

# **UCLA**

## **American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

### **Title**

The Indian Frontier of the American West, 1846-1890. By Robert M. Utley.

### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4z4677nc>

### **Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 8(3)

### **ISSN**

0161-6463

### **Author**

Clark, C. B.

### **Publication Date**

1984-06-01

### **DOI**

10.17953

### **Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

not as a series of events in chronological order but as a series of social demarcations which impacted the Lakota.

*The Sixth Grandfather* provides an excellent data base to compare Neihardt's published works with the original source material. To this end the editor has included two appendices to assist the interested reader. Appendix A indexes all the material in the interviews to the appropriate pages in Neihardt's works. Appendix B is an orthography which was used in standardizing the Lakota words found in the interview notes. Both appendices are extremely useful and are valuable research aids.

The importance of this book transcends its value as a literary tool. *The Sixth Grandfather* provides valuable insight into Lakota culture as well as the symbolic complexity and richness of Lakota religious thought. Aside from its obvious contribution to Lakota ethnography, *The Sixth Grandfather* remains a remarkable body of teachings that deserves contemplation as a way of knowledge and not just mere ethnographic fact.

Gregory R. Campbell  
University of Oklahoma

**The Indian Frontier of the American West, 1846–1890.** By Robert M. Utley. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. 325 pp. \$19.95 Cloth. \$10.95 Paper.

Utley has produced an excellent contribution to the fine Histories of the American Frontier Series. The work is the best overview of military-Indian conflicts involving the expansion of the frontier in the Trans-Mississippi West and of reformers' efforts to correct alleged abuses following the Civil War. Based on the author's wide research and extensive reading, this work builds on his earlier *Frontiersmen in Blue* (1967) and *Frontier Regulars* (1973) as well as his collaborative *The American Heritage History of the Indian Wars* (1977). *The Indian Frontier of the American West* culminates years of experience in the West and scholarly publishing on that field.

Utley first introduces the reader to a broad summary of tribalism and cultural change in the West, focusing on the Nez Perce and the Blackfeet. The author then surveys the foundations of American Indian policy in the decade prior to the Civil War, examining broad themes of progress and assimilationist

pressures. He expands our picture of American Indian involvement in the Civil War, taking the reader into Arizona and New Mexico, on into American Indian Territory for the Five Civilized Tribes' travail, on to Minnesota for the Sioux uprising, through the Kit Carson campaigns to Bosque Redondo, into the Sand Creek carnage and on to postwar treaty relations. Utley conveys the reader through the roller coaster of the postwar "Peace Policy" and its incessant warfare and treaty councils. He then explores the vision of various reform elements as their collective voices rose toward the crescendo of allotment in severalty. This book travels the same route of Utley's *The Last Days of the Sioux Nation*, taking a path through the Sioux reservations, assessing the malaise of confinement at an agency, then concludes with Wounded Knee in 1890 and the closing of the frontier in other parts of American Indian country. He effectively weighs the military and reformist framework within which American Indian policy evolved and the sources and dissonance within that framework. Drawing from his earlier soldierly works, he is at his best describing troops in action.

The book is sprinkled with interpretations that lend a refreshing note to the flow of a narrative that could easily digress into pedantry because of the vastness of the book's scope. The author demonstrates that both the military and peace policies were costly failures. Utley uncovers the paradox of the reservation policy in pointing out that "Every important Indian war since 1870 had been essentially a war not of concentration but of rebellion—of Indians rebelling against reservations they had already accepted in theory in not in fact" (p. 201). He underscores the irony of the post-Civil War peace initiatives when he earlier states, ". . . the era of the Peace Policy featured some of the bitterest warfare in the history of Indian relations" (p. 155). He provides insightful glimpses of individual actors, both Indian and non-Indian, in the drama of confrontation ranging from the brash Satank to the embittered Robert S. Neighbors and many more.

