

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Navajo as Seen by the Franciscans, 1898-1921: A Sourcebook.
Edited by Howard M. Bahr.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5167d340>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Brugge, David M.

Publication Date

2011

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

hundred years. The large climatic changes, the rise of agriculture, and the early transformations in Indians societies that took place over centuries all receive the same space as decades' worth of events after 1607. Nonetheless, Rice conveys the momentousness of the changes between 700 and 1600 with as much detail as his sources will allow. By his own admission, he relies on "imagination," with a "willingness to speculate and even to be wrong," when he tries to give these early centuries as much of a human face as possible (8). He invites the reader to play the role of visitor and paddle a canoe up the Potomac and its tributaries while he introduces the inhabitants. To do otherwise would be to write history "without considering how individuals felt, smelled, and saw the world they moved through, [which] disregards their humanity" (22). Daily life in the Potomac for an Englishman during the eighteenth century is vividly described. Although Rice's central focus is broad patterns of subsistence and market relations practiced by the English, he gives these a lively spin by extrapolating from the lives of individuals who left behind detailed writings about their daily lives.

Rice has set an example that historians of regions beyond the Potomac will hopefully follow. Specialists in Native American, colonial American, and environmental history will all profit from reading this book. Rice leaves little doubt that the Potomac watershed had a unique history within Virginia, Maryland, or the "southern colonies." Even today, inhabitants of the Potomac live with the legacy of a history set in motion well before the arrival of John Smith. Reading the book makes one wonder about its subtitle. How much was the turn of the nineteenth century really the age of Jefferson or even the age of Washington?

James D. Drake

Metropolitan State College of Denver

The Navajo as Seen by the Franciscans, 1898–1921: A Sourcebook. Edited by Howard M. Bahr. Lanham, MD, and Toronto: The Scarecrow Press, 2004. 656 pages. \$73.70 cloth.

Howard Bahr's title, although long, is a modest one. The subtitle is the best description for this book as it is essentially an edited mini-archive. The greater part of *The Navajo as Seen by the Franciscans* is made up of full texts and excerpts from published and unpublished articles and documents, most written by the Franciscan fathers. Those that have been previously published are from what are, today, obscure sources put out by branches of the Franciscan Order. Several were originally written in German and have been translated into English. Although the book provides many insights into the Franciscan

missionaries' views on the Navajos during the early twentieth century, it is also a valuable source on Franciscan and Navajo history.

As might be expected, it tells much about the founding and expansion of Catholic missions in Navajo country in terms of personnel, facilities, and, perhaps of greater interest, dealings with the Navajos, the federal government, and other Christian denominations. In the book there is some mention of non-Navajo neighbors, especially of traders.

As members of a monastic order within a major branch of Christianity, the Franciscans in the missions at St. Michaels, Chinle, and Lukachukai were in agreement that the Navajos were heathens in need of salvation in a religious sense, but beyond that their views of just what that meant and how they should address the situation varied. Their descriptions of the Navajos range from objective and well reasoned to verbose and condescending. Many of the circumstances in which they dealt with the Navajos involved disputes or crises. The one description included here, which was written by a trader, J. B. Moore at Crystal, New Mexico, differs markedly from all of those by Franciscans (512–15).

The missionaries were fortunate in having among their number two outstanding individuals, Father Anselm Weber, who was exceptionally successful in defending Navajo land rights and seeing that they received fair treatment by government officials, and Father Bernard Haile, who as a scholar made major contributions to the study of the Navajo language and traditional beliefs. Both have been the subjects of book-length works (Robert L. Wilken, *Anselm Weber, O.F.M.: Missionary to the Navaho*, 1955; Fr. Murray Bodo, O.F.M., *Tales of an Endishodi: Father Berard Haile and the Navajos, 1900–1961*, 1998). The former is the best represented in this book and in more significant ways.

Modern readers may find understanding the times in which the priests and brothers worked less than easy to visualize. It was a time of extreme religious prejudice, and Catholicism was a distinctly minority religion, one strongly opposed by Protestant denominations. The competition for converts was much brisker than most of us have seen in more recent times. Although the Franciscans' accusations of the Protestants' tactics should not be too readily dismissed, it is clear that the Franciscans could hold their own quite well.

While serious researchers may find the book most valuable as a guide to the original sources, the breadth of coverage includes a great deal of detail not in print elsewhere. Significant subject matter on early-twentieth-century federal law-enforcement programs among Native American populations, regulation of missions, provision of education and health care, and major events in Navajo history such as the witch purge of the late 1870s, the Beautiful Mountain incident of 1913, the 1918 and 1919 flu epidemic, and the flood prophesies of

1919 and 1920 are among those of special interest. The first flood prophecy appears to have been made by a Protestant missionary in 1919 (481).

The Navajo as Seen by the Franciscans also contains considerable material as to the personalities and character of prominent individuals, Navajos as well as non-Navajos. I found the brief mention of the Hubbells and Brother Simeon Schwenberger frustrating (Paul V. Long, *Big Eyes: The Southwestern Photographs of Simeon Schwenberger, 1902–1908, 1992*), but considerable detail regarding the Days, Blackhorse, the Chinle Gormans, Chee Dodge, and Father Emanuel Trockur is included.

The major lack in the editing is that there is no explanation of the ways in which Navajo words are spelled. These writings predate the standardization of Navajo orthography, and writers struggled then to render Navajo in written form. Here common terms, such as the Navajo word for *man*, are found with the spellings *hastiin*, *hastin*, *hasten*, *qastqin*, *qastquin*, and *qastqui*. More complex constrictions suffer convoluted variations, often far from transparent even for a reader with some knowledge of the Navajo language. A few correlations of Navajo and English translations of personal names appear in the index, but there are others that do not, leaving individuals mentioned by Navajo names, translations of Navajo names, and sometimes very different English names unconnected.

In conclusion, I can recommend this book highly for those doing research in Navajo history and ethnohistory as a source of writings contemporary with most events mentioned, but must warn more casual readers that it will not be easy going without some background knowledge of things Navajo.

David M. Brugge
Independent Scholar

Science, Colonialism, and Indigenous Peoples: The Cultural Politics of Law and Knowledge. By Laurelyn Whitt. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009. 284 pages. \$85.00 cloth.

Colonialism is most pernicious, thorough, and invisible—even to the colonized—when it is embedded in the assumptions that order the world and the worldview of the colonizers, naturalizing “coloniality” (in the words of the Peruvian scholar, Anibal Quijano) as a condition of existence. In this exemplary work of cultural criticism, Laurelyn Whitt undertakes to deconstruct three such assumptions of Euro-modernity that have been complicit in the incarceration of indigenous peoples in the “iron cage” of coloniality: science as the only way of knowing the world, market-driven property regimes as the