

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Musical Repercussions of 1492: Encounters in Text and Performance.  
Edited by Carol E. Robertson.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4m11j08z>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 17(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Frisbie, Charlotte J.

**Publication Date**

1993-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Throughout my perusal of this book, I kept asking myself, "How did the Potawatomi Nation end up in Indiana?" During my childhood in Wisconsin, I spent many enjoyable days in Potawatomi State Park near my home, and I knew that the Potawatomi were a Wisconsin Indian nation. When did the Potawatomi move to Indiana? My answer was found in *Keepers of the Fire: The History of the Potawatomi Indians of Wisconsin*, published by the Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction. The Potawatomi Nation migrated down the St. Lawrence River and settled along the shores of Lake Michigan. Years later, as the population of the nation grew, some members moved south to Indiana. Thus Winter found the Potawatomi Nation in Indiana and recorded part of their history in both writings and pictures.

I recommend *Indians and a Changing Frontier* for both high school and college students. Serious study of this book will help students learn about the causes and effects of the Removal Act of 1830 and will provide them with some important understandings of acculturation and survival. In addition, it will help American Indian youth develop some insights into how their people have changed.

Leona M. Zastrow  
St. Catherine Indian School  
Santa Fe, New Mexico

**Musical Repercussions of 1492: Encounters in Text and Performance.** Edited by Carol E. Robertson. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992. 486 pages. \$62.00 cloth.

Now that the Columbus quincentennial is finally over, the numerous events, actions, and reactions that it spawned in the Americas should be documented and analyzed. In the United States, where 1992 was presidentially proclaimed the "Year of the American Indian," some celebrated a deified Columbus, an inquisitive explorer, a discovering hero, with hoopla and hype, parades, parties, and special masses honoring the arrival of the first Christian missionaries. But, simultaneously, others were bashing Columbus and demonstrating against a villain, a demon, a murderer, an oppressor. Journalists reacted accordingly, taking one side or the other, as did universities, museums, professional societies, and speakers on tour. Some described the rich

culture of the Americas before Columbus and the vitality, diversity, contributions, and problems of today's indigenous peoples, stressing the need to explode the Columbus myth. Others focused on national polls showing that Columbus was still viewed as a hero, editorials that expressed outrage about demonstrations, and articles reminding readers that Europeans were not the only ones whose religion and politics led to conquest, exploitation, cruelty, and slavery before, during, or after the fifteenth century. Filmmakers created serial works for television and new resources for educators; activist groups organized protests; and new groups formed to promote native voices during the Columbus quincentennial.

But lest anyone think that the multiple-voice coverage of the quincentennial helped resolve any of the negative reverberations of the 1492 encounter, let us note that 1993, proclaimed by the United Nations as the "Year of Indigenous Peoples," continues, in the Americas and elsewhere, to provide examples of ethnocide and genocide, incarceration of political prisoners, toxic waste dumping, deforestation, pollution, enforced relocation, appropriation and desecration, and celebrations of land grabbing, complete with commemorative postage stamps.

It is in this context that Robertson's book has emerged. The publication results from a spring 1987 conference at the Smithsonian Institution that brought together ethnomusicologists, anthropologists, musicologists, folklorists, composers, and performers to consider the musical implications of Columbus's voyage and the role music might have played in the Columbus quincentenary. Rather than reduce music to a collection of sounds, the group focused on the vitality and complexity of the dialogues and messages of the cultural performances. As stated by Robertson,

As an embodiment of the beliefs, myths, and modes of explanation that shape reality, performance can lead us to an understanding of how problems, conflicts, histories, scientific explorations, and spiritual transcendence converge in the dance of time. As an essential form of knowledge in all cultures (a central way of knowing the universe), music is one of the most important footprints left by the passage of time. Performance is a culture's way of breathing life into these footprints, for as a dancer or an instrumentalist begins to move or create sound, the full force of traditions is set in motion (p. 2).

After the editor's prologue, acknowledgments, and introduction, which set the stage for the encounters of Africa, America, and Europe, the volume is divided into five major sections, each of which is prefaced with an overview by Robertson. These overviews make a significant contribution to the success of the volume, in which readers will find many different voices, approaches to scholarship, and topical concerns. The diversity, in itself, is appropriate and enriching, in light of the ongoing, multifaceted consequences of the 1492 encounter and subsequent ones, and the numerous approaches to excavation, reconstruction, and argumentation that are characteristic of the different disciplines of scholarship. Robertson's overviews are essential in identifying common threads, contextualizing divergent viewpoints, and providing coherency.

