzes a wide array of literary, epigraphic, papyrological, and archaeological data. I begin with a consideration of Thracian cultural influences in five Greek colonies in Thrace—Mesambria, Zone, Odessos, Dionysopolis, and Apollonia—the residents of which, I argue, possessed mixed Greco-Thracian identities. The second case study reconstructs the history of the Thracian slave and freed population in Attica and how they eventually developed a sense of ethno-religious solidarity. The third focuses on the Thracians' encounters with the Achaemenid Persian Empire and the conceptualization of

Thracians within ancient Near Eastern ideological paradigms of imperial space. The fourth discusses Thracian military service, resettlement, social mobility, and identity formation under Alexander the Great and the Macedonian "Successor" states of the Hellenistic East. Altogether, I attempt to demonstrate that both Thracians and non-Thracians contributed to the construction of Thracian identity over time, with expressions of "Thracianness"—that is, the experiences, practices, beliefs, and forms of self-identification that marked out Thracians in the eyes of their contemporaries—being most pronounced and noticeable in settings where Thracians constituted a minority.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Chapter 1

Introduction

The people known in antiquity as the Thracians left a considerable presence in the historical record, yet much about them remains poorly understood, owing not only to the fragmentary and often tendentious nature of the ancient evidence but also a relative lack of sustained research within modern scholarship. This dissertation seeks to improve our understanding of the Thracians by exploring how "Thracianness"—that is, the experiences, practices, beliefs, and forms of self-identification that marked out Thracians in the eyes of their contemporaries—found expression through their interactions with non-Thracians. Fundamentally, the impetus for my investigation lies in a desire to contribute to a fuller and more inclusive portrait of ancient societies, one which recognizes the agency and influence of so-called "peoples without history." With respect to the Thracians, I hope to show that they belong no less to the history of the ancient Mediterranean, Near East, and Black Sea area than their better-known neighbors, namely the Greeks, Macedonians, and Persians.

My approach centers around four case studies. The first deals with the phenomenon of culturally "mixed" Greek-Thracian cities along the northern Aegean and western Black Sea coasts, where we discover indigenous Thracian influences interwoven into the fabric of civic and religious life in Greek colonies. The second examines the population of Thracian slaves and freedpersons in Attica and their contributions to Athenian history and society. The third focuses on Thracians' encounters with the Achaemenid Empire and the Persians' employment of Thracians as laborers, soldiers, and ideological symbols of

imperial reach and authority. The fourth considers Thracian military service and resettlement under Alexander the Great and the Hellenistic Successor states of the East, in the course of which a collective Thracian identity appears to have taken firmer shape as significant numbers of Thracians established themselves in Egypt and the Near East. These studies highlight the ways in which individuals and communities distinguished themselves as Thracians in cross-cultural settings while also aiming, more broadly, to reintroduce the Thracians into our modern (and traditionally Helleno-centric) narratives of the Archaic, Classical, and Hellenistic periods.

Thrace and the Thracians

In its most common usage, "Thracian" refers to a native inhabitant of Thrace, a region roughly bounded in antiquity by the Danube River to the north, the Aegean and Propontis to the south, the Black Sea to the east, and the Struma River to the west (today, this area overlaps with parts of Bulgaria, Greece, Romania, and Turkey.[1] Despite a physical environment that included thick forests, hills, mountains, and malarial wetlands, ancient Thrace possessed enough arable and pasturable land to support a substantial sedentary population, while a network of internal waterways and access to the Aegean and Black Seas facilitated the movement of people, goods, and ideas.[2] Standing at the crossroads of

[1] On the challenges of defining Thrace's boundaries: see Jan Bouzek and Denver Graninger, "Geography," in *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, ed. Julia Valeva et al. (Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015), 12-21 (12f.).

[2] See e.g. Zosia H. Archibald, *The Odrysian Kingdom of Thrace* (Oxford Monographs on Classical Archaeology; Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), 11-24; idem, *Ancient Economies of the Northern Aegean: Fifth to First Centuries BC* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), passim; Roger Batty, *Rome and the Nomads: The Pontic-Danubian Realm in Antiquity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), 55-106; Bouzek and Graninger, "Geography," 3-17. On the use of internal waterways in Thrace: see also Jan de Boer, "River

Europe and Asia, Thrace also formed a zone of extensive cross-cultural activity. By the end of the sixth century B.C.E., Thracians were engaged in regular contact (and at times conflict) with Greeks, Macedonians, and the forces of the Achaemenid Empire, and two centuries after that, Thracians comprised a significant portion of the multiethnic army that Alexander led to victory over the Persians.

The native inhabitants of Thrace consisted of numerous *ethne* (ἔθνη, usually translated as "tribes"), whom the Greeks collectively designated as *Thraikes* (Θρᾷκες), "Thracians" (etymologists in the nineteenth century of our era suggested a derivation from the verb θράσσω, "to stir up, to trouble").[3] To outsiders, these *ethne* seemed to share similar language, lifestyles, and values, and our sources also allege (probably correctly) close historical and cultural ties between the Thracians and certain peoples of Asia Minor, like the Bithynians and Phrygians.[4] Unsurprisingly, perhaps, the *Iliad* contains our earliest mentions of Thracians—the epic depicts them as "horse herders" (ἱπποπόλοι), brave warriors "with top-knotted hair" (ἀκρόκομοι), and allies of the Trojans in their war against

Trade in Eastern and Central Thrace from the Bronze Age till the Hellenistic Period," *Eirene* 46 (2010): 176-189; Totko Stoyanov, "The River System of North-Eastern Thrace as a Medium in Economic Relations in Classical and Hellenistic Times," in *Environment and Habitation around the Ancient Black Sea*, ed. David Braund et al. (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2021), 77-90.

[3] On the etymology: see e.g. John Kenrick, "On the Names of the Antehellenic Inhabitants of Greece," *Philological Museum* 1 (1832): 609-627 (618f.). Θράσσω derives, in turn, from Proto-Indo-European *$*d^hreh_2g^h$-*, "to irritate": see Robert Beekes with Lucien van Beek, *Etymological Dictionary of Greek*, 2 vols. (Leiden: Brill, 2010), 553 s.v. θράσσω. Cf. Wilhelm Tomaschek, "Die alten Thraker I. Eine ethnologische Untersuchung," *Sitzungsberichte der Philosophisch Historischen Classe der Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften* 128 (1893): 1-130 (11f.), who suggested a derivation from Proto-Indo-European *$*d^herh_2$-*, "to hold, to support."

[4] I discuss the connection between the Thracians and Asia Minor later in this study. On the literary traditions concerning this connection: see Stanley Casson, *Macedonia, Thrace and Illyria* (London: Humphrey Milford, Oxford University Press, 1926), 102-107.

the Greeks—yet the actual origins of "Thracian" as a concept remains unclear.[5] Nor do we know, for that matter, whether an equivalent term for "Thracian" ever existed in the Thracians' languages. Nevertheless, it does appear that by the mid-fourth century B.C.E., the Thracian rulers of the local Odrysian Kingdom had begun to refer to their subjects as "Thracians" (and possibly employ the title "King of the Thracians") in their dealings with the Greek world, and though the average "Thracian" in Thrace probably identified first and foremost with his or her *ethne*, we will see later that Thracians overseas frequently called themselves "Thracian" as well.

Thracians who had regular encounters with non-Thracians, I submit, eventually became a recognizable ethnic group to both themselves and outsiders, although what Thracian ethnic identity actually entailed varied depending on the circumstances. Broadly speaking, I agree with Jonathan M. Hall's definition of ethnic identity as "the operation of socially dynamic relationships which are constructed on the basis of a putative shared ancestral heritage," with territory, common myths of descent, and opposition to other ethnic groups—rather than language, religion, and culture— being key factors that influence its formation.[6] Thus, according to Hall, the Greeks' mythical genealogies provided the foundations for their sense of ethnic identity, while the experience of the Persian Wars

[5] See e.g. *Il.* 4.576, 10.433-440, 13.4. These descriptions perhaps reflect actual conditions in Thrace and contacts with Asia Minor during the Bronze Age: see e.g. Jan Bouzek, *Studies of Homeric Greece* (Prague: Charles University, Karolinum Press, 2018), 127-133.

[6] Jonathan M. Hall, *Ethnic Identity in Greek Antiquity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 16, 32. Cf. Siân Jones, *The Archaeology of Ethnicity: Constructing Identities in the Past and Present* (London: Routledge, 1997), 84: "Ethnic groups are culturally ascribed identity groups, which are based on the expression of a real or assumed shared culture and common descent (usually through the objectification of cultural, linguistic, religious, historical and/or physical characteristics). As a process ethnicity involves a consciousness of difference, which, to varying degrees, entails the reproduction and transformation of basic classificatory distinctions between groups of people who perceive themselves to be in some respect culturally distinct."

played a critical role in its crystallization, as it encouraged Greeks to articulate their differences from the "barbarian."[7] Unlike the Greeks, however, the Thracians did not leave behind an extensive body of literature that would afford us their own perspective on their myths and attitudes toward others, and we must instead rely upon the testimonies of non-Thracians alongside scattered evidence of Thracian self-identification and expression of Thracianness in mediums such as funerary monuments, graffiti, and religious dedications.[8] I propose that these sources attest to the development, over time, of different concepts of Thracian ethnicity, even if we cannot always precisely pinpoint the assumptions that underlay them.

Sources, Historiography, and Methodology

We must exercise caution, of course, when evaluating evidence for Thracianness on the basis of information reported by Greek and Roman authors, who customarily viewed the Thracians through a prism of stereotypes that portray them as unruly, uncivilized, and bellicose barbarians.[9] These stereotypes already surface in the fifth-century history of Herodotus, one of our earliest and most important sources on the Thracians. At the start of

[7] Hall, *Ethnic Identity*, 40ff.; see also idem, *Hellenicity: Between Ethnicity and Culture* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002).

[8] Extant texts written in Thracian languages (albeit with Greek script) remain few and largely undeciphered, and if Thracians did produce literature in the Greek language, none have survived to the present: see e.g. Anna Panayotou, "Greek and Thracian," transl. Chris Markham, in *A History of Ancient Greek: From the Beginnings to Late Antiquity*, ed. A.-F. Christidis with Maria Arapopoulou and Maria Chriti (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 738-744; Dan Dana, "Inscriptions," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 243-264 (244f.).

[9] On Greek stereotyping of Thracians: see e.g. Edith Hall, *Inventing the Barbarian: Greek Self-Definition through Tragedy* (Oxford Classical Monographs; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), 133-138; Joseph E. Skinner, *The Invention of Greek Ethnography: From Homer to Herodotus* (Greeks Overseas; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 83-86; Matthew A. Sears, *Athens, Thrace, and the Shaping of Athenian Leadership* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 142-149.

his ethnography of the Thracians, for instance, he declares them the largest population on earth after the Indians and deems their inability to unite politically as the sole obstacle to them becoming the "strongest of all peoples by far" (πολλῷ κράτιστον πάντων ἐθνέων).[10] Further in, he states that Thracians look down on those who cultivate the soil and that they consider it more honorable to live off of warfare and plundering.[11] Here and elsewhere, he draws attention to the Thracians' supposed propensity for violence, a notion which took on even greater prominence in subsequent descriptions of the Thracians.[12] Indeed, Herodotus' near contemporary and fellow historian Thucydides, an Athenian with close ties to Thrace, condemns the Thracian "race" (γένος) for what he characterizes as their extreme bloodthirstiness (φονικώτατος).[13]

Apart from such stereotypes, Greeks came to associate Thrace itself with liminality and faraway "outer space" in their geographic imaginations.[14] The *Iliad* and *Odyssey* convey these ideas in mythological terms by making Thrace the domain of Ares, the god of savage warfare, and Boreas, the god of the frigid north wind, whose traits set them apart from "civilized" life.[15] Even more explicitly, Herodotus claims that the lands north of the

[10] Hdt. 5.3.1. On Herodotus' conception of the Thracians: see David Asheri, "Herodotus on Thracian Society and History," in *Hérodote et Les Peuples Non Grecs: Neuf Exposés Suivis de Discussions*, ed. Giuseppe Nenci and Olivier Reverdin (Entretiens Sur l'Antiquité Classique 35; Vandoeuvres: Fondation Hardt, 1990), 131-169.

[11] Hdt. 5.6.2.

[12] For descriptions of Thrace and Thracians by Roman authors: see e.g. Tac. *Ann*. 4.46.1; Hor. *Carm.* 2.16.5; Flor. *Epit.* 39.

[13] Thuc. 7.29.4. On Thucydides' ties to Thrace: see e.g. Luciano Canfora, "Biographical Obscurities and Problems of Composition," in *Brill's Companion to Thucydides*, ed. Antonios Rengakos and Antonios Tsakmakis (Leiden: Brill, 2006), 3-31 (3-6); Sears, *Athens*, 87-89.

[14] See also Bouzek and Graninger, "Geography," 18f.

[15] For Ares: see *Il.* 13.301, *Od.* 8.361. For Boreas: see *Il.* 9.5, 23.229f. On their Thracian (i.e. "barbarous") origins: see e.g. Alexander Fol and Ivan Marazov, *Thrace and the Thracians* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1977), 24; Richard Janko, *The Iliad: A Commentary*, vol. 4 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 85.

Danube are "desolate" (ἐρῆμος) and "infinite" (ἄπειρος), thereby positioning Thrace as one of the edges of what Greeks considered the inhabited earth (οἰκουμένη), and he reinforces this point by juxtaposing the Thracians with the Indians, a people whom Greeks located at the earth's eastern edge.[16] Moreover, in another possible allusion to Thrace's liminality in relation to Greece, the fourth-century mythographer Andron of Halikarnassos names Europe, Thraike, Asia, and Libya as the four daughters of the Titan Okeanos.[17] As each daughter here corresponds with a continent, Andron has detached Thrace from Europe entirely and resituated it alongside the "barbarian" continents of Asia and Libya.[18] In this case, the ideological marginalization of Thrace takes precedence over the reality of Thrace's geographic adjacency to Greece.

Regrettably, the limitations and biases of our literary sources have influenced, both directly and indirectly, the shape of modern research on the Thracians, who continue to stand at the margins of mainstream scholarship, for the most part. In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries of our era, scholars at times repeated wholesale the negative image of the backward and uncultured Thracians. To quote, for example, the exceptionally harsh assessment by the Victorian classicist George Grote: "…the general character of the [Thracian] race presents an aggregate of repulsive features unredeemed by the presence of even the commonest domestic affections."[19] And as late as the 1970s, the renowned classicist Lionel Casson wrote dismissively of the Thracians as a "primitive peoples living

[16] Hdt. 5.9.1; James S. Romm, *The Edges of the Earth in Ancient Thought: Geography, Exploration, and Fiction* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), 35-37.

[17] Andron *BNJ* 10 F 7 (Schol. Aesch. *Pers*. 188).

[18] See Robert L. Fowler, *Early Greek Mythography*, vol. 2 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 14f.

[19] George Grote, *History of Greece*, vol. 4 (London: John Murray, 1854), 27.

beyond the pale of civilization," unable to grow past "their old primitive selves" when faced with opportunities to embrace Greek culture.[20] Overall, however, Thracians have suffered more from neglect than malice in the modern literature. To this day, they tend to receive little if any attention in general histories of the ancient world, and even the more specialized studies on the northern Aegean and Black Sea areas occasionally treat Thracians as peripheral subjects. Notably, Alexandru Avram's *Prosopographia Ponti Euxini Externa* (2013) omits Thracians on the pretext of their exceeding multitude and purported irrelevance to the Black Sea region![21]

On a broader level, scholars have often struggled to reconstruct the histories of "barbarian" peoples in general, let alone integrate them within larger narratives, due to the Helleno- and Romano-centric nature of the vast majority of our literary sources.[22] Nevertheless, a number of recent publications, such as Denise Demetriou's *Negotiating Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean: The Archaic and Classical Greek Multiethnic Emporia* (2012) and Kostas Vlassopoulos' *Greeks and Barbarians* (2013), have effectively implemented interdisciplinary approaches to discuss ethnic and cultural diversity in the ancient world, recontextualizing and reinterpreting our problematic literary evidence through the careful use of epigraphic, papyrological, and archaeological data. These works

[20] Lionel Casson, "The Thracians," *Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin* 35 (1977): 2-6 (4f.).

[21] Alexandru Avram, *Prosopographia Ponti Euxini Externa* (Colloquia Antiqua 8; Leuven: Peeters, 2013), xvii: "À peine vaut-il mentionner que je laisse de côté les Thraces, non seulement parce qu'ils sont extrêmement nombreux, ce qui réclamerait un traitement à part, mais surtout parce que, dans leur grande majorité, ils n'ont rien à voir avec la mer Noire."

[22] See e.g. Jonathan M. Hall, *A History of the Archaic Greek World, ca. 1200-479 BCE*, 2nd ed. (Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2014), 324, who outright questions the value of attempting to reconstruct the histories of non-Greek peoples on the basis of Greek sources and archaeology, an approach which he considers methodologically dubious.

reveal, among other tihings, how the imaginary and ideological barriers separating Greeks from non-Greeks frequently stood at odds with the tenor of the actual encounters between the two groups. My investigation follows this model and likewise focuses on uncovering the realities of the Thracians' interactions with non-Thracians.

In fact, our body of available evidence concerning the Thracians has also expanded tremendously since the beginning of modern research on the Thracians over two and a half centuries ago, and we owe a particular debt to the work of Thracologists, scholars who specifically study the Thracians.[23] Although Thracology has at times served nationalist agendas by elevating the Thracians to the status of "national" ancestors of modern Eastern European countries, especially Bulgaria and Romania, many important archaeological and epigraphic discoveries in the region would have remained out of reach to international audiences if not for Thracologists' efforts in analyzing, synthesizing, and disseminating this material.[24] My discussion of the culturally "mixed" Greek-Thracian cities in Thrace builds, to a significant extent, upon the foundational research of scholars involved in the field of Thracology.

Today, there exist a range of scholarly resources that that allow for easier study of the Thracians. These include books like Christo M. Danov's *Altthrakien* (1976) and Zosia H. Archibald's *The Odrysian Kingdom of Thrace* (1996), which synthesize a mass of archaeological\ data, while the recently published edited volume *A Companion to Ancient*

[23] For an overview of important contributions to modern research on the Thracians: see Nikola Theodossiev, "An Introduction to Studying Ancient Thrace," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 3-11.

[24] On the influence of nationalism in the study of the Thracians: see Tchavdar Marinov, "Ancient Thrace in the Modern Imagination: Ideological Aspects of the Construction of Thracian Studies in Southeast Europe (Romania, Greece, Bulgaria)," in *Entangled Histories of the Balkans*, vol. 3, ed. Roumen Daskalov and Alexander Vezenkov (Balkan Studies Library 16; Leiden: Brill, 2015), 10-117.

Thrace (2015) offers a collection of largely up-to-date overviews on various aspects of Thracian history. No less important is Dan Dana's *Onomasticon Thracicum* (2014; abbreviated hereafter as *OnomThrac*), a detailed compendium of nearly every attestation of Thracian personal names in ancient sources.[25] Although focused on onomastics, *OnomThrac* also functions as a partial prosopography of Thracians across all times and places, given the likelihood that an individual with a Thracian name possessed at least some Thracian heritage.[26] One can supplement this prosopography with books like Michael J. Osborne and Sean G. Byrne's *The Foreign Residents of Athens* (1996) and Csaba A. La'da's *Foreign Ethnics in Hellenistic Egypt* (2002), which catalogue individuals by their ethnic identifiers.

Scholarly discussion of the Thracians has traditionally centered on historical developments in Thrace, but the extensive distribution of Thracian names and Thracian ethnic identifiers outside of Thrace, as recorded in the abovementioned onomastic and prosopographical studies, underscore that the Thracians were also involved in the broader histories of the Mediterranean and Near East. Yet this involvement mostly occurred in contexts in which non-Thracians (specifically Greeks, Macedonians, and Persians, in terms of the scope of my investigation) exerted cultural and political hegemony. These

[25] This work supplants Dimiter Detschew's now very outdated *Die thrakishen Sprachreste* (Wien: Verlag der Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1976). Dana updates his catalogue through the online *Onomasticon Thracicum Supplementum* (cited hereafter as *OnomThracSuppl*), the latest version of which was published on December 8, 2021: https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-03504671.

[26] Conceivably, non-Thracians may have sometimes adopted Thracian names in acknowledgement of ties of guest-friendship with Thracians, but specific examples of this remain lacking: cf. Gabriel Herman, "Patterns of Name Diffusion within the Greek World and Beyond," *Classical Quarterly* 40, no. 2 (1990): 349-363; Christian Habicht "Foreign Names in Athenian Nomenclature," in *Greek Personal Names: Their Value as Evidence*, ed. Simon Hornblower and Elaine Matthews (Proceedings of the British Academy 104; Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2000), 119-127 (120).

imbalances clearly manifest in our evidence; indeed, when Thracians produced inscriptions, they overwhelmingly did so using the Greek language and in accordance with Greek epigraphic habits, and often as part of a dialogue with Greek political, cultural, social, or religious institutions. And in the case of the Thracians whom the Achaemenid Empire forcibly relocated to the Iranian heartland, much of what we know about their communities comes from officially generated information preserved in Persian administrative documents, which reveal nothing of how these Thracians viewed themselves and their plight. But it was precisely these types of experiences and circumstances, I maintain, that encouraged Thracians to reflect upon identity and find or invent ways to differentiate their ethnicity from that of others. Thus, as I attempt to show through my case studies, expressions of Thracianness appear to have been more pronounced in settings where Thracians constituted a minority.

Outline of the Dissertation

The first of my case studies approaches the question of Thracianness by examining signs of Thracian influences and populations within five Greek-founded *poleis* (πόλεις), or city-states, in Thrace. Evidence from each of these five *poleis*—Mesambria, Zone, Odessos, Dionysopolis, and Apollonia—illustrate to varying degrees a sort of multiculturalism that ancient Greeks called "mixing," whereby "barbarians" integrated with the community after having become Hellenized on some level. In these *poleis*, I suggest, the coexistence of Thracians and Greeks blurred the cultural boundaries between the two peoples, to the extent that we cannot always distinguish the Thracian element from

the Greek in the local traditions, religious practices, and uses of space. Generally, in fact, the residents of these places do not seem to have identified with a specific ethnicity, as befits their "mixed" environs.

Building upon the wide array of scholarship on Athenian social history and slavery in the ancient world, my second case study documents the importation of slaves from Thrace to Attica as well as the lives of the Thracian population in Attica. I specifically explore how slaves' Thracian backgrounds, whether real or ascribed, may have uniquely affected their experience of slavery, not only because Athenians appear to have singled out Thracians at times for certain kinds of exploitation and treatment, but also because the Athenians' ethnic categories and conceptions of Thracianness possibly helped instill in their slaves a sense of ethnicity that they may not have possessed or felt a strong attachment to prior to their enslavement. Accordingly, as I attempt to demonstrate, the Thracian community in Attica eventually developed a sense of ethnic solidarity, which they proudly expressed through a state-sanctioned cult dedicated to the Thracian goddess Bendis.

The perception and treatment of Thracians under the Achaemenid Empire represent the topics of my third case study. I contend that the Persians and Babylonians, somewhat similarly to the Greeks, associated the Thracians with liminality and otherness. This allowed for the incorporation of the Thracians into longstanding ancient Near Eastern paradigms of imperial space and power, in which Thracians may have symbolized the reach of the king's authority to far corners of the earth. Furthermore, I discuss the deportation of Thracians to the interior of the Achaemenid Empire as well as their employment by the

Persians as laborers and soldiers. Overall, this chapter seeks to illustrate that Thracians also constituted a recognizable ethnic category under the Achaemenid imperial system.

The final case study examines identity formation and social mobility among the countless Thracian soldiers, mercenaries, and military settlers who served under Alexander the Great and his Hellenistic successors. On the basis of demographic data, examples of prominent Thracians, and a variety of sources from Ptolemaic Egypt, I argue that Greeks and Macedonians came to regard Thracians as cultural allies in their efforts to rule over the much larger indigenous populations of the Hellenistic East. These circumstances created opportunities for Thracians to express Thracian identity, even as they increasingly assimilated to local Greek and native cultures.

Chapter 2

"Mixed" *Poleis* in Thrace

Introduction

This chapter investigates the phenomenon of "mixing," which entails, in its broadest sense, acculturation between Greeks and non-Greeks. I focus in particular on five *poleis*, all of them situated along the coasts of Thrace: Mesambria Pontica, Zone, Odessos, Dionysopolis, and Apollonia Pontica. In selecting these *poleis*, I have considered not only the availability of ancient literary and epigraphical sources—for the vast majority of attested *poleis* in Thrace remain poorly documented—but also a body of modern scholarship that claims to have detected a Thracian presence in the archaeological and toponymic data. In fact, as I hope to demonstrate through this chapter's case studies, distinguishing the Thracian element from the Greek often proves impossible within the context of a *polis*. I contend, nevertheless, that the ambiguous situation embodies the very nature of "mixing" and that the *poleis* created opportunities for "mixed" populations to participate with and alongside each other in political, religious, and social life.

I take some inspiration from Zosia Archibald's recent monograph *Ancient Economies of the Northern Aegean* (2013). Here she advances the thesis that, within the east Balkan—north Aegean region from the fifth to first centuries B.C.E., "there was no such thing as a 'contact zone' between two compartmentalized worlds, the 'civilized' world and the 'barbarian' world, only many networks of exchange, commercial, cultural, and intellectual," for "the idea of a cultural divide may have existed at an abstract, intellectual

level, but it did not exist in spatial terms."[1] Archibald offers an alternative to the popular "creolization" or "hybridity" model, which, drawing from postcolonial studies, explores the dynamics between colonizers and colonized within supposed contact zones.[2] This model, in my view, limits the scope of inquiry and potential conclusions by assuming the inherency of asymmetrical power relationships in colonial settings, whereas the idea of "networks of exchange" represents a more flexible framework for interpreting Greek-indigenous interactions, and one that better suits the conditions in Thrace.[3]

On the matter of *poleis*, Archibald also calls into question the methods of the Copenhagen Polis Centre and its monumental publication *An Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis (2004), which attempts to catalogue and describe every known *polis* of the Archaic and Classical periods (and to which she also contributes a chapter on inland Thrace). Specifically, she criticizes the project's Helleno-centric outlook:

> The editors of the *Inventory* admit that there were 'barbarian' *poleis*, but rather than seeing the investigation of 'barbarian' alongside Hellenic 'city-states' as an opportunity to highlight the defining characteristics that they seek to illuminate, a comparison between these entities is treated as subordinate to the compilation of Hellenic data. Evidence of barbarian *poleis* must, apparently, be dismissed… [T]he editors acknowledge a genuine difficulty in understanding what they call 'mixed' *poleis*…[4]

[1] Archibald, *Economies*, 127.

[2] See e.g. Peter van Dommelen, "Colonial Constructs: Colonialism and Archaeology in the Mediterranean," *World Archaeology* 28, no. 3 (1997): 305-323; Carla Antonaccio, "Hybridity and the Cultures within Greek Culture," in *The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture: Contact, Conflict, Collaboration*, ed. Carol Dougherty and Leslie Kurke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 57-74 (59f.).

[3] Cf. Irad Malkin, *A Small Greek World: Networks in the Ancient Mediterranean* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 45-48.

[4] Archibald, *Economies*, 63f.

Indeed, Mogens Herman Hansen, the former director of the Copenhagen Polis Centre, recognizes just two principal categories of *polis*: Greek and "barbarian."[5] "Mixed" *poleis* fall under the former, which unfortunately leads Hansen to equate the processes of acculturation in these places with unidirectional Hellenization. Indigenous populations, according to this model, would simply become Hellenized over time "through immigration of individual Greek settlers and through regular interaction with neighbouring Hellenic communities."[6] Of course, the *Inventory*'s approach reflects the larger and longstanding tendency to assume that the Greeks exerted a civilizing influence upon the peoples they encountered, as encapsulated by John Boardman's pithy remark that "the Greeks had nothing to learn, much to teach."[7] Although such influence did manifest in the adoption of the Greek language and material culture, this did not necessarily mean the adoption of a Greek identity and abandonment of prior customs, nor does it negate the possibility of Greek appropriation of indigenous culture and institutions.[8]

At the opposite spectrum, the Thracological approach has frequently overstated the degree of the Thracians' influence upon or resistance against Greek settlers.[9] Among the

---

[5] Mogens Herman Hansen, "A Survey of the Use of the Word *Polis* in Archaic and Classical Sources," in *Further Studies in the Ancient Greek Polis*, ed. Pernille Flensted-Jensen (Historia Einzelschriften 138, Papers from the Copenhagen Polis Centre 5; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2000), 161-172 (168); see also idem, "Was Every *Polis* Town the Centre of a *Polis* State?" in *The Return of the Polis: The Use and Meanings of the Word* Polis *in Archaic and Classical Sources* (Historia Einzelschriften 198, Papers from the Copenhagen Polis Centre 8; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2007), 13-66 (20f.).

[6] See idem, "Colonies and Indigenous Hellenised Communities," in *Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis, 150-153 (151).

[7] John Boardman, *The Greeks Overseas: Their Early Colonies and Trade* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1980), 190 (regarding Greeks in the Western Mediterranean), cf. 245.

[8] See Sara Owen, "Analogy, Archaeology and Archaic Greek Colonization," in *Ancient Colonizations: Analogy, Similarity and Difference*, ed. Henry Hurst and Sara Owen (London: Duckworth, 2005), 5-22, esp. 13.

[9] A certain strand of nationalist discourse, which celebrates the Thracians as the autochthonous, primordial ancestors of present-day Bulgarians, also plays some role in this line of interpretation: see Ivan Marinov and Nicolas Zorzin, "Thracology and Nationalism in Bulgaria. Deconstructing Contemporaneous

poleis examined in this chapter, Mesambria Pontica (modern Nesebar and a UNESCO World Heritage Site) has received the most attention from those searching for an example of continuity between a glorious Thracian past and the period of Greek colonization, with many of the narratives built up around the city envisaging its origins as an indigenous "protopolis" and the peaceful integration of the first Greek arrivals.[10] Thracologists have at times propagated similar (albeit less sensational) narratives about Dionysopolis and Odessos. As we will see, the evidence paints a less clear-cut picture in every case, even if "mixing" likely did occur.

Two other books deserve mention here, since their subjects overlap with mine: Benjamin Isaac's *The Greek Settlements in Thrace until the Macedonian Conquest* (1986) and Krzysztof Nawotka's *The Western Pontic Cities: History and Political Organization* (1997). The former achieves breadth rather than depth, providing mostly general treatments of the numerous *poleis* and towns in Thrace, while the latter focuses on the political and civic institutions of a small number of *poleis*, which happen to include Dionysopolis, Odessos, and Mesambria Pontica. Neither have much to say about Thracians beyond surveying the possible archaeological, literary, and toponymic evidence for indigenous foundations of certain *poleis*. However, although I do try to address a gap left by these

---

Historical and Archaeological Representations," *EX NOVO Journal of Archaeology* 2 (2017): 85-110; Mirena Slavova, "Bulgarian Lands in Antiquity: A Melting Pot of Thracian, Greek, and Roman Culture," in *A Handbook to Classical Reception in Eastern and Central Europe*, ed. Torlone et al. (Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2017), 396-410 (407f.).

[10] See e.g. Ljuba Ognenova-Marinova, "Mesambria et le monde Thrace entre le VII^{e} et le V^{e} s. av. n. è," in *Thracia Pontica III: Troisième symposium international, Sozopol, 6-12 octobre 1985*, ed. Michail Lazarov et al. (Sofia: Centre d'histoire maritime et d'archeologie sous-marin, 1986), 238-244 (243f.); Hristo Preshlenov, "Mesambria," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, vol. 1, ed. D. V. Grammenos and E. K. Petropoulos (Publications of the Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece 4; Thessaloniki: Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece, 2003), 157-196 (164f.)

studies and the *Inventory*, I also make no pretense of matching their level of coverage and overall detail. Readers should turn to them for the information not brought up in this chapter.

The Semantics of "Mixing"

In his description of the *poleis* on the Athos Peninsula, Thucydides identifies Thyssos, Kleonai, Akrothooi, Olophyxos, and Dion as places inhabited "by mixed *ethne* of bilingual barbarians" (ξυμμείκτοις ἔθνεσι βαρβάρων διγλώσσων).[11] Their denizens, according to Thucydides, consisted mostly of Pelasgians (descended from Tyrrhenians who had once occupied Lemnos and Athens) and Thracians (specifically Bisaltai, Krestonaioi, and Edonoi), but he acknowledges the existence of a small Chalkidian Greek element as well, which implies that the "bilingual barbarians" spoke Greek alongside their native language(s).[12] Other ancient authors also characterize Greek-Thracian relations in terms of "mixing." Hellanikos of Lesbos, from whom Thucydides' information about the Tyrrhenian-Pelasgians probably derives, writes that the Sinties on the island of Lemnos had become "mixed Greeks" (μιξέλληνες) as a result of Greeks interbreeding with Thracians.[13] And Pseudo-Skymnos reports that Dionysopolis, "situated on the borders of the territory of the Krobyzoi (i.e., a Thracian tribe) and Scythians, has mixed Greek

[11] Thuc. 4.109.3f.

[12] See C. E. Graves, *The Fourth Book of Thucydides* (London: MacMillan, 1884), 276; A. W. Gomme, *A Historical Commentary on Thucydides*, vol. 3 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956), 588f.

[13] Hellanikos *BNJ* 4 F 71a (Schol. *Od.* 8.294). On the Tyrrhenian-Pelasgians: see Robert L. Fowler, "Pelasgians," in *Poetry, Theory, Praxis: The Social Life of Myth, Word and Image in Ancient Greece: Essays in Honour of William J. Slater,* ed. Eric Csapo and Christina Miller (Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2003), 2-18 (3f.). On the Sinties: see Cvete Lazova, "The Thracian Tribe Sintians," *Thracia* 4 (1977): 141-145.

inhabitants" (ἐν μεθορίοις δὲ τῆς Κροβύζων καὶ Σκυθῶν χώρας κειμένη μιγάδας Ἕλληνας οἰκητὰς ἔχει).[14]

Despite the different semantics, Thucydides' "bilingual barbarians" and Pseudo-Skymnos' "mixed Greek inhabitants" both fit the ancient definition of "mixed Greeks" (μιξέλληνες). Unlike the term "mixed barbarians" (μιξοβάρβαροι or μειξοβάρβαροι), which typically denotes "barbarized" Greeks, μιξέλληνες seems to designate non-Greeks who have Hellenized in some manner, whether by blood or acculturation.[15] Thus Plutarch, in his biography of Crassus, identifies two Greek-speaking βάρβαροι of the Parthian army as μιξέλληνες, even though they performed the distinctly Persian act of proskynesis that Greeks found so distasteful and offensive.[16] Closer to Thrace, a Hellenistic decree from Pontic Olbia, in Scythia, counts μιξέλληνες among the city's allies during a past conflict, and these individuals might correspond to the "Greek Scythians" (Ἕλληνες Σκύθαι) known as the Kallippidai whom Herodotus locates in the same vicinity.[17]

The cluster of references to "mixing" involving Thracians or the Black Sea region suggests the existence of a real and perhaps widespread phenomenon in Greek-indigenous

[14] Ps.-Skymnos F 2b (*Peripl. Pont. Eux.* 78), ed. Didier Marcotte, *Géographes Grecs*, vol. 1 (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 2000).

[15] See Michel Dubuisson, "Remarques sur le vocabulaire grec de l'acculturation," *Revue belge de philologie et d'histoire* 60 (1982): 5-32 (11-14); Michel Casevitz, "Le vocabulaire du mélange démographique: mixobarbares et mixhellènes," in *Origines gentium*, ed. Valérie Fromentin and Sophie Gotteland (Bordeaux: Ausonius, 2001), 41-47.

[16] Plut. *Cras.* 31.1.

[17] *IOSPE* I^2 32 B lines 15-20, ed. Basilius Latyshev, *Inscriptiones antiquae orae septentrionalis Ponti Euxini Graecae et Latinae* (St. Petersburg: Societatis Archaeologicae Imperii Russici, 1916); Hdt. 4.17.1; Margarit Damyanov, "On the Local Population around the Greek Colonies in the Black Sea Area (5th-3rd Centuries BC)," *Ancient West and East* 2, no. 2 (2003): 253-264; cf. David Braund, "Greater Olbia: Ethnic, Religious, Economic, and Political Interactions in the Region of Olbia, *c*. 600–100 BC," in *Classical Olbia and the Scythian World: From the Sixth Century BC to the Second Century AD*, ed. idem and S. D. Kryzhitskiy (Proceedings of the British Academy 142; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), 37-77 (66f.).

relations. Regrettably, our literary sources fail to disclose how exactly their relations transpired, the extent to which Thracians became Hellenized, and whether they also imparted anything upon their Greek neighbors. Comprehensive answers to these questions lie beyond reach, but the evidence from my five chosen *poleis* do illustrate some possible examples of bidirectional acculturation. I begin with Mesambria Pontica, a city that evidently incorporated "mixing" into the story of its name and foundation.

Mesambria Pontica

Situated on a peninsula just south of Cape Emine on the Black Sea, most of the site of ancient Mesambria now lies beneath the modern town of Nesebar, making excavations difficult, or underwater as a consequence of wind erosion and geomorphological change, which has reduced the terrestrial area of the peninsula by roughly a third of its former size (estimated at about 40 hectares in antiquity).[18] We have no literary sources for the internal history of Mesambria aside from seemingly discrepant traditions about its foundation, while the surviving inscriptions reveal only glimpses of social, political, and religious life during the Hellenistic period and beyond.[19] Undeterred, scholars have long considered the implications of Mesambria's ostensibly Thracian name, which has helped fuel the aforementioned narratives about the Thracian origins and population of the *polis*. This

[18] Velizar Velkov, "Mesambria Pontica," in *Die bulgarische Schwarzmeerküste im Altertum*, ed. Wolfgang Schuller (Xenia 16; Konstanz: Universitätsverlag Konstanz, 1985), 29-40 (29); Ljuba Ognenova-Marinova, "'Mesembriacos Portus,'" in *Thracia Pontica V: Actes du symposium international, Sozopol, 7-12 octobre 1991*, ed. Michail Lazarov and Christina Angelova (Sozopol: Centre d'archéologie subaquatique, 1991), 139-142 (140).

[19] ` datable to the Classical period remain limited to short funerary epitaphs (e.g. *IGBulg* I^2 331) and a graffito on a vase (*SEG* 59 750).

section reexamines the issues from the ground up, starting with the ancient etymologies of Μεσ(σ)αμβρία, as the name appears in the local Doric spelling, or more commonly Μεσημβρία, in Attic and Koine.[20] I submit that these etymologies, regardless of their historical or linguistic accuracy, arose from the Mesambrians' desire to acknowledge the "mixed" nature of their *polis*.

Of the two different etymologies reported in ancient sources, both of which involve a compound of a personal name with the Thracian word *bria*, the epitome of Stephanos of Byzantion presents what likely reflects the more authentic one:

> Μεσημβρία· πόλις Ποντική. Νικόλαος ε΄. ἐκλήθη ἀπὸ Μέλσου. βρίαν γὰρ τὴν πόλιν φασὶ Θρᾷκες. ὡς οὗ Σηλυμβρία ἡ τοὺ Σήλυος πόλις, Πολτυμβρία ἡ Πόλτυος <πόλις>, οὕτω Μελσημβρία ἡ Μέλσου πόλις, και διὰ τὸ εὐφωνότερον λέγεται Μεσημβρία.[21]
>
> Mesembria: a Pontic *polis*. Nikolaos 5. It is named after Melsas/Melsos. For Thracians say *polis* as *bria*. Just as Selymbria is "the *polis* of Selys" and Poltymbria is "the *polis* of Poltys," thus Melsembria is "the *polis* of Melsas/Melsos," and it is called Mesembria because it sounds more euphonic.

The citation at the beginning refers to the first-century historian Nikolaos of Damaskos, but while other fragments of Nikolaos do concern Thracian history and ethnography, how much he contributed here to Stephanos remains rather unclear.[22] Under the entry on Ainos, Stephanos cites Apollodoros (the second-century grammarian from Athens, apparently) for the tidbit that the city possessed the alternate name of Poltymbria,

[20] For a list of variant spellings and name changes: see Velizar Velkov, "Mesambria—Mesembria—Nessèbre (Situation, recherches, notes historiques)," in *Nessebre*, vol. 1, ed. Teofil Ivanov (Sofia: Editions de l'Académie bulgare des sciences, 1969), 9-28 (27f.).

[21] Steph. Byz. M 153, ed. Margarethe Billerbeck et al., *Stephani Byzantii Ethnica*, 5 vols., Corpus Fontiae Historiae Byzantiae 43 (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2006-2017).

[22] See Nikolaos *BNJ* 90 F 43 with the commentary of Andrea Favuzzi and Annalisa Paradiso ad loc.; cf. *FGrH* 90 F 43 with Jacoby ad loc.

and later Stephanos cites no source when discussing the etymology of Selymbria, which he also compares with that of Poltymbria.[23] In all probability, multiple sources underlie Stephanos' treatment of Mesambria. We know that Hellanikos of Lesbos wrote about the naming of Ainos/Poltymbria after the mythical Thracian king Poltys.[24] Ephoros' interest in the cities of Thrace and the circumstances of their foundations makes him a candidate as well.[25]

Potential corroboration for Stephanos' account comes from an unexpected quarter, surfacing as it does on a Roman-era funerary stele for a certain Ioulia daughter of Neikias, who claims to have apotheosized into the goddess Hekate. Recovered in 1928 at the village of Chimos (today Aheloy), the stele had allegedly stood years before in Mesambria, approximately seven kilometers to the north, until someone moved it for unspecified reasons.[26] In the inscription, Ioulia identifies Mesambria as her πατρίς and adds in the same breath that its name stems from Μέλσας and βρία. Why she felt the need to clarify this has proven quite a mystery, considering that her audience on the whole would have consisted of fellow citizens who presumably knew the etymology too, but while we cannot discount metrical convenience as a possible factor in her decision, I suggest later in this section that

[23] Steph. Byz. A 135 (Apollodoros *FGrH/BNJ* 244 F 184), Σ 117.

[24] Hellanikos *FGrH* 4 F 197 bis (= *BNJ* 4 F 197a). On Hellanikos as a possible source for Stephanos' information on Poltymbria: see Fowler, *Early Greek Mythography*, 532f. On Poltys: see further Plut. *Mor*. 174c; Schol. Ap. Rhod. 1.216-217a.

[25] Cf. Konstantin Boshnakov, *Die Thraker südlich vom Balkan in den* Geographika *Strabos: Quellenkritische Untersuchungen* (Palingenesia 81; Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2003), 168f.

[26] Gawril I. Kazarow, "Grabstele von Mesembria," *Jahreshefte des Österreichischen Archäologischen Institutes* 26 (1930): 111-114 (111).

the worship of Hekate did play a role in the Mesambrian's "mixed" identity.[27] The text itself reads as follows:

> ἐνθάδε ἐγὼ κεῖμε Ἑκάτη
> θεὸς ὡς ἐσορᾷς. ἤμην τὸ
> πάλαι βροτός, νῦν δὲ ἀθάνα-
> τος καὶ ἀγήρως· Ἰουλία Νεικίου
> θυγάτηρ μεγαλήτορος ἀνδρός,
> Μεσεμβρία δέ μυ πατρὶς ἀπὸ
> [Μ]έλσα καὶ βρία· ζήσασα ἔτη ὅσα
> μοι στήλη κατέχει· τρὶς πέντε
> δὲ [ε]ἴκοσι καὶ δέκα πέντε.
> εὐτυχεῖτε, παροδῖται.[28]
>
> Here I lie, Hekate the goddess, as you see. I was once a mortal, and now I am undying and unaging. Ioulia daughter of Neikias, a greathearted man, and Mesembria is my fatherland, from *Melsas* and *bria*. I lived as many years as my stele bears: three times twenty-five and fifteen. May you prosper, passers-by.

Strabo provides the alternate etymology while cataloguing cities along the western Black Sea coast. When he reaches Mesambria, he enters into a digression that parallels, in many respects, what Stephanos records:

> Μεσημβρία Μεγαρέων ἄποικος, πρότερον δὲ Μενεβρία, οἷον Μένα πόλις, τοῦ κτίσαντος Μένα καλουμένου, τῆς δὲ πόλεως βρίας καλουμένης Θρᾳκιστί· ὡς καὶ ἡ τοῦ Σήλυος πόλις Σηλυμβρία προσηγόρευται, ἥ τε Αἶνος Πολτυοβρία ποτὲ ὠνομάζετο.[29]
>
> Mesembria, a colony of the Megarians, and previously Menebria, as in "*polis* of Menas," since its founder is called Menas, and since *polis* is called *bria* in Thracian; so too has Selymbria been addressed as "the *polis* of Selys," and Ainos was once named Poltyobria.

---

[27] For an attempt at a metrical analysis: see Antonin Salač, "Náhrobní stela z Mesembrie," *Listy filologické* 57, no. 4/5 (1930): 436-444 (443).

[28] *IGBulg* I^2 345 (= V 5119), ed. Georgius Mihailov, *Inscriptiones Graecae in Bulgaria repertae*, 5 vols. (Serdica: Academiae Litterarum Bulgaricae, 1956–1997); cf. Ernst Pfuhl and Hans Möbius, *Die ostgriechischen Grabreliefs*, vol. 2 (Mainz: Philipp von Zabern, 1977), no. 2088. Although βρία appears here in the nominative case, Μέλσα presumably represents the Doric genitive form of Μέλσας, given the preceding ἀπό.

[29] Strabo 7.6.1. Πολτυοβρία may reflect a corruption of Πολτυμβρία, which in fact appears as a variant in the manuscripts.

Strabo does not necessarily relay a separate tradition, of course. The corruption of Μέλσας for Μένας in the process of textual transmission of either Strabo or his source, duly followed by a scribal "correction" of Μελσημβρία for Μενεβρία, remains within the realm of conceivability, perhaps through the misconstruing of a lambda next to a lunate sigma (viz. ΛC) as a nu.[30] The testimony of Ioulia, together with the onomastic data from Mesambria reviewed further below, lends greater credibility to the form Μέλσας at any rate. Curiously, however, elements of both Stephanos' and Strabo's accounts turn up in three tenth-century Byzantine descriptions of Mesambria, which share virtually identical phrasing except for minor variations on the names.[31] Unlike Stephanos and Strabo, the Byzantine descriptions specifically characterize the city's founder as a Thracian. To quote, for example, the chronicle attributed to Pseudo-Symeon Magistros:

> Μεσημβρία δὲ ἡ πρὶν Μεμνεβρία, ἀπὸ τοῦ Μέμνου Θρᾳκὸς τοῦ ταύτην οἰκίσαντος καὶ βρία τὸ παρά τισι Θρᾳκῶν πόλισμα λεγόμενον· πρὸς δὲ τὸ εὐφραδέστερον Μεσημβρία νῦν ὀνομάζεται.[32]
>
> Mesembria, which was once Memnebria, from Memnos, the Thracian who founded it, and *bria*, as the *polisma* is called among some Thracians; now it is named Mesembria because it sounds more eloquent.

[30] See Gustav Kramer, *Strabonis Geographica*, 2 vols. (Berlin: Friedrich Nicolai, 1847), 2.54; María Luisa del Barrio Vega, "The Greek Language in the Black Sea," in *Studies in Ancient Greek Dialects: From Central Greece to the Black Sea*, ed. Georgios K. Giannakis et al. (Trends in Classics Supplementary Volumes 49; Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2018), 511-530 (522, with reference to Kramer and a suggestion by Richard Janko).

[31] On these three works in general: see Leslie Brubaker and John Haldon, *Byzantium in the Iconoclast Era (*ca *680–850): The Sources* (Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs 7; Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001), 173-178 (concerning Georgios Continuatus, Pseudo-Symeon Magistros, and Theophanes Continuatus).

[32] Ps.-Symeon Magistros *De Leone Basilii filio* 13B, ed. Immanuel Bekker, *Theophanes Continuatus, Ioannes Cameniata, Symeon Magister, Georgius Monachus* (Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae 45; Bonn: Weber, 1838).

The variants in the continuations of the chronicles of George Hamartolos/Monachos and Theophanes feature Μενεμβρία from Μέννος and Μενεβρία from Μένος, respectively.[33] The differences among the three could easily have resulted from copyists' errors, as proposed by Nawotka, who also sees Strabo and Stephanos as the probable intermediaries between their source and the one underlying the Byzantine works. The extra detail about the founder's Thracian background would represent, by extension, nothing more than an inference gleaned from the Thracian component of Mesambria's name.[34] Indeed, the forms Μέμνος, Μένος, and Μέννος suggest influence from Strabo's Μέναϛ, while the remarks about orthography and pronunciation closely resemble Stephanos'. Another tenth-century work, the *De Thematibus* by Emperor Constantine VII Porphyrogenitos, nevertheless raises the prospect of an additional or even independent source. In his section on the *thema* (a type of administrative unit) of Thrace, he alludes to a more expansive legend about Mesambria's name:

> τὸ τοίνυν θέμα τῆς Θρᾴκης ἄρτι τὴν θέσιν καὶ τὴν ὀνομασίαν ἔλαχε θέματος, ἀφ' οὗ τὸ τῶν Βουλγάρων γένος τὸν Ἴστρον ποταμὸν διεπέρασεν, ἐπεὶ πρότερον εἰς βασιλείας διττὰς διῄρητο· καὶ μαρτυροῦσιν αὐτὰ τὰ ὀνόματα τῶν πόλεων, ἥ τε Μεσημβρία καὶ Σηλυμβρία, βασιλέων προσηγορίας ἔχουσαι πόλεις πρὶν ἢ τὴν τῶν Ῥωμαίων βασιλείαν αὐξηθῆναί τε καὶ διαδραμεῖν πάντα τὰ τοῦ κόσμου πληρώματα.[35]

---

[33] Georgios Continuatus M. 831, ed. V. M. Istrin, "Prodolzheniye khroniki Georgiya Amartola po Vatikanskomu spisku № 153 [Continuation of the Chronicle of Georgios Hamartolos according to Vatican Catalogue no. 153]," in idem, *Khronika Georgiya Amartola v drevnem slavyanorusskom perevode* [*Chronicle of Georgios Hamartolos in the Old Slavonic Translation*], vol. 2 (Petrograd: Rossiyskaya gosudarstvennaya akademicheskaya tipografiya, 1922), reprinted in Friedrich Scholz, *Die Chronik des Georgios Hamartolos in altslavischer Übersetzung*, vol. 2 (Slavische Propyläen 135; Munich: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1972); Theophanes Continuatus 6.22D, ed. Bekker, *Theophanes*.

[34] Krzysztof Nawotka, "Melsas, the Founder of Mesambria?" *Hermes* 122, no. 3 (1994): 320-326 (322-324); cf. also Aubrey Diller, "Excerpts from Strabo and Stephanus in Byzantine Chronicles," *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 81 (1950): 241-253.

[35] Constantinus Porphyrogenitus *De Thematibus* 2.1, ed. Agostino Pertusi, *Constantino Porfirogenito De Thematibus* (Studi e Testi 160; Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1952).

> Therefore, the *thema* of Thrace recently obtained the position and designation of a *thema*, after which the *genos* of the Bulgarians crossed the Istros River, since previously it was divided into two kingdoms; and the very names of the *poleis* attest to this, Mesembria and Selymbria, *poleis* bearing the designations of kings before the Roman Empire was enlarged and all the ends of the earth were run through.

Constantine implies here that the founders of Mesambria and Selymbria each ruled over a kingdom. Although Nawotka suspects that Constantine merely extrapolated from the etymologies supplied by Strabo and Stephanos, this begs the question of why Constantine would omit Ainos/Poltymbria/Poltyobria, which Strabo and Stephanos highlight alongside Mesambria and Selymbria, and which still existed as a major port throughout the Byzantine period.[36] More likely, given his fondness for Classical and Hellenistic literature, Constantine has condensed a tale told by some ancient author, such as Nikolaos, whom he cites elsewhere in the *De Thematibus*.[37] The information on Mesambria in the three chronicles might have derived in whole or in part from this source as well. If so, the Byzantine evidence would allow us to flesh out the portrait of Melsas beyond what little we learn through Strabo and Stephanos, revealing with it a possible analogy to the Thracian king and city-founder Poltys.

Our earliest extant accounts for the actual foundation of Mesambria seem contradictory at first glance. According to the Herodotus, the Byzantines and Kalchedonians "settled" (οἴκησαν) Mesambria in 493, having fled in advance of an

[36] Nawotka, "Melsas," 323f. On Byzantine Ainos: see Peter Soustal, *Thrakien (Thrakē, Rodopē und Haimimontos)* (Tabula Imperii Byzantini 6, Osterreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, Denkschriften 221; Vienna: Verlag der Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1991), 170-173 s.v. Ainos.

[37] Cf. Boshnakov, *Thraker südlich vom Balkan*, 165-167. For the references to Nikolaos: see Constantinus Porphyrogenitos *De Thematibus* 1.3 (Nikolaos *FGrH/BNJ* 90 F 71), 2.6 (F 23). On Constantine's interest in ancient Greek literature: see Arnold Toynbee, *Constantine Porphyrogenitus and His World* (London: Oxford University Press, 1973), 577f.

attacking Phoenician fleet following the Persian suppression of the Ionian Revolt.[38] This contrasts with the testimony of Pseudo-Skymnos, who states, on the authority of the third- and second-century geographer Demetrios of Kallatis, that the Kalchedonians and Megarians "colonized" or "founded" (ᾤκισαν) the *polis* at the time of Darius I's Scythian expedition around 513.[39] Attempts to reconcile the two have posited multiple waves of arrivals, with Avram and Nawotka emphasizing in particular the semantic distinction between οἴκησαν (from οἰκέω) and ᾤκισαν (from οἰκίζω), as the former can entail emigration to an already-established community.[40] Herodotus himself may corroborate this interpretation; in an earlier passage, he relates how the Thracian tribes inhabiting the hinterlands of Apollonia (modern Sozopol) and Mesambria, whom he calls the Skyrmiadai and Nipsaioi, surrendered to Darius without a fight as the king marched his forces toward Scythia.[41]

[38] Hdt. 6.33.2. This version forms the basis for an account by the twelfth-century Byzantine scholar Eustathios (*Commentarii in Dionysium Periegetam* 803, ed. Carolus Müllerus, *Geographi Graeci Minores*, vol. 2 [Paris: Ambrosio Firmin Didot, 1861]): see Alexandru Avram, "Les cités grecques de la côte Ouest du Pont-Euxin," in *Introduction to an Inventory of* Poleis: *Symposium August, 23-26 1995*, ed. Mogens Herman Hansen (Acts of the Copenhagen Polis Centre 3, Det Kongelige Danske Videnskabernes Selskab, Historisk-filosofiske Meddelelser 74; Copenhagen: Munksgaard, 1996), 288-316 (291f.).

[39] Ps.-Skymnos 718-720, 738-742. On Pseudo-Skymnos' use of Demetrios: see Valery Yailenko, "Source Study Analysis of Pseudo-Scymnus' Data on the Pontic Cities' Foundation," *Pontica* 48-49 (2015-2016): 9-23 (10-12). On the date of the Scythian expedition: see Miroslav Ivanov Vasilev, *The Policy of Darius and Xerxes toward Thrace and Macedonia* (Mnemosyne Supplements 379; Leiden: Brill, 2015), 58f.

[40] Avram, "Cités grecques," 290f.; idem, "Le rôle des époikoi dans la colonisation grecque en mer Noire: quelques études de cas," *Pallas* 89 (2012): 197-215 (208); Krzysztof Nawotka, *The Western Pontic Cities: History and Political Organization* (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1997), 27. Both authors cite Michel Casevitz, *Le vocabulaire de la colonisation en grec ancien. Étude lexicologique: les familles de κτίζω et de οἰκέω-οἰκίζω* (Collection Études et Commentaries 97; Paris: Klincksieck, 1985), who defines the terms on 75f. and 92-96. Cf. John Hind, "Megarian Colonisation in the Western Half of the Black Sea (Sister- and Daughter-Cities of Herakleia)," in *The Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area: Historical Interpretation of Archaeology*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze (Historia Einzelschriften 121; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1998), 131-152 (137f.)

[41] Hdt. 4.93; Adrian Robu, *Mégare et les établissements mégariens de Sicile, de la Propontide et du Pont-Euxin: Histoire et institutions* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2014), 313f.

Neither Herodotus nor Pseudo-Skymnos mention a pre-existing Thracian population at Mesambria itself, which matches the picture currently painted by the archaeological data. To be sure, excavations and underwater investigations carried out during the 1950s, '60s, and '70s did uncover traces of a pre-colonial, fortified settlement.[42] The dates initially assigned to the accompanying ceramic finds, ranging from twelfth to sixth centuries, continue to provide the basis for rosy narratives (as presented by Kalin Porozhanov, for example) of Greeks peacefully integrating into a Thracian "royal city," where they submitted themselves to the protection of the "king, god, and hero" Melsas.[43] However, subsequent analyses set the lower limit of the ceramics to the eighth century, leaving a substantial chronological gap between the end of the indigenous settlement and the start of the Greek one.[44] This would mean that the Kalchedonians and Megarians chanced upon an abandoned site.

How then did Mesambria acquire its Thracian etymology? In Nawotka's opinion, the Mesambrians invented the figure of Melsas for civic-ideological purposes during the

[42] See e.g. Ivan Venedikov, "Les fortifications dans la partie nord-ouest de Nessebre," in *Nessebre*, vol. 2, ed. Velizar Velkov (Sofia: Editions de l'Académie bulgare des sciences, 1980), 23-80 (75-80); Ljuba Ognenova-Marinova, "La 'bria' thrace d'après les recherches archéologiques à Nessèbre," in *Thracia Pontica IV: Quatrième symposium international, Sozopol, 6-12 octobre 1988*, ed. Michail Lazarov et al. (Sofia: Centre d'archéologie subaquatique, 1991), 133-136 (134f.).

[43] See Kalin Porozhanov, "Thracian Kings as Founders of Hellenic *Apoikias* Astakos, Byzantion and Mesambria Pontica," *Orpheus* 9 (1999): 27-31 (28f.); idem, "La ville thrace de Mesembria sur la côte de la mer Noire," *Thracia* 13 (2000): 345-350. For the original dating of the ceramic finds: see Ivan Venedikov, "La Mesambria Thrace," in *Nessebre*, vol. 2, 7-22.

[44] See Petre Alexandrescu and Sebastian Morintz, "A propos de la couche précoloniale de Mesambria," *Pontica* 15 (1982): 47-55; Mihail Lazarov, "Notizen zur griechischen Kolonisation am westlichen Schwarzen Meer. Schriftquellen und archäologische Denkmäler," in *Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area*, 85-95 (90f.); Margarit Damyanov, "First Encounters and Further Developments: Greeks Meeting Thracians on the Western Pontic Coast," in *Archaeology Across Frontiers and Borderlands: Fragmentation and Connectivity in the North Aegean and the Central Balkans from the Bronze Age to the Iron Age*, ed. Stefanos Gimatzidis et al. (Oriental and European Archaeology 9; Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2018), 243-268 (250f.).

second or first centuries, when their city emerged as a minor regional power.[45] He offers two principal objections against the antiquity and authenticity of the foundation story: first, the name Μέλσας and stem *mels*- have no exact parallels in Thracian onomastics and toponymy; and second, a shift from Μελσα- to Μεσα- constitutes a phonological impossibility in the Mesambrians' Doric dialect.[46] Yet these arguments strike me as problematic. His first point, while strictly correct at the time he published his article—we may now have attestations of the name Μελσα(ς) on late-fourth century Thracian coins—does not take into consideration relevant onomastic data from Mesambria, which I will address shortly.[47] The second assumes a false dichotomy between natural and artificial phonological change, ignoring the role of speakers' preferences for what sounded "more euphonic" or "more eloquent," as underscored by Stephanos and the Byzantine chronicles (these preferences may owe to the similarity of Μεσ[σ]αμβρία with the common noun μεσημβρία, "midday" or "south").[48] Finally, and on a fundamental level, Nawotka fails to explain why the Mesambrians would not have simply chosen a better-fitting name for their founder if they fabricated an etymology out of whole cloth.

---

[45] Nawotka, "Meslas," 325f.

[46] Ibid., 324f. Regarding the shift from Μελσα- to Μεσα-, Nawotka explains: "The assimilation of a liquid and spirant group -λσ-, -ρσ- occurs in some Greek dialects yet not in Doric which was spoken in Mesambria. This assimilation leads to -λ-, -ρ- accompanied by the compensatory lengthening of the preceding vowel; hence hypothetically: Μελσ- > Μειλ- >, not: Μελσ- > Μεσ-. Moreover, in foreign words (usually proper names) this process often did not occur at all" (325).

[47] On the Μελσα coins: see Yannis Stoyas, "Two Peculiar Thracian Coin Issues: ΔΑΝΤΗΛΤΩΝ and ΜΕΛΣΑ," in *Ηρακλέους Σωτήρος Θασίων: Studia in honorem Iliae Prokopov sexagenario ab amicis et discipulis dedicate*, ed. Evgeni Paunov and Svetoslava Filipova (Veliko Turnovo: Faber, 2012), 143-186 (157-166).

[48] On the similarity with μεσημβρία: see del Barrio Vega, "Greek Language on the Black Sea," 523; cf. *IGBulg* I^2 345 with Mihailov ad loc. and references. Some Mesambrian coins from the fifth and fourth centuries feature on their reverses a wheel surrounded by rays, which might represent the midday sun: see Barclay V. Head, *Historia Numorum: A Manual of Greek Numismatics*, 2nd ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911), 278.

The best evidence that the Melsas legend predates the second century rests with the unusual masculine personal name Μελσέων, which evidently relates in some way to the name Μέλσας and already shows up in the epigraphical record in the first half of the third century.[49] Significantly, every documented and potential occurrence of Μελσέων ties its bearer to Mesambria and perhaps even to the city's prominent families:

(1) The genitive form Μελσέωνος appears stamped on amphorae discovered at Seuthopolis and Kabyle.[50] Testing of clay samples from the vicinity of Nesebar through ICP-AES analysis and X-ray diffractometry, as well as comparisons with roof tiles and pottery from Mesambria, have confirmed Totkyo Stoyanov's longstanding theory that these amphorae likewise originated in or around Mesambria.[51] He dates them to the end of the first or start of the second quarter of the third century based on their contexts at Seuthopolis and Kabyle, and

[49] See Mirena Slavova, "The Greek Language on the Bulgarian Coast (6th cent. B.C.-1st cent. B.C.)," in *Le grec du monde colonial antique: Le N. et N.-O. de la Mer Noire*, ed. Guy Vottéro (Etudes anciennes 42; Paris: Boccard, 2010), 195-220 (215f.); Adrian Robu, "Traditions et rapprochements onomastiques dans les cités grecques de la mer Noire: quelques exemples tirés du 'monde mégarien,'" *Il Mar Nero* 8 (2010/2011): 281-293 (289f. s.v. Μελσέων); cf. del Barrio Vega, "Greek Language on the Black Sea," 523.

[50] Totkyo Stoyanov, "Reflections on the 'Parmeniskos' Group," *Thracia* 13 (2000): 409-415 (412, with references); Ana Balkanska and Chavdar Tzochev, "Amphora Stamps from Seuthopolis – Revised," in *Phosphorion: Studia in honorem Mariae Čičikova*, ed. Diana Gergova (Sofia: Prof. Marin Drinov Academic Publishing House, 2008), 188-205 (189, 202 no. 43). In later studies, Stoyanov includes an amphora discovered at Iezeru, Călărași County, Romania among those stamped with Μελσέωνος (see e.g. "The Parmeniskos Amphora Group – New Data and Reflections on Production Centres and Chronology," *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 7 [2003]: 35-43 [37 n7]), but note that the original publishers of the stamp only made out Με[..]σώνος (see Crişan Muşeţeanu et al., "Contribution au problème de l'importation des amphores grecques dans le sud-est de la Munténie," *Dacia* 22 [1978]: 173-199 [189 no. 49, 194 fig. 3.9]).

[51] See Totkyo Stoyanov, "New Evidence for Amphora Production in Early Hellenistic Mesambria Pontica," in *PATABS II: Production and Trade of Amphorae in the Black Sea: Acts of the International Round Table held in Kiten, Nessebar and Sredetz, September 26-30, 2007*, ed. Chavdar Tzochev et al. (Sofia: Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, National Archaeological Institute with Museum, 2011), 191-201, esp. 197; idem, "More on the Amphora Production in Early Hellenistic Mesambria Pontica," in *Monuments and Text in Antiquity and Beyond: Essays for the Centenary of Georgi Mihailov (1915-1991)*, ed. Mirena Slavova and Nikolay Sharankov (Studia Classica Serdicensia 5; Sofia: St. Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2016), 362-370, esp. 365.

because production seems to have taken place at two separate workshops, he believes that the stamps denote the name of a magistrate rather than a manufacturer.[52]

(2) In the same century, according to a very fragmentary decree, the Mesambrians honored a Melseon son of Herodoros, apparently in recognition of his benefactions to the city.[53]

(3) During the late-second and/or early-first centuries, a Polyxenos son of Melseon held the title of *strategos* in Mesambria and also received proxeny status and other honors in Dionysopolis, which we know from inscriptions found at both locations.[54]

(4) A Melseon may have served as a monetary official of Mesambria in the third quarter of the second century, but this depends upon the uncertain interpretation of the abbreviated genitival name Με- as Με<λσέωνος> on Mesambrian tetradrachms.[55]

Mesambria's civic iconography may contain further allusions to Melsas. Indeed, from as early as the fifth century, the city's coinage frequently featured images of Corinthian helmets or helmeted faces, which the Bulgarian numismatists Todor Gerasimov and Ivan Karayotov have interpreted as references to Melsas, citing as parallels Roman-era

[52] Ibid., 196-198; idem, "More on the Amphora Production," 365f.

[53] *IGBulg* I^2 308 sexies.

[54] *IGBulg* V 5103; Nicolay Sharankov, "Inscriptions," in *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, transl. Margarit Damyanov and Nicolay Sharankov (Varna: Slavena, 2013), 47-89 (59-62 with excerpts of two unpublished decrees from Dionysopolis honoring Polyxenos son of Melseon).

[55] See Ivan Karayotov, *The Coinage of Mesambria*, vol. 1 (Thracia Pontica 6, Thracia Maritima, Corpus Numorum; Sozopol: Centre of Underwater Archaeology, 1994), 43 no. M10, 131 no. 69.

coins from Byzantion that show the helmeted head of the founder Byzas or just his helmet.[56] We also find Corinthian helmets represented together with the Mesambrian amphorae stamps, and Stoyanov emphasizes here the rarity of these types of helmets in Thrace as well as their heroic symbolism on the coinage of the Thrace-Macedonia region.[57] Still, a connection to Melsas remains unproven. The helmets could instead belong a deity, especially Ares or Athena, or even encode a reference to a passage in the *Iliad*, as J. G. F. Hind speculated.[58]

If civic iconography emerges as something of a dead end for understanding the origins of Melsas, the evidence pertaining to religious life in Mesambria may offer an alternative source of insight. To start, a second- or first-century relief plaque depicts the college of six *strategoi* as they prepare to make a sacrifice around a cylindrical altar, which lies beneath a small shrine with a portrayal of two men reclining and evidently sharing a drink from a *rhyton*; to the immediate left of the altar and shrine stands the distinctive statue of a triple-bodied Hekate (i.e., a Hekataion), while the top corners of the relief have various

[56] Todor Gerasimov, "Neizdadeni avtonomni moneti ot Mesambriya na Cherno more [Unpublished Autonomous Coins of Mesambria on the Black Sea]," *Izvestiya na Narodniya muzei – Burgas* [*Bulletin of the National Museum – Burgas*] 1 (1950): 23-33 (26); Karayotov, *Coinage of Mesambria*, vol. 1, 19; idem, "Melsas, the Founder of Messembria, on a Coin from the V Century BC," *Thracia* 17 (2007): 353-368; idem, *The Coinage of Mesambria*, vol. 2 (Burgas: Centre for Maritime History, Archaeology and Ecology – Sozopolo, 2009), 20f., 30-34. On Byzas: see Thomas Russell, *Byzantium and the Bosporus: A Historical Study, from the Seventh Century BC until the Foundation of Constantinople* (Oxford Classical Monographs; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 234-236.