The volume does have shortcomings. No single work can cover every aspect or mention every possible source reading concerning events in the West during the important forty-four years under study. Utley corrects much previous writing on the Civil War in the West with his summary of the Five Tribes' relocation, their struggles to rebuild anew in American Indian Territory and

their entrapment in the war "When the White People Fought Each Other." However, some of the sources the author cites have been superseded by more recent scholarship. A wealth of works on that conflict and its aftermath have come out since Annie Abel's volumes, yet he cites only her standard but dated work on the negotiations for surrender treaties. The author misinterprets the role of John Ross, the composition of American Indian delegates and the eagerness of American Indians to capitulate at Fort Smith in 1865. Many of the American Indians present were former Union supporters, while others had served on both sides in the war. Utley does mention that the seeds sown in the reconstruction treaties would be reaped in later years in tribal bitterness and political controversies. Similarly Utley's summary of the evolution of American Indian Territory up to Statehood is simplistic. He presents a straight line through the Curtis Act to Statehood and the end of tribal government. He makes no mention of Crazy Snake, Redbird Smith or other resistance, nor does he call attention to the Atoka Agreement (1897), the 1902 agreements nor the 1906 acts dealing with tribal governments. Although seriously assaulted and fettered, tribal governments continued.

In the Far West the author's biggest flaw is inadequate treatment of California Indians. He is not alone among historians. No other surveyors have succeeded because of the diversity and complexity of the subject. His population figures virtually ignore California's large Native population (p. 4). The Chumash are misidentified as being in Nevada on a map (p. 5). The narrative over the problems of California reservation policy omits the role of Edward Beale and the Tejon-Sebastian Reservation (p. 52). More could be made of the relentless American slaughter and assault of Natives, of the resistance of California Indians to American presence, of the role of California Indians in the building of Los Angeles during the late Mexican and early American eras and of the incorporation of Natives into the California labor force following the American take-over. American Indians speak in the text during the period of warfare but few speak during the reformist eras. More Native sources would have presented the recipients' views amid all the pious rhetoric of reform.

Rather than stigmatize, the book's deficiencies tend to highlight the volume's thrust and direction. A highly readable prose style is enlivened with a dozen maps and nearly ninety illustrations.

*The Indian Frontier of the American West* is a masterful synthesis that will long rank as the standard survey.

C.B. Clark  
California State University,  
Long Beach

**The Subarctic Fur Trade: Native Social and Economic Adaptations.** Edited by Shepard Krech, III. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1984. xix + 194 pp. \$23.95 U.S. (\$28.95 Cda.) Cloth.

This work consists of six papers presented in 1981 at the American Society for Ethnohistory. Spanning from the seventeenth to the early twentieth century, they take as their theme the American Indians' role in the fur trade and the effects it had on their lives.

Arthur J. Ray deals with "Periodic Shortages, Native Welfare, and the Hudson's Bay Company 1670-1930." His argument, rather contrived, is that the northern American Indians today rely, to a large extent, on government assistance for their economic survival and that the Hudson's Bay Company is mainly responsible for their failure to regain the economic self-sufficiency they once had. It is maintained that the Company's provision of relief by the credit barter system kept the American Indian trappers and hunters in a state of economic subservience and prevented their adjustment to a cash economy. Ray points out that the Company could well afford to grant credit and cancel old debts on occasion since its profits were extortionate and it had to support the providers of those profits. But was the Company's practice really "relief," akin to that provided by the government today, as the author claims? It seems to have been merely a necessary easing of the Company's exploitation of the American Indians when circumstances so dictated.

Two other points require comment. Ray asserts, "Very quickly, another specialty emerged: engaging in the trade as middlemen. American Indians who became middlemen devoted little or no time to commercial trapping activities. . . ." No particular tribes are mentioned and no evidence is offered in support of the statement. The implication is that these middlemen were capitalist entrepreneurs in moccasins. This reviewer has yet to see a scrap of