The first two parts, each of which contains three essays, focus on selected aspects of musical knowledge in the preconfluence cultures of the Americas and Spain. Part 1, "Music of the Ancient Americas," includes examinations of instrument-making technologies in Meso-America and the Andes. Dale A. Olson's study was made possible through musical archaeology; Susan Radcliffe's article employs both archaeology and an analysis of acoustics and other technologies of sound production. Other perspectives on the ancient Americas are offered in the essay coauthored by two prominent composers, Julio Estrada and Peter Garcia, who reflect on some of the links between ancient traditions and their own creativity. Part 2, "The Music of the Three Spains," attempts to defuse misconceptions by examining the cultural pluralism of the pre-1492 Iberian peninsula, identifying the contributions of Jews, Moslems, and Christians, and illustrating how these affect understandings of the dynamics of five hundred years of explorations, encounters, mythologizing, and constructing identities. Israel J. Katz's essay explores the repertoires and performance abilities of the Jews of Spain, who were deemed enemies by an expanding Christianity. Rodrigo de Zayas examines the musicology and cultural heritage of the Spanish Moors, who, because of their Islamic religion and the strength of their educational, cultural, and political contributions, were also viewed as enemies of Christianity. Alejandro Planchart examines the role and multicultural heritages of Jewish, Arabic, and Christian music in the Christian courts of Spain, and considers the role of music composed for the church in both Spain and the Americas, where the spread of Christianity was again marked by intolerance and persecution.

Part 3, "Musical Repercussions of the Spirit of Discovery," contains essays by Dorothy Keyser, Barry S. Brook, and the late Frank L. Harrison. All of these examine pieces of the emerging Renaissance ideology, wherein expansions of time, space, and creativity paralleled expansions of the physical universe.

Part 4, "Harmony and Dissonance: Mythologizing the Encounter," includes six essays, by Elizabeth Travassos Lins, Luis Millones, Jürgen Maehder, Rayna Green, Malena Kuss, and Julio Estrada. Using diverse topics and approaches, all address the difficult questions involved in evaluating the reference screens or cultural myths through which humans view encounters. Included are discussions of the construction, manipulation, and never-ending re-creation of myths as encounters continue and cultural identities are recast. Estrada's essay, his second contribution to the volume, raises important questions about attitudes that sanctify history while denigrating both oral history and the peoples who engender mythologies of the encounter. Anthropologists and folklorists who are interested in myths and mythologizing, as well as acculturation, assimilation, syncretism, and change, will find this part of the volume full of challenging commentaries and ideas for future research.

Part 5, "Explorations, Encounters, and Identities in Contemporary Traditions of the Americas," includes six essays selected to "reflect the varied expressions of how cultural confluence emerges and changes over time" (p. 4). Malena Kuss, in her second contribution to the volume, focuses on multicultural threads in an opera to examine definitions of Cuban identity. Using hymn repertoires in Eastern Woodland communities and Andean brotherhoods, Beverley Diamond-Cavanagh and Ercilia Moreno Chá, respectively, challenge earlier understandings of acculturation and culture loss and early assessments of the uses of Christianity by indigenous peoples. Lorna McDaniel, focusing on the Big Drum Dance of Carriacou, Grenada, addresses the importance of music in concepts of nation and in cultural survival. Joann W. Keali'inohomoku compares the impact of colonization on Hopi and Hawaiian music and dance, thus broadening the scope of research related to the repercussions of encounter. Anthony Seeger, the final author in part 5, examines some of the misconceptions about the interactions of music and ethnicity that have influenced research on the heterogeneous, pre-Columbian, and contemporary musical traditions of the Americas. He also considers the power relationships and political issues that were imposed by the

encounter and that continue to exist in current professional ethical dilemmas, in examinations of the arrogance of scholarship—which continues to marginalize and disenfranchise—and in studies of the politics of naming. Seeger's ideas about alternatives, perspectives, and prospects have relevance to all disciplines represented in the volume.

In her epilogue, Robertson notes that no single volume can address the confluence of cultures precipitated by 1492 and that the musical repercussions of 1492 need further consideration in interdisciplinary, multicultural climates that focus on performance as a statement of cultural complexity. She reminds her readers that we, too, are part of the encounter, as we continue to translate beliefs, values, and "facts" in our attempts to understand both the dialogue of cultures and our own ever-changing roles in them.

*Charlotte J. Frisbie*

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville

**Nuvendaltin Quht'ana: The People of Nondalton.** By Linda J. Ellanna and Andrew Balluta. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992. 354 pages. \$19.95 paper.

Anthropologists of the late twentieth century wrestle with the question of how best to include the voices of those whom they portray in their writings. With *Nuvendaltin Quht'ana: The People of Nondalton*, anthropologist Linda Ellanna and Andrew Balluta—a nonnative and a Dena'ina Athabaskan, respectively—have given us an ethnohistoric ethnography that rings with the authentic voices of the Dena'ina themselves.

This work arose out of research needs felt by the superintendent of the Lake Clark National Park and Preserve, which encompasses over three million acres of traditional Inland Dena'ina territory, including the current Inland Dena'ina village of Nondalton. *Nuvendaltin Quht'ana* thus has, as its primary, official agenda, to document the cultural history of the Inland Dena'ina Athabaskans, a goal that coincides with Dena'ina interests in transmitting their own culture to their younger generation more effectively. In broader terms, this is a case study of subarctic Athabaskans, of indigenous North Americans, of modern hunting and gathering societies, and the human condition in general as