[57] Totko Stoyanov, "Pieces of Metalwork as Emblems on the Amphora Stamps of Thasos (till 336 B.C.) – Interpretation Issues," in *Ancient Macedonia VII: Macedonia from the Iron Age to the Death of Philip II. Papers Read at the Seventh International Symposium Held in Thessaloniki, October 14-18, 2002*, ed. Danai Kaplanidou and Irini Chioti (Thessaloniki: Institute for Balkan Studies, 2007), 153-163 (156f.); idem, "Warfare," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 426-442 (430).

[58] For Ares: see Percy Gardner, "Ares as a Sun-god, and Solar Symbols on the Coins of Macedon and Thrace," *Numismatic Chronicle* 20 (1880): 49-61 (60); Head, *Historia Numorum*, 237; cf. Karayotov, "Melsas," 363. For Athena: see Robu, *Mégare*, 320f. For a reference to the *Iliad*: see J. G. F. Hind, "Homer's 'Stout Helmet' on the Coins of Mesambria on the Black Sea," *Numismatic Chronicle* 167 (2007): 23f.

military accoutrements (two helmets, a pair of greaves, and a breastplate) on display.[59] It looks probable from the martial context, banqueting males, and Hekate's chthonic functions that the scene involves the commemoration of two heroized individuals who had died in defense of the city.[60] For the purposes of this study, I draw attention to the presence of the Hekataion, as it lends greater salience to the other traces of Hekate's cult in Mesambria. Beyond the numerous attestations of the theophoric name Ἑκαταῖος and the existence of an actual second-century marble Hekataion (now at the Nesebar Museum), we saw earlier how Ioulia claims to have apotheosized into Hekate before going on to highlight her status as a citizen of Mesambria, "from *Melsas* and *bria*."[61]

Lewis Farnell long ago posited a link between Hekate and the Thracian goddess Bendis, whom the Greeks typically identified with Artemis, on the basis of not only their shared associations with livestock and torches but also the prominence of dogs, an animal sacred and often sacrificed to Hekate, in a few ancient stories set in Thrace (in fact, we now have a substantial amount of archaeological documentation for ritual burials and sacrifices of dogs throughout Thrace).[62] Although the illustrations carved onto Ioulia's funerary stele

[59] Ivan Venedikov, "Trois reliefs surprenants de Mésambria," in *Nessebre*, vol. 2, 81-95 (81-85, 92); *IGBulg* V 5102, though see V 5104 for discussion of the date.

[60] Venedikov, "Trois reliefs," 83-85; see also Maria Alexandrescu Vianu, "L'iconographie des reliefs aux stratèges de Mésambria," *Studii Clasice* 24 (1986): 99-107; Aneta Petrova, "Images of the Dead on Hellenistic Funerary Reliefs from Mesambria," in *The Bosporus: Gateway between the Ancient West and East (1st Millennium BC-5th Century AD). Proceedings of the Fourth International Congress on Black Sea Antiquities Istanbul, 14th-18th September 2009*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze et al. (BAR International Series 2517; Oxford: Archaeopress, 2013), 325-332 (327).

[61] For the names: see *LGPN* IV, 115f. s.v. Ἑκαταῖος; and more generally, Parissaki, *Prosopography*, 167f., 268. For a photo of the Hekataion: see Zhana Chimbuleva and Dimiter Saselov, *The Ancient City of Nessebur* (Sofia: Technica Publishing House, 1993), 39.

[62] Lewis Richard Farnell, *The Cults of the Greek States*, vol. 2 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1896), 474-476, 507f.; for an assessment, cf. David R. West, *Some Cults of Greek Goddesses and Female Daemons of Oriental Origin* (Alter Orient und Altes Testament 233; Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1995), 221-224. On dog burials and sacrifices in Thrace: see e.g. Georgi Nekhrizov and Julia Tzvetkova, "Ritual Pit Complexes in Iron Age Thrace: The Case Study Svilengrad," in *Anatolian Iron Ages 7: Proceedings of the*

reveal no direct hints of Thracian influence—a middle panel shows Ioulia-Hekate brandishing torches, and the top and bottom ones include two dogs each, none of which seems exceptional in iconographical terms—it deserves notice that torches and a dog likewise feature on a second- or first-century votive relief from nearby Odessos, depicting a female figure identified as Phosphoros in its dedicatory inscription.[63] My section on Odessos will discuss Phosphoros at length; for the moment, I merely wish to point out that Artemis, Hekate, and Bendis all possessed the epithet Φωσφόρος, "Light-bringer," and that the dedication to Phosphoros turned up alongside a roughly contemporaneous dedication to a local Thracian god, Heros Karabasmos, during the excavation of a sanctuary.[64] We see in this instance how conceptually similar deities, and perhaps religious ideas in general, could blend in such a way that isolating the Thracian element from the Greek becomes impossible.[65]

The *strategoi* relief and stele of Ioulia offer examples from Thrace, yet exclusive to Mesambria, of the immortalization of the dead under the auspices of Hekate and in both public and private spheres.[66] The eminence of the *strategoi*, as demonstrated by how

Seventh Anatolian Iron Ages Colloquium Held at Edirne, 19–24 April 2010, ed. Altan Çilingiroğlu and Antonio Sagona (Ancient Near Eastern Studies Supplement 39; Leuven: Peeters, 2012), 177-209 (182, 191f.).

[63] For a line drawing of Ioulia's stele and an analysis of the images: see Lilian Portefaix, *Sisters Rejoice: Paul's Letter to the Philippians and Luke-Acts as Received by First-century Philippian Women* (Coniectanea Biblica 20; Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International, 1988), 87-91.

[64] For the epithet Φωσφόρος: see e.g. Eur. *Hel.* 569 (applied to Hekate); Proc. *In R.* 1.18.9-21 (discussed in relation to Artemis-Bendis), ed. Wilhelm Kroll, *Procli Diadochi in Platonis rem publicam commentarii*, 2 vols. (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1899-1901).

[65] See also Siegrid Düll, "Götter auf makedonischen Grabstelen," in *Essays in Memory of Basil Laourdas*, ed. Louisa B. Laourda (Thessaloniki: Sfakianakis, 1975), 115-135, esp. 117-119.

[66] Cf. Hekate's less direct role in the cult of Abderos, the eponymous hero of Abdera (on which, see Pind. *Pae.* 2; Benjamin Isaac, *The Greek Settlements in Thrace until the Macedonian Conquest* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1986), 107f.; A. J. Graham, "Abdera and Teos," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 112 [1992]: 44-73 [67]). On the immortalization of the dead in a broader context: see e.g. Andrzej Wypustek, *Images of Eternal Beauty in Funerary Verse Inscriptions of the Hellenistic and Greco-Roman Periods* (Mnemosyne Supplements 352; Leiden: Brill, 2013), 29ff. (with a brief discussion of Ioulia's stele on 30f.).

frequently they crop up in the epigraphical and monumental record, further implies an important position for Hekate within the civic ideology.[67] Returning then to Mesambria's etymology, I do believe (in slight agreement with Dimitar Bojadziev) that its incorporation on Ioulia's stele serves to express a degree of "Thracian" identity—after all, "from *Melsas* and *bria*" reminds readers of the Thracian derivation behind the city's name—but I suspect as well that she would not have separated this from her identities as a citizen of Mesambria and devotee of Hekate.[68] For Ioulia, to regard Mesambria as her πατρίς might have simply gone hand in hand with pride in its purported Thracian roots and recognition of the apotheosizing powers of Hekate, a goddess who transcended cultural barriers in Thrace. The narrative or notion of "mixing" that appears to underlie the legend of Melsas could thus find some resonance here.

To all this, we can add two pieces of concrete evidence for Mesambria's ties with Thracian populations. First, a second-century proxeny decree honors a man from the tribe of the Astai, who occupied the region and town of Salmydessos (modern Kıyıköy) on the Black Sea, about 120 kilometers south of Mesambria.[69] The Astai developed a reputation for preying upon shipwrecks, according to Strabo, and in this they followed in the footsteps of their predecessors at Salmydessos, the so-called Melinophagoi or "Millet-eaters," as

[67] On the *strategoi* of Mesambria: see Nawotka, *Western Pontic Cities*, 186-189.

[68] Cf. Dimitar Bojadziev, "Un cas de contact entre la langue thrace et la langue grecque," in *Thracia Pontica III*, 182-185.

[69] *IGBulg* I^2 312. On the Astai: see Peter Delev, "Once More on the Thracian Strategies of Claudius Ptolemy," in *Sbornik v pamet na profesor Velizar Velkov* [*Collection in Memory of Professor Velizar Velkov*], ed. Dochka Vladimirova-Aladzhova (Sofia: Natsionalen arkheologicheski institut i muzei - BAN, 2009), 245-253 (247); Dilyana Boteva, "'Under cover of carrying succour to the Byzantines': King Philip V of Macedon against Thracian Chiefs (Analysis of Liv. XXXIX, 35, 4)," in *Cities in Southeastern Thrace: Continuity and Transformation*, ed. Daniela Stoyanova et al. (Sofia: St. Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2017), 115-124 (119).

known from Xenophon's eyewitness description of them during the late-fifth or early-fourth century.[70] Recently, Adrian Robu has adduced both Strabo's testimony and the proxeny decree to complement his interpretation of a partially-preserved Hellenistic treaty between the Mesambrians and the Thracian dynast Sadalas (our second piece of evidence), seeing in these three sources potential signs of the Astai's influence over the Greek *poleis* of the western Black Sea area.[71] The Sadalas Inscription, or what survives of it, deserves quoting in full:

[- -]
[- - - - - - - - -] τ̣ο̣ις Σαδαλαι ὥς κα δυνα-
[τὸν τ]ά̣χιστα· στεφανῶσαι δὲ αὐτὸν χρυσ[έ-]
[ωι] στεφάνωι εὐε[ρ]γέταν ἐόντα τᾶς πόλιος
Διονυσίοις ἐν τῶι θεάτρωι· δεδόσθαι δὲ αὐ-
τῶι καὶ ἐκγόνοις πολιτείαν καὶ προξενίαν
καὶ προεδρίαν ἐν τοῖς ἀγῶσιν καὶ εἴσπλουν
καὶ ἔκπλουν ἀσυλεὶ καὶ ἀσπονδεί· στεφα-
νοῦσθαι δὲ αὐτὸν καθ' ἕκαστον ἐνιαυ-
τὸν στεφάνωι στατήρων πεντήκοντα·
τὸν δὲ ταμίαν τὸν ὅρκον καὶ τὰς ὁμολογία[ς]
γράψαντα εἰς στάλαν λιθίναν κοῖλα γράμ-
ματα ἀναθέμεν εἰς τὸ ἱερὸν τοῦ Ἀπόλ-
λωνος παρὰ τὰς στάλας τῶμ προγόνων
Μοψυηστιος καὶ Ταρουτινου καὶ Μηδιστα̣
καὶ Κοτυος.

vacat

ὁμολογία Σαδαλα καὶ Μεσσαμβριανῶν·
αἳ τινές κα ἐκπίπτωντι Μεσσαμβριανῶν
[ποτὶ τ]ὰ̣ν Σαδαλα, ἀποδιδόντες τῶν ναύλ-

[70] Strabo 7.6.1; Xen. *Anab.* 7.5.13. On Salmydessos, the Melinophagoi, and the plundering of shipwrecks: see further Jan P. Stronk, "Wreckage at Salmydessos," *Talanta* 18-19 (1986-1987): 63-75; Kalin Porozhanov, "Salmidessos – An *Orphikos* and *Axeinos* Part of Thracia Pontica," *Thracia* 16 (2005): 21-34.

[71] Adrian Robu, "Les relations de Byzance avec les cités du Pont Gauche à l'époque hellénistique: la guerre pour l'emporion de Tomis," in *Die Außenbeziehungen pontischer und kleinasiatischer Städte in hellenistischer und römischer Zeit: Akten einer deutsch-rumänischen Tagung in Constanța, 20.–24. September 2010*, ed. Victor Cojocaru and Christof Schuler (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2014), 19-36 (24).

[λων - - - - - στα]τῆρας κ̣αὶ ἡμ̣ιστάτηρο-
[ν -][72]

> … to Sadalas as quickly as possible. Crown him with a gold crown, as he is a benefactor of the *polis*, during the Dionysiai in the theater. Let it be granted to him and his descendants: citizenship, proxeny, front-row seating at the games, and the right to sail in and sail out without harm and without truce. Let him be crowned each year with a crown worth fifty staters. Let the treasurer, after inscribing the oath and the agreements upon a stone stele in hollow letters, set it up in the sanctuary of Apollo alongside the stelae of his forebearers Mopsuestios, Taroutinos, Medistas, and Kotys.
>
> Agreement of Sadalas and the Messambrians: if any of the Messambrians are cast out upon the territory of Sadalas, rendering… of the cargo… staters and a half-stater…

The fragmentary clause at the beginning of the ὁμολογία evidently concerns the fate of Mesambrian shipwrecks off the coast of Sadalas' territory, and Robu discerns here an allusion to the activities of the Astai around Salmydessos.[73] This builds upon the opinion of Christo Danov, who assigned the treaty to the middle or second half of the third century, when the Odrysian Kingdom no longer existed, and thereby identified Sadalas as a leader of the Astai through the process of geographical elimination.[74] However, Ivan Venedikov objected to this on the grounds that the Astai remain unattested in the literary and epigraphical record until the second century.[75] Other scholars offered alternative perspectives as well. Mihailov placed the treaty between 281 and 277, after the collapse of

[72] *IGBulg* I^2 307 (= V 5086) with Mihailov ad loc. For a translation of and additional commentary on the publication clause in lines 11-16: see Denver Graninger, "Documentary Contexts for the 'Pistiros Inscription,'" *Electrum* 19 (2012): 99-110 (106).

[73] Robu, "Relations de Byzance," 24; cf. also Petăr Balabanov, "Trois inscriptions du littoral sud-est de la mer Noire," in *Studia in honorem Georgii Mihailov*, ed. Alexandre Fol et al. (Sofia: Institute of Thracology, Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski," 1995), 37-40 (38f.).

[74] See e.g. Christo M. Danov, "The Celtic Invasion and Rule in Thrace in the Light of Some New Evidence," *Studia Celtica* 10/11 (1975/1976): 29-40 (30f.); idem, "Die Thraker auf dem Ostbalkan von der hellenistischen Zeit bis zur Gründung Konstantinopels," *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt* II.7.1 (1979): 21-85 (49f., 74f.).

[75] Ivan Venedikov, "L'inscription de Sadalas," *Epigraphica* 42 (1980): 7-12.

Lysimachos' kingdom but before invading Celts established themselves in southeastern Thrace, a brief window during which an Odrysian ruler could have imposed his terms upon Mesambria.[76] Yordanka Youroukova pushed the date back even further to the last quarter of the fourth century, arguing from a numismatic standpoint that the monetary value of the crown bestowed upon Sadalas would not have suited the (supposedly) poorer economic conditions of the third century.[77]

None, to my knowledge, have entertained the possibility that Sadalas belonged to the Melinophagoi. They fit the context of shipwrecks just as well as the Astai, while a reference to the Melinophagoi in 340 by the historian Theopompos could bring them within the lifetime of one of Sadalas' four ancestors as long as the treaty dates to the mid-third century or earlier.[78] Although Mihailov did propose to identify Sadalas with a homonymous Odrysian prince mentioned in the Seuthopolis Inscription, this seems overly speculative in light of the popularity of their name.[79] Nor do we have any reason to think that Sadalas possessed wide-reaching authority, with the absence of a royal title in the

[76] Georgi Mihailov, "La Thrace au IV^{e} et III^{e} siècle avant notre ère," *Athenaeum* 39 (1961): 33-44 (37); *IGBulg* I^{2} 307 with idem ad loc.; see also Hermann Bengtson, "Neues zur Geschichte des Hellenismus in Thrakien und in der Dobrudscha," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 11 (1962): 18-28 (25f.).

[77] Jordanka Youroukova, "Les monnaies dans l'inscription de Sadalas," *Epigraphica* 42 (1980): 13-24; cf. also Jeanne Robert and Louis Robert, *Bulletin épigraphique* (1953), 150f. no. 133 (dating the inscription paleographically to the early Hellenistic period).

[78] Theopompos *FGrH/BNJ* 115 F 223; Gordon S. Shrimpton, *Theopompus the Historian* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991), 63; John Buckler, *Aegean Greece in the Fourth Century BC* (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 478. In Sadalas' day, relations between his family and Mesambria could have already spanned as much as a century: see Thibaut Castelli, "Un 'protectorat' thrace? Les relations politiques entre Grecs et Thraces autour de la baie de Bourgas (III^{e}-II^{e} s. Av. J.-C.)," in *I Traci tra geografia e storia*, ed. Paola Schirripa (Aristonothos: Scritti per il Mediterraneo antico 9; Trento: Tangram Edizioni Scientifiche, 2015), 81-108 (94).

[79] See also Peter Delev, "From Corupedion towards Pydna: Thrace in the Third Century," *Thracia* 15 (2003): 107-123 (112 n30). For the numerous occurrences of the name Σαδαλας and its variants: see *OnomThrac*, 299-301 s.v. Sadala.

treaty perhaps signifying his status as a mere chieftain or nobleman.[80] Therefore, we might picture the Mesambrians as having regular social, economic, political, and maybe religious contacts with the Thracians of Salmydessos, which started from at least the fourth century and persisted even after the Astai absorbed or supplanted the Melinophagoi.[81] In exchange for protecting castaway Mesambrian sailors and their cargo, apparently, these Thracians could secure various privileges (including citizenship and proxeny) within the *polis*.

To sum up the key points:

(1) The Mesambrians insisted that their city had a Thracian origin, judging from its etymology, which involves a compound of the personal name Μέλσας with the Thracian word *bria*, as well as the figure of Melsas himself, whom the foundation legend probably characterized as a Thracian king.

(2) This legend may have already existed by the end of the fourth century, as suggested by the earliest attestation of the uniquely Mesambrian name Μελσέων around the start of the third century.

(3) Although from the Roman period, Ioulia's funerary stele seems to articulate a "mixed" Mesambrian identity by invoking both the Thracian etymology and a Mesambrian conception of Hekate, a goddess otherwise associated with indigenous Thracian religions.

[80] See Maria Mainardi, "Mesambria Pontica e i Traci," *Acme* 64, no. 3 (2011): 3-26 (21, with reference to Luigi Moretti).

[81] For an alternative and highly speculative take on Mesambria's relations with the Melinophagoi and other Thracian tribes: cf. Ljuba Ognenova, "Une hypothèse sur le nom de Mesambria," in *Studia in honorem Borisi Gerov*, ed. Margarita Tačeva and Dimitâr Bojadžiev (Sofia: Sofia Press, 1990), 156f.

(4) Epigraphical sources confirm that the Mesambrians had strong relations with nearby Thracian communities, the beginnings of which might coincide with the development of the Melsas legend in the fourth century.

The internal history of Mesambria and the source of the Melsas legend still remain obscure, and we lack comprehensive demographic data about the proportions of the Greek and Thracian populations, but the evidence nevertheless paints a portrait of a *polis* that openly embraced a narrative of "mixing." This may have come in response to very real cross-cultural interactions with their Thracian neighbors, and we can possibly detect some of the resultant cultural ambiguity in the civic ideology and religion. The situation at Mesambria encourages us to think beyond arguments about Greek versus Thracian foundations, which have dominated the scholarly literature so far, and instead appreciate how the inhabitants appear to have felt no qualms about claiming a "mixed" identity.

Zone

The site of ancient Zone (once identified by scholars with another, and perhaps illusory, Mesambria) lies at the mouth of the stream Shabla Dere on the southern Thracian coast, approximately 20 kilometers west of the Hebros River and opposite to the island of Samothrace.[82] Although we know virtually nothing about Zone's internal history, literary

[82] On Zone's location: see conveniently Polyxeni Tsatsopoulou-Kaloudi, *Mesimvria-Zoni* (Athens: Tameio Archaiologikon Poron kai Apallotrioseon, 2001), 9-11; Louisa Loukopoulou, "Thrace from Nestos to Hebros," in *Inventory*, 870-884 (881f. no. 651). On the possible nonexistence of Aegean Mesambria: see Louisa D. Loukopoulou et al., eds., *Epigrafes tis Thrakis tou Aigaiou* (Athens: Kentron Hellenikes kai Romaikes Archaiotetos, 2005) [abbreviated hereafter as *IThrAeg*], 508 n2, with reference to Michael Zahrnt; discussed further in Michalis Tiverios, "Greek Colonisation of the Northern Aegean," in *Greek Colonisation: An Account of Greek Colonies and Other Settlements Overseas*, vol. 2, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze (Mnemosyne Supplements 193; Leiden: Brill, 2008), 1-154 (109).

sources do imply that the city had Thracian origins; Stephanos, on the authority of Hekataios, describes it as a "*polis* of the Kikones" (πόλις Κικόνων), referring here to a Thracian tribe first attested in the *Odyssey*, while Herodotus states that the entire region formerly belonged to the Kikones.[83] From an archaeological perspective, the dating of two circular tombs in the local necropolis, which apparently saw use from at least the tenth century B.C.E down to the seventh, seems to confirm the existence of an indigenous, pre-Greek settlement in the vicinity.[84] Zone's background helps contextualize the later evidence for interactions there between Greeks and Thracians, and this section explores how that evidence might exhibit the phenomenon of "mixing."

Excavations at Zone's temple of Apollo have brought to light a little over two hundred ostraca that feature writing in a non-Greek language, albeit mostly in Greek letters, with 90% dating to the sixth century and 10% to the first quarter of the fifth.[85] We encounter the same combination of language and script employed on seventy-eight ostraca from Samothrace as well as a handful of badly damaged lapidary inscriptions from Zone, Samothrace, and Maroneia (another "*polis* of the Kikones," according to Hekataios *apud* Stephanos), the majority likewise dating to the sixth-fifth centuries and the rest to the fourth.[86] These texts lend credence to Diodorus' claim in the first century that the indigenes

[83] Hekataios *FGrH/BNJ* 1 F 161 (Steph. Byz. Z 33); Hdt. 7.59.2, 7.108.2f.

[84] Polyxenia Tsatsopoulou-Kaloudi, "Eisagogi," in *Archaia Zoni I: To Iero tou Apollona* (Komotini: Ypourgeio Politismou kai Athlitismou, Eforeia Archaiotíton Evrou, Perifereia Anatolikis Makedonias-Thrakis, 2015), 16-112 (74); cf. also Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 72f.

[85] Claude Brixhe, "Langue et écriture," in *Archaia Zoni*, 282-306 (282).

[86] Hekataios *FGrH/BNJ* 1 F 159 (Steph. Byz. M 81). For the texts from Zone: see Claude Brixhe, "Corpus," in *Αρχαία Ζώνη I*, 211-250; in the same volume, idem and Antigoni Zournatzi, "Les inscriptions sur pierres," 251-281 (251-269 no. I-III, IV.B). For the texts from Samothrace: see Karl Lehmann, "Documents of the Samothracian Language," *Hesperia* 24, no. 2 (1955): 93-100 (97-100 no. 1-40); idem, *Samothrace: The Inscriptions on Ceramics and Minor Objects* (Samothrace 2.2; New York: Pantheon Books, 1960), 45-64 no. 1-75; P. M. Fraser, *Samothrace: The Inscriptions on Stone* (Samothrace 2.1; New York:

of Samothrace spoke "their own ancient language, much of which is even now preserved in the sacrificial rites" (παλαιὰν ἰδίαν διάλεκτον… ἧς πολλὰ ἐν ταῖς θυσίαις μέχρι τοῦ νῦν τηρεῖται).[87] Claude Brixhe, who has had some success in deciphering the Zone-Samothrace ostraca, classifies the language as a form of Thracian while also discerning parallels with Greek and Phrygian.[88]

Assuming that Brixhe has understood them correctly, nearly all of the ostraca represent dedications to Apollo. Moreover, a large number seem to adhere to a formula comprising four basic elements, which I list below in the order of their arrangement:

(1) Αβολο. We can clearly recognize Apollo's name here, but it probably reflects the dative case rather than the nominative, judging by what follows.

(2) υνεσο. Because it evidently shares a case-ending with the preceding theonym, Brixhe suspects that υνεσο functions as a divine epithet. He suggests a borrowing from a hypothetical Greek adjective *ὄνησος, the equivalent of ὀνήσιμος, "useful."

Pantheon Books, 1960), 120f. no. 64; Dimitris Matsas, "I Samothraki stin Proimi Epochi tou Sidirou," in *To Aigaio stin Proimi Epochi tou Sidirou: Praktika tou Diethnous Symposiou, Rodos 1-4 Noemvriou 2002*, ed. N. Χρ. Σταμπολίδης et al. (Athens: Panepistimio Kritis, 2004), 227-257 (230f.). For the texts from Maroneia: see *IThrAeg* E376-378.

[87] Diod. 5.47.3. Cf. Al. N. Oikonomides, "Misread Greek Inscriptions as Documents of the 'Samothracian,' 'Tarentine,' 'Gallic,' and 'Illyrian' Languages," *Ancient World* 1, no. 4 (1978): 159-166 (159), who insisted that "the word *dialect* (διάλεκτον) cannot be translated in this case as *language*"; for a succinct rebuttal, see A. J. Graham, "The Colonization of Samothrace," *Hesperia* 71, no. 3 (2002): 231-260 (251).

[88] Claude Brixhe, "Zônè et Samothrace: lueurs sur la langue thrace et nouveau chapitre de la grammaire comparée?" *Comptes rendus des séances de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 150 (2006): 121-146; idem, "Langue et écriture," 282ff.; cf. also Giuliano Bonfante, "A Note on the Samothracian Language," *Hesperia* 24, no. 2 (1955): 101-109.

(3) The dedicant's name. Examples include Greek names (e.g., Απολοδορε, from Ἀπολλόδωρος) and one distinctly Thracian name (i.e., Σαντο), among many others that prove ambiguous.[89]

(4) καιε/καε. Brixhe takes it as the third-person singular of a verb for "offer" or "dedicate" and proposes a connection to the Greek καίειν, "to burn."

Together, the elements produce a sentence that translates to: "[Personal Name] dedicates (this) to Apollo *uneso*." It deserves notice that two ostraca from Samothrace, dating to the late-sixth or first half of the fifth century, also reveal a potential variant on the formula, in which the Thracian goddess Bendis might occupy the place of the theonym, but this depends upon the accuracy of Brixhe's reconstructions. On one of the ostraca, at the right end of a sinistroverse text, he interprets the crescent-shaped line of a partially preserved letter as a lunate beta (common to the Zone ostraca) instead of the arms of a kappa, leaving us with the phrase Βενζι υνεσοz[…]; on the other, at the edge of the left fracture of a dextroverse text, he "restores" (on no epigraphical basis, as far as I can tell) a delta from what actually looks like the leg of a lambda, so that he can read [Βεν]δει υνεσο πορκ[…]. The inconsistent spellings of Bendis' name could have stemmed from the "palatalization then depalatalization of *d/g* under conditions that remain to be specified," he maintains.[90] Of these two supposed attestations of Bendis, however, only the first strikes me as plausible.

[89] On the name Σαντο: see *OnomThrac*, 303 s.v. σαντ-.

[90] Brixhe, "Zônè et Samothrace," 125 fig. 3, 139f.; idem, "Langue et écriture," 292; for the original publication and line drawings of the texts, see Matsas, "Samothraki," 230 eik. 2.

A recently published bilingual Greek-Thracian inscription, discovered near Zone's temple of Apollo in 1988 and dated paleographically to the late-fifth or early-fourth century, may offer further insights into the status of the Thracian language.[91] While highly fragmentary, what survives of the Greek portion contains part of a decree granting inviolability (ἀσυλία)—a type of a "positive right," like proxeny, that *poleis* could bestow upon individuals—and we have no reason to think that the Thracian text substantially deviates in content.[92] The rather mundane occasion for this decree raises the prospect that a Thracian language enjoyed equal footing with Greek in the eyes of Zone's political authorities, though we should not exclude outside pressure (from the Odrysians?) as a potential consideration here.[93] Nor can we simply infer that Zone possessed a bilingual populace, for the few other examples of bilingual inscriptions from the Classical world often reflect unique "social arrangements" in largely monolingual contexts, as outlined by Shane Hawkins:

> i) predominately monolingual communities living together who cannot read each others' language; ii) societies that contain one (or more) subgroup of monolinguals; iii) a society of monolinguals with a bilingual elite. Inscriptions may transcend local concerns; one language of a bilingual may be used as an international language of communication, or, as in case of the obsolescent Akkadian on Achaemenid inscriptions, to convey prestige.[94]

---

[91] For both parts of the text: see Antigoni Zournatzi, "Texte grec," in "Les inscriptions sur pierres," *Archaia Zoni,* 257-259; in the same section, Claude Brixhe, "Texte thrace, 259-266.

[92] Ibid., 263f. On "positive rights" in this period: see Graninger, "Pistiros Inscription," 103.

[93] Antigoni Zournatzi, "La question de la signification du monument," in "Les inscriptions sur pierres," *Archaia Zoni,* 266-269 (267).

[94] Shane Hawkins, "Greek and the Languages of Asia Minor during the Classical Period," in *A Companion to the Ancient Greek Language,* ed. Egbert J. Bakker (Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010), 213-227 (223).

To shift to a slightly different topic, Livy records that when a Roman army marched through southern Thrace in 188, it encamped for a night near a temple of Bendis before proceeding westward across the Hebros and past a temple of Apollo, "whom the inhabitants call Zerynthius" (*Zerynthium quem vocant incolae*). Both temples must have stood relatively close to Zone, since the Romans managed to reach its neighbor Sale (probably at modern Makri, less than 10 kilometers east of Zone) by the end of the day, despite having suffered delays due to battles against the Thracians.[95] The scholiast on Nicander's second-century poem *Theriaka* provides additional information in a comment about Mount Rheskynthion: "There is a temple of Hera and Apollo Zerynthios in this place… Not far from the river [Hebros] is the *polis* Zone, after which are the oaks of Orpheus, and under these is the *polis* Zerynthion, in which there is a cave" (ἔστι δὲ τῆς Ἥρας καὶ Ζηρυνθίου Ἀπόλλωνος νεὼς ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ τόπῳ… οὐ μακρὰν δέ ἐστι τοῦ ποταμοῦ ἡ Ζώνη ἡ πόλις, μεθ' ἣν αἱ Ὀρφέως δρύες εἰσίν, ὑφ' ἃς πόλις ἐστὶ Ζηρύνθιον, ἐν ᾗ τὸ ἄντρον).[96] Thus, the population of the region surrounding Zone appears to have worshipped not only Bendis but also a local manifestation of Apollo, known as Zerynthios and possibly connected with the site of Zerynthion, at least during the second century.

---

[95] Livy 38.41.1-8. On Sale's location: see François Mottas, "Les voies de communication antiques de la Thrace égéenne," in *Labor omnibus unus: Gerold Walser zum 70. Geburtstag dargebracht von Freunden, Kollegen und Schülern*, ed. Heinz E. Herzig and Regula Frei-Stolba (Historia Einzelschriften 60; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1989), 82-104 (88, 95); Polyxeni Tsatsopoulou, "The Colonies of Samothrace: Topography and Archaeological Research," in *Thrace in the Graeco-Roman World: Proceedings of the 10th International Congress of Thracology, Komotini – Alexandroupolis 18-23 October, 2005*, ed. Athena Iakovidou (Athens: Center for Greek and Roman Antiquity, National Hellenic Research Foundation, 2007), 648-656 (649f.).

[96] Schol. Nic. *Ther*. 460, ed. Annunciata Crugnola, *Scholia in Nicandri Theriaka cum glossis* (Testi e documenti per lo studio dell'Antichità 34; Milan: Istituto Editoriale Cisalpino, 1971). The specific mention of "oaks" (δρύες) may play on the name of Drys (Δρῦς), Zone's neighbor to the west: see Floris Overduin, *Nicander of Colophon's* Theriaca: *A Literary Commentary* (Mnemosyne Supplements 374; Leiden: Brill, 2015), 354.

Although it remains uncertain whether a *polis* by the name of Zerynthion ever existed—we have no further evidence of it besides Stephanos' entry on "Zerynthos" (Ζήρυνθος)—he and other sources do note the existence of a cave with an identical name that belonged to the goddess Hekate.[97] The Hellenistic poem *Alexandra*, attributed to Lykophron and likely dating to the early-second century, refers to this Zerynthos, describing it as the "cave of the goddess to whom dogs are sacrificed" (ἄντρον τῆς κυνοσφαγοῦς θεᾶς), and the *Alexandra* later speaks of Hecuba after her transformation into a dog at the hands of Hekate, "terrifying mortals through her nightly howls, as many as do not venerate the images of Zerynthia, the ruler of Strymon, with torches held" (κλαγγαῖσι ταρμύσσουσαν ἐννύχοις βροτούς, ὅσοι μεδούσης Στρυμόνος Ζηρυνθίας δείκηλα μὴ σέβουσι λαμπαδουχίαις).[98] The Byzantine encyclopedia *Suda* and scholia on Aristophanes' *Peace* allege, too, that the rituals performed in the cave did involve sacrifices of dogs to Hekate.[99] Yet curiously enough, the *Alexandra* and *Suda* elsewhere equate Zerynthia with

[97] Steph. Byz. Z 204. On the possible location of the cave: cf. Karl Lehmann, *Samothrace: A Guide to the Excavations and the Museum* (New York: New York University Press, 1955), 55f.; Valeria Fol, "The Great Goddess-Mother and the Monster *Kenchrines*," *Études balkaniques* 52 (2016): 28-40 (31-33). Another comment by the scholiast on the *Theriaka* (462) places Zerynthos on Samothrace, as does Ovid's reference to "Zerynthian shores" (*Zerynthia litora*) in connection to that island (*Tr.* 1.10.19f.), but the absence of any caves there makes this unlikely: cf. Henry Fanshawe Tozer, *The Islands of the Aegean* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1890), 342f.

[98] Ps.-Lycoph. *Alex.* 77f., 1178f., ed. Lorenzo Mascialino, *Lycophronis Alexandra* (Leipzig: Teubner, 1964). On the authorship and date of the *Alexandra*: see Simon Hornblower, *Lykophron's* Alexandra, *Rome, and the Hellenistic World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 3-7; idem, "Hellenistic Tragedy and Satyr-Drama: Lycophron's *Alexandra*," in *Greek Tragedy after the Fifth Century: A Survey from ca. 400 BC to ca. AD 400*, ed. Vayos Liapis and Antonis K. Petrides (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019), 90-124 (117-120).

[99] *Suda* s.v. Σαμοθρᾴκη; Schol. Aristoph. *Pax* 277f.

Aphrodite.[100] A non-Greek or culturally ambiguous origin of Zerynthia might explain the confusion over her identity.[101]

The question arises as to whether the worship of Zerynthios and Zerynthia predates or postdates contact with the Greeks. Of course, the former would create an odd scenario insofar that the authors of the Zone-Samothrace ostraca, despite expressing themselves in a Thracian language, opted to address their dedications to Apollo (whose name the Greeks presumably introduced to the region) rather than the native Zerynthios.[102] This could mean that the fusion of the two took place at a later stage. If, on the other hand, Zerynthios and Zerynthia developed after the arrival of the Greeks, we might have an instance of a "Thracian" cult that nevertheless emerged under Greek cultural and religious influences. I find the latter option somewhat more likely; aside from the lack of references to Zerynthios, Zerynthia, and Zerynthion/Zerynthos prior to the second century, Zerynthia's similarities to Bendis, a more categorically Thracian goddess worshipped in the same area, as well as to Hekate—indeed, all their cults prominently featured dogs and torches—invite the hypothesis that the conception of Zerynthia also drew inspiration from both Bendis and

[100] Ps.-Lycoph. *Alex.* 449, 958; *Suda* s.v. Ζηρυνθία; P. M. Fraser, "Lycophron on Cyprus," *Report of the Department of Antiquities, Cyprus* (1979): 328-343 (333); Simon Hornblower, "Lykophron and Epigraphy: The Value and Function of Cult Epithets in the *Alexandra*," *Classical Quarterly* 64 (2014); 91-120 (115); idem, *Lykophron's* Alexandra, 56f.

[101] Cf. also Lehmann, *Samothrace*, 22; Nikola Theodossiev, "Mountain Goddesses in Ancient Thrace: The Broader Context," *Kernos* 15 (2002): 325-329 (325). For a linguistic analysis of Ζήρυνθος and other forms of the toponym (treating them as examples of the Thracian linguistic material): see Ivan Duridanov, *Die Sprache der Thraker* (Bulgarische Sammlung 5; Neuried: Hieronymus Verlag, 1985), 50.

[102] The worship of Apollo seems to predate the Greeks, but his origins probably lie in Anatolia, where he went by the name Appaluwa: see Mary R. Bachvarova, *From Hittite to Homer: The Anatolian Background of Greek Epic* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), 243-249; cf. Václav Blažek, "Apollo the Archer," in *Ancient Greek Linguistics: New Approaches, Insights, Perspectives*, ed. Felicia Logozzo and Paolo Poccetti (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2017), 643-661.

Hekate.[103] Zerynthia, in this case, could have represented a product of the cross-cultural exchanges that had already begun in the sixth century, as evidenced by the Zone-Samothrace ostraca.

All in all, the dedications to Apollo show that his temple at Zone served as a space for some measure of non-Greek religious expression, and the presence of such a space within a nominally Greek *polis* points at a minimum to the toleration of the Thracian population. When factoring in Diodorus' testimony about the integration of the native's "ancient language" into the sacrificial rites at Samothrace, we might posit that the same likewise occurred at Zone and that the situation there extended beyond mere toleration of the Thracians to the acceptance or embracing of a "mixed" community. The much later appearances of Apollo-Zerynthios and Hekate-Zerynthia in the region may reflect, in turn, the continuation of the process of "mixing" down through the centuries, whereby interactions between Greeks and Thracians in the religious sphere eventually led to the creation of two new deities.

Odessos

Odessos' internal history remains poorly documented, owing to a dearth of relevant literary sources and the prohibitive difficulties of excavating in the heart of the modern port city of Varna. From Pseudo-Skymnos, we learn that Milesian colonists founded the *polis* during the first half of the sixth century, which pottery finds appear to corroborate,

[103] Cf. Alexander Fol, "Der Schatzfund von Rogozen. Zum Hellenismus in Südosteuropa," in *Akten des XIII. Internationalen Kongresses für klassische Archäologie, Berlin 1988* (Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 1990), 195-205 (198), who maintains that Bendis, Zerynthia, and various other deities represented local forms of a common "great mother goddess."

and that the Thracian tribe of the Krobyzoi lived in its hinterland (ἐν κύκλῳ δὲ αὐτῆς ἔχει Κροβύζους Θρᾷκας), but while linguists have also identified Ὀδησσός as a toponym of non-Greek origin, no direct traces of a preceding native settlement (at least after the Early Bronze Age) have yet come to light.[104] This has not discouraged scholars from assuming that a Thracian settlement did exist and that the evidence for it merely lies buried beneath the thick archaeological layers at Varna.[105] Nevertheless, as Margarit Damyanov notes, the grave goods recovered from burials in and around Odessos exhibit few signs of material or cultural exchanges between the Greek and indigenous populations before the fourth century.[106]

This section examines the more intriguing hints of "mixing" from Hellenistic Odessos, focusing in particular on the deities Heros Karabasmos (Ἥρως Καραβασμος) and Phosphoros (Φωσφόρος) as well as their possible relationship to the cult of Apollo, whom the Odessitans seem to have regarded as one of their chief gods in pre-Roman times.[107] I

[104] Ps.-Skymnos F 1 (*Peripl. Pont. Eux.* 80). For an overview of the archaeological picture: see Alexander Minchev, "Odessos (6th Century B.C. to Early 1st Century A.D.)," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, vol. 1, 209-278 (210-214). For linguistic perspectives on Odessos' name: see e.g. Veselin Beševliev, "Die Westküste des Schwarzen Meeres," *Klio* 63 (1981): 261-266, esp. 264; idem, "Vorthrakisch?" *Balkan Studies* 31 (1990): 47-50; Duridanov, *Sprache*, 130.

[105] See e.g. Mihail Lazarov, "Odessos—une ville antique sur le littoral Thrace du Pont Euxin," in *Le Pouvoir central et les villes en Europe de l'Est et du Sud-Est du XV^e siècle aux débuts de la révolution industrielle*, ed. Michael Mollat (Sofia: Editions de l'Académie Bulgare des Sciences, 1985), 63-72 (63f.).

[106] Margarit Damyanov, "Notes on the Development of Odessos and its Vicinity until Early Hellenistic Times," *Talanta* 36-37 (2004-2005): 289-308, esp. 294f.; idem, "Greeks and Natives in the Region of Odessos," in *Grecs et indigènes de la Catalogne à la Mer Noire: Actes des rencontres du programme européen Ramses2 (2006-2008)*, ed. Henri Tréziny (Bibliothèque d'Archéologie Méditerranéenne et Africaine 3; Paris: Édition Errance, 2010), 265-276; cf. Alexander Minchev, "Some Aspects of Cultural Exchange During 5th – 1st C BC in North-Eastern Thrace: Thracian, Scythian and Celtic Bridle Frontlets in the Archaeological Museum of Varna," in *The Lower Danube in Antiquity (VI C BC – VI C AD): International Archaeological Conference, Bulgaria-Tutrakan, 6.-7.10.2005*, ed. Lyudmil F. Vagalinski (Sofia: National Institute of Archaeology and Museum, 2007), 25-36.

[107] On Apollo's importance in the colonies of Miletos and Black Sea region in general: see e.g. Zlatozara Gočeva, "Le culte d'Apollon dans les colonies grecques de la côte ouest-pontique," *Kernos* 11 (1998): 227-234; Dobrinka Chiekova, *Cultes et vie religieuse des cités grecques du Pont Gauche (VII^e-I^er*

submit that the cult of Apollo at Odessos, like its counterpart at Zone, afforded opportunities for non-Greeks to participate in religious life alongside their Greek neighbors. Yet the situation at Odessos also differs in that we can potentially discern "mixing" from the physical spaces of worship and how the community handled religious diversity in these spaces. Although the Roman period, to be sure, reveals much clearer indications of Thracian influence upon the city and its religion—most notably, people then began to identify the Great God of Odessos (Θεὸς Μέγας Ὀδησιτῶν) with the Thracian deity Darzalas/Derzelas—our understanding of these later developments should ultimately benefit from the additional context provided by a consideration of the earlier, Hellenistic history of cross-cultural interactions.[108]

Dedications to the abovementioned Heros Karabasmos and Phosphoros surfaced in 1961 in the course of Gorana Tončeva's excavations of a small sanctuary (measuring 4.3 meters long and 4.2 meters wide) adjacent to the Roman bath at the corner of 8 Noemvri Street and Primorski Boulevard in Varna. Here she identified both Hellenistic and Roman strata, with the former spanning from the late-fourth century down to the first, when invading Getai may have razed the sanctuary, and the latter from the second century C.E. until the end of the fourth, during which a restored edifice presumably stood upon the

siècles avant J.-C.) (Publications universitaires europeennes, Série 38; Archäologie 76; Bern: Peter Lang, 2008), 15-69.

[108] On Darzalas: see Zlatosara Gočeva, "Der Kult des Theos Megas Darzalas in Odessos," *Würzburger Jahrbücher für die Altertumswissenschaft* 7 (1981): 229-234; Waldemar Szubert, "Notes on the Influence of Thracian Religious Cults in the West Pontian Greek Towns during the Roman Occupation. The Sanctuary of the Great God – Darzalos at Odessos," in *Dritter Internationaler Thrakologischer Kongress zu Ehren W. Tomascheks, 2. - 6. Juni 1980 Wien*, vol. 2, ed. Anton Peschew et al. (Sofia: Staatlicher Verlag Swjat, 1984), 275-283; Alexander Minchev, "Greek Traditions and Roman Taste: Continuity and Change in Odessos/Odessus (3rd c. B.C.-3rd c. A.D.)," in *Early Roman Thrace: New Evidence from Bulgaria*, ed. Ian P. Haynes (Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplementary Series 82; Portsmouth: Journal of Roman Archaeology, 2011), 15-39 (19).

location. The Hellenistic material included local and imported pottery (along with a ceramic object that might have originally formed part of a *kernos*), lamps covered with black varnish, beads from an Egyptian glass necklace, terracottas thought to represent Demeter, a marble figurine of a herm, and a large quantity of animal bones (from sacrifices, no doubt). At the bottom of the stratum, Tončeva discovered two votive reliefs with short inscribed dedications, one addressed to Heros Karabasmos and the other to Phosphoros, both of which Mihailov dated to the second or first century B.C.E., as well as a proxeny decree issued by the *boule* and *demos* of Odessos, which Mihailov dated to third or second century.[109]

Further attestations of Heros Karabasmos continue up through the second century C.E, all of them at Odessos or close by at the village of Galata.[110] The accompanying reliefs invariably feature what scholars have dubbed the "Thracian Horseman" or "Thracian Rider"—an extremely common theme in Thracian iconography, but not necessarily corresponding to a specific deity or figure.[111] While the depictions of the Rider from Odessos adhere to Hellenistic artistic conventions, the name Καραβασμος (also spelled Καραβασβος, Καραβαζμος, and Καραβασζμος) seems unmistakably Thracian, especially

[109] Gorana Tončeva, "Le sanctuaire du Héros Karabasmos d'Odessos," in *Actes du premier congrès des études balkaniques et sud-est européennes,* vol. 2, ed. Vladimir Georgiev et al. (Sofia: Editions de l'Académie Bulgare des Sciences, 1969), 353-364; in the same volume, Stefan Ivanov, "Tierknochen aus dem Heiligtum des Heros Karabasmus in Odessos," 375-377. For the inscriptions: see *IGBulg* I^2 78 bis (dedication to Heros Karabasmos), I^2 88 bis (= V 5034; dedication to Phosphoros), I^2 37 bis (= V 5015; the proxeny decree).

[110] See *IGBulg* I^2 78 bis, 78 ter, 79, 79 bis, 284-290; also published in Zlatozara Gočeva and Manfred Oppermann, *Corpus Cultus Equitis Thracii I: Monumenta Orae Ponti Euxini Bulgariae* [abbreviated hereafter as *CCET* I] (Études préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'Empire romain 74; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1979), nos. 28, 30, 33, 34, 83-89.

[111] On the Thracian Rider: see e.g. Nora Dimitrova, "Inscriptions and Iconography in the Monuments of the Thracian Rider," *Hesperia* 71, no. 2 (2002): 209-229; Dilyana Boteva, "The 'Thracian Horseman' Reconsidered," in *Early Roman Thrace,* 84-106.

in light of the repeated occurrences of the initial element Καρ- in toponyms and divine epithets in Thrace.[112] We can say nothing with confidence about the character of this god, unfortunately. A fragmentary second-century C.E. dedication found not far from the sanctuary, the first line of which Mihailov reconstructed to read [Θεῷ Ἀπόλ]λονι (*sic*) [Καρ]αβα[σμῳ], "to the god Apollo Karabasmos," offers only late and highly tentative evidence of assimilation with Apollo.[113]

Phosphoros proves less enigmatic. Indeed, the votive relief shows her wearing a quiver on her back, holding two torches, and standing next to a dog, and in this respect, she shares traits with three other goddesses—Bendis, Hekate, and Artemis—all of whom likewise possessed the epithet Φωσφόρος, "Light-bringer," as I already observed in my discussion of Hekate at Mesambria.[114] Phosphoros also had worshippers elsewhere in Thrace, with the Seuthopolis Inscription referring to a Phosphorion (i.e., a temple of Phosphoros) at Kabyle in the late-fourth or early-third century.[115] We can perhaps see her as well in the story of how Bosporion, the harbor of Byzantion, became known as Phosphorion among its inhabitants; according to Stephanos, when Philip II of Macedonia

[112] For names and epithets containing Καρ-: see Detschew, *Thrakischen Sprachreste*, 227-233; Peter A. Dimitrov, *Thracian Language and Greek and Thracian Epigraphy* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2009), 82f., cf. 135. On the Hellenistic artistic influences: see Marina-Corina Nicolae, "The Iconography of the Antique Hero in the Balkan Area," *Marisia* 31 (2011): 159-173 (164).

[113] *IGBulg* I^2 79 (= *CCET* I 33); cf. also Zlatozara Gočeva, "Der Apollonkult in Odessos," in *Studia in Honorem Veselini Beševliev*, ed. Vladimir Georgiev et al. (Sofia: Academia Litterarum Bulgarica, 1978), 288-298 (297f.); Dimitrova, "Thracian Rider," 216.

[114] Tončeva, "Sanctuaire," 357-360 (picture on 358 fig. 6).

[115] For the Seuthopolis Inscription: see *IGBulg* III.2 1731; Karl-Ludwig Elvers, "Der 'Eid der Berenike und ihrer Söhne': Eine Edition von IGBulg. III 2, 1731," *Chiron* 24 (1994): 241-266. On the Phosphorion: see Zofia Halina Archibald, "Thracian Cult—From Practice to Belief," in *Ancient Greeks West and East*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze (Mnemosyne Supplements 196; Leiden: Brill, 1999), 427-468 (440-442, 460f.); cf. Dimitur P. Dimitrov and Maria Čičikova, *The Thracian City of Seuthopolis*, transl. Marguerite P. Alexieva (BAR Supplementary Series 38; Oxford: British Archaeological Reports, 1978), 46f.

besieged Byzantion in 340, Hekate Phosphoros' illuminating powers foiled a nighttime attempt by Philip's tunnellers to capture the city from within, thus earning her the gratitude of the locals.[116] At any rate, the Phosphoros of the Odessos dedication probably represents a manifestation of the same divine archetype that lay behind conceptions of Bendis, Hekate, and Artemis in Thrace.

Tončeva, believing that she had stumbled upon the sanctuary of Heros Karabasmos, and suspecting that it had originally housed three more fragmentary Hellenistic decrees retrieved from its vicinity (one repurposed as the capital on a Byzantine column, and another affixed to a wall of the *praefurnium* in the Roman bath), thought it remarkable that a space set aside for a Thracian deity had served as a repository for Odessos' public documents.[117] But each of these conclusions strikes me as problematic: first, nothing explicitly indicates whom the sanctuary belonged to; second, the Odessitans would have displayed most of their public documents in a place where the populace could easily view them; and third, the three decrees must have stood outside the building prior to its destruction in the first century, since they obviously did not get buried with the inscriptions inside. In fairness to Tončeva, however, her assessment underscored the basic fact that

[116] Steph. Byz. B 130. On Phosphoros at Byzantion: see Russell, *Byzantium*, 181-186; cf. Louiza D. Loukopoulou, *Contribution a l'histoire de la Thrace Propontique durant la periode archaique* (Meletemata 9; Athens: Kentron Hellenikes kai Romaikes Archaiotetos, 1989), 106-109.

[117] Tončeva, "Sanctuaire," 361-364. For the decrees: see *IGBulg* I^2 42 bis (= V 5017), I^2 43 bis (= V 5019), I^2 45 bis. Tončeva later discovered a fourth-century funerary inscription (I^2 101 ter [= V 5042]) in a nearby pit that also contained animal bones and ceramics from the fourth and first half of the third centuries, which suggests that the inscription had come from somewhere else (presumably the burial site southwest of the sanctuary). On the possible circumstances of this inscription's dislocation: see Hristo Preshlenov, "Temenosŭt na Apolon v Odesos – arkhitektura, topografiya, sinkretizŭm na kulta" [The Temenos of Apollo in Odessos – Architecture, Topography, Syncretism of Worship], in *Jubilaeus VII. Society, Kings, Gods: In memoriam professoris Margaritae Tachevae*, ed. Dilyana Boteva-Boyanova et al. (Sofia: St Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2018), 259-289 (277 n135).

worship of Heros Karabasmos took place within an urban environment, and at the time she made her discoveries, she could not have known that the sanctuary possibly existed within the boundaries of a temple *temenos*.

During a rescue excavation in 1963 at the corner of San Stefano Street and Chernorizets Hrabur Street, roughly 100 meters east of the sanctuary, Milko Mirčev unearthed the paltry vestiges of a Doric order temple measuring 9 meters long and 4.9 meters wide; more recent studies have dated the surviving column drums, and thus the structure itself, to the first half of the third century.[118] Mirčev identified the temple as Apollo's, reportedly on the basis of an architectural fragment found in proximity bearing the letters ΑΠΟΛΛ.[119] Though unconfirmed, his identification receives some further circumstantial support from a mid-first-century inscription recovered about 100 meters to the southeast, which contains a resolution honoring Menogenes son of Asklepides, a *strategos* of the Thracian king Sadalas, as well as instructions to set up the text in the temple of Apollo.[120] The location and publication clause of this inscription, together with the concentration of other decrees nearby, could at least suggest that the area immediately surrounding the temple and sanctuary—a *temenos*, presumably—held civic importance for

[118] Hristo Preshlenov, "Urban Spaces in *Odessus* (6th C BC-7th C AD)," *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 6, no. 3 (2002): 13-43 (22, 26); idem, "Temenosŭt na Apolon," 268 n64; Minchev, "Odessos," 243. On the column drums: see further Totko Stoyanov and Daniela Stoyanova, "The Tholos of Odessos," *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 1, no. 3 (1997): 22-33 (30).

[119] See Zlatozara Gočeva, "Organization of Religious Life in Odessos," *Kernos* 9 (1996): 121-127 (123f.); idem, "Culte d'Apollon," 231. Note also an unpublished fragment of a fourth- or third-century dedication to Apollo Delphinios, now kept at the Varna Archaeological Museum: see Alexandre Avram, "Bulletin épigraphique (Pont)," *Revue des Études Grecques* 119, no. 2 (2006): 683-693 (683 no. 275); Chiekova, *Cultes*, 38 n98; cf. J. G. F. Hind, "Greek and Barbarian Peoples on the Shores of the Black Sea," *Archaeological Reports* 30 (1983-1984): 71-97 (74).

[120] *IGBulg* I^2 43. The inscription came to light during the digging of a pipe trench for Varna's sewage system in the area between the beach and port: see Antoine Salač, "Un décret inédit de la ville d'Odessos," *Bulletin de correspondance hellénique* 55 (1931): 43-57 (43).

the Odessitans.[121] The use of a *temenos* for civic purposes does have parallels elsewhere, such as in the *temenos* of Apollo at Didyma (a sanctuary controlled by Odessos' mother city Miletos, incidentally).[122]

How did Heros Karabasmos and Phosphoros come to have a presence in a central part of the city? If the temple really did belong to Apollo, we might answer this question by simply pointing to the ample evidence (albeit from the Roman period) of the Thracian Rider's association with Apollo and then ascribing Phosphoros the role of his twin sister Artemis or even their cousin Hekate.[123] Yet I propose, alternatively or in addition, that the sanctuary could have accommodated the needs of an increasingly "mixed" population who participated in *polis* life but worshipped a "non-traditional" deity in lieu of the chief god Apollo. A flexible arrangement such as this may help explain why the publication clause in a third- or second-century Odessitan decree mentions only "the temple" (τὸ ἱερόν) and why a list of eponymous priests covering the years 44/43 B.C.E. to 2/3 C.E does not specifically name "the god" (τῷ θεῶι)—i.e., "the temple" and "the god" could involve either Apollo or Heros Karasbamos, depending upon the readers' religious backgrounds or

[121] See Preshlenov, "Urban Spaces," 24.

[122] On the *temenos* of Apollo at Miletos, which included (coincidentally?) a smaller sanctuary for Phosphoros: see Joseph Fontenrose, *Didyma: Apollo's Oracle, Cult, and Companions* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 30-44.

[123] For examples of the Thracian Rider's association with Apollo: see Marjorie Mackintosh, *The Divine Rider in the Art of the Western Roman Empire* (BAR International Series 607; Oxford: Hadrian Books, 1995), 53f.; Dimitrova, "Thracian Rider," 216-218. On Apollo's relationship to Hekate: see Gregory Nagy, *Greek Mythology and Poetics* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1990), 76.

preferences.[124] The interchangeability of the Great God of Odessos with the Great God Darzalas/Derzelas in subsequent centuries perhaps reflects an analogous phenomenon.[125]

I conclude with an odd tale about Odessos preserved by the sixth-century C.E. historian Jordanes, author of a history of the Goths called the *Getica*. According to Jordanes, when Philip II once tried to sack the Odessos (then under Gothic rule), "the priests of the Goths, the ones who are called 'pious,' having suddenly thrown open the gates, went out toward him with citharas and shining white robes, chanting in a suppliant tone to their ancestral gods that they be propitious to them and repel the Macedonians (*sacerdotes Gothorum illi qui pii vocabantur subito patefactis portis cum citharis et vestibus candidis obviam egressi patriis diis, ut sibi propitii Macedonas repellerent, voce supplici modulantes*).[126] Perturbed by the demonstration, the Macedonians pulled back from the city, repatriated prisoners of war, and agreed to a treaty before returning to their homeland. Although Jordanes cites "Dio" (either Cassius or Chrysostom) as his source, the information may ultimately derive from a contemporary of the alleged event, the fourth century B.C.E historian Theopompos, a fragment of whose work states that the Getai "conduct negotiations while carrying citharas and playing citharas" (κιθάρας ἔχοντες καὶ κιθαρίζοντες τὰς ἐπικηρυκείας ποιοῦνται).[127] If these accounts have any truth to them,

[124] Pace Zlatozara Gočeva, "Prêtres éponymes d'Odessos et de Dionysopolis," *Klio* 62 (1980): 49-53 (49f.). For the decree: see *IGBulg* I^2 41. For the list of eponymous priests: see ibid. I^2 46, cf. V 5024.

[125] Cf. Robert Parker, *Greek Gods Abroad: Names, Natures, and Transformations* (Sather Classical Lectures; Oakland: University of California Press, 2017), 8.

[126] Jord. *Get.* 10.65, ed. Theodorus Mommsen, *Iordanis Romana et Getica* (Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Auctores Antiquissimi 5.1; Berlin: Weidmann, 1882).

[127] Theopompos *BNJ* 115 F 216 (Stephanos Byzantios B 166); Petre Alexandrescu, "Ataias," *Studii Clasice* 9 (1967): 85-91 (91 n19); John Gardiner-Garden, "Ateas and Theopompus," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 109 (1989): 29-40 (31f.); Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 237; cf. Reinhold Bichler, "Philip II and the Scythians in the Light of Alexander Historiography," transl. Franz Pramhaas, in *The History of the Argeads:*

Philip's foray against Odessos would have happened during his Thracian campaign in 342.[128]

On the matter of historicity, Jordanes' anachronistic references to the Goths pose no major problem insofar that he elsewhere identifies them with the Thracian Getai, who apparently did inhabit the region around Odessos in the Classical era.[129] The detail about the "pious" (*pii*) also somewhat resembles a claim by the second-first century writer Poseidonios that the Moesians (often conflated with the Getai) became known as "god-fearers" (θεοσεβής) and "smoke-walkers" (καπνοβάται) for their religiously-motivated vegetarianism.[130] Finally, I should acknowledge that the sole Thracian personal names attested in pre-Roman Odessos belong to the priest for 42/41 B.C.E., Kotys son of Dernaios.[131] Personal names alone tell us nothing for certain about the individuals who bore them, but in the case of Kotys, one imagines that his ancestors at least had Thracian origins. Given the hereditary nature of the priesthood, could he have descended from a Getic priests who confronted Philip? While a charming possibility to entertain, I would only venture as far as to say that Jordanes' story may resonate with the Hellenistic evidence for Thracian influence upon religion in Odessos, as represented by the dedications to Heros Karabasmos and Phosphoros in the *temenos* of Apollo.

New Perspectives, ed. Sabine Müller et al. (Classica et Orientalia 19; Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2017), 253-268 (258f.).

[128] See Buckler, *Aegean Greece*, 463-466.

[129] For the equation of the Goths with the Getai: see Jord. *Get.* 9.58; cf. Vladimir Iliescu, "Geten oder Skythen? Zu Iord. *Get.* 65," *Eos* 56 (1966): 316-320. On the location of the Getai: see Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 108-111.

[130] Poseidonios *BNJ* 87 F 104 (Strabo 7.3.3); Fanula Papazoglu, *The Central Balkan Tribes in Pre-Roman Times: Triballi, Autariatae, Dardanians, Scordisci and Moesians*, transl. Mary Stansfield-Popović (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1978), 502f.

[131] *IGBulg* I^2 46.5. On these names: see *OnomThrac*, 91-96 s.v. *Cotys* et al., 130 s.v. [Diernais] et al.

Dionysopolis

As mentioned earlier in this chapter, literary evidence testifies to "mixing" at Dionysopolis (modern Balchik), Odessos' neighbor to the north. To quote again Pseudo-Skymnos, whose information here probably derives from the third-second century geographer Demetrios of Kallatis, Dionysopolis, "situated on the borders of the territory of the Krobyzoi and Scythians, has mixed Greek inhabitants" (ἐν μεθορίοις δὲ τῆς Κροβύζων καὶ Σκυθῶν χώρας κειμένη μιγάδας Ἕλληνας οἰκητὰς ἔχει).[132] The presence of a "mixed" population at Dionysopolis hardly seems obvious, however, from the available (though admittedly rather meager) archaeological and epigraphical data.[133] That said, the fairly recent discovery of a Hellenistic temple there dedicated to the Pontic Mother of the Gods (Μήτηρ θεῶν Ποντία)—a manifestation of the so-called "Great Mother" conventionally referred to today by the Phrygian-derived name "Kybele" (Κυβέλη)—opens an alternative avenue for investigating the situation in the *polis*.[134] Indeed, the cult of the Pontic Mother may present a further example of religious activity that transcended cultural barriers in Thrace.

Much of the modern research on Dionysopolis has fixated on the problem of who founded the city and when, with some scholars, such as Nawotka, citing "mixed Greek

[132] Ps.-Skymnos F 2b (*Peripl. Pont. Eux.* 78). On Pseudo-Skymnos' source: see Alexandru Avram, "Untersuchungen zur Geschichte des Territoriums von Kallatis in griechischer Zeit," *Dacia* 35 (1991): 103-137 (107); cf. Konstantin Boshnakov, *Pseudo-Skymnos (Semos von Delos?). Τὰ ἀριστερὰ τοῦ Πόντου. Zeugnisse griechischer Schriftsteller über den westlichen Pontosraum* (Palingenesia 82; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2004), 49-51, 182-184.

[133] For an overview of the evidence: see Margarit Damyanov, "Dionysopolis, Its Territory and Neighbours in the Pre-Roman Times," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, vol. 1, ed. Dimitrios V. Grammenos and Elias K. Petropoulos (BAR International Series 1675; Oxford: Archaeopress, 2007), 1-31 (6-15). For published inscriptions from Dionysopolis: see *IGBulg* I^2 13-34, V 5005-5011.

[134] The Phrygian "Kybele" simply went by the name *Matar*: see Lynn E. Roller, *In Search of God the Mother: The Cult of Anatolian Cybele* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999), 66-69.

inhabitants" as evidence for the diverse backgrounds of only the Greek colonists (of course, this interpretation of "mixing" defies the ancient definitions of the concept, which I discussed near the start of the chapter).[135] Muddling the picture, Pseudo-Skymnos identifies Dionysopolis' former name as Κρουνοί and attributes its change to the recovery of a statue of Dionysos from the sea, whereas the geographers Strabo and Pomponius Mela appear to treat Krounoi as a separate location.[136] While the potential solutions to these conundrums have no direct bearing on my analysis, I should address Irina Shopova's theory on the Thracian origins of Dionysopolis and its well-attested cult of Dionysos.[137] In her opinion, the absence here of an Apollo cult (a distinctive feature of the Milesian colonies in this region, like Odessos), the possibility of a preceding settlement, and the antiquity of Dionysos worship among the Thracians all build to the conclusion that Krounoi-Dionysopolis began as a Thracian city and remained so even after the arrival of Greek colonists.[138]

Shopova perhaps overstates the uniqueness and "Thracianness" of Dionysos' prominence at Dionysopolis. Certainly, Thracians did worship a god or gods whom Greeks in the Classical period already associated with Dionysos, but nothing about his cult at

[135] See e.g. Nawotka, *Western Pontic Cities*, 23.

[136] Ps.-Skymnos F 2b (*Peripl. Pont. Eux.* 78), F 2a (Steph. Byz. Δ 90); Strabo 7.6.1; Mela 2.22. For attempts to locate Krounoi (as a place separate from Dionysopolis): see e.g. Louis Robert, "Les inscriptions grecques de Bulgarie," *Revue de philologie, de littérature et d'histoire anciennes* 33 (1959): 11-236 (196-199); Zlatozara Gocheva, "The Problem of Krounoi – Dionysopolis: One Settlement or Two?" in *New Studies on the Black Sea Littoral*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze (Colloquia Pontica 1; Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1996), 13-16.

[137] For Dionysos at Dionysopolis: see Damyanov, "Dionysopolis," 6-8; Chiekova, *Cultes*, 108-110.

[138] Irina Shopova, "To the Problem Concerning the Origin of Krounoi-Dionysopolis," in *The Thracian World at the Crossroads of Civilizations: Proceedings of the Seventh International Congress of Thracologie, 20-26 May 1996, Constanţa–Mangalia–Tulcea*, vol. 2, ed. Petre Roman (Bucharest: Institutul Român de Tracologie, 1997), 318-323; cf. Avram, "Cités grecques," 298f.

Dionysopolis reveals signs of Thracian influence (e.g., serving as an oracle).[139] The Dionysian mysteries referenced in a number of the city's Hellenistic and Roman inscriptions could merely reflect the mysteries' widespread proliferation and popularity throughout the Greco-Roman world, not just in Thrace.[140] Nor can we safely assume that these mysteries would have always appealed to a non-Greek audience; Herodotus provides a comparative perspective in his account of how Skyles, a Hellenophile Scythian king, sought initiation into the rites of Dionysos Bakcheios at Greek Olbia, thereby angering his people through this perceived act of cultural betrayal.[141] On the other hand, as I explain further below, we do have some evidence of similarities between the ceremonies of Dionysos and the "Great Mother."

The Pontic Mother represents, again, a manifestation of the "Great Mother" better known as Kybele, whom the Greeks had assimilated into their pantheon as early as the seventh or sixth century, and whose cult, we will see, fits comfortably into Thrace's indigenous religious systems.[142] Interestingly, a fragment of the sixth-century poet Hipponax also identifies Artemis with Kybebe (denoting either Kybele or a related Anatolian goddess) and Bendis (καὶ Διὸς κούρη Κυβήβη καὶ Θρεϊκίη Βενδῖς), and such an

---

[139] On the Thracian "Dionysos": see Hdt. 5.7, 7.111.2; Kostadin Rabadjiev, "Religion," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 443-456 (444-446).

[140] Cf. also Marta Oller Guzmán, "What Was 'Thracian' in the Cult of Dionysos in Roman Thrace?" in *Proceedings of the First International Roman and Late Antique Thrace Conference "Cities, Territories and Identities" (Plovdiv, 3rd – 7th October 2016)*, ed. Lyudmil Vagalinski et al. (Bulletin of the National Archaeological Institute 44; Sofia: National Institute of Archaeology with Museum, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 2018), 211-219 (216). For the Dionysian mysteries at Dionysopolis: see *IGBulg* I^2 14, 20, 22 bis; Mirena Slavova, "Mystery Clubs in Bulgarian Lands in Antiquity: Greek Epigraphical Evidence," *Opuscula Atheniensia* 27 (2002): 137-149. On the popularity of Dionysian mysteries: see conveniently Antonía Tripolitis, *Religions of the Hellenistic-Roman Age* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2002), 22-25.

[141] Hdt. 4.78-80.

[142] On the "Great Mother": see Roller, *God the Mother*, 27ff.

equation might allude to Artemis' less pronounced role as a mother goddess too, despite her virginity.[143] But on the whole, evidence for the worship of the "Great Mother" in Thrace comes in the way of statues, statuettes, and reliefs of Kybele rather than specific references to her in literary or epigraphical sources; "Hellenized" depictions typically show her seated upon a throne, wearing a *chiton* with a *himation* draped over a shoulder, holding a *patera/phiale* (a libation vessel) and *tympanon* (a type of tambourine), and attended by one or two lions.[144] Her iconography features regularly, moreover, on Dionysopolis' Hellenistic coinage.[145]

The temple of the Pontic Mother at Dionysopolis, purportedly "the best preserved Hellenistic temple on the Western Pontic coast," dates in its construction to the first half of the third century; the inscriptions and numerous artifacts of Kybele found inside allowed the excavators to identify its presiding deity.[146] According to Nikolay Sharankov, the goddess' epithet, Ποντία, likely originated earlier in Asia Minor, "as suggested by the use of forms in Ionic dialect in connection to the cult, *e.g.* the epithet καθαρή ("pure") instead

[143] Hipponax F 127, ed. M. L. West, *Iambi et Elegi Graeci ante Alexandrum cantati*, vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971); Roller, *God the Mother*, 124. On Artemis as a mother goddess: see also Bodil Hjerrild, "Near Eastern Equivalents to Artemis," in *From Artemis to Diana: The Goddess of Man and Beast*, ed. Tobias Fischer-Hansen and Birte Poulsen (Acta Hyperborea 12; Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, University of Copenhagen, 2009), 41-49 (44).

[144] For the evidence from Thrace: see Patricia A. Johnston, "Cybele and Her Companions on the Northern Littoral of the Black Sea," in *Cybele, Attis and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M. J. Vermaseren*, ed. Eugene M. Lane (Religions in the Graeco-Roman World 131; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996), 101-116 (103-106); Zlatozara Gotcheva, "La Thrace Pontique et la mythologie Grecque," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, 51-84 (72-74); Chiekova, *Cultes*, 127-149.

[145] Yanislav Tachev, *Monetosečeneto na Dionisopolis: IV vek pr. Hr. - III vek sl. Hr* [*The Coinage of Dionysopolis: IV Century BC – III Century AD*] (Sofia: n.p., 2014), 47, 54, 63-65 (English summaries on 317, 321); cf. Dimitar Dragonov, "The Bronze Coinage of Dionysopolis," *Numismatic Circular* 105, no. 10 (1997): 371-377 (371, 374f.), who misidentifies the goddess as Demeter.

[146] Igor Lazarenko et al., "Conclusion," in *Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods*, 71 (for the quote); in the same volume, Daniela Stoyanova, "Chronology and Parallels," 22-28; Elina Mircheva, "Sculpture and Relief," 34-46; Sharankov, "Inscriptions," 47-58.

of καθαρά in a Hellenistic dedication, or νεομηνιασταί with uncontracted -εο- (and not νουμηνιασταί) even in an inscription of the third century AD."[147] Ποντία has a maritime connotation as well, and Sharankov finds a counterpart to the Pontic Mother in a late-Hellenistic dedication to Aphrodite Pontia from Kyzikos in Asia Minor, which gives thanks to her and Poseidon but displays an image of the enthroned Kybele in its accompanying relief.[148] Nevertheless, the Pontic Mother's importance for the Dionysopolitans may have owed more to her function as a protector of the city and not just of seafarers.[149]

Indications of non-Greek participation in the cult of the Pontic Mother—i.e., several votive tablets of the Thracian Rider recovered from her temple, and a conspicuous amount of Thracian personal names among the clergy and worshippers—surface only in the Roman era, yet this does not necessarily mean that Greeks alone comprised the goddess' adherents in earlier times.[150] For comparative evidence, we can look to Seuthopolis, the short-lived Odrysian capital during the early Hellenistic period, where, next to the remains of a house, archaeologists uncovered a fragmentary terracotta figurine of Kybele alongside figurines of other deities. Emil Nankov has performed a detailed study

[147] Sharankov, "Inscriptions," 48.

[148] Ibid., 48f., with reference to J. H. Mordtmann, "Zur Epigraphik von Kyzikos III," *Mittheilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Institutes in Athen* 10 (1885): 200-211 (204-207 no. 30). On Aphrodite Pontia: see further Robert Parker, "The Cult of Aphrodite Pandamos and Pontia on Cos," in Kykeon: *Studies in Honour of H. S. Versnel*, ed. H. F. J. Horstmanshoff et al. (Religions in the Graeco-Roman World 142; Leiden: Brill, 2002), 143-160, esp. 146; Denise Demetriou, *Negotiating Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean: The Archaic and Classical Greek Multiethnic Emporia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 92f.

[149] See Birgitte Bøgh, "Mother of the Gods: Goddess of Power and Protector of Cities," *Numen* 59 (2012): 32-67; cf. Roller, *God the Mother*, 111-115, 140, 207.

[150] For the votive tablets of the Thracian Rider and the Thracian personal names: see Mircheva, "Sculpture and Relief," 46; Sharankov, "Inscriptions," 50 n106, 53, 55, 57 n124; *OnomThrac*, 24 s.v. Βακης, Βακκης, 108 s.v. Dalatralis et al., 271 s.v. [Πιετραλις], Πιαιτραλις, 365 s.v., Θιουθιǁοςǁ, s.v. Τιουθιǁοςǁ, 409 s.v. Ζουκη, s.v. [Ζουκηγεσκος], Ζουκεγεσκος.

of this Kybele figurine, examining it against the backdrop of "domestic cult" exemplified by the *escharai*, decorated clay altar-hearths common throughout Thrace and situated within virtually every residence at Seuthopolis.[151] The modest size of the figurine (around 17-19 cm tall in its original, intact condition), together with the physical context of its discovery, naturally hints at its use in private religious activity instead of "official cult," though Nankov also notes that the goddess' ceremonies had a public element to them and that these may have received royal sanction.[152]

In Nankov's view, "the local perception of Kybele [at Seuthopolis] was rooted in the older beliefs related to the unnamed 'Thracian goddess'" even as her iconography drew from Greek and Anatolian artistic traditions, while Thracian soldiers returning from Alexander's campaigns in Asia could have introduced Kybele herself, albeit "in accordance with their own religious upbringing, thus facilitating the process of syncretism."[153] However, the earliest representations of Kybele in Thrace actually date to the sixth century; these notably include one in a *naiskos* (a small, temple-shaped structure) from Salmydessos, an area controlled and populated by Thracians.[154] The first Kybele *naiskoi*, "Hellenized" in design but still under Phrygian influence, emerged in western Asia

[151] Emil Nankov, "Toward the Thracian Religion in the Early Hellenistic Period: A Terracotta Figurine of Kybele from *Seuthopolis* Reconsidered," *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 11, no. 3 (2007): 46-67. On the *escharai*: see further Archibald, "Thracian Cult," 444-454; cf. Kostadin Rabadjiev, "The Royal Palace (?) in Seuthopolis," *Thracia* 13 (2000): 387-397 (396f.).

[152] Nankov, "Thracian Religion," 61-63.

[153] Ibid., 63.

[154] For the *naiskos*: see M. J. Vermaseren, *Corpus Cultus Cybelae Attidisque (CCCA)*, vol. 6 (Études préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'Empire romain 50/6; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1989), 108 no. 365; Johnston, "Cybele," 103. Hipponax (F 115) and Herodotus (4.93) both attest to Thracian control of Salmydessos in the sixth century; see also above (in the section on Mesambria) for Xenophon's testimony about the Thracian Melinophagoi. Σαλμυδησσός, like Ὀδησσός, probably has a non-Greek derivation: see Duridanov, *Sprache*, 130.

Minor in the same century, so the goddess' iconography spread to Thrace rather quickly, it seems.[155] This suggests that the "process of syncretism" envisioned by Nankov may have already begun in Archaic Thrace, with the caveat that it would have taken longer for ideas to filter inland.[156] Whatever the case, the evidence for Kybele worship in Thracian settings underscores her cross-cultural appeal.

The "Thracian goddess" mentioned by Nankov warrants brief comment. Among the Thracians, in fact, various goddesses (including Bendis) appear to have taken on the "mother" role at different times and places.[157] Strabo offers further insight here, for he observes that the sacred rites of the Thracian Kotyto and Bendis resembled those of Dionysos and Kybele or Kybebe in their musical and performative aspects, leading him to bring up the theory that the Phrygians and their rites originated in Thrace.[158] The strong ancient literary traditions concerning Phrygia's Thracian roots will receive treatment in my chapter on Thracians under the Achaemenid Empire; for the moment, I note that a growing body of research supports the existence of cultural ties between Thrace and Phrygia. Scholars in favor of this notion have emphasized, in particular, the similarity of the rock-cut monuments in both regions and their apparent connection to cults of the "Great Mother."[159] This shared history could very well underlie the Pontic Mother's high stature

[155] Mary Jane Rein, "Phrygian Matar: Emergence of an Iconographic Type," in *Cybele, Attis and Related Cults*, 223-237; Roller, *God the Mother*, 126-133.

[156] Cf. Nankov, "Thracian Religion," 47 n3.

[157] See e.g. Nikola Theodossiev, "ΚΟΤΕΟΥΣ ΗΛΙΟΥ and ΚΟΤΕΟΥΣ ΜΗΤΡΟΣ ΟΡΕΑΣ," *Hermes* 129, no. 2 (2001): 279-283 (281f.); Lynn E. Roller, "The Mother Goddess between Thrace and Phrygia," *Thracia* 15 (2003): 161-167 (162); Petra Janouchová, "The Cult of Bendis in Athens and Thrace," *Graeco-Latina Brunensia* 18 (2013): 95-106 (103).

[158] Strabo 10.3.15f.

[159] See e.g. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, "Between West and East: Anatolian Roots of Local Cultures of the Pontus," in *Ancient Greeks West and East*, 469-496 (472-475); Maya Vassileva, "Further Considerations on the Cult of Kybele," *Anatolian Studies* 51 (2001): 51-63; idem, "Thracian and Phrygian Rock-Cut Tombs:

at Dionysopolis, the only *polis* on western Black Sea coast for which we have explicit textual confirmation of a "mixed" population.

In sum, despite having little archaeological and epigraphical evidence for "mixing" in pre-Roman Dionysopolis, we can seek to understand the prominence and iconography of its cult to the Pontic Mother as the product of a "mixed" environment. Not unlike the case of Odessos, the signs of non-Greek participation in religious life during the Roman period undoubtedly reflect the continuation or culmination of much earlier trends. Dionysos' relationship to all this remains less certain, unfortunately. The alleged resemblance of his rites to those of the "Great Mother" might invite us to imagine that Dionysopolis' "mixed" denizens would have embraced him as well, but we would still have insufficient grounds to accept Shopova's conclusion that Thracians founded the city and its cults independent of outside influence.

Apollonia Pontica

Founded by Milesians in the late-seventh century, Apollonia Pontica (today Sozopol) stands out as not only the oldest *polis* discussed in this chapter but also one of the better documented ancient sites on the western Black Sea coast.[160] Literary sources attest, moreover, to Thracian peoples in the regions around the city during its early history; as we

A Comparative Overview," in *Megalithic Monuments and Cult Practices: Proceedings of the Second International Symposium, Ancient Cultures in South-East Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean, Blagoevgrad, 12-15 October 2016*, ed. Dimitriya Spasova (Blagoevgrad: Neofit Rilski University Press, 2012), 44-57; Birgitte Bogh, "The Phrygian Background of Kybele," *Numen* 54 (2007): 304-339 (310).

[160] Ps.-Skymnos 730-733; Alexandru Avram et al., "The Black Sea Area," in *Inventory*, 924-973 (931 no. 682); Dmitri Nedev and Kristina Panayotova, "Apollonia Pontica (End of the 7th-1st Centuries B.C.)," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, vol. 1, 95-155 (96-100); cf. Isaac, *Greek Settlements*, 242f.

have already seen, Herodotus places the tribes of the Skyrmiadai and Nipsaioi in its hinterland, while a group of Thracians occupied Salmydessos to the south. Recent studies have proposed, on the basis of Greek imports discovered in the territories adjoining Apollonia, that the Greek colonists must have maintained peaceful, economic relations with the native inhabitants, perhaps even negotiating with them for access to land and resources.[161]

Within Apollonia itself, excavations at the necropoleis have turned up possible traces of indigenous influence from the sixth to third centuries in the form of grave goods, specifically "Thracian" fibulae, as well as cremations and certain types of inhumations popular throughout Thrace.[162] Overall, the archaeological data remains too imprecise to draw any firm conclusions about the identities of the deceased, since the same or similar burial practices existed elsewhere in the Greek world, and the presence of the fibulae confirms, at most, cultural contact with Thracians.[163] Such ambiguity in the archaeological

[161] See Jan G. de Boer, "Apollonia Pontica and its *Emporia*, Ports of Trade?" in *Pont Euxin et commerce: la genèse de la 'route de la soie.' Actes du IX^e Symposium de Vani (Colchide, 1999)*, ed. Murielle Faudot et al. (Besançon: Institut des Sciences et Techniques de l'Antiquité, 2002), 125-138; Nedev and Panayotova, "Apollonia Pontica," 100f.; Alexandre Baralis et al., "Apollonia Pontica (Sozopol, Bulgaria): The Results of the Franco-Bulgarian Archaeological Mission," in *The Black Sea in the Light of New Archaeological Data and Theoretical Approaches: Proceedings of the 2nd International Workshop on the Black Sea in Antiquity Held in Thessaloniki, 18-20 September 2015*, ed. Manolis Manoledakis (Oxford: Archaeopress, 2016), 153-179 (165f., 176).

[162] See e.g. Ralph F. Hoddinott, *Bulgaria in Antiquity: An Archaeological Introduction* (London: Ernest Benn, 1975), 34-38; Maria Tzaneva, "Thrako-Griechische Beziehungen in der frühen Periode von der Entwicklung von Apollonia Pontica," in *Thracia Pontica I: Premier symposium international, Sozopol, 9–12 octobre 1979*, ed. Alexandre Fol (Sofia: Centre d'histoire maritime et d'archeologie sous-marin, 1982), 197-200; Miglena Vasileva, "Fibulae from *Apollonia Pontica*," *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 18 (2014): 35-63, esp. 50f.

[163] Lieve Donnellan, "Ethnic Identity in the Western Black Sea Area: The Cases of Histria, Kallatis and Apollonia Pontika (7th – 4/3rd centuries BC)," *Talanta* 36-37 (2004-2005): 189-268 (225-235); Krystina Panayotova, "Burial and Post-Burial Rites in the Necropoleis of the Greek Colonies," in *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, 85-126 (100f.); Margarit Damyanov, "Normative and Non-Normative Burial Practices in the Necropoleis of the Greek Colonies in the Western Black Sea Area," *Ancient West and East* 11 (2012): 35-68 (47-49); Vasileva, "Fibulae," 51.

record could very well reflect "mixing" at Apollonia, nevertheless.[164] Further indications in this direction lie in several names, which scholars have typically identified as Thracian, on five nondescript tombstones recovered (albeit out of context) from the Kalfata necropolis at Apollonia, each dating to the fifth or fourth century. Although frequently cited as potential evidence of a Thracian population, these names have received little in-depth treatment with respect to their actual "Thracianness."

I begin with the most dubious "Thracian" name in this collection, Σαμας, which shows up as a father's name among three clearly Greek names:

> Σιληνὸς
> Σαμαντος.
> Ἀνθεστηρὶς
> Ἐκαταίο γυνή.[165]

Mihailov's commentary mentions attestations of the similar sounding "stem" Σαμος in Thracian, Greek, and "Asian" onomastics, referring to Detschew's *Die Thrakischen Sprachreste* for supposed examples of its Thracian use.[166] These claims explain why subsequent works have consistently listed this inscription as one of the five from Apollonia that allegedly bear Thracian names.[167] However, Detschew provided no justification for the "Thracianness" of Σαμος apart from its occurrence in Thrace, and Dana's more recent *Onomasticon Thracicum* rightly omits both it and Σαμας. It comes as

---

[164] Cf. Donnellan, "Ethnic Identity," 226, with reference to Georges Seure, "Archéologie Thrace. Documents inédits ou peu connus," *Revue Archéologique* 19 (1924): 307-350 (327).

[165] *IGBulg* I^2 426.

[166] Ibid. with Mihailov ad loc.; Detschew, *Thrakischen Sprachreste*, 417 s.v. Σαμος, Sammus, Σαμυλος., cf. 417-420 s.v. Σάμος Θρηϊκίη et al., s.v. Samus.

[167] For references to this inscription and its "Thracian" name: see e.g. Isaac, *Greek Settlements*, 246; Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, "Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area," in *Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area*, 9-68 (47); Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 148; Margarit Damyanov, "The Greek Colonists," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 295-307 (303); cf. idem, "First Encounters," 257 n128 (citing the inscription and name while also acknowledging their omission in *OnomThrac*).

no surprise that scholars have marshalled even the slenderest epigraphic and onomastic evidence for the early urban presence of Thracians, given how thoroughly "Hellenized" the western Black Sea *poleis* might seem on the surface, but the case of Σαμας underscores the dangers of drawing upon older and often outdated linguistic studies, which tend toward overzealousness in labeling names and words "Thracian"—to say nothing of the additional problem of attempting to associate an individual's personal name with his or her ethnic or cultural self-identity.[168]

Our next "Thracian" name, Δισκους, again comes in the form of a father's name:

Ἀπολλωνὶς
Δισκοτος.[169]

Mihailov saw in Δισκους the well-attested "Thracian" name Διοσκους, with a single omicron having dropped out somehow.[170] Yet the "Thracianness" of Διοσκους remains uncertain. As Dana notes in the *Onomasticon Thracicum*, despite the popularity of Διοσκους among indigenous communities (especially in Macedonia), the name itself may reflect a hypocorism of the Greek Διοσκουρίδης; on the other hand, various Thracian names do feature the prefixes διο-, διοσκ-, διεσκ-, and διασκ-, so Διοσκους could instead illustrate an instance of "collision entre une famille onomastique thrace et l'onomastique grecque."[171] If the latter, and assuming that Διοσκους does lie behind Δισκους, Apollonis'

[168] Many of the flaws in the literature on the Thracian language ultimately stem from political and nationalistic considerations: see Panayotou, "Greek and Thracian," 738.

[169] *IGBulg* I^2 438.

[170] Ibid. with Mihailov ad loc.; cf. the alternative genitive form Διοσκουνος in *IGBulg* IV 2286; Dimitrov, *Thracian Language*, 65 s.v. Δισκους.

[171] *OnomThrac*, 139 s.v. Διοσκους et al. (though the list does not include Δισκους from Apollonia), cf. 126 s.v. dia-, δια-, 131 s.v. diesc-, διεσκ-, 138 s.v. dio-, διο-, 139 s.v. diosc-, διοσκ-; see also Miltiades B. Hatzopoulos, "Bulletin épigraphique (Macédoine)," *Revue des Études Grecques* 102, no. 487/489 (1989): 428-436 (433).

tombstone would testify at least to the cultural "mixing" that produced a hybrid Thracian-Greek name. Such "mixing" would not necessarily have taken place within Apollonia, however, since Apollonis or Di(o)skous could have immigrated to the *polis*. The only safe conclusions that we can draw about Apollonis hardly seem profound in the grand scheme of things: an individual buried in Apollonia had a father who possessed a possibly Thracian-influenced name.

The name Ἀψίνθιος, while also problematic in terms of its "Thracianness," proves the most unique and curious as well:

Θεμισταγό- ↓
Ἀψινθίο. -ρη [172]

The stonecutter ran out of room on the first line for the final two letters of Θεμισταγόρη, a Greek feminine name, forcing him to relegate them to the end of the second line (interestingly, the only other attestation of this name in Thrace appears on a fragmentary stele, possibly dating to the same period, found not far from the Kalfata necropolis).[173] Ἀψινθίο, the genitive of Ἀψίνθιος and here the father's name, might invoke the Thracian tribe of the Apsinthioi (Ἀψίνθιοι), whom Herodotus situates north of the Thracian Chersonesos.[174] The question of the name's "Thracianness" centers on whether Ἀψίνθιος derives from the Thracian ethnonym Ἀψίνθιοι or the Greek ἄψινθος or ἀψίνθιον, "wormwood," though they might all, in fact, share a common linguistic root through the

[172] *IGBulg* I^2 426.

[173] For the name and stele: see Martin Giuzelev, "Ancient Funerary Monuments at Sozopol Archaeological Museum," *Izvestiya na Narodniya muzei – Burgas* [*Bulletin of the National Museum – Burgas*] 4 (2002): 119-129 (124 no. 19); Mirena Slavova, *Phonology of the Greek Inscriptions in Bulgaria* (Palingenesia 83; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2004), 35; *LGPN* IV, 162 s.v. Θεμισταγόρη.

[174] See Hdt. 6.34.1, 9.119; Robert, "Inscriptions grecques de Bulgarie," 230 n1; Slavova, *Phonology*, 56; *LGPN* IV, 63 s.v. Ἀψίνθιος; *OnomThrac*, 8 s.v. ?Ἀψίνθιος.

Proto-Indo-European **ap*-, "water."[175] Toponymy may lend some support to the first option; indeed, Stephanos describes the former name of the *polis* Ainos/Poltymbria as Ἄψυνθος—a reference, it seems, to the Apsinthioi, the original inhabitants of the region—and Dionysios Periegetes speaks of the "banks of the Thracian Apsinthos" (Θρήικος… ᾐόσιν Ἀψίνθοιο), evidently a river.[176]

Since Ἀψίνθιος occurs nowhere else epigraphically, geographical considerations alone increase the likelihood that Ἀψινθίο on Themistagore's tombstone denotes or belongs to a member of the Apsinthioi. That these Thracians had a particularly violent reputation raises tantalizing implications. According to Herodotus, their victory over the Dolonkoi, a neighboring group of Thracians on the Chersonesos, had led the Dolonkoi to seek out the leadership of the Athenian Miltiades the Elder, who proceeded to erect a wall across the entire isthmus of the peninsula in an effort to ward off the Apsinthioi.[177] The historian later relates how the Apsinthioi sacrificed a captive Persian named Oiobazos to their god Pleistoros before slaughtering his companions in an unspecified manner.[178] Thus, even if Ἀψινθίο has nothing to do with the Apinsthioi, we can still imagine that a contemporary

[175] Mihailov (*IGBulg* I^2 426 ad loc.) believes that Ἀψίνθιος "*optime Graecum esse potest*"; cf. Dimitrov, *Thracian Language,* 43 s.v. Ἀψίνθιος, 122 n11. For linguistic analyses: see Detschew, *Thrakischen Sprachreste,* 39f. s.v. Ἀψίνθιοι, Ἀψύνθιοι; Albert Carnoy, "Noms grecs de plantes d'origine pré-hellénique," *L'antiquité classique* 27, no. 2 (1958): 305-327 (325); Duridanov, *Sprache,* 21f. s.v. Apsinthos, Apsynthos, 74 s.v. apsa, 141.

[176] On Apsynthos: see Steph. Byz. A 135; Tiverios, "Greek Colonisation," 119; cf. also Hekataios *BNJ* 1 F 163 (Steph. Byz. X 40). For the river: see Dionys. Per. 575, ed. Müllerus, *Geographi Graeci Minores,* vol. 2. Note that the component *-nt(h)-* also occurs frequently among toponyms in Thrace, though its presence does not necessarily indicate "Thracianness": cf. Peter G. van Soesbergen, "Thracian Personal, Ethnic and Topographic Names in Linear A and B," *Kadmos* 18 (1979): 26-39 (33-36).

[177] Hdt. 6.34-37. No identifiable remains of Miltiades' wall have survived, but it evidently received renovations under Perikles around the mid-fifth century (Plut. *Per.* 19.1) and the Spartan Deryklidas in 398 (Xen. *Hell.* 3.2.8-10): see also Brian Croke, "The Date of the 'Anastasian Long Wall' in Thrace," *Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies* 20 (1982): 59-78, esp. 61-63; Isaac, *Greek Settlements,* 167-170.

[178] Hdt. 9.119.1.

reader of the epitaph would have thought of the infamous Thracian tribe, regardless. Somewhat ironically, the broader Thracian context makes Themistagore's cultural background ambiguous; in a different setting, we might simply view Ἀψίνθιος as an unusual Greek anthroponym.

This brings us at last to Βασστακιλης and Παιβινη, the only definitely Thracian names in this collection of inscriptions.[179] The former, as a patronym modifying the name Δισκορίδη (a misspelling of Διοσκουρίδης?), presents interpretive challenges similar to what we already encountered with Apollonis son of Di(o)skous.[180] Παιβινη, conversely, precedes two Greek names, but all three of them have the nominative case, when we would expect to find at least a genitive patronym:

> Παιβινη.
> Αὔγη.
> Ἑρμαῖος.[181]

The nature of the relationship between these individuals remains impossible to determine, and the lack of a precise archaeological context prevents us from knowing whether the grave that had once accompanied the tombstone ever contained three burials, although the absence of any father's name likely indicates that the deceased did not possess citizenship. Comparative examples from Classical Attica feature multiple names belonging to members of a single family, potentially both living and deceased and across multiple

[179] On the names: see *OnomThrac*, 26f. s.v. Βαστακιλας et al., 267 s.v. Παιβινη, cf. 266 s.v. Paibes et al., s.v. Παιβης, [---]παιβης. For another occurrence of Παιβινη (not catalogued in *OnomThrac* or *OnomThracSuppl*), apparently belonging to a daughter of the Odrysian king Seuthes III: see Metodi Manov, "The Hellenistic Tomb with Greek Inscription from Smyadovo, Bulgaria – Reconsidered," *Journal of Ancient History and Archaeology* 6, no. 3 (2019): 99-118 (105, with references).

[180] *IGBulg* I^2 440; cf. *LGPN* IV, 109 s.v. Δισκορίδη.

[181] *IGBulg* I^2 430.

generations, but the Attic funerary stelae also generally include reliefs that depict some type of family scene.[182] If this far plainer tombstone from Apollonia follows the same conventions, the names' genders—two feminine (Παιβινη and Αὔγη) and one masculine (Ἑρμαῖος)—allow us to picture various combinations of relationships, such as a mother and her two children or a child and her parents. In some situations, we conceivably have a "mixed" parent who either possessed a Thracian name themself or bestowed one upon their daughter. An alternative scenario here, a communal burial of persons unrelated by blood, seems quite doubtful, for communal burials elsewhere in the Greek world almost always involved men killed in battle.[183]

Whatever the situation, the appearance of Thracian and Greek names side-by-side in the broader context of a public cemetery reinforces the idea that the archaeological signs of indigenous influence in Apollonia probably reflect a "mixed" environment, as opposed to a state of mere "coexistence" between culturally discrete populations.[184] That Themistagore, a woman with a Greek name and a resident of a Greek *polis*, might have simultaneously self-identified as a descendant or member of the Thracian Apsinthioi could illustrate this phenomenon as well. Perhaps more significantly, however, the earliness of these tombstones strengthens the possibility that the process of "mixing" had also already

[182] On Attic grave stelae that bear multiple names: see Johannes Bergemann, *Demos und Thanatos: Untersuchungen zum Wertsystem der Polis im Spiegel der attischen Grabreliefs des 4. Jahrhunderts v. Chr. und zur Funktion der gleichzeitigen Grabbauten* (Munich: Biering & Brinkmann, 1997), 25ff.; Ruth E. Leader, "In Death Not Divided: Gender, Family, and State on Classical Athenian Grave Stelae," *American Journal of Archaeology* 101, no. 4 (1997): 683-699, esp. 697f.

[183] On communal burials: see Donna C. Kurtz and John Boardman, *Greek Burial Customs* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1971), 174f., 247-259.

[184] For the argument that the archaeological and onomastic evidence paints a picture of "coexistence of natives and colonists" at Apollonia: cf. Stratis Papadopoulos, "The 'Thracian' Pottery of South-East Europe: A Contribution to the Discussion on the Handmade Pottery Traditions of the Historical Period," *Annual of the British School at Athens* 96 (2001): 157-194 (184).

begun during the Classical era in the other western Black Sea *poleis*, for which, due to the vicissitudes of preservation and discovery, our surviving evidence comes primarily from later periods.

Conclusion

The five *poleis* discussed in this chapter reveal various ways in which "mixing" occurred in Thrace. Naturally enough, religion played a major role in facilitating acculturation, with the cults of Apollo and Hekate in particular becoming synthesized with those of their Thracian counterparts, while the Pontic Mother of the Gods may represent an inverse case of a native deity whom Greeks assimilated into their own conception of Kybele. But apart from religion, we also see "mixing" in the creation of a Thracian-oriented foundation legend at Mesambria, the interactions between the Greek and indigenous languages at Zone, and the multiculturalism of the onomastic record at Apollonia. The examples here seem to bolster Archibald's thesis about the absence of a real "cultural divide" on the ground.[185] As I proposed at the start of this chapter, the difficulty of distinguishing the Thracian element from the Greek in these *poleis* ultimately embodies the very nature of "mixing."

The case studies on the "mixed" *poleis* provide, moreover, points of comparison and contrast for when we examine the experiences of Thracians outside of Thrace. In the subsequent chapters, I will focus specifically on Thracians communities in Attica, the Achaemenid Empire, and the Hellenistic East, all of which arose, to some extent, from the

[185] Archibald, *Ancient Economies*, 127.

involuntary displacement of Thracians from their homelands. These Thracians, unlike the residents of the "mixed" *poleis*, frequently found themselves subordinate to larger, dominant cultures and power structures, situations which made cultural differences far more noticeable and meaningful to both ends of the power relationship.

Chapter 3

Thracians in Attica

Introduction

This chapter investigates the experiences of Thracians in Attica from the sixth century B.C.E. down to the first, focusing in particular on Thracian slaves and freedpersons. Although a lack of reliable demographic data makes it impossible to determine just how many of them lived in Attica at any given time, they must have constituted a major subset of the overall population; indeed, Thracians count among the most frequently attested foreigners in both the literary and epigraphic records, and they almost certainly comprised a significant proportion of the Athenians' tens if not hundreds of thousands of slaves, who may have regularly outnumbered free citizens.[1] More importantly, as we will see, Thracians contributed to the fabric of Athenian political, social, economic, and religious life despite (or perhaps as a result of) their marginalization, performing much of the thankless, menial work that helped Athens thrive and survive while also introducing the worship of their goddess Bendis into public and official spheres. Within this environment, a proverbial "melting pot" where Thracians of diverse origins

[1] For non-exhaustive catalogues of attested Thracians in Attica: see Michael J. Osborne and Sean G. Bryne, *The Foreign Residents of Athens: An Annex to the* Lexicon of Greek Personal Names: Attica, (Studia Hellenistica 33; Leuven: Peeters, 1996), 106-110 nos. 2487-2595. On the size of the Athenian slave population, a recent estimate suggests "a range from 60,000 to 120,000 (25 percent to 45 percent of the total population) in the fourth century with higher numbers in the fifth century": see Peter Hunt, "Ancient Greece as a 'Slave Society,'" in *What is a Slave Society? The Practice of Slavery in Global Perspective*, ed. Noel Lenski and Catherine M. Cameron (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), 61-85 (69); cf. also e.g. Hans van Wees, "Demetrius and Draco: Athens' Property Classes and Population In and Before 317 BC," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 131 (2011): 95-114; G. J. Oliver, *War, Food, and Politics in Early Hellenistic Athens* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 76-87; Ben Akrigg, *Population and Economy in Classical Athens* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019), 89ff.

intermingled and created a new community, we might further discern signs of an emerging collective identity that transcended the tribal divisions of their homelands.

Scholars have already written much about Athenian social history and slavery in the ancient world, and Matthew Sears' *Athens, Thrace, and the Shaping of Athenian Leadership* (2013) also discusses the extensive connections between Athenian elite society and Thrace, which stretched back to the Athenian colonization of the Thracian Chersonesos around the mid-sixth century. Yet the Thracians who resided in Attica have, for the most part, figured only tangentially within the literature, with the notable, if still problematic, exception of Sara M. Wijma's recent *Embracing the Immigrant: The Participation of Metics in Athenian Polis Religion (5th–4th BC)* (2014).[2] In a chapter titled "Embracing Bendis," as part of an attempt to document the religious activities and social status of Thracians in Attica, Wijma contends that official regulation of the cult of Bendis facilitated the "thorough integration" of its worshippers into the wider Athenian community. These worshippers, she maintains, belonged to a "large middle group" of Thracian metics, (free resident foreigners) situated socially between the mass of slaves and a handful of elites, yet she admits to the dearth of clear evidence for the existence of such a group.[3] While Wijma, to her credit, treats the Thracians of Attica as an independent object of historical inquiry, her approach regrettably minimizes the possible role of the Thracians for whom we *do* have

[2] For tangential discussions of the Thracian population in Attica: see e.g. Nicholas F. Jones, *The Associations of Classical Athens: The Response to Democracy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 256-262; David M. Lewis, *Greek Slave Systems in their Eastern Mediterranean Context,* c.*800–146 BC* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 250, 284f.

[3] Sara M. Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant: The Participation of Metics in Athenian Polis Religion (5th–4th BC)* (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2014), 126-155.

evidence—the majority of them seemingly slaves—in bringing the cult to Attica and raising it to prominence, which I address later in this chapter.

The evidence in question consists primarily of inscriptions that mention individuals called Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα, the masculine and feminine forms, respectively, of "Thracian." Θρᾶιττα occurs as a stock slave name in several comedies of Aristophanes, which corresponds with Strabo's claim that the Athenians named slaves after their *ethne,* though they could just as often have non-ethnic names (including common Greek names borne by citizens), leaving many potential slaves undetectable in our epigraphic sources.[4] In numerous grave epitaphs, nonetheless, we encounter non-ethnic names together with ethnic identifiers that designate the bearers as Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα (such as a fourth-century funerary stele that reads Ἀγάθων Θρᾶιξ).[5] Another category of slave names, albeit one far less useful for singling out Thracians, draws upon stereotyped physical characteristics; the names Πύρρος and Πυρρίας, for example, seem to refer to red hair, a trait that Greeks associated with "northern" peoples in general.[6] In addition to all these, we have a small

[4] Ar. *Ach.* 273, *Vesp.* 828, *Pax* 1138, *Thesm.* 279ff.; Strabo 7.3.12. On slave names in general: see recently Kostas Vlassopoulos, "Athenian Slave Names and Athenian Social History," *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 175 (2010): 113-144; idem, "Plotting Strategies, Networks, and Communities in Classical Athens: The Evidence of Slave Names," in *Communities and Networks in the Ancient Greek World*, ed. Claire Taylor and Kostas Vlassopoulos (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), 101-127; Rob Tordoff, "Introduction: Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comedy," in *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, ed. Ben Akrigg and Rob Tordoff (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 1-62 (24-27).

[5] *IG* II^2 8897; see also ibid. 8896, 8898, 8899, 8901, 8902, 8902a, 8903, 8904, 8905, 8906, 8907, 8909, 8910, 8912, 8913, 8914, 8916, 8917, 8919, 8920, 8921, 8922, 8923, 8924, 8925, 8926, 8927, 8928; *IG* I^3 422 (lines 195-197); *Agora* XVII 506 and 508, ed. Donald W. Bradeen, *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*, vol. 17 [The Funerary Monuments] (Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 1974). The identifier in *IG* II^2 8908 reads Θρ<ᾶιττ>α, but it could alternatively refer to the deme of Thria: see Osborne and Bryne, *Foreign Residents*, 106 no. 2496.

[6] Vlassopoulos, "Athenian Slave Names," 123; Kelly L. Wrenhaven, *Reconstructing the Slave: The Image of the Slave in Ancient Greece* (London: Bloomsbury, 2012), 35; Peter Hunt, *Ancient Greek and Roman Slavery* (Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2018), 31.

number of well-known Thracian names (like Σεύθης) and names evidently derived from Thracian ethnonyms (as in the case of Τριβαλός, after the tribe of the Triballians).[7]

Some scholars, to be sure, have expressed serious doubts about whether ethnic names like Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα can reliably tell us anything about slaves' backgrounds. To quote David Braund and Gocha R. Tsetskhladze:

> Origin could become confused, as well as forgotten or falsified, through kidnapping or repeated sale. We can only guess at the confusion which could arise from linguistic limitations of even adult slaves with some firm idea of their homeland, let alone small children. At the same time, geographical precision can hardly be expected even of scholar-geographers of antiquity, let alone traders—particularly where their financial interests might be at stake.[8]

Regarding the last point, Braund and Tsetskhladze cite the testimony of Varro, a Roman writer of the late Republic and early Empire, who states that buyers would pay higher prices for slaves from "better" *nationes*.[9] If so, this may have incentivized slave-dealers to lie about the origins of their slaves. Yet as David Lewis notes, our available data from Classical Attica suggest that origins alone had little impact on the commercial value of slaves, since an "eastern" slave cost about the same on average as one of his or her "northern" counterparts (179½ drachmas versus 173), while comparative evidence in the form of manumission inscriptions from Hellenistic Delphi show a fairly consistent

---

[7] For Σεύθης: see e.g. *IG* II/III^3 1328. For Τριβαλός: see e.g. *IG* I^3 1032 (line 115). On the name Τριβαλός: see Louis Robert, "De Delphes à l'Oxus, inscriptions grecques nouvelles de la Bactriane," *Comptes rendus des séances de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 112-113 (1968): 416-457 (419f.); *OnomThrac*, 380 s.v. ?Τριβαλός, Τριβαλλός, with commentary ad loc.

[8] D. C. Braund and G. R. Tsetskhladze, "The Export of Slaves from Colchis," *Classical Quarterly* 39 (1989): 114-125 (120f.); see also Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, "Pontic Slaves in Athens: Orthodoxy and Reality," in *Antike Lebenswelten: Konstanz–Wandel–Wirkungsmacht. Festschrift für Ingomar Weiler zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. Peter Mauritsch et al. (Philippika 25; Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2008), 309-319; P. M. Fraser, *Greek Ethnic Terminology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 103-118 (103-111); Wrenhaven, *Reconstructing the Slave*, 35.

[9] Braund and Tsetskhladze, "Export of Slaves," 119; Varro *Ling.* 9.93 (*in hominibus emendis, si natione alter est melior, emimus pluris*).

correlation between ethnic names and how their bearers appear to have identified themselves ethnically, as seen in such pairings as Δαρδάνα τὸ γένος Δαρδάναν, "Dardana, a Dardanian by *genos*," and Κύπριος τὸ γένος Κύπριον, "Kyprios, a Kyprian by *genos*."[10] Lewis does reject the possibility of conclusively ascertaining ethnicity on the basis of names and instead views samples of slave names as indicators of broader ethnic trends, but for the purposes of this study, I would submit that a person's actual origins perhaps matters less than their affiliation (whether adopted or imposed) with a particular ethnic community; thus, for a child sold or born into slavery, who had little if any memories of their homeland, having the name Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα may have still marked them as a member of the Thracian community in Attica and therefore a potential participant in the shared cultural and religious practices of that community.[11] I will elaborate further on this idea when we examine the cult of Bendis.

Before we delve deeper, the purpose and implications of assigning slaves the names Θρᾶιξ and Θρᾶιττα warrant some comment. As I previously touched on, the native inhabitants of Thrace probably identified first and foremost with their tribes, and while we can certainly speculate (on the oppositional model of identity formation) that a sense of collective Thracianness might have arisen in response to contacts with the Mediterranean

[10] David Lewis, "Near Eastern Slaves in Classical Attica and the Slave Trade with the Persian Territories," *Classical Quarterly* 61 (2011), 91-113 (93-98), with reference to W. Kendrick Pritchett, "The Attic Stelai: Part II," *Hesperia* 25, no. 3 (1956): 178-328 (278 on slave prices); see also David Lewis, "Notes on Slave Names, Ethnicity, and Identity in Classical and Hellenistic Greece," in *Tell Me Who You Are: Labelling Status in the Graeco-Roman World*, ed. Maria Nowak et al. (Studia Źródłoznawcze 16; Warsaw: Sub Lupa Academic, 2017), 183-213 (188 n12, 191-196). For Dardana: see *SGDI* II 2194 (line 11), ed. Hermann Collitz, *Sammlung der griechischen Dialekt-Inschriften*, vol. 2 (Göttingen: Verlag von Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1899). For Kyprios: see ibid. 1749 (line 2).

[11] See also Peter Hunt, "Trojan Slaves in Classical Athens: Ethnic Identity among Athenian Slaves," in *Communities and Networks*, 128-154.

and Near Eastern worlds, the vast majority of these natives, I suspect, would have felt no need to call themselves Thracians except in interactions with outsiders. In this respect, the habit of naming or renaming individuals as Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα demonstrates a degree of ethnocentric indifference on the part of Greeks towards the cultural diversity among Thracians.[12] Beyond reflections of ethnocentrism, however, slave names further served to depersonalize, dehumanize, and denigrate their bearers by reducing them to a generic label for not only an entire people but also, from the perspective of slave-traders and buyers, a type of commodity.[13] It comes as no surprise that many ex-slaves seem to have changed their names following manumission.[14] We should always remember that names like Θρᾶιξ and Θρᾶιττα fundamentally represented instruments of oppression.

In the next section, I briefly consider the types of experiences that surrounded the arrival and stay of Thracian slaves in Attica and whether significant numbers of them went on to join the metic population or escape bondage. Since several studies already offer composite pictures of the general "slave experience" in Greco-Roman antiquity, my coverage here focuses instead on the evidence and issues that directly pertain to Thracians.[15] I then turn my attention to contextualizing the individual and groups of Thracians attested in literary and epigraphic sources, who include skilled laborers, military

[12] Bruce Robertson, "The Slave-Names of *IG* i3 1032 and the Ideology of Slavery at Athens," in *Epigraphy and the Greek Historian*, ed. Craig Cooper (Phoenix Supplementary 47; Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), 79-117 (85-87); Hunt, "Trojan Slaves," 131f.

[13] See David Wiles, "Greek Theatre and the Legitimation of Slavery," in *Slavery and Other Forms of Unfree Labour*, ed. Léonie J. Archer (London: Routledge, 1988), 53-67 (60); Hunt, *Greek and Roman Slavery*, 179f.

[14] See Vlassopoulos, "Plotting Strategies," 116-119.

[15] On the "slave experience" in ancient Greece: see now Sara Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greece* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021).

personnel, and prostitutes. Finally, the last part of this chapter explores the origins of the cult of Bendis in Attica and its role in the religious, social, and cultural life of the local Thracian community. Participants in this cult, as I attempt to demonstrate, came to develop and take pride in a common Thracian identity.

The Thracian Experience of Slavery

Thrace had a reputation throughout much of antiquity as a major hub of slave trading.[16] Already in the fifth century, Herodotus claims that the Thracians customarily sold children for export, and he recounts, moreover, the tale of Rhodopis, a Thracian slave-prostitute acquired by a Samian and then brought by another Samian to Egypt, where Charaxos of Mytilene, the brother of the poetess Sappho, eventually purchased her freedom (this makes Rhodopis "the first sexually trafficked female in the Greek historical record," observes Madeleine M. Henry).[17] According to Polybius, writing about three hundred years later, the Black Sea region in general yielded livestock and slaves in the both the highest quality and greatest quantity.[18] The strength of the slave trade may have owed in no small measure to the scarcity of natural salt deposits in Thrace; a fragment of a fourth-century comedy by Menander speaks of a "well-born Thracian… bought for salt" (Θρᾷξ εὐγενὴς...

[16] On the evidence for slave trading in the Black Sea region: see now Alexandru Avram, "Some Thoughts about the Black Sea and the Slave Trade before the Roman Domination (6th–1st Centuries BC)," in *The Black Sea in Antiquity: Regional and Interregional Economic Exchanges*, ed. Vincent Gabrielsen and John Lund (Black Sea Studies 6; Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2007), 239-251; cf. M. I. Finley, "The Black Sea and Danubian Regions and the Slave Trade in Antiquity," *Klio* 40 (1962): 51-59.

[17] Hdt. 5.6.1, 2.134-135; Madeleine M. Henry, "The Traffic in Women: From Homer to Hipponax, from War to Commerce," in *Greek Prostitutes in the Ancient Mediterranean, 800 BCE–200 CE*, ed. Allison Glazebrook and Madeleine M. Henry (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011), 14-33 (28).

[18] Plb. 4.38.4.

πρὸς ἅλας ἠγορασμένος), and in the *Onomasticon* of Julius Pollux, a grammarian of the second century C.E., the explanation for the word ἀλώνητοι, "salt-bought," states that Thracians of the interior exchanged slaves for salt.[19]

Xenophon's firsthand account of a raid against a group of Thynian villages in 399 B.C.E., carried out under the direction of the Odrysian dynast Seuthes II, illustrates just one of many potential avenues by which a Thracian could have entered bondage. In this case, an initial foray by Seuthes' swift-moving cavalry and peltasts seems to have caught the residents wholly off guard, and Xenophon reports the netting of a thousand captives, twice that number in cattle, and a myriad of smaller animals, apparently with minimal bloodshed. Afterwards, Seuthes ordered the villages razed and tasked a subordinate with selling the "booty" at Perinthos, a port city on the Propontis.[20] Although Xenophon says nothing about the methods used to transport the captives, we might imagine seeing columns of them shacked together by their necks while forcibly led forth to their destination (a depiction of something similar features on a first-century C.E. tombstone from Amphipolis in Thrace, which memorializes a certain Aulos Kapreilios Timotheos, a self-described freedman and slave trader).[21] At Perinthos, slave-traders would have presumably secured

[19] Men. fr. 891, ed. R. Kassel and C. Austin, *Poetae Comici Graeci*, vol. 6.2 (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1998); Poll. *Onom.* 7.14 (ἀλώνητοι δ' ἐκαλοῦντο οἱ μηδενὸς ἄξιοι τῶν οἰκετῶν, ὅτι τῶν Θρᾳκῶν οἱ μεσόγειοι ἁλῶν ἀντικατηλλάττοντο τοὺς), ed. Ericus Behte, *Pollucis Onomasticon*, 3 vols. (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1900–1937). On the salt trade: see Marius Alexianu, "Lexicographers, Paroemiographers and Slaves-for-Salt Barter in Ancient Thrace," *Phoenix* 65, no. 3/4 (2011): 389-394; Lewis, *Greek Slave Systems*, 285.

[20] Xen. *Anab.* 7.3.35-7.4.2; Jan P. Stronk, *The Ten Thousand in Thrace: An Archaeological and Historical Commentary on Xenophon's Anabasis, Books VI.Iii-vi-VII* (Amsterdam Classical Monographs 2; Amsterdam: J. C. Gieben, 1995), 219-222.

[21] See M. I. Finley, *Aspects of Antiquity: Discoveries and Controversies* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1968), 162-176; Hervé Duchêne, "Sur la Stèle d'Aulus Caprilius Timotheos, Sômatemporos," *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 110-111 (1986): 513-530; Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery*, 71-73.

the captives healthy enough to re-sell at other ports around the Mediterranean. Ancient sources reveal exceedingly little, unfortunately, about conditions aboard the ships that ferried human chattels. For all we know, their ships may have stopped at multiple locations along the way, prolonging the time that it took to travel the few days' sailing distance between Thrace and Attica and thus increasing the risk for death or physical deterioration.[22]

Those who survived the journey to the Peiraieus would subsequently go up for sale in the agora and specifically (at least from the Hellenistic period onwards) in a space called the κύκλοι, "rings" or "circles," where merchants also peddled domestic implements and furniture.[23] Any families that had managed to stay together until this juncture would likely split up as transactions between sellers and buyers took place. To be sure, in a list of property confiscated from the herm-mutilators of 415 B.C.E. and then auctioned off to the Athenian public, we do find three Thracians (two females and a male) collectively valued at 361 drachmas—perhaps a mother with her daughter and son.[24] But they represent outliers; another list of confiscated and auctioned property records individual prices for each of the five Thracians here (three females and two males), ranging from 115 drachmas (for one of the males) to 220 (for one of the females), and a third list has separate entries

[22] Cf. David M. Lewis, "The Market for Slaves in the Fifth- and Fourth-Century Aegean: Achaemenid Anatolia as a Case Study," in *The Ancient Greek Economies: Markets, Households and City-States*, ed. Edward M. Harris et al. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), 316-336 (322f.).

[23] On the κύκλοι: see esp. Poll. *Onom.* 7.11, 10.18; Hsch. κ 4478, ed. Kurt Latte and Ian. C. Cunningham, *Hesychii Alexandrini Lexicon*, vol. 2a (Sammlung griechischer und lateinischer Grammatiker 11/2a; Berlin: De Gruyter, 2020); Harp. K 91, ed. John J. Keaney, *Harpocration:* Lexeis *of the Ten Orators* (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1991); R. E. Wycherley, "The Market of Athens: Topography and Monuments," *Greece & Rome* 3 (1956): 2-23 (9f.); but see also W. Geoffrey Arnott, *Alexis: The Fragments: A Commentary* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 284 ("it may be safer to confine the market meaning of κύκλοι to slave rings").

[24] *IG* I^3 422 (lines 195-197); Winfried Schmitz, "Der Verkauf einer Sklavenfamilie," *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 179 (2011): 54-56.

for the two Thracians (both males) itemized in its fragments.[25] Nor can we discern any family units among the non-Thracian slaves in these lists. By and large, slave-dealers and -owners appear to have had no qualms about breaking up families.[26]

Persistent Greek stereotypes about the Thracians' warlike nature may have attracted buyers seeking the toughest slaves for physically demanding labor.[27] As it happens, a Thracian waiter portrayed in Menander's *Aspis* alludes to this very notion, albeit in insinuating that Thracian slaves also had a reputation for disobedience. After berating a Phrygian slave who had not taken advantage of an opportunity to abscond with his master's possessions, the waiter boasts of his own people's masculinity and cites the multitudes of his fellow Thracians toiling away in the grain mills (i.e., places for punishing misbehaved slaves): "Nothing's sacred; you're a man-woman. Only we Thracians are men—and the Getai, by Apollo, manly stuff indeed. That's why the mills are full of us" (οὐδὲν ἱερόν· ἀνδρόγυνος. ἡμεῖς μόνοι οἱ Θρᾶικές ἐσμεν ἄνδρες· οἱ μὲν δὴ Γέται, Ἄπολλον, ἀνδρεῖον τὸ χρῆμα· τοιγαροῦν γέμουσιν οἱ μυλῶνες ἡμῶν).[28] What motivated the purchasing of female Thracians, on the other hand, may have frequently involved plans to sexually exploit them, whether for economic gain (mainly through breeding and prostitution) or for the owner's personal gratification. The latter comes up in Aristophanes' *Acharnians*, where the

[25] *IG* I^3 421 (lines 34-36, 40-41), 427 (lines 3-4, 20-21).

[26] See Hans van Wees, "Agesilaos' Abandoned Children: 'Humane' Treatment of the Displaced?" *Pallas* 112 (2020): 191-198; Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery*, 79-81.

[27] See Wrenhaven, *Reconstructing the Slave*, 35; Thomas Harrison, "Classical Greek Ethnography and the Slave Trade," *Classical Antiquity* 38 (2019): 36-57 (42).

[28] Men. *Aspis* 238-244, ed. F. H. Sandbach, *Menandri Reliquiae Selectae* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972). An alternative reading of the final clause here changes it into a response from the Phrygian (τοιγαροῦν γέμουσιν οἱ μυλῶνες ὑμῶν, "that's why the mills are full of *you*"), but the implications remain the same: see also David Konstan, "Menander's Slaves: The Banality of Violence," in *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, 144-158 (157). On the mills: see Virginia J. Hunter, *Policing Athens: Social Control in the Attic Lawsuits, 420–320 B.C.* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994), 171f., 240 n32.

protagonist Dikaiopolis fantasizes about overpowering and raping a Thraitta caught stealing wood, as well as in the *Peace*, where the chorus considers it a simple joy of life to kiss a Thraitta while one's wife bathes.[29]

The Thracians' supposed penchant for tattooing may have set them apart from the rest of the foreign population appearance-wise, thereby accentuating their "otherness" in the eyes of Athenians.[30] Notably, Attic vase paintings depict Thracian women, both free and slave (the former in mythological scenes), with tattoos covering various parts of their bodies, especially their arms, legs, and faces.[31] Tattoos such as these would have made it more difficult for Thracian slaves to avoid notice during escape attempts or even hide their ethnic backgrounds if they earned their freedom and became metics.[32] Yet we can wonder whether Thracians' indigenous tattoos would have also helped reduce the conspicuousness of their slave "marks" (i.e., brands or tattoos applied by their owners) and any associated feelings of shame.[33] Athenaeus addresses this possibility in a rather different context when

[29] Ar. *Ach.* 270-274, *Pax* 1138-1139; see also James Robson, "Fantastic Sex: Fantasies of Sexual Assault in Aristophanes," in *Sex in Antiquity: Exploring Gender and Sexuality in the Ancient World*, ed. Mark Masterson et al. (Rewriting Antiquity; London: Routledge, 2015), 315-331, esp. 317-319 (319: "Dicaeopolis' fantasy could hardly be more guilt free. A female slave is caught stealing – she surely deserves punishment and will neither have any means of complaining about her treatment nor, even if she did, any witnesses to the act").

[30] Besides literary evidence for Thracian tattooing (see e.g. Hdt. 5.6.2), a few pieces of indigenous Thracian art seem to depict facial tattoos: see Ann E. Farkas, "Style and Subject Matter in Native Thracian Art," *Metropolitan Museum Journal* 16 (1981): 33-48 (45).

[31] See esp. Konrad Zimmermann, "Tätowierte Thrakerinnen auf griechischen Vasenbildern," *Jahrbuch des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts* 95 (1980): 163-196; Despoina Tsiafakis, "Thracian Tattoos," in *Bodies in Transition: Dissolving the Boundaries of Embodied Knowledge*, ed. Dietrich Boschung et al. (Morphomata 23; Paderborn: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 2015), 89-117.

[32] Cf. Xen. *Vect.* 4.21, who points out the difficulty of stealing and reselling slaves branded with marks that identified them as public property. On ancient methods of concealing tattoos or brands: see Deborah Kamen, "A Corpus of Inscriptions: Representing Slave Marks in Antiquity," *Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome* 55 (2010): 95-110 (103-107).

[33] On the branding of slaves: see Page duBois, *Slaves and Other Objects* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003), 106-109; Kamen, "Slave Marks," 98-103; cf. C. P. Jones, "*Stigma*: Tattooing and Branding in Graeco-Roman Antiquity," *Journal of Roman Studies* 77 (1987): 139-155 (147f.).

he describes how a group of Thracian women responded to the tattoos that they received from their Scythian captors:

> ὅθεν πολλοῖς ἔτεσιν ὕστερον αἱ ὑβρισθεῖσαι τῶν Θρᾳκῶν γυναῖκες ἰδίως ἐξηλείψαντο τὴν συμφορὰν προσκαταγραψάμεναι τὰ λοιπὰ τοῦ χρωτός, ἵν᾽ ὁ τῆς ὕβρεως καὶ τῆς αἰσχύνης ἐπ᾽ αὐταῖς χαρακτὴρ εἰς ποικιλίαν καταριθμηθεὶς κόσμου προσηγορίᾳ τοὔνειδος ἐξαλείψῃ.[34]
>
> Many years later, the Thracian women who had been humiliated erased the misfortune on their own by inscribing the remainder of their skin, so that the mark of humiliation and shame upon them, included among the variety, might erase the disgrace under the guise of adornment.

Of course, the conventional ways of representing Thracians in Attic art, with a focus not only on their tattoos but also other "exotic" elements like Thracian clothing and armaments, functioned in themselves as a means of "othering."[35] And on a more mundane level, the negative jokes and stereotypes against Thracians repeated in literary sources—that the men sucked beer through straws (as if performing fellatio), drank alcohol excessively and messily, and married as many as thirty wives, to give a few examples—perhaps illustrate the sorts of open mockery that Thracians might have had to endure in their everyday encounters with Athenians.[36] A sixth-century graffito discovered on a rock in the modern Vari-Voula-Vouliagmeni area of Attica offers a potential glimpse into this

[34] Ath. 12.27. ed. Georgius Kaibel, *Athenaei Naucratitae Dipnosophistarum Libri XV*, 3 vols. (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1887–1890); see also Kamen, "Slave Marks," 105.

[35] On the "othering" of Thracians in Athenian art: see esp. Despoina Tsiafakis, "The Allure and Repulsion of Thracians in the Art of Classical Athens," in *Not the Classical Ideal: Athens and the Construction of the Other in Greek*, ed. Beth Cohen (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 364-389; idem, "Ancient Thrace and the Thracians through Athenian Eyes," *Thracia* 21 (2016): 261-282; cf. Sears, *Athens*, 191-201.

[36] For Thracians drinking beer through straws: see Archilochus fr. 42 (Ath. 10.447b), ed. Laura Swift, *Archilochus: The Poems: Introduction, Text, Translation, and Commentary* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), with commentary at 265f. For Thracians drinking excessively: see e.g. Pl. *Leg.* 637e; Xen. *Anab.* 7.3.24-35; Nep. *Alc.* 11.4. For Thracian polygamy: see Men. fr. 877; Arist. titel 143,1 (29.58), ed. Olof Gigon, *Aristotelis Opera*, vol. 3 [Librorum Deperditorum Fragmenta] (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1987).

otherwise undocumented realm of daily life , delivering as it does a bit of crude humor at a Thracian's expense: Θραῖχς εἰμι τοῦ καταπύγονος.[37] Its publisher, Merle K. Langdon, translates the text as "I am Thraix, son of the butt-fucker," but κατάπυγον can also have the etymological sense of "(taking it) in/up the ass," and we could instead interpret its intended meaning here as "son of the butt-fucked."[38] Given the ancient stigma surrounding "passive" male homoerotic sex, in which the "passive" partner assumed the perceived gender role of a woman, I suspect that the author of this graffito may have aimed to ridicule the Thracian population (personified by a generic figure with the slave name Θραῖχς) by connecting their enslavement to the symbolic deprivation of their masculinity.[39]

Manumission would have provided one path to escaping bondage, but we have virtually no unequivocal evidence for Thracian freedpersons in Attica apart from a shopkeeper called Thraitta in a list of manumissions dating to *ca.* 330–320.[40] Nevertheless, a mid-fourth-century grave stele found at Keratea near Laurion, commemorating a Thraita (Θρᾶιτα) together with a man, Timon, and a second woman, Herpyllis, might belong to a family of freedpersons as well, judging by the accompanying relief (here, each name

[37] Published in Merle K. Langdon, "Additions to the Corpus of Greek Erotic Inscriptions," *GRAMMATEION* 5 (2016): 83-104 (85 no. A10).

[38] On this "passive" sense of κατάπυγον: see e.g. Bruce S. Thornton, "Greek Appetite and Its Discontents," review of *Courtesans and Fishcakes* by James Davidson, *Arion* 7, no. 3 (2000): 153-166 (159-161); Holt N. Parker, "Vaseworld: Depiction and Description of Sex at Athens," in *Ancient Sex: New Essays*, ed. Ruby Blondell and Kirk Ormand (Classical Memories/Modern Identities; Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2015), 23-142 (55 n87).

[39] On Athenian attitudes toward male homosexual intercourse and the gendering of the participants: see David Cohen, "Law, Society and Homosexuality in Classical Athens," in *Studies in Ancient Greek and Roman Society*, ed. Robin Osborne (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 61-77, esp. 69-71. Similar ideas existed elsewhere throughout the ancient Mediterranean and Near East: see conveniently Martti Nissinen, *Homoeroticism in the Biblical World: A Historical Perspective*, transl. Kirsi Stjerna (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1998).

[40] *SEG* XVIII 36 (face A, col. V, line 493); David M. Lewis, "Attic Manumissions," *Hesperia* 28, no. 3 (1959): 208-238 (326f.) on the date.

appears to label one of the three finely dressed individuals pictured beneath it, while a fourth, unnamed figure—probably a servant girl—stands in the background with a pyxis in her hands).[41] Another fourth-century grave stele, this one from Dipylon, includes a Thraitta among members of a multigenerational Salaminian household, though it does not specify the nature of her relationship to them, leaving open the possibility that she died a slave and that her owners chose to inter her in the family's burial plot.[42] Finally, the funerary monuments of a Thraitta from the early-fourth century and a Thraix from *ca.* 400 record their occupations as perfumer (μύρεψος) and slipper-maker (περσικοποιός), respectively, which indicate to Wijma "their semi-autonomous and most likely metic status in Athens."[43] Yet I would caution against this assumption, since slaves also seem to lie behind many of the Attic funerary epitaphs that identify the occupation of the deceased as wet nurse.[44]

That females comprise the majority of our potentially attested Thracian freedpersons fits a pattern in historical slaveholding societies whereby women tended to have more opportunities than men to earn income for themselves and thus purchase their

[41] *IG* II^2 12808; Balbina Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen und wehrhafte Skythen: Nichtgriechen im klassischen Athen und ihre archäologische Hinterlassenschaft* (Beiträge zur Altertumskunde 108; Stuttgart: B. G. Teubner, 1998), 276f. no. 118; Romain Guicharrousse, "Gravées dans la mémoire. Le cas des étrangères à Athènes à l'époque Classique," *Pallas* 99 (2015): 61-76 (65f., with a full photo on the stele on 75).

[42] *IG* II^2 10208; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 273f. no. 112; Rachel Zelnick-Abramovitz, "Whose Grave Is This? The Status of Grave Plots in Ancient Greece," *Dike* 18 (2015): 51-95 (73).

[43] *IG* II^2 11688 (Θρᾶιττα Μύρεψος), 11689 (Θρᾶιξ περσικοποιός); Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 197f., 275 no. 115; Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 131.

[44] On the funerary evidence for slave wet nurses: see Angeliki Kosmopoulou, "'Working Women': Female Professionals on Classical Attic Gravestones," *Annual of the British School at Athens* 96 (2001): 281-319 (285-292, esp. 290f.); Lesley A. Beaumont, *Childhood in Ancient Athens: Iconography and Social History* (Routledge Monographs in Classical Studies; London: Routledge, 2012), 56f.

own freedoms.[45] In ancient Attica, these opportunities would have likely centered around professional wool-working, midwifery, wet nursing, and prostitution.[46] The individuals discussed above, however, constitute only a small fraction of the roughly sixty possible Thracians found in Attic funerary monuments from the Classical and Hellenistic periods. Although freedpersons and metics could conceivably form a good portion of them, we should keep in mind the likelihood that manumission rates in Attica remained low on the whole and that the average slave received no permanent grave marker at all.[47] Moreover, the Thracians represented in our data may skew disproportionately towards those whom slave-owners wished to memorialize, for whatever reason; indeed, several of the funerary epitaphs contain the adjective χρηστός (and, in a single instance, the feminine χρηστή), "useful," the trait that masters valued most in slaves.[48]

Predictably, given the circumstances, there exists no evidence for any Thracian slaves in Attica who pursued the alternative to manumission: fleeing on foot.[49] Flight

[45] See Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982), 263-266; idem, "Slavery, Gender, and Work in the Pre-Modern World and Early Greece: A Cross-Cultural Analysis," in *Slave Systems, Ancient and Modern*, ed. Enrico Dal Lago and Constantina Katsari (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 32-69 (59-61).

[46] See Kosmopoulou, "Working Women," 285-302; Kelly L. Wrenhaven, "The Identity of the 'Wool-Workers' in the Attic Manumissions," *Hesperia* 78, no. 3 (2009): 367-386; Rebecca Futo Kennedy, *Immigrant Women in Athens: Gender, Ethnicity, and Citizenship in the Classical City* (Routledge Studies in Ancient History 6; London: Routledge, 2014), 131-145.

[47] For speculation on manumission rates: see Rachel Zelnick-Abramovitz, *Not Wholly Free: The Concept of Manumission and the Status of Manumitted Slaves in the Ancient Greek World* (Mnemosyne Supplements 266; Leiden: Brill, 2005), 64f.; Akrigg, *Population and Economy*, 138; idem, "Metics in Athens," in *Communities and Networks*, 155-173. On slave burials: see Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery*, 183f.

[48] *IG* II^2 8905, 8917, 12035a, 12822; *Agora* XVII 506. On χρηστός as an epithet of slaves: see Thomas Heine Nielsen et al., "Athenian Grave Monuments and Social Class," *Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies* 30 (1989): 411-420 (419); Andreas Scholl, *Die attischen Bildfeldstelen des 4. Jhs. v. Chr.: Untersuchungen zu den kleinformatigen Grabreliefs im spätklassischen Athen* (Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Athenische Abteilung 17; Berlin: Gebr. Mann Verlag, 1996), 177; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 65f.

[49] On flight from slavery in ancient Greece in general: see Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery*, 211-216.

carried the risk of incurring severe punishment in the event of recapture, something made easier by the fact that members of the public could apprehend a runaway on behalf of his or her owner; and as noted above, Thracians' tattoos may have increased the chances of unwanted detection as well.[50] That said, Thucydides does report the mass exodus of over twenty thousand slaves—"a large part of them skilled laborers" (τούτων πολὺ μέρος χειροτέχναι)—when the Athenians lost control of the Attic countryside with the Spartan occupation of Dekeleia in 413.[51] The fifth-century Christian historian Orosius also refers to a rebellion of mine slaves in the 130s, and according to Athenaeus, citing the second/first-century scholar Poseidonios, the tens of thousands of slaves "shackled" (δεδεμέναι) in the mines of Laurion rose up again *ca.* 100, during which "they slaughtered the mines' guards, seized the acropolis at Sounion, and ravaged Attica for a long time" (καταφονεῦσαι μὲν τοὺς ἐπὶ τῶν μετάλλων φύλακας, καταλαβέσθαι δὲ τὴν ἐπὶ Σουνίωι ἀκρόπολιν καὶ ἐπὶ πολὺν χρόνον πορθῆσαι τὴν Ἀιτική).[52] These incidents demonstrate, at the very least, that slaves in Attica did not always passively submit to domination. The recalcitrant Thracians sentenced to the grain mills in Menander's *Aspis* suggest that many Thracian slaves engaged in simpler acts of resistance on a day-to-day basis, such as slowing down the pace of their work or stealing food and money from their masters.[53]

---

[50] On the apprehension of runaway slaves: see Xen. *Mem.* 2.10.1-2; Pl. *Leg.* 914e.

[51] Thuc. 7.27.5; see Simon Hornblower, *A Commentary on Thucydides*, vol. 1 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 3.591 on the reading of the text here. Some have doubted whether Thucydides could have known the actual number of escaped slaves: see Victor Davis Hanson, "Thucydides and the Desertion of Attic Slaves during the Decelean War," *Classical Antiquity* 11, no. 2 (1992): 210-228; Akrigg, *Population and Economy*, 91f.

[52] Oros. 5.9.5; Ath. 6.104 (Poseidonios *FGrH/BNJ* 87 F 35). On the dates: see Christian Habicht, *Athens from Alexander to Antony*, transl. Deborah Lucas Schneider (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997), 292f.

[53] On methods of slave resistance: see Paul Cartledge, "Rebels and *Sambos* in Classical Greece: A Comparative View," in *Crux: Essays in Greek History Presented to G.E.M. de Ste. Croix on His 75th*

Thracians of Attica in Literary and Epigraphic Sources

The importation of Thracian slaves to Attica may have already started as early as the mid-sixth century, coinciding with the period when the Peisistratids established a powerbase in Thrace, though signs of a permanent population of them remains slight.[54] The *Constitution of the Athenians* attributed to Aristotle offers some dubious and indirect evidence in mentioning a tradition that ascribes Thracian descent to Phye, a beautiful, six-foot-tall garland-seller whom Peisistratos purportedly passed off as the goddess Athena in an elaborate bid to seize the tyranny (Herodotus merely states that the girl lived in the deme of Paiania).[55] The epigraphic record reveals only two possible Thracians in addition. The earlier one appears on an Attic vase discovered at Leporano in Italy and dated to 550–530, which bears the potter's signature: Θρᾶιχς ἐποίεσεν, "Thraix made (this)."[56] His status as a slave remains uncertain, but we do have other instances of slaves signing their handiwork.[57] The second Thracian, a [Θρ]ᾶιχς Κορτυνίο, has left us a dedication to Athena from the late-sixth century.[58] The name Κορτύνιος raises a conundrum, for it could represent an ethnic referring to either Gortyna in Crete or Gortys in Arcadia.[59] If so, why

Birthday, ed. idem and F. D. Harvey (London: Duckworth, 1985), 16-46; Hunt, *Greek and Roman Slavery*, 137-144; Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery*, 203-207.

[54] See also Vincent J. Rosivach, "Enslaving *Barbaroi* and the Athenian Ideology of Slavery," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 48, no. 2 (1999): 129-157 (155-157). On the Peisistratids and Thrace: see Sears, *Athens*, 52-59.

[55] Arist. *Ath. Pol.* 14.4; Hdt. 1.60.4.

[56] J. D. Beazley, *Attic Black-Figure Vase-Painters* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956), 178; Attic Vase Inscriptions 7605, https://www.avi.unibas.ch/DB/searchform.html?ID=7880.

[57] For slaves' signatures: see Alison Burford, *Craftsmen in Greek and Roman Society* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972), 90f.; Jeffrey M. Hurwit, *Artists and Signatures in Ancient Greece* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 93.

[58] *IG* I^3 639.

[59] See Michael B. Walbank, *Athenian Proxenies of the Fifth Century B.C.* (Toronto: Samuel Stevens, 1974), 474; Leslie Threatte, *The Grammar of Attic Inscriptions*, vol. 1 (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1980), 437.

would a non-Thracian name his son Θρᾶιχς? Alternatively, however, Κορτυνίο could denote the name of Thraix's owner; as we will see further below, this use of the genitive occurs in a document from the late-fifth or early-fourth century.[60]

At this point, we should discuss the allegation that Themistokles (born sometime in the latter half of the sixth century) had a Thracian mother named Habrotonon. Plutarch makes note of her at the beginning of his biography of Themistokles, quoting a funerary epigram that he may have come across in Amphikrates of Athens' first-century treatise *On Illustrious Men*:

> Ἀβρότονον Θρήισσα γυνὴ γένος· ἀλλὰ τεκέσθαι
> τὸν μέγαν Ἕλλησίν φημι Θεμιστοκλέα.[61]
>
> Habroton, a Thracian woman by *genos*; but I delivered
> to the Greeks the great Themistokles, I say.

Nevertheless, Plutarch acknowledges a competing tradition recorded by the earlier writers Phanias (fourth century) and Neanthes (third century?), who identified the mother of Themistokles as a Karian named Euterpe.[62] And in light of the prostitutes named Habrotonon in Menander's comedies, Peter Bicknell has argued that the claims about Themistokles' Thracian mother stem from "sexually oriented slander" directed against

[60] A late-fifth-century inscription from the Erechtheion (*IG* I^3 476) employs the genitive in the same way: see Richard H. Randall, Jr., "The Erechtheum Workmen," *American Journal of Archaeology* 57, no. 3 (1953): 199-210 (200), with reference to William Bell Dinsmoor, "The Burning of the Opisthodomos at Athens," *American Journal of Archaeology* 36, no. 2 (1936): 143-172 (145 n5).

[61] Plut. *Them.* 1.1, ed. Konrat Ziegler, *Plutarchi Vitae Parallelae*, 3 vols. (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1960–1973); Frank J. Frost, *Plutarch's Themistocles: A Historical Commentary* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980), 61f. The version quoted by Athenaeus (13.37), citing Amphikrates, has φασὶ in place of φημι.

[62] Plut. *Them.* 1.2; see also Ath. 13.37; cf. Nep. *Them.* 1.2, who identifies Themistocles' mother as an Acarnanian citizen. On Phanias and Neanthes: see now Neanthes *BNJ* 84 with Christopher Baron's biographical essay; Oliver Hellmann and David Mirhady, eds., *Phaenias of Eresus: Text, Translation, and Discussion* (Rutgers University Studies in Classical Humanities 19; London: Routledge, 2015), 3f.

prominent Athenians, "a stock feature of fifth century Attic comic drama."[63] Yet Menander could just as well have chosen Habrotonon as a stock name for prostitutes *because* of its link to the ignoble origins of Themistokles, a controversial figure in his own day, while the notion that he had a Karian mother might have developed out of his later stay at Karian Magnesia.[64] Ultimately, the evidence proves inconclusive.

Elsewhere, in the course of a fictional dialogue on the topic of love, Plutarch poses the rhetorical question: "Would it not be best to take as a wife some unbetrothed Thracian Abrotonon or Milesian Bakchis, bought from an agora for a price and handfuls of nuts?" (ἆρ᾽ οὖν κράτιστον ἐξ ἀγορᾶς γαμεῖν Ἀβρότονόν τινα Θρῇσσαν ἢ Βακχίδα Μιλησίαν ἀνέγγυον ἐπαγομένην δι᾽ ὠνῆς καὶ καταχυσμάτων;).[65] He has in mind here, evidently, the practice of purchasing slave-wives, individuals known as παλλακαί under Athenian law. Sold into marriage by either her owner or herself, a παλλακή remained a slave in all legal respects regardless of any emotional attachments between her and her husband, and their offspring would consequently have the status of νόθοι, "bastards," who lacked the right to a full inheritance from their father.[66] In fact, Plutarch explicitly designates Themistokles a

[63] Peter Bicknell, "Themistokles' Father and Mother," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 31, no. 2 (1982): 161-173 (166); cf. also e.g. J. K. Davies, *Athenian Propertied Families, 600–300 B.C.* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971), 213f.; D. L. Page, ed., *Further Greek Epigrams* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 333f.; Hellmann and Mirhady, *Phaenias*, 226-228. On Menander's Habrotonons: see William D. Furley, *Menander* Epitrepontes (London: Institute of Classical Studies, School of Advanced Study, University of London, 2009), 122f.; idem., *Menander* Perikeiromene *or* The Shorn Head (London: Institute of Classical Studies, School of Advanced Study, University of London, 2015), 135.

[64] On the possible origin of the tradition about Themistokles' Karian mother: see Helmann and Mirhady, *Phaenias*, 227; cf. Bicknell, "Themistokles' Father and Mother," 165.

[65] Plut. *Amat.* 753D, ed. Curt Hubert, *Plutarchi Moralia*, vol. 4 (Leipzig: Teubner, 1938).

[66] Morris Silver, *Slave-Wives, Single Women and "Bastards" in the Ancient Greek World: Law and Economics Perspectives* (Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2018), passim (see 25 and 173f. on Themistokles' mother). A bastards could apparently still receive a bequest of up to five hundred or a thousand drachmas from his father, though this amounted to just "a fraction of a wealthy man's estate": see Cheryl Anne Cox, *Household Interests: Property, Marriage Strategies, and Family Dynamics in Ancient Athens* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), 172.

νόθος on account of his mother, in which case he might have attained citizenship only through his father Neokles' ties to the distinguished Lykomidai family.[67] Νόθοι of less privileged backgrounds appear to have fallen under the category of metics or even ξένοι, "foreigners."[68] Overall, the issues surrounding Themistokles' supposed part-Thracian parentage help illustrate the challenges that many Thracian women and their children would have faced as residents of Attica.

The introduction of Perikles' citizenship law in 451/450, which restricted the franchise to those with two Athenian parents, must have further marginalized Thracian women and their children.[69] Although the law seems to have had no retroactive force, its immediate objective probably aimed at weakening the elite families who derived influence or prestige from the non-Athenian branches of their lineages (among them Perikles' political rival Kimon, the son of Miltiades the Younger and the Thracian princess Hegesipyle).[70] As Susan Lape explains: "The citizenship law served to discredit aristocratic

[67] Plut. *Them.* 1.1-3; Daniel Ogden, *Greek Bastardy in the Classical and the Hellenistic Periods* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), 55-57; Paulin Ismard, "Associations and Citizenship in Attica from Solon to Cleisthenes," in *Defining Citizenship in Archaic Greece*, ed. Alain Duplouy and Roger Brock (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 145-159 (153-155).

[68] Ogden, *Bastardy*, 43; Josine Blok, *Citizenship in Classical Athens* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017), 267f.; cf. Deborah Kamen, *Status in Classical Athens* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), 62-70, who treats the νόθοι as a category of their own, though "legally, they were most akin to metics" (66). But see also Silver, *Slave-Wives*, 169-176 for the argument that νόθοι could qualify for citizenship upon turning eighteen, at least prior to the passing of Pericles' citizenship law in 451/0.

[69] On the citizenship law: see esp. Arist. *Ath. Pol.* 26.3; Plut. *Per.* 37.2-5. For further references and discussion: see Josine H. Blok, "Perikles' Citizenship Law: A New Perspective," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 58, no. 2 (2009): 141-170, esp. 142-146 for an attempt to partially reconstruct the original text of the law; David D. Phillips, *The Law of Ancient Athens* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2013), 179f. no. 125.

[70] See David Braund, "Friends and Foes: Monarchs and Monarchy in Fifth-century Athenian Democracy," in *Alternatives to Athens: Varieties of Political Organization and Community in Ancient Greece*, ed. Roger Brock and Stephen Hodkinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 103-118 (114f.); Susan Lape, *Race and Citizen Identity in the Classical Athenian Democracy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 110f.; cf. Robin Osborne, "The Law, the Democratic Citizen, and the Representation

maternal ancestry by reframing it, that is, by defining it as foreign rather than as aristocratic."[71] Moreover, Perikles' law diminished the marriage prospects of metic women, since any child of a union between an Athenian father and non-Athenian mother could no longer inherit citizenship through the former.[72] Enforcement of the law apparently slackened toward the end of the fifth century, however, as suggested by the passing of new legislation in 403/402 that essentially reenacted the provisions of the 451/450 law, albeit exempting those born before 403/402.[73] The lull and exemption may have benefited the statesman and general Timotheos, born in the final decades of the fifth century as the son of the admiral Konon by a Thracian *hetaira*.[74] In contrast, the philosopher Antisthenes, purportedly born *ca.* 445 to an Athenian father and Thracian mother, would have had to earn his citizenship, most likely as an award for exemplary military service.[75]

At any rate, these literary references to Thracian women in Archaic and Classical Attica complement the picture painted by our epigraphic material. Much of this material consists of grave monuments—a single example survives from the fifth century and over a dozen from the fourth—some of them documenting what the deceased did in life, such as

---

of Women in Classical Athens," in *Studies in Ancient Greek and Roman Society*, 38-60 (39-43). On Kimon's parentage: see Plut. *Cim.* 4.1; cf. Hdt. 6.39.2.

[71] Lape, *Race and Citizen Identity*, 111.

[72] G. E. M. de Ste. Croix, "The Athenian Citizenship Laws," in *Athenian Democratic Origins and Other Essays*, ed. David Harvey and Robert Parker with Peter Thonemann (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 233-253 (247); Kennedy, *Immigrant Women*, 19.

[73] For the law of 403/402: see esp. Dem. 57.30; Ath. 13.38; Eumelos *FGrH/BNJ* 77 F 2 (Schol. Aeschin. *In Tim.* 39); Blok, *Citizenship*, 48f.; Philips, *Law*, 180f. no. 127.

[74] Ath. 13.38 describes Timotheos' mother as "a Thracian by *genos*, but otherwise dignified in her manners" (Θρᾴττης τὸ γένος, σεμνῆς δ' ἄλλως τοὺς τρόπους); cf. Davies, *Athenian Propertied Families*, 507f. On Timotheos' citizenship: see Douglas M. MacDowell, *The Law in Classical Athens* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1978), 67; Ste. Croix, "Citizenship Laws," 239; Lape, *Race and Citizen Identity*, 265.

[75] On Antisthenes' parentage: see esp. Diog. Laert. 6.1; additional testimonia collected in Susan Prince, *Antisthenes of Athens: Texts, Translations, and Commentary* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2015), 27f. On the issues surrounding Antisthenes' parentage and citizenship: see H. D. Rankin, *Anthisthenes Sokratikos* (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1986), 2-6; Price, *Antisthenes*, 11, 28f.

that of the aforementioned perfumer.[76] Another stele of a Thraitta features a relief with a woman holding a spindle, which points to work in textiles.[77] Yet a particularly evocative stele often thought to commemorate a Thracian woman does not actually specify the ethnicity of its subject, the wet nurse Pyraichme (Πυραίχμη τίττη); commentators have identified Pyraichme as a Thracian on the grounds of her stereotypically Thracian occupation and the potential allusion to red hair in her name.[78] In the accompanying relief, she wears a long-sleeved chiton (clothing associated iconographically with slaves) and sits in a chair, while by her feet rests a *chous*, a type of pitcher used primarily in the Dionysiac festival of Anthesteria, during which slaves could drink wine in company with their masters.[79] In this instance, Pyraichme or whoever commissioned her stele may have wished to emphasize her devoted service as a slave and wet nurse.[80]

Fourth-century inscriptions also attest to the Thracian wife of a shopkeeper as well as a possible Thracian prostitute. The former, a Thraitta, together with her husband Kallias,

[76] Two fragmentary fifth-century inscriptions contain probable mentions of Thraittas as well, though the contexts remain unclear in both instances: see *IG* I^3 1037 (line 35, Θρᾶιτ[τα]) and *SEG* XXI 97 (line 12, Θρᾶιτ[τα]); on the former, cf. also Elizabeth A. Meyer, "Inscribing in Columns in Fifth-Century Athens," in *Writing Matters: Presenting and Perceiving Monumental Inscriptions in Antiquity and the Middle Ages*, ed. Irene Berti et al. (Materiale Textkulturen 14; Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2017), 205-261 (243 n107), who reads the genitive Θραιτ[τιδος] "given its position in the line, at least six spaces in." Meyer suggests that the text "may reflect honors given to makers of Athena's *peplos* or a dedication by them," but this strikes me as exceedingly speculative.

[77] Werner Peek, "Attische Inschriften," *Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Athenische Abteilung* 67 (1942): 1-217 (125 no. 270); Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 279 no. 122.

[78] *SEG* XXI 1064; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 282-284 no. 128. For the identification of Pyraichme as a Thracian: see e.g. Erika Simon, "Ein Anthesterien-Skyphos des Polygnotos," *Antike Kunst* 6 (1963): 6-22 (9f.); Kosmopoulou, "Working Women," 287, 290.

[79] On the association of long-sleeved chitons with slaves: see John H. Oakley, "Some 'Other' Members of the Athenian Household: Maids and Their Mistresses in Fifth-Century Athenian Art," in *Not the Classical Ideal*, 227-247 (237); Beaumont, *Childhood in Ancient Athens*, 128; Wrenhaven, *Reconstructing the Slave*, 95f. On the Anthesteria: see Robert Parker, *Polytheism and Society at Athens* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 290ff.

[80] Cf. Hilde Rühfel, "Ammen und Kinderfrauen im klassischen Athen," *Antike Welt* 19, no. 4 (1988): 43-57 (48); Kosmopoulou, "Working Women," 287; Wrenhaven, *Reconstructing the Slave*, 96.

appears among the numerous targets of a curse tablet, the majority of them shopkeepers and tradespersons (including two slaves).[81] The author of this curse—perhaps a business competitor or a disgruntled customer—might have added Thraitta to the list because she helped Kallias run the store.[82] As for the possible prostitute, an oblong-shaped marble plaque found near the Stoa of Attalos bears a dedication by "Malthake on behalf of Thraittis" (Μαλθάκη ὑπὲρ Θραιττίδος), which Balbina Bäbler has linked to the sanctuary of Eros and Aphrodite on the north slope of Acropolis, citing similar "phallic stone symbols" recovered from its vicinity.[83] The name Μαλθάκη ("Soft" or "Tender"), although not uncommon in Attica, stands out in relation to these erotic goddesses due to its close association with *hetairai* in literary and dramatic works.[84] Thus, we could have here a dedication made by one prostitute for another.

There exists far less data, unfortunately, on what sorts of daily activities and drudgeries Thracian men engaged in. This comes as little surprise, since Athenians presumably relegated most of their male slaves to physically demanding manual labor on

---

[81] Richard Wünsch, *Defixionum Tabellae Atticae* (Corpus Inscriptionum Atticarum Appendix; Berlin: Reimer, 1897), 20 no. 87; John G. Gager, ed., *Curse Tablets and Binding Spells from the Ancient World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992), 156f. no. 62.

[82] Clare Kelly Blazeby, "Woman + Wine = Prostitute in Classical Athens?" in *Greek Prostitutes in the Ancient Mediterranean*, 86-105 (95f.).

[83] Benjamin D. Meritt, "Greek Inscriptions," *Hesperia* 30, no. 3 (1961): 205-292 (267 no. 91 [plate 51]); *SEG* XXI 784; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 280 no. 123; *Agora* XVIII V559, ed. Daniel J. Geagan, *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*, vol. 21 [The Dedicatory Monuments] (Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 2011). On the cult of Eros and Aphrodite and the "phallic stone symbols": see also Oscar Broneer, "Excavations on the North Slope of the Acropolis in Athens, 1933–1934," *Hesperia* 4, no. 2 (1935): 109-188 (125-132).

[84] On the name Μαλθάκη: see E. W. Handley, "Another Fragment of Menander's *Sikyonios*," *Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies* 31 (1984): 25-31 (26); Konstantinos Kapparis, *Prostitution in the Ancient Greek World* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2018), 423. Note that a character named Malthake in Menander's *Sikyonian(s)* also seems to give herself up as a παλλακή: see Silver, *Slave-Wives*, 53, with reference to Alan H. Sommerstein, "Menander and the *Pallake*," in *Menander in Contexts*, ed. idem (Routledge Monographs in Classical Studies 16; New York: Routledge, 2014), 11-23 (16).

farms and in the mines, where we would not expect them to leave behind a paper trail.[85] In fact, literary sources provide only a single reference to a Thracian involved in the mines, an overseer named Sosias to whom the fifth-century politician and general Nikias leased a thousand miners.[86] Judging from comparative evidence, Sosias had probably toiled in the mines himself before earning his freedom on the condition that he continue to serve under his former master.[87] And among the funerary monuments from Laurion, just one might conceivably memorialize a Thracian mine slave, with its epitaph merely identifying the deceased as "Philonikos son of Bithys, a Thracian" (Φιλόνικος Βίθυος Θρᾶιξ).[88] On the other hand, the previously discussed potter and slipper-maker attest to a population of skilled Thracian craftsmen. Two further pieces of evidence, both fifth-century, also hint in the same direction. The first of these, a fragmentary base of a *lekane*-bowl with the name Τρίβαλος ("Triballian") inscribed on it, apparently as a mark of ownership, suggests that this Tribalos had acquired a degree of literacy, like our potter.[89] The second piece of evidence consists of a pair of graffiti, in this case the names Θραχ and Ξανθιας ("Blondie," also a recurring slave name in Aristophanes' comedies) painted in red on the hidden face

[85] Cf. also Ian Morris, "Remaining Invisible: The Archaeology of the Excluded in Classical Athens," in *Women and Slaves in Greco-Roman Culture: Differential Equations*, ed. Sandra R. Joshel and Sheila Murnaghan (London: Routledge, 1998), 193-220.

[86] Xen. *Vect.* 4.14.

[87] Philippe Gauthier, *Un commentaire historique des* Poroi *de Xénophon* (Hautes études du monde gréco-romain 8; Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1976), 140-142, with reference esp. to Dem. 36.4. On conditional manumission and the obligations of freed slaves to their former masters: see also Zelnick-Abramovitz, *Not Wholly Free*, 308-334.

[88] *IG* II^2 8927; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 270f. no. 107.

[89] *Agora* XXI F 62, ed. Mabel Lang, *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*, vol. 21 [Graffiti and Dipinti] (Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 1976). On owners' marks as possible indicators of literacy: see David M. Pritchard, "Athens," in *A Companion to Ancient Education*, ed. W. Martin Bloomer (Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2015), 112-122 (119f.).

of a stone block from the *pronaos* of the Parthenon.[90] Thrax and Xanthias perhaps belonged to an artisan contracted to do work on the Parthenon, which would imply training in the their master's trade.[91]

Thracian men surface in martial contexts as well. Notably, the fifth- or fourth-century grave stele of a Getas, set up for him by Aristomedes (a friend, employer, or owner?) according to the text painted below the epitaph, features a painting of a *gorytos* or bow case and possibly two bows inside of it.[92] While some have thought Getas a member of Athens' Scythian police force on account of the Scythians' traditional use of the *gorytos*, his name points rather to a Getic or at least Thracian background.[93] We might instead attribute the presence of the *gorytos* to the Thracians' long history of contacts with their northern neighbors.[94] The imagery on Getas' stele could just as well suit a mercenary, in any case. In a fragmentary a list of mercenaries in the employ of Athens from *ca.* 300, which groups them by their ethnic or civic origin, the first forty-six extant names (out of

[90] *SEG* XXXVIII 32; H. W. Catling, "Archaeology in Greece 1988–89," *Archaeological Reports* 35 (1988–1989): 3-116 (9). On the name Ξανθίας: see Tordoff, "Introduction," 25, 27.

[91] On the use of skilled slaves in building projects: see Shimon Epstein, "Organizing Public Construction in Ancient Greece," review of *Organizatsyja obshtshestvennogo stroitelstva v drevnej Gretsyji* by V. D. Kuznetsov, *Scripta Classica Israelica* 27 (2008): 95-111 (99f.); idem, "Attic Public Constructions: Who Were the Builders?" *Ancient Society* 40 (2010): 1-14, esp. 9f.

[92] *IG* I^3 1376; Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 180f., 263 no. 90.

[93] Cf. Bäbler, *Fleissige Thrakerinnen*, 180f.; idem, "Bobbies or Boobies? The Scythian Police Force in Classical Athens," in *Scythians and Greeks: Cultural Interactions in Scythia, Athens and the Early Roman Empire (Sixth Century BC – First Century AD)*, ed. David Braund (Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 2005), 114-122 (119f.); Tsetskhladze, "Pontic Slaves in Athens," 313. On the name Γέτας: see *OnomThrac*, 188f. s.v. Geta et al., with commentary ad loc.

[94] A Macedonian royal tomb at Vergina, possibly that of Philip II's Getic wife Meda, contained a gilded *gorytos* nearly identical to another found in a Scythian grave at Kuban: see Elizabeth Carney, "Commemoration of a Royal Woman as a Warrior: The Burial in the Antechamber of Tomb II at Vergina," *Syllecta Classica* 27 (2016): 109-149, esp. 112f., 122; Peli Plika, "Comparative Research between the Macedonian Tombs and the Scythian *Kurgans*," in *The Greeks and Romans in the Black Sea and the Importance of the Black Sea Region for the Graeco-Roman World (7th Century BC-5th Century AD): 20 Years On (1997-2017)*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze et al. (Oxford: Archaeopress, 2021), 84-93 (91f. [figures 8 and 9]).

one hundred fifty-three) also seem to encompass an exceptionally large contingent of Thracians.[95] As the late Vincent J. Rosivach observed, many of these Thracians possess names associated with slaves (such as Πυρρίας, "Redhead," occurring three times here), and noting the size of their contingent in comparison to the rest (ranging from just one to six members each), he ventured that these Thracians "were not professional free lances [*sic*], but were rather recruited from among Athens' own slave and/or freedman metic population."[96]

That Thracian slaves did render military service seems likewise evident from a catalogue of naval personnel dating to the late-fifth or early-fourth century, in which we find nine rowers of possible Thracian extraction (the majority of them called Θρᾶιξ) under the heading θεράποντες, "slaves," as well as the names of their masters next to them in the genitive.[97] Ordinarily, Classical Athenian warships had mixed complements of both free and slave rowers, with masters sometimes serving alongside their slaves and at other times hiring them out to individual officers.[98] In critical moments, however, the decision to muster large numbers of slaves may have owed simply to desperation; indeed, Xenophon

[95] *IG* II^2 1956. Further down the list, at lines 184-186, two individuals (Θεόδωρος and Νίκων) appear under the heading Θρᾶικες.

[96] Vincent J. Rosivach, "The Thracians of IG II^2 1956," *Klio* 82 (2000): 379-381.

[97] *IG* I^3 1032 (line 108, Γέτας Ἀλεξίππο; line 115, Τρίβαλλος Ἀριστα[…]; line 248, Θρᾶιξ Νικοβόλο; line 383, Θρᾶιξ [Π]ειθαγό; line 390, Θρᾶιξ Ἀμφικλ; line 391, Θρᾶιξ Ἱπποδάμα; line 395, Θρᾶιξ Μίκο; line 406, Θρᾶιξ Ἀρχίο; line 466, Θραικυλίων Νικο). On this document: see esp. A. J. Graham, "Thucydides 7.13.2 and the Crews of Athenian Triremes," *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 122 (1992): 257-270 (263-267); idem, "Thucydides 7.13.2 and the Crews of Athenian Triremes: An Addendum," *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 128 (1998): 89-114; Geoffrey Bakewell, "Trierarchs' Records and The Athenian Naval Catalogue (*IG* i^3 1032)," in *Orality, Literacy, Memory in the Ancient Greek and Roman World*, ed. E. Anne Mackay (Orality and Literacy in Ancient Greece 7, Mnemosyne Supplements 298; Leiden: Brill, 2008), 143-162.

[98] On slave rowers: see Graham, "Addendum," 98-102, 108-110; Borimir Jordan, "The Crews of Athenian Triremes," *L'Antiquité Classique* 69 (2000): 81-101 (99-101); Peter Hunt, "Arming Slaves and Helots in Classical Greece," in *Arming Slaves: From Classical Times to the Modern Age*, ed. Christopher Leslie Brown and Philip D. Morgan (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 14-39 (25-29).

states that prior to the Battle of Arginousai in 406, the Athenians took the drastic step of drafting all men of military age, slave and free, to crew a hastily assembled relief force for the main fleet trapped by the Spartans at Mytilene.[99] The immensity of the crisis, in this instance, even appears to have driven the Athenians to grant their slaves freedom and partial citizenship rights (no doubt as an incentive to effort and a deterrent to desertion) on top of the standard wages paid to rowers.[100]

Such military exigencies may have had a precedent in the alleged mass manumission of slaves on the eve of the Battle of Marathon in 490. Pausanias alone reports this emergency measure, singling out Miltiades the Younger as one of its chief proponents, and he further claims the existence of a grave on the Marathon plain for the Plataians and slaves who fell in the engagement; "for even slaves fought then for the first time" (ἐμαχέσαντο γὰρ καὶ δοῦλοι τότε πρῶτον).[101] Although none seem to doubt the basic credibility of his testimony—in fact, travelers in the early-nineteenth century of our era sighted a possible candidate for the burial mound (now gone, unfortunately, due to erosion or other geomorphological processes)—debate persists as to why exactly the Athenians felt the need to free their slaves and what function these slaves could have subsequently fulfilled in combat.[102] Sears, among the most recent to weigh in on these questions,

[99] Xen. *Hell.* 1.6.24.

[100] Peter Hunt, "The Slaves and Generals of Arginusae," *American Journal of Philology* 122, no. 3 (2001): 359-380; idem, "Arming Slaves," 29f. On the payment of slave rowers: see also Graham, "Thucydides 7.13.2," 262f.

[101] Paus. 1.32.3 (for the quote), 7.15.7, 10.20.2, ed. Friedrich Spiro, *Pausaniae Graeciae Descriptio*, 3 vols. (Leipzig: Teubner, 1903).

[102] See e.g. James A. Notopoulos, "The Slaves at the Battle of Marathon," *American Journal of Philology* 62, no. 3 (1941): 352-354; J. A. S. Evans, "Herodotus and the Battle of Marathon," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 42, no. 3 (1993): 279-307 (293 n65, 302); Peter Hunt, *Slaves, Warfare, and Ideology in the Greek Historians* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 26-28. For discussion on the possible candidates for the grave of the Plataians and slaves: see J. A. G. van der Veer, "The Battle of

proposes that Miltiades' experiences in Thrace convinced him of the efficacy of light-armed troops in protecting flanks, a role performed well enough on short notice by newly freed slaves.[103] "Many of these Attic slaves," Sears adds, "were most likely Thracians themselves, or at least from other lands familiar with light-armed warfare."[104]

The Cult of Bendis and the Thracian Community in Attica

The disparate elements of the Thracian population in Attica, which included, as we have seen, not only slaves of various status and occupations but also metics and mercenaries, may not have constituted a cohesive community on a practical level, but the evidence for the local worship of Bendis does suggest, all the same, the development of a collective Thracian identity centered around her cult. Signs of this identity already emerge from Plato's brief description (placed in the mouth of Socrates) of the inaugural festival of Bendis at the Peiraieus sometime in the second half of the fifth century, commenting as it does on the distinctiveness of the Thracian participants: "Now, the procession of the native inhabitants (i.e., Athenians) struck me as beautiful indeed, but what the Thracians put on seemed no less impressive" (καλὴ μὲν οὖν μοι καὶ ἡ τῶν ἐπιχωρίων πομπὴ ἔδοξεν εἶναι, οὐ μέντοι ἧττον ἐφαίνετο πρέπειν ἢν οἱ Θρᾷκες ἔπεμπον).[105] Plato's account reveals, in other words, that the Thracians organized their own procession in the Bendideia, separate

Marathon: A Topographical Survey," *Mnemosyne* 35, no. 3/4 (1982): 290-321 (301-304); N. G. L. Hammond, "Plataea's Relations with Thebes, Sparta and Athens," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 112 (1992): 143-150 (147-150); Peter Krentz, *The Battle of Marathon* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), 129f.

[103] Sears, *Athens*, 247-249.

[104] Ibid., Athens, 249.

[105] Pl. *Resp.* 1.327a, ed. S. R. Slings, *Platonis* Rempublicam (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003).

from yet equal in quality to the one conducted by the Athenians. We see here a group of Thracians in Attica coming together for common purpose and perhaps literally parading their Thracianness amid the veneration of a Thracian goddess.[106]

A decree dated to 240/239, which formalizes cooperation between two groups of Thracian *orgeones* (members of religious clubs), refers even more explicitly to a Thracian identity.[107] From its contents, it appears that *orgeones* at the Peiraieus have responded to a request from their compatriots in the city of Athens to join them during the procession for the Bendideia. The existence of independent groups of *orgeones* in each location may reflect the long period of political division in Attica from 295, when the Macedonians secured control over the Peiraieus, until 262, when the Macedonians also subjugated the city of Athens in the Chremonidean War.[108] Yet the decree shows that both groups wished to present themselves as belonging to a single Thracian community and heritage despite their geographical separation. In the interest of clarity, I reproduce the decree below in full, following the text and adapting the translation published by John S. Kloppenborg and Richard S. Ascough in their recent collection of documents on ancient associations and clubs:

> Θ E O I.
> ἐπὶ Πολυστράτου ἄρχοντος μηνὸς Ἑκατομβαιῶνος ὀγδόη-
> ι ἱσταμένου· ἀγορᾶι κυρίαι· Σωσίας Ἱπποκράτου εἶπεν· [v]

[106] See also Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 140f.

[107] *IG* II^2 1283; John S. Kloppenborg and Richard S. Ascough, *Greco-Roman Associations: Texts, Translation, and Commentary*, vol. 1 [Attica, Central Greece, Macedonia, Thrace] (Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche 181; Berlin: De Gruyter, 2011), 125-132 no. 23, with reference to Michael J. Osborne, "The Archons of Athens 300/299–228/7," *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 171 (2009): 83-99 (97f.) on the date.

[108] Jon D. Mikalson, *Religion in Hellenistic Athens* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 142; Kloppenborg and Ascough, *Greco-Roman Associations*, 130f.; Oliver, *War, Food, and Politics*, 53-67; cf. Jones, *Associations of Classical Athens*, 258f.

ἐπειδὴ τοῦ δήμου τοῦ Ἀθηναίων δεδωκότος τοῖς Θραιξὶ μ-
ὀνοις τῶν ἄλλων ἐθνῶν τὴν ἔγκτησιν καὶ τὴν ἵδρυσιν τοῦ
ἱεροῦ κατὰ τὴν μ[α]ντείαν τὴν ἐγ Δωδώνης καὶ τὴν πονπὴν π-
ένπειν ἀπὸ τῆς ἑστίας τῆς ἐκκ τοῦ πρυτανείου καὶ νῦν οἱ
ἠι[ρη]μένοι ἐν τῶι ἄστει κατασκευάσασθαι ἱερὸν οἴοντα-
ι δεῖν οἰκείως διακεῖ[σθ]αι πρὸς ἀλλήλους· ὅπως ἂν οὖν φα-
[ίν]ωνται καὶ οἱ ὀργεῶνες τῶι τε τῆς πόλεως νόμωι πειθαρ-
χοῦντες ὃς κελεύει τοὺς Θρᾶικας πέμπειν τὴμ πομπὴν εἰ-
[ς Π]ε[ι]ραιᾶ καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ἐν τῶι ἄστει ὀργεῶνας οἰκείως [δ]-
ιακείμενοι· ᵛ ἀγαθεῖ τύχει δεδόχθαι τοῖς ὀργεῶσιν ᵛ [τὴ]-
[ν μὲν] πονπὴ[ν ὡ]ς ἂν [ἔ]λωνται οἱ ἐν τῶι ἄστει συνκαθι[στάνα]-
ι τὴμ πομπὴν καὶ τήνδε οὖν ἐκ τοῦ πρυτανείου εἰς Πει[ραιᾶ]
πορεύεσσθαι ἐν τῶι αὐτῶι τοῖς ἐκ τοῦ Πειραιέως· τ[οὺς δὲ ἐ]-
ν τῶι Πειραιεῖ ἐπιμελητὰς ὑποδέχεσσθαι τούτου[ς παρέ]-
χοντας ἔν τε τῶι Νυμφαίωι σφόγγους καὶ λεκάνας κ[αὶ ὕδωρ]
καὶ στεφάνους καὶ ἐν τῶι ἱερῶι ἄριστον καθάπερ [καὶ ἐαυ]-
τοῖς παρασκευάζουσιν· ὅταν δὲ ὦσιν αἱ θυσίαι εὖ[χεσθαι]
τὸν ἱερέα καὶ τὴν ἱέρειαν πρὸς ταῖς εὐχαῖς ἃς εὖ[χονται]
καὶ τοῖς ὀργεῶσι τοῖς ἐν τῶι ἄστει κατὰ ταὐτά, ὅ[πως ἂν τού]-
τῶν γινομένων καὶ ὁμονοοῦντος παντὸς τοῦ ἔθ[νους αἵ τ]-
ε θυσίαι γίνωνται τοῖς θεοῖς καὶ τὰ ἄλλα ὅσα πρ[οσήκει]
κατά τε τὰ πάτρια τῶν Θραικῶν καὶ τοὺς τῆς πόλ[εως νόμου]-
ς καὶ ἔχει καλῶς καὶ εὐσεβῶς παντὶ τῶι ἔθν[ει τὰ πρὸς τοὺ]-
ς θεούς· εἶναι δ’ αὐτοῖς καὶ ἐὰν περὶ ἄλλο[υ τινὸς βούλωντ]-
αι προσιέναι πρὸς τοὺς ὀργεῶνας πρ[όσοδον ἀεὶ πρώτοις]
μετὰ τὰ ἱερὰ καὶ ἐάν τινε[ς βούλωνται τῶν ἐν τῶι ἄστει]
ὀργεώνων ἐπεισιέ[ναι εἰς τοὺς ὀργεῶνας ἐξεῖναι αὐτοῖ]-
ς εἰσιέναι κ[αὶ λαμβάνειν καὶ μὴ τελοῦντας τὴν φορὰν διὰ]
βίου τὸ μέρ[ος –]

G O D S!

During the archonship of Polystratos, eighth of Hekatombaion, at the regular assembly, Sosias son of Hippokrates made the motion: Whereas, the people of Athens granted to the Thracians, alone of all of the *ethne*, the right to own property and to build a temple, in accordance with the oracle of Dodona and (to have) a procession from the hearth of the Prytaneion; and now those who have been chosen to build a temple in the city think that both (groups) should be favorably disposed to each other; so that the *orgeones* also may be seen to be obedient to the law of the *polis*, which orders the Thracians to have their procession continue to the Peiraieus, and being favorably disposed towards the *orgeones* who are in the city; for good fortune, the *orgeones* resolve that the procession, when those in the city choose to arrange the procession, the (procession) shall therefore proceed from the Prytaneion to the Peiraieus in the same (procession) with those (members) from the Peiraieus. (Further, it is resolved) that the supervisors in the Peiraieus shall promise to supply

sponges in the Nymphaion and cups and water and wreaths and a breakfast in the temple, just as they prepare for themselves.

20 When the sacrifices occur, the priest and priestesses shall pray, in addition to the prayers that they (normally) pray, also and in the same way for the *orgeones* who are in the city, so that when these things take place and the entire *ethnos* lives in concord, the sacrifices and other rites shall be made to the gods, in accordance both with the ancestral customs of the Thracians and the laws of the *polis* and so that it will go well and piously for the entire *ethnos* in matters concerning the gods.

27 (And further) it shall be (that), if one (of the *orgeones* of the city) should wish to have access to the *orgeones* (of the Peiraeius) concerning some other matter, they shall always have priority following the sacred rites, and if one of the *orgeones* of the city should wish to join the *orgeones*, they may do so, and receive (sacrificial meat) without paying the fee, for life, the portion…[109]

On several occasions, the decree emphasizes the cultural unity of the Thracian population in Attica. Lines 4-6, for instance, distinguish the Thracians from other *ethne* in Attica by asserting (falsely, in fact, at least by the time of the mid-third century) that the Thracians alone had obtained permission to construct their own sanctuary—a source of pride here, obviously.[110] Further in, lines 23-26 call for harmony among "the entire *ethnos*" to ensure the success of the sacrifices and prayers, which adhere to "the ancestral customs of the Thracians and the laws of the *polis*." This remarkable appeal to "the ancestral customs of the Thracians" (τὰ πάτρια τῶν Θρακῶν) presupposes that the *orgeones* felt some attachment to a Thracian identity, regardless of whether these customs had any basis in "genuine" religious practices in Thrace (their juxtaposition with "the laws of the *polis*"

[109] Kloppenborg and Ascough, *Greco-Roman Associations*, 125-127.

[110] A decree from 333/332 (*IG* II^2 337) indicates that the Kitians established a sanctuary for Aphrodite and the Egyptians a sanctuary for Isis, both at the Peiraieus, evidently: see also Robert Parker, *Athenian Religion: A History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), 170; Kloppenborg and Ascough, *Greco-Roman Associations*, 127; Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 136f.; Oliver, *War, Food, and Politics*, 65f.

could very well imply conformity to Athenian expectations).[111] From a broader perspective, the decree again illustrates how the Bendideia allowed the Thracians the opportunity to express ethnic and religious solidarity within a non-Thracian setting, and the focus on the most public aspect of these observances, the procession, suggests that the *orgeones* wanted all to witness this solidarity.

What of the genesis of the cult of Bendis in Attica and the reasons behind its official sanction? In answering these questions, Christopher Planeaux has argued at length that Bendis "officially" entered Attica in 429, the year of the earliest potential mention of the goddess in an Attic inscription (specifically, a treasury account with a record of offerings to her) and amid the Athenians' attempts to pursue closer ties with the Odrysian Kingdom in Thrace and possibly seek a divine solution to the then ongoing plague.[112] Unofficial worship of Bendis may have already taken root by the mid-fifth century, however, as suggested by a fragment of Kratinos' comedy *Thracian Women*, likely produced in the late 440s, which refers to Bendis by her epithet δίλογχος, "two-speared."[113] Another fragment amounts to no more than the word κακόδουλος, probably meaning "bad slave" in its original usage; it invites us to speculate that the *Thracian Women* dealt in some manner

[111] See also Denise Demetriou, "What Is an Emporion? A Reassessment," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 60, no. 3 (2011): 255-272 (270); idem., *Negotiating Identity*, 225f.; Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 149-152.

[112] Christopher Planeaux, "The Date of Bendis' Entry into Attica," *Classical Journal* 96, no. 2 (2000-2001): 165-192; see also e.g. Ronda R. Simms, "The Cult of the Thracian Goddess Bendis in Athens and Attica," *Ancient World* 18, nos. 3-4 (1988): 59-76 (60-62); Archibald, "Thracian Cult," 458; Kloppenborg and Ascough, *Greco-Roman Associations*, 128f. For the treasury account: see *IG* I^3 383 (col. II, fr. V, line 143).

[113] Cratinus fr. 85, ed. R. Kassel and C. Austin, *Poetae Comici Graeci*, vol. 4 (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1983). On the date of the play: see Simms, "Bendis," 60; Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 133 n40.

with the veneration of Bendis by Thracian slaves in Attica.[114] That slaves contributed to the proliferation of her cult seems a fair enough assumption, and we do have fourth- or third-century evidence from Laurion attesting to her worship there, presumably by the large population of mine slaves.[115]

Robert Parker's remark that "the Athenians are unlikely to have chosen to honour the goddess merely because their slaves did" warrants brief comment.[116] In his opinion, official acceptance of Bendis reflected an acknowledgement of Athenian economic, strategic, and ideological interests in Thrace, yet I find it difficult to grasp why these interests would have motivated the Athenians to promote a cult that primarily served (as Parker concedes) the Thracian residents of Attica. In more recent slaveholding societies, such as Brazil and Cuba in the era of the Atlantic slave trade and beyond, the strength of indigenous African religious traditions compelled authorities "to recognize the rights of Africans to convene all kinds of social, political, cultural, and religious organizations that represented particular African ethnic groups," as Laird W. Bergad explains, while at the other times, ethno-religious organizations for African slaves maintained "a nominal façade of Catholicism" in response to the Church's attempts to Christianize them, leading in some

[114] For κακόδουλος: see Cratinus fr. 86, with Kassel and Austin's commentary ad loc.; Michel Casevitz, "Δουλεκδουλος: Sur une injure et certains composés nominaux," *Revue de philologie, de littérature et d'histoire anciennes* 83 (2009): 31-38 (37). For further speculation on the contents of the *Thracian Women*: see e.g. Donald Sells, "Slaves in the Fragments of Old Comedy," in *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, 91-110 ("Cratinus' *Thraittai*… may have parodied Aeschylus' play of the same name and lampooned Thracian slave women introducing the cult of Bendis to Athens").

[115] See Parker, *Athenian Religion*, 174 n74, with reference to a dedication to Bendis (i.e., *SEG* XXXIX 210) and three statues of the goddess from Laurion.

[116] Ibid., 174. Wijma, *Embracing the Immigrant*, 130 quotes this statement with approval.

cases to the syncretization of African deities with Catholic saints.[117] While conditions in these countries must have differed considerably from those in ancient Attica, I see no reason why the Athenians could not have similarly desired to regulate the religious practices of their slaves or provide them a figurative safety valve for expressing their cultural identity.

Conclusion

As we have seen, there came to develop in ancient Attica a sizable Thracian community, and one that articulated a sense of collective Thracianness through the cult of Bendis. This community had its origins, by and large, in the extensive importation of slaves from Thrace, whom slave traders specifically marketed as Thracians, and whom Athenians sometimes purchased on account of the perceived suitability of Thracians for certain kinds of work. I believe that this process, which also frequently involved the renaming of slaves as Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα, could have inadvertently contributed to the strengthening and perpetuation of Thracian ethnic identity among the Thracian population, perhaps helping to bring down the barriers of their pre-enslavement tribal identities, while many of\ their children would have grown up in an environment that simply categorized them as Thracians. The public manifestations of their "Thracian" cultural practices, as far as we discern from the texts relating to the cult of Bendis, also operated within the parameters of what the Athenian state permitted.

[117] Laird W. Bergad, *The Comparative Histories of Slavery in Brazil, Cuba, and the United States* (New Approaches to the Americas; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 180-187 (quotes on 180 and 185).

Yet the existence of their identity seems all the more remarkable in light of the adverse conditions and cultural pressures that the Thracian community in Attica had to face. Although their Thracianness may have been, to a significant extent, a construct imposed upon them by Greeks, the prominence of the cult of Bendis suggests that Thracians sought to use that identity to improve their standing in the eyes of Athenian society. Thracians made their presence felt through a variety of other ways as well, ranging from acts of resistance that would receive recognition in Attic comedy, of all places, to the military service that they rendered in times of crisis. In Attica, we find Thracianness expressed under the most trying circumstances.

Chapter 4

Thracians and the Achaemenid Empire

Introduction

This chapter discusses the deportation and exploitation of Thracians as well as the ideologically driven conceptualizations of Thrace and Thracianness under the Achaemenid Empire, which controlled portions of Thrace at various points during the late-fifth and fourth centuries. In particular, I argue that the Achaemenid Empire invested the Thracians with considerable symbolic importance, for they came to represent the idea of liminality within a paradigm of imperial space and power that emphasized the reach of the Great King's authority to far corners of the earth; this symbolism ultimately factored into the Persians' policy of resettling Thracians in the interior of the empire for use as labor and the levying Thracians for military service. Working with Babylonian texts from the final years of the Achaemenid Empire, I also attempt to show how Babylonian writers invoked imagery surrounding the Thracians in their depictions of the invading army of Alexander the Great (356–323). All in all, it appears that the Persians (and perhaps the Babylonians as well) recognized the Thracians as an ethnic group, albeit for ideological purposes.

Unfortunately, the poverty of the surviving evidence leaves us with just scattered snapshots of the interactions between Thracians and Persians, precluding any attempt at a comprehensive account and analysis. Indeed, our principal literary witnesses, Herodotus and Xenophon, discuss Thraco-Persian relations in a largely tangential manner and often as a means of contextualizing events that involved the Greeks, while Achaemenid sources, comprising a small number of a royal inscriptions and a chronologically narrow corpus of

administrative documents, present top-down perspectives under the constraints of imperial ideology or bureaucracy. Additional complications arise from doubts about whether Near Eastern texts can tell us anything at all about Thrace and Thracians, with a recent study by Wouter F. M. Henkelman and Matthew W. Stolper notably challenging the traditional opinion that the Skudrians, a people mentioned in Persian inscriptions, correspond to the Thracians.[1] I address question of the Skudrians further below.

A Historical Overview of Achaemenid Thrace

The Persian conquest of Thrace began around 513 B.C.E. in the course of Darius I's (r. 522–486) ill-fated expedition against the European Scythians, during which he obtained the peaceful surrender of Thracian tribes along the western Black Sea coast and subdued the defiant Getae south of the Istros River, according to Herodotus.[2] Following the termination of this campaign, Darius left behind in Thrace a large army (purportedly eighty thousand strong) under a trusted subordinate, Megabazos.[3] Initially tasked with "taming every *polis* and every *ethnos* of that country for the King" (πᾶσαν πόλιν καὶ πᾶν ἔθνος τῶν ταύτῃ οἰκημένων ἡμερούμενος βασιλέι), Megabazos later carried out new orders (with only partial success) to deport the Paionians, an apparently non-Thracian people who

[1] Wouter F. M. Henkelman and Matthew W. Stolper, "Ethnic Identity and Ethnic Labelling at Persepolis: The Case of the Skudrians," in *Organisation des pouvoirs et contacts culturels dans les pays de l'empire achéménide*, ed. Pierre Briant and Michael Chauveau (Paris: Éditions de Boccard, 2009), 271-329.

[2] Hdt. 4.93.

[3] Ibid. 4.143-144. For discussion of Megabazos, his family, and status: see Ernst Badian, "Herodotus on Alexander I of Macedon: A Study in Some Subtle Silences," in *Greek Historiography*, ed. Simon Hornblower (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994), 107-130 (110f.); Lionel Scott, *Historical Commentary on Herodotus Book 6* (Mnemosyne Supplements 268; Leiden: Brill, 2005), 493f.; Miroslav Izdimirski, "Persian *Hyparchoi* and *Strategoi* in Ancient Thrace According to Herodotus," *Orpheus* 20 (2013): 15-25 (15-19).

may nevertheless have shared common roots and cultural ties with the Thracians, from their lands along the Strymon River to Asia Minor.[4] Otanes son of Sisamnes, Megabazos' replacement and possibly a son-in-law of Darius, conducted further operations that led to the capture of Byzantion as well as several Greek *poleis* in western Asia Minor and the northern Aegean Sea.[5]

A series of military installations and at least one settlement allowed the Achaemenid Empire to maintain a permanent presence in Thrace, although direct control does not seem to have extended far into the interior.[6] Important sites known to us by name include Doriskos, a "royal fortress" (τεῖχος βασιλήιον) near Zone on the northern Aegean coast, and Boryza, a "*polis* of the Persians" (πόλις Περσέων) somewhere on the western Black Sea coast, as attested in a fragment of Hekataios.[7] To help oversee these areas, the Great Kings appointed multiple *hyparchs* (ὕπαρχοι), who functioned as both governors and garrison commanders.[8] Since we lack compelling evidence that the Persians ever organized their European possessions into an independent satrapy, the *hyparchs* in Thrace likely

[4] Hdt. 5.2, 5.12-17. See further below on the Paionians.

[5] Ibid. 5.25-26. Herodotus later lists an Otanes among Persian generals married to daughters of Darius (5.116); see further Hans Hauben, "The Chief Commanders of the Persian Fleet in 480 B.C.," *Ancient Society* 4 (1973): 23-37 (26-28); Scott, *Commentary,* 492f.

[6] See e.g. Christo M. Danov, *Altthrakien* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1976), 268-270; Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 84-88; Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 108, 118. Cf. the eight "great forts" (τείχεα μεγάλα) that Darius attempted to build along the Oaros River in Scythia (Hdt. 4.124).

[7] On Doriskos: see Hdt. 7.59.1-2; Isaac, *Greek Settlements,* 137-140. On Boryza: see Hekataios *FGrH/BNJ* 1 F 166; Steph. Byz. B 127; Pericles Georges, "Darius in Scythia," *American Journal of Ancient History* 12, no. 2 (1987 [1995]), 97-147 (131f.); Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 77-82. See also Galya D. Bacehva, "Detecting a Satrapy: The Skudra Case," *Thracia* 20 (2012): 11-26 (12f.).

[8] Hdt. 7.105-106; Christopher Tuplin, "Xenophon and the Garrisons of the Achaemenid Empire," *Archäologische Mitteilungen aus Iran* 20 (1987): 167-245 (183f., 229f.); Jack Martin Balcer, "Persian Occupied Thrace (Skudra)," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 37 (1988): 1-21 (2-4, 14f.).

answered to the satrap of Lydia (with his capital at Sardis) or the satrap of Hellespontine Phrygia (with his capital at Daskylion) in Asia Minor.[9]

What happened to the Persian forces in Europe amid the chaos of Ionian Revolt (499–493) remains unclear—some scholars posit the virtual collapse of Achaemenid rule in Thrace—but an expedition under Darius' son-in-law Mardonios in 492 quickly restored, and perhaps expanded, Persian hegemony throughout the region.[10] During Xerxes' invasion of Greece in 480, Doriskos and other places served as staging areas and supply dumps, while the army and fleet recruited liberally from the native Thracian population, all of which suggests that the Persians had managed to impose a degree of stability upon their part of Thrace.[11] In the decades following Mardonios' defeat and death at Plataia in 479, when the Greeks of the Delian League pursued the expulsion of the Achaemenid Empire from Europe, we hear of Thracians moving to the aid of the embattled Persians.[12] The limits of imperial influence revealed themselves elsewhere, however; Xerxes' sacred chariot fell into the hands of Paionians and then Thracians, who refused his requests for its

[9] See Balcer, "Persian Occupied Thrace," 17-19; Thierry Petit, *Satrapes et satrapies dans l'empire achéménide de Cyrus le Grand à Xerxès I^er^* (Bibliothèque de la Faculté de philosophie et lettres de l'Université de Liège 254; Paris: Société d'Édition "Les Belles Lettres," 1990), 183-185; Jan P. Stronk, "Crossing the Straits: The Persians in Thrace," *Talanta* 30-31 (1998-1999): 55-72 (66-68); Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 120-122, 154-161; cf. Bruno Jacobs, *Die Satrapienverwaltung im Perserreich zur Zeit Darius' III* (Beihefte zum Tübinger Atlas der Vorderen Orients, Reihe B, 87; Wiesbaden: Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, 1994), 124-128.

[10] Hdt. 6.43-45; Michael Zahrnt, "Die Perser in Thrakien," in *Thrace ancienne. Actes 2e Symposium International des Études Thraciennes*, ed. Association Culturelle de Komotini (Komotini: Musée Archéologique de Komotini, 1992), 91-100 (91f.); idem, "Early History of Thrace to the Murder of Kotys I (360 BCE)," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 35-47 (38); Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 124-161.

[11] Hdt. 7.25, 7.59.2, 7.110, 7.115.2; Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 165.

[12] Plut. *Cim.* 7.1-2, 14.1; Zahrnt, "Perser in Thrakien," 96f. n21; Izdimirski, "Persian *Hyparchoi* and *Strategoi*," 19f.; Sears, *Athens*, 71-73; Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 217f., 224f.

return, and the Apsinthioi slaughtered a group of Persian refugees from Sestos, sacrificing one of them to the local god Pleistoros.[13]

Doriskos, the last Persian stronghold in Europe, appears to have held out until early in the reign of Artaxerxes I (r. 465–424).[14] Yet the loss of Europe did not spell an end to the relationship between Thracians and the Achaemenid Empire. As I explore in this chapter, even as the Persian occupation of Thrace reflected, to a degree, a continuation of previous contacts with the Thracians of Asia Minor, it also produced long-term consequences in creating new subaltern communities and redefining perceptions of royal authority. For Thracians, Persian rule could mean involuntary relocation to the Iranian heartland; for Persians, Thrace constituted a major source of manpower and a key ideological symbol of the Great King's reach over his dominion.

Skudrians and Thracians

References to Skudrians and their country Skudra initially surface in the reign of Darius I. Since they do not appear in the Bisitun Inscription, in which Darius narrates how he secured the throne in 522, but do appear in an administrative document dated to 508/7, the Persians may have attained control of the Skudrians during the intervening period—conceivably when Darius campaigned in Thrace and Scythia around 513.[15] Among the

[13] On the sacred chariot: see Hdt. 8.115.4; Dietmar Kienast, "Der Wagen des Ahura Mazda und der Ausmarsch des Xerxes," *Chiron* 29 (1996): 285-313 (286-291, 306-310). On the killing of the Persians from Sestos: see Hdt. 9.119.1.

[14] Hdt. 7.106.1, with W. W. How and J. Wells, *A Commentary on Herodotus*, 2 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1912), ad loc.; Zahrnt, "Perser in Thrakien," 96f. n21; Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 225f.; cf. Isaac, *Greek Settlements*, 138 n75.

[15] See Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 290.

imperial subjects listed in Persian inscriptions, Skudra sits between the "Saka (i.e., Scythians) who are beyond the sea" (Old Persian *Sakā tyaiy paradraya*) and "Ionians (i.e., Greeks) who are beyond the sea" (*Yaunā tyaiy paradraya*) or, more enigmatically, "Ionians holding up shields (?)" (*Yaunā takabarā*).[16] This seems to situate Skudra across the Bosporus from the Persians' geographic standpoint.

Etymological and linguistic considerations factor into the picture as well. Already in the nineteenth century, the pioneering Iranologist Ferdinand Justi identified Skudra with Thrace and Macedonia on the assumption that *Skudra* borrowed from the Greek Σκύδρα, the name of an obscure *polis* in Bottiaia.[17] A. T. Olmstead followed suit in his seminal, posthumously published *History of the Persian Empire*.[18] As Oswald Szemerényi later pointed out, however, it makes little sense that the Persians would dub an entire region after a settlement as insignificant as Skydra. Arguing instead for a derivation from Proto-Indo-European **skeud-o-*, "shooter, archer," which may also represent the root of the Greek Σκύθης, "Scythian," and noting further that the reliefs on Darius' tomb at Naqsh-i

[16] DNa 28-29, ed. Rüdiger Schmitt, *The Old Persian Inscriptions of Naqsh-i Rustam and Persepolis* (Corpus Inscriptionum Iranicarum 1.1.2; London: Lund Humphries, 2000), 25-32; DSm 10-11, ed. Roland G. Kent, *Old Persian: Grammar, Texts, Lexicon*, 2nd ed. (American Oriental Series 33; New Haven: American Oriental Society, 1953), 145; DSe 29-30, ed. M.-J. Steve, "Inscriptions des Achéménides à Suse," *Studia Iranica* 3 (1974): 7-28. On the meaning of *takabarā*, which scholars have traditionally translated as "wearing a *petasos*": see Robert Rollinger, "*Yaunā takabarā* und *maginnatā* tragende 'Ionier'. Zum Problem der 'griechischen' Thronträgerfiguren in Naqsch-i Rustam und Persepolis," in *Altertum und Mittelmeerraum: Die antike Welt diesseits und jenseits der Levante. Festschrift für Peter W. Haider zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. idem and Brigitte Truschnegg (Oriens et Occidens 12; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2006), 365-400, esp. 387f.; but see also Christopher Tuplin, "Revisiting Dareios' Scythian Expedition," in *Achaemenid Impact in the Black Sea: Communication of Powers*, ed. Jens Nieling and Ellen Rehm (Black Sea Studies 11; Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2010), 281-312 (297).

[17] Ferdinand Justi, *Geschichte der orientalischen Völker im Altertum* (Allgemeine Weltgeschichte 1; Berlin: G. Grote'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1884), 390. On the *polis* Skydra: see Fanoula Papazoglou, *Les villes de Macédoine à l'époque romaine* (Suppléments au Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique 16; Athens: École Française d'Athènes, 1988), 149f. s.v. Skydra.

[18] A. T. Olmstead, *History of the Persian Empire* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948), 157f.

Rustam depict Skudrians and Scythians in a similar fashion, Szemerényi located the Skudrians in Thrace ("essentially European Turkey and the Eastern part of modern Bulgaria") but in the same cultural group as the Scythians.[19]

Henkelman and Stolper's more recent study, while acknowledging Szemerényi's observations on the potential Scythian element, lays greater emphasis on the Thracians' apparent ties to western Asia Minor.[20] Signs of these ties exist in the shared onomastic lexis among the Thracians and Bithynians, the linguistic parallels between Thracian and Phrygian, and the ancient literary traditions about the Phrygians' Thracian ancestry.[21] In searching for clues as to what lies behind the name *Skudra*, the authors look to toponyms in the area around the Bosporus, such as Κύδραρα (a city on the border of Phrygia and Lydia), *Uscudama* (an earlier settlement at the site of Hadrianopolis, now Edirne in European Turkey), and Σκοῦδρα (a village on the Sangarios River known only from the seventh-century C.E. *Life of St. Theodoros of Sykeon*).[22] The data from Asia Minor

[19] Oswald Szemerényi, *Four Old Iranian Ethnic Names: Scythian, Skudra, Sogdian, Saka* (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse, Sitzungsberichte 371; Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1980), 20-26.

[20] Cf. Gerd Gropp, "Sassen die Skudra Wirklich in Thrakien? Ein Problem der Satrapienverteilung in Kleinasien," in *Achaemenid Anatolia: Proceedings of the First International Symposium on Anatolia in the Achaemenid Period, Bandirma 15-18 August 1997*, ed. Tomris Bakır and Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg (Uitgaven van het Nederlands Historisch-Archaeologisch Instituut te İstanbul 92; Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 2001), 37-42, who locates the Skudrians east of Lydia for reasons that I do not quite comprehend. For criticisms of Gropp's approach: see Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 296 n66; Ellen Rehm, "The Impact of the Achaemenids on Thrace: A Historical Review," in *Achaemenid Impact*, 137-160 (149).

[21] Henkleman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 296-298. On the onomastic evidence: see also Thomas Corsten, "The Rôle and Status of the Indigenous Population in Bithynia," in *Rome and the Black Sea Region: Domination, Romanisation, Resistance*, ed. Tønnes Bekker-Nielsen (Black Sea Studies 5; Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2006), 85-92; idem, "Thracian Personal Names and Military Settlements in Hellenistic Bithynia," in *Old and New Worlds in Greek Onomastics*, ed. Elaine Matthews (Proceedings of the British Academy 148; Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2007), 121-133.

[22] Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 299. For Κύδραρα: see Hdt. 7.30.2. For *Uscudama*: see Amm. Marc. 14.11.15, 27.4.12. For Σκοῦδρα: see *Vita S. Theodori Syceotae* 141, ed. A.-J. Festugière, *Vie de Théodore de Sykeôn*, vol. 1 (Subsidia Hagiographica 48; Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1970);

ultimately leads them to question the extent to which we can equate the Skudrians with Thracians:

> If *skudra-* derives from a local, northwest Anatolian toponym or ethnonym, 'Skudrian' may be understood as a name that the Persians learned from or gave to people they first encountered in Bithynia or an adjacent region. Its use was subsequently expanded to groups that were (in Persian eyes) related, but lived across the Bosporus. This would imply that 'Skudrian' could indeed include groups that Greeks would consider to be 'Thracian,' but also that both Phrygian and Scythian cultural influences have to be reckoned with, if not that groups actually considering themselves to be Phrygian or Scythian could be summarized under the label 'Skudrian.' In other words: 'Skudrian' reflects a distinctively Persian outlook, just as 'Thracian' is largely a Greek construct. Though there may be an overlap with what Greeks understood to be 'Thracian,' it would be unwise to translate *skudra-* as such.[23]

As sensible as it sounds, Henkelman and Stolper's proposal fails to account for the Skudrians' position among the peoples "beyond the sea" and the correlative implication that the Persians associated the Skudrians primarily with Europe rather than Asia Minor. Another one of Darius' inscriptions lends support to this inference, as it appears to count Skudra, the Saka beyond the sea, and the Ionians beyond the sea/holding up shields under the general category of "countries that are beyond the sea" (*dahyāva tyā paradraya*).[24] Moreover, whether or not we accept Szemerényi's explanation of *Skudra*, comparisons with names containing similar graphemes or phonemes do allow for the possibility of Thracian origins. We can cite here the abovementioned Uscudama, a town of the Thracian

---

Ladislav Zgusta, *Kleinasiatische Ortsnamen* (Beiträge zur Namenforschung, Neue Folge 21; Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag, 1984), 578 §1236.

[23] Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 299.

[24] DPe 14-15, ed. Schmitt, *Old Persian Inscriptions*, 60-62; see also Balcer, "Persian Occupied Thrace," 4, 18; Tuplin, "Scythian Expedition," 296; Jeffrey D. Lerner, "Persia, Thrake, and Skudra," in *History of the Argeads*, 7-25 (17, 19).

Bessi according to Eutropius, as well as the Brygian *polis* called Κυδραί, situated along the Erigon River in Macedonia.[25]

In fact, Henkelman and Stolper's interpretation of how the Persians may have defined the Skudrians does not altogether differ from Greek conceptions of the Thracians. The connections to Asia Minor pose no problem in this regard, for our sources attest to a substantial Thracian presence in the region. Xenophon goes as far as to label the stretch of territory from the mouth of Black Sea to Herakleia Pontica as "Thrace in Asia" (Θράκη ἡ ἐν τῇ Ἀσίᾳ), in view of the "Thracian Bithynians" who lived there.[26] The Bithynians themselves, if we can believe Herodotus, claimed to have descended from Thracians who had fled their homeland by the Strymon.[27] Yet another tradition known to Herodotus held that the Brygians became Phrygians after migrating to Asia, and this resonates with the evidence of shared material culture, linguistic practices, burial customs, and religious rites between Thrace and Phrygia.[28] "Scythian cultural influences" feature, too, in Greek

[25] For the Bessi at Uscudama: see Eutr. 6.10. For Kydrai: see Strabo 7.7.9. Cf. also N. G. L. Hammond, *A History of Macedonia*, vol. 1 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972), 414; Stanimir Kalojanov, "Thraco-Persica. Thrace and the Achaemenids 6th-4th c. B.C.," *Bulgarian Historical Review* 4 (1988): 82-87 (85); Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 84 n29; Kiril Jordanov, "Achaemenido-Thracica: Attempts at Political and Administrative Control (ca. 515-466 BC)," *Thracia* 15 (2003): 39-54 (46).

[26] Xen. *Anab*. 6.4.1-2. On the Thracian population in this region: see further Stanley Mayer Burstein, *Outpost of Hellenism: The Emergence of Heraclea on the Black Sea* (University of California Publications in Classical Studies 14; Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976), 6-11; Maya Vassileva, "Phrygia and the Southern Black Sea Littoral," in *The Danubian Lands Between the Black, Aegean and Adriatic Seas (7th century BC–10th century AD): Proceedings of the Fifth International Congress on Black Sea Antiquities (Belgrade – 17-21 September 2013)*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze et al. (Oxford: Archaeopress, 2005), 91-96, esp. 92.

[27] Hdt. 7.75.2; see also Pherekydes *FGrH/BNJ* 3 F 27 (Schol. Ap. Rhod. 2.178-182c); Strabo 12.3.3-4. On the historical background of this tradition: see Peter Delev, "Stratifying Herodotus: Local Tribes between the Lower Axios and the Nestos," *Thracia* 16 (2005): 105-121 (106f.).

[28] Hdt. 7.73; see also Strabo 7.3.2. On the Thracian-Phrygian connection: see e.g. Oscar White Muscarella, "The Iron Age Background to the Formation of the Phrygian State," *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research* 299/300 (1995): 91-101; Eleonora Petrova, "Bryges and Phrygians: Parallelism Between the Balkans and Asia Minor Through Archaeological, Linguistic and Historical Evidence," in *Thracians and Phrygians: Problems of Parallelism: Proceedings of an International Symposium on the*

depictions of Thracians, which comes as no surprise given the proximity of the two peoples and their long history of interactions.[29]

To offer an alternative to Henkelman and Stolper's scenario, I submit that the Persians did encounter Thracians/Skudrians in Asia Minor but also recognized their origins from "beyond the sea," having ascertained this either from local traditions circulating in Bithynia and Phrygia or through mere deduction based on the experiences in Thrace and Scythia. I would venture further that a perceived relationship between Thrace and Phrygia contributed to Darius' decision to resettle the Paionians in Phrygia when Megabazos deported them from their lands along the Strymon, even if the Paionians would not have thought of themselves as Thracians; ancient sources do link the Paionians to western Asia Minor, and the Persians may have seen the Paionians as falling within the same cultural spectrum as the Thracians and Phrygians, not noticing or caring for the nuances that separated these peoples.[30]

Archaeology, History and Ancient Languages of Thrace and Phrygia, Ankara, 3-4 June 1995, ed. Numan Tuna et al. (Ankara: METU, Faculty of Architecture Press, 1995), 45-54; in the same volume, Roumyana Georgieva, "Burial Rites in Thrace and Phrygia," 61-64; Maya Vassileva, "A Few Notes on Phrygian and Thracian Script and Literacy," *Thracia* 16 (2005): 79-93; idem, "Phrygia, Troy and Thrace," in *Anatolian Iron Ages 5: Proceedings of the Fifth Anatolian Iron Ages Colloquium Held at Van, 6–10 August 2001*, ed. Altan Çilingiroğlu and Gareth Darbyshire (British Institute at Ankara Monograph 31; London: British Institute at Ankara, 2005), 227-234. See my earlier chapter, in the section on Dionysopolis, for details about religious rites.

[29] See Rehm, "Impact of the Achaemenids," 148f.; cf. Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 298. On depictions of Thracians and Scythians in Greek art: see further Wulf Raeck, *Zum Barbarenbild in der Kunst Athens im 6. und 5. Jahrhundert V. Chr* (Habelts Dissertationsdrucke, Reihe Klassische Archäologie 14; Bonn: Rudolf Habelt Verlag, 1981), 10ff., esp. 33f.; H. A. Shapiro, "Amazons, Thracians, and Scythians," *Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies* 24 (1983): 105-114; Walter Duvall Penrose, Jr., *Postcolonial Amazons: Female Masculinity and Courage in Ancient Greek and Sanskrit Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 95-97. On the relations between the two peoples: see conveniently David Braund, "Thracians and Scythians: Tensions, Interactions and Osmosis," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 352-365.

[30] On the deportation: see Hdt. 5.15, 5.17.1, 5.23.1, 5.98.1; Stephen Hirsch, "The Deportation of the Paeonians: Strategies and the Experiences of Thracian Deportees," in *I Traci nel Mediterraneo: VI symposium internazionale di tracologia, Firenze 11-13 maggio 1989* (Rome: Editrice Nagard, 1992), 230-

The existence of Thracians/Skudrians in western Asia Minor, or a broader geographic understanding of Skudra that encompassed both sides of the Bosporus, could help explain why, roughly a century after the Achaemenid Empire lost its foothold in Europe, the tomb inscriptions of Artaxerxes III (r. 359/358–338) continue to list Skudra among the imperial subjects (a relief depicting a Skudrian throne-bearer accompanies this text).[31] But the Saka beyond the sea and Ionians holding up shields turn up here as well, highlighting also the importance of ideology over political and territorial realities.[32]

Thrace and Thracians in Persian Imperial Ideology

In keeping with the precedent established by the Assyrians and Babylonians, the official ideology of the Achaemenid Empire asserted imperial sovereignty over the entirety of the world and its peoples.[33] The Old Persian royal inscriptions regularly invoke this

239 (234). Herodotus seems to have believed that the Paionians descended from Teukrians of Troy (5.13.2, 7.20.2); Strabo identifies the Paionians as Thracians (7 fr. 11a) and alludes to a tradition about their Phrygian ancestry (7 fr. 17a). Modern scholarship has tended to acknowledge the uncertainties surrounding the Paionians, drawing no firm conclusions about their cultural background and makeup: see e.g. Radoslav Katičić, *Ancient Languages of the Balkans*, vol. 1 (Trends in Linguistics 4; The Hague: Mouton, 1976), 116-120; Peter Delev, "Tribes, Poleis and Imperial Aggression in the Lower Strymon Area in the 5th c. BC – The Evidence of Herodotus," in *Thrace in the Graeco-Roman World*, 110-119 (111-113); cf. Eleonora Petrova, "Bryges, Paeones and Ancient Macedonians – Mythical, Onomastic and Archaeological Relations and Differences," *Živa Antika* 47 (1997): 159-166.

[31] A^{3}Pb 25, ed. Schmitt, *Old Persian Inscriptions*, 119-122. Cf. Lerner, "Persia, Thrake, and Skudra," 20f., who proposes that the Persians recognized at least two separate groups of Thracians, citing the plural form *Skudrā* in one of Xerxes' inscriptions (XPh), which scholars have traditionally interpreted as an error; on the problems with Lerner's approach, see Miroslav Ivanov Vasilev's book review in the *Bryn Mawr Classical Review*, https://bmcr.brynmawr.edu/2018/2018.11.37.

[32] See Pierre Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander: A History of the Persian Empire*, transl. Peter T. Daniels (Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2002), 734; idem, "The Empire of Darius III in Perspective," in *Alexander the Great: A New History*, ed. Waldemar Heckel and Lawrence A. Tritle (Malden: Blackwell, 2009), 141-170 (164f.).

[33] On the Persian claims to world rule: see e.g. Bruce Lincoln, "The Role of Religion in Achaemenian Imperialism," in *Religion and Power: Divine Kingship in the Ancient World and Beyond*, ed. Nicole Brisch (Oriental Institute Seminars 4; Chicago: Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2008), 221-241; Reinhold Bichler, "Persian Geography and the Ionians: Herodotus," in *Brill's Companion to Ancient Geography: The Inhabited World in Greek and Roman Tradition*, ed. Serena Bianchetti et al.

concept through a variety of titles and expressions that underscore the global scope of the Great King's dominion, such as "king in all the earth" (*xšāyaθiya haruvahyāya būmiyā*), "king of countries, king in this earth" (*XŠ DHyūnām XŠ ahyāyā BUyā*), and "king in this great earth, far and wide" (*XŠ hyāyā BUyā vazrakāyā dūraiy apiy*).[34] Likewise, in his communications with the Greeks, the Great King purportedly styled himself as "master of all men from the rising of the sun to its setting" (δεσπότης … ἁπάντων ἀνθρώπων ἀφ᾽ ἡλίου ἀνιόντος μέχρι δυομένου), as the fourth-century Attic orator Aeschines tells us.[35] The most vivid description of the realm's dimensions, however, has come down to us through an Akkadian-language building inscription at Persepolis, a portion of which I quote below:

> *^{ilu}ú-ru-ma-az-da ra-bi šá ra-bu-ú ina muḫ-ḫi ilani^{meš} gab-bi šame^{e} u irṣitim^{tim} ib-nu-ú niše^{meš} ib-nu-ú šá dum-ki gab-bi id-din-nu-ma niše^{meš} ina lìb-bi bal-ṭu-ʾ šá a-na ^{I}da-a-ri-i̯a-muš šarru ib-nu-ú u a-na ^{I}da-a-ri-i̯a-muš šarri šarru-ú-tu id-din-nu ina ḳaḳ-ḳar a-ga-a rap-šá-a-tum ša matate^{meš} ma-di-e-tum ina lìb-bi-šu ^{matu}par-su ^{matu}ma-da-a-a u matate^{meš} ša-ni-ti-ma li-ša-nu ša-ni-tum ša šade^{meš} u ma-a-tum ša a-ḫa-na-a-a a-ga-a ša naru mar-ra-tum u a-ḫu-ul-lu-a-a ul-li-i ša naru mar-ra-tum ša a-ḫa-na-a-a a-ga-a ša ḳaḳ-ḳar ṣu-ma-ma-i-tum u a-ḫu-ul-lu-a-a ul-li-i ša ḳaḳ-ḳar ṣu-ma-ma-i-tum*
>
> Great is Auramazda, who is the greatest of all the gods, who created the heaven and the earth, created the peoples, who gave all prosperity to the peoples living within, who made Darius king and gave Darius the King kingship over this vast land, in which there are many countries: Persia, Media, and other countries of other

(Leiden: Brill, 2016), 3-20 (16-19). On this ideology in other Near Eastern contexts: see e.g. Rolf Strootman, "Hellenistic Imperialism and the Ideal of World Unity," in *The City in the Classical and Post-Classical World: Changing Contexts of Power and Identity*, ed. Claudia Rapp and H. A. Drake (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 38-61; Mattias Karlsson, *Relations of Power in Early Neo-Assyrian State Ideology* (Studies in Ancient Near Eastern Records 10; Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2016), 148ff.

[34] DSb 7-9 and A^{2}Hc 16-17, ed. Kent, *Old Persian*, 141, 154f.; A^{2}Sa 1, A^{2}Sa (2) 1 and A^{2}Sa (3) 1, ed. M.-J. Steve, "Inscriptions des Achéménides à Suse (fin)," *Studia Iranica* 4 (1975): 7-26 (8-10).

[35] Aeschin. *In Ctes.* 132. Cf. Christopher Tuplin, *Achaemenid Studies* (Historia Einzelschriften 99; Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1996), 159, writing that Aeschines "does not reproduce any genuine Achaemenid phrase." But similar language does appear in earlier Egyptian and Near Eastern texts: see e.g. Mario Liverani, *Prestige and Interest: International Relations in the Near East, ca. 1600-1100 B.C.* (History of the Ancient Near East Studies 1; Padova: Sargon srl, 1990), 51f.

> languages, of mountains and plains, from this side of the Bitter River (i.e., the ocean) and from the other side of the Bitter River, from this side of the Land of Thirst (i.e., the desert) and the other side of the Land of Thirst.[36]

While the Achaemenid Empire obviously never reached the territorial extent envisaged in its propaganda, the Great Kings presumably still sought ways to uphold the pretense, just as their Assyrian and Babylonian predecessors did.[37] The annals of the Assyrian king Esarhaddon (r. 680–669) illustrate this phenomenon in explaining how the world fell under his control: "I wrote to all the kings who are in the midst of the sea, from Iadnana (i.e., Cyprus), Iaman (i.e., Ionia), to Tarsisi (in southern Iberia), (and) they bowed down at my feet. I received their heavy tribute. I achieved victory over the rulers of the four quarters (of the earth)" (*áš-pur* MAN.MEŠ *šá* MURUB$_4$ *tam-tim* DÙ-*šú-nu* TA KUR.*ia-da-na-na* KUR.*ia-man a-di* KUR.*tar-si-si a-na* GÌR.II-*ia ik-nu-šú* GUN-[*su-nu*] ⌜DUGUD⌝-*tú am-ḫur* UGU *mal-ki šá kib-rat* LÍMMU-*tim li-i-*⌜*tú*⌝).[38] In this instance, the nominal extension of Assyrian influence into the Mediterranean, represented by the very

[36] DPg §1, ed. F. H. Weissbach, *Die Keilinschriften der Achämeniden* (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs'sche Buchhandlung, 1911), 85. On the terminology for the ocean: see Wayne Horowitz, *Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography* (Mesopotamian Civilizations 8; Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 1998), 304f.

[37] Ancient Near Eastern royal inscriptions tend to exaggerate or embellish rather than outright fabricate when making grandiose claims: see e.g. Baruch Halpern, *David's Secret Demons: Messiah, Murderer, Traitor, King* (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2003), 126. As Halpern puts it: "The question is, what is the minimum the king might have done to lay claim to the achievements he publishes? Looting a town? He shoplifted a toothbrush from the local drug store. Ravaging the countryside? Perhaps he trampled crops near a farmstead. Receiving submission from distant kings in lands one hasn't invaded? A delegation arrived to inaugurate diplomatic relations. Each small mark of prestige becomes the evidence for a grand triumph."

[38] Erle Leichty, *The Royal Inscriptions of Esarhaddon, King of Assyria (680-669 BC)* (Royal Inscriptions of the Neo-Assyrian Period 4; Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2011), 135 (Esarhaddon 60, 9′-12′). On Tarsisi (which Liechty mistakes for Tarsus): see Carolina López-Ruiz, "Tarshish and Tartessos Revisited: Textual Problems and Historical Implications," in *Colonial Encounters in Ancient Iberia: Phoenician, Greek, and Indigenous Relations*, ed. Michael Dietler and Carolina López-Ruiz (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009), 255-280 (256-263); John Day, "Where was Tarshish?" in *Let Us Go Up to Zion: Essays in Honour of H. G. M. Williamson on the Occasion of His Sixty-Fifth Birthday*, ed. Iain Provan and Mark J. Boda (Supplements to Vetus Testamentum 153; Leiden: Brill, 2012), 359-369.

minimal criteria of receiving tribute, provided sufficient justification for Esarhaddon's claim to have completed his subjugation of the "rulers of the four quarters."[39]

If the Great Kings of Persia used similar techniques to sustain the illusion of a global empire, the Skudrians, I suspect, fulfilled a somewhat analogous role to Esarhaddon's Mediterranean "subjects." As Johannes Haubold has recently argued, insofar that the sea constituted "outer space" within the "mental maps" of Near Eastern civilizations, traversing and occupying lands across the sea could symbolically equate to mastery of the earth; and here he sees possible motivations behind not only the Persians' campaigns against the Greeks and Scythians but also their impressive feats of aquatic engineering, such as the canal linking the Nile to the Red Sea.[40] Haubold's discussion regrettably leaves out Skudra, the only one of the "countries that are beyond the sea" where the Achaemenid Empire managed to maintain a relatively long-term presence. We might discern something of Skudra's ideological value as an "outlying" space through the stele that Darius erected on Tearos River in Thrace, which, at least according to Herodotus, bore this inscription (its original language goes unspecified):

> Τεάρου ποταμοῦ κεφαλαὶ ὕδωρ ἄριστόν τε καὶ κάλλιστον παρέχονται πάντων ποταμῶν· καὶ ἐπ᾽ αὐτὰς ἀπίκετο ἐλαύνων ἐπὶ Σκύθας στρατὸν ἀνὴρ ἄριστος τε καὶ

[39] Esarhaddon's claims here follow the account of his conquest of Tyre, and thus he may have also asserted control over Tyre's colonial and commercial network throughout the Mediterranean: see Sebastián Celestino and Carolina López-Ruiz, *Tartessos and the Phoenicians in Iberia* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 116. On the four quarters: see Horowitz, *Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography*, 324.

[40] Johannes Haubold, "The Achaemenid Empire and the Sea," *Mediterranean Historical Review* 27 (2012): 5-24; idem, *Greece and Mesopotamia: Dialogues in Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 102-112. See also Donald Murray, "The Waters at the End of the World: Herodotus and Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography," in *New Worlds from Old Texts: Revisiting Ancient Space and Place*, ed. Elton Barker et al. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 47-60.

> κάλλιστος πάντων ἀνθρώπων, Δαρεῖος ὁ Ὑστάσπεος, Περσέων τε καὶ πάσης τῆς ἠπείρου βασιλεύς.[41]
>
> The source of the river Tearos gives the best and finest water of all rivers; and to them came, leading an army against the Scythians, the best man and finest of all men, Darius son of Hystaspes, king of the Persians and of the entire continent.

Scholars have questioned the veracity of this "translation"—neither the subject matter nor titulary have exact parallels in Persian texts—though when Lieutenant General August Jochmus toured the region in 1847, a local dervish did attempt to guide him to a stele inscribed "in ancient Syrian or Assyrian" with "letters described as resembling 'nails'" (a reference to cuneiform, evidently), resulting in the discovery that it had disappeared sometime in the past two decades.[42] I also cannot help but note the contrast between the emphasis here on good water and the image of an empire bounded by the Bitter River and Land of Thirst. The very existence of the stele carries significance, in any case, for Darius seems to have followed an earlier Assyrian practice of placing monuments at geographic extremities and boundaries (especially mountains, seashores, and riverbanks) as symbols of the king's reach to the edges of the earth.[43] The same symbolism perhaps

[41] Hdt. 4.91.2. On the possible locations of the Tearos: see Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 59-61. The "continent" (ἤπειρος) probably refers to Asia, judging by how Herodotus uses the term elsewhere (e.g., 1.96.1, 1.178.1., 6.33.1); see also How and Wells, *Commentary*, 1.334.

[42] For doubts about the contents of the stele: see e.g. Stephanie West, "Herodotus' Epigraphical Interests," *Classical Quarterly* 35, no. 2 (1985): 278-305 (296); Mihail Vasilescu, "Études sur la crédibilité d'Hérodote III. Les stèles de Darius de Thrace," *Arheologia Moldovei* 30 (2007): 117-127; Tuplin, "Scythian Expedition," 295. On Jochmus' attempt to locate the stele: see A. Jochmus, "Notes on a Journey into the Balkan, or Mount Haemus, in 1847," *Journal of the Royal Geographical Society of London* 24 (1854): 36-85 (43f.). For a later report on the possible discovery of the stele's base: see Eckhard Unger, "Die Dariusstele am Tearos," *Archäologischer Anzeiger* (1915): 3-16. A fragmentary Old Persian text found at Gherla, Romania might also relate in some way to Darius' monuments in Europe: see Rüdiger Schmitt, *Pseudo-altpersische Inschriften: Inschriftenfälschungen und moderne Nachbildungen in altpersischer Keilschrift* (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse, Sitzungsberichte 762; Veröffentlichungen zur Iranistik 39; Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2007), 62f.

[43] On the Assyrian monuments: see e.g. Hayim Tadmor, "World Dominion: The Expanding Horizon of the Assyrian State," in *Landscapes: Territories, Frontiers and Horizons in the Ancient Near East*, ed.

underlies the two marble stelae that Darius set up at his crossing point on the European side of the Bosporus, which recorded in "Assyrian" and Greek the names of the many peoples who formed his army.[44] In other words, these stelae may have demarcated Thrace as the border of the Persians' supposedly globe-encompassing empire.

We can glean further, indirect evidence for Skudra's ideological importance from the literary traditions that identify Thrace as a primary objective of previous world conquerors. These traditions smack of anti-Persian polemic, manifesting most clearly in Herodotus' account of how King Sesostris (an amalgamation of the second-millennium Pharaohs Senwosret I and Senwosret III) subdued the whole of Asia before defeating the Thracians and Scythians, a feat memorialized by the stelae that he left behind in Europe.[45] And the version of this legend preserved in the fragments of Manetho, a native Egyptian priest of the third century, limits the European campaign to just Thrace, as if to highlight the true target of his conquests.[46] A similar tale concerns Tearkon the Ethiopian, or Pharaoh

---

Lucio Milano et al. (History of the Ancient Near East Monographs 3/1; Padova: Sargon srl, 1999), 55-62 (56); Shigeo Yamada, *The Construction of the Assyrian Empire: A Historical Study of the Inscriptions of Shalmaneser III (859–824 B.C.) Relating to His Campaigns in the West* (Culture and History of the Ancient Near East 3; Leiden: Brill, 2000), 294f.; Karlsson, *Relations of Power*, 110-112.

[44] Hdt. 4.87.1. A recently published fragment of an Old Persian text (from Phanagoreia in the Cimmerian Bosporus) may have come from one of these stelae or another set up in the course of Darius' campaign: see Eduard Rung and Oleg Gabelko, "From Bosporus… to Bosporus: A New Interpretation and Historical Context of the Old Persian Inscription from Phanagoreia," *Iranica Antiqua* 54 (2019): 83-124; Ehsan Shavarebi, "An Inscription of Darius I from Phanagoria (DFa): Preliminary Report of a Work in Progress," *ARTA* 5 (2019): 1-15, http://www.achemenet.com/pdf/arta/ARTA_2019_005_Shavarebi.pdf; cf. Vladimir D. Kuznetsov and Alexander B. Nikitin, "An Old Persian Inscription from Phanagoria," *Ancient Civilizations from Scythia to Siberia* 25 (2019): 1-7.

[45] Hdt. 2.102-103; Alan B. Lloyd, *Herodotus, Book II* (Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'Empire romain 42; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1993), 16-21; Askold I. Invantchik, "Eine griechische Pseudo-Historie. Der Pharao Sesostris und der skytho-ägyptische Krieg," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 48, no. 4 (1999): 395-441 (397-407); Ian S. Moyer, "Herodotus and the Egyptian Mirage: The Genealogies of the Theban Priests," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 122 (2002): 70-90 (81f.).

[46] Manetho *BNJ* 609 F 2, 3a, 3b. Manetho's account may ultimately derive from Herodotus: see John Dillery, *Clio's Other Sons: Berossus and Manetho* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2015), 179f., 313f.; cf. also Ivantchik, "Sesostris," 439.

Taharqa (r. 690–664), who "led an army from Iberia to Thrace and Pontos" (ἐκ τῆς Ἰβηρίας εἰς τὴν Θράικην καὶ τὸν Πόντον ἀγαγεῖν τὴν στρατιάν), as Strabo reports on the authority of the early Seleukid historian Megasthenes.[47] None of these accounts have much basis in historical reality, of course, but they do appear to stem from efforts to preempt Darius' claims and actual accomplishments, thereby revealing how he may have publicly portrayed his Thracian foray.

It deserves mention that Xerxes staged a massive military review at Doriskos in Thrace, which involved the parading and enumeration of the various ethnic contingents within his army; Darius had possibly organized one too when he catalogued his forces for his two marble stelae on the Thracian Bosporus.[48] Reviews of this kind, in the words of Pierre Briant, "served mainly to demonstrate the immensity and diversity of the Great King's rule—comparable to the long lines of gift-bearing peoples who are represented on the stairs of the *apadana* (hall of audiences)."[49] The choice of Thrace as a venue owed to ideological considerations, perhaps, for its perceived liminality could have accentuated the sense of totality embodied in such displays of imperial pomp. By the same token, the bringing of Skudrian laborers into the interior of the empire—the subject of my next

[47] Megasthenes *BNJ* 715 F 11a (Strabo 15.1.6). On the possible sources and context of Megasthenes' claims: see Paul J. Kosmin, *The Land of the Elephant Kings: Space, Territory, and Ideology in the Seleucid Empire* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2014), 52, 270f. On the historical Pharaoh Taharqa: see K. A. Kitchen, *The Third Intermediate Period in Egypt (1100-650 BC)*, 2nd ed. with 1995 supplement (Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 1996), 387-393 §348-354.

[48] Hdt. 7.100. Xerxes held an earlier review at Abydos on the Hellespont (7.44).

[49] Pierre Briant, "The Achaemenid Empire," in *War and Society in the Ancient and Medieval Worlds: Asia, the Mediterranean, Europe and Mesoamerica*, ed. Kurt A. Raaflaub and Nathan Rosenstein (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 105-128 (119); see also idem, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 196-198; Krentz, *Battle of Marathon*, 31f.

section—would have shown the Great King's ability to mobilize resources from the far ends of the earth.[50]

Thracians in the Service of the Achaemenid Empire

Skudrians comprise the most frequently attested group of foreign laborers in the collection of 15,000–18,000 Persian administrative documents (the vast majority of them written in Elamite) known as the Persepolis Fortification tablets, all of which date between Darius' thirteenth and twenty-eighth regnal years (509–493).[51] These documents predominantly concern the storage and distribution of agricultural products in the wider region surrounding the ceremonial capital Persepolis, disclosing virtually nothing about the backgrounds and lives of these Skudrians, although they included, men, women, and children and seem to have resided in their own separate communities.[52] The largest concentration of Skudrians laborers appears in the Fahliyān area northwest of Persepolis—Henkelman and Stolper estimate their population at over a thousand—where they received rations of barley, flour, sesame, and beer, among other foodstuffs.[53] As the Persians customarily rewarded childbirth, extra beer went to postpartum mothers, with boys earning

[50] Cf. Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 177-179.

[51] For an overview of the Persepolis Fortification tablets: see Charles E. Jones and Matthew W. Stolper, "How Many Persepolis Fortification Tablets Are There?" in *L'archive des Fortifications de Persépolis: État des questions et perspectives de recherches*, ed. Pierre Briant et al. (Persika 12; Paris: Boccard, 2008), 27-50; Wouter F. M. Henkelman, "Administrative Realities: The Persepolis Archives and the Archaeology of the Achaemenid Heartland," in *The Oxford Handbook of Ancient Iran*, ed. D. T. Potts (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 528-546 (530-533).

[52] David M. Lewis, *Sparta and Persia* (Cincinnati Classical Studies, New Series 1; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977), 7; Hirsch, "Deportation of the Paeonians," 234f.; Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 292f.

[53] Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 309-312, 318-320.

double the amount for girls.[54] These children grew up to become laborers themselves, presumably.[55]

The bulk of the Skudrian workforce probably toiled away on the estates of the Achaemenid royal family and elites, engaged in such drudgery as cultivating fields, hauling grain, and tending livestock.[56] Among the seventy-eight archival references to Skudrians collated by Henkelman and Stolper, no less than fifty-four designate the Skudrians as *kurtaš*, "workers," and while their precise status remains somewhat uncertain, the nature of their activities indicates that it amounted to servitude.[57] To quote Briant, they "constituted an undifferentiated labor force that the administration intended to exploit unhindered," reflecting a system "much closer to slavery than the 'helot' type of rural dependency."[58] In addition, sixteen documents refer to Skudrian *puhu*, "servants" or "pages" (literally "boys"), whose more privileged status may have entitled them to positions in administration or in the entourages of high-ranking Persians.[59] Mentions of

[54] For the postnatal beer rations: see e.g. PF 1215, ed. Richard T. Hallock, *Persepolis Fortification Tablets* (University of Chicago Oriental Institute Publications 92; Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), 347. On the Persian practice of rewarding childbirth: see Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 435; Yazdan Safaee, "Achaemenid Women: Putting the Greek Image to Test," *Talanta* 48-49 (2016-2017): 101-132 (117f.). See also Amélie Kuhrt, "Women and War," *NIN: Journal of Gender Studies in Antiquity* 2 (2001): 1-26 (6-8).

[55] Cf. Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 437f.

[56] A. Uchitel, "Foreign Workers in the Fortification Archive," in *Mésopotamie et Elam: actes de la XXXVIème Rencontre assyriologique internationale, Gand, 10-14 juillet 1989* (MHE, Occasional Publications 1; Ghent: University of Ghent, 1991), 127-135 (130); Hirsch, "Deportation of the Paeonians," 235; Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 293.

[57] Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 316-322. On the status of the *kurtaš*: see Muhammad A. Dandamaev, *Slavery in Babylonia*, rev. ed., transl. Victoria A. Powell, ed. Marvin A. Powell and David B. Weisberg (DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1984), 572-584; idem and Vladimir G. Lukonin, *The Culture and Social Institutions of Ancient Iran*, transl. Philip L. Kohl with D. J. Dadson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 158-177; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 429-439.

[58] Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 439.

[59] For the Skudrian *puhu*: see Henkelman and Stolper, "Ethnic Identity," 292f., 309, 312f., 317, 321f. On the status of the *puhu*: see Grazia Giovinazzo, "I *'puhu'* nei testi di Persepoli. Nuove interpretazioni," *Annali dell'Istituto Universitario Orientale di Napoli* 55 (1995): 142-157, esp. 149-156;

Persian *puhu* copying texts suggest that some of their Skudrian counterparts may have also undergone scribal training.[60]

Both the *kurtaš* and the *puhu* likely faced violence or threats of violence as part of their daily hardships, judging from comparative evidence. Diodorus paints a particularly grim portrait of a group of Greek deportees encountered by Alexander the Great and his soldiers near Persepolis in 330:

> ἀπήντησαν γὰρ αὐτῷ μεθ' ἱκετηριῶν Ἕλληνες ὑπὸ τῶν πρότερον βασιλέων ἀνάστατοι γεγονότες, ὀκτακόσιοι μὲν σχεδὸν τὸν ἀριθμὸν ὄντες, ταῖς δ' ἡλικίαις οἱ πλεῖστοι μὲν γεγηρακότες, ἠκρωτηριασμένοι δὲ πάντες, οἱ μὲν χεῖρας, οἱ δὲ πόδας, οἱ δὲ ὦτα καὶ ῥῖνας· τῶν δ' ἐπιστήμας ἢ τέχνας εἰδότων καὶ ἐν παιδείᾳ προκεκοφότων τὰ μὲν ἄλλα τῶν ἀκρωτηρίων ἀπεκέκοπτο, αὐτὰ δὲ μόνα τὰ συνεργοῦντα πρὸς τὰς ἐπιστήμας ἀπελέλειπτο…[61]
>
> Greeks, ones who had been displaced by earlier kings, approached him (i.e., Alexander) with branches of supplication. Being around eight hundred in number, most were advanced in age, and all had been mutilated, some with respect to their hands, some their feet, some their ears and noses. After becoming acquainted with an expertise or craft and making progress in their training, the rest of their extremities had been amputated, leaving them only with what complemented their expertise…

Waldemar Heckel has dismissed this description as "fiction" filled with "dramatic purpose," and it seems likely that anti-Persian polemic at least played a role in its dissemination, yet history has illustrated, time and again, the willingness of empires or states to inflict cruelties on their own subjects (in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries of

---

Wouter Henkelman, "An Elamite Memorial: The Šumar of Cambyses and Hystaspes," in *A Persian Perspective. Essays in Memory of Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg*, ed. idem and Amélie Kuhrt (Achaemenid History 13; Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 2003), 101-172 (129-137).

[60] PF 871 and 1137, ed. Hallock, *Fortification Tablets*, 252, 330; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 924f. See also Amélie Kuhrt, "State Communications in the Persian Empire," in *State Correspondence in the Ancient World: From New Kingdom Egypt to the Roman Empire*, ed. Karen Radner (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 112-140 (129).

[61] Diod. 17.69.2-3; cf. also Curt. 5.5.5-7; Just. 11.14.11-12. These Greeks probably represented *kurtaš* as well: see Dandamaev and Lukonin, *Culture and Social Institutions*, 171; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 434, 735f.; idem, "Empire of Darius III," 167.

our era, for example, the Belgians maimed countless Congolese laborers for failing to meet rubber collection quotas).[62] In fact, an additional detail in Quintus Curtius Rufus' version—that the deportees bore brands "with the marks of barbarian letters" (*barbararum litterarum notis*)—lends to the authenticity of the account, seeing that it fits the longstanding ancient Near Eastern practice of branding or tattooing slaves and prisoners.[63] Had the Skudrians suffered the same treatment, one wonders whether the Thracians' supposed inclination for tattooing would have reduced any feelings of shame associated with the brands, for among the Thracians, Herodotus says, "having marks sets apart the well-born, while having no marks the low-born" (τὸ μὲν ἐστίχθαι εὐγενὲς κέκριται, τὸ δὲ ἄστικτον ἀγεννές).[64]

At any rate, the Greek deportees reportedly opted to stay in Persia despite Alexander's offer of repatriation, unwilling to leave behind their native wives and children, risk the dangers of a long journey home, and potentially find themselves unwelcome among their countrymen.[65] We can imagine that subsequent generations integrated further with the local population even if they continued to hold onto aspects of their heritage, as in the case of another "Greek" community in Persia mentioned by Diodorus, this one consisting

---

[62] Waldemar Heckel, *The Conquests of Alexander the Great* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 82. On the Achaemenid Empire's capacity for cruelty in a historical context: see e.g. Lewis, *Sparta and Persia*, 21f.; Thomas Harrison, *Writing Ancient Persia* (London: Bristol Classical Press, 2011), 66-68.

[63] Curt. 5.5.6. On the practice of branding in the ancient Near East: see Jones, "*Stigma*," 146f.; Matthew W. Stolper, "Inscribed in Egyptian," in *Studies in Persian History: Essays in Memory of David M. Lewis*, ed. Maria Brosius and Amélie Kuhrt (Achaemenid History 11; Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 1998), 133-143; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 458; Mallory Ditchey, "Body Language: Tattooing and Branding in Ancient Mesopotamia," *Journal of Ancient Near Eastern History* 3 (2017): 1-24.

[64] Hdt. 5.6.2. On tattooing among the Thracians: see Jones, "*Stigma*," 145f.; Mireille M. Lee, *Body, Dress, and Identity in Ancient Greece* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 84f. (with figures 3.16 and 3.17); Tsiafakis, "Thracian Tattoos," 89-117.

[65] Diod. 17.69.5-6; Curt. 5.5.8-24. For a thoughtful examination of these accounts from the perspective of disability studies: see M. Miles, "Segregated We Stand? The Mutilated Greeks' Debate at Persepolis, 330 BC," *Disability & Society* 18, no. 7 (2013): 865-879.

of descendants of Boiotians deported during Xerxes' reign.[66] The Skudrians may have experienced a similar situation without a regular influx of fresh blood from Thrace or Asia Minor.

Several scholars have speculated that the Skudrians of the Fortification tablets included the Paionians deported under Darius, but this contradicts Herodotus' testimony that the deportees inhabited their own village in Phrygia until returning to Thrace in late 498 or early 497 at the encouragement of Aristagoras, a chief instigator of the Ionian Revolt (the Persians, at this juncture, might have thought the Paionians more trouble than their worth, which would explain why the Paionians met no opposition after they crossed back into Europe).[67] As Gerassimos G. Aperghis has suggested, the initial impetus for the mass importation of foreign workers possibly lay in labor shortages arising from Darius' ambitious building projects and military campaigns.[68] Under such circumstances, the Persians would have had no reason to limit their pool of "Thracian" manpower to the Paionians alone. Nevertheless, the Paionians may very well have shared the privations of the *kurtaš* if their village stood on the property of some royal or nobleman, while many of

[66] Diod. 17.110.4-5. These Boiotians may have included the Thebans who surrendered at Thermopylae, whom Xerxes had branded with "royal marks" (στίγματα βασιλήια), according to Herodotus (7.233); cf. Jan P. Stronk, *Semiramis' Legacy: The History of Persia According to Diodorus of Sicily* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2017), 372 n180.

[67] Hdt. 5.98; Vasilev, *Policy of Darius and Xerxes*, 130. For the identification of the Paionians with the Skudrians: see e.g. Włodzimierz Pająkowski, "Einige Bemerkungen zur Lokalisierung der Persischen Provinz (Satrapie) Skudra," *Eos* 71 (1983): 243-255 (252); Jack Martin Balcer, *The Persian Conquest of the Greeks 545–450 B.C.* (Xenia 32; Konstanz: Universitätsverlag Konstanz, 1995), 152; Archibald, *Odrysian Kingdom*, 84; Tuplin, "Scythian Expedition," 298.

[68] Gerassimos G. Aperghis, "War Captives and Economic Exploitation: Evidence from the Persepolis Fortification Tablets," in *Economie antique: la guerre dans les économies antiques*, ed. Jean Andreau et al. (Entretiens d'archéologie et d'histoire 5; Saint-Bertrand-de-Comminges: Musée archéologique départemental, 2000), 127-144 (129).

the Skudrians near Persepolis had undoubtedly left their homelands as prisoners of war or captured "booty" like the Paionians.[69]

Of course, the Achaemenid Empire also called upon Thracians for military service. In Herodotus' colorful descriptions of the ethnic contingents assembled for Xerxes' review at Doriskos, the Bithynian Thracians wield javelins, small shields, and daggers while sporting fox pelts on their heads, multicolored *zeirai* (a type of Thracian cloak or mantle) over their tunics, and fawnskins for their legs and feet—equipment and clothing suitable for peltasts.[70] Besides these Thracians, Xerxes recruited from the European tribes that he passed by during his march down to Greece, with those along the coasts mustered into the navy and those inland into the army.[71] None of the ethnic contingents, however, feature in the accounts of the battles of the Greco-Persian Wars except Plataia, which leads Briant to interpret the Doriskos review as nothing more than an ideological statement about the diversity of the Great King's subjects.[72] But outside of reviews, the Persians may have simply dispersed the Thracians throughout the rest of the army, as happened on the journey from Asia and at Plataia according to Herodotus, or assigned them to non-frontline duties, like garrisoning fortresses and protecting the baggage train or supply depots.[73]

---

[69] See Dandamaev and Lukonin, *Culture and Social Institutions*, 169-171; Miroslav Izdimirski, "Deportiranite peontsi v Mala Aziya i persiĭskite tsarski stopanstva" [Deported Paionians in Asia Minor and Persian Royal Estates], *Thracia* 23 (2018): 181-188; idem, "Deportations of *Kurtaš* Workers in the Achaemenid Empire According to Classical Literary Tradition," *Živa Antika* 68 (2018): 51-64.

[70] Hdt. 7.75; J. G. P. Best, *Thracian Peltasts and Their Influence on Greek Warfare* (Studies of the Dutch Archaeological and Historical Society 1; Groningen: Wolters-Noordhoff, 1969), 7f. On *zeirai*: see Lee, *Body, Dress, and Identity*, 124-126.

[71] Hdt. 7.110, 7.115.2, 7.185.2.

[72] Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 195-197; idem, "Achaemenid Empire," 119; cf. also Andrew R. Burn, *Persia and the Greeks: The Defence of the West, c. 546–478 B.C.* (London: Edward Arnold, 1962), 325f.; J. M. Cook, *The Persian Empire* (New York: Schocken Books, 1983), 103f.

[73] Hdt. 7.40.1, 9.32.1; cf. J. F. Lazenby, *The Defence of Greece 490–479 B.C.* (Warminister: Aris and Philips, 1993), 92; Balcer, *Persian Conquest*, 241.

Cyrus the Younger also employed Thracians during his unsuccessful bid to seize the Persian throne from his brother Artaxerxes II (r. 405/404–359/358). Although Xenophon refers only to eight hundred Thracian peltasts and around forty Thracian horsemen under the Spartan mercenary commander Klearchos (whose close relationship to Cyrus actually resembled that of a client to patron), Cyrus' personal levies from his satrapy of Greater Phrygia would almost certainly have included Thracians of Asia Minor as well.[74] In fact, that Klearchos' Thracians might have represented contributions from the Odrysians due to their own ties of dependence with Cyrus, as Miroslav Izdmirski proposes. He cites two pieces of evidence in support of this hypothesis: first, the officer in charge of these Thracians, Miltokythes, may correspond to a pretender by the same name who rose against the Odrysian king Kotys I in the 360s; and second, the epilogue to the *Anabasis* (likely an interpolation, but perhaps deriving from Xenophon's notes) lists Seuthes I among the Achaemenid Empire's governors, with his jurisdiction specified as "over the Thracians in Europe" (τῶν ἐν Εὐρώπῃ Θρᾳκῶν).[75] We know, at least, that the earlier Milkothyes defected to Artaxerxes II after Cyrus' death at Cunaxa in 401, bringing with him three hundred forty of his Thracians.[76]

---

[74] Xen. *Anab.* 1.2.9, 1.5.13, 2.2.7. Cyrus seems to have drawn troops from nearly all of Asia Minor: see Diod. 14.19.6-7; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 620. Note that in Herodotus' list of satrapies, he groups the Thracians of Asia together with the Phrygians, Paphlagonians, Mariandynians, and Syrians (3.90.2). On Cyrus' client-patron network: see Sean Manning, "A Prosopography of the Followers of Cyrus the Younger," *Ancient History Bulletin* 32, no. 1-2 (2018): 1-24 (12-16); Jeffrey Rop, *Greek Military Service in the Ancient Near East, 401–330 BCE* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019), 70-77.

[75] Xen. *Anab.* 2.2.7, 7.8.25; Miroslav Izdimirski, "Trakite v armiyata na Kir Mladi" [Thracians in the Army of Cyrus the Younger], *Thracia* 21 (2016): 7-15 (11-13). On the epilogue to the *Anabasis*: see further Otto Lendle, *Kommentar zu Xenophons Anabasis (Bücher 1-7)* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1995), 486f. The rarity of the name Μιλτοκύθης, at only three documented attestations (see *OnomThrac*, 222 s.v. *Μιλτοκύθης*, Μελτοκυθης), perhaps strengthens the equation of the two Miltokytheses.

[76] Xen. *Anab.* 7.8.25.

In 400, Bithynian Thracians fought alongside Persian forces sent by Pharnabazos, the satrap of Hellespontine Phrygia, to assist them against the ravaging Ten Thousand and ultimately prevent the Greeks from entering Phrygia.[77] Xenophon claims, however, that when the Spartan Derkylidas launched his own expedition in Bithynia the following year, it prompted little irritation from Pharnabazos, "for the Bithynians were frequently at war with him" (πολλάκις γὰρ οἱ Βιθυνοὶ αὐτῷ ἐπολέμουν).[78] That the Bithynians managed to retain a degree of independence also seems clear in Photios' summary of a history by Memnon of Herakleia, which mentions the Bithynian dynast Doidalses, who reigned in the second half of the fifth century, his successor Boteiras, who held power for seventy-six years, and Boteiras' son Bas, who fended off a Macedonian incursion led by Alexander's general Kalas.[79] And notably, we have no record of Darius III utilizing Thracian troops (whether from Bithynia or Phrygia) in his conflict with Alexander, though Phrygians purportedly fought at Gaugamela.[80]

The Coming of the Hanaeans

A number of Babylonian cuneiform texts from the late-Achaemenid and Hellenistic periods refer to "Hanaeans" (^{lú}*Ḫa-ni-i*) and "land of the Hanaeans" (^{kur}*Ḫa-ni-i*), often in

[77] Ibid. 6.4.24, 6.5.30; see also Stronk, *Ten Thousand in Thrace*, 100f.; Frédéric Maffre, "Indigenous Aristocracies in Hellespontine Phrygia," in *Persian Responses: Political and Cultural Interaction with(in) the Achaemenid Empire*, ed. Christopher Tuplin (Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2007), 117-141 (121).

[78] Xen. *Hell.* 3.2.2.

[79] Memnon *FGrH/BNJ* 434 F 1 §12.4 (Phot. *Bibl*. 224.226a); see also Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 699. On Memnon of Herakleia: see Burstein, *Outpost of Hellenism*, 3f.; Daniela Dueck, "Memnon of Herakleia on Rome and the Romans," in *Rome and the Black Sea Region*, 43-61 (44-50).

[80] For the Phrygians at Gaugamela: see Curt. 4.12.11; Richard A. Billows, *Antigonos the One-Eyed and the Creation of the Hellenistic State* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), 44 n82; Maffre, "Indigenous Aristocracies," 121.

connection to the Macedonians and Greeks, though the name "Hanaeans" originally belonged a second-millennium people from the Middle Euphrates region of Mesopotamia. Consensus takes the later occurrences of "land of the Hanaeans" as "a metaphor of Macedon, or by extension Greeks and Macedonians," to quote Bert van der Spek, and this appears quite justified at first glance; indeed, the Babylonian astronomical diaries (records of daily celestial phenomena and terrestrial events) contain an entry dated to "year 8 of Alexander (i.e., 328), the king who is from the land of the Hanaeans" (mu 8.kám ^{I}*A-le*[*k-sa-a*]*n-dar-ri-is* LUGAL *šá* TA *mat Ḫa-ni-i*).[81] Moreover, two fragmentary works, one a chronicle and the other an enigmatic prophecy, mention "troops of the Hanaeans" (^{lú}érin *Ḫa-né-i*) and "troops of the land of the Hanaeans" (^{lú}érin$^{meš\ kur}$*Ḫa-ni-i*), respectively, within the context of the war between Alexander and Darius III.[82] Hanaean troops likewise surface in a fragmentary chronicle that covers the events of Alexander's final year.[83] In each of these cases, substituting "Hanaeans" with "Macedonians" or even "Greeks and Macedonians" would not create any discernible contradictions.

[81] Robartus J. van der Spek, "Darius III, Alexander the Great and Babylonian Scholarship," in *Persian Perspective*, 289-346 (305); Abraham J. Sachs and Hermann Hunger, *Astronomical Diaries and Related Texts from Babylonia*, vol. 1 (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse 195; Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1988), 185-191 (no. -324, left edge).

[82] For various editions of the chronicle: see *ABC* 8, obv. line 6, ed. A. Kirk Grayson, *Assyrian and Babylonian Chronicles* (Locust Valley: J. J. Augustin, 1975); *MC* 9, line 6', ed. Jean-Jacques Glassner, *Mesopotamian Chronicles*, ed. Benjamin R. Foster (Writings from the Ancient World 19; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2004); van der Spek, "Darius III," 301-310 (no. 3 obv. line 6'); *BCHP* 1, line 6, ed. Irving Finkel and Robartus J. van der Spek, *Babylonian Chronicles of the Hellenistic Period*, http://www.livius.org/sources/about/mesopotamian-chronicles. For the prophecy (generally known as the "Dynastic Prophecy"): see A. K. Grayson, *Babylonian Historical-Literary Texts* (Toronto Semitic Texts and Studies 3; Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975), 28-37 (col. iii, line 9); van der Spek, "Darius III," 311-324 (no. 5, col. iii, line 9).

[83] *BCHP* 2, line 4'.

Some scholars push this line of interpretation further, arguing that "Hanaeans" also conveyed the image of "radically alien" or "barbarians" among the Babylonians.[84] According to Amélie Kuhrt, for instance, Babylonians traditionally viewed the Hanaeans as nomads who, in terms of Mesopotamian conceptions of geography, existed outside the bounds of civilization, in "the far-off region beyond the 'Cedar Mountain' to the north-west… on one of the far-off edges of the universe," thereby casting them in the mold of "unruly trouble-makers," "nomadic hordes," and "sacrilegious pillagers" down through the ages.[85] Hence, from the perspective of Babylonian scribes in the late-fourth century and after, the Macedonians and Greeks followed in the destructive footsteps of the earlier Hanaeans. This hostility toward the Macedonians and Greeks seemingly underlies an account of the invasion of Mesopotamia and siege of Babylon undertaken by Ptolemy III of Egypt in 246/245, since it describes the attackers, or at least an element of them, as "troops of the Hanaeans who do not fear the gods" ([^{l}]^{ú}[érin$^{meš\ kur}$]*Ḫa-ni-i* [*šá l*]*a a-dir* dingir^{meš}).[86]

This understanding of "Hanaeans" rests upon faulty premises, however. As Stephanie Dalley points out in response to Kuhrt, the eighth-century text known as the *Sargon Geography*, which presents an Assyrian conception of imperial space, "seems to

[84] For "radically alien": see Francis Joannès, "Le monde occidental vu de Mésopotamie, de l'époque néo-babylonienne à l'époque hellénistique," *Transeuphratène* 13 (1997): 141-153 (150f.). For "barbarians": see Amélie Kuhrt, *'Greeks' and 'Greece' in Mesopotamian and Persian Perspectives* (The Twenty-First J. L. Myres Memorial Lecture; Oxford: Leopard's Head Press, 2002), 25-27.

[85] Kuhrt, *'Greeks' and 'Greece'*, 14, 25.

[86] *BCHP* 1, obv. line 6; see also Haubold, *Greece and Mesopotamia*, 134f.; idem, "Hellenism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Role of the Babylonian Elites in the Seleucid Empire," in *Cosmopolitanism and Empire: Universal Rulers, Local Elites, and Cultural Integration in the Ancient Near East and Mediterranean*, ed. Myles Lavan et al. (Oxford Studies in Early Empires; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 89-101 (98); Stanley M. Burstein, "Ptolemy III and the Dream of Reuniting Alexander's Empire," *Ancient History Bulletin* 30, no. 3-4 (2016): 77-86 (84).

imply that the far border of Hana, viewed from central Mesopotamia, is the Cedar Mountain, not the reverse," while the Hanaeans of the second millennium had established "a literate, urbanised and well-organised kingdom… Hardly barbarians, therefore, in the eyes of Mesopotamians."[87] And although second-millennium sources do associate the Hanaeans with pastoralism or nomadism, nothing suggests that their purported way of life somehow made them incompatible with "civilization."[88] Wolfgang Heimpel observes, on the contrary, that the Hanaeans enjoyed a reputation as "experienced outdoor people and highly valued soldiers," who "could deal with lions where urbanites failed and found the tastiest locusts for the royal table in faraway locations," and whose "military prowess is documented frequently and clearly."[89] Finally, in its most generic sense (when not referring to the historical people), "Hanaeans" simply meant "nomads" or "pastoralists."[90]

---

[87] Stephanie Dalley, review of *'Greeks' and 'Greece' in Mesopotamian and Persian Perspectives*, by Amélie Kuhrt, *Ancient West and East* 3, no. 2 (2004): 430f.; see also Horowitz, *Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography*, 79f., 93. For the text of the *Sargon Geography*: see A. K. Grayson, "The Empire of Sargon of Akkad," *Archiv für Orientforschung* 25 (1974/1977): 56-64; Horowitz, *Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography*, 68-75.

[88] See Daniel E. Fleming, "Kingship of City and Tribe Conjoined: Zimri-Lim at Mari," in *Nomads, Tribes, and the State in the Ancient Near East: Cross-Disciplinary Perspectives*, ed. Jeffrey Szuchman (Oriental Institute Seminars 5; Chicago: Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2009), 227-240 (236): "As a whole, the Mari archives of King Zimri-Lim show one configuration by which mobile pastoralists, the population that we come to regard as 'nomads,' could be integrated into a political network that included settlement-based kingdoms… [T]he herding communities of early second-millennium Mesopotamia could participate in regional politics at every level without binding themselves irrevocably to the definition of power by city-based kingdoms."

[89] Wolfgang Heimpel, *Letters to the King of Mari: A New Translation, with Historical Introduction, Notes, and Commentary* (Mesopotamian Civilizations 12; Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2003), 29.

[90] Ibid., 35f., with reference to Jean-Marie Durand, "Unité et diversité au Proche-Orient à l'époque amorrite," in *La circulation des biens, des personnes et des idées dans le Proche-Orient ancien: actes de la XXXVIIIe Rencontre assyriologique internationale, Paris, 8-10 juillet 1991*, ed. Dominique Charpin and Francis Joannès (Paris: Editions Recherche sur les civilisations, 1992), 97-128; Ohnishi Tsuneyuki, "Mari bunsho ni okeru ḫa.na no kaishaku o megutte" ["ḫa.na" in Mari Texts: An Examination], *Bulletin of the Society for Near Eastern Studies in Japan* 50 (2007): 1-19.

If the later usage of "Hanaeans" lacks any overtly pejorative connotations, we must then ask why the Babylonian scribes did not call the Macedonians and Greeks by their proper names. In fact, one of the abovementioned chronicles contains a probable reference to the "land of Macedonia" ([k]urMa-akꞱ-ka-du-nu) in addition to the "land of the Hanaeans," and another chronicle refers to both Hanaeans and a Greek, although the poor conditions of these texts leave the contexts uncertain, unfortunately.[91] A fragmentary chronicle from the early-third century also relates how Seleukos I (r. 305–281), in his final campaign, set out "to the land of Macedonia, his land" (*ana* kur*Ma-ak-ka-du-nu* kur-*šú*), as opposed to the "land of Hanaeans" that Alexander came from according to the astronomical diary entry.[92] The account cuts off before presumably describing Seleukos' assassination in Thrace in 281, yet a second-century Babylonian king list does report the location of his death: "Year 31 (of the Seleukid Era), month of Ulūlu, Se<leukos> the King was killed in the land of the Hanaeans" (mu 31.kám Kin ⁱ*Si* LUGAL *ina* kur *Ḫa-ni-i* ga[z]).[93] This detail led A. Kirk Grayson to equate the "land of the Hanaeans" with Thrace, an idea that merits further consideration.[94]

---

[91] For the reference to Macedonia: see *BCHP* 1, rev. line 13'; van der Spek, "Darius III," 301-310 (no. 3, rev. line 13'). For the reference to Hanaeans and Greeks: see *MC* 36, obv. line 11, rev. line 5; *BCHP* 7, obv. line 12, rev. lines 3 and 5; cf. *ABC* 13a, rev. line 5. An astronomical diary entry composed shortly after the Battle of Gaugamela also mentions "Ionians" (lú*Ia-ma-na-a-a*), i.e. Greeks: see Sachs and Hunger, *Astronomical Diaries*, 176-179 (no. -330, rev. line 9).

[92] *ABC* 12, rev. line 3; *MC* 33, rev. line 3'; *BCHP* 9, rev. line 3'; cf. also Pierre Briant, "De Samarkhand à Sardes et de la ville de Suse au pays des Hanéens," *Topoi* 4, no. 2 (1994): 455-467 (463-466). Cf. Photios' summary of Memnon (*FGrH/BNJ* 434 F 1 §8.1 [= Phot. *Bibl*. 224.226a]): "Seleukos… was eager to cross over to Macedonia, having a longing for his fatherland…" (Σέλευκος… εἰς τὴν Μακεδονίαν διαβαίνειν ὥρμητο, πόθον ἔχων τῆς πατρίδος…).

[93] *MC* 4, line 8. On the king list: see further A. Kirk Grayson, "Königslisten und Chroniken," in *Reallexikon der Assyriologie und Vorderasiatischen Archäologie*, vol. 6, ed. Dietz O. Edzard (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1980-1983), 86-135 (98-100); Tom Boiy, "The Reigns of the Seleucid Kings According to the Babylonian King List," *Journal of Near Eastern Studies* 70 (2011): 1-12, esp. 2.

[94] *ABC*, 256 s.v. Hanu; Grayson, *Babylonian Historical-Literary Texts*, 4.

Although I would not go as far as to suggest a one-to-one equivalency between the "land of the Hanaeans" and Thrace, I do think it possible that both evoked the image of the earth's edges in the minds of the Babylonian scribes, given how the *Sargon Geography* appears to situate the Hanaeans, albeit anachronistically, before its northernmost geographic point, the Cedar Mountain (apparently signifying the mountains northwest of Mesopotamia, from which the Euphrates flows, and past which lay the "cosmic sea" that encircled the terrestrial world), and how Achaemenid imperial ideology appears to treat Thrace as a boundary of the global empire, as I proposed earlier in this chapter.[95] The Thracians may have also resembled the second-millennium Hanaeans to a superficial extent—not so much in having pastoralist lifestyles, perhaps, but rather in their perceived martial ability and closeness to nature (the Thracians in Xerxes' army, we can recall, supposedly covered their heads, legs, and feet with animal skins).[96] Thus, even if it did not strictly mean "Thrace," the "land of the Hanaeans" might have embodied concepts that the Babylonian scribes, under the influence of the Persians, associated at the time with what we would define as Thrace.

The identification of Alexander as a "king who is from land of the Hanaeans" could allude to several different things, in this regard. Alexander's realm did include a significant

[95] On the Cedar Mountain as one of the edges of the earth in Assyrian royal ideology: see Mehmet-Ali Ataç, "'Imaginal' Landscapes in Assyrian Imperial Monuments," in *Experiencing Power, Generating Authority: Cosmos, Politics, and the Ideology of Kingship in Ancient Egypt and Mesopotamia*, ed. Jane A. Hill et al. (Penn Museum International Research Conferences 6; Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, 2013), 383-423 (388, 392); cf. also Mario Liverani, "The Sargon Geography and the Late Assyrian Mensuration of the Earth," *State Archives of Assyria Bulletin* 13 (1999-2001): 57-85.

[96] Agriculture and pastoralism coexisted in Thrace, despite Herodotus' claim that the Thracians despised those who worked the soil (5.6.2): see Archibald, *Ancient Economies*, 181-183.

portion of Thrace, of course, and he had indeed marched out from there when he began his campaign in 334, having crossed the Bosporus at Sestos on the Thracian Chersonesos (whence Darius I had likewise returned to Asia after his Scythian expedition).[97] On an ideological level, the emphasis on Alexander's remote place of origin might also underscore, symbolically, the overturning of the old political order as the Achaemenid Empire lost its claim to global rule. But the simplest explanation lies in Thrace's geographical proximity to Asia and its status as the only part of Europe that the Persians had occupied long-term, which would have made the Thracian "Hanaeans" more recognizable to the scribes than the Macedonians, at least from the standpoint of prior historical and geographical knowledge. Analogously to how Babylonian, Persian, and other Near Eastern sources call all Greeks "Ionians," the Babylonians may have seen Alexander's Macedonia as an extension or subdivision of the "land of the Hanaeans."[98]

In short, the evidence does not quite bear out the assumption that the occurrences of "Hanaeans" in late-Achaemenid and Hellenistic Babylonian sources represent specific metaphors for Macedonians, much less "barbarians," "unruly trouble-makers," "nomadic hordes," or "sacrilegious pillagers" from the distant reaches of the universe. Rather, as the Persian conquest of Thrace expanded the ideological conception of what constituted a

[97] Arr. *Anab.* 1.11.5. On the Macedonian conquest of Thrace: see e.g. N. G. L. Hammond and G. T. Griffith, *A History of Macedonia*, vol. 2 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1979), 264-285, 554-581; N. G. L. Hammond and F. W. Walbank, *A History of Macedonia*, vol. 3 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988), 32-39. On Darius' return to Asia: see Hdt. 4.143.1; Briant, *From Cyrus to Alexander*, 146.

[98] On the use of "Ionians" in Near Eastern texts: see e.g. Amélie Kuhrt, "Greek Contact with the Levant and Mesopotamia in the First Half of the First Millennium BC: A View from the East," in *Greek Settlements in the Eastern Mediterranean and the Black Sea*, ed. Gocha R. Tsetskhladze and A. M. Snodgrass (BAR International Series 1062; Oxford: Archaeopress, 2002), 17-25; Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg, "*Yaunā* by the Sea and across the Sea," in *Ancient Perceptions of Greek Ethnicity*, ed. Irad Malkin (Washington, D.C.: Center for Hellenic Studies, 2001), 323-346 (331).

"world" empire, the "land of the Hanaeans" shifted accordingly from its previously designated location on the earth's edge, transforming "Hanaeans" into an expression for the peoples across the Bosporus. This suggests, in turn, that "troops of the Hanaeans" could comprise not just Macedonians and Greeks but also Thracians, substantial numbers of whom served in the armies of Alexander and the Hellenistic kings, as my next chapter explores in greater detail.

How the Babylonian truly felt about the Thracians remains impossible to determine. We certainly need not conclude that the characterization of the Ptolemaic "troops of the Hanaeans who do not fear the gods" reflects a generally negative outlook, for another fragmentary chronicle mentions "Hanaeans whom the king [stationed] to reinforce the guard" ([^{lú}]*Ḫa-ni-i šá* LUGAL *ana du-nun* EN.NUN *ina bi-rit*) in a plainly neutral context, with these Hanaeans forming part of the "troops of the king" (^{lú}érin^{meš} LUGAL) under Alexander's half-brother and successor Philip III Arrhidaios (r. 323–317).[99] Nevertheless, the integration of Thrace into a preexisting paradigm for liminal space (i.e., the land of the Hanaeans), as well as the violent circumstances surrounding the arrival of the "king who is from the land of the Hanaeans" and his Hanaean soldiers, strengthen the prospect that the Babylonians would have viewed Thracians as quintessential "others," though "others" does not necessarily mean "barbarians" or the like. At the minimum, "Hanaeans" seems more laden with cultural and historical overtones than "Macedonians" and "Ionians."

[99] *ABC* 10, obv. lines 14 and 17; *MC* 30, obv. lines 14' and 17'; *BCHP* 3, obv. lines 33 {14'} and 36 {17'}; cf. also Tom Boiy, "Royal and Satrapal Armies in Babylonia during the Second Diadoch War. The *Chronicle of the Successors* on the Events during the Seventh Year of Philip Arrhidaeus (=317/316 BC)," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 130 (2010): 1-13 (7-10).

Conclusion

Although our sources present many interpretive challenges, I have argued in this chapter for the likelihood that Achaemenid royal inscriptions do refer to Thracians as Skudrians and that they formed an important element within the Persian kings' ideological claims about the extent of their domain and power. In my view, moreover, the Persians' conception of the Thracians included peoples of Asia Minor whom Greeks also regarded as Thracians or descendants of Thracian. Accordingly, continued Persian control over Asia Minor, along with the recruitment of Thracian soldiers and the presence of Thracian *kurtaš* communities in the Iranian heartland, would have helped sustain the illusion of Persian rule "across the sea" well after the Achaemenid Empire lost the last of its European holdings around the middle of the fifth century.

I have further argued that the Hanaeans mentioned in Babylonian texts from the final years of the Achaemenid Empire also relate to how Babylonians saw Thrace and the Thracians. Since the name "Hanaeans" seems to have evoked a sense of liminality and otherness, Babylonian writers may have thought it appropriate to associate the Hanaeans with Alexander and his invading army, which did contain, in fact, a significant Thracian component. In the next chapter, I examine these soldiers in greater detail and explore the subsequent history of Thracian military service and settlement in the Hellenistic East.

Chapter 5

Thracians in the Hellenistic East

Introduction

When Alexander the Great invaded the Achaemenid Empire in 334 BCE, he brought with him several thousand Thracian soldiers—a byproduct, no doubt, of his and his father Philip II's campaigns in Thrace over the preceding two decades, which had witnessed the subjugation and apparent vassalization of the Odrysian Kingdom.[1] A portion of Alexander's Thracians eventually resettled in places as far away as Bactria-Sogdiana and Gandhara, and they represented the first among many of their countrymen to find themselves transplanted to the "East" (including Egypt) in connection to their military service under Greek and Macedonian kings. Yet despite their separation from their homeland, I hope to show that these Thracians, as a whole, enjoyed more opportunities for social, economic, and political advancement than the ones we have previously investigated, owing to the conditions brought about by Alexander's conquest of the Achaemenid Empire, the rise of the Successor states in the East, and the endemic warfare that pervaded the three centuries of the Hellenistic era. In their collective plight as foreign interlopers surrounded by much larger native populations, Thracians, Greeks, and Macedonians appear to have developed what the late Jean Bingen (in a short article on Thracians in Ptolemaic Egypt) described as a sense of "mutual solidarity," and such solidarity, as I explore further in this

[1] For a historical overview: see e.g. Peter Delev, "Thrace from the Assassination of Kotys I to Koroupedion (360–281 BCE)," in *Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 48-58 (48-52). Aliénor Rufin Solas has argued that large-scale integration of Thracians into the Macedonian army began under Philip II, although her evidence (on which, see further below) comes almost entirely from the time of Alexander ("Philippe II de Macédoine, l'argent et la guerre: les recrutements de guerriers thraces," *Revue des Études Grecques* 127 [2014]: 75-96, esp. 90-92).

chapter, allowed Thracians to take advantage of their "Thracianness" on a more systematic level than ever before.[2]

Bingen was not the first to suggest that military service in the East elevated the Thracians' stature in the eyes of Greeks and Macedonians. In his classic study *The Mercenaries of the Hellenistic World* (1935), G. T. Griffith already wrote that a "renaissance of the Thracians as a power in Greek armies" had "helped Alexander to conquer the East" and that they had "an important role as auxiliaries in the principal Hellenistic armies."[3] Decades later, Marcel Launey's monumental, posthumously published *Recherches sur les armées hellénistiques* (1949–1950) noted the sheer number of Thracian soldiers attested in our sources, placing them among "the bearers of Hellenic culture" who kept Hellenism alive in the East in the face of demographic pressures from indigenous populations.[4] Unfortunately, both Griffith and Launey operated within an older scholarly tradition that interpreted the Hellenistic period as a story of overall decline for Greek civilization; Launey, in particular, attempted to demonstrate through demographic analyses the supposedly pernicious effects of "mixed marriages" and "racial alterations" upon Europeans in the Hellenistic East.[5] In no small measure, his labeling of the Thracians

---

[2] Jean Bingen, "The Thracians in Ptolemaic Egypt," in *Hellenistic Egypt: Monarchy, Society, Economy, Culture*, ed. Roger S. Bagnall (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 83-93 (92), originally published as "Les Thrace en Égypte ptolémaïque," *Pulpudeva* 4 (1983): 72-79.

[3] G. T. Griffith, *The Mercenaries of the Hellenistic World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1935), 253. Griffith regarded all "professional" soldiers as mercenaries, which seems an overly broad definition: see Matthew Trundle, *Greek Mercenaries: From the Late Archaic Period to Alexander* (London: Routledge, 2004), 21-24.

[4] Marcel Launey, *Recherches sur les armées hellénistiques*, 2 vols. (Paris: Boccard, 1949–1950; reprint, 1987), 1.18. Even earlier, Fritz Heichelheim's *Die auswärtige Bevölkerung im Ptolemäerreich* (Klio Beiheft 18; Leipzig: Dietrich'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1925) recorded a large number of Thracians in Egypt using a relatively small body of papyrological data, though he did not accord them much importance.

[5] Launey, *Armées*, 2.1089, and more generally, the preface. Griffith believed, on the other hand, that emigration to the East led to the "depopulation and race-exhaustion" of Greece (*Mercenaries*, 321f.).

as "bearers of Hellenic culture" reflects a perceived dichotomy between colonizers and colonized, in which Thracians must belong to the former by virtue of their historical and "racial" ties with Europe.

This dichotomy, minus the racial overtones, has remained mostly intact in the literature on the Hellenistic era that has emerged since the 1970s under the influence of postcolonial studies.[6] Emphasizing the enormous gulfs that separated colonizers from colonized and the fundamentally exploitative nature of Greco-Macedonian imperialism, the postcolonial approach conceptualizes the Hellenistic world in terms of "the coexistence of two largely autonomous socio-cultural entities, even if there are noticeable areas of osmosis, such as religion, and even transitional zones from one group to another," to quote Bingen.[7] Conveniently for this model, the Thracians in Ptolemaic Egypt seemed to Bingen thoroughly Hellenized, which situates them clearly within the "Alexandrian royal system" and "Hellenophone power structure."[8] Yet scholarship in more recent years has widened our understanding of those "transitional zones," underlining the limitations and flexibility of the "Hellenophone power structure" and complicating earlier assumptions about what

[6] The postcolonial approach to the Hellenistic period appears to have started with Claire Préaux's *Le monde hellénistique: La Grèce et l'Orient de la mort d'Alexandre à la conquête romaine de la Grèce (323-146 av. J.-C.)*, 2 vols. (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1978). For other studies in this vein: see e.g. Édouard Will, "Pour une 'anthropologie coloniale' du monde hellénistique," in *The Craft of the Ancient Historian: Essays in Honor of Chester G. Starr*, ed. John W. Eadie and Josiah Ober (Lanham: University Press of America, 1985), 273-302; Peter Green, *From Alexander to Actium: The Historical Evolution of the Hellenistic Age* (Hellenistic Culture and Society 1; Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990).

[7] Jean Bingen, "Greek Economy and Egyptian Society in the Third Century," in *Hellenistic Egypt*, 215-228 (216), originally published as "Économie grecque et société égyptienne au IIIe siècle," in *Das ptolemaïsche Ägypten*, ed. Herwig Maehler and Volker M. Strocka (Mainz: Philipp von Zabern, 1978), 211-219.

[8] Idem, "Thracians in Ptolemaic Egypt," 92.

membership in it actually entailed on a practical, day-to-day basis.[9] As we will see, Thracians did benefit from their ties with the Greco-Macedonian ruling class, but this also meant sharing in the same sorts of cultural compromises with the native populations of the East that had allowed Greco-Macedonian rule to take hold there in the first place.

Jews of the Hellenistic diaspora offer another potential model for examining the Thracians' experiences in the Hellenistic East, although Jews evidently stood below Thracians within the theoretical "hegemonic ethnic hierarchies" (to borrow a formulation from Philip A. Harland) imposed by the Greeks and Macedonians.[10] Indeed, some have observed distinct parallels between how Jews and Thracians expressed their identities through onomastic practices, the use of ethnics, and participation in ethnic-based organizations, even as both groups embraced many of the trappings of Hellenistic Greek culture.[11] This fits well with Erich Gruen's argument that the "heterogeneous society of the Hellenistic world" facilitated reflection on and cultivation of identity, encouraging Jews

[9] For this "hybridity" approach: see e.g. Susan Sherwin-White and Amélie Kuhrt, *From Samarkhand to Sardis: A New Approach to the Seleucid Empire* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993); J. G. Manning, *The Last Pharaohs: Egypt Under the Ptolemies, 305–30 BC* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010). Unfortunately, this approach has sometimes downplayed the very real ethno-based power disparities that existed at the heart of the Hellenistic states in the East: see now the pushback by Rolf Strootman, *Courts and Elites in the Hellenistic Empires: The Near East After the Achaemenids, c. 300 to 30 BCE* (Edinburg: Edinburgh University Press, 2014), 8-10, 124-126; Paul J. Kosmin, *Time and Its Adversaries in the Seleucid Empire* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2018), 7f.

[10] On the Jews' position within these ethnic hierarchies and the strategies that they employed to improve their standing: see Philip A. Harland, "Climbing the Ethnic Ladder: Ethnic Hierarchies and Judean Responses," *Journal of Biblical Literature* 138, no. 3 (2019): 665-686.

[11] See esp. Koen Goudriaan, "Ethnical Strategies in Graeco-Roman Egypt," in *Ethnicity in Hellenistic Egypt*, ed. Per Bilde et al. (Studies in Hellenistic Civilization 3; Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 1992), 74-99; Sylvie Honigman, "The Birth of a Diaspora: The Emergence of a Jewish Self-Definition in Ptolemaic Egypt in the Light of Onomastics," in *Diasporas in Antiquity*, ed. Shaye J. D. Cohen and Enrest S. Frerichs (Brown Judaic Studies 288; Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1994), 93-127; idem, "The Ptolemaic and Roman Definitions of Social Categories and the Evolution of Judean Communal Identity in Egypt," in *Jewish and Christian Communal Identities in the Roman World*, ed. Yair Furstenberg (Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity 94; Leiden: Brill, 2016), 25-74.

and other peoples "to articulate their special qualities with reference to the dominant culture, but without succumbing to it."[12] Similarly, in the case of the Thracians, while solidarity with the Greco-Macedonian ruling class may have shaped the ways in which their identity outwardly manifested, it need not have compelled them to abandon any basic feelings of "Thracianness"—a possibility that the simple colonizers-colonized binarism tends to obscure.

Aside from the Jews, non-Greek and non-Macedonian foreigners have rarely featured as independent subjects of inquiry in the literature on the Hellenistic East except with respect to the ethnic composition of Hellenistic armies, for which Launey's study (now over seventy years old) remains unsurpassed in the scope of its coverage.[13] This neglect has not gone unnoticed; in a very recent article, Csaba A. La'da comments on the "surprising finding" that Thracians represent one of the most frequently attested immigrant groups in Ptolemaic Egypt, a fact belied by the far greater interest that scholars have shown for the smaller Jewish community.[14] At the same time, some claim that ethnic identifiers like "Thracian," when used in Hellenistic military contexts, eventually became "pseudo-ethnics" with no bearing on soldiers' actual backgrounds, perhaps signifying instead the

[12] Erich S. Gruen, "Cultural Fictions and Cultural Identity," *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 123 (1993): 1-14 (14); cf. also John J. Collins, "Hellenistic Judaism in Recent Scholarship," in idem, *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture: Essays on the Jewish Encounter with Hellenism and Roman Rule* (Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 100; Leiden: Brill, 2005), 1-20.

[13] A few well-researched popular works, aimed at an audience of military enthusiasts and wargamers, deserve some acknowledgement here as well: see esp. Duncan Head's *Armies of the Macedonian and Punic Wars* (Goring-by-Sea: Wargames Research Group, 1982); Nick Sekunda, *Seleucid and Ptolemaic Reformed Armies 168–145 BC*, 2 vols. (Stockport: Montvert Publications, 1994–1995).

[14] Csaba A. La'da, "Towards a History of Immigration to Hellenistic Egypt: The Contribution of Ethnic Designations to Research," *Archiv für Papyrusforschung und verwandte Gebiete* 66 (2020): 44-80 (68).

fighting styles associated with the designated peoples.[15] This notion appears largely groundless as far as it concerns the Thracians, however (we will see further below that "Greek" and "Macedonian" later did become pseudo-ethnics to a degree), nor is it at all clear what would constitute a "real" Thracian under this theory.[16] The prospect that any given group of people may have included "pseudo" members should not deter us, in any case, from investigating that group altogether, especially if they involve historically understudied and marginalized peoples.

In short, the history of Thracians under Alexander and in the Hellenistic East encompasses many of the defining features of the age, such as human migration, warfare, and multiculturalism, while simultaneously presenting an alternative perspective to that of the Greeks and Macedonians who have long dominated the historiography and of the native populations whose experiences have lately received more attention in the literature. I intend to cover this history from three different angles: first, an overview of demographic data on the Thracians' numbers in the East over time, which serves to underscore the size of their presence in relation to other peoples; second, a discussion of the Thracians' evolving status from involuntary vassals and hostages in Alexander's initial invasion force to cultural partners and even honorary "Hellenes" in Greco-Macedonian perception; and third, an examination of the various contexts where we can see Thracians express an ethnic identity

[15] See e.g. Fraser, *Greek Ethnic Terminology*, 141; D. J. Houle, "Soldiers and Hellenism: Recruitment in the Hellenistic Militaries," in *Colonial Geopolitics and Local Cultures in the Hellenistic and Roman East (3rd century BC–3rd century AD)*, ed. Hadrien Bru et al. (Oxford: Archaeopress, 2021), 160-166, esp. 162, 164.

[16] Cf. also the criticisms by Goudriaan, "Ethnical Strategies," 78f. On the lack of evidence for the use of "Thracian" as a "pseudo-ethnic": see also Csaba A. La'da, *Ethnic Terminology in Hellenistic and Early Roman Egypt: New Sources and New Perspectives of Research* (Tyche Supplementband 13; Vienna: Verlag Holzhausen, 2019), 13.

in both informal settings and Greco-Macedonian institutional frameworks. In the conclusion, I briefly speculate on the fate of Thracians communities throughout the East after the end of the Hellenistic period, focusing here on the likelihood of their gradual assimilation into the native cultures.

Quantitative and Statistical Data

In support of his arguments on the "degradation" of Hellenistic societies, Launey sought to track long-term changes in the "racial" makeup of Hellenistic armies by collating all known soldiers from the period whose ancestries he could determine with reasonable confidence on the basis of ethnics or onomastic criteria. Predictably, he concluded that statistical analyses of this material revealed a general trend across three centuries towards increasing "local indigenous recruitment" and decreasing representation of Greeks, Macedonians, and "Balkan peoples," of whom Thracians comprised the largest group by far.[17] His methodology had major defects; most notably, he did not account for the possibility that city ethnics (primary markers of Greek origin) may have naturally dropped out of use among the descendants of Greek settlers over successive generations.[18] In addition, he relied disproportionately upon evidence from Egypt, the only area of the Hellenistic world where sufficient records have survived to permit meaningful diachronic comparisons on demography. Despite these flaws, he made the sound observation that,

[17] Launey, *Armées*, 1.63-103 (statistical data and analyses), 1.366-423 (discussion of the "Balkan peoples"), 2.1113-1267 (prosopography of soldiers).

[18] For other criticisms of Launey's methodology: see Roger S. Bagnall, "The Origins of Ptolemaic Cleruchs," *Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists* 21 (1984): 7-20, esp. 13f., reprinted in idem, *Hellenistic and Roman Egypt: Sources and Approaches* (Burlington: Ashgate, 2006), chapter VIII. On the decline in the use of ethnics: see also La'da, "Immigration to Hellenistic Egypt," 69f.

from the outset, Thracians entered the East in significant numbers alongside the Greeks and Macedonians, and that these early arrivers formed the core of the subsequent foreign presence there.

In fact, Launey's fixation on the seemingly ever-diminishing numbers of Europeans helps to remind us that they always constituted a small minority within the overall populations of these regions. During the third century, for example, Greeks and Macedonians may have amounted to no more than around five percent of the population in Egypt, according to the latest modeling by Christelle Fischer-Bovet, and she further notes that mass immigration of Greeks and Macedonians to Egypt appears to have mostly ceased by the middle of that century.[19] Likewise, all agree that the Seleukid army already suffered deficiencies of Greek and Macedonian manpower in the third century, which points to a lack of sustained Greco-Macedonian immigration to the Near East and Central Asia beyond the initial waves under Alexander and Seleukos I.[20] If, as Launey inferred, Thracians followed roughly the same demographic trajectory as the Greeks and Macedonians in the Hellenistic East, the three groups would have shared significant common ground in their status as the vastly outnumbered colonizers.

---

[19] Christelle Fischer-Bovet, "Counting the Greeks in Egypt: Immigration in the First Century of Ptolemaic Rule," in *Demography and the Graeco-Roman World: New Insights and Approaches*, ed. Claire Holleran and April Pudsey (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 135-154; cf. La'da, "Immigration," 71, here suggesting that "immigration did not stop completely after the third century and that it continued, albeit at a reduced rate, for some time into the second century."

[20] On the Seleukid's sources of manpower: see e.g. Sherwin-White and Kuhrt, *From Samarkhand to Sardis*, 53-56, 212-214; Kyle R. Fingerson, "Persian Katoikoi in Hellenistic Smyrna," *Ancient Society* 37 (2007): 107-120; John D. Grainger, *The Rise of the Seleucid Empire (323–223 BC): Seleukos I to Seleukos III* (Barnsley: Pen & Sword, 2014), 92f. See also Rachel Mairs, "Reassessing Settlement Policies in the Hellenistic Far East," in *Comparing the Ptolemaic and Seleucid Empires: Integration, Communication, and Resistance*, ed. Christelle Fischer-Bovet and Sitta von Reden (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021), 49-64 (62), who sees no evidence of Greco-Macedonian immigration to Bactria and Central Asia "on any great scale after the first military settlements."

A review of the ancient evidence and some more recent statistical data sets does bear out the impression, at least, that Thracians formed a major pillar of Alexander's army and that the Eastern Successor states saw value in maintaining Thracian contingents, even as they increasingly recruited from their local subjects. Let us start with the force that Alexander first led into the Achaemenid Empire in 334. Diodorus, the only extant author to outline the internal composition of this force, breaks down the elements and strength as follows[21]:

Table 1: Composition of Alexander's Initial Invasion Force			
Infantry		*Cavalry*	
Macedonians	12,000	Macedonians	1,800
Greek Allies	7,000	Thessalians	1,800
Mercenaries	5,000	Other Greeks	600
Odrysians, Triballians, and Illyrians	7,000	Thracians and Paionians	900
Archers and Agrianians	1,000		
TOTAL	32,000	TOTAL	5,100

The Thracians here (including Odrysians and Triballians) have unfortunately been lumped in with the Thracian-adjacent Illyrians and Paionians, thus obscuring the precise numbers for each group. Whether we should count the Agrianians among the Thracians also remains unclear, for although the Agrianians inhabited the Upper Strymon area of

[21] Diod. 17.17.3-4. He may have drawn from multiple sources, which would explain the slight discrepancies between the total reported strength of the infantry and cavalry (30,000 and 4,500, respectively) and the actual sums of the figures listed for the constituent elements (as shown in the table below): see P. A. Brunt, "Alexander's Macedonian Cavalry," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 83 (1963): 27-46 (32-34); E. W. Marsden, *The Campaign of Gaugamela* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1964), 25.

Thrace, our sources frequently distinguish them from the Thracians when referring to two together.[22] At any rate, the 7,000 Odrysian, Triballian, and Illyrian infantry must have contained the bulk of the initial Thracian element in Alexander's army, and the Illyrians feature so little in the narratives of his campaign that one suspects that they contributed much less than the others.[23] Assuming a conservative figure of about 4,500 Thracians overall, they would have comprised a modest 12.13% of the total strength of 37,100, as opposed to 37.20% for the Macedonians and 25.34% for the Greeks.[24] Over time, however, as shown in the table below that lists attested reinforcements from Europe, the Thracians' numbers expanded quite considerably, while the flow of Macedonians appears to have stopped or greatly diminished after 330[25]:

Table 2: Reinforcements from Europe to Alexander's Army		
Date	*Location*	*Reinforcements*
334/3	Gordion	3,350 Macedonians (3,000 infantry, 350 cavalry); 200 Thracian cavalry; 150 Eleians[26]

[22] On the Agrianians: see Launey, *Armées*, 1.404-407; Delev, "Stratifying Herodotus," 110f.; Denis Knoepfler, "De quelques épitaphes d'étrangers et d'étrangères au Musée d'Érétrie," in *Sidelights on Greek Antiquity: Archaeological and Epigraphical Essays in Honour of Vasileios Petrakos*, ed. Konstantinos Kalogeropoulos et al. (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2021), 45-102 (53-57).

[23] Cf. Helmut Berve, *Das Alexanderreich auf prosopographischer Grundlage*, 2 vols. (Munich: C. H. Beck, 1926; reprint, New York: Arno Press, 1973), 1.139; Launey, *Armées*, 1.410f. Apart from Curtius' claim that the Illyrians, Thracians, and mercenaries held the rear line at Gaugamela (4.13.31), we find only passing references to the Illyrians in speeches (Arr. *Anab.* 2.7.5; Curt. 3.10.9; Justin 11.9.4) and a mention of 3,000 reinforcements from Illyria in 330 (Curt. 6.6.35).

[24] 500 Agrianians would add another 1.35%. For other estimates: see e.g. Berve, *Alexanderreich*, 1.136, 1.138 (3,000 Thracian infantry, 700 Thracian cavalry [based on his estimate of 200 Paionian cavalry], 500 Agrianians); Marsden, *Gaugamela*, 39, 51, 66f. (5,500 Thracian infantry, 450 Thracian cavalry, 500 Agrianians); Hammond and Griffith, *History of Macedonia*, 2.432 (4,000 Thracian infantry, 400 Thracian cavalry, and 500 Agrianians).

[25] For other attempts to track the reinforcements: cf. Berve, *Alexanderreich*, 1.178-185; Donald W. Engels, *Alexander the Great and the Logistics of the Macedonian Army* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), 146-150 (Appendix 5 [Tables 4-6]); Shane Wallace, "East and West: Lines of Communication between Alexander and the Greeks," *Hermathena* 200/201 (2016): 15-72 (44-48 [Table 1]).

[26] Arr. *Anab.* 1.29.4.

333	Near Cilicia	5,800 (5,000 infantry, 800 cavalry) of unknown ethnic composition, but possibly including Macedonian, Greeks, and Thracians[27]
333	Near Issos	Unspecified number of Agrianians "recently brought from Thrace"[28]
332	Sidon	4,000 Greek mercenaries from the Peloponnese[29]
331	Memphis	400 Greek mercenaries; 500 Thracian cavalry[30]
330	Babylonia	6,500 Macedonians (6,000 infantry, 500 cavalry); 4,100 Thracians (3,500 Tralians, 600 cavalry); 4,380 mercenaries from the Peloponnese (4,000 infantry, 380 cavalry)[31]
330	Areia	500 Greek cavalry; 3,000 from Illyria; 130 Thessalian cavalry[32]
329	Bactria	8,000 Greeks (7,400 infantry, 600 cavalry); up to 5,000 mercenaries, who apparently included Thracians[33]
326	Hydaspes	36,000 allies and mercenaries (30,000 infantry, 6,000 cavalry) from Greece; 5,000 cavalry from Thrace[34]

This data, I should note, represented a lynchpin for A. B. Bosworth's rather controversial argument that the campaign in the East created a demographic crisis in

[27] Kallisthenes *FGrH/BNJ* 124 F 35 (Plb. 12.19.2); A. B. Bosworth, *The Legacy of Alexander: Politics, Warfare, and Propaganda under the Successors* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 69f., who also connects Polybius' testimony to Curtius' (3.1.24) remark that reinforcements *ex Macedonia* arrived near Cappadocia.

[28] Curt. 3.9.10 (*ex Thracia nuper advectos*).

[29] Arr. *Anab.* 2.20.5; cf. Curt. 4.3.11.

[30] Arr. *Anab.* 3.5.1.

[31] Curt. 5.1.40-41; Diod. 17.65.1 (who numbers the mercenary cavalry at nearly 1,000, though Curtius' more precise figure seems preferable here); Bosworth, *A Historical Commentary on Arrian's History of Alexander*, 2 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980–1995), 1.319f.; cf. Arr. 3.16.10.

[32] Curt. 6.6.35.

[33] Arr. *Anab.* 4.7.2; Curt. 7.10.11-12. Curtius puts the mercenaries' numbers at 4,000 infantry and 1,000 cavalry, and the officers who delivered them included a certain Ptolemaios, whom Arrian introduces as "the general of the Thracians" (ὁ τῶν Θρᾳκῶν στρατηγὸς); the majority of these mercenaries, however, may have come from recruitment in Asia and/or forces that Alexander had previously left behind: see further Bosworth, *Commentary*, 2.40f.

[34] Diod. 17.95.4; Curt. 9.3.21; cf. Bosworth, *Legacy of Alexander*, 72f., subsuming the 5,000 cavalry from Thrace (per Curtius) under the 36,000 allies and mercenaries from Greece (as reported by Diodorus).

Macedonia by depleting the country of its military-age men, but the spotty nature of the ancient literary evidence casts a strong air of uncertainty over his analysis, and critics have questioned whether the Macedonians endured losses at a scale that would substantially reduce the rate of population growth.[35] Nevertheless, the ratio of Macedonians to Thracians in Alexander's army probably did narrow as the years wore on, given the above figures for reinforcements (9,850 Macedonians versus 9,800 Thracians in minimum absolute numbers) and the fact that these Thracians functioned primarily as scouts and auxiliaries (on which, see the next section), sparing them from potentially costly frontline fighting. The apparent mistrust of non-Macedonians that led Alexander to relegate his Thracians—and, for that matter, his Greek allies—to secondary roles may also have motivated him to remove as many of them as he could out of their homelands, where they might otherwise cause trouble; indeed, Macedonian forces under the regent Antipatros had to suppress rebellions in both Thrace and the Peloponnese in 331.[36]

We have no record of Alexander repatriating any of his Thracians, like he did with his Greek allies in 330 (though many of them reportedly reenlisted as mercenaries) and

[35] See A. B. Bosworth, "Alexander the Great and the Decline of Macedon," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 106 (1986): 1-12; idem, *Legacy of Alexander*, 64-97. For criticisms and counterarguments: see e.g. N. G. L. Hammond, "Casualties and Reinforcements of Citizen Soldiers in Greece and Macedonia," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 109 (1989): 56-69; Richard A. Billows, *Kings and Colonists: Aspects of Macedonian Imperialism* (Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition 22; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995), 184-217; Edward M. Anson, *Alexander the Great: Themes and Issues* (London: Bloomsbury, 2013), 160f.

[36] See A. B. Bosworth, *Conquest and Empire: The Reign of Alexander the Great* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 264f. On Alexander's distrust of his Greek allies: see also e.g. Paul Cartledge, *Alexander the Great: The Hunt for a New Past* (New York: Vintage Books, 2005); 136; Anson, *Alexander*, 159f. The circumstances surrounding the Thracian rebellion in 331, for which Diodorus (17.62.4-6, 17.63.1) represents our only source, remain extremely enigmatic, and oddly enough, the principal instigator of the revolt, the Macedonian governor Memnon, appears to have later accompanied the 5,000 Thracian cavalry who joined Alexander's army at the Hydaspes in 326 (Curt 9.3.21); cf. also Waldemar Heckel, *In the Path of Conquest: Resistance to Alexander the Great* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020), 126f.

10,000 or so Macedonian veterans in 323.[37] And since Alexander seems to have regarded the majority of his Thracian troops as clients or vassals, most were presumably unaffected when he ordered his satraps and commanders in Asia to disband their mercenaries in 324.[38] Thus, following his unexpected death at Babylon in June 323, many Thracians would have still stood at the disposal of the soon-to-be warring Successors. This might explain the presence of Thracian cavalry at the Battle of Paraitakene in 317, which saw a clash in Persia between the forces of Antigonos One-Eye and those of Eumenes of Kardia, with the former fielding 1,000 Thracians in his army and the latter 500, according to Diodorus.[39]

Diodorus identifies Eumenes' Thracians at Paraitakene as having come "from the upper colonies" (ἐκ τῶν ἄνω κατοικιῶν) in Bactria-Sogdiana.[40] Alexander had resettled Macedonian veterans and Greek mercenaries in this region during the 320s, evidently for the purpose of consolidating his control over the conquered territories and retiring his aged,

[37] For these repatriations: see Arr. *Anab.* 3.19.5, 7.12.1; Diod. 17.74.3, 17.109.1, 18.4.1, 18.21.1; Billows, *Kings and Colonists*, 188 n10; Bosworth, *Legacy of Alexander*, 73 n30. According to Arrian, Alexander also discharged a group of Macedonians and Thessalians in 329 (*Anab.* 3.29.5); Curtius, without specifying their origins, puts their number at 900 (7.5.27).

[38] Cf. Hammond and Griffith, *History of Macedonia*, 2.432. On the disbanding of the mercenaries: see Diod. 17.106.2-3; Ernst Badian, "Harpalus," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 81 (1961): 16-43, esp. 25-28; cf. Bosworth, *Conquest and Empire*, 148f.

[39] Diod. 19.27.5, 19.29.4. The Teubner edition adds "Thracians" to 19.29.2 (ἐκ τῶν ἄνω κατοικούντων <Θρᾳκῶν> ὀκτακοσίους), but this emendation appears unwarranted: see further Alexander Meeus, *The History of the Diadochoi in Book XIX of Diodoros'* Bibliotheke: *A Historical and Historiographical Commentary* (Untersuchungen zur antiken Literatur und Geschichte 149; Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2022), 247. Earlier, the satrap of Persia, Peukestas, had brought with him a unit of 600 Greek and Thracian cavalry when he and Eumenes joined forces (19.14.5); and even earlier, in 321, one of Eumenes' Thracians had allegedly wounded the general Krateros in a battle near the Hellespont: see Plut. *Eum.* 7.3; Launey, *Armées*, 1.369. Polyainos (4.6.14) mentions 1,000 Thracians under Antigonos in a different context, but they may be one and the same with those deployed at Paraitakene: see Billows, *Antigonos*, 357.

[40] Diod. 19.27.5. On the meaning of "upper" here: see Frank L. Holt, *Alexander the Great and Bactria* (Mnemosyne Supplements 109; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1988), 94 n29; cf. also Pierre Briant, "The Seleucid Kingdom, the Achaemenid Empire and the History of the Near East in the Near East in the First Millennium B.C.," in *Religion and Religious Practice in the Seleucid Kingdom*, ed. Per Bilde et al. (Studies in Hellenistic Civilization 1; Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 1990), 40-65 (49).

infirm, and most troublesome soldiers, and Diodorus' testimony here offers the clearest indication that Thracians participated (albeit unwillingly, perhaps) in the colonization program as well.[41] Alexander's attempt to establish a city at the confluence of the Akesinos and Indus rivers in 325 also involved a sizable body of Thracians, it seems, though some of them may have ultimately accompanied their commander Eudamos when he marched west to join forces with Eumenes in *ca.* 317.[42] In any case, communities such as these would have helped sustain (or at least delay the disappearance of) Thracian populations in the East; as we will see later, the Seleukids appear to have recruited from colonies of Thracians well into the second century.

The greatest concentration of evidence for Thracians in the Hellenistic East comes from Egypt, where epigraphic and papyrological sources have turn up approximately 170 individuals with the ethnics Θρᾶιξ, Θρᾶιξ τῆς ἐπιγονῆς ("Thracian of the descent," i.e., a descendant of a Thracian soldier in Egypt), or Θράισσα as well as numerous others with Thracian names.[43] On a purely quantitative level, moreover, Thracians represent one of the

---

[41] On the resettlement of these Macedonians and Greeks: see Holt, *Alexander and Bactria*, 52-86; Billows, *Kings and Colonists*, 146-178; Michael Iliakis, "Greek Mercenary Revolts in Bactria: A Re-Appraisal," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 63, no. 2 (2013): 182-195.

[42] Arrian states that Alexander left "all the Thracians" with the satrap of India, Philippos son of Machatas, who also had orders to found a city (*Anab.* 6.15.2), but these could not have included the Thracians under Sitalkes (see further below), then attached to Parmenion's army (ibid. 3.26.3, 6.27.3-4). Eudamos took charge after Philippos' murder in 324 at the hands of his mercenaries (ibid. 6.27.2; Curt. 10.1.20-21, calling Eudamos the *dux Thracum*); cf. also A. B. Bosworth, "The Historical Setting of Megasthenes' *Indica*," *Classical Philology* 91, no. 2 (1996): 113-127 (119f.); idem, *Conquest and Empire*, 239; Holt, *Alexander and Bactria*, 84 n139. When Eudamos traveled west, he brought with him 500 cavalry, 300 infantry, and 120 elephants (Diod. 19.14.8). Incidentally, no identifiable traces of this settlement have survived, and whether it ever came into existence at all remains uncertain: see Getzel M. Cohen, *The Hellenistic Settlements in the East from Armenia and Mesopotamia to Bactria and India* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013), 291-293.

[43] See Velizar Velkov and Alexandre Fol, *Les Thraces en Égypte gréco-romaine* (Studia Thracica 4; Sofia: Academia Litterarum Bulgarica, 1977), 22-72; Csaba A. La'da, *Foreign Ethnics in Hellenistic Egypt* (Prosopographia Ptolemaica 10; Leuven: Peeters, 2002), 87-103; idem, *Ethnic Terminology*, 42-44; idem, "Immigration," 68; *OnomThrac and OnamThracSuppl*, passim, with names attested in Hellenistic Egypt

most attested foreign peoples in Hellenistic Egypt, trailing behind only Greeks and Macedonians. Statistical data sets compiled in the past two decades, which draw upon material that had been unavailable to Launey, underscore this fact in a variety of ways. For instance, in numerating the top ten city, regional, and ethnic designations borne by settlers, Katja Mueller ranks Thrace second in the list, just slightly below the Greek-populated Cyrenaica in Libya:[44]

Table 3: Origins of Settlers in Hellenistic Egypt	
Origin	*Number of Attestations*
Cyrenaica	201
Thrace	199
Judaea	102
Crete	80
Attica	63
Thessaly	58
Caria	53
Arabia	49
Pamphylia	40

marked as Aegyptus (Pt) or Aegyptus [Pt]. On the meaning of τῆς ἐπιγονῆς: see Csaba A. La'da, "Who Were Those 'of the *Epigone*'?" in *Akten des 21. Internationalen Papyrologenkongresses, Berlin, 13.–19.8.1995*, ed. Bärbel Kramer et al. (Archiv für Papyrusforschung 3.1; Stuttgart: Teubner, 1997), 563-569; Christelle Fischer-Bovet, *Army and Society in Ptolemaic Egypt* (Armies of the Ancient World 1; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 183-186.

[44] Katja Mueller, "Geographical Information Systems (GIS) in Papyrology. Mapping Fragmentation and Migration Flow to Hellenistic Egypt," *Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists* 42 (2005): 63-92 (77 [Table 1]); idem, *Settlements of the Ptolemies: City Foundations and New Settlement in the Hellenistic World* (Studia Hellenistica 43; Leuven: Peeters, 2006), 168-170 n85, which is also cited in Fischer-Bovet, *Army and Society*, 173f. (Table 5.1). Mueller excludes from her count the "fictitious ethnics" Ἕλλην, Μακεδών, and Πέρσης (on which, see further below).

Ionia	37

More recently, Mary Stefanou has assembled a mostly up-to-date data set on ethnics attested among cleruchs (i.e., military colonists) in Hellenistic Egypt from the late-fourth century until 145, where we also find Thracians to be far more numerous than other non-Greek and non-Macedonian foreigners. The table below presents this data in condensed form, and as points of comparison, I have included (in parentheses) her subfigures for Illyrians, Agrianians, Paionians, Jews, and Libyans[45]:

Table 4: Origins of Cleruchs in Hellenistic Egypt		
Ethnics by Origin	*Number of Cleruchs*	*Percent*
Mainland Greece	127	16.89
Northern Greece	22	2.93
Aegean Islands	25	3.32
Propontis	11	1.46
Pontus	24	3.19
Asia Minor (city-states)	26	3.46
Asia Minor (ethnic regions)	25	3.32
Cyprus	2	0.27
Balkans	135	17.95

[45] Mary Stefanou, "Waterborne Recruits: The Military Settlers of Ptolemaic Egypt," in *The Ptolemies, the Sea, and the Nile: Studies in Waterborne Power*, ed. Kostas Buraselis et al. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 108-131 (111-117 [Tables 7.1-4]; cf. Fischer-Bovet, *Army and Society*, 175 (Table 5.2), which depends on older data sets compiled by Fritz Uebel (*Die Kleruchen Ägyptens unter den ersten sechs Ptolemäern* [Abhandlungen der deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Klasse für Sprachen, Literatur und Kunst 3; Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1968]) and Roger S. Bagnall ("Origins of Ptolemaic Cleruchs," 10-12). In a several instances, the percentages that I calculated here differ slightly from Stefanou's original figures.

(Illyrians)	(2)	(0.27)
(Agrianians)	(1)	(0.13)
(Paionians)	(5)	(0.66)
(Thracians)	(127)	(16.89)
East	45	5.98
(Jews)	(37)	(4.92)
Cyrenaica	101	13.43
(Libyans)	(5)	(0.66)
Italy and Sicily	15	2.00
Macedonia	181	24.07
Unidentified city-states	13	1.73
TOTAL	752	100.00

Interestingly, in Stefanou's breakdown of the figures by time period for the five most commonly attested geographic or ethnic origins among cleruchs, the total proportion of Thracians remains essentially constant (in the range of about 16–18%) across each period, although the overall number of cleruchs greatly decreases after 205[46]:

Table 5: Origins of Cleruchs Over Time

Origins	Until 246		246–205		205–145	
	Number	*Percent*	*Number*	*Percent*	*Number*	*Percent*
Macedonians	21	15.22	75	18.56	85	40.48
Mainland Greece	31	22.46	68	16.83	28	13.33

[46] Cf. Stefanou, "Waterborne Recruits," 117 (Table 7.4). Again, my calculations differ slightly from hers.

Cyrenaica	30	21.74	59	14.61	7	3.33
Thracians	22	15.94	67	16.58	38	18.10
Jews	1	0.73	15	3.71	21	10.00
All others	33	23.91	120	29.71	31	14.76
TOTAL	138	100.00	404	100.00	210	100.00

As Stefanou suggests, if the diminishing number of cleruchs correlates with a decline in immigration to Egypt, then the dramatic upsurge in the percentage of Macedonians after 205 may reflect, in part, the apparent transition of the term "Macedonian" into a pseudo-ethnic—we discussed this concept earlier in terms of its non-applicability to "Thracian"—rather than an influx of fresh blood from Macedonia.[47] This would help explain, in fact, why some individuals in our sources from Egypt bear the ethnic "Macedonian" despite having Thracian names, fathers with Thracian names, or both, but the fairly consistent percentage of Thracians representation among cleruchs over the years must also caution against the assumption that they became "Macedonians" on a significant scale.[48] At any rate, given the signs that immigration to Egypt began to wane by the mid-third century, it would seem that many and perhaps the majority of Thracian cleruchs descended from troops brought to the East by Alexander and mercenaries hired by the early

[47] Ibid., 123f. On the use of "Macedonian" as a pseudo-ethnic: see also Launey, *Armées*, 1.321ff.; La'da, "Immigration," 52; Fischer-Bovet, *Army and Society*, 178-191.

[48] See e.g. La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 169 no. E415, 191 nos. E1622 and E1626. Cf. Dan Dana, "Les Thraces dans les armées hellénistiques: essai d''histoire par les noms,'" in *Pratiques et identités culturelles des armées hellénistiques du monde méditerranéen*, ed. Jean-Christophe Couvenhes et al. (Hellenistic Warfare 3; Bordeaux: Ausonius Éditions, 2011), 87-115. Dana proposes that the Thracians who first settled in the Hellenistic East came primarily from eastern Macedonia, citing, among other things, Thracian personal names that regularly occur both there and in Egypt as well as the Thracians in Egypt who bear the ethnic "Macedonian," but I find his data set too small a basis to draw any firm conclusions.

Ptolemies.[49] In addition, from the 240s until 200, the Ptolemaic Kingdom controlled parts of southern Thrace, and while we have astonishingly little evidence of efforts to recruit from this area, Ptolemaic hegemony in the Aegean may have at least (in the words of Stefanou) "facilitated the movement of people and in general favoured their emigration towards Egypt."[50]

Status: From Hostages to Honorary Hellenes

In Alexander's time, the Thracians under Macedonian control appear to have had the status of vassals, judging from the continued existence of the Odrysian dynasty during his reign—a ruler of that line, Seuthes III, rebelled in 325, taking advantage of the death of the Macedonian military governor—as well as Arrian's reference to "pledges" (πίστεις) exchanged between Alexander and the peoples along the Danube who submitted to him, among them the Triballians.[51] According to Frontinus, moreover, Alexander feared that the Thracians would revolt after he departed for Asia and thus brought along with him their kings and "officials" (*praefecti*) as hostages, albeit on the pretext of honoring them.[52]

[49] Cf. also Bagnall, "Origins of Ptolemaic Cleruchs," 15-18.

[50] Stefanou, "Waterborne Recruits," 131; cf. Launey, *Armées*, 1.374f. The extent of Ptolemaic rule in Thrace remains rather unclear, in fact: see Roger S. Bagnall, *The Administration of the Ptolemaic Possessions Outside Egypt* (Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1976), 159-162; John D. Grainger, *The Syrian Wars* (Mnemosyne Supplements 320; Leiden: Brill, 2010), 166f.; cf. Peter Delev, "Thrace from the Assassination of Kotys I to Koroupedion," 61, 64f. As Mueller (*Settlements of the Ptolemies*, 56) also notes, we have no evidence of the Ptolemies establishing a dynastic settlement (i.e., a settlement named after a member of the royal family) in Thrace as they did in every other part of their empire, which she regards as an "abnormality."

[51] Cf. Hammond and Walbank, *History of Macedonia*, 3.37-39. For Seuthes' rebellion: see Curt. 10.1.44-45; cf. Helen S. Lund, *Lysimachus: A Study in Early Hellenistic Kingship* (London: Routledge, 1992), 20-23; Delev, "Thrace from the Assassination of Kotys I to Koroupedion," 53f.; Heckel, *In the Path of Conquest*, 127. For the submission of the Danubian peoples: see Arr. *Anab.* 1.4.6-7.

[52] Frontin. *Str.* 2.11.3, ed. Gotthold Gundermann, *Iuli Frontini Strategematon libri quattuor* (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1888); cf. also Just. 11.5.3, who states that Alexander "took with him to war the tributary kings of noted ability" (*reges stipendiarios conspectioris ingenii ad conmilitium secum trahit*).

Presumably, most of those Thracian leaders who accompanied him helped command the various Thracian units in his army (see below), but at least one individual of Thracian extraction, a certain Philotas son of Karsis, joined the ranks of the royal pages, a group of elite-born adolescents attached to the Macedonian court (Philotas went on to participate in the so-called Pages' Conspiracy, an unsuccessful bid by several pages to assassinate Alexander in 327).[53] In a probably early tradition preserved in the *Alexander Romance* and *The Book of the Death and Testament of Alexander*, which attributes Alexander's death to deliberate poisoning, the list of conspirators also features a Herakleides the Thracian—perhaps another member of the court, if the list does refer to real people.[54]

Of the five men known to have commanded Thracian units during the campaign in Asia, only one, Sitalkes, bears a Thracian name.[55] Often identified by scholars as a possible

[53] Arr. *Anab.* 4.13.4 (here identifying Philotas' father as Κάρσις ὁ Θρᾷξ); see further Berve, *Alexanderreich*, 2.392 no. 801; Heckel, *Marshals*, 270 no. 118; Argyro B. Tataki, *Macedonians Abroad: A Contribution to the Prosopography of Ancient Macedonia* (Meletemata 26; Athens: Research Centre for Greek and Roman Antiquity, National Hellenic Research Foundation, 1998), 456 no. 118. Note that the only other attestation of the name Κάρσις occurs among the Thracians in a list of mercenaries employed by Athens *ca.* 300 (*IG* II^2 1956, line 11), which we previously examined in the chapter on Attica: see also *OnomThrac*, 79 s.v. Καρσις. On the Royal Pages: see Elizabeth Donnelly Carney, *King and Court in Ancient Macedonia: Rivalry, Treason and Conspiracy* (Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2015), 207-223, esp. 208f.

[54] *Ps.-Call.* 3.31.8; *Liber de Morte* 97. Both texts are reproduced in Waldemar Heckel, *The Last Days and Testament of Alexander the Great: A Prosopographic Study* (Historia Einzelschriften 56; Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1988), 86-101. The tradition could derive from Ptolemy I's propaganda: see Brian Bosworth, "Ptolemy and the Will of Alexander," in *Alexander the Great in Fact and Fiction*, ed. idem and E. J. Baynham (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 207-241; and in the same volume, Elizabeth Baynham, "Baleful Birth in Babylon: The Significance of the Prodigy in the *Liber de Morte*—An Investigation of Genre," 242-262.

[55] The others are named Agathon son of Tyrimmas, Asklepiodoros son of Eunikos, Eudamos, and Ptolemaios (I have not counted the officer in charge of the Agrianians, a certain Attalos). Agathon seems to have led the Thracian cavalry during the early part of the campaign (Arr. *Anab.* 1.14.3, 3.12.4). Asklepiodoros brought Thracian cavalry to Alexander at Memphis in early 331 (ibid. 3.5.1; see also the above table of reinforcements) and became the satrap of Syria not long afterwards (ibid. 3.6.8), a position which he seems to have lost by 327, perhaps due to his son Antipatros' involvement in the Pages' Conspiracy (ibid. 4.13.4; cf. Curt. 8.6.9). Eudamos, as mentioned earlier, took charge in India following the death of its satrap in 324, and Curtius identifies Eudamos here as the *dux Thracum* (10.1.21). Ptolemaios, whom Arrian calls "the general of the Thracians" (ὁ τῶν Θρᾳκῶν στρατηγὸς), delivered mercenaries to Alexander at Bactria in 329 (*Anab*. 4.7.2; see also the above table of reinforcements). For the entries on these individuals in various

scion of the Odrysian dynasty, Sitalkes led a contingent of Thracian javelin-throwers (ἀκοντισταί) and fought on the army's left wing at Issos in 333 and Gaugamela in 331.[56] Nothing in his record indicates that Alexander treated him differently on a personal basis from the Macedonian and Greek officers, which fits Frontinus' claim about the pretense of honoring the hostages, and notably, Sitalkes was among those whom Alexander entrusted with assassinating the old general Parmenion in 330 after the execution of Parmenion's son Philotas for suspected treason.[57] In a more negative context, we might detect further signs of the ostensibly equal treatment of Thracian, Macedonian, and Greek officers in Alexander's decision in 324 to jointly punish some of the assassins, including Sitalkes, in response to accusations that they and their soldiers had committed atrocities against the native populace of Media.[58]

As already mentioned, the Thracian troops in Alexander's army appear, on the whole, to have acted as scouts and auxiliaries, Sitalkes' javelin-throwers notwithstanding. Diodorus alludes to the former in identifying the Thracian cavalry in the initial invasion force as πρόδρομοι (literally "front-runners," but typically translated as "scouts"), whose day-to-day tasks most likely centered around reconnaissance and screening, and Curtius also refers in passing to the use of light-armed Thracians for reconnoitering in Cilicia

---

prosopographies: see Berve, *Alexanderreich*, 2.6f. no. 8 (Agathon), 2.88 no. 167 (Asklepiodoros), 2.154 no. 311 (Eudamos), 2.337 no. 673 (Ptolemaios); Heckel, *Marshals*, 329 no. 5.1 (Agathon), 304 no. 3.2 (Ptolemaios) and no. 3.3 (Eudamos); Tataki, *Macedonians*, 218 no. 7 (Agathon), 273 no. 318 (Asklepiodoros), 311f. no. 36 (Eudamos), 418 no. 133 (Ptolemaios).

[56] Arr. *Anab.* 1.28.4, 2.9.3, 3.12.4; Berve, *Alexanderreich*, 2.357 no. 712; Bosworth, *Commentary*, 1.171; Hammond and Walbank, *History of Macedonia*, 3.39; Heckel, *Marshals*, 305 no. 3.4.

[57] Arr. *Anab.* 3.26.3-4; Curt. 10.1.1, cf. 7.2.19-32.

[58] Arr. *Anab.* 6.27.3-4; Curt. 10.1.1-8. Both Berve (*Alexanderreich*, 2.357 no. 712) and Heckel (*Marshals*, 305 no. 3.4) assume that Alexander had Sitalkes put to death; in fact, neither Arrian nor Curtius specifically state this, although the former does seem to imply it.

during 333.[59] As for auxiliary duties, we hear of Thracian troops building a mountain road in Pamphylia in 334/3, protecting the baggage train at Gaugamela in 331, and subsequently serving in satrapal armies and garrisons in Media, Parthia, Hyrcania, and India.[60] While militarily essential, such less-than-glamorous assignments suggest that Alexander lacked confidence in the Thracians' ability to hold their own against the enemy or that he did not want them to share in the same battlefield glories as the Macedonians, either of which would underscore the reality of the Thracians' second-class status.

In the Hellenistic East, the perceived cultural and ideological gap that separated Thracians from Greeks and Macedonians seems to have narrowed to a considerable degree, as we can discern, for instance, from the appointment of Thracians or their descendants to positions of authority and prestige under the Greco-Macedonian power structure.[61] The career of Seleukos son of Bithys represents our best documented example of this phenomenon; between 142 and 131, in the service of the Ptolemaic Kingdom, he variously

[59] Diod. 17.17.4; Curt. 3.4.13. At times, scholars have considered Diodorus' text here (Θρᾷκες δὲ πρόδρομοι καὶ Παίονες) problematic on the assumption that the πρόδρομοι consisted solely of Macedonians, but as Bosworth (*Commentary*, 1.110f.; *Conquest and Empire*, 262 n17) points out, the army could have included both Thracian and Macedonian πρόδρομοι units: *pace* e.g. R. D. Milns, "Alexander's Macedonian Cavalry and Diodorus xvii 17.4," *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 86 (1966): 167f. On πρόδρομοι in general: see Glenn R. Bugh, "Cavalry Inscriptions from the Athenian Agora," *Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens* 67 (1998): 81-90; idem, "Greek Cavalry in the Hellenistic World: Review and Reappraisal," in *New Approaches to Greek and Roman Warfare*, ed. Lee L. Brice (Hoboken: Wiley-Blackwell, 2020), 65-80 (72f.).

[60] For the building of the road: see Arr. *Anab.* 1.16.1; cf. also Plut. *Alex.* 17.8, who mentions the road in passing. For the protection of the baggage train: see Arr. *Anab.* 3.12.5; cf. Curt. 4.13.31. For garrison duties: see Arr. *Anab.* 3.19.7 (Media), 5.20.7 (Parthia and Hyrcania), 6.15.2 (India); Bosworth, *Commentary*, 1.337f., 2.320f.; idem; *Conquest and Empire*, 265.

[61] By all indications, ethnic Greeks and Macedonians formed the majority of the ruling elite in the Hellenistic East: see James L. O'Neil, "Places and Origin of the Officials of Ptolemaic Egypt," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 55 (2006): 16-25; Rolf Strootman, "Hellenistic Court Society: The Seleukid Imperial Court under Antiochos the Great, 223–187 BCE," in *Royal Courts in Dynastic States and Empires: A Global Perspective*, ed. Jeroen Duindam et al. (Rulers & Elites 1; Leiden: Brill, 2011), 63-89, esp. 81-83; idem, *Courts and Elites*, 124ff.

held the titles of Kinsman of the King (συγγενὴς τοῦ βασιλέως), High Priest (ἀρχιερεύς), General (στρατηγός) of Cyprus, and Admiral (ναύαρχος), all of which his son Theodoros would later attain as well.[62] In the table below, I have catalogued other persons of known or probable Thracian ancestry who attained prominence in the Ptolemaic and Seleukid kingdoms, all of them attested during or after the late-third century, when Thracians had already been living in the East for several generations:

Table 6: Prominent Thracians

Name	*Date*	*Kingdom*	*Positions, Titles, and Honorifics*
Bithys	209	Seleukid	Satrapal official in Lydia[63]
Bithys son of Thraseas	125–96	Seleukid	Kinsman (συγγενής) and Letter-Writer (ἐπιστο-λογράφος) of Antiochos VIII[64]
Demetrios son of Sitalkes	198/7	Ptolemaic	Eponymous priest of Alexander and the deified Ptolemies at Alexandria[65]
Dionysios	217	Ptolemaic	Commander of 6,000 Thracians and Gauls, 4,000 of whom were descendants of military settlers[66]
Isiades	130	Ptolemaic	Brother of the Cavalry Settlers (ἀδελφός τῶν κατ-οίκων ἱππέων) at Hermonthis[67]

[62] P. M. Fraser, *Ptolemaic Alexandria*, 3 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972), 2.167 n333; Leon Mooren, *The Aulic Titulature in Ptolemaic Egypt: Introduction and Prosopography* (Brussels: Paleis der Academiën, 1975), 189f. no. 0353, 192-195 no. 0355; Bagnall, *Ptolemaic Possessions*, 258-260; Velkov and Fol, *Thraces*, 39f. no. 129, 55 no. 241; cf. Bingen, "Thracians," 92.

[63] *SEG* XXXVII 1010; Hasan Malay, "Letter of Antiochos III to Zeuxis with Two Covering Letters (209 B.C.)," *Epigraphica Anatolica* 10 (1987): 7-15, esp. 11 n7; John D. Grainger, *A Seleukid Prosopography and Gazetteer* (Mnemosyne Supplements 172; Leiden: Brill, 1997), 85 s.v. Bithys (1).

[64] *OGIS* 259, ed. Wilhelm Dittenberg, *Orientis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*, 2 vols. (Leipzig: S. Hertzel, 1903–1905); Grainger, *Seleukid Prosopography*, 85 s.v. Bithys (2).

[65] Willy Clarysse and Griet van der Veken, *The Eponymous Priests of Ptolemaic Egypt* (Papyrologica Lugduno-Batava 24; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1983), 20 no. 93 with references.

[66] Plb. 5.65.10 (Διονύσιος ὁ Θρᾷξ).

[67] *P. Bad.* II 2, lines 36-37 (Ἰσιάδ[ης] Θρᾶιξ), http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.bad;2;2; Mooren, *Aulic Titulature*, 167 no. 0258.

Leonides son of Ptolemaios	150/49	Ptolemaic	Gymnasiarch at Theadelphia in Arsinoites[68]
Santobithys	130s	Ptolemaic	Chief Bodyguard (ἀρχισωματοφύλαξ); General in the Thebaid region[69]
Teres son of Herakleides	155–146	Ptolemaic	Friend (φίλος) of Ptolemy VI Philometor; General in Herakleopolites[70]
Thraikidas son of Hierax	first century	Ptolemaic	General in the Elephantine-Syene region[71]

Leonides son of Ptolemaios, the gymnasiarch at Theadelphia and a self-described Thracian, deserves special notice here, since gymnasia functioned as spaces for expressing and reinforcing Greekness through the uniquely Greek practice of nude exercise.[72] As Mario C. D. Paganini puts it in his recent monograph on Ptolemaic gymnasia, "regardless of their ethnic origin or mixed background, they (i.e., members of gymnasia) were all actively contributing to the transmission and perpetuation of Greek traditions."[73] At the

[68] *I. Fayoum* 102, 103 (Λεωνίδης Πτολεμαίου Θρᾷξ), ed. Étienne Bernard, *Recueil des inscriptions grecques du Fayoum*, vol. 2 [La "Méris" de Thémistos] (Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 1981).

[69] *BGU* VI 1247, https://papyri.info/ddbdp/bgu;6;1247; Mooren, *Aulic Titulature*, 116 no. 0119; cf. J. David Thomas, *The Epistrategos in Ptolemaic and Roman Egypt*, vol. 1 [Ptolemaic Epistrategos] (Papyrologica Coloniensia 6; Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1975), 38f.; Velkov and Fol, *Thraces*, 55 no. 236. On his name: see *OnomThrac*, 303 s.v. Σαντοβιθυς.

[70] *P. Berl. Zill.* II, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.berl.zill;;2; *P. Münch* III 50, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.muench;3.1;50; *P. Gen.* III 131, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/sb;20;15113; Mooren, *Aulic Titulature*, 108 no. 097; Joshua D. Sosin and John Bauschatz, "Four Duke Papyri Concerning Pesouris, *Basilikos Grammateus*," *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 141 (2002): 177-190 (179).

[71] *SB* V 7578, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/sb;5;7578; Velkov and Fol, *Thraces*, 41f. no. 143. The well-attested name Θρᾳκίδας seems to indicate Thracian ancestry, and I note here Lewis' (*Greek Slave Systems*, 279) interpretation of it as "MacThracian": cf. *OnomThrac*, 368.

[72] On gymnasia, nude exercise, and Greek identity: see e.g. Lee, *Body, Dress, and Identity*, 57-59; Donald G. Kyle, *Sport and Spectacle in the Ancient World*, 2nd ed. (Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2015), 5-7, 224-239; Mario C. D. Paganini, *Gymnasia and Greek Identity in Ptolemaic Egypt* (Oxford Classical Monographs; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022).

[73] Paganini, *Gymnasia*, 228. On non-Greek participation in gymnasia under the Seleukids: cf. also Getzel M. Cohen, *The Seleucid Colonies: Studies in Founding, Administration and Organization* (Historia Einzelschriften 30; Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1978), 36f.

same time, however, the integration of non-Greeks into the life of the gymnasia reflected a broadening definition of what constituted Greekness, under which Greek cultural practices transcended birth and ethnicity.[74] In a similar vein, we also find a growing (though still small) number of non-Greeks participating in Greek athletic events during the Hellenistic period.[75] Among Thracian athletes, a certain Asklepiodoros son of Triballos from Seleukia on the Tigris—presumably the descendant of a Triballian in Alexander's army, given his father's name and home city—traveled all the way to Athens to compete at the Panathenaia of 170/69, where he won the hoplite race.[76] And a list of victors from a set of contests held to celebrate Ptolemy II's birthday in 267 features no less than seven Thracians, several of them apparently the sons of one of the organizers, the Thracian-named Amadokos.[77]

In fact, non-Greeks in Ptolemaic Egypt could also earn official recognition as honorary Greeks. Vivid evidence for this, as far it concerns Thracians, survives in a mid-third-century tax register for the Fayoum village of Trikomia and its surrounding area, where there seem to have lived a mixed population of Egyptians, Greeks, Thracians, and Jews, judging from the personal names attested here.[78] Incredibly, individuals belonging

[74] Paganini, *Gymnasia*, 224.

[75] See Evangelos Albanidis et al., "The Joint Participation of Greeks and 'Barbarians' in Athletic Activities During the Hellenistic and Roman Times," *Nikephoros* 19 (2006): 187-226.

[76] Stephen V. Tracy and Christian Habicht, "New and Old Panathenaic Victor Lists," *Hesperia* 60, no. 2 (1991): 187-236 (188, col. I line 5, 216). On the name Τριβαλλός: see also Robert, "De Delphes à l'Oxus," 419f.; *OnomThrac*, 380 s.v. ? Τριβαλός, Τριβαλλός.

[77] *SEG* XXVII 1114; Ludwig Koenen, *Eine agonistische Inschrift aus Ägypten und frühptolemäische Königsfeste* (Beiträge zur klassischen Philologie 56; Meisenheim am Glan: Verlag Anton Hain, 1977); Bingen, "Thracians," 86-89. On the royal birthday festival for Ptolemy II: see also Fraser, *Ptolemaic Alexandra*, 1.232.

[78] *P. Count* 26, https://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.count;;26; Willy Clarysse, "Jews in Trikomia," in *Proceedings of the 20th International Congress of Papyrologists, Copenhagen, 23–29 August, 1992*, ed. Adam Bülow-Jacobsen (Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, 1994), 199-203; idem and Dorothy J.

to each of these four groups appear in the register under the heading of "Hellenes" (Ἕλληνες), a status which exempted them from an annual one-obol tax. The low value of the obol (an adult laborer in this period received, on average, about an obol a day in wages) points to the symbolic nature of the tax, and to qualify for "tax-Hellene" status, one likely had to render services to the Ptolemaic state and demonstrate cultural Greekness.[79] Accordingly, these "tax-Hellenes" may have enjoyed additional, unwritten privileges simply by virtue of their ties to the Greco-Macedonian ruling class, as presupposed by their honorary Greekness. To quote Willy Claryss and Dorothy J. Thompson:

> By whatever means this status was achieved, it is clear that to become a 'Hellene', with a preferential tax-status, brought benefits to its holder. With it came the outward marks of Greekness. Some took on Greek names… Greek language-use is likely to have been involved, not just for communication and within the bureaucracy but in legal and other official dealings. For those who could afford it, a Greek education for the children might bring them later rewards; to 'go Greek' might bring different forms of advantage. For some, likely to be a minority, membership of the gymnasium might follow. For the gymnasium, a traditional Graeco-Macedonian social and civic institution, played an important role in the hellenisation of the Ptolemaic countryside. Its members formed the elite of Ptolemaic society. And over time, to different degrees, the new tax-Hellenes who joined the ranks of the settlers might come to identify more strongly with the Ptolemaic regime, now well established in Egypt.[80]

Another remarkable piece of evidence for the Thracians' elevated social and cultural status in Hellenistic Egypt comes down to us in one of four Greeks hymns

---

Thompson, *Counting the People in Hellenistic Egypt*, 2 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 2.356-377 no. 26. For the Thracian names: see col. 7 lines 110 ([Δ]ιζουλας) and 113 (Σπάρτακος), col. 10 line 189 (Τηρης), col. 15 line 257 ([…] Μειζελμιο).

[79] Clarysse and Thompson, *Counting the People*, 2.71f., 2.138-147; Dorothy J. Thompson, "Hellenistic Hellenes: The Case of Ptolemaic Egypt," in *Ancient Perceptions of Greek Ethnicity*, 301-322 (306-312); Fischer-Bovet, *Army and Society*, 222; Paganini, *Gymnasia*, 226f. On wages in third-century Egypt: see Catharine Lorber and Christelle Fischer-Bovet, "Getting Paid in Ptolemaic Egypt in the 2nd and 1st Centuries BC," in *Money Rules! The Monetary Economy of Egypt, from Persians Until the Beginning of Islam*, ed. Thomas Faucher (Bibliothèque d'étude 176; Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 2020), 169-201 (172f. [Figure 1]).

[80] Clarysse and Thompson, *Counting the People*, 2.147.

dedicated to the goddess Isis by a certain Isiodoros.[81] Composed by a certain Isidoros, these hymns were inscribed on two pilasters at the entrance to the temple of Isis-Thermouthis at Medinet Madi in the southern Fayoum and probably date no later than the 80s.[82] Significantly, the first hymn, which exalts Isis for her omnipotence and universality, specifically distinguishes the Thracians from the "barbarians" in listing various non-Egyptian peoples who worship her under different names:

> ὅσσοι δὲ ζώουσι βροτοὶ ἐπ' ἀπείρονι γαίηι,
> Θρᾷκες καὶ Ἕλληνες, καὶ ὅσσοι βάρβαροί εἰσι,
> οὔνομά σου τὸ καλόν, πολυτίμητον παρὰ πᾶσι,
> φωναῖσι φράζουσ' ἰδίαις, ἰδίαι ἐνὶ πάτρηι.
> Ἀστάρτην Ἄρτεμίν σε Σύροι κλῄζουσι Ναναίαν
> καὶ Λυκίων ἔθνη {η} Λητοῦν καλέουσιν ἄνασ[σαν,
> μητέρα δὴ κλήζουσι θεῶν καὶ Θρήϊκες ἄνδρες,
> Ἕλληνες δ' Ἥρην μεγαλόθρονον ἠδ' Ἀφροδίτη[ν,
> καὶ Ἑστίαν ἀγαθήν, καὶ Ῥεῖαν, καὶ Δήμητρα…[83]
>
> As many mortals who live on the boundless earth,
> Thracians and Greeks, and as many who are barbarians,
> speak your beautiful name, much honored by all,
> with their own tongues, each in their own land.
> The Syrians call you Astarte, Artemis, and Nanaia,
> and the Lycian peoples call you Queen Leto,
> while Thracian men celebrate you also as Mother of the Gods,
> and Greeks as Great-throned Hera and Aphrodite,
> and good Hestia, and Rheia, and Demeter…

Thus, it seems that in Isidoros' worldview, the entire human race comprises a triad of the Thracians, Greeks, and barbarians (including, apparently, Egyptians), although the

[81] For the texts, translations, and commentary: see Frederika Vanderlip, *The Four Greek Hymns of Isidorus and the Cult of Isis* (American Studies in Papyrology 12; Toronto: A. M. Hakkert, 1972).

[82] On the physical context of these hymns: see conveniently Ian Moyer, "Isidorus at the Gates of the Temple," *in Greco-Egyptian Interactions: Literature, Translation, and Culture, 500 BCE–300 CE*, ed. Ian Rutherford (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 209-244 (212-215); Roger S. Bagnall and Dominic W. Rathbone, eds., *Egypt from Alexander to the Copts*, rev. ed. (Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 2017), 148-150. On the date of the hymns: see Vanderlip, *Hymns of Isidorus*, 9-16.

[83] *Hymn I*, lines 15-22. The translation below is my own.

goddess Isis, through her multiple incarnations, acts as a unifying figure.[84] The Thracians' prominence here contrasts sharply with their reputation in Archaic and Classical Greek literature as quintessential barbarians, and some scholars have detected in Isidoros' claims a possible acknowledgment of the Thracians' substantial numbers in Hellenistic Egypt and their importance to the Ptolemaic army.[85] Despite all this, the essentially Greco-Egyptian character of the hymn reminds us that the Thracian population would have faced constant pressure to assimilate to both the local Greek and Egyptian cultures, the former on account of the social, political, and economic benefits that it conferred and the latter as a consequence of the sheer force of demography. Yet as I hope to show in the next section, Thracians in the Hellenistic East often did hold on to a sense of Thracianness, to the extent that a person like Isidoros would still consider them a distinct people in first-century Egypt.

Thracian Identity in the Hellenistic East

We previously discussed Alexander's resettlement of Thracian troops in Bactria-Sogdiana; Thracian military colonies must have existed elsewhere too, some of them perhaps established by the early Successors rather than Alexander.[86] Down through the

[84] See Marco Fantuzzi and Richard Hunter, *Tradition and Innovation in Hellenistic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 359.

[85] See Vanderlip, *Hymns of Isidorus*, 27; Fantuzzi and Hunter, *Hellenistic Poetry*, 359; cf. Moyer, "Isidorus," 218f. n24.

[86] The archaeologist Sir William Mitchell Ramsay proposed long ago that Thracians had formed a large part of the original settlers at Pisidian Antioch (which the Seleukids established sometime in the third century) "because an inscription of pre-Roman time has been found containing a list of citizens, all Thracians" ("Studies in the Roman Province Galatia," *Journal of Roman Studies* 12 [1922]: 147-186 [186]). Unfortunately, this inscription "was never published and no trace of it has to come light since, either at Antioch or in Ramsay's logbooks," according to Stephen Mitchell ("Geographical and Historical Introduction," in *Pisidian Antioch: The Site and Its Monuments*, ed. idem and Marc Waelkens (Swansea: Duckworth/Classical Press of Wales, 1998), 1-18 [16 n28]); see also Louis Robert, *Noms indigènes dans l'Asie mineure gréco-romaine* (Bibliothèque archéologique et historique de l'Institut français d'archéologie

centuries, these colonies appear to have served as a source of Thracian manpower for the Hellenistic armies of the East. At the Battle of Raphia in 217, for instance, the Ptolemaic forces included 4,000 Thracians and Gauls "from among the settlers and their descendants" (ἐκ τῶν κατοίκων καὶ τῶν ἐπιγόνων), according to Polybius.[87] And when the Seleukid king Antiochus IV held a grand parade at the town of Daphne (near Syrian Antioch) in 166, it featured 3,000 Thracian soldiers, who, Launey believed, probably hailed from colonies as well, since the Romans had forbidden Seleukid recruitment from Europe under the terms of Treaty of Apameia in 188.[88] The segregation of Thracians into their own ethnic units might suggest, at any rate, that they were trained and equipped for traditional "Thracian-style" warfare as light infantry and cavalry, specialized roles which the Ptolemaic and Seleukid states may have deliberately cultivated by allowing and perhaps even encouraging their Thracians to express their ethnic identity.[89]

Thracian participation in ethnic-based military associations, as attested in two second-century Ptolemaic inscriptions, provides us some clearer evidence for such officially sanctioned expression of ethnic identity.[90] In one of these inscriptions, which was

---

d'Istanbul 13; Paris: Adrien Maisonneuve, 1963), 360; Getzel M. Cohen, *The Hellenistic Settlements in Europe, the Islands, and Asia Minor* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), 279.

[87] Plb. 5.65.10.

[88] Ibid. 30.25 (Ath. 5.194c-195a); Launey, *Armées*, 1.384; cf. Griffith, *Mercenaries*, 147; Sekunda, *Seleucid and Ptolemaic Reformed Armies*, 1.17f. Alternatively, the Treaty of Apameia may have been no longer enforced or in effect by the time of Antiochos IV: see e.g. Eliezer Paltiel, "The Treaty of Apamea and the Later Seleucids," *Antichthon* 13 (1979): 30-41. On the Daphne Parade: see Nicholas Sekunda, *Hellenistic Infantry Reform in the 160's BC* (Studies on the History of Ancient and Medieval Art of Warfare 5; Gdańsk: Foundation for the Development of Gdańsk University, 2006), 84-86, 150-158.

[89] See similarly Bezalel Bar-Kochva, *The Seleucid Army: Organization and Tactics in the Great Campaigns* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976), 34. The literary, archaeological, and iconographical evidence for Thracian soldiers in the Hellenistic period seems to bear out the impression that they largely fought as light infantry and cavalry: see conveniently Head, *Armies*, 124-127.

[90] On Hellenistic military associations: see Angelos Chaniotis, *War in the Hellenistic World: A Social and Cultural History* (Ancient World at War; Malden: Blackwell, 2005), 95; Thomas Kruse, "Ethnic *Koina* and *Politeumata* in Ptolemaic Egypt," in *Private Associations and the Public Sphere: Proceedings of*

discovered in 2009 at the site of the Boubastieion (temple of Bastet) in central Alexandria, the "association of the Thracian Tralians and the Masylians who came from Libya and those attached to them, as well as the Persians and Cypriots who are serving with them" (κοινὸν τῶν Τραλεών Θραικῶν καὶ τῶν παραγενομένων [ἀπ]ὸ τῆς Λιβύης Μασύλ[ω]ν καὶ [τῶ]ν τούτοις προσκειμένων [κα]ὶ Περσῶν καὶ Κυπρί[ων τῶ]ν συν<σ>τρατευομένων), grants honors to One of the First Friends (τῶν πρώτων φίλων) of the king—probably a high-ranking military officer in the court of Ptolemy VI.[91] The Tralians here may have belonged to the royal guard, and although the use of their tribal ethnic indicates that they identified first and foremost as Tralians, they also did not fail to emphasize their Thracianness.[92] The second inscription concerns the dedication of a statue to Ptolemy IX, then the crown prince, by "the association of the Thracians stationed in Cyprus and the fellow members of the body" (τὸ κοινὸν τῶν ἐν Κύπρωι τασσομένων Θραικῶν καὶ τῶν συνπολιτευομένων), with the latter group perhaps consisting of non-Thracian civilians (like merchants) who regularly kept company with the troops.[93] The existence of these two

a Symposium held at the Royal Danish Academy of Sciences and Letters, 9–11 September 2010, ed. Vincent Gabrielsen and Christian A. Thomsen (Copenhagen: Det Kongelige Danske Videnskaberns Selskab, 2015), 270-300.

[91] *CPI* 55, ed. Alan K. Bowman et al., *Corpus of Ptolemaic Inscriptions*, vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021), with commentary at 124-126; cf. Ahmed Abd el-Fattah et al., "Deux Inscriptions Grecques du *Boubasteion* d'Alexandrie," *Ancient Society* 44 (2014): 149-177 (151-161).

[92] For the identification of these Tralians as members of the royal guard: see Christelle Fischer-Bovet, "Soldiers in the Epigraphy of Ptolemaic Egypt," in *The Epigraphy of Ptolemaic Egypt*, ed. Alan Bowman and Charles Crowther (Oxford Studies in Ancient Documents; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020), 127-158 (138f.). On the Tralians in Hellenistic armies: see Launey, *Armées*, 1.399-402; John Ma, "The Attalids: A Military History," in *Attalid Asia Minor: Money, International Relations, and the State*, ed. Peter Thonemann (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 49-82 (63f.).

[93] *OGIS* 143. For speculation on the identity of the συμπολιτευόμενοι: see Cohen, *Seleucid Colonies*, 74; Kruse, "Ethnic *Koina* and *Politeumata*," 288-290., 293; cf. Houle, "Soldiers and Hellenism," 162 n14.

associations illustrate how Thracians could channel their ethnic and professional pride into community organizations, albeit under the auspices of the Ptolemaic state.

Outside of the official sphere, we find individuals self-identifying as Thracians with the ethnic Θρᾶιξ in Greek-language graffiti that they left behind in Egyptian temples and tombs, which they visited as either pilgrims or tourists, apparently.[94] The personal and informal nature of these graffiti suggest the existence of a Thracian ethnic consciousness within the Thracian population of Hellenistic Egypt, independent of (but not necessarily uninfluenced by) the ethnic category of "Thracian" known to Greeks and Macedonians, although the use of written Greek and the Egyptian historical-religious context remind us, again, that Thracians here experienced an ever-present process of assimilation. The graffiti themselves mostly consist of names and ethnics, and I have catalogued below the ones tentatively dated to the Hellenistic period:

Table 7: Thracian Self-Identification in Graffiti	
Location	*Graffito*
Abydos	Ἀρχίας Θρᾶιξ[95]
Abydos	Πέταλος Ἀγαθοκλέους Θρᾶιξ παρεγενήθη πρὸς τὸν Σάραπιν νουμηνίαι[96]

[94] On ancient pilgrim and tourist graffiti in Egypt: see Ian Rutherford, "Pilgrimage in Greco-Roman Egypt: New Perspectives on Graffiti from the Memnonion at Abydos," in *Ancient Perspectives on Egypt*, ed. Roger Matthews and Cornelia Roemer (Encounters with Ancient Egypt; London: UCL Press, 2003), 171-189; Filip Coppens, "Late Dynastic, Greco-Roman, and Christian Times: Post–New Kingdom Graffiti," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Valley of the Kings*, ed. Richard H. Wilkinson and Kent R. Weeks (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 469-480.

[95] *I. Memnonion* 415, ed. Paul Perdrizet and Gustave Lefebvre, *Inscriptiones Graecae Aegypti*, vol. 3 (Nancy: Berger-Levrault, 1919; reprint, Chicago: Ares Publishers, 1978); La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 88 no. E715.

[96] *I. Memnonion* 53; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 95 no. E780.

Amarna	[…]ωτος Θραιξ[97]
Valley of the Kings	Ἀσκληπιάδης Βίθυος Θράϊξ[98]
Valley of the Kings	Δαδᾶ[ς] Ζιπύρου Θρᾷ[ξ][99]
Valley of the Kings	Γλαυκίας Θρᾶξ[100]
Valley of the Kings	Μένων Θρᾷξ[101]
Valley of the Kings	Σάτοκος [Θ]ρᾶξ[102]
Valley of the Kings	[…]ος Θραιξ ἰδῶν ἐθαύμασα[103]

Onomastic practices represent another means by which Thracians might have displayed their ethnic identity in the Hellenistic East; indeed, the use of Thracian names across multiple generations of a family with a Thracian immigrant background hints at a continued, long-term attachment to their cultural heritage.[104] Many Thracians, to be sure, did adopt Greek names and give Greek names to their children, and among those labelled

[97] Seymour de Ricci, "The Greek Graffiti," in N. de Garis Davies, *The Rock Tombs of El Amarna*, vol. 3 (London: Egypt Exploration Fund, 1905), 34-37 (35 no. 19); Velkov and Fol, *Thraces*, 68 no. 334.

[98] *I. Syringes* 18, ed. Jules Baillet, *Inscriptions grecques et latines des tombeaux des rois ou syringes*, 2 vols. (Mémoires publiés par les membres de l'Institut français d'archéologie orientale du Caire 42; Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 1926); La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 88 no. E716

[99] *I. Syringes* 698; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 89 no. E724.

[100] *I. Syringes* 487; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 89 no. E723.

[101] *I. Syringes* 1959; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 94 no. E771.

[102] *I. Syringes* 473; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 96 no. E794.

[103] Gustave Deville, "Inscriptions grecques d'Egypte recueillies en 1861," *Archives des missions scientifiques et littéraires* 2 (1865): 457-492 (476 no. 170); Velkov and Fol, *Thraces*, 68 no. 338.

[104] The onomastic practices of the ancient Jewish diaspora offer a point of comparison here: see e.g. Honigman, "Birth of a Diaspora," 100ff.; Margaret H. Williams, "Semitic Name-Use by Jews in Roman Asia Minor and the Dating of the Aphrodisias *Stele* Inscriptions," in *Old and New Worlds in Greek Onomastics*, 173-197.

"Thracians of the descent" (i.e., descendants of Thracian settlers) in Egypt, we have only a few documented cases of a father and a son both bearing Thracian names.[105] That said, Thracian families seem to have commonly used Greek *and* Thracian names; to cite a particularly notable example of this phenomenon, a second-century lease agreement from the nome of Herakleopolites records the following "five Thracians" (πέ[ν]τε Θ̣ράι[κ]ες) as witnesses, all of them the sons of the Greek-named Neoptolemos: Sadalas (Thracian name), Aristolochos (Greek name), Masartas (Thracian name), Demetrios (Greek name), and Ptolemaios (Greek name).[106] Below, I have listed (non-exhaustively) further examples of Greek-named fathers with Thracian-named sons:

Table 8: Greek-Named Fathers with Thracian-Named Sons	
Son's Name	*Father's Name*
Bithys	Thraseas[107]
Isazelmis	Ptolemaios[108]
Medokos	Eudemos[109]
Sadalas	Theogenes[110]
Spokes	Herakleites[111]

[105] Masartas son of Medokos (*CPR* XVIII 3, line 2, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/cpr;18;3; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 101 no. E833); Spokes son of Bithys (*P. Sorb.* I 7, line 21, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.sorb;1;17dupl; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 102 no. E842); Teres son of Posistis (*P. Sorb.* I 7, lines 21, 23, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.sorb; 1;17dupl; La'da, *Foreign Ethnics*, 102 no. E847).

[106] *BGU* XIV 2390, lines 40-41, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/bgu;14;2390; *OnomThrac*, 211 s.v. Μασαρτας. See also *OGIS* 734, a fragmentary second-century inscription from El-Qusiya which identifies a Lysimachos (Greek name) and a Bastakilas (Thracian name) as the sons of another Bastakilas (Λυσίμαχος Βασταχίλου Θρ[ᾶ]ιξ καὶ Βαστακ[ί]λας καὶ […]μος οἱ υἱοὶ αὐτοῦ).

[107] *OGIS* 259; see also the table of prominent Thracians further above.

[108] *CPR* XVIII 3, line 1, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/cpr;18;3.

[109] *BGU* III 1002, line 3, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/bgu;3;1002.

[110] S. Wackenier apud *OnomThrac*, 299 (citing an unpublished letter).

[111] *BGU* XVIII.1 2732, line 11, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/bgu;18.1;2732.

Seuthes	Demetrios[112]
Seuthes	Philippos[113]
Seuthes	Simon[114]
Seuthes	Nikeratos[115]
Spartakos	Alexandros[116]
Spartakos	Eutychides[117]
Spartakos	Phaidros[118]
Teres	Artemidoros[119]
Teres	Lysimachos[120]

If religion played a role in shaping Thracian identity in the Hellenistic East, as it did in Attica with the cult of Bendis, no clear evidence of it has survived. On the other hand, we do see signs of Greek and Egyptian influence upon Thracians' religious lives. As already illustrated by their graffiti, Thracians made pilgrimages to Egyptian temples, no doubt to seek blessings from traditional Egyptian deities like Osiris—one graffito, written by the above-listed Spartakos son of Phaidros, ends with the cry, "Save me, Osiris" (Σῷζέ με, Ὄσιρι)—or even the Greco-Egyptian god Sarapis.[121] The divine entities embodied in

[112] *P. Tebt.* III.2 1021 R, line 19, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.tebt;3.2;1001r.
[113] *P. Tebt.* III.2 1022, line 133, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.tebt;3.2;1022.
[114] *I. Hermopolis* 5, col. III line 188, ed. Étienne Bernard, *Inscriptions grecques d'Hermoupolis Magna et de sa nécropole* (Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 1999).
[115] *P. Athen*. VIII, lines 17-18, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.athen;;8.
[116] *BGU* VI 1272, line 23, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/bgu;6;1272.
[117] *P. Count* 26, col. 7 line 113, https://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.count;;26.
[118] *I. Memnonion* 377.
[119] *P. Count* 26, col. 10, line 189, https://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.count;;26.
[120] *P. Heid.* VII 392, lines 3-4, http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.heid;7;392.
[121] *I. Memnonion* 377. On the deities invoked in the graffiti and the pilgrims' requests: see Rutherford, "Pilgrimage," 179f.

the iconography of the "Thracian Rider," which I discussed much earlier in relation to the local god Heros Karabasmos at Odessos, also underwent Egyptianization after their introduction to Egypt by Thracian soldiers, taking the form of a new god called Heron and becoming well-integrated, in time, within the broader religious landscape of Greco-Roman Egypt.[122] Notably, the second- and first-century dedications to Heron discovered at the Fayoum village of Theadelphia, where we previously encountered the Thracian gymnasiarch Leonides son of Ptolemaios, all come from persons with Egyptian names (Phnebses son of Psenamounis, Tnepheros, Phatres son of Horus, Petosiris son of Herakles).[123] Whether they were native Egyptians or Egyptianized foreigners remains impossible to determine, but such distinctions would perhaps not have mattered to them within their multicultural, "mixed" community.

Conclusion

In attempting to explain why Thracians eventually disappeared as a recognizable ethnic group in Egypt but not the Jews, Koen Goudriaan offers these remarks: "The Thracians of Egypt adopted Greek names, they used the Greek language, and the army made them familiar with the Greek way of life… In the end, there was no cultural feature left by which they could (or, for that matter, would) distinguish themselves from the Greeks. At that moment they vanished from history."[124] For Jews, in contrast, religion

[122] On Heron: see Jean Bingen, "Le dieu Hèrôn et les Hèrôn du Fayoum," in *Hommages à Jean Leclant*, vol. 3, ed. Catherine Berger et al. (Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 1994), 41-50; Gaëlle Tallet and Christiane Zivie-Coche, "Imported Cults," in *The Oxford Handbook of Roman Egypt*, ed. Christina Rigg (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 436-456 (439f., 444-446).

[123] *I. Fayoum* 64, 65, 115; see also Bingen, "Hèrôn," 45f.

[124] Goudriaan, "Ethnical Strategies," 79.

served as a pillar of their identity, which also had the effect of separating them from non-Jews who did not adhere to the Law, irrespective of any other cultural practices that they shared through Hellenization or Egyptianization. While Goudriaan ignores here the role of Egyptian influence upon Thracians, he captures the essence of the fact that social, political, and demographic conditions in the Hellenistic East would have naturally pushed Thracians toward cultural adaptation. The pressure to adapt must have been strongest in the areas controlled by the Seleukid Kingdom, where large-scale immigration from Europe appears to have ceased entirely by the early third century.

Yet despite these circumstances, Thracian identity proved remarkably durable, at least in Egypt, as illustrated in our data by the numerous individuals who self-identify as Thracians and the persistence of Thracian onomastic practices down to the end of the Hellenistic period (after which Roman rule brought new waves of Thracian soldiers and settlers to the region). The survival of the Thracians as a distinct ethnic group owes on some level, I believe, to the demographic realities in the Hellenistic East that compelled the Greco-Macedonian class to treat Thracians as cultural allies. This meant that Thracianness carried some advantages, namely when it came to opportunities for social, economic, and political advancement under the Greco-Macedonian power structure, and certainly giving Thracians an edge over the indigenous populations. Thus, Thracians had little reason to consciously abandon their identity.

Chapter 6

Conclusions

Throughout the preceding four chapters, I have attempted to uncover, as far as the evidence permits, what Thracianness might have entailed in different historical and cultural contexts. In the case of the "mixed" *poleis* in Thrace, Thracian and Greek elements of local traditions, practices, and uses of space became blended together, at times almost seamlessly, and we generally cannot discern among the inhabitants any attachment to particular ethnic identity. Outside of Thrace, however, Thracians may have often found themselves pigeonholed into ethnic categories conceived of or favored by non-Thracians. In Attica, the imposition of Thracianness took the form of naming or renaming slaves as Θρᾶιξ or Θρᾶιττα, which could also influence the type of exploitation and treatment that they received. For the Thracians deported to the interior of the Achaemenid Empire, their perceived Thracianness, to whatever degree the Persian kings understood it, served mainly to uphold a pillar of imperial ideology and propaganda. And it seems that Alexander the Great and the Successor states of the Hellenistic East usually kept their Thracian troops segregated into their own ethnic military units and colonies, apparently for the purpose of maintaining or cultivating their "Thracian-style" fighting techniques.

On the other hand, I have also tried to highlight the diverse ways in which Thracians expressed Thracian ethnic identity as a means of building community, showing ethnic pride, and improving their social standing under conditions in which non-Thracians exercised cultural and political hegemony. In Attica, for example, the Thracian population helped raise the cult of Bendis to prominence, thus earning them a place in Athenian public

life. In the Hellenistic East, we find self-identified Thracians forming themselves into socio-military associations, joining the ranks of the Greco-Macedonian power structure, and participating alongside Greeks and Macedonians in athletic events. Accordingly, both Thracians and non-Thracians could contribute to the construction of Thracian identity, which might have involved negotiations and renegotiations over time on what Thracianness meant to each group.

These conclusions are tentative, of course, and there exists significant room for additional research and discussion. Indeed, time constraints have prevented me from utilizing a vast array of data from other areas, especially Asia Minor. Apart from the light that it could shed on interactions between Thracians and other peoples of the region, this data also concerns the emergence of the independent Thracian kingdom of Bithynia during the late Achaemenid and early Hellenistic periods as well as Bithynia's unique multicultural setting, where we can discern Thracian, Phrygian, and Greek influences. In addition, developments in the Bithynian kingdom may have had a part in the wider history of the Thracians' movements and evolving status in the Hellenistic era, and it may prove worthwhile, moreover, to examine the literary and epigraphic evidence for Bithynian mercenaries in the Hellenistic East.

In considering the origins, development, and different manifestations of Thracian ethnicity, the roles played by the Odrysian Kingdom and Thracian elites also warrant further investigation, given their extensive interactions with the Greeks, as documented, for instance, by a number of Athenian honorary decrees for Odrysian kings and princes. On a preliminary basis, we might speculate that already during the Classical period,

prominent Thracians may have thought it expedient to embrace the "Thracian" label, whether to indulge Greek sensibilities for the sake of diplomacy or, in the case of a ruler who styled himself "King of the Thracians," to present grander political claims than a title like "King of the Odrysians" would convey. A systematic analysis of attestations of Thracian tribal ethnics may help us better grasp, too, the nature of Thracian tribal identities vis-à-vis the political and ethnic conceptions of Thracianness.

Overall, I believe that my case studies help to shed light on not only the Thracians and their encounters with non-Thracians but also, in general, the histories of the Greek colonies in Thrace, Attica, the Achaemenid Empire, and the Hellenistic East. As I have hopefully demonstrated, Thracians influenced the environments they came to inhabit, whether by rendering services or introducing new ideas and practices, and they left behind a sizable presence in the historical record, even if we rarely have all the details we would like. My research represents one step in the difficult and ongoing process of reintroducing the Thracians and other so-called "peoples without history" into our understanding of the ancient world.

Bibliography

Abd el-Fattah, Ahmed, Mohamed Abd el-Maksoud, and Jean-Yves Carrez-Maratray. "Deux Inscriptions Grecques du *Boubasteion* d'Alexandrie." *Ancient Society* 44 (2014): 149–77.

Akrigg, Ben. "Metics in Athens." In *Communities and Networks in the Ancient Greek World*, edited by Claire Taylor and Kostas Vlassopoulos, 155–73. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

———. *Population and Economy in Classical Athens*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

Albanidis, Evangelos, Fernando García Romero, and Onoufrios Pavlogiannis. "The Joint Participation of Greeks and 'Barbarians' in Athletic Activities During the Hellenistic and Roman Times." *Nikephoros* 19 (2006): 187–226.

Alexandrescu, Petre. "Ataias." *Studii Clasice* 9 (1967): 85–91.

Alexandrescu, Petre, and Sebastian Morintz. "A propos de la couche précoloniale de Mesambria." *Pontica* 15 (1982): 47–55.

Alexianu, Marius. "Lexicographers, Paroemiographers and Slaves-for-Salt Barter in Ancient Thrace." *Phoenix* 65, no. 3/4 (2011): 389–94.

Anson, Edward M. *Alexander the Great: Themes and Issues*. London: Bloomsbury, 2013.

Antonaccio, Carla. "Hybridity and the Cultures within Greek Culture." In *The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture: Contact, Conflict, Collaboration*, edited by Carol Dougherty and Leslie Kurke, 57–74. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Aperghis, Gerassimos G. "War Captives and Economic Exploitation: Evidence from the Persepolis Fortification Tablets." In *Economie antique: la guerre dans les économies antiques*, edited by Jean Andreau, Pierre Briant, and Raymond Descat, 127–44. Entretiens d'archéologie et d'histoire 5. Saint-Bertrand-de-Comminges: Musée archéologique départemental, 2000.

Archibald, Zosia H. *Ancient Economies of the Northern Aegean: Fifth to First Centuries BC*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.

———. *The Odrysian Kingdom of Thrace*. Oxford Monographs on Classical Archaeology. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.

———. "Thracian Cult—From Practice to Belief." In *Ancient Greeks West and East*,

edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 427–68. Mnemosyne Supplements 196. Leiden: Brill, 1999.

Arnott, W. Geoffrey. *Alexis: The Fragments: A Commentary*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

Asheri, David. "Herodotus on Thracian Society and History." In *Hérodote et Les Peuples Non Grecs: Neuf Exposés Suivis de Discussions*, edited by Giuseppe Nensi and Olivier Reverdin, 131–69. Entretiens Sur l'Antiquité Classique 35. Vandoeuvres: Fondation Hardt, 1990.

Ataç, Mehmet-Ali. "'Imaginal' Landscapes in Assyrian Imperial Monuments." In *Experiencing Power, Generating Authority: Cosmos, Politics, and the Ideology of Kingship in Ancient Egypt and Mesopotamia*, edited by Jane A. Hill, Philip Jones, and Antonio J. Morales, 383–423. Penn Museum International Research Conferences 6. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, 2013.

Avram, Alexandru. "Bulletin Épigraphique (Pont)." *Revue des Études Grecques* 119, no. 2 (2006): 683–93.

———. "Le rôle des époikoi dans la colonisation grecque en mer Noire: quelques études de cas." *Pallas* 89 (2012): 197–215.

———. "Les cités grecques de la côte Ouest du Pont-Euxin." In *Introduction to an Inventory of* Poleis*: Symposium August, 23-26 1995*, edited by Mogens Herman Hansen, 288–316. Acts of the Copenhagen Polis Centre 3; Det Kongelige Danske Videnskabernes Selskab, Historisk-filosofiske Meddelelser 74. Copenhagen: Munksgaard, 1996.

———. *Prosopographia Ponti Euxini Externa*. Colloquia Antiqua 8. Leuven: Peeters, 2013.

———. "Some Thoughts about the Black Sea and the Slave Trade before the Roman Domination (6th–1st Centuries BC)." In *The Black Sea in Antiquity: Regional and Interregional Economic Exchanges*, edited by Vincent Gabrielsen and John Lund, 239–51. Black Sea Studies 6. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2007.

———. "Untersuchungen zur Geschichte des Territoriums von Kallatis in griechischer Zeit." *Dacia* 35 (1991): 103–37.

Avram, Alexandru, John Hind, and Gocha R. Tsetskhladze. "The Black Sea Area." In *Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis, edited by Hansen and Thomas Heine Nielsen, 924–73. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Bäbler, Balbina. “Bobbies or Boobies? The Scythian Police Force in Classical Athens.” In *Scythians and Greeks: Cultural Interactions in Scythia, Athens and the Early Roman Empire (Sixth Century BC – First Century AD)*, edited by David Braund, 114–22. Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 2005.

———. *Fleissige Thrakerinnen und wehrhafte Skythen: Nichtgriechen im klassischen Athen und ihre archäologische Hinterlassenschaft.* Beiträge zur Altertumskunde 108. Stuttgart: B. G. Teubner, 1998.

Bacheva, Galya D. “Detecting a Satrapy: The Skudra Case.” *Thracia* 20 (2012): 11–26.

Bachvarova, Mary R. *From Hittite to Homer: The Anatolian Background of Greek Epic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.

Badian, Ernst. “Harpalus.” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 81 (1961): 16–43.

———. “Herodotus on Alexander I of Macedon: A Study in Some Subtle Silences.” In *Greek Historiography*, edited by Simon Hornblower, 107–30. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994.

Bagnall, Roger S. *The Administration of the Ptolemaic Possessions Outside Egypt*. Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1976.

———. “The Origins of Ptolemaic Cleruchs.” *Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists* 21 (1984): 7–20.

Bagnall, Roger S., and Dominic W. Rathbone, eds. *Egypt from Alexander to the Copts*. Rev. ed. Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 2017.

Baillet, Jules. *Inscriptions grecques et latines des tombeaux des rois ou syringes*. 2 vols. Mémoires Publiés Par Les Membres de l’Institut Français d’archéologie Orientale Du Caire 42. Cairo: Institut Français d’Archéologie Orientale, 1926.

Bakewell, Geoffrey. “Trierarchs’ Records and The Athenian Naval Catalogue (*IG* i^3 1032).” In *Orality, Literacy, Memory in the Ancient Greek and Roman World*, edited by E. Anne Mackay, 143–62. Orality and Literacy in Ancient Greece 7; Mnemosyne Supplements 298. Leiden: Brill, 2008.

Balabanov, Petăr. “Trois inscriptions du littoral sud-est de la mer Noire.” In *Studia in Honorem Georgii Mihailov*, edited by Alexandre Fol, Bogdan Bogdanov, Petăr Dimitrov, and Dimităr Bojadžiev, 37–40. Sofia: Institute of Thracology, Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski,” 1995.

Balcer, Jack Martin. “Persian Occupied Thrace (Skudra).” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 37 (1988): 1–21.

———. *The Persian Conquest of the Greeks 545–450 B.C.* Xenia 32. Konstanz: Universitätsverlag Konstanz, 1995.

Balkanska, Ana, and Chavdar Tzochev. "Amphora Stamps from Seuthopolis – Revised." In *Phosphorion: Studia in Honorem Mariae Čičikova*, edited by Diana Gergova, 188–205. Sofia: Prof. Marin Drinov Academic Publishing House, 2008.

Baralis, Alexandre, Krastina Panayotova, Teodora Bogdanova, Martin Gyuzelev, Dimitar Nedev, and Kostantin Gospodinov. "Apollonia Pontica (Sozopol, Bulgaria): The Results of the Franco-Bulgarian Archaeological Mission." In *The Black Sea in the Light of New Archaeological Data and Theoretical Approaches: Proceedings of the 2nd International Workshop on the Black Sea in Antiquity Held in Thessaloniki, 18-20 September 2015*, edited by Manolis Manoledakis, 153–79. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2016.

Bar-Kochva, Bezalel. *The Seleucid Army: Organization and Tactics in the Great Campaigns*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.

Barrio Vega, María Luisa del. "The Greek Language in the Black Sea." In *Studies in Ancient Greek Dialects: From Central Greece to the Black Sea*, edited by Georgios K. Giannakis, Emilio Crespo, and Panagiotis Filos, 511–30. Trends in Classics Supplementary Volumes 49. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2018.

Batty, Roger. *Rome and the Nomads: The Pontic-Danubian Realm in Antiquity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

Baynham, E. J. "Baleful Birth in Babylon: The Significance of the Prodigy in the *Liber de Morte*—An Investigation of Genre." In *Alexander the Great in Fact and Fiction*, edited by A. B. Bosworth and E. J. Baynham, 242–62. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Beaumont, Lesley A. *Childhood in Ancient Athens: Iconography and Social History*. Routledge Monographs in Classical Studies. London: Routledge, 2012.

Beazley, J. D. *Attic Black-Figure Vase-Painters*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956.

Beekes, Robert, and Lucien van Beek. *Etymological Dictionary of Greek*. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2010.

Behte, Ericus, ed. *Pollucis Onomasticon*. 3 vols. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1900.

Bekker, Immanuel, ed. *Theophanes Continuatus, Ioannes Cameniata, Symeon Magister, Georgius Monachus*. Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae 45. Bonn: Weber, 1838.

Bengtson, Hermann. “Neues zur Geschichte des Hellenismus in Thrakien und in der Dobrudscha.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 11 (1962): 18–28.

Bergad, Laird W. *The Comparative Histories of Slavery in Brazil, Cuba, and the United States*. New Approaches to the Americas. Cambridge: Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Bergemann, Johannes. *Demos und Thanatos: Untersuchungen zum Wertsystem der Polis im Spiegel der attischen Grabreliefs des 4. Jahrhunderts v. Chr. und zur Funktion der gleichzeitigen Grabbauten*. Munich: Biering & Brinkmann, 1997.

Bernard, Étienne. *Inscriptions grecques d’Hermoupolis Magna et de sa Nécropole*. Cairo: Institut Français d’Archéologie Orientale, 1999.

———. *Recueil des inscriptions grecques du Fayoum*. Cairo: Institut Français d’Archéologie Orientale, 1981.

Berve, Helmut. *Das Alexanderreich auf prosopographischer Grundlage*. 2 vols. Munich: C. H. Beck, 1926.

Beševliev, Veselin. “Die Westküste des Schwarzen Meeres.” *Klio* 63 (1981): 261–66.

———. “Vorthrakisch?” *Balkan Studies* 31 (1990): 47–50.

Best, J. G. P. *Thracian Peltasts and Their Influence on Greek Warfare*. Studies of the Dutch Archaeological and Historical Society 1. Groningen: Wolters-Noordhoff, 1969.

Bichler, Reinhold. “Persian Geography and the Ionians: Herodotus.” In *Brill’s Companion to Ancient Geography: The Inhabited World in Greek and Roman Tradition*, edited by Serena Bianchetti, Michele R. Cataudella, and Hans-Joachim Gehrke, 3–20. Leiden: Brill, 2016.

———. “Philip II and the Scythians in the Light of Alexander Historiography.” In *The History of the Argeads: New Perspectives*, edited by Sabine Müller, Timothy Howe, Hugh Bowden, and Robert Rollinger, translated by Franz Pramhaas, 253–68. Classica et Orientalia 19. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2017.

Bicknell, Peter. “Themistokles’ Father and Mother.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 31, no. 2 (1982): 161–73.

Billerbeck, Margarethe, Christian Zubler, and Arlette Neumann-Hartmann, eds. *Stephani Byzantii Ethnica*. 5 vols. Corpus Fontiae Historiae Byzantiae 43. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2006.

Billows, Richard A. *Antigonos the One-Eyed and the Creation of the Hellenistic State*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.

———. *Kings and Colonists: Aspects of Macedonian Imperialism*. Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition 22. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995.

Bingen. "Le dieu Hèrôn et les Hèrôn du Fayoum." In *Hommages à Jean Leclant*, edited by Catherine Berger, Gisèle Clerc, and Nicolas Grimal, 3:41–50. Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 1994.

Bingen, Jean. "Greek Economy and Egyptian Society in the Third Century." In *Hellenistic Egypt: Monarchy, Society, Economy, Culture*, edited by Roger Bagnall, 215–28. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.

———. "The Thracians in Ptolemaic Egypt." In *Hellenistic Egypt: Monarchy, Society, Economy, Culture*, edited by Roger Bagnall, 83–93. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.

Blazeby, Clare Kelly. "Woman + Wine = Prostitute in Classical Athens?" In *Greek Prostitutes in the Ancient Mediterranean, 800 BCE–200 CE*, edited by Allison Glazebrook and Madeleine M. Henry, 86–105. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011.

Blažek, Václav. "Apollo the Archer." In *Ancient Greek Linguistics: New Approaches, Insights, Perspectives*, edited by Felicia Logozzo and Paolo Poccetti, 643–61. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2017.

Blok, Josine H. *Citizenship in Classical Athens*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

———. "Perikles' Citizenship Law: A New Perspective." *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 58, no. 2 (2009): 141–70.

Boardman, John. *The Greeks Overseas: Their Early Colonies and Trade*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1980.

Boer, Jan G. de. "Apollonia Pontica and Its Emporia, Ports of Trade?" In *Pont Euxin et commerce: la genèse de la 'route de la soie.' Actes du IX^e^ Symposium de Vani (Colchide, 1999)*, edited by Murielle Faudot, Arlette Fraysse, and Évelyne Geny, 125–38. Besançon: Institut des Sciences et Techniques de l'Antiquité, 2002.

———. "River Trade in Eastern and Central Thrace from the Bronze Age till the Hellenistic Period." *Eirene* 46 (2010): 176–89.

Bøgh, Birgitte. "Mother of the Gods: Goddess of Power and Protector of Cities." *Numen* 59 (2012): 32–67.

———. "The Phrygian Background of Kybele." *Numen* 54 (2007): 304–39.

Boiy, Tom. “Royal and Satrapal Armies in Babylonia during the Second Diadoch War. *The Chronicle of the Successors* on the Events during the Seventh Year of Philip Arrhidaeus (=317/316 BC).” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 130 (2010): 1–13.

———. “The Reigns of the Seleucid Kings According to the Babylonian King List.” *Journal of Near Eastern Studies* 70 (2011): 1–12.

Bojadziev, Dimitar. “Un Cas de Contact Entre La Langue Thrace et La Langue Grecque.” In *Thracia Pontica III: Troisième symposium international, Sozopol, 6-12 octobre 1985*, edited by Michail Lazarov, Ventsislav Popov, and Khalin Porojanov, 182–85. Sofia: Centre d’histoire maritime et d’archeologie sous-marin, 1986.

Bonfante, Giuliano. “A Note on the Samothracian Language.” *Hesperia* 24, no. 2 (1955): 101–9.

Boshnakov, Konstantin. *Die Thraker südlich vom Balkan in den* Geographika *Strabos: Quellenkritische Untersuchungen*. Palingenesia 81. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2003.

———. *Pseudo-Skymnos (Semos von Delos?). Τὰ ἀριστερὰ τοῦ Πόντου. Zeugnisse griechischer Schriftsteller über den westlichen Pontosraum*. Palingenesia 82. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2004.

Bosworth, A. B. *A Historical Commentary on Arrian’s History of Alexander*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980.

———. “Alexander the Great and the Decline of Macedon.” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 106 (1986): 1–12.

———. *Conquest and Empire: The Reign of Alexander the Great*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.

———. “Ptolemy and the Will of Alexander.” In *Alexander the Great in Fact and Fiction*, edited by A. B. Bosworth and E. J. Baynham, 207–41. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

———. “The Historical Setting of Megasthenes’ *Indica*.” *Classical Philology* 91, no. 2 (1996): 113–27.

———. *The Legacy of Alexander: Politics, Warfare, and Propaganda under the Successors*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Boteva, Dilyana. “The ‘Thracian Horseman’ Reconsidered.” In *Early Roman Thrace: New Evidence from Bulgaria*, edited by Ian P. Haynes, 84–106. Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplementary Series 82. Portsmouth: Journal of Roman

Archaeology, 2011.

———. "'Under Cover of Carrying Succour to the Byzantines': King Philip V of Macedon against Thracian Chiefs (Analysis of Liv. XXXIX, 35, 4)." In *Cities in Southeastern Thrace: Continuity and Transformation*, edited by Daniela Stoyanova, Grigor Boykov, and Ivaylo Lozanov, 115–24. Sofia: St. Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2017.

Bouzek, Jan. *Studies of Homeric Greece*. Prague: Charles University, Karolinum Press, 2018.

Bouzek, Jan, and Denver Graninger. "Geography." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 12–21. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Bowman, Alan K., Charles V. Crowther, Simon Hornblower, Rachel Mairs, and Kyriakos Savvopoulos. *Corpus of Ptolemaic Inscriptions*. Vol. 1. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021.

Bradeen, Donald W. *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*. Vol. 17. Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 1974.

Braund, David. "Friends and Foes: Monarchs and Monarchy in Fifth-Century Athenian Democracy." In *Alternatives to Athens: Varieties of Political Organization and Community in Ancient Greece*, edited by Roger Brock and Stephen Hodkinson, 103–18. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

———. "Greater Olbia: Ethnic, Religious, Economic, and Political Interactions in the Region of Olbia, *c.* 600–100 BC." In *Classical Olbia and the Scythian World: From the Sixth Century BC to the Second Century AD*, edited by David Braund and S. D. Kryzhitskiy, 37–77. Proceedings of the British Academy 142. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

Braund, David, and G. R. Tsetskhladze. "The Export of Slaves from Colchis." *Classical Quarterly* 39 (1989): 114–25.

Briant, Pierre. "De Samarkhand à Sardes et de la ville de Suse au pays des Hanéens." *Topoi* 4, no. 2 (1994): 455–67.

———. *From Cyrus to Alexander: A History of the Persian Empire*. Translated by Peter T. Daniels. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2002.

———. "The Achaemenid Empire." In *War and Society in the Ancient and Medieval Worlds: Asia, the Mediterranean, Europe and Mesoamerica*, edited by Kurt A.

Raaflaub and Nathan Rosenstein, 105–28. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.

———. “The Empire of Darius III in Perspective.” In *Alexander the Great: A New History*, edited by Waldemar Heckel and Lawrence A. Tritle, 141–70. Malden: Blackwell, 2009.

———. “The Seleucid Kingdom, the Achaemenid Empire and the History of the Near East in the Near East in the First Millennium B.C.” In *Religion and Religious Practice in the Seleucid Kingdom*, edited by Per Bilde, Troeis Engberg-Pedersen, Lise Hannestad, and Jan Zahle, 40–65. Studies in Hellenistic Civilization 1. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 1990.

Brixhe, Claude. “Corpus.” In *Archaia Zoni I: To Iero tou Apollona*, 251–81. Komotini: Ypourgeio Politismou kai Athlitismou, Eforeia Archaiotíton Evrou, Perifereia Anatolikis Makedonias-Thrakis, 2015.

———. “Langue et écriture.” In *Archaia Zoni I: To Iero tou Apollona*, 282–306. Komotini: Ypourgeio Politismou kai Athlitismou, Eforeia Archaiotíton Evrou, Perifereia Anatolikis Makedonias-Thrakis, 2015.

———. “Zônè et Samothrace: lueurs sur la langue thrace et nouveau chapitre de la grammaire comparée?” *Comptes rendus des séances de l’Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 150 (2006): 121–46.

Brixhe, Claude, and Antigoni Zournatzi. “Les Inscriptions Sur Pierres.” In *Archaia Zoni I: To Iero tou Apollona*, 251–66. Komotini: Ypourgeio Politismou kai Athlitismou, Eforeia Archaiotíton Evrou, Perifereia Anatolikis Makedonias-Thrakis, 2015.

Broneer, Oscar. “Excavations on the North Slope of the Acropolis in Athens, 1933–1934.” *Hesperia* 4, no. 2 (1935): 109–88.

Brubaker, Leslie, and John Haldon. *Byzantium in the Iconoclast Era (ca 680–850): The Sources*. Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs 7. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001.

Brunt, P. A. “Alexander’s Macedonian Cavalry.” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 83 (1963): 27–46.

Buckler, John. *Aegean Greece in the Fourth Century BC*. Leiden: Brill, 2003.

Bugh, Glenn R. “Cavalry Inscriptions from the Athenian Agora.” *Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens* 67 (1988): 81–90.

———. “Greek Cavalry in the Hellenistic World: Review and Reappraisal.” In *New*

Approaches to Greek and Roman Warfare, edited by Lee L. Brice, 65–80. Hoboken: Wiley-Blackwell, 2020.

Burford, Alison. *Craftsmen in Greek and Roman Society*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1972.

Burn, Andrew R. *Persia and the Greeks: The Defence of the West, c. 546–478 B.C.* London: Edward Arnold, 1962.

Burstein, Stanley M. *Outpost of Hellenism: The Emergence of Heraclea on the Black Sea*. University of California Publications in Classical Studies 14. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976.

———. "Ptolemy III and the Dream of Reuniting Alexander's Empire." *Ancient History Bulletin* 30, no. 3–4 (2016): 77–86.

Canfora, Luciano. "Biographical Obscurities and Problems of Composition." In *Brill's Companion to Thucydides*, edited by Antonios Rengakos and Antonios Tsakmakis, 3–31. Leiden: Brill, 2006.

Carney, Elizabeth. "Commemoration of a Royal Woman as a Warrior: The Burial in the Antechamber of Tomb II at Vergina." *Syllecta Classica* 27 (2016): 109–49.

———. *King and Court in Ancient Macedonia: Rivalry, Treason and Conspiracy*. Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2015.

Carnoy, Albert. "Noms grecs de plantes d'origine pré-hellénique." *L'antiquité Classique* 27, no. 2 (1958): 305–27.

Cartledge, Paul. *Alexander the Great: The Hunt for a New Past*. New York: Vintage Books, 2005.

———. "Rebels and *Sambos* in Classical Greece: A Comparative View." In *Crux: Essays in Greek History Presented to G.E.M. de Ste. Croix on His 75th Birthday*, edited by Paul Cartledge and F. D. Harvey, 16–46. London: Duckworth, 1985.

Casevitz, Michel. "Δουλεκδουλος: Sur une injure et certains composés nominaux." *Revue de philologie, de littérature et d'histoire anciennes* 83 (2009): 31–38.

———. *Le vocabulaire de la colonisation en grec ancien. Étude lexicologique: les familles de κτίζω et de οἰκέω-οἰκίζω.* Collection Études et Commentaries 97. Paris: Klincksieck, 1985.

———. "Le vocabulaire du mélange démographique: mixobarbares et mixhellènes." In *Origines Gentium*, edited by Valérie Fromentin and Sophie Gotteland, 41–47. Bordeaux: Ausonius, 2001.

Casson, Lionel. “The Thracians.” *Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin* 35 (1977): 2–6.

Casson, Stanley. *Macedonia, Thrace and Illyria*. London: Humphrey Milford, Oxford University Press, 1926.

Castelli, Thibaut. “Un ‘protectorat’ thrace? Les relations politiques entre Grecs et Thraces autour de la baie de Bourgas (III^{e}-II^{e} s. Av. J.-C.).” In *I Traci tra geografia e storia*, edited by Paola Schirripa, 81–108. Aristonothos: Scritti per il Mediterraneo antico 9. Trento: Tangram Edizioni Scientifiche, 2015.

Catling, H. W. “Archaeology in Greece 1988–89.” *Archaeological Reports* 35 (1989 1988): 3–116.

Celestino, Sebastián, and Carolina López-Ruiz. *Tartessos and the Phoenicians in Iberia*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Chaniotis, Angelos. *War in the Hellenistic World: A Social and Cultural History*. Ancient World at War. Malden: Blackwell, 2005.

Chiekova, Dobrinka. *Cultes et vie religieuse des cités grecques du Pont Gauche (VII^{e}-I^{er} siècles avant J.-C.)*. Publications universitaires europeennes, Série 38; Archäologie 76. Bern: Peter Lang, 2008.

Chimbuleva, Zhana, and Dimiter Saselov. *The Ancient City of Nessebur*. Sofia: Technica Publishing House, 1993.

Clarysse, Willy. “Jews in Trikomia.” In *Proceedings of the 20th International Congress of Papyrologists, Copenhagen, 23–29 August, 1992*, edited by Adam Bülow-Jacobsen, 199–203. Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, 1994.

Clarysse, Willy, and Dorothy J. Thompson. *Counting the People in Hellenistic Egypt*. 2 vols. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

Clarysse, Willy, and Griet van der Veken. *The Eponymous Priests of Ptolemaic Egypt*. Papyrologica Lugduno-Batava 24. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1983.

Cohen, David. “Law, Society and Homosexuality in Classical Athens.” In *Studies in Ancient Greek and Roman Society*, edited by Robin Osborne, 61–77. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Cohen, Getzel M. *The Hellenistic Settlements in Europe, the Islands, and Asia Minor*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996.

———. *The Hellenistic Settlements in the East from Armenia and Mesopotamia to Bactria and India*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013.

———. *The Seleucid Colonies: Studies in Founding, Administration and Organization*. Historia Einzelschriften 30. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1978.

Collins, John J. "Hellenistic Judaism in Recent Scholarship." In *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture: Essays on the Jewish Encounter with Hellenism and Roman Rule*, 1–20. Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 100. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

Collitz, Hermann. *Sammlung der griechischen Dialekt-Inschriften*. Vol. 2. Göttingen: Verlag von Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1899.

Cook, J. M. *The Persian Empire*. New York: Schocken Books, 1983.

Coppens, Filip. "Late Dynastic, Greco-Roman, and Christian Times: Post–New Kingdom Graffiti." In *The Oxford Handbook of the Valley of the Kings*, edited by Richard H. Wilkinson and Kent R. Weeks, 469–80. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Corsten, Thomas. "The Rôle and Status of the Indigenous Population in Bithynia." In *Rome and the Black Sea Region: Domination, Romanisation, Resistance*, edited by Tønnes Bekker-Nielsen, 85–92. Black Sea Studies 5. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2006.

———. "Thracian Personal Names and Military Settlements in Hellenistic Bithynia." In *Old and New Worlds in Greek Onomastics*, edited by Elaine Matthews, 121–33. Proceedings of the British Academy 148. Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2007.

Cox, Cheryl Anne. *Household Interests: Property, Marriage Strategies, and Family Dynamics in Ancient Athens*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.

Croke, Brian. "The Date of the 'Anastasian Long Wall' in Thrace." *Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies* 20 (1982): 59–78.

Crugnola, Annunciata. *Scholia in Nicandri Theriaka cum glossis*. Testi e documenti per lo studio dell'Antichità 34. Milan: Istituto Editoriale Cisalpino, 1971.

Dalley, Stephanie. Review of *'Greeks' and 'Greece' in Mesopotamian and Persian Perspectives*, by Amélie Kuhrt. *Ancient West and East* 3, no. 2 (2004): 430–31.

Damyanov, Margarit. "Dionysopolis, Its Territory and Neighbours in the Pre-Roman Times." In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, edited by Dimitrios V. Grammenos and Elias K. Petropoulos, 1:1–31. BAR International Series 1675. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2007.

———. "First Encounters and Further Developments: Greeks Meeting Thracians on the

Western Pontic Coast." In *Archaeology Across Frontiers and Borderlands: Fragmentation and Connectivity in the North Aegean and the Central Balkans from the Bronze Age to the Iron Age*, edited by Stefanos Gimatzidis, Magda Pieniazek, and Sila Mangalaglu-Votruba, 243–68. Oriental and European Archaeology 9. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2018.

———. "Greeks and Natives in the Region of Odessos." In *Grecs et indigènes de la Catalogne à la Mer Noire: Actes des rencontres du programme européen Ramses2 (2006-2008)*, edited by Henri Tréziny, 265–76. Bibliothèque d'Archéologie Méditerranéenne et Africaine 3. Paris: Édition Errance, 2010.

———. "Normative and Non-Normative Burial Practices in the Necropoleis of the Greek Colonies in the Western Black Sea Area." *Ancient West and East* 11 (2012): 35–68.

———. "Notes on the Development of Odessos and Its Vicinity until Early Hellenistic Times." *Talanta* 36–37 (2005 2004): 289–308.

———. "On the Local Population around the Greek Colonies in the Black Sea Area (5th-3rd Centuries BC)." *Ancient West and East* 2, no. 2 (2003): 253–64.

———. "The Greek Colonists." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 295–307. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Dana, Dan. "Inscriptions." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 243-264. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

———. "Les Thraces dans les armées hellénistiques: essai d''histoire par les noms.'" In *Pratiques et identités culturelles des armées hellénistiques du monde méditerranéen*, edited by Jean-Christophe Couvenhes, Sandrine Crouzet, and Sandra Péré-Noguès, 87–115. Hellenistic Warfare 3. Bordeaux: Ausonius Éditions, 2011.

———. *Onomasticon Thracicum*. Meletemata 70. Athens: Ethniko Idryma Erevnon, Institouto Istorikon Erevnon, 2014.

Dandamaev, Muhammad A. *Slavery in Babylonia*. Edited by Marvin A. Powell and David B. Weisberg. Translated by Victoria A. Powell. Rev. ed. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1984.

Dandamaev, Muhammad A., and Vladimir G. Lukonin. *The Culture and Social Institutions of Ancient Iran*. Translated by Philip L. Kohl and D. J. Dadson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Danov, Christo M. *Altthrakien*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1976.

———. “Die Thraker auf dem Ostbalkan von der Hellenistischen Zeit bis zur Gründung Konstantinopels.” *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt* II.7.1 (1979): 21–85.

———. “The Celtic Invasion and Rule in Thrace in the Light of Some New Evidence.” *Studia Celtica* 10/11 (1976 1975): 29–40.

Davies, J. K. *Athenian Propertied Families, 600–300 B.C.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971.

Day, John. “Where Was Tarshish?” In *Let Us Go Up to Zion: Essays in Honour of H. G. M. Williamson on the Occasion of His Sixty-Fifth Birthday*, edited by Iain Provan and Mark J. Boda, 359–69. Supplements to Vetus Testamentum 153. Leiden: Brill, 2012.

Delev, Peter. “From Corupedion towards Pydna: Thrace in the Third Century.” *Thracia* 15 (2003): 107–23.

———. “Once More on the Thracian Strategies of Claudius Ptolemy.” In *Sbornik v pamet na profesor Velizar Velkov*, edited by Dochka Vladimirova-Aladzhova, 245–53. Sofia: Natsionalen arkheologicheski institut i muzei - BAN, 2009.

———. “Stratifying Herodotus: Local Tribes between the Lower Axios and the Nestos.” *Thracia* 16 (2005): 105–21.

———. “Thrace from the Assassination of Kotys I to Koroupedion (360–281 BCE).” In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 48–58. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

———. “Tribes, Poleis and Imperial Aggression in the Lower Strymon Area in the 5th c. BC – The Evidence of Herodotus.” In *Thrace in the Graeco-Roman World: Proceedings of the 10th International Congress of Thracology, Komotini – Alexandroupolis 18-23 October, 2005*, edited by Athena Iakovidou, 110–19. Athens: Center for Greek and Roman Antiquity, National Hellenic Research Foundation, 2007.

Demetriou, Denise. *Negotiating Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean: The Archaic and Classical Greek Multiethnic Empori*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

———. “What Is an Emporion? A Reassessment.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 60, no. 3 (2011): 255–72.

Detschew, Dimiter. *Die Thrakishen Sprachreste*. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichische

Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1976.

Deville, Gustave. “Inscriptions grecques d’Egypte recueillies en 1861.” *Archives des missions scientifiques et littéraires* 2 (1865): 457–92.

Diller, Aubrey. “Excerpts from Strabo and Stephanus in Byzantine Chronicles.” *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 81 (1950): 241–53.

Dillery, John. *Clio’s Other Sons: Berossus and Manetho*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2015.

Dimitrov, Dimitur P., and Maria Čičikova. *The Thracian City of Seuthopolis*. Translated by Marguerite P. Alexieva. BAR Supplementary Series 38. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports, 1978.

Dimitrov, Peter A. *Thracian Language and Greek and Thracian Epigraphy*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2009.

Dimitrova, Nora. “Inscriptions and Iconography in the Monuments of the Thracian Rider.” *Hesperia* 71, no. 2 (2002): 209–29.

Dinsmoor, William Bell. “The Burning of the Opisthodomos at Athens.” *American Journal of Archaeology* 36, no. 2 (1936): 143–72.

Ditchey, Mallory. “Body Language: Tattooing and Branding in Ancient Mesopotamia.” *Journal of Ancient Near Eastern History* 3 (2017): 1–24.

Dittenberg, Wilhelm. *Orientis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*. 2 vols. Leipzig: S. Hertzel, 1903.

Dommelen, Peter van. “Colonial Constructs: Colonialism and Archaeology in the Mediterranean.” *World Archaeology* 28, no. 3 (1997): 305–23.

Donnellan, Lieve. “Ethnic Identity in the Western Black Sea Area: The Cases of Histria, Kallatis and Apollonia Pontika (7th – 4/3rd Centuries BC).” *Talanta* 36–37 (2005 2004): 189–268.

Dragonov, Dimitar. “The Bronze Coinage of Dionysopolis.” *Numismatic Circular* 105, no. 10 (1997): 371–77.

duBois, Page. *Slaves and Other Objects*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.

Dubuisson, Michel. “Remarques sur le vocabulaire grec de l’acculturation.” *Revue belge de philologie et d’histoire* 60 (1982): 5–32.

Duchêne, Hervé. “Sur la Stèle d’Aulus Caprilius Timotheos, Sômatemporos.” *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 110–111 (1986): 513–30.

Dueck, Daniela. “Memnon of Herakleia on Rome and the Romans.” In *Rome and the Black Sea Region: Domination, Romanisation, Resistance*, edited by Tønnes Bekker-Nielsen, 43–61. Black Sea Studies 5. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2006.

Düll, Siegrid. “Götter auf makedonischen Grabstelen.” In *Essays in Memory of Basil Laourdas*, edited by Louisa B. Laourda, 115–35. Thessaloniki: Sfakianakis, 1975.

Durand, Jean-Marine. “Unité et diversité au Proche-Orient à l’époque amorrite,” in *La circulation des biens, des personnes et des idées dans le Proche-Orient ancien: actes de la XXXVIIIe Rencontre assyriologique internationale, Paris, 8-10 juillet 1991*, edited by Dominique Charpin and Francis Joannès, 97–128. Paris: Editions Recherche sur les civilisations, 1992.

Duridanov, Ivan. *Die Sprache Der Thraker*. Bulgarische Sammlung 5. Neuried: Hieronymus Verlag, 1985.

Elvers, Karl-Ludwig. “Der ‘Eid der Berenike und ihrer Söhne’: Eine Edition von IGBulg. III 2, 1731.” *Chiron* 24 (1994): 241–66.

Engels, Donald W. *Alexander the Great and the Logistics of the Macedonian Army*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978.

Epstein, Shimon. “Attic Public Constructions: Who Were the Builders?” *Ancient Society* 40 (2010): 1–14.

———. “Organizing Public Construction in Ancient Greece.” *Scripta Classica Israelica* 27 (2008): 95–111.

Evans, J. A. S. “Herodotus and the Battle of Marathon.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 42, no. 3 (1993): 279–307.

Fantuzzi, Marco, and Richard Hunter. *Tradition and Innovation in Hellenistic Poetry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Farkas, Ann E. “Style and Subject Matter in Native Thracian Art.” *Metropolitan Museum Journal* 16 (1981): 33–48.

Farnell, Lewis Richard. *The Cults of the Greek States*. 5 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1896.

Festugière, A.-J. *Vie de Théodore de Sykeôn*. Vol. 1. Subsidia Hagiographica 48. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1970.

Fingerson, Kyle R. “Persian Katoikoi in Hellenistic Smyrna.” *Ancient Society* 37 (2007): 107–20.

Finley, M. I. *Aspects of Antiquity: Discoveries and Controversies*. London: Chatto & Windus, 1968.

———. “The Black Sea and Danubian Regions and the Slave Trade in Antiquity.” *Klio* 40 (1962): 51–59.

Fischer-Bovet, Christelle. *Army and Society in Ptolemaic Egypt*. Armies of the Ancient World 1. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

———. “Counting the Greeks in Egypt: Immigration in the First Century of Ptolemaic Rule.” In *Demography and the Graeco-Roman World: New Insights and Approaches*, edited by Claire Holleran and April Pudsey, 135–54. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

———. “Soldiers in the Epigraphy of Ptolemaic Egypt.” In *The Epigraphy of Ptolemaic Egypt*, edited by Alan Bowman and Charles Crowther, 127–58. Oxford Studies in Ancient Documents. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020.

Fleming, Daniel E. “Kingship of City and Tribe Conjoined: Zimri-Lim at Mari.” In *Nomads, Tribes, and the State in the Ancient Near East: Cross-Disciplinary Perspectives*, edited by Jeffrey Szuchman, 227–40. Oriental Institute Seminars 5. Chicago: Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2009.

Fol, Alexander. “Der Schatzfund von Rogozen. Zum Hellenismus in Südosteuropa.” In *Akten des XIII. Internationalen Kongresses für klassische Archäologie, Berlin 1988Berlin 1988*, 195–205. Mainz am Rhein: Verlag Philipp von Zabern, 1990.

Fol, Alexander, and Ivan Marazov. *Thrace and the Thracians*. New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1977.

Fol, Valeria. “The Great Goddess-Mother and the Monster Kenchrines.” *Études Balkaniques* 52 (2016): 28–40.

Fontenrose, Joseph. *Didyma: Apollo’s Oracle, Cult, and Companions*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.

Forsdyke, Sara. *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greece*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021.

Fowler, Robert L. *Early Greek Mythography*. Vol. 2. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.

———. “Pelasgians.” In *Poetry, Theory, Praxis: The Social Life of Myth, Word and Image*

in Ancient Greece: Essays in Honour of William J. Slater, edited by Eric Csapo and Christina Miller, 2–18. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2003.

Fraser, P. M. *Greek Ethnic Terminology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.

———. "Lycophron on Cyprus." *Report of the Department of Antiquities, Cyprus*, 1979, 328–43.

———. *Ptolemaic Alexandria*. 3 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972.

———. *Samothrace: The Inscriptions on Stone*. Samothrace, 2.1. New York: Pantheon Books, 1960.

Frost, Frank J. *Plutarch's Themistocles: A Historical Commentary*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980.

Furley, William D. *Menander* Epitrepontes. London: Institute of Classical Studies, School of Advanced Study, University of London, 2009.

———. *Menander* Perikeiromene *or* The Shorn Head. London: Institute of Classical Studies, School of Advanced Study, University of London, 2015.

Gager, John G., ed. *Curse Tablets and Binding Spells from the Ancient World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992.

Gardiner-Garden, John. "Ateas and Theopompus." *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 109 (1989): 29–40.

Gardner, Percy. "Ares as a Sun-God, and Solar Symbols on the Coins of Macedon and Thrace." *Numismatic Chronicle* 20 (1880): 49–61.

Gauthier, Philippe. *Un commentaire historique des* Poroi *de Xénophon*. Hautes études du monde gréco-romain 8. Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1976.

Geagan, Daniel J., ed. *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*. Vol. 21. Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 2011.

Georges, Pericles. "Darius in Scythia." *American Journal of Ancient History* 12, no. 2 (1987): 97–147.

Georgieva, Roumyana. "Burial Rites in Thrace and Phrygia." In *Thracians and Phrygians: Problems of Parallelism: Proceedings of an International Symposium on the Archaeology, History and Ancient Languages of Thrace and Phrygia, Ankara, 3-4 June 1995*, edited by Numan Tuna, Zeynep Aktüre, and Maggie Lynch, 61–64. Metu: METU, Faculty of Architecture Press, 1995.

Gerasimov, Todor. “Neizdadeni avtonomni moneti ot Mesambriya na Cherno more.” *Izvestiya na Narodniya muzei – Burgas* 1 (1950): 22–33.

Gigon, Olaf, ed. *Aristotelis Opera*. Vol. 3. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1987.

Giovinazzo, Grazia. “I *‘puhu’* nei testi di Persepoli. Nuove interpretazioni.” *Annali dell’Istituto Universitario Orientale di Napoli* 55 (1995): 142–57.

Giuzelev, Martin. “Ancient Funerary Monuments at Sozopol Archaeological Museum.” *Izvestiya na Narodniya muzei – Burgas* 4 (2002): 119–29.

Glassner, Jean-Jacques. *Mesopotamian Chronicles*. Edited by Benjamin R. Foster. Society of Biblical Literature Writings from the Ancient World 19. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2004.

Gočeva, Zlatozara. “Der Apollonkult in Odessos.” In *Studia in Honorem Veselini Beševliev*, edited by Vladimir Georgiev, Boris Gerov, Vasilka Tăpkova-Zaimova, Nikolaj Todorov, and Velizar Velkov, 288–98. Sofia: Academia Litterarum Bulgarica, 1978.

———. “Der Kult des Theos Megas Darzalas in Odessos.” *Würzburger Jahrbücher für die Altertumswissenschaft* 7 (1981): 229–34.

———. “La Thrace Pontique et la mythologie Grecque.” In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, edited by Dimitrios V. Grammenos and Elias K. Petropoulos, 1:51–84. BAR International Series 1675. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2007.

———. “Le culte d’Apollon dans les colonies grecques de la côte ouest-pontique.” *Kernos* 11 (1998): 227–34.

———. “Organization of Religious Life in Odessos.” *Kernos* 9 (1996): 121–27.

———. “Prêtres éponymes d’Odessos et de Dionysopolis.” *Klio* 62 (1980): 49–53.

———. “The Problem of Krounoi – Dionysopolis: One Settlement or Two?” In *New Studies on the Black Sea Littoral*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 13–16. Colloquia Pontica 1. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 1996.

Gočeva, Zlatozara, and Manfred Oppermann. *Corpus Cultus Equitis Thracii I: Monumenta Orae Ponti Euxini Bulgariae*. Études préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l’Empire romain 74. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1979.

Gomme, A. W. *A Historical Commentary on Thucydides*. Vol. 3. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956.

Goudriaan, Koen. “Ethnical Strategies in Graeco-Roman Egypt.” In *Ethnicity in*

Hellenistic Egypt, edited by Per Bilde, Troeis Engberg-Pedersen, Lise Hannestad, and Jan Zahle, 74–99. Studies in Hellenistic Civilization 3. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 1992.

Graham, A. J. "Abdera and Teos." *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 112 (1992): 44–73.

———. "The Colonization of Samothrace." *Hesperia* 71, no. 3 (2002): 231–60.

———. "Thucydides 7.13.2 and the Crews of Athenian Triremes." *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 122 (1992): 257–70.

———. "Thucydides 7.13.2 and the Crews of Athenian Triremes: An Addendum." *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 128 (1998): 89–114.

Grainger, John D. *The Rise of the Seleucid Empire (323–223 BC): Seleukos I to Seleukos III*. Barnsley: Pen & Sword, 2014.

———. *A Seleukid Prosopography and Gazetteer*. Vol. 172. Mnemosyne Supplements. Leiden: Brill, 1997.

———. *The Syrian Wars*. Mnemosyne Supplements 320. Leiden: Brill, 2010.

Graninger, Denver. "Documentary Contexts for the 'Pistiros Inscription,.'" *Electrum* 19 (2012): 99–110.

Graves, C. E. *The Fourth Book of Thucydides*. London: MacMillan, 1884.

Grayson, A. Kirk. *Assyrian and Babylonian Chronicles*. Locust Valley: J. J. Augustin, 1975.

———. *Babylonian Historical-Literary Texts*. Toronto Semitic Texts and Studies 3. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975.

———. "Königslisten und Chroniken." In *Reallexikon der Assyriologie und Vorderasiatischen Archäologie*, edited by Dietz O. Edzard, 6:86–135. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1980.

———. "The Empire of Sargon of Akkad." *Archiv für Orientforschung* 25 (1977 1974): 56–64.

Green, Peter. *From Alexander to Actium: The Historical Evolution of the Hellenistic Age*. Hellenistic Culture and Society 1. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.

Griffith, G. T. *The Mercenaries of the Hellenistic World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1935.

Gropp, Gerhard. “Sassen die Skudra Wirklich in Thrakien? Ein Problem der Satrapienverteilung in Kleinasien.” In *Achaemenid Anatolia: Proceedings of the First International Symposium on Anatolia in the Achaemenid Period, Bandirma 15-18 August 1997*, edited by Tomris Bakır and Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg, 37–42. Uitgaven van het Nederlands Historisch-Archaeologisch Instituut te İstanbul 92. Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 2001.

Grote, George. *History of Greece*. Vol. 4. London: John Murray, 1854.

Gruen, Erich S. “Cultural Fictions and Cultural Identity.” *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 123 (1993): 1–14.

Guicharrousse, Romain. “Gravées dans la mémoire. Le cas des étrangères à Athènes à l’époque Classique.” *Pallas* 99 (2015): 61–76.

Gundermann, Gotthold, ed. *Iuli Frontini Strategematon libri quattuor*. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1888.

Guzmán, Marta Oller. “What Was ‘Thracian’ in the Cult of Dionysos in Roman Thrace?” In *Proceedings of the First International Roman and Late Antique Thrace Conference “Cities, Territories and Identities” (Plovdiv, 3rd – 7th October 2016)*, edited by Lyudmil Vagalinski, Milena Raycheva, Dilyana Boteva, and Nicolay Sharankov, 211–19. Bulletin of the National Archaeological Institute 44. Sofia: National Institute of Archaeology with Museum, Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, 2018.

Habicht, Christian. *Athens from Alexander to Antony*. Translated by Deborah Lucas Schneider. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.

———. “Foreign Names in Athenian Nomenclature.” In *Greek Personal Names: Their Value as Evidence*, edited by Simon Hornblower and Elaine Matthews, 119–27. Proceedings of the British Academy 104. Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2000.

Hall, Edith M. *Inventing the Barbarian: Greek Self-Definition through Tragedy*. Oxford Classical Monographs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989.

Hall, Jonathan M. *A History of the Archaic Greek World, ca. 1200-479 BCE*. 2nd ed. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2014.

———. *Ethnic Identity in Greek Antiquity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

———. *Hellenicity: Between Ethnicity and Culture*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.

Hallock, Richard T. *Persepolis Fortification Tablets*. University of Chicago Oriental Institute Publications 92. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969.

Halpern, Baruch. *David's Secret Demons: Messiah, Murderer, Traitor, King*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2003.

Hammond, N. G. L. *A History of Macedonia*. Vol. 1. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972.

———. "Casualties and Reinforcements of Citizen Soldiers in Greece and Macedonia." *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 109 (1989): 56–69.

———. "Plataea's Relations with Thebes, Sparta and Athens." *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 112 (1992): 143–50.

Hammond, N. G. L., and G. T. Griffith. *A History of Macedonia*. Vol. 2. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1979.

Hammond, N. G. L., and F. W. Walbank. *A History of Macedonia*. Vol. 3. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988.

Handley, E. W. "Another Fragment of Menander's *Sikyonios*." *Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies* 31 (1984): 25–31.

Hansen, Mogens Herman. "A Survey of the Use of the Word Polis in Archaic and Classical Sources." In *Further Studies in the Ancient Greek Polis*, 161–72. Historia Einzelschriften 138; Papers from the Copenhagen Polis Centre 5. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2000.

———. "Colonies and Indigenous Hellenised Communities." In *Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis, edited by Mogens Herman Hansen and Thomas Heine Nielsen, 150–53. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

———. "Was Every Polis Town the Centre of a Polis State?" In *The Return of the Polis: The Use and Meanings of the Word* Polis *in Archaic and Classical Sources*, 13–66. Historia Einzelschriften 198; Papers from the Copenhagen Polis Centre 8. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2007.

Hansen, and Thomas Heine Nielsen, eds. *Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Hansen, Victor Davis. "Thucydides and the Desertion of Attic Slaves during the Decelean War." *Classical Antiquity* 11, no. 2 (1992): 210–28.

Harland, Philip A. "Climbing the Ethnic Ladder: Ethnic Hierarchies and Judean Responses." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 138, no. 3 (2019): 665–86.

Harrison, Thomas. “Classical Greek Ethnography and the Slave Trade.” *Classical Antiquity* 38 (2019): 36–57.

———. *Writing Ancient Persia*. London: Bristol Classical Press, 2011.

Hatzopoulos, Miltiades B. “Bulletin Épigraphique (Macédoine).” *Revue des Études Grecques* 102, no. 487/489 (1989): 428–36.

Hauben, Hans. “The Chief Commanders of the Persian Fleet in 480 B.C.” *Ancient Society* 4 (1973): 23–37.

Haubold, James. *Greece and Mesopotamia: Dialogues in Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

———. “The Achaemenid Empire and the Sea.” *Mediterranean Historical Review* 27 (2012): 5–24.

Hawkins, Shane. “Greek and the Languages of Asia Minor during the Classical Period.” In *A Companion to the Ancient Greek Language*, edited by Egbert J. Bakker, 213–27. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010.

Head, Barclay V. *Historia Numorum: A Manual of Greek Numismatics*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1911.

Head, Duncan. *Armies of the Macedonian and Punic Wars*. Goring-by-Sea: Wargames Research Group, 1982.

Heckel, Waldemar. *In the Path of Conquest: Resistance to Alexander the Great*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020.

———. *The Conquests of Alexander the Great*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

———. *The Last Days and Testament of Alexander the Great: A Prosopographic Study*. Historia Einzelschriften 56. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1988.

Heichelheim, Fritz. *Die auswärtige Bevölkerung im Ptolemäerreich*. Klio Beiheft 18. Leipzig: Dietrich’sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1925.

Heimpel, Wolfgang. *Letters to the King of Mari: A New Translation, with Historical Introduction, Notes, and Commentary*. Mesopotamian Civilizations 12. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2003.

Hellmann, Oliver, and David Mirhady, eds. *Phaenias of Eresus: Text, Translation, and Discussion*. Rutgers University Studies in Classical Humanities 19. London: Routledge, 2015.

Henkelman, Wouter F. M. “Administrative Realities: The Persepolis Archives and the Archaeology of the Achaemenid Heartland.” In *The Oxford Handbook of Ancient Iran*, edited by D. T. Potts, 528–46. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.

———. “An Elamite Memorial: The Šumar of Cambyses and Hystaspes.” In *A Persian Perspective. Essays in Memory of Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg*, edited by Wouter F. M. Henkelman and Amélie Kuhrt, 101–72. Achaemenid History 13. Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 2003.

Henkelman, Wouter F. M., and Matthew W. Stolper. “Ethnic Identity and Ethnic Labelling at Persepolis: The Case of the Skudrians.” In *Organisation des pouvoirs et contacts culturels dans les pays de l’empire achéménide*, edited by Pierre Briant and Michael Chauveau, 271–329. Paris: Éditions de Boccard, 2009.

Henry, Madeleine M. “The Traffic in Women: From Homer to Hipponax, from War to Commerce.” In *Greek Prostitutes in the Ancient Mediterranean, 800 BCE–200 CE*, edited by Allison Glazebrook and Madeleine M. Henry, 14–33. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011.

Herman, Gabriel. “Patterns of Name Diffusion within the Greek World and Beyond.” *Classical Quarterly* 40, no. 2 (1990): 349–63.

Hind, John. “Greek and Barbarian Peoples on the Shores of the Black Sea.” *Archaeological Reports* 30 (1984 1983): 71–97.

———. “Homer’s ‘Stout Helmet’ on the Coins of Mesambria on the Black Sea.” *Numismatic Chronicle* 167 (2007): 23–24.

———. “Megarian Colonisation in the Western Half of the Black Sea (Sister- and Daughter-Cities of Herakleia).” In *The Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area: Historical Interpretation of Archaeology*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 131–52. Historia Einzelschriften 121. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1998.

Hirsch, Stephen. “The Deportation of the Paeonians: Strategies and the Experiences of Thracian Deportees.” In *I Traci nel Mediterraneo: VI symposium internazionale di tracologia, Firenze 11-13 maggio 1989*, 230–39. Rome: Editrice Nagard, 1992.

Hjerrild, Bodil. “Near Eastern Equivalents to Artemis.” In *From Artemis to Diana: The Goddess of Man and Beast*, edited by Tobias Fischer-Hansen and Birte Poulsen, 41–49. Acta Hyperborea 12. Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, University of Copenhagen, 2009.

Hoddinott, Ralph F. *Bulgaria in Antiquity: An Archaeological Introduction*. London: Ernest Benn, 1975.

Holt, Frank L. *Alexander the Great and Bactria*. Mnemosyne Supplements 109. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1988.

Honigman, Sylvie. "The Birth of a Diaspora: The Emergence of a Jewish Self-Definition in Ptolemaic Egypt in the Light of Onomastics." In *Diasporas in Antiquity*, edited by Shaye J. D. Cohen and Enrest S. Frerichs, 93–127. Brown Judaic Studies 288. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1994.

———. "The Ptolemaic and Roman Definitions of Social Categories and the Evolution of Judean Communal Identity in Egypt." In *Jewish and Christian Communal Identities in the Roman World*, edited by Yair Furstenberg, 25–74. Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity 94. Leiden: Brill, 2016.

Hornblower, Simon. *A Commentary on Thucydides*. Vol. 1. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.

———. "Hellenistic Tragedy and Satyr-Drama: Lycophron's *Alexandra*." In *Greek Tragedy after the Fifth Century: A Survey from ca. 400 BC to ca. AD 400*, edited by Vayos Liapis and Antonis K. Petrides, 90–124. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

———. "Lykophron and Epigraphy: The Value and Function of Cult Epithets in the *Alexandra*." *Classical Quarterly* 64 (2014): 91–120.

———. *Lykophron's* Alexandra*, Rome, and the Hellenistic World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

Horowitz, Wayne. *Mesopotamian Cosmic Geography*. Mesopotamian Civilizations 8. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 1998.

Houle, D. J. "Soldiers and Hellenism: Recruitment in the Hellenistic Militaries." In *Colonial Geopolitics and Local Cultures in the Hellenistic and Roman East (3rd Century BC–3rd Century AD)*, edited by Hadrien Bru, Adrian G. Dumitru, and Nicholas Sekunda, 160–66. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2021.

How, H. W., and J. Wells. *A Commentary on Herodotus*. 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1912.

Hubert, Curt. *Plutarchi Moralia*. Vol. 4. Leipzig: Teubner, 1938.

Hunt, Peter. "Ancient Greece as a 'Slave Society.'" In *What Is a Slave Society? The Practice of Slavery in Global Perspective*, edited by Noel Lenski and Catherine M. Cameron, 61–85. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018.

———. *Ancient Greek and Roman Slavery*. Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2018.

———. “Arming Slaves and Helots in Classical Greece.” In *Arming Slaves: From Classical Times to the Modern Age*, edited by Christopher Leslie Brown and Philip D. Morgan, 14–39. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006.

———. *Slaves, Warfare, and Ideology in the Greek Historians*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

———. “The Slaves and Generals of Arginusae.” *American Journal of Philology* 122, no. 3 (2001): 359–80.

———. “Trojan Slaves in Classical Athens: Ethnic Identity among Athenian Slaves.” In *Communities and Networks in the Ancient Greek World*, edited by Claire Taylor and Kostas Vlassopoulos, 128–54. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Hunter, Virginia J. *Policing Athens: Social Control in the Attic Lawsuits, 420–320 B.C.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.

Hurwit, Jeffrey M. *Artists and Signatures in Ancient Greece*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.

Iliakis, Michael. “Greek Mercenary Revolts in Bactria: A Re-Appraisal” 63, no. 2 (2013): 182–95.

Iliescu, Vladimir. “Geten oder Skythen? Zu Iord. *Get.* 65.” *Eos* 56 (1966): 316–20.

Invantchik, Askold I. “Eine griechische Pseudo-Historie. Der Pharao Sesostris und der skytho-ägyptische Krieg.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 48, no. 4 (1999): 395–441.

Isaac, Benjamin. *The Greek Settlements in Thrace Until the Macedonian Conquest*. Studies of the Dutch Archaeological and Historical Society 10. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1986.

Ismard, Paulin. “Associations and Citizenship in Attica from Solon to Cleisthenes.” In *Defining Citizenship in Archaic Greece*, edited by Alain Duplouy and Roger Brock, 145–59. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

Ivanov, Stefan. “Tierknochen aus dem Heiligtum des Heros Karabasmus in Odessos.” In *Actes du premier congrès des études balkaniques et sud-est européennes*, edited by Vladimir Georgiev, Nikolaĭ Todorov, and Vasilka Tŭpkova-Zaimova, 2:375–77. Sofia: Editions de l’Académie Bulgare des Sciences, 1969.

Izdimirski, Miroslav. “Deportations of *Kurtaš* Workers in the Achaemenid Empire According to Classical Literary Tradition.” *Živa Antika* 68 (2018): 51–64.

———. “Deportiranite peontsi v Mala Aziya i persiĭskite tsarski stopanstva.” *Thracia* 23 (2018): 181–88.

———. “Persian *Hyparchoi* and *Strategoi* in Ancient Thrace According to Herodotus.” *Orpheus* 20 (2013): 15–25.

———. “Trakite v armiyata na Kir Mladi.” *Thracia* 21 (2016): 7–15.

Jacobs, Bruno. *Die Satrapienverwaltung im Perserreich zur Zeit Darius’ III*. Beihefte zum Tübinger Atlas der Vorderen Orients, Reihe B, 87. Wiesbaden: Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, 1994.

Janko, Richard. *The Iliad: A Commentary*. Vol. 4. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Janouchová, Petra. “The Cult of Bendis in Athens and Thrace.” *Graeco-Latina Brunensia* 18 (2013): 95–106.

Joannès, Francis. “Le monde occidental vu de Mésopotamie, de l’époque néo-babylonienne à l’époque hellénistique.” *Transeuphratène* 13 (1997): 141–53.

Jochmus, A. “Notes on a Journey into the Balkan, or Mount Haemus, in 1847.” *Journal of the Royal Geographical Society of London* 24 (1854): 36–85.

Johnston, Patricia A. “Cybele and Her Companions on the Northern Littoral of the Black Sea.” In *Cybele, Attis and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M. J. Vermaseren*, edited by Eugene M. Lane, 101–16. Religions in the Graeco-Roman World 131. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.

Jones, C. P. “*Stigma:* Tattooing and Branding in Graeco-Roman Antiquity.” *Journal of Roman Studies* 77 (1987): 139–55.

Jones, Charles E., and Matthew W. Stolper. “How Many Persepolis Fortification Tablets Are There?” In *L’archive des Fortifications de Persépolis: État des questions et perspectives de recherches*, edited by Pierre Briant, Wouter Henkelman, and Matthew W. Stolper. Persika 12. Paris: Boccard, 2008.

Jones, Nicholas F. *The Associations of Classical Athens: The Response to Democracy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Jones, Siân. *The Archaeology of Ethnicity: Constructing Identities in the Past and Present*. London: Routledge, 1997.

Jordan, Borimir. “The Crews of Athenian Triremes.” *L’Antiquité Classique* 69 (2000): 81–101.

Jordanov, Kiril. “Achaemenido-Thracica: Attempts at Political and Administrative Control (ca. 515-466 BC).” *Thracia* 15 (2003): 39–54.

Justi, Ferdinand. *Geschichte der orientalischen Völker im Altertum*. Allgemeine Weltgeschichte 1. Berlin: G. Grote'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1884.

Kaibel, Georgius, ed. *Athenaei Naucratitae Dipnosophistarum Libri XV*. 3 vols. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1887.

Kalojanov, Stanimir. "Thraco-Persica. Thrace and the Achaemenids 6th-4th c. B.C." *Bulgarian Historical Review* 4 (1988): 82–87.

Kamen, Deborah. "A Corpus of Inscriptions: Representing Slave Marks in Antiquity." *Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome* 55 (2010): 95–110.

———. *Status in Classical Athens*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013.

Kapparis, Konstantinos. *Prostitution in the Ancient Greek World*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2018.

Karayotov, Ivan. "Melsas, the Founder of Messembria, on a Coin from the V Century BC." *Thracia* 17 (2007): 353–68.

———. *The Coinage of Mesambria*. Vol. 1. Thracia Pontica 6; Thracia Maritima, Corpus Numorum. Sozopol: Centre of Underwater Archaeology, 1996.

———. *The Coinage of Mesambria*. Vol. 2. Burgas: Centre for Maritime History, Archaeology and Ecology – Sozopolo, 2009.

Karlsson, Mattias. *Relations of Power in Early Neo-Assyrian State Ideology*. Studies in Ancient Near Eastern Records 10. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2016.

Kassel, R., and C. Austin, eds. *Poetae Comici Graeci*. Vol. 4. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1983.

———, eds. *Poetae Comici Graeci*. Vol. 6.2. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1998.

Katičić, Radoslav. *Ancient Languages of the Balkans*. Vol. 1. Trends in Linguistics 4. The Hague: Mouton, 1976.

Kazarow, Gawril I. "Grabstele von Mesembria." *Jahreshefte des Österreichischen Archäologischen Institutes* 26 (1930): 111–14.

Keaney, John J., ed. *Harpocration:* Lexeis *of the Ten Orators*. Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1991.

Kennedy, Rebecca Futo. *Immigrant Women in Athens: Gender, Ethnicity, and Citizenship in the Classical City*. Routledge Studies in Ancient History 6. London: Routledge, 2014.

Kenrick, John. “On the Names of the Antehellenic Inhabitants of Greece.” *Philological Museum* 1 (1832): 609–27.

Kent, Roland G. *Old Persian: Grammar, Texts, Lexicon*. 2nd ed. American Oriental Series 33. New Haven: American Oriental Society, 1953.

Kienast, Dietmar. “Der Wagen des Ahura Mazda und der Ausmarsch des Xerxes.” *Chiron* 29 (1996): 285–313.

Kitchen, K. A. *The Third Intermediate Period in Egypt (1100-650 BC)*. 2nd ed. Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 1996.

Kloppenborg, John S., and Richard S. Ascough. *Greco-Roman Associations: Texts, Translation, and Commentary*. Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche 181. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2011.

Knoepfler, Denis. “De quelques épitaphes d’étrangers et d’étrangères au Musée d’Érétrie.” In *Sidelights on Greek Antiquity: Archaeological and Epigraphical Essays in Honour of Vasileios Petrakos*, edited by Konstantinos Kalogeropoulos, Dora Vassilikou, and Michalis Tiverios, 45–102. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2021.

Koenen, Ludwig. *Eine agonistische Inschrift aus Ägypten und frühptolemäische Königsfeste*. Beiträge zur klassischen Philologie 56. Meisenheim am Glan: Verlag Anton Hain, 1977.

Konstan, David. “Menander’s Slaves: The Banality of Violence.” In *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, edited by Ben Akrigg and Rob Tordoff, 144–58. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Kosmin, Paul J. *The Land of the Elephant Kings: Space, Territory, and Ideology in the Seleucid Empire*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2014.

———. *Time and Its Adversaries in the Seleucid Empire*. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2018.

Kosmopoulou, Angeliki. “‘Working Women’: Female Professionals on Classical Attic Gravestones.” *Annual of the British School at Athens* 96 (2001): 281–319.

Kramer, Gustav, ed. *Strabonis Geographica*. 2 vols. Berlin: Friedrich Nicolai, 1844.

Krentz, Peter. *The Battle of Marathon*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010.

Kroll, Wilhelm. *Procli Diadochi in Platonis rem publicam commentarii*. 2 vols. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1899.

Kruse, Thomas. “Ethnic *Koina* and *Politeumata* in Ptolemaic Egypt.” In *Private*

Associations and the Public Sphere: Proceedings of a Symposium Held at the Royal Danish Academy of Sciences and Letters, 9–11 September 2010, edited by Vincent Gabrielsen and Christian A. Thomsen, 270–300. Copenhagen: Det Kongelige Danske Videnskaberns Selskab, 2015.

Kuhrt, Amélie. "Greek Contact with the Levant and Mesopotamia in the First Half of the First Millennium BC: A View from the East." In *Greek Settlements in the Eastern Mediterranean and the Black Sea*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze and A. M. Snodgrass, 17–25. BAR International Series 1062. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2002.

———. *'Greeks' and 'Greece' in Mesopotamian and Persian Perspectives*. The Twenty-First J. L. Myres Memorial Lecture. Oxford: Leopard's Head Press, 2002.

———. "State Communications in the Persian Empire." In *State Correspondence in the Ancient World: From New Kingdom Egypt to the Roman Empire*, edited by Karen Radner, 112–40. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

———. "Women and War." *NIN: Journal of Gender Studies in Antiquity* 2 (2001): 1–26.

Kuhrt, Amélie, Myles Lavan, Richard E. Payne, and John Weisweiler. "Hellenism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Role of the Babylonian Elites in the Seleucid Empire." In *Cosmopolitanism and Empire: Universal Rulers, Local Elites, and Cultural Integration in the Ancient Near East and Mediterranean*, 89–101. Oxford Studies in Early Empires. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Kurtz, Donna C., and John Boardman. *Greek Burial Customs*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1971.

Kuznetsov, Vladimir D., and Alexander B. Nikitin. "An Old Persian Inscription from Phanagoria." *Ancient Civilizations from Scythia to Siberia* 25 (2019): 1–7.

Kyle, Donald G. *Sport and Spectacle in the Ancient World*. 2nd ed. Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

La'da, Csaba A. *Ethnic Terminology in Hellenistic and Early Roman Egypt: New Sources and New Perspectives of Research*. Tyche Supplementband 13. Vienna: Verlag Holzhausen, 2019.

———. *Foreign Ethnics in Hellenistic Egypt*. Prosopographia Ptolemaica 10. Leuven: Peeters, 2002.

———. "Towards a History of Immigration to Hellenistic Egypt: The Contribution of Ethnic Designations to Research." *Archiv für Papyrusforschung und verwandte Gebiete* 66 (2020): 44–80.

———. “Who Were Those ‘of the *Epigone*’?.” In *Akten des 21. Internationalen Papyrologenkongresses, Berlin, 13.–19.8.1995*, edited by Bärbel Kramer, Wolfgang Luppe, Herwig Maehler, and Gunter Poethke, 563–69. Archiv für Papyrusforschung 3.1. Stuttgart: Teubner, 1997.

Lang, Mabel. *The Athenian Agora: Results of Excavations Conducted by the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*. Vol. 21. Princeton: American School of Classical Studies at Athens, 1976.

Langdon, Merle K. “Additions to the Corpus of Greek Erotic Inscriptions.” *GRAMMATEION* 5 (2016): 83–104.

Lape, Susan. *Race and Citizen Identity in the Classical Athenian Democracy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Latte, Kurt, and Ian C. Cunningham, eds. *Hesychii Alexandrini Lexicon*. Vol. 2a. Sammlung griechischer und lateinischer Grammatiker, 11/2a. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2020.

Latyshev, Basilius, ed. *Inscriptiones antiquae orae septentrionalis Ponti Euxini Graecae et Latinae*. St. Petersburg: Societatis Archaeologicae Imperii Russici, 1916.

Launey, Marcel. *Recherches sur les armées hellénistiques*. 2 vols. Paris: Boccard, 1949.

Lazarenko, Igor, Elina Mircheva, and Radostina Encheva. “Conclusion.” In *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, by Igor Lazarenko, Elina Mircheva, Radostina Encheva, Daniela Stoyanova, and Nicolay Sharankov, translated by Margarit Damyanov and Nicolay Sharankov. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

———. “Conclusion.” In *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, 71. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

Lazarenko, Igor, Elina Mircheva, Radostina Encheva, Daniela Stoyanova, and Nicolay Sharankov. *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*. Translated by Margarit Damyanov and Nicolay Sharankov. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

Lazarov, Michail. “Notizen zur griechischen Kolonisation am westlichen Schwarzen Meer. Schriftquellen und archäologische Denkmäler.” In *The Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area: Historical Interpretation of Archaeology*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 85–95. Historia Einzelschriften 121. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1998.

———. “Odessos—une ville antique sur le littoral Thrace du Pont Euxin.” In *Le Pouvoir central et les villes en Europe de l’Est et du Sud-Est du XV^{e} siècle aux débuts de la révolution industrielle*, edited by Michael Mollat, 63–72. Sofia: Editions de

l'Académie Bulgare des Sciences, 1985.

Lazenby, J. F. *The Defence of Greece 490–479 B.C.* Warminister: Aris and Phillips, 1993.

Lazova, Cvete. "The Thracian Tribe Sintians." *Thracia* 4 (1977): 141–45.

Leader, Ruth E. "In Death Not Divided: Gender, Family, and State on Classical Athenian Grave Stelae." *American Journal of Archaeology* 101, no. 4 (1997): 683–99.

Lee, Mireille M. *Body, Dress, and Identity in Ancient Greece*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.

Lehmann, Karl. "Documents of the Samothracian Language." *Hesperia* 24, no. 2 (1955): 93–100.

———. *Samothrace: A Guide to the Excavations and the Museum*. New York: New York University Press, 1955.

———. *Samothrace: The Inscriptions on Ceramics and Minor Objects*. Samothrace, 2.2. New York: Pantheon Books, 1960.

Leichty, Erle. *The Royal Inscriptions of Esarhaddon, King of Assyria (680-669 BC)*. Royal Inscriptions of the Neo-Assyrian Period 4. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns, 2011.

Lendle, Otto. *Kommentar zu Xenophons Anabasis (Bücher 1-7)*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1995.

Lerner, Jeffrey D. "Persia, Thrake, and Skudra." In *The History of the Argeads: New Perspectives*, edited by Sabine Müller, Timothy Howe, Hugh Bowden, and Robert Rollinger, 7–25. Classica et Orientalia 19. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2017.

Lewis, David M. "Attic Manumissions." *Hesperia* 28, no. 3 (1959): 208–38.

———. *Sparta and Persia*. Cincinnati Classical Studies, New Series 1. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977.

Lewis, David M. *Greek Slave Systems in Their Eastern Mediterranean Context*, c.*800–146 BC*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

———. "Near Eastern Slaves in Classical Attica and the Slave Trade with the Persian Territories." *Classical Quarterly* 61 (2011): 91–113.

———. "Notes on Slave Names, Ethnicity, and Identity in Classical and Hellenistic Greece." In *Tell Me Who You Are: Labelling Status in the Graeco-Roman World*, edited by Maria Nowak, Adam Łajtar, and Jakub Urbanik, 183–213. Studia Źródłoznawcze 16. Warsaw: Sub Lupa Academic, 2017.

———. “The Market for Slaves in the Fifth- and Fourth-Century Aegean: Achaemenid Anatolia as a Case Study.” In *The Ancient Greek Economies: Markets, Households and City-States*, edited by Edward M. Harris, David M. Lewis, and Mark Woolmer, 316–36. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.

Lincoln, Bruce. “The Role of Religion in Achaemenian Imperialism.” In *Religion and Power: Divine Kingship in the Ancient World and Beyond*, edited by Nicole Brisch, 221–41. Oriental Institute Seminars 4. Chicago: Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 2008.

Liverani, Mario. *Prestige and Interest: International Relations in the Near East, ca. 1600-1100 B.C.* History of the Ancient Near East Studies 1. Padova: Sargon srl, 1990.

———. “The Sargon Geography and the Late Assyrian Mensuration of the Earth.” *State Archives of Assyria Bulletin* 13 (2001 1999): 57–85.

Lloyd, Alan B. *Herodotus, Book II*. Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l’Empire romain 42. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1993.

López-Ruiz, Carolina. “Tarshish and Tartessos Revisited: Textual Problems and Historical Implications.” In *Colonial Encounters in Ancient Iberia: Phoenician, Greek, and Indigenous Relations*, edited by Michael Dietler and Carolina López-Ruiz, 255–80. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.

Lorber, Catherine, and Christelle Fischer-Bovet. “Getting Paid in Ptolemaic Egypt in the 2nd and 1st Centuries BC.” In *Money Rules! The Monetary Economy of Egypt, from Persians Until the Beginning of Islam*, edited by Thomas Faucher, 169–201. Bibliothèque d’étude 176. Cairo: Institut Français d’Archéologie Orientale, 2020.

Loukopoulou, Louisa D. *Contribution a l’histoire de la Thrace Propontique durant la periode archaique*. Meletemata 9. Athens: Kentron Hellenikes kai Romaikes Archaiotetos, 1989.

———. “Thrace from Nestos to Hebros.” In *Inventory of Archaic and Classical* Poleis, edited by Hansen and Thomas Heine Nielsen, 870–84. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Loukopoulou, Louisa D., Antigone Zournatzi, Maria Gabriella Parisaki, and Selena Psoma, eds. *Epigrafes tis Thrakis tou Aigaiou*. Athens: Kentron Hellenikes kai Romaikes Archaiotetos, 2005.

Lund, Helen S. *Lysimachus: A Study in Early Hellenistic Kingship*. London: Routledge, 1992.

Ma, John. “The Attalids: A Military History.” In *Attalid Asia Minor: Money, International*

Relations, and the State, edited by Peter Thonemann, 49–82. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.

MacDowell, Douglas M. *The Law in Classical Athens*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1978.

Mackintosh, Marjorie. *The Divine Rider in the Art of the Western Roman Empire*. BAR International Series 607. Oxford: Hadrian Books, 1995.

Maffre, Frédéric. "Indigenous Aristocracies in Hellespontine Phrygia." In *Persian Responses: Political and Cultural Interaction with(in) the Achaemenid Empire*, edited by Christopher Tuplin, 117–41. Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2007.

Mainardi, Maria. "Mesambria Pontica e i Traci." *Acme* 64, no. 3 (2011): 3–26.

Mairs, Rachel. "Reassessing Settlement Policies in the Hellenistic Far East." In *Comparing the Ptolemaic and Seleucid Empires: Integration, Communication, and Resistance*, edited by Christelle Fischer-Bovet and Sitta von Reden, 49–64. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021.

Malay, Hasan. "Letter of Antiochos III to Zeuxis with Two Covering Letters (209 B.C.)." *Epigraphica Anatolica* 10 (1987): 7–15.

Malkin, Irad. *A Small Greek World: Networks in the Ancient Mediterranean*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Manning, J. G. *The Last Pharaohs: Egypt Under the Ptolemies, 305–30 BC*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010.

Manning, Sean. "A Prosopography of the Followers of Cyrus the Younger." *Ancient History Bulletin* 32, no. 1–2 (2018): 1–24.

Manov, Metodi. "The Hellenistic Tomb with Greek Inscription from Smyadovo, Bulgaria – Reconsidered." *Journal of Ancient History and Archaeology* 6, no. 3 (2019): 99–118.

Marcotte, Didier. *Géographes grecs*. Vol. 1. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 2000.

Marinov, Tchavdar. "Ancient Thrace in the Modern Imagination: Ideological Aspects of the Construction of Thracian Studies in Southeast Europe (Romania, Greece, Bulgaria)." In *Entangled Histories of the Balkans*, vol. 3, edited by Roumen Daskalov and Alexander Vezenkov, 10–117. Balkan Studies Library 16. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Marinov, Ivan, and Nicolas Zorzin. "Thracology and Nationalism in Bulgaria. Deconstructing Contemporaneous Historical and Archaeological Representations."

EX NOVO Journal of Archaeology 2 (2017): 85–110.

Marsden, E. W. *The Campaign of Gaugamela*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1964.

Mascialino, Lorenzo, ed. *Lycophronis Alexandra*. Leipzig: Teubner, 1964.

Matsas, Dimitris. "I Samothraki stin Proimi Epochi tou Sidirou." In *To Aigaio stin Proimi Epochi tou Sidirou: Praktika tou Diethnous Symposiou, Rodos 1-4 Noemvriou 2002*, 227–57. Athens: Panepistimio Kritis, 2004.

Meeus, Alexander. *The History of the Diadochoi in Book XIX of Diodoros'* Bibliotheke: *A Historical and Historiographical Commentary*. Untersuchungen zur antiken Literatur und Geschichte 149. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2022.

Meritt, Benjamin M. "Greek Inscriptions." *Hesperia* 30, no. 3 (1961): 205–92.

Meyer, Elizabeth A. "Inscribing in Columns in Fifth-Century Athens." In *Writing Matters: Presenting and Perceiving Monumental Inscriptions in Antiquity and the Middle Ages*, edited by Irene Berti, Katharina Bolle, Fanny Opdenhoff, and Fabian Stroth, 205–61. Materiale Textkulturen 14. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2017.

Mihailov, Georgi. *Inscriptiones Graecae in Bulgaria repertae*. 5 vols. Serdica: Academiae Litterarum Bulgaricae, 1956.

———. "La Thrace au IV^{e} et III^{e} siècle avant notre ère." *Athenaeum* 39 (1961): 33–44.

Mikalson, Jon D. *Religion in Hellenistic Athens*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.

Miles, M. "Segregated We Stand? The Mutilated Greeks' Debate at Persepolis, 330 BC." *Disability & Society* 18, no. 7 (2013): 865–79.

Milns, R. D. "Alexander's Macedonian Cavalry and Diodorus Xvii 17.4." *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 86 (1966): 167–68.

Minchev, Alexander. "Greek Traditions and Roman Taste: Continuity and Change in Odessos/Odessus (3rd c. B.C.-3rd c. A.D.)." In *Early Roman Thrace: New Evidence from Bulgaria*, edited by Ian P. Haynes, 15–39. Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplementary Series 82. Portsmouth: Journal of Roman Archaeology, 2011.

———. "Some Aspects of Cultural Exchange During 5th – 1st C BC in North-Eastern Thrace: Thracian, Scythian and Celtic Bridle Frontlets in the Archaeological Museum of Varna." In *The Lower Danube in Antiquity (VI C BC – VI C AD): International Archaeological Conference, Bulgaria-Tutrakan, 6.-7.10.2005*, edited

by Lyudmil F. Vagalinski, 25–36. Sofia: National Institute of Archaeology and Museum, 2007.

Mircheva, Elina. “Sculpture and Relief.” In *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, 34–46. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

Mitchell, Stephen. “Geographical and Historical Introduction.” In *Pisidian Antioch: The Site and Its Monuments*, edited by Stephen Mitchell and Marc Waelkens. Swansea: Duckworth/Classical Press of Wales, 1998.

Mommsen, Theodorus. *Iordanis Romana et Getica*. Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Auctores Antiquissimi, 5.1. Berlin: Weidmann, 1882.

Mooren, Leon. *The Aulic Titulature in Ptolemaic Egypt: Introduction and Prosopography*. Brussels: Paleis der Academiën, 1975.

Mordtmann, J. H. “Zur Epigraphik von Kyzikos III.” *Mittheilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Institutes in Athen* 10 (1885): 200–211.

Morris, Ian. “Remaining Invisible: The Archaeology of the Excluded in Classical Athens.” In *Women and Slaves in Greco-Roman Culture: Differential Equations*, edited by Sandra R. Joshel and Sheila Murnaghan, 193–220. London: Routledge, 1998.

Mottas, François. “Les voies de communication antiques de la Thrace égéenne.” In *Labor omnibus unus: Gerold Walser zum 70. Geburtstag dargebracht von Freunden, Kollegen und Schülern*, edited by Heinz E. Herzig and Regula Frei-Stolba, 82–104. Historia Einzelschriften 60. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1989.

Moyer, Ian S. “Herodotus and the Egyptian Mirage: The Genealogies of the Theban Priests.” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 122 (2002): 70–90.

———. “Isidorus at the Gates of the Temple.” In *Greco-Egyptian Interactions: Literature, Translation, and Culture, 500 BCE–300 CE*, edited by Ian Rutherford, 209–44. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Mueller, Katja. “Geographical Information Systems (GIS) in Papyrology. Mapping Fragmentation and Migration Flow to Hellenistic Egypt.” *Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists* 42 (2005): 63–92.

———. *Settlements of the Ptolemies: City Foundations and New Settlement in the Hellenistic World*. Studia Hellenistica 43. Leuven: Peeters, 2006.

Müllerus, Carolus, ed. *Geographi Graeci Minores*. Vol. 2. Paris: Ambrosio Firmin Didot, 1861.

Murray, Donald. “The Waters at the End of the World: Herodotus and Mesopotamian

Cosmic Geography." In *New Worlds from Old Texts: Revisiting Ancient Space and Place*, edited by Elton Barker, Stefan Bouzarovski, Christopher Pelling, and Leif Isaksen, 47–60. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Muscarella, Oscar White. "The Iron Age Background to the Formation of the Phrygian State." *Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research* 299/300 (1995): 91–101.

Mușețeanu, Crişan, Niculae Conovici, and Apostol Atanasiu. "Contribution au problème de l'importation des amphores grecques dans le sud-est de la Munténie." *Dacia* 22 (1978): 173–99.

Nagy, Gregory. *Greek Mythology and Poetics*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1990.

Nankov, Emil. "Toward the Thracian Religion in the Early Hellenistic Period: A Terracotta Figurine of Kybele from *Seuthopolis* Reconsidered." *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 11, no. 3 (2007): 46–67.

Nawotka, Krzysztof. "Melsas, the Founder of Mesambria?" *Hermes* 122, no. 3 (1994): 320–26.

———. *The Western Pontic Cities: History and Political Organization*. Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1997.

Nedev, Dmitri, and Kristina Panayotova. "Apollonia Pontica (End of the 7th-1st Centuries B.C.)." In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, edited by D. V. Grammenos and E. K. Petropoulos, 1:95–155. Publications of the Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece 4. Thessaloniki: Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece, 2003.

Nekhrizov, Georgi, and Julia Tzvetkova. "Ritual Pit Complexes in Iron Age Thrace: The Case Study Svilengrad." In *Anatolian Iron Ages 7: Proceedings of the Seventh Anatolian Iron Ages Colloquium Held at Edirne, 19–24 April 2010*, edited by Altan Çilingiroğlu and Antonio Sagona, 177–209. Ancient Near Eastern Studies Supplement 39. Leuven: Peeters, 2012.

Nicolae, Marina-Corina. "The Iconography of the Antique Hero in the Balkan Area." *Marisia* 31 (2011): 159–73.

Nielsen, Thomas Heine, Lars Bjertrup, Mogens Herman Hansen, Lene Rubinstein, and Torben Vestergaard. "Athenian Grave Monuments and Social Class." *Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies* 30 (1989): 411–20.

Nissinen, Martti. *Homoeroticism in the Biblical World: A Historical Perspective*. Translated by Kirsi Stjerna. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1998.

Notopoulos, James A. “The Slaves at the Battle of Marathon.” *American Journal of Philology* 62, no. 3 (1941): 352–54.

Oakley, John H. “Some ‘Other’ Members of the Athenian Household: Maids and Their Mistresses in Fifth-Century Athenian Art.” In *Not the Classical Ideal: Athens and the Construction of the Other in Greek*, edited by Beth Cohen, 227–47. Leiden: Brill, 2000.

Ogden, Daniel. *Greek Bastardy in the Classical and the Hellenistic Periods*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996.

Ognenova-Marinova, Ljuba. “La ‘bria’ thrace d’après les recherches archéologiques à Nessèbre.” In *Thracia Pontica IV: Quatrième symposium international, Sozopol, 6-12 octobre 1988*, edited by Michail Lazarov, Margarita Tatcheva, Christina Angelova, and Michail Georgiev, 133–36. Sofia: Centre d’archéologie subaquatique, 1991.

———. “Mesambria et le monde Thrace entre le VII^{e} et le V^{e} s. av. n. è.” In *Thracia Pontica III: Troisième symposium international, Sozopol, 6-12 octobre 1985*, edited by Michail Lazarov, Ventsislav Popov, and Khalin Porojanov, 238–44. Sofia: Centre d’histoire maritime et d’archeologie sous-marin, 1986.

———. “Mesembriacos Portus.” In *Thracia Pontica V: Actes du symposium international, Sozopol, 7-12 octobre 1991*, edited by Michail Lazarov and Christina Angelova, 139–42. Sozopol: Centre d’archéologie subaquatique, 1991.

———. “Une Hypothèse Sur Le Nom de Mesambria.” In *Studia in Honorem Borisi Gerov*, edited by Margarita Tačeva and Dimitâr Bojadžiev, 156–57. Sofia: Sofia Press, 1990.

Ohnishi Tsuneyuki. “Mari bunsho ni okeru ḫa.na no kaishaku o megutte.” *Bulletin of the Society for Near Eastern Studies in Japan* 50 (2007): 1–19.

Oikonomides, Al. N. “Misread Greek Inscriptions as Documents of the ‘Samothracian,’ ‘Tarentine,’ ‘Gallic,’ and ‘Illyrian’ Languages.” *Ancient World* 1, no. 4 (1978): 159–66.

Oliver, G. J. *War, Food, and Politics in Early Hellenistic Athens*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.

O’Neil, James L. “Places and Origin of the Officials of Ptolemaic Egypt.” *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 55 (2006): 16–25.

Osborne, Michael J. “The Archons of Athens 300/299–228/7.” *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 171 (2009): 83–99.

Osborne, Michael J., and Sean G. Bryne. *The Foreign Residents of Athens: An Annex to the* Lexicon of Greek Personal Names: Attica. Studia Hellenistica 33. Leuven: Peeters, 1996.

Osborne, Robin. "The Law, the Democratic Citizen, and the Representation of Women in Classical Athens." In *Studies in Ancient Greek and Roman Society*, edited by Robin Osborne, 38–60. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Overduin, Floris. *Nicander of Colophon's* Theriaca: *A Literary Commentary*. Mnemosyne Supplements 374. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Owen, Sara. "Analogy, Archaeology and Archaic Greek Colonization." In *Ancient Colonizations: Analogy, Similarity and Difference*, edited by Henry Hurst and Sara Owen, 5–22. London: Duckworth, 2005.

Paganini, Mario C. D. *Gymnasia and Greek Identity in Ptolemaic Egypt*. Oxford Classical Monographs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022.

Page, D. L. *Further Greek Epigrams*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

Pająkowski, Włodzimierz. "Einige Bemerkungen zur Lokalisierung der Persischen Provinz (Satrapie) Skudra." *Eos* 71 (1983): 243–55.

Paltiel, Eliezer. "The Treaty of Apamea and the Later Seleucids." *Antichthon* 13 (1979): 30–41.

Panayotou, Anna. "Greek and Thracian." In *A History of Ancient Greek: From the Beginnings to Late Antiquity*, edited by A.-F. Christidis, Maria Arapopoulou, and Maria Chriti, translated by Chris Markham, 738–44. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Panayotova, Kristina. "Burial and Post-Burial Rites in the Necropoleis of the Greek Colonies." In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea 2*, edited by Dimitrios V. Grammenos and Elias K. Petropoulos, 1:85–126. BAR International Series 1675. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2007.

Papadopoulos, Stratis. "The 'Thracian' Pottery of South-East Europe: A Contribution to the Discussion on the Handmade Pottery Traditions of the Historical Period." *Annual of the British School at Athens* 96 (2001): 157–94.

Papazoglou, Fanoula. *Les villes de Macédoine à l'époque romaine*. Suppléments au Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique 16. Athens: École Française d'Athènes, 1988.

Papazoglu, Fanula. *The Central Balkan Tribes in Pre-Roman Times: Triballi, Autariatae,*

Dardanians, Scordisci and Moesians. Translated by Mary Stansfield-Popović. Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1978.

Parker, Holt M. "Vaseworld: Depiction and Description of Sex at Athens." In *Ancient Sex: New Essays*, edited by Ruby Blondell and Kirk Ormand. Classical Memories/Modern Identities. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2015.

Parker, Robert. *Athenian Religion: A History*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996.

———. *Greek Gods Abroad: Names, Natures, and Transformations*. Sather Classical Lectures. Oakland: University of California Press, 2017.

———. *Polytheism and Society at Athens*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

———. "The Cult of Aphrodite Pandamos and Pontia on Cos." In Kykeon: *Studies in Honour of H. S. Versnel*, edited by H. J. F. Horstmanshoff, H. W. Singor, F. T. Van Straten, and J. H. M. Strubbe, 143–60. Religions in the Graeco-Roman World 142. Leiden: Brill, 2002.

Patterson, Orlando. *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982.

———. "Slavery, Gender, and Work in the Pre-Modern World and Early Greece: A Cross-Cultural Analysis." In *Slave Systems, Ancient and Modern*, edited by Enrico Dal Lago and Constantina Katsari, 32–69. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

Peek, Werner. "Attische Inschriften" *Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Athenische Abteilung*, no. 67 (1942): 1–217.

Penrose, Jr., Walter Duvall. *Postcolonial Amazons: Female Masculinity and Courage in Ancient Greek and Sanskrit Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Perdrizet, Paul, and Gustave Lefebvre. *Inscriptiones Graecae Aegypti*. Vol. 3. Nancy: Berger-Levrault, 1919.

Pertusi, Agostino, ed. *Constantino Porfirogenito De Thematibus*. Studi e Testi 160. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1952.

Petrova, Aneta. "Images of the Dead on Hellenistic Funerary Reliefs from Mesambria." In *The Bosporus: Gateway between the Ancient West and East (1st Millennium BC-5th Century AD). Proceedings of the Fourth International Congress on Black Sea Antiquities Istanbul, 14th-18th September 2009*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, Sümer Atasoy, Alexandru Avram, Sevket Dönmez, and James Hargrave, 325–32. BAR International Series 2517. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2013.

Petrova, Eleonora. “Bryges and Phrygians: Parallelism Between the Balkans and Asia Minor Through Archaeological, Linguistic and Historical Evidence.” In *Thracians and Phrygians: Problems of Parallelism: Proceedings of an International Symposium on the Archaeology, History and Ancient Languages of Thrace and Phrygia, Ankara, 3-4 June 1995*, edited by Numan Tuna, Zeynep Aktüre, and Maggie Lynch, 45–54. Metu: METU, Faculty of Architecture Press, 1995.

———. “Bryges, Paeones and Ancient Macedonians – Mythical, Onomastic and Archaeological Relations and Differences.” *Živa Antika* 47 (1997): 159–66.

Pfuhl, Ernst, and Hans Möbius. *Die ostgriechischen Grabreliefs*. 2 vols. Mainz: Philipp von Zabern, 1977.

Phillips, David D. *The Law of Ancient Athens*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2013.

Planeaux, Christopher. “The Date of Bendis’ Entry into Attica.” *Classical Journal* 96, no. 2 (2001 2000): 165–92.

Plika, Peli. “Comparative Research between the Macedonian Tombs and the Scythian Kurgans.” In *The Greeks and Romans in the Black Sea and the Importance of the Black Sea Region for the Graeco-Roman World (7th Century BC-5th Century AD): 20 Years On (1997-2017)*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, Alexandru Avram, and James Hargrave, 84–93. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2021.

Porozhanov, Kalin. “La ville thrace de Mesembria sur la côte de la mer Noire.” *Thracia* 13 (2000): 345–50.

———. “Salmidessos – An *Orphikos* and *Axeinos* Part of Thracia Pontica.” *Thracia* 16 (2005): 21–34.

———. “Thracian Kings as Founders of Hellenic *Apoikias* Astakos, Byzantion and Mesambria Pontica.” *Orpheus* 9 (1999): 27–31.

Portefaix, Lilian. *Sisters Rejoice: Paul’s Letter to the Philippians and Luke-Acts as Received by First-Century Philippian Women*. Coniectanea Biblica 20. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International, 1988.

Préaux, Claire. *Le monde hellénistique: La Grèce et l’Orient de la mort d’Alexandre à la conquête romaine de la Grèce (323-146 av. J.-C.)*. 2 vols. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1978.

Preshlenov, Hristo. “Mesambria.” In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, edited by D. V. Grammenos and E. K. Petropoulos, 1:157–96. Publications of the Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece 4. Thessaloniki: Archaeological

Institute of Northern Greece, 2003.

———. “Odessos (6th Century B.C. to Early 1st Century A.D.).” In *Ancient Greek Colonies in the Black Sea*, edited by D. V. Grammenos and E. K. Petropoulos, 1:209–78. Publications of the Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece 4. Thessaloniki: Archaeological Institute of Northern Greece, 2003.

———. “Temenosŭt na Apolon v Odesos – arkhitektura, topografiya, sinkretizŭm na kulta.” In *Jubilaeus VII. Society, Kings, Gods: In memoriam professoris Margaritae Tachevae*, edited by Dilyana Boteva-Boyanova, Peter Delev, and Julia Tzvetkova, 259–89. Sofia: St Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2018.

———. “Urban Spaces in *Odessus* (6th C BC-7th C AD).” *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 6, no. 3 (2002): 13–43.

Prince, Susan. *Antisthenes of Athens: Texts, Translations, and Commentary*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2015.

Pritchard, David M. “Athens.” In *A Companion to Ancient Education*, edited by W. Martin Bloomer, 112–22. Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Pritchett, W. Kendrick. “The Attic Stelai: Part II.” *Hesperia* 25, no. 3 (1956): 178–328.

Rabadjiev, Kostadin. “Religion.” In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 443–56. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

———. “The Royal Palace (?) In Seuthopolis.” *Thracia* 13 (2000): 387–97.

Raeck, Wulf. *Zum Barbarenbild in der Kunst Athens im 6. und 5. Jahrhundert V. Chr* Habelts Dissertationsdrucke, Reihe Klassische Archäologie 14. Bonn: Rudolf Habelt Verlag, 1981.

Ramsay, William Mitchell. “Studies in the Roman Province Galatia.” *Journal of Roman Studies* 12 (1922): 147–86.

Randall, Jr., Richard H. “The Erechtheum Workmen.” *American Journal of Archaeology* 57, no. 3 (1953): 199–210.

Rankin, H. D. *Anthisthenes Sokratikos*. Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1986.

Rehm, Ellen. “The Impact of the Achaemenids on Thrace: A Historical Review.” In *Achaemenid Impact in the Black Sea: Communication of Powers*, edited by Jens Nieling and Ellen Rehm, 137–60. Black Sea Studies 11. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2010.

Rein, Mary Jane. “Phrygian Matar: Emergence of an Iconographic Type.” In *Cybele, Attis and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M. J. Vermaseren*, edited by Eugene M. Lane, 223–37. Religions in the Graeco-Roman World 131. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.

Ricci, Seymour de. “The Greek Graffiti.” In *The Rock Tombs of El Amarna*, by N. de Garis Davies, 34–37. London: Egypt Exploration Fund, 1905.

Robert, Louis. “De Delphes à l’Oxus, inscriptions grecques nouvelles de la Bactriane.” *Comptes rendus des séances de l’Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* 112–113 (1968): 416–57.

———. “Les inscriptions grecques de Bulgarie.” *Revue de Philologie, de Littérature et d’histoire Anciennes* 33 (1959): 11–236.

———. *Noms indigènes dans l’Asie mineure gréco-romaine*. Bibliothèque archéologique et historique de l’Institut français d’archéologie d’Istanbul 13. Paris: Adrien Maisonneuve, 1963.

Robertson, Bruce. “The Slave-Names of *IG* I3 1032 and the Ideology of Slavery at Athens.” In *Epigraphy and the Greek Historian*, edited by Craig Cooper, 79–117. Phoenix Supplementary 47. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008.

Robson, James. “Fantastic Sex: Fantasies of Sexual Assault in Aristophanes.” In *Sex in Antiquity: Exploring Gender and Sexuality in the Ancient World*, edited by Mark Masterson, Nancy Sorkin Rabinowitz, and James Robson, 315–31. Rewriting Antiquity. London: Routledge, 2015.

Robu, Adrian. “Les relations de Byzance avec les cités du Pont Gauche à l’époque hellénistique: la guerre pour l’emporion de Tomis.” In *Die Außenbeziehungen pontischer und kleinasiatischer Städte in hellenistischer und römischer Zeit: Akten einer deutsch-rumänischen Tagung in Constanța, 20.–24. September 2010*, edited by Victor Cojocaru and Christof Schuler, 19–36. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2014.

———. *Mégare et les établissements mégariens de Sicile, de la Propontide et du Pont-Euxin: Histoire et institutions*. Bern: Peter Lang, 2014.

———. “Traditions et rapprochements onomastiques dans les cités grecques de la mer Noire: quelques exemples tirés du ‘monde mégarien.’” *Il Mar Nero* 8 (2011 2010): 281–93.

Roller, Lynn E. *In Search of God the Mother: The Cult of Anatolian Cybele*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999.

———. “The Mother Goddess between Thrace and Phrygia.” *Thracia* 15 (2003): 161–67.

Rollinger, Robert. "*Yaunā takabarā* und *maginnatā tragende* 'Ionier'. Zum Problem der 'griechischen' Thronträgerfiguren in Naqsch-i Rustam und Persepolis." In *Altertum und Mittelmeerraum: Die antike Welt diesseits und jenseits der Levante. Festschrift für Peter W. Haider zum 60. Geburtstag*, edited by Robert Rollinger and Brigitte Truschnegg, 365–400. Oriens et Occidens 12. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2006.

Romm, James S. *The Edges of the Earth in Ancient Thought: Geography, Exploration, and Fiction*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992.

Rop, Jeffrey. *Greek Military Service in the Ancient Near East, 401–330 BCE*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

Rosivach, Vincent J. "Enslaving *Barbaroi* and the Athenian Ideology of Slavery." *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 48, no. 2 (1999): 129–57.

———. "The Thracians of *IG* II^2 1956." *Klio* 82 (2000): 379–81.

Rühfel, Hilde. "Ammen und Kinderfrauen im klassischen Athen." *Antike Welt* 19, no. 4 (1988): 43–57.

Rung, Eduard, and Oleg Gabelko. "From Bosporus… to Bosporus: A New Interpretation and Historical Context of the Old Persian Inscription from Phanagoreia." *Iranica Antiqua* 54 (2019): 83–124.

Russell, Thomas. *Byzantium and the Bosporus: A Historical Study, from the Seventh Century BC until the Foundation of Constantinople*. Oxford Classical Monographs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.

Rutherford, Ian. "Pilgrimage in Greco-Roman Egypt: New Perspectives on Graffiti from the Memnonion at Abydos." In *Ancient Perspectives on Egypt*, edited by Roger Matthews and Cornelia Roemer, 171–89. Encounters with Ancient Egypt. London: UCL Press, 2003.

Sachs, Abraham J., and Hermann Hunger. *Astronomical Diaries and Related Texts from Babylonia*. Vol. 1. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse 195. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1988.

Safaee, Yazdan. "Achaemenid Women: Putting the Greek Image to Test." *Talanta* 48–49 (2017 2016): 101–32.

Salač, Antoine. "Un décret inédit de la ville d'Odessos." *Bulletin de correspondance hellénique* 55 (1931): 43–57.

Salač, Antonin. “Náhrobní stela z Mesembrie.” *Listy filologické* 57, no. 4/5 (1930): 436–44.

Sancisi-Weerdenburg, Heleen. “*Yaunā* by the Sea and across the Sea.” In *Ancient Perceptions of Greek Ethnicity*, edited by Irad Malkin, 323–46. Washington, D.C.: Center for Hellenic Studies, 2001.

Sandbach, F. H., ed. *Menandri Reliquiae Selectae*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972.

Schmitt, Rüdiger. *Pseudo-altpersische Inschriften: Inschriftenfälschungen und moderne Nachbildungen in altpersischer Keilschrift.* Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse, Sitzungsberichte 762; Veröffentlichungen zur Iranistik 39. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2007.

———. *The Old Persian Inscriptions of Naqsh-i Rustam and Persepolis*. Corpus Inscriptionum Iranicarum, 1.1.2. London: Lund Humphries, 2000.

Schmitz, Winfried. “Der Verkauf einer Sklavenfamilie.” *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 179 (2011): 54–56.

Scholl, Andreas. *Die attischen Bildfeldstelen des 4. Jhs. v. Chr.: Untersuchungen zu den kleinformatigen Grabreliefs im spätklassischen Athen*. Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Athenische Abteilung 17. Berlin: Gebr. Mann Verlag, 1996.

Scholz, Friedrich, ed. *Die Chronik des Georgios Hamartolos in altslavischer Übersetzung*. Vol. 2. Slavische Propyläen 135. Munich: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1972.

Scott, Lionel. *Historical Commentary on Herodotus Book 6*. Mnemosyne Supplements 268. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

Sears, Matthew A. *Athens, Thrace, and the Shaping of Athenian Leadership*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Sekunda, Nicholas. *Hellenistic Infantry Reform in the 160’s BC*. Studies on the History of Ancient and Medieval Art of Warfare 5. Gdańsk: Foundation for the Development of Gdańsk University, 2006.

———. *Seleucid and Ptolemaic Reformed Armies 168–145 BC*. 2 vols. Stockport: Montvert Publications, 1994.

Sells, Donald. “Slaves in the Fragments of Old Comedy.” In *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, edited by Ben Akrigg and Rob Tordoff, 91–110. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Seure, Georges. “Archéologie Thrace. Documents inédits ou peu connus.” *Revue Archéologique* 19 (1924): 307–50.

Shapiro, H. A. “Amazons, Thracians, and Scythians.” *Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies* 24 (1983): 105–14.

Sharankov, Nicolay. “Inscriptions.” In *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, 47–89. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

Shavarebi, Ehsan. “An Inscription of Darius I from Phanagoria (DFa): Preliminary Report of a Work in Progress.” *ARTA* 5 (2019): 1–15.

Sherwin-White, Susan, and Amélie Kuhrt. *From Samarkhand to Sardis: A New Approach to the Seleucid Empire*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

Shopova, Irina. “To the Problem Concerning the Origin of Krounoi-Dionysopolis.” In *The Thracian World at the Crossroads of Civilizations: Proceedings of the Seventh International Congress of Thracologie, 20-26 May 1996, Constanţa–Mangalia–Tulcea*, edited by Petre Roman, 2:318–23. Bucharest: Institutul Român de Tracologie, 1997.

Shrimpton, Gordon S. *Theopompus the Historian*. Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1991.

Silver, Morris. *Slave-Wives, Single Women and “Bastards” in the Ancient Greek World: Law and Economics Perspectives*. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2018.

Simms, Ronda R. “The Cult of the Thracian Goddess Bendis in Athens and Attica.” *Ancient World* 18, no. 3–4 (1988): 59–76.

Simon, Erika. “Ein Anthesterien-Skyphos des Polygnotos.” *Antike Kunst* 6 (1963): 6–22.

Skinner, Joseph E. *The Invention of Greek Ethnography: From Homer to Herodotus*. Greeks Overseas. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Slavova, Mirena. “Bulgarian Lands in Antiquity: A Melting Pot of Thracian, Greek, and Roman Culture.” In *A Handbook to Classical Reception in Eastern and Central Europe*, edited by Zara Martirosova Torlone, Dana LaCourse Munteanu, and Dorota Dutsch, 396–410. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2017.

———. “Mystery Clubs in Bulgarian Lands in Antiquity: Greek Epigraphical Evidence.” *Opuscula Atheniensia* 27 (2002): 137–49.

———. *Phonology of the Greek Inscriptions in Bulgaria*. Palingenesia 83. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2004.

———. “The Greek Language on the Bulgarian Coast (6th Cent. B.C.-1st Cent. B.C.).” In *Le grec du monde colonial antique: Le N. et N.-O. de la Mer Noire*, edited by Guy Vottéro, 195–220. Etudes Anciennes 42. Paris: Boccard, 2010.

Slings, S. R., ed. *Platonis* Rempublicam. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Soesbergen, Peter G. van. “Thracian Personal, Ethnic and Topographic Names in Linear A and B.” *Kadmos* 18 (1979): 26–39.

Solas, Aliénor Rufin. “Philippe II de Macédoine, l’argent et La Guerre: Les Recrutements de Guerriers Thraces.” *Revue des Études Grecques* 127 (2014): 75–96.

Sommerstein, Alan H. “Menander and the *Pallake*.” In *Menander in Contexts*, edited by Alan H. Sommerstein, 11–23. Routledge Monographs in Classical Studies 16. New York: Routledge, 2014.

Sosin, Joshua D., and John Bauschatz. “Four Duke Papyri Concerning Pesouris, *Basilikos Grammateus*.” *Zeitschrift Für Papyrologie Und Epigraphik* 141 (2002): 177–90.

Soustal, Peter. *Thrakien (Thrakē, Rodopē und Haimimontos)*. Tabula Imperii Byzantini 6; Osterreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-Historische Klasse, Denkschriften 221. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1991.

Spek, Robartus J. van der. “Darius III, Alexander the Great and Babylonian Scholarship.” In *A Persian Perspective. Essays in Memory of Heleen Sancisi-Weerdenburg*, edited by Wouter F. M. Henkelman and Amélie Kuhrt, 289–346. Achaemenid History 13. Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 2003.

Spiro, Friedrich, ed. *Pausaniae Graeciae Descriptio*. 3 vols. Leipzig: Teubner, 1903.

Ste. Croix, G. M. E. de. “The Athenian Citizenship Laws.” In *Athenian Democratic Origins and Other Essays*, edited by David Harvey, Robert Parker, and Peter Thonemann, 233–53. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.

Stefanou, Mary. “Waterborne Recruits: The Military Settlers of Ptolemaic Egypt.” In *The Ptolemies, the Sea, and the Nile: Studies in Waterborne Power*, edited by Kostas Buraselis, Mary Stefanou, and Dorothy J. Thompson, 108–31. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Steve, M.-J. “Inscriptions des Achéménides à Suse.” *Studia Iranica* 3 (1974): 7–28.

———. “Inscriptions des Achéménides à Suse (Fin).” *Studia Iranica* 4 (1975): 7–26.

Stolper, Matthew W. “Inscribed in Egyptian.” In *Studies in Persian History: Essays in Memory of David M. Lewis*, edited by Maria Brosius and Amélie Kuhrt, 133–43.

Achaemenid History 11. Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten, 1998.

Stoyanov, Totko. “More on the Amphora Production in Early Hellenistic Mesambria Pontica.” In *Monuments and Text in Antiquity and Beyond: Essays for the Centenary of Georgi Mihailov (1915-1991)*, edited by Mirena Slavova and Nikolay Sharankov, 362–70. Studia Classica Serdicensia 5. Sofia: St. Kliment Ohridski University Press, 2016.

———. “New Evidence for Amphora Production in Early Hellenistic Mesambria Pontica.” In *PATABS II: Production and Trade of Amphorae in the Black Sea: Acts of the International Round Table Held in Kiten, Nessebar and Sredetz, September 26-30, 2007*, edited by Chavdar Tzochev, Totko Stoyanov, and Anelia Bozkova, 191–201. Sofia: Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, National Archaeological Institute with Museum, 2011.

———. “Pieces of Metalwork as Emblems on the Amphora Stamps of Thasos (till 336 B.C.) – Interpretation Issues.” In *Ancient Macedonia VII: Macedonia from the Iron Age to the Death of Philip II. Papers Read at the Seventh International Symposium Held in Thessaloniki, October 14-18, 2002*, edited by Danai Kaplanidou and Irini Chioti, 153–63. Thessaloniki: Institute for Balkan Studies, 2007.

———. “Reflections on the ‘Parmeniskos’ Group.” *Thracia* 13 (2000): 409–15.

———. “The Parmeniskos Amphora Group – New Data and Reflections on Production Centres and Chronology.” *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 7 (2003): 35–43.

———. “The River System of North-Eastern Thrace as a Medium in Economic Relations in Classical and Hellenistic Times.” In *Environment and Habitation around the Ancient Black Sea*, edited by David Braund, Vladimir F. Stolba, and Ulrike Peter, 77–90. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2021.

———. “Warfare.” In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 426–42. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Stoyanov, Totko, and Daniela Stoyanova. “The Tholos of Odessos.” *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 1, no. 3 (1997): 22–33.

Stoyanova, Daniela. “Chronology and Parallels.” In *The Temple of the Pontic Mother of Gods in Dionysopolis*, 22–28. Varna: Slavena, 2013.

Stoyas, Yannis. “Two Peculiar Thracian Coin Issues: ΔΑΝΤΗΛΤΩΝ and ΜΕΛΣΑ.” In *Ηρακλέους Σωτήρος Θασίων: Studia in honorem Iliae Prokopov sexagenario ab amicis et discipulis dedicate*, edited by Evgeni Paunov and Svetoslava Filipova, 143–86. Veliko Turnovo: Faber, 2012.

Stronk, Jan P. “Crossing the Straits: The Persians in Thrace.” *Talanta* 30–31 (1999 1998): 55–72.

———. *Semiramis’ Legacy: The History of Persia According to Diodorus of Sicily*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2017.

———. *The Ten Thousand in Thrace: An Archaeological and Historical Commentary on Xenophon’s Anabasis, Books VI.Iii-vi-VII*. Amsterdam Classical Monographs 2. Amsterdam: J. C. Gieben, 1995.

———. “Wreckage at Salmydessos.” *Talanta* 18–19 (1987 1986): 63–75.

Strootman, Rolf. *Courts and Elites in the Hellenistic Empires: The Near East After the Achaemenids, c. 300 to 30 BCE*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014.

———. “Hellenistic Court Society: The Seleukid Imperial Court under Antiochos the Great, 223–187 BCE.” In *Royal Courts in Dynastic States and Empires: A Global Perspective*, edited by Jeroen Duindam, Tülay Artan, and Metin Kunt, 63–89. Rulers & Elites 1. Leiden: Brill, 2011.

———. “Hellenistic Imperialism and the Ideal of World Unity.” In *The City in the Classical and Post-Classical World: Changing Contexts of Power and Identity*, edited by Claudia Rapp and H. A. Drake, 38–61. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Swift, Laura, ed. *Archilochus: The Poems: Introduction, Text, Translation, and Commentary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019.

Szemerényi, Oswald. *Four Old Iranian Ethnic Names: Scythian, Skudra, Sogdian, Saka*. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse, Sitzungsberichte 371. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1980.

Szubert, Waldemar. “Notes on the Influence of Thracian Religious Cults in the West Pontian Greek Towns during the Roman Occupation. The Sanctuary of the Great God – Darzalos at Odessos.” In *Dritter Internationaler Thrakologischer Kongress zu Ehren W. Tomascheks, 2. - 6. Juni 1980 Wien*, edited by Anton Peschew, Dimitar Popov, Kiril Jordanov, and Iris von Bredow, 2:275–83. Sofia: Staatlicher Verlag Swjat, 1984.

Tachev, Yanislav. *Monetosečeneto na Dionisopolis: IV vek pr. Hr. - III vek sl. Hr*. Sofia: n.p., 2014.

Tadmor, Hayim. “World Dominion: The Expanding Horizon of the Assyrian State.” In *Landscapes: Territories, Frontiers and Horizons in the Ancient Near East*, edited

by Lucio Milano, Stefano De Martino, Frederick Mario Fales, and Giovanni B. Lanfranchi, 55–62. History of the Ancient Near East Monographs 3/1. Padova: Sargon srl, 1999.

Tallet, Gaëlle, and Christiane Zivie-Coche. "Imported Cults." In *The Oxford Handbook of Roman Egypt*, edited by Christina Rigg, 436–56. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Tataki, Argyro B. *Macedonians Abroad: A Contribution to the Prosopography of Ancient Macedonia*. Meletemata 26. Athens: Research Centre for Greek and Roman Antiquity, National Hellenic Research Foundation, 1998.

Theodossiev, Nikola. "An Introduction to Studying Ancient Thrace." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 3–11. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

———. "ΚΟΤΕΟΥΣ ΗΛΙΟΥ and ΚΟΤΕΟΥΣ ΜΗΤΡΟΣ ΟΡΕΑΣ." *Hermes* 129, no. 2 (2001): 279–83.

———. "Mountain Goddesses in Ancient Thrace: The Broader Context." *Kernos* 15 (2002): 325–29.

Thierry, Petit. *Satrapes et satrapies dans l'empire achéménide de Cyrus le Grand à Xerxès I^er^*. Bibliothèque de la Faculté de philosophie et lettres de l'Université de Liège 254. Paris: Société d'Édition "Les Belles Lettres," 1990.

Thomas, J. David. *The Epistrategos in Ptolemaic and Roman Egypt*. Vol. 1. Papyrologica Coloniensia 6. Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, 1975.

Thompson, Dorothy J. "Hellenistic Hellenes: The Case of Ptolemaic Egypt." In *Ancient Perceptions of Greek Ethnicity*, edited by Irad Malkin, 301–22. Washington, D.C.: Center for Hellenic Studies, 2001.

Thornton, Bruce S. "Greek Appetite and Its Discontents." *Arion* 7, no. 3 (2000): 153–66.

Threatte, Leslie. *The Grammar of Attic Inscriptions*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1980.

Tiverios, Michalis. "Greek Colonisation of the Northern Aegean." In *Greek Colonisation: An Account of Greek Colonies and Other Settlements Overseas*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 1–154. Mnemosyne Supplements 193. Leiden: Brill, 2008.

Tomaschek, Wilhelm. "Die alten Thraker I. Eine ethnologische Untersuchung." *Sitzungsberichte der Philosophisch Historischen Classe der Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften* 128 (1893): 1–130.

Tončeva, Gorana. "Le sanctuaire du Héros Karabasmos d'Odessos." In *Actes du premier*

congrès des études balkaniques et sud-est européennes, edited by Vladimir Georgiev, Nikolaĭ Todorov, and Vasilka Tŭpkova-Zaimova, 2:353–64. Sofia: Editions de l'Académie Bulgare des Sciences, 1969.

Tordoff, Rob. "Introduction: Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comedy." In *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama*, edited by Ben Akrigg and Rob Tordoff, 1–62. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Toynbee, Arnold. *Constantine Porphyrogenitus and His World*. London: Oxford University Press, 1973.

Tozer, Henry Fanshawe. *The Islands of the Aegean*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1890.

Tracy, Stephen V., and Christian Habicht. "New and Old Panathenaic Victor Lists." *Hesperia* 60, no. 2 (1991): 187–236.

Tripolitis, Antonia. *Religions of the Hellenistic-Roman Age*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2002.

Trundle, Matthew. *Greek Mercenaries: From the Late Archaic Period to Alexander*. London: Routledge, 2004.

Tsatsopoulou, Polyxeni. "The Colonies of Samothrace: Topography and Archaeological Research." In *Thrace in the Graeco-Roman World: Proceedings of the 10th International Congress of Thracology, Komotini – Alexandroupolis 18-23 October, 2005*, edited by Athena Iakovidou, 648–56. Athens: Center for Greek and Roman Antiquity, National Hellenic Research Foundation, 2007.

Tsatsopoulou-Kaloudi, Polyxeni. "Eisagogi." In *Archaia Zoni I: To Iero tou Apollona*, 16–112. Komotini: Ypourgeio Politismou kai Athlitismou, Eforeia Archaiotíton Evrou, Perifereia Anatolikis Makedonias-Thrakis, 2015.

———. *Mesimvria-Zoni*. Athens: Tameio Archaiologikon Poron kai Apallotrioseon, 2011.

Tsetskhladze, Gocha R. "Between West and East: Anatolian Roots of Local Cultures of the Pontus." In *Ancient Greeks West and East*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 469–96. Mnemosyne Supplements 196. Leiden: Brill, 1999.

———. "Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area." In *The Greek Colonisation of the Black Sea Area: Historical Interpretation of Archaeology*, edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, 9–68. Historia Einzelschriften 121. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1998.

———. "Pontic Slaves in Athens: Orthodoxy and Reality." In *Antike Lebenswelten: Konstanz–Wandel–Wirkungsmacht. Festschrift für Ingomar Weiler zum 70.*

Geburtstag, edited by Peter Mauritsch, Werner Petermandl, and Robert Rollinger, 309–19. Philippika 25. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2008.

Tsiafakis, Despoina. "Ancient Thrace and the Thracians through Athenian Eyes." *Thracia* 21 (2016): 261–82.

———. "The Allure and Repulsion of Thracians in the Art of Classical Athens." In *Not the Classical Ideal: Athens and the Construction of the Other in Greek*, edited by Beth Cohen, 364–89. Leiden: Brill, 2000.

———. "Thracian Tattoos." In *Bodies in Transition: Dissolving the Boundaries of Embodied Knowledge*, edited by Dietrich Boschung, Alan Shapiro, and Frank Waschek, 89–117. Morphomata 23. Paderborn: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 2015.

Tuplin, Christopher. *Achaemenid Studies*. Historia Einzelschriften 99. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1996.

———. "Revisiting Dareios' Scythian Expedition." In *Achaemenid Impact in the Black Sea: Communication of Powers,* edited by Jens Nieling and Ellen Rehm, 281–312. Black Sea Studies 11. Aarhus: Aarhus University Press, 2010.

———. "Xenophon and the Garrisons of the Achaemenid Empire." *Archäologische Mitteilungen Aus Iran* 20 (1987): 167–245.

Tzaneva, Maria. "Thrako-Griechische Beziehungen in der frühen Periode von der Entwicklung von Apollonia Pontica." In *Thracia Pontica I: Premier Symposium International, Sozopol, 9–12 Octobre 1979*, edited by Alexandre Fol, 197–200. Sofia: Centre d'histoire maritime et d'archeologie sous-marin, 1982.

Uchitel, A. "Foreign Workers in the Fortification Archive." In *Mésopotamie et Elam: actes de la XXXVIème Rencontre assyriologique internationale, Gand, 10-14 juillet 1989*, 127–35. MHE, Occasional Publications 1. Ghent: University of Ghent, 1991.

Uebel, Fritz. *Die Kleruchen Ägyptens unter den ersten sechs Ptolemäern*. Abhandlungen der deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Klasse für Sprachen, Literatur und Kunst 3. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1968.

Unger, Eckhard. "Die Dariusstele am Tearos." *Archäologischer Anzeiger,* 1915, 3–16.

Valeva, Julia, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, eds. *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Valeva, Julia, Emil Nankov, Denver Graninger, and David Braund, eds. "Thracians and Scythians: Tensions, Interactions and Osmosis." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, 352–65. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Vanderlip, Frederika. *The Four Greek Hymns of Isidorus and the Cult of Isis*. American Studies in Papyrology 12. Toronto: A. M. Hakkert, 1972.

Vasilescu, Mihail. "Études sur la crédibilité d'Hérodote III. Les stèles de Darius de Thrace." *Arheologia Moldovei* 30 (2007): 117–27.

Vasilev, Miroslav Ivanov. Review of *The History of the Argeads: New Perspectives*, edited by Sabine Müller, Timothy Howe, Hugh Bowden, and Robert Rollinger. *Bryn Mawr Classical Review*. https://bmcr.brynmawr.edu/2018/2018.11.37.

———. *The Policy of Darius and Xerxes toward Thrace and Macedonia*. Mnemosyne Supplements 379. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Vasileva, Miglena. "Fibulae from *Apollonia Pontica*." *Archaeologia Bulgarica* 18 (2014): 35–63.

Vassileva, Maya. "A Few Notes on Phrygian and Thracian Script and Literacy." *Thracia* 16 (2005): 79–93.

———. "Further Considerations on the Cult of Kybele." *Anatolian Studies* 51 (2001): 51–63.

———. "Phrygia and the Southern Black Sea Littoral." In *The Danubian Lands Between the Black, Aegean and Adriatic Seas (7th Century BC–10th Century AD): Proceedings of the Fifth International Congress on Black Sea Antiquities (Belgrade – 17-21 September 2013),* edited by Gocha R. Tsetskhladze, Alexandru Avram, and James Hargrave, 91–96. Oxford: Archaeopress, 2005.

———. "Phrygia, Troy and Thrace." In *Anatolian Iron Ages 5: Proceedings of the Fifth Anatolian Iron Ages Colloquium Held at Van, 6–10 August 2001*, edited by Altan Çilingiroğlu and Gareth Darbyshire, 227–34. British Institute at Ankara Monograph 31. London: British Institute at Ankara, 2005.

———. "Thracian and Phrygian Rock-Cut Tombs: A Comparative Overview." In *Megalithic Monuments and Cult Practices: Proceedings of the Second International Symposium, Ancient Cultures in South-East Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean, Blagoevgrad, 12-15 October 2016*, edited by Dimitriya Spasova, 44–57. Blagoevgrad: Neofit Rilski University Press, 2012.

Veer, J. A. G. van der. "The Battle of Marathon: A Topographical Survey." *Mnemosyne* 35, no. 3/4 (1982): 290–321.

Velkov, Velizar. "Mesambria Pontica." In *Die bulgarische Schwarzmeerküste im Altertum,* edited by Wolfgang Schuller, 29–40. Xenia 16. Konstanz: Universitätsverlag Konstanz, 1985.

———. “Mesambria—Mesembria—Nessèbre (Situation, recherches, notes historiques).” In *Nessebre*, edited by Teofil Ivanov, 1:9–28. Sofia: Editions de l’Académie bulgare des sciences, 1969.

Velkov, Velizar, and Alexandre Fol. *Les Thraces en Égypte gréco-romaine*. Studia Thracica 4. Sofia: Academia Litterarum Bulgarica, 1977.

Venedikov, Ivan. “La Mesambria Thrace.” In *Nessebre*, edited by Velizar Velkov, 2:7–22. Sofia: Editions de l’Académie bulgare des sciences, 1980.

———. “Les fortifications dans la partie nord-ouest de Nessebre.” In *Nessebre*, edited by Velizar Velkov, 2:23–80. Sofia: Editions de l’Académie bulgare des sciences, 1980.

———. “L’inscription de Sadalas.” *Epigraphica* 42 (1980): 7–12.

———. “Trois reliefs surprenants de Mésambria.” In *Nessebre*, edited by Velizar Velkov, 2:81–95. Sofia: Editions de l’Académie bulgare des sciences, 1980.

Vermaseren, M. J. *Corpus Cultus Cybelae Attidisque (CCCA)*. Vol. 6. Études préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l’Empire romain 50/6. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1989.

Vianu, Maria Alexandrescu. “L’iconographie des reliefs aux stratèges de Mésambria.” *Studii Clasice* 24 (1986): 99–107.

Vlassopoulos, Kostas. “Athenian Slave Names and Athenian Social History.” *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 175 (2010): 113–44.

———. “Plotting Strategies, Networks, and Communities in Classical Athens: The Evidence of Slave Names.” In *Communities and Networks in the Ancient Greek World*, edited by Claire Taylor and Kostas Vlassopoulos, 101–27. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Walbank, Michael M. *Athenian Proxenies of the Fifth Century B.C.* Toronto: Samuel Stevens, 1974.

Wallace, Shane. “East and West: Lines of Communication between Alexander and the Greeks.” *Hermathena* 200/201 (2016): 15–72.

Wees, Hans van. “Agesilaos’ Abandoned Children: ‘Humane’ Treatment of the Displaced?” *Pallas* 112 (2020): 191–98.

———. “Demetrius and Draco: Athens’ Property Classes and Population In and Before 317 BC.” *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 131 (2011): 95–114.

Weissbach, F. H. *Die Keilinschriften der Achämeniden*. Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs’sche

Buchhandlung, 1911.

West, David R. *Some Cults of Greek Goddesses and Female Daemons of Oriental Origin*. Alter Orient und Altes Testament 233. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1995.

West, M. L., ed. *Iambi et Elegi Graeci ante Alexandrum cantati*. Vol. 1. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971.

West, Stephanie. "Herodotus' Epigraphical Interests." *Classical Quarterly* 35, no. 2 (1985): 278–305.

Wijma, Sara M. *Embracing the Immigrant: The Participation of Metics in Athenian Polis Religion (5th–4th BC)*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2014.

Wiles, David. "Greek Theatre and the Legitimation of Slavery." In *Slavery and Other Forms of Unfree Labour,* edited by Léonie J. Archer, 53–67. London: Routledge, 1988.

Will, Édouard. "Pour une 'anthropologie coloniale' du monde hellénistique." In *The Craft of the Ancient Historian: Essays in Honor of Chester G. Starr*, edited by John W. Eadie and Josiah Ober, 273–302. Lanham: University Press of America, 1985.

Williams, Margaret H. "Semitic Name-Use by Jews in Roman Asia Minor and the Dating of the Aphrodisias Stele Inscriptions." In *Old and New Worlds in Greek Onomastics,* edited by Elaine Matthews, 173–97. Proceedings of the British Academy 148. Oxford: British Academy/Oxford University Press, 2007.

Wrenhaven, Kelly L. *Reconstructing the Slave: The Image of the Slave in Ancient Greece*. London: Bloomsbury, 2012.

———. "The Identity of the 'Wool-Workers' in the Attic Manumissions." *Hesperia* 78, no. 3 (2009): 367–86.

Wünsch, Richard. *Defixionum Tabellae Atticae*. Corpus Inscriptionum Atticarum Appendix. Berlin: Reimer, 1897.

Wycherley, R. E. "The Market of Athens: Topography and Monuments." *Greece & Rome* 3 (1956): 2–23.

Wypustek, Andrzej. *Images of Eternal Beauty in Funerary Verse Inscriptions of the Hellenistic and Greco-Roman Periods*. Mnemosyne Supplements 352. Leiden: Brill, 2013.

Yailenko, Valery. "Source Study Analysis of Pseudo-Scymnus' Data on the Pontic Cities' Foundation." *Pontica* 48–49 (2016 2015): 9–23.

Yamada, Shigeo. *The Construction of the Assyrian Empire: A Historical Study of the Inscriptions of Shalmaneser III (859–824 B.C.) Relating to His Campaigns in the West*. Culture and History of the Ancient Near East 3. Leiden: Brill, 2000.

Youroukova, Jordanka. "Les monnaies dans l'inscription de Sadalas." *Epigraphica* 42 (1980): 13–24.

Zahrnt, Michael. "Die Perser in Thrakien." In *Thrace ancienne. Actes 2e Symposium International des Études Thraciennes*, edited by Association Culturelle de Komotini, 91–100. Komotini: Musée Archéologique de Komotini, 1992.

———. "Early History of Thrace to the Murder of Kotys I (360 BCE)." In *A Companion to Ancient Thrace*, edited by Julia Valeva, Emil Nankov, and Denver Graninger, 35–47. Hoboken: Wiley Blackwell, 2015.

Zelnick-Abramovitz, Rachel. *Not Wholly Free: The Concept of Manumission and the Status of Manumitted Slaves in the Ancient Greek World*. Mnemosyne Supplements 266. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

———. "Whose Grave Is This? The Status of Grave Plots in Ancient Greece." *Dike* 18 (2015): 51–95.

Zgusta, Ladislav. *Kleinasiatische Ortsnamen*. Beiträge zur Namenforschung, Neue Folge 21. Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag, 1984.

Ziegler, Konrat. *Plutarchi Vitae Parallelae*. 3 vols. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1960.

Zimmermann, Konrad. "Tätowierte Thrakerinnen auf griechischen Vasenbildern." *Jahrbuch des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts* 95 (1980): 163–